

APPENDIX
TO THE
REPORT
OF
THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

relating to the following Departments:—

- I. FOREST DEPARTMENT,
- II. AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT,
- III. CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT,
- IV. SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT,
- V. MADRAS SURVEY DEPARTMENT, and
- VI. BURMA LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

Presented to both Houses of Parliament by Command of His Majesty.



LONDON:

PRINTED UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
By JAS. TRUSCOTT AND SON, LIMITED, SUFFOLK LANE, E.C.

To be purchased, either directly or through any Bookseller, from
WYMAN AND SONS, LIMITED, 29, BREAMS BUILDINGS, FETTER LANE, E.C., and
28, ABINGDON STREET, S.W., and 54, ST. MARY STREET, CARDIFF; or

H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE (SCOTTISH BRANCH), 23, FORTH STREET, EDINBURGH; or
E. PONSONBY, LIMITED, 116, GRAFTON STREET, DUBLIN;

or from the Agencies in the British Colonies and Dependencies,
the United States of America and other Foreign Countries of
T. FISHER UNWIN, LIMITED, LONDON, W.C.

1915.

Price 3s. 3d.

GOVERNMENT PUBLICATIONS

(with the under-mentioned exceptions)

can be purchased in the manner indicated on the first page of this wrapper.

Accredited Agents of Free Public Libraries are entitled to a discount of 25 per cent. from published prices.

Hydrographical Publications of the Admiralty are sold by—

J. D. POTTER, 145, Minories, London, E.C.

Patent Office Publications are sold at—

The Patent Office, 25, Southampton Buildings, Chancery Lane, London, W.C.

(N.B.—Classified Abridgments of Patent Specifications are sold also by Wyman & Sons, Ltd.)

Ordnance Survey and Geological Survey Publications can be purchased from—

The Director-General of the Ordnance Survey, Southampton; or

The Superintendent, Ordnance Survey, Dublin; or

Agents in most of the chief towns of the United Kingdom.

(N.B.—Small Scale Maps are, as a rule, procurable at Railway Bookstalls in England and Wales.)

The Journal of the Board of Agriculture and Fisheries is published monthly by the Board, at 4, Whitehall Place, London, S.W. Price 1d., post free.

The London Gazette is published on Tuesday and Friday evenings by WYMAN AND SONS, LTD. Price 1s.

The following is a list of some Parliamentary Publications relating to India:—

DELHI TOWN-PLANNING COMMITTEE.

FIRST REPORT.—Choice of a Site for the new Imperial Capital at Delhi. With two maps. [Cd. 6885] of Session 1913. Price 1s. 2d., post free 1s. 4d.

SECOND REPORT.—Possibility of building the Imperial Capital on the North Site. With Medical Report and two maps. [Cd. 6888] of Session 1913. Price 1s. 3d., post free 1s. 5½d.

FINAL REPORT.—Town-planning of the new Imperial Capital. With plan and two maps. [Cd. 6889] of Session 1913. Price 1s. 8d., post free 1s. 11d.

RAILWAYS AND IRRIGATION WORKS.

RETURN showing the Estimated position, as regards Capital Expenditure, of the several Railways and Irrigation Works under Construction in India on 31st March, 1914, and the Proposed Expenditure thereon during 1914-15.

H.C. 318 of Session 1914. Price 1d., post free 1½d.

EAST INDIA (INDENTURED LABOUR).

Report on the conditions of Indian Immigrants in Four British Colonies and Surinam. Deals with Housing of Labourers; Medical Arrangements; Tasks, Hours and Wages; Repatriation; Education; &c. Appendices:—Amounts remitted to India by Labourers; Deposits in Banks; Contracts with Emigrants; Leasing by Indentured Immigrants Indians; Number of Indians despatched to, and returned entioned: Statistical Tables; &c.

PART I.—Trinidad and British Guiana

[Cd. 7744] of Session 1914-15.

PART II.—Surinam, Jamaica, Fiji, and Ceylon

[Cd. 7745] of Session 1914-15. Price 1s. 6d., post free.

CENSUS.

GENERAL REPORT OF THE CENSUS OF INDIA, 1911.

Contains Twelve Chapters, each with Subsidiary Tables and Appendix. Distribution and Movement of the Population. Birthplace. Migration. Religion. Age. Sex. Education. Infantile Mortality. Sex. Female Infanticide. Causes of a Deficiency of Boys. Relative Mortality of Males and Females in Famine Years. Marriage. Mother-kin. Polyandry. Premarital Communism. Divorce. Polygyny. Widow-marriage. Restrictions on Marriage. Exogamy. Totemism. Hypergamy. Cousin Marriage. Forms of Marriage. The Courvade. Circumcision. Marriage Customs. Universality of Marriage. Variation by Religion. Infant Marriage. Education. Language. Infirmities. Insanity. Deaf mutism. Blindness. Leprosy. Caste, Tribe, and Race. Blue Pigmentation as a Test of Race. Occupation. Summary Tables. With maps and diagrams.

[Cd. 7377] of Session 1914. Price 4s. 8d., post free 5s. 1d.

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

RAJASTHAN APPENDIX LIBRARY
TO THE
REPORT
OR
THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

relating to the following Departments:—

- I. FOREST DEPARTMENT,
- II. AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT,
- III. CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT,
- IV. SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT,
- V. MADRAS SURVEY DEPARTMENT, and
- VI. BURMA LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

Presented to both Houses of Parliament by Command of His Majesty.



LONDON:

PRINTED UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
BY JAS. TRUSCOTT AND SON, LIMITED, SUFFOLK LANE, E.C.

To be purchased, either directly or through any Bookseller, from
WYMAN AND SONS, LIMITED, 29, BREAMS BUILDINGS, FETTER LANE, E.C., and
28, ABINGDON STREET, S.W., and 54, ST. MARY STREET, CARDIFF; or
H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE (SCOTTISH BRANCH), 23, FORTH STREET, EDINBURGH; or
E. PONSONBY, LIMITED, 116, GRAFTON STREET, DUBLIN;
or from the Agencies in the British Colonies and Dependencies,
the United States of America and other Foreign Countries of
T. FISHER UNWIN, LIMITED, LONDON, W.C.

1915.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE.
I.—FOREST DEPARTMENT	1-190
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	2
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	3
APPENDICES	117
INDEX	159
II.—AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT	191-296
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	192
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	193
APPENDICES	257
INDEX	278
III.—CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT	297-352
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	298
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	299
APPENDICES	327
INDEX	343
IV.—SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT	353-406
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	353
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	354
APPENDICES	393
INDEX	399
V.—MADRAS SURVEY DEPARTMENT	407-428
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	407
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	408
APPENDICES	419
INDEX	424
VI.—BURMA LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT	429-440
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	429
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	430
APPENDICES	434
INDEX	439

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

APPENDIX
TO THE
REPORT
OF
THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

FOREST DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	2
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	3
APPENDICES	117
INDEX	159

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

	PAGE
At DELHI, Tuesday, 4th November, 1913.	
P. H. CLUTTERBUCK, Esq., Conservator of Forests, United Provinces	8
At DELHI, Wednesday, 5th November, 1913.	
G. S. HALT, Esq., C.I.E., Inspector-General of Forests	7
G. O. COOMBS, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, United Provinces	15
L. MERCER, Esq., President of the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun	20
R. MCINTOSH, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab	24
Pandit GOKUL DAS, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab	27
At CALCUTTA, Monday, 19th January, 1914.	
H. S. GIBSON, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bengal	30
Lalit Mohan SEN, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Bengal	33
G. E. S. CUBITT, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma	36
R. M. KAVANAGH, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma	41
At CALCUTTA, Tuesday, 20th January, 1914.	
T. H. MONTEATH, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa	46
R. G. A. HANNAH, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa	49
W. F. PERREE, Esq., Officiating Conservator of Forests, Assam	53
Rai Bahadur Upendra Nath KANJILAL, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Assam	56
At MADRAS, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.	
F. A. LODGE, Esq., C.I.E., Conservator of Forests, Madras	59
M. R. Ry Rao Bahadur V. ALWAR CHETTY Garu, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Madras	70
At BOMBAY, Wednesday, 11th February, 1914.	
G. P. MILLETT, Esq., Conservator of Forests, Bombay	74
N. D. SATABALAVALA, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay	81
D. O. WITT, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces	84
Rai Bahadur Srinivasulu Naidu, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces	89
At LONDON, Monday, 4th May, 1914.	
F. C. DRAKE, Esq., Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office	92
At LONDON, Tuesday, 5th May, 1914.	
Sir William SCHLICH, K.C.I.E., Professor of Forestry, University of Oxford	97
A. M. GACCIA, Esq., M.V.O., Director of Indian Forest Studies	100
At LONDON, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.	
Sir J. D. LA TOUCHE, K.C.S.I., Member of the India Council	106
At LONDON, Wednesday, 17th June, 1914.	
William DAWSON, Esq., University Reader in Forestry, University of Cambridge	107
E. P. STEBBING, Esq., Head of the Department of Forestry, University of Edinburgh	111

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

FOREST DEPARTMENT,

At Delhi, Tuesday, 4th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., O.I.E.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, O.S.I.

And the following Commissioners:—

M. HILL, Esq., Chief Conservator of Forests,
Central Provinces.

G. T. WRAFTER, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator
of Forests, Dehra Dun.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

P. H. CLUTTERBUCK, Esq., Conservator of Forests, United Provinces.

Joint written Statement relating to the Forest Department, containing the corporate opinion of the Imperial Forest Service Officers of the United Provinces.

66044. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—A large majority of officers consider that under the present system, the aim of which is that the recruit shall obtain an honours degree in natural science before entering on the forestry course, the recruits reach India at too late an age. This affects their whole service and is almost a more serious matter at the end than at the beginning. The majority, then, consider that the recruitment should be by means of nomination followed by a competitive examination between the ages of 18 and 20, of a nature to test a good general education, again followed by a course of training as noted in the next main head. The physical test formerly imposed as part of the competitive examination is thought to have been an excellent thing, and it seems that greater stress should be laid on physical fitness, in general, than at present.

A small minority of officers think the present method of recruitment preferable and that a rule for the prior possession of an honours degree in natural science obtained at a university is likely to ensure the recruitment of a body of men of greater general efficiency and larger breadth of view than can be expected from a class of younger men specialising in forestry and trained perhaps at a special institution.

66045. (II) System of Training and Probation. There is complete unanimity that the training of Indian Forest Probationers in England should be carried out at one residential institution. It is felt that now the efficiency of the Imperial Forest Service is being subordinated to the rivalries of the home universities.

The majority of officers of the United Provinces favour training at a university, and that university, Oxford.

It is believed that, with the method of recruitment favoured by the majority, it would be possible for the training to be so arranged that a certain number of probationers could take an honours degree in natural science more or less in combination with the forestry course, gain the diploma in the latter, and still be in India at the age of 22 or 23.

There is every desire that the recruits should come out with an education not inferior to that received by any members now in the service, and the advantage of the possession of an honours degree is fully appreciated, especially in these days when education looms so largely on the Indian horizon. If, however, a degree is taken it is felt that it should be obtained in a subject which may be of practical use in the Forest Officer's career.

Further, more attention should be devoted in the Forestry course to Engineering and also to Surveying, and perhaps less to some other subjects such as Entomology and Chemistry.

4 November 1913.]

Mr. P. H. CLUTTERBUCK.

[Continued.]

The present general arrangement of the practical training on the Continent is approved, but on no account should more than 3 months be spent in the first place visited in Germany; this will afford more time for the remainder of the tour and for the inspection of a greater variety of forests. More time might be spent in the French forests.

66046. (III) Conditions of Service.—The meaning of this heading is not clear. If it refers to the terms of agreement under which Imperial Forest Officers enter the department, then no desire for any alteration of these terms has been expressed by officers.

If it refers to the physical and climatic conditions of forest life, it is pointed out that these are generally severe and unhealthy and that the life is solitary. The latter being the case, it is both reasonable and desirable that officers should marry. Facilities for them doing so depend largely on the conditions of pay, leave allowances and pension, and on the provision of a family pension fund.

66047. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The majority of officers consider that the pay of officers of all ranks is insufficient in view of the greatly enhanced cost of living, both in India and in England. It is also certain that the cost of living will continue to rise, whereas the recommendations of the Royal Commission as regards pay will not undergo revision for a long term of years.

Accordingly it is almost unanimously proposed—
(a) that the payment of officers below the rank of Conservator should commence at Rs. 400 and rise by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,500 in the twenty-third year of service, provided that no further increments beyond Rs. 1,250 be allowed to any officer who is not reported upon as fit for a Conservatorship. In view of the present block in promotion to Conservator's grade, which will probably become intensified in the near future and continue so thereafter, it seems just that this block should be met by giving additional increments to Deputy Conservators of more than 18 years' service who are classed as fitted to hold administrative appointments;

(b) that there should be two grades of Conservators only, on Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,500 respectively. The present salaries of officers holding administrative posts are very insufficient to enable them to maintain their positions suitably, and the present difference between the pay of Conservators and Deputy Conservators is not proportionate to the greatly increased expenses of the former; and

(c) that the pay of Chief Conservators be Rs. 3,000 and of the Inspector-General of Forests Rs. 3,500.

66048. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The present conditions, if modified by the alterations recently proposed by the Government of India, are suitable. To these, however, must be added:—

(a) that the minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should be £500, or the salary last drawn on duty whichever may be less, and that the maximum allowance should be £1,000. In view of the enhanced cost of living in England it is not considered that an officer can maintain his position on less than £500 a year, and he should be allowed to draw up to £1,000 a year so long as his half pay justifies this limit; and

(b) that commutation of long leave on half pay to shorter periods on full pay be permissible, subject to suitable restrictions.

66049. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—If we may assume that the ordinary pension is reckoned to be deferred pay of one-quarter of the amount of the salary drawn on active service, the amount paid in pension compares poorly with the income derivable from the same amount if invested in a deferred annuity policy.

The present pensions allow only partially for the fall in the exchange value of the rupee and not at all for the increased cost of living in Europe. They also suffer by comparison with the pensions obtainable by the officers of the provincial forest service. It is earnestly represented that:—

(a) the pensions should be paid in sterling;

(b) that pensions should be graduated according to length of service in order to induce officers to remain in the service of Government at a time when their experience is of the highest value to Government;

(c) that ordinary pensions be paid according to the scale given below:—

		£
On completing 20 years' service		350
" 21 "		380
" 22 "		410
" 23 "		440
" 24 "		470
" 25 "		500
" 26 "		540
" 27 "		580
" 28 "		620
" 29 "		660
" 30 "		700

(d) that an additional special service pension of £40 per year of completed service be accorded to officers in the administrative grades, subject to a maximum total pension of £940 per annum;

(e) that an invalid pension of £150 per annum be given after 10 years' service and be allowed to rise by annual increments of £20 to £350 in the twentieth year; and

(f) that the above pension be granted irrespective of pay, or, as an alternative, that half average pay be converted into sterling at the ratio of two shillings per rupee.

66050. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—Entry into the Imperial Service is open to non-Europeans under exactly the same conditions as to Europeans, except with reference to marriage, no alterations appear necessary or advisable.

The maintenance of the existing system of Imperial and Provincial branches in the United Provinces is essential, and no increase in the numbers of Provincial officers in the place of Imperial officers can be made without a loss of efficiency. The prospects of the Provincial Forest Service have been very greatly improved in the last few years, but while it is hoped and believed that with the spread of education sufficient recruits of good social, intellectual, and physical qualifications will hereafter be forthcoming, and while there is no desire at all to belittle the work done by the present staff of the Provincial Service, there is a firm conviction in the minds of officers of the Imperial Service that up to the present from one cause or another, and with very few exceptions, we have not succeeded in recruiting officers in the Provincial branch who can claim equality of position with those of the Imperial branch, or are capable of doing the work which the latter have to do. The course of training undergone by Imperial officers in Europe is of a much higher standard than anything possible in India in the present state of scientific forestry in the latter country.

66051. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil and other Services.—The relations between the local Forest officers and the heads of the districts to whom they are subordinate call for little comment. The present system works well in the United Provinces.

66052. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission.—With regard to such minor concessions as free steamship passages, free medical attendance for wives and children and increased travelling allowances on transfer, etc., it is considered that they are unimportant and unnecessary provided that the proposed scales of pay, leave allowances and pension, and the formation of a family pension fund are granted.

The institution of a family pension fund is strongly desired. The basis of this fund should be the compulsory deduction of $\frac{1}{4}$ per cent. of an officer's pay augmented by an equal contribution from Government in lieu of the deferred pay which now lapses to Government in the event of the decease of officers who have not qualified for pen-

4 November 1913.]

Mr. P. H. CLUTTERBUCK.

[Continued.]

sion. Interest should be allowed at the rate of four per cent. and pensions fixed in accordance with actuarial figures.

Some officers are in favour of the continuance of

the General Provident Fund in addition to the proposed family pension fund, but the majority agree that the latter is the more urgently required fund.

Mr. P. H. CLUTTERBUCK

66053. (Chairman.) The witness said he represented his colleagues in the Imperial Forest Service in the United Provinces.

66054. His general view was that the maintenance of the division into Imperial and Provincial Services was absolutely essential. That view was not entirely based on the ground that facilities for training in India were inferior to those available in England and on the Continent. The chief reason was that the Indian had a dislike for hard physical work. In fact, most educated Indians thought it *infra dignitatem*. A Forest officer was really more or less a free agent; he had enormous areas to control and he could, if so inclined, slur his inspections, and perhaps not do them at all without anyone being very much the wiser. The Provincial Service did excellent work under direct supervision, but for independent charges they had been found very wanting. He considered that the present system produced less anomalies on the whole than the system which had been in force before the introduction of the Provincial Service in 1891. It was not a fact that the Extra Deputies were doing the same work and undertaking the same responsibilities as the Deputies. In the United Provinces there were three Extra Deputy posts, but at present there was only one Extra Deputy Conservator. The other two posts were vacant, because there was no one who could be certified as fit for holding a major charge. Moreover, the one Extra Deputy Conservator who now existed in the Province, was holding a major charge of comparatively very minor importance. It was not true to say that in previous years more Extra Deputies had occupied charges. These Extra Deputy posts had only been instituted on present lines during the last four years, so the system had not yet had time to develop except to the extent of the one charge to which he had just referred. If the standard of future recruits to the Provincial Service became as high as that of Imperial recruits, they would, of course, occupy charges similar in responsibility and work. The charges varied enormously, especially in the matter of area and revenue. But the Department had to do more than control major charges; in addition they had to carry out a great deal of scientific and working plan work, and this had to be done entirely by the Imperial Service. He was not aware that the present system caused any dissatisfaction amongst the Extra Deputy class. He had no doubt that at the present moment the men who were senior in the Extra Assistant grade were probably annoyed at not being promoted to Extra Deputyships, but there was a rule that until such men were certified fit, they could not be promoted. Even assuming that Indians went through a proper course of training in England and on the Continent for a proportion of vacancies in the Imperial Service, his opinion would still remain unaltered that Indians did not rejoice in physical work and would thus be handicapped. His idea was that whoever entered such a service as the Forestry Department should only do so if he was prepared to undertake hard physical work. That was probably the reason why the Department had never had a native of India in the Service, although it was open to them. The officers were recruited in England by a selection committee. If there was a large number of candidates, the Secretary of State might arrange for a competitive examination. He granted that anyone with obvious disqualifications would not be selected.

66055. With regard to the suggestion that the age limits should be reduced from 19 to 22 to 18 to 20, the witness said that he and his colleagues considered that the majority of officers came out to India too old. The quality of the recruits was excellent, but they were at a great disadvantage

called and examined.

through coming out at 25, and in some cases at 26 years of age. Such men did not acclimatise easily and lost so much service. He thought the sooner a man came out after College the better. A man was quite old enough at 23 to face the rigours of the climate.

66056. In the witness's opinion the physical test for admission to the service was not sufficiently rigorous. The indications were that there were men in the Department who were not very strong and who gave signs that they might, under severe circumstances, fall ill. Up to five years ago there had been a rule that a man intended for the service should walk 25 miles across country with a walking champion in about five hours, submitting himself the next day to a very severe medical examination. He could not say why that rule had been abandoned. He was satisfied with the medical examination, but he would like to see the physical test revived.

66057. The preference for an Oxford training expressed by the majority of his colleagues was due to Sir William Schlich's presence there at that university. He thought it was unnecessary that the selected probationers should spend part of their training course on practical work in India. Indian forestry differed distinctly in certain respects from European forestry, and it had not reached such a high stage. All his colleagues were of opinion that it would be a very bad thing for the Continental training to be given up. The Continent was the only place in the world where ideal conditions of forestry could be seen and studied, and if a man came out to India without a knowledge of those ideal conditions, they would look upon Indian conditions as the best they had seen, and would not be able to aspire to the European standard. The present system was that a man went to one of the University centres, learnt the principles of forestry, then went for a course of training on the Continent, then came to India, and became attached for one year to a division under a selected officer. He thought that was a sufficient training. As a rule, most officers, after arrival in India, passed the Departmental test within a year, but it was open to them to pass as soon as they could. The Departmental test was considered to be sufficient.

66058. The reason for asking that there should be a difference of Rs. 500 between the pay of the Deputy Conservator and Conservator and the pay of the Conservator and Chief Conservator, was that at present a senior officer in charge of a division on Rs. 1,250 was much better off than a Conservator on Rs. 1,500. A Deputy Conservator on Rs. 1,250 was in charge of one district, whereas a Conservator on Rs. 1,500 had charge of a whole province, or of half a province. An additional Rs. 500 was asked for on the ground of extra travelling and increased expenses all round. The allowance made to the Conservator for travelling was at present Re. 1 a day more than the Deputy Conservator's allowance, and this was found to be absolutely inadequate. A Conservator toured for about seven months in the year, and, according to the country, he had either carts or camels. He had also sometimes to travel by train. With regard to the allowance for the transport of horses when going by train, the Government could sanction, under the Civil Service Regulations, two horses by rail, but special sanction had to be obtained in every case. He would not admit the possibility of reducing initial rates of salary if the age of arrival in India were reduced, nor would it modify his proposal in regard to increased salaries in the higher grades. One of the reasons why he wanted men to come out earlier was because the men who came out later lost so much in pay. When he came out at 21 he began on Rs. 250.

66059. Not many officers took advantage of the

4 November 1913.]

Mr. P. H. CLUTTERBUCK.

[Continued.]

option of retiring after 20 years' service. They could not afford it. He thought in any case that 20 years' service was rather too short a period to qualify for retirement. He considered it was a bad thing for the service if many men did go at 20 years' service, because after 20 years' experience a man ought to be one of the most valuable officers in the service. If the age of the recruit coming out was reduced, the argument for lengthening the qualifying period would be still stronger. Very few officers remained in the service after the age of 55. If they desired to do so, they would have to obtain special permission, which in the administrative rank was not very often granted. There were no sedentary posts in the service, except an occasional position like that of the Assistant Inspector-General of Forests, which could be held for two years. He did not think, if the scale of pensions were improved, that officers in the Forestry Service would be prepared to come into line with other Departments in regard to the period of service qualifying for optional retirement, if the limit laid down was above 25 years; but if the limit was fixed at 25 years he thought they probably would come into line. In his opinion a system which would provide for the payment of retiring allowances, partly in the form of pension, and partly in the form of a lump sum gratuity, would be very favourably considered. He could not say to what extent Forest Officers took advantage of the opportunity of contributing beyond 6*1/2* per cent. to the General Provident Fund, but he thought a considerable number gave more than the compulsory 6*1/2* per cent. His colleagues were very keen indeed on having a Family Pension Fund. The majority of officers would like such a fund to be in lieu of the Family Pension Fund. He did not think many officers would be prepared to contribute both to the Provident Fund and to a Family Pension Fund.

66060. (Mr. Gokhale.) The witness said the total strength of the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service in the United Provinces was 19 officers, and there was a proposal for an addition of 13 more, making 32 in all. In the Imperial Service there were two Conservators and 17 Deputies and Assistants, and if the proposed increase was granted, there would still be two Conservators with 30 Deputies and Assistants. He admitted that there were a good many Indian Engineers who had to do a great deal of out-door work, but in reply to a further suggestion that if Indians could do the work of engineers they could also do the work of Forest officers; the witness urged that in addition to the argument he had previously put forward it was necessary to remember that engineering was an exact science. It was extremely simple to teach anyone an exact science, and also very easy to supervise men engaged in engineering work. Forestry was an inexact science, and success in forestry entirely depended on the individuality of the officer. If any Indian had a real leaning towards forestry work he could get into the service, and would probably do well.

66061. He had asked a good many educated Indians why they did not try to get into the service, and they had replied that in towns a Forest officer had not much standing.

66062 (Mr. Sly.) The witness said that until 1905 entry to the Forestry Department was by open competition. Under the present system of recruitment a science degree had recently been made a qualification for admission to the service. He had not been to a University himself, and was not able to say exactly up to what age a science degree could be obtained, but he understood that if the selected candidates were to go to the Universities at 18, it would be quite possible for them to join the service at 21 or 22 with a science degree and a Forest diploma, provided arrangements were made for taking the two courses concurrently. The proposal of the United Provinces officers was that there should be limited competition at 18 to 20 followed by a three years' course at a University, which would include science degree. There was no support in the United Provinces for a proposal to establish a central institution other than a

University. They thought it was advisable to have one institution, and that that institution should be Oxford.

66063. The present leave reserve in the United Provinces was more than adequate because officers could not afford to take much leave.

66064. The Provincial Service of the Forestry Department was at present recruited partly direct and partly by promotion of Rangers. He was of opinion that, eventually, recruitment from Rangers should be abolished except in cases of special merit, but it would be very unfair to take this step at once. At present the direct recruits to the Provincial Service were nominated by Government. He did not consider it would be desirable to have a system of competition for the Provincial Service because he thought more suitable men could be obtained by nomination. He thought the six months' practical test given to candidates for the Provincial service was suitable, and he would deprecate a proposal to reduce it to three months.

66065. The scale of pay which had recently been sanctioned for the Provincial Forest Service was quite adequate to attract a satisfactory class of recruits to that service.

66066. On the question of leave, the witness said that in his opinion, the proposal that Provincial Forest officers who had shown special merit should be allowed periods of study leave to Europe, was a very good one. On the other hand he did not think that satisfactory results would be obtained by recruiting a certain proportion of Indians in India for the Imperial Service and sending them to England to undergo the same course of training as the English recruits underwent.

66067. (Mr. Madge.) In reply to a question he thought the domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians in his Department were sufficiently energetic in their work; the witness replied that the domiciled European was a curious person, whose characteristics were well known. It was difficult to find domiciled Europeans who were really keen on hard physical work. There were no exceptions to that rule among the senior officers in the United Provinces, but it was hoped that new rules for direct recruitment would bring about some improvement. It was not true to say that since the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial divisions, all promotions from the Ranger grades to the Provincial Service had ceased; in fact it was just the reverse in his Department.

66068. The witness stated that it was not the fact that Indian forests in their magnitude and wealth of material afforded as good a training in scientific forestry as much as any other country in the world. Scientific forestry in India was in its infancy. His Department's one ideal was to try and introduce the highest system of scientific management into the quarter of a million square miles of forests which India possessed.

66069. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) The witness said that his own personal view was that men in the Provincial Service would never be qualified to do the work of an Imperial officer. He would have no objection to some other division of the Service, say into a first and a second class, which would obviate the feeling which was generated by the use of the terms "Imperial" and "Provincial," provided only that the majority of the work was supervised by Imperial officers.

66070. (Mr. Hill.) The witness did not suggest that the increased salary for the Conservator should be given merely on account of travelling and other expenses. He thought the fact that a Conservator was at the head of his Department, was responsible to the Government, and was in charge of a great number of divisions, alone justified the increase. He had heard indirectly of cases where the smallness in the difference of emoluments as between Deputy Conservators and Conservators, and Conservators and Chief Conservators, had led to officers refusing a higher appointment. There were also cases within his own knowledge where Conservators had definitely stated that their appointment had involved financial loss.

5 November 1913.]

At Delhi, Wednesday, 5th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

M. HILL, Esq., Chief Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces.

C. T. WRAFTER, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Dehra Dun.

R. R. Scott, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

G. S. HART, Esq., C.I.E., Inspector General of Forests.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Service.

A.—IMPERIAL SERVICE.

66071. (I) Method of Recruitment.—The present method of recruitment is by selection from among candidates who have obtained an honours degree in Science at the University of Oxford or Cambridge, or who have passed a similar examination at some other University in the United Kingdom, and who are under 22 years of age on the 1st of January of the year in which they present themselves for selection. Subsequent to this selection candidates may be required, at the discretion of the Secretary of State, to appear in a competitive examination. The Board of Selection consists of four members, viz., one member of the India Council (generally a retired Lieutenant-Governor), one officer appointed by the Government of India (generally a retired Inspector-General of Forests), one officer appointed by the India Office (generally a member of the English Board of Agriculture), and the Director of Indian Forest Studies (*ex officio*). Social, moral, and physical qualities are taken into consideration as well as educational attainments, and the composition of the Board is such that the main objection to selection, the chance of favouritism, is adequately guarded against.

All recruits that have arrived in India so far since the closing of the Royal Imperial Engineering College, Coopers Hill, have received the theoretical part of their training at the Oxford School of Forestry, and with the single exception that the average age at which the men reach India is too high, I consider that this method has been satisfactory. So far as I have seen we have secured an excellent stamp of man for the Service, and I believe it to be of the greatest importance that probationers should have received a substantial preliminary training in science before they devote themselves to the study of forestry, pure and simple. I am of opinion, however, that greater attention should be paid to physical fitness, and that for this purpose the physical test should be reintroduced and should precede the appearance of candidates before the medical and selection Board. This test, which consisted of some 20 to 25 miles across country at an average pace of about five miles an hour, was abolished in or about the year 1902. I think this abolition was a mistake, for I have heard complaints regarding the physical fitness of some of the men who have joined the Service in recent years, and I have myself met with one or two instances of this description. Medical examination may not be always sufficient, for it is of more than ordinary importance that recruits for the Forest Service should be thoroughly sound physically, and the test was no more than just enough to exclude those who were not so. It is impossible to express any opinion as regards the results likely to be attained in future under the system which permits probationers to undergo training at one of three or more Universities; but for various reasons, which will be mentioned in the second section of this memorandum, I consider that training at one institution is essential, and, therefore, I fear that the future results are unlikely to be as successful as those of the past.

Method recommended.—If it were possible to ensure the arrival of recruits in India at an earlier age and to revert to training at one institution, I should prefer to continue the selection of proba-

tioners from men who have taken science degrees, or passed suitable tests at one of the British Universities. But if this is impossible, I would fix the limits of age for probationers at from 18 to 20 years. I would insist on a physical test first of all, then on a stricter medical examination than at present, then on appearance before a Board of Selection, and then on a competitive examination followed by training at one institution. If this examination were framed so as to ensure that no one could pass it unless he had received a good preliminary training in science subjects, I believe that the necessary theoretical and practical courses in forestry, etc., could be carried out in two years. This would result in recruits joining the Service at an average age of between 21 and 22, which is the best time for a man to start his forest career in India. During the past five years the age of the recruits has averaged 24 years, as compared with an average age of 22½ in the case of the last five years recruited from Coopers Hill, and the former is too old. It means that the recruits do not easily settle down to the conditions of forest life in India, that they expect to be put in responsible positions sooner than is either possible or desirable, that they are unlikely to reach administrative rank until they are within a few years of 50, and that, if they are unlucky as regards promotion, they may even be unable to earn the extra pension which is granted for three years' approved service in the class of Conservator.

66072. (II) System of Training and Probation.—Before joining the Service in India selected candidates have to obtain a University diploma in forestry and to undergo a course of practical training abroad, either as part of, or supplementary to, the diploma course. The theoretical portion of the diploma course can be taken at either of the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, or Edinburgh. On arrival in India, the first year passed by the young forest officer is regulated by the orders issued by the Government of India in Circular No. 13.F.-85-2, of 10th May, 1911. These orders are that during this period he is to be considered as still under training, and that he should not usually be utilised for the ordinary purposes of forest administration: that his training should be carried out under a selected officer, or officers, and should include both active work in a division, and a period of work at the headquarters of the circle: that he should tour in his own province and possibly visit selected forests in other provinces.

The question of practical training in India.—The question of substituting practical training in India for that now undergone in Europe has been raised on at least one occasion previously. Personally, I am strongly opposed to this suggestion. In the first place, I believe it to be essential that recruits for the Forest Service should have practical acquaintance with the best system of forest management, and this they cannot obtain out of Europe; while, secondly, I hold that on arrival in India young forest officers can best be employed studying the language and conditions of the provinces in which they are destined to pass a large part of their service.

The period of probation.—On the other hand, I am of opinion that, if the present method of recruitment is maintained, there is no necessity to insist on a fixed period of probation, or rather training, after a candidate has been selected and before he

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. S. HART.

[Continued.]

joins the Service. It is quite possible for a student at the Universities to take the theoretical course required for the diploma of forestry along with the science course, and thus, previous to appearing before the Selection Board, to comply with all the Secretary of State's requirements, except the practical course on the Continent and the final examination in forestry. I consider that a man who is willing to go through the extra work to obtain these qualifications should be allowed to join the Service in India as soon as he has completed the practical course and passed the final examination. An alteration in the regulations to this effect would tend to induce men to obtain the extra qualifica-

and pensions, but otherwise I do not propose to refer to these matters as the facts are notorious and unquestionable.

In addition, I think the conditions of service in the Department would be the better for alteration in the two following respects.

Allotment of recruits to Provinces.—During the past 15 years the 150 men who have joined the Service have been allotted to Provinces as follows:—

It is to be noted that in all but two cases the men who have gone to Madras have been the last men of their respective lists. Also that the popularity of service in Burma seems to have fallen off,

Province.	Number of recruits.	Men in first quarter of lists.		Men in first half of Lists.		Men in 2nd half of Lists.		Men who held either first or 2nd place.	
		No.	Per cent.	No.	Per cent.	No.	Per cent.	No.	Per cent.
Bengal	14	1	7.1	3	21.6	11	78.6	1	7.2
United Provinces	16	11	68.7	14	87.7	2	12.5	11	68.7
Punjab	13	9	69.2	12	92.3	1	7.7	7	53.8
Burma	44	11	25.0	26	59.1	18	40.9	8	18.2
Eastern Bengal and Assam	13	2	15.4	11	84.6
Central Provinces	17	7	41.2	15	88.2	2	11.8	3	17.6
Madras	14	14	100.0
Bombay	17	5	29.4	12	73.6
Bihar and Orissa	2	2	100.0
Total	160								

tions previous to selection, would probably reduce the cost of training, and would lessen the average age at which the recruits arrive in India. Still, even if the method of recruitment is changed, there should be no hard and fast insistence on the recruits coming out to India as soon as they have complied with the requirements of the Secretary of State. Recently a few of the men who have shown special aptitude in particular subjects have been permitted to remain on in Europe for an extra year's study. I think that the continuance of this policy is likely to be of great advantage both to the men themselves and to the Service generally, and I would suggest that the necessary alteration be made in the regulations. The extra year spent in Europe should count as service and for pension, and the young officers selected for this purpose by the Secretary of State should receive the usual deputation allowance of two-thirds Indian salary plus actual travelling expenses.

Training at one institution.—In the previous section of this memorandum, I have stated my opinion that training at one institution is essential. I hold this opinion because I believe it to be most desirable that the details of technical training should be carried out on the same lines, and because the number of recruits required annually (normally eleven, but now reduced to five owing to previous over-recruitment) is too small to make it worth the while of more than one institution to provide a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions. It is, for instance, of the greatest importance that the training of officers for the Indian Service should comprise more detailed and thorough instruction in surveying and in forest engineering generally, than is given at present. I know that there is a general concensus of opinion that in these respects the training of the recent recruits is defective, and I doubt if it will be possible to remedy this state of affairs without special training at one institution.

66073. (III) *Conditions of Service.*—All the memoranda submitted by Forest Officers serving in the various Provinces lay stress on the fact that the conditions of forest life in India are unusually arduous and often unhealthy. Many of them also quote figures to show the very small proportion of men who have been able to last out the Service long enough to obtain their full pension. I concur in the opinion expressed that these conditions deserve special consideration in the matter of pay

for the eight men who were either first or second on their lists all belonged to the first nine years of the period: an examination of the figures for the last six years shows that Burma has had 28 recruits of whom four were in the first quarter of their lists, 14 in the first half, 14 in the second half, but none either first or second in their lists.

The present method of allotment is that, some six months before the men are expected to reach the country, the Government of India furnish the Secretary of State with a list shewing the distribution they propose to make and the recruits are then permitted to select the Provinces in which they wish to serve according to their standing in the final order of merit list.

The figures quoted above shew that some alteration in this procedure is desirable, more especially when it is remembered that the men who go to Madras and Bombay enter water-tight compartments from which they have a very slender chance of emerging and to which additions by transfers of other officers are equally unlikely. I suggest that the system should be assimilated to that in force in the case of the Indian Civil Service, namely, allotment by groups of provinces. As the number of men recruited annually for the forest service is small, it would be undesirable to have more than three groups which might conveniently be formed as follows:—

(i.) *Upper India.*—The Punjab, United Provinces, Central Provinces, Bihar and Orissa, Assam and Bengal.

(ii.) *Burma.*

(iii.) *Madras and Bombay.*

The first three men on the list should be obliged to elect for service in one or other of the three groups, in order of merit, and so on, the allotment to particular Provinces in groups (i) and to Madras and Bombay in group (iii) being made by the Government of India in accordance with requirements at the time being. This arrangement would ensure a more even distribution of the recruits, for though it does not necessarily follow that the men who come out at the top of the list will always do better than those below them, the chances are in that direction; also it would free the Government of India from the necessity of definitely deciding on the distribution to be made months before the men reach India, which, with a small Service like the Forest Department, is open to objection.

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. S. HABT.

[Continued.]

Transfers among officers.—The other matter in which I think a change is desirable is that of transfers of officers from Province to Province before they reach Conservator's rank. At present such transfers are exceptional and when they do occur they are generally due to the necessity of moving an officer on account of a break-down in his health. In such cases, or whenever a Province is called on to give up an officer for any other reason, I am afraid it is true that the Province in question discards the man whom it is most anxious to get rid of.

I am convinced that it would be to the benefit of the Service and of the officers themselves if transfers were more frequent and if it were understood that the men so transferred were not the undesirables, but those who had distinguished themselves by their ability and energy and marked themselves out as likely to make good administrative officers. Transfers of this kind would have to be regulated by the Government of India and might be carried out on the return of officers from leave. Under these conditions the standard of divisional work in Provinces should improve, the climatic advantages and disadvantages of Service in different Provinces would be distributed more fairly, Conservators would usually have experience of work in at least two Provinces before taking charge of a circle and there would be a greater exchange of ideas and experience, all of which would, I think, be of general benefit to the progress of Forest administration in India. Now that the Service has a time-scale of pay, the only reasonable objection to this proposal that I know of is the difference in the vernaculars of the various Provinces. Undoubtedly, this is a difficulty, but it is not insurmountable. Transfers of this kind have been made from time to time in the past without giving rise to grave inconvenience and, in any case, it is no great hardship for a man to be obliged to pass by the lower standard in a new language.

I think, myself, that if this principle is accepted it should be applied to Madras and Bombay as well as to the Provinces directly under the control of the Government of India. But this could hardly be done without, at the same time, placing the selection of officers for Conservatorships in Madras and Bombay under the Government of India.

68074. (IV) *Conditions of Salary.*—At present officers of the Imperial branch join the Service on a salary of Rs. 350 per mensem and rise by annual increments of Rs. 40 to Rs. 700 per mensem, thereafter, they rise by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,250 per mensem in the 20th year of service. There are three grades of Conservator of Forests, who receive Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,700, and Rs. 1,900 respectively. Chief Conservators (in Burma and the Central Provinces only) receive Rs. 2,150 per mensem, and the salary of the Inspector-General of Forests is Rs. 2,650 per mensem.

The pay of the executive grades.—The last permanent promotions to the class of Conservator were gazetted in Government of India Notifications, No. 767, f. 232-2, dated the 13th August, 1913, and No. 788, f. 220-4, dated the 15th August, 1913, and concerned the two first men of the batch which joined the Service at the end of 1889, who therefore had nearly 24 years' service before they received substantive promotion to administrative rank. It is, I think, certain that in future men will not become Conservators with less than 24 years' service. Indeed, I fear that this figure is likely to be exceeded, for though it is possible that one or two more administrative appointments may be created during the next few years, it is still more certain that correspondingly greater additions must be made to the general strength of the Service. During coming years the development of the forests in India is likely to proceed much more rapidly than it has in the past, and though the Imperial forest staff is now slightly over strength in almost every Province, complaints as to the want of officers are constant, and it is known that at least four Local Governments are considering schemes of reorganisation involving increase in the forest staff.

The officers now in the early years of their service will be about 44 years of age before they obtain a salary of Rs. 1,250 per mensem, and may be anything from 47 to 50 before they receive further promotion. I venture to think that if, in addition to the generally arduous and unhealthy condition of service, due consideration be given to the highly specialised nature of the training, to the rate of promotion to administrative rank, to the later age at which men now enter the Service, to the higher standard of work, both as regards quantity and quality, now required from Forest officers, to the immense value of the property for the management and development of which the officers of the Service are primarily responsible, and to the greatly increased cost of living in India, which makes it more and more difficult every year for an officer to provide for the proper education of his children in England, there can be little question that these emoluments are insufficient for an officer of the class concerned. Accordingly, I submit that the following minimum scale should be substituted for that now in force:—

Grade.	Year of service.	Pay per mensem, Rs.
Assistant Conservator	1st	400
"	2nd	450
"	3rd	500
"	4th	550
"	5th	600
"	6th	650
"	7th	700
Deputy Conservator	8th	750
"	9th	800
"	10th	850
"	11th	900
"	12th	950
"	13th	1,000
"	14th	1,050
"	15th	1,100
"	16th	1,150
"	17th	1,200
"	18th	1,250
"	19th	1,300
"	20th	1,350
"	21st	1,400
"	22nd	1,450
"	23rd	1,500

With the present age of entry to the Service this scale would give an officer a salary of £1,200 a year at an age of about 48 years, a remuneration which can hardly be considered as extravagant, even if there is no further increase in the present cost of living in India and of education at home. If this scale were granted, I would suggest that no further increment should be given after Rs. 1,250 to officers declared to be unfit to hold charge of a Circle, or after Rs. 1,400 to officers who have not been definitely declared suitable for promotion to administrative rank by the time they reach that salary.

The pay of the administrative grades.—In their despatch No. 371, dated 2nd November, 1905, the Government of India proposed that the pay of the administrative grades should be as follows, excluding exchange compensation allowance which was to be continued:—

Per mensem.	Rs.
Third grade Conservator	1,500
Second "	1,750
First "	2,000
Chief Conservator	2,250—50—2,500
Inspector-General	3,000

But with the exception of third grade Conservators the salaries now in force are less than the above while exchange compensation allowance has been discontinued in all cases. Apart altogether from the question of raising the limit of pay of the time scale for the executive grades, I venture to hold, and indeed I know from personal experience that a salary of Rs. 1,500 per mensem is quite insufficient to enable an officer to maintain his position as a Conservator and to meet the necessary expenses connected with the maintenance of his

5 November 1918.]

Mr. G. S. HART.

[Continued.]

family. I regard Rs. 1,750 per mensem as the minimum upon which this can be done with the moderate comfort which an officer who has gained this position after many years' strenuous service is entitled to expect. I submit, therefore, that the three grades of Conservator of Forests should be paid at the monthly rates of Rs. 1,750, Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,250, and that the pay of Chief Conservators and of the Inspector-General should be Rs. 2,500, rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,000 and Rs. 3,000 rising similarly to Rs. 3,500, respectively.

66075. (V) Conditions of Leave.—Certain alterations in the leave rules were proposed some little time ago by the Government of India and are believed to be still under consideration. If these proposals are carried into effect the conditions of leave will be improved considerably, but the following additional improvements appear to me to be desirable:—

(i) In cases where, owing to the exigencies of the public service, Government is obliged to refuse the grant of leave when due, the officers concerned should be permitted to accumulate privilege leave without limit until such time as leave can be given to them.

(ii) A minimum furlough allowance should be fixed, as in the case of members of the Indian Civil Service. In accordance with the ratio adopted for the maxima allowances (four-fifths) this minimum should be £400 a year, or the pay last drawn on duty whichever is less. The present minimum of £200 a year—and this only on production of a medical certificate—is so small that officers who, in the interests of their health, should take leave are obliged to remain on or return to duty at all costs.

(iii) The maximum limit of £200 a year should be raised to the £1,000 a year fixed in the case of the Indian Civil Service. There is no difference in the manner in which officers of the other European Services and of the Indian Civil Service have to maintain themselves and their families when on leave in England, for all come from the same social class. There is no reason therefore why the few officers belonging to the other Services who are in receipt of salaries sufficient for half-pay (converted at the rate of 1s. 6d. to the rupee) to exceed £800* a year should be penalised while on the furlough which they have earned, more especially as officers of the Indian Civil Service become entitled to this maximum much earlier in their service than officers of other departments.

66076. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The present conditions of pension are:—

(i) After 20 years' service—Rs. 4,000 per annum.

(ii) After 25 years' service—Rs. 5,000 per annum.

(iii) An additional sum of Rs. 1,000 per annum to officers who have shown special energy and efficiency during an effective service of 3 years as Inspector-General, Chief Conservator or Conservator provided that voluntary retirement does not take place before the completion of 28 years of qualifying service, unless the officer concerned joined the Department on or before 31st December, 1909, and has rendered 3 years' active service in an appointment not below the first grade of Conservator.

Reasons why these pensions are insufficient.—I consider (ii) and (iii) of the above rates of pension to be insufficient for three main reasons. In the first place these pensions, which at the conversion rate of 1s. 9d. per rupee are equal to £437 10s. and £525, respectively, do not represent a living wages under present conditions to officers who have been recruited in England and who have spent from 25 to 33 or 34 years in the Service of Government. The pay of the Service is such that if an officer marries and has children, as most men do, it is impossible for him to save to any extent worth mentioning. Indeed, if an officer succeeds in providing for the education of his children, for occasional visits to England, and for reasonably moderate life insurance, and then at the end of his service is able to leave the country without

* Only officers drawing over Rs. 1,750 per mensem.

debt and with a few hundred pounds in his pocket, I think he may be considered to have done fairly well. Unless, therefore, an officer has private means the best he can look forward to on retirement is to spend the remainder of his life in comparative indigence and in a perpetual struggle to make both ends meet. If at the time of retirement he has still to provide for the education of children, comparative indigence must become actual. In the second place, the sterling value of these pensions is less now than it was at the time they were fixed very many years ago, when the value of the rupee was two shillings. As in the meantime Government has found it necessary to raise salaries paid in India, owing to great increase in the general cost of living, this state of affairs appears to be indefensible. Thirdly, it is not fair that an officer of the Imperial Service who for any reason is unable to qualify for the extra pension, should only receive the same pension as officers of the Provincial Service, who, under the recent re-organisation, can obtain a pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum, after two years' service in the top grade of Extra Deputy Conservator.

Recommendations.—I venture to urge, first of all, that the pensions for the Imperial branch of the Service, and indeed for all Home-recruited Services, should be fixed in sterling. Officers, who are born and recruited in Great Britain, must be expected to return to their own country at the end of their service and, this being so, it seems anomalous that their pensions should be fixed in anything but the currency of that country.

As regards the amount of the pensions I consider that it would be inadvisable to increase the first pension of £350 per annum for optional retirement after 20 years' service. In point of fact few men have availed themselves of this pension in the past, and in any case it is not in the interests of the Service that Government should hold out any further inducements for retirement at an age when its officers are probably commencing to reach the stage of their greatest utility. Indeed, if it were not for my belief that the possibility of taking this early pension is an aid to recruitment, I should be prepared to advocate its abolition in the case of future entrants to the Service. For the rest, I am strongly in favour of graduating pensions in accordance with length of service, so that there may be inducements to the best men to remain in service and not to retire at a time when for administrative purposes they are most useful to Government, and, at the same time, of giving Government the power to retire compulsorily officers who are comparatively, or actually, inefficient as soon as they have qualified for a reasonable pension. Therefore, I would recommend the following scale:—

	Per annum.
After 20 years' qualifying service	... £350
After 25 years' qualifying service	... 500
After 30 years' qualifying service, or after 25 years' service and 3 years' approved service as Conservator	... 650
Extra for 3 years' approved service as Chief Conservator or Inspector- General of Forests	... 100

If this scale of pensions is sanctioned, I would give Government the power to retire compulsorily any officer who after a service of, or exceeding, 25 years is declared unfit to hold charge of a Circle, and of any Conservator who, after 3 years' service in the class of Conservator, is similarly considered unfit for promotion to the post of Chief Conservator.

Medical pensions.—Pensions granted to officers who are obliged to retire under medical certificates of unfitness for further service should be more liberal than those which are admissible under the present rules. I would urge that with 10 years' completed qualifying service an officer so retired should receive £200 a year, and that the pension should rise by annual increments of £20 to £400 at 20 years' service. I can see no reason why an officer, who with this length of service is

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. S. HART.

[Continued.]

compelled to retire on account of a complete breakdown in his health, should not be treated more liberally than a man who retires voluntarily because he has no wish to serve Government further. Similarly, I think that if the scale of ordinary pensions is graduated according to length of service, the invalid pensions between 20 and 25 years' service and between 25 and 30 years' service, should increase proportionately also.

66077. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial Branches.—The present constitution of the Department is:—

(a) *The Imperial Service*.—Recruited in England by the Secretary of State comprises 80 per cent. of the upper controlling staff, i.e., the staff required for the management of forest charges, classed as *major*, *plus* the usual allowance for leave, training, etc.

(b) *The Provincial Service*.—Recruited in India and with few exceptions trained at the Forest College, Dehra Dun. Comprises the remainder of the upper controlling staff and the whole of the lower controlling staff, i.e., the staff required to hold charges classed as *minor*.

(c) *The Subordinate Service*.—Indians are eligible for appointment to the Imperial Service under exactly the same condition as Europeans, except that the restriction against previous marriage is withdrawn in their favour. In my opinion it is unnecessary to make any change in the existing regulations with the object of still further facilitating the entry of Indians into the Imperial Service. For many years past numbers of Indian youths have visited England with the object of completing their education and gaining admission to one or other of the Indian Services, but very few have made any attempt to enter the Forest Service. It would seem that the solitary and rough conditions under which the Indian Forest Officer has to pass a large proportion of his service, coupled with the moderate emoluments obtainable, do not attract Indians who are sufficiently highly educated to comply with the tests for entry to the Imperial Service.

The Forest Department is a scientific service in which the evil effects of even comparative inefficiency are more lasting and more difficult to repair than in the case of purely administrative Services. Again, it is not possible to obtain in India training in forestry, which can be compared to that given to the probationers selected at home, and this state of affairs will continue until the practice of Indian forestry reaches the level attained in Europe. Therefore, although I have no reason to urge against the admission to the Imperial Service of Indians who qualify themselves under the same regulations as apply to Europeans, I think it is essential to maintain a sharp line of division between the Imperial and Provincial Services.

66078. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—In all parts of India with which I am acquainted the relations between Forest Officers and Officers of the Indian Civil Service and other Services are perfectly satisfactory. It is essential that the Forest Officer, while having comparative freedom of action in purely professional matters, should be subordinate to the Revenue Officer in all matters that affect the welfare of the people. From the representation submitted by Madras Forest Officers, it would appear that the conditions in that province may not be altogether satisfactory.

66079. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—(i) Allowances on transfer should cover the actual cost of transport of an officer's family and private effects, subject to reasonable limits.

(ii) Government should institute a widows and orphans fund instead of the existing provident fund. The scheme should be worked out on actuarial principles to yield pensions of from one-half to two-thirds of those guaranteed to the Indian Civil Service.

B.—PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

66080. I do not propose to deal with the Provincial Service in detail under each of the nine heads which have been mentioned in connection with the Imperial Service, but there are certain matters in connection with which I think that modification of the existing regulations is desirable.

66081. (II) Systems of Training and Probation.—The length of the period of probation after passing through the two years' course of training at the Forest College is left to the discretion of Local Governments. Considering that candidates selected for direct appointment are put through a course of at least six months' preliminary practical training in the jungles before they join the College, and that, if they prove incapable of following the College course satisfactorily, the President has power to reject them at any time, I consider that a further probation of one year is sufficient. At the end of that time, if their work has been satisfactory, I think they should be appointed substantively to the Provincial Service, being regarded as supernumerary if there is no vacancy in the sanctioned cadre.

66082. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—Under the rules an officer of the Provincial Service cannot be promoted to be an Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests until a vacancy occurs. The number of Extra Deputy Conservators in any province bears no ratio to the number of Extra Assistant Conservators, but is fixed at 20 per cent. of the "major" charges. I have known cases in which this bears hardly on deserving officers, and I believe that this state of affairs will be still more pronounced in future, for, as forest administration develops, it will be necessary to increase the number of assistants to Divisional Forest Officers. It is true that the rules provide for the grant of personal allowances to officers who are considered fit for advancement to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator, but for whom no vacancies exist. These allowances, however, are not as good as the time-scale, while naturally the men concerned desire to reach the class of Extra Deputy Conservator. I think, therefore, that it would be fairer to make the time-scale continuous, subject to a provision that increment should cease at a certain point unless an officer is declared fit to hold a "major" charge. The scale which I would suggest is as follows:—

Grade.	Year of Service.	Salary.
Extra Assistant Conservator	1	250
"	2	270
"	3	290
"	4	310
"	5	330
"	6	350
"	7	370
"	8	390
"	9	410
"	10	430
"	11	450
"	12	470
"	13	490
"	14	510
"	15	530
"	16	550*
Extra Deputy Conservator	17	600
"	18	625
"	19	650
"	20	675
"	21	700
"	22	725
"	23	750
"	24	775
"	25	800
"	26	830
"	27	860
"	28	890
"	29	920
"	30	950

* No further increment unless declared fit to hold a "major" charge.

5 November 1918.]

Mr. G. S. HART.

[Continued.]

66083. (V) Conditions of Leave.—(i) Privilege leave should be accumulative under the same conditions as recommended for the Imperial Service.

(ii) One year's furlough should be granted after eight years' service, and an additional year after every six years' further service. Three years in 30 should count as service qualifying for pension, whether spent in or out of India. A minimum furlough allowance of Rs. 200 per mensem should be granted.

66084. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—There ap-

pears to me to be no necessity to increase the present maximum pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum. But retirement on medical certificate of unfitness for further service should be permitted after 20 years' service and should be optional without any such certificate after 25 years' service. In both cases the pension permissible should be one-half of the average salary of the last three years' service, and, in the case of retirement on medical certificate between 20 and 25 years the pensions should increase in accordance with salary.

Mr. G. S. HART called and examined.

66085. (Chairman.) The witness said he arrived in India in 1887, and served in the Punjab for 18 years. In 1906 he went to the Central Provinces as a Conservator, and was transferred to a similar appointment in Bengal at the end of 1908. In June, 1910, he returned to the Central Provinces as Chief Conservator, and was appointed Inspector General in April of the present year. His present duties were to advise the Government of India on all forest matters which came before them, to control working plans, and to inspect forests generally all over India, except in Bombay and Madras, with which presidencies he had nothing to do, unless his advice was specially asked for.

66086. The duty of a Conservator was to take charge of a circle. He had under him a certain number of divisions manned by divisional officers and the ordinary staff. The duty of a Chief Conservator was to act as adviser to the Secretariat in forest matters, and also to exercise general control over the circles. In the Central Provinces the appointment of Chief Conservator was first made temporarily for five years, but at the end of that time the Government decided that its retention was essential. A Deputy Conservator, unless he was on special duty, such as working plans, was in charge under the orders of the Conservator, of a Forest Division, which might extend from 100 to 1,500 or 2,000 square miles of forest. There was a great difference in the responsibility and work of the various divisions. An Assistant Conservator might be attached to a division, or he might frequently be in charge of a division. Promotion from the grade of Assistant to that of Deputy Conservators depended entirely upon length of service. Asked what was the earliest date at which an Assistant Conservator was placed in a responsible position the witness replied that the Department was so short-handed at the present time that an Assistant Conservator had been put in charge of a division after eighteen months' service, but normally it was preferable that he should not be given a charge until after four years' service. The Provincial Service consisted of Extra Assistant Conservators and Extra Deputy Conservators and before he could be promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy an officer had to be certified as fit to hold a major charge. The forest charges in a Province were divided into major and minor charges, and 80 per cent. of the major charges would be held by Imperial officers. There would also be special charges and 25 per cent. would be added for leave and training. Twenty per cent. of the major charges and a certain proportion of minor charges belonged to the Provincial Service, and a reserve of 14 per cent. was allowed for leave and training. The officers of the Provincial Service were recruited for an entirely different class of work from that discharged by the Imperial Officers. They were recruited for minor charges and to carry out the duties of assistants, but to the extent of 20 per cent. of the major charges might be promoted after long and meritorious service to what was called the upper controlling staff. Not all the appointments of Extra Deputy Conservator assigned to the Provincial Service had been filled up. For instance, Bengal had one such post, but it was not filled up; the United Provinces had three which were filled up; but two of the officers were on deputation. The Punjab had two posts filled up; Burma had 19 posts, of which 14 were

filled; Bihar and Orissa had three, all filled up; Assam had two, both filled; the Central Provinces had six, all filled; Madras had eight vacancies, of which six were filled; and Bombay had five, all filled.

66087. Replying to a question as to what amount of accuracy there was in the statement that the posts filled by extra Deputies were of exactly the same responsibility and same onerous work as those filled by the Imperial Officers, the witness said that a certain percentage of the major posts were set aside for the best officers in the Provincial Service, but they were not promoted to them until they had served from 16 to 25 years. These officers occupied positions of exactly the same responsibility as their colleagues in the Imperial Service.

66088. On the question of recruitment, the witness said he thought it would be unnecessary under present conditions for the Secretary of State to arrange for a competitive examination subsequent to nomination, but if recruitment was at an earlier age, he did think competition would be necessary. In his opinion, the ideal age for a young Forest officer to reach India was as soon after 21 as possible. He would so frame the syllabus of the examination that no candidate would have any chance of success unless he possessed a good grounding in natural science. That was the old system, and he thought excellent results had accrued from it. He did not think an Honours degree in Science was in any way necessary provided that a man had received a sufficient grounding in natural science. He would like to see the revival of the physical test which had been abolished some years ago. He could not say why this test had been abolished. He had met men who would not have got into the Service had it been continued.

66089. He would be very strongly opposed to the substitution of practical training in India for the training at present undergone in Europe, his reason being that there were no forests in India which had been treated on scientific principles for two or three hundred years. He was further of opinion that, during his first year, an officer should concentrate his attention on language and local conditions. He laid the greatest stress upon the seven month's course of training in the Continent. The whole period of training in Europe was so important that he would not diminish the year and five months spent in England in order to give more time in India. At present the rate of recruitment for the Indian Forest Service was only five per annum. That was an argument in favour of having all candidates trained at one centre, as it was out of the question to suppose that two or three institutions could each employ a special staff to train at the most 15 recruits a year. He thought Oxford provided as good facilities for teaching survey and forest engineering as any other place in England.

66090. On the subject of the employment of Indians, the witness pointed out that up to the present time the service had always been open to Indians, subject in the old days to competitive examination, and more recently to selection by the Secretary of State; but they had never shown any great desire to get into the Service. With two exceptions no Indians had either passed the competitive examination or been nominated by the Secretary of State. The Service did not seem to

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. S. HART.

[Continued.]

appeal to Indians to any great extent. He thought that for the purposes of the Forest Department greater efficiency was secured from the European; but if it was necessary to provide greater facilities for the entry of Indians into the Service, he was of opinion that open competition in India would be quite useless. If the Government found it absolutely necessary to recruit Indians, a system of nomination combined with competition would be the most successful method. Asked whether he saw any advantage or disadvantage in a scheme of organisation for the Forest Service which would provide for the employment of two classes of officers, one for the superior work and the other for the inferior work, thereby getting rid of the anomalies which at present seemed to exist in the Service, the witness replied that he would prefer to see things left as they were, with a possibility of having to take a certain number of specially good Indians for the Imperial Service. He could not suggest any means of getting rid of the grievance which undoubtedly existed amongst some of the officers of the Service in regard to the Extra Deputy class. It did occur in practice that a senior member of the Provincial Service was placed under a junior member of the Imperial Service, but he was not aware that this had given rise to friction. He would be against promoting Provincial officers into the Imperial cadre as an alternative to direct recruitment in India for the Imperial Service. He presumed that promotion under such a system would go to senior Provincial officers with exceptional qualifications, and there would be great difficulty in carrying out the scheme in practice. In his opinion the Provincial officers had been very well treated in the recent reorganisation of the Provincial Service subject to one or two small exceptions to which he had referred in his memorandum. He thought it was advisable to keep the two services quite distinct, and, if necessary, to recruit Indians specially for the Imperial Service. He did not see how the anomalies to which attention had been called could be avoided.

66091. The present system of recruitment for the Provincial Service the witness considered to be satisfactory. It was of great importance that the Service should be recruited to a great extent by promotion from deserving officers of the subordinate Service. Local Governments had this matter in their own hands, and up to the present time a very considerable number had been promoted. It seemed unnecessary to tie the hands of local governments by making a rule that a fixed proportion of vacancies should be reserved to the Ranger class, but personally he thought that at least one-third of the vacancies should be so reserved. The practical training given in the various Provinces to direct recruits for the Provincial Service prior to their selection was quite satisfactory, and the training of Provincial officers at Dehra Dun was the best that could be given under present conditions. He thought that the standard was steadily improving. Burma and Madras were the only Provinces which had colleges for training Rangers, the remainder being trained at Dohra Dun, but all Provinces except Bihar and Orissa had a small school of their own for the training of lower subordinates.

66092. Turning to the question of pay, the witness explained that he was proposing increased rates, not on the ground that the present rates were attracting an unsuitable class of recruit, but because promotion in the future would be much slower than it had been in the past. It was not likely in the future that a man would rise to the rank of Conservator with less than 24 years' service, and the present time scale stopped at the twentieth year. If the initial rate of salary were reduced below its present limit on account of the age being reduced, it would considerably interfere with recruitment. In his opinion, moreover, Conservators were worth more than they were now paid. In India there was a total area of 242,960 square miles of forest land in charge of the Service. There were 21 Conservators' charges, including one charge in Sind which was held by a Deputy Con-

servator. The average area of each charge of forest was 11,570 square miles. The total revenue of the Service was 290 lakhs. The average revenue was about 13 lakhs per circle; the average expenditure was 8 lakhs and the average surplus 5 lakhs per circle. He thought an officer who, after 24 years' service obtained a charge of that description, was at least worth the pay which was given to a Deputy Commissioner of a district. The pay now authorised for the Provincial Service was adequate, in his judgment, to attract the right kind of candidate. He would, however, like to improve present conditions so far as to allow Provincial officers to advance to the pay of Extra Deputy Conservators irrespective of vacancies, and subject only to fitness for promotion to the higher rank. The number of Extra Deputy Conservators' posts in a Province depended upon the number of major charges. It was only 20 per cent. of the major charges, and had no reference to the total number of posts in the Provincial Service. A case had occurred recently in which a local Government had appointed eight new officers to the Provincial Service, thereby adding eight men to the number of Extra Assistant Conservators, and under the present system no addition could be made to the number of extra Deputies. That meant that there would be an enormous block in promotion in future years.

66093. Regarding leave and training reserves, the witness stated that the present reserve was adequate, but if the new rules laid down a fixed percentage of officers who could be on leave at any one time, the question might require reconsideration. Officers could obtain study-leave under certain rules laid down in the Forest Code. Recently the rules had been relaxed, with the result that more officers were now taking advantage of the concession. He agreed that in proportion as the higher specialisation of officers assumed greater importance, study-leave would be taken to a much greater extent.

66094. The witness regarded the present pension scheme as entirely inadequate, and thought improvement of pension conditions would be of far greater importance to the Service than improvement of pay. The option of retiring at 20 years was not taken advantage of to any very great extent, and he thought it distinctly unfortunate in the interests of the Service that a competent man should have an option of retiring after 20 years' service. The effect of the concession, especially if the age of entry was reduced, was to allow an officer to retire in the prime of life. He would be prepared to lay down the principle that if an officer was given an option to retire after a certain period of service, the Government should have the same unreserved power to retire him after the same term of service.

66095. The witness expressed the view that a Family Pension Fund in substitution for the existing Provident Fund might be usefully established for future entrants to the Service. There might also be Provident Fund in addition up to a certain percentage on salary. He thought it unlikely that the majority of officers would take advantage of both funds. The Family Pension Fund scheme he had in view was based on the same principles as the Indian Civil Service Fund: but if this was impossible he would accept the principle of Government management without Government contribution.

66096. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) The witness admitted that it was rather early to judge of what the value of the Provincial Service, recruited as it was being recruited at the present time, would be in the future. He also agreed that the Forest Service was one in which it was far more difficult to judge of the value of a man by any examination or test to which he might be subjected, than by the result of work actually done under supervision. Experience accounted for much more than book-learning in the case of an officer of the Forest Service.

66097. The Department at present was being run on an extremely small cadre. The area of a German Forest division was anything from 15 to 20,000 acres, whereas an Indian Forest division was from 100 to 2,000 square miles. He regarded the

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. S. HARR.

[Continued.]

Forest Service of India as a revenue producing Department which should be capable of enormous development in that respect in the future, and he urged that from the economic point of view alone it ought to be treated liberally by the Government.

66098. He did not think the profit from the business of the Department was likely to increase so rapidly in future as it had done in recent years: that depended to a large extent on the money the Government was prepared to spend on establishments, communications and mechanical plant. The importance of the Department did not consist only in the actual development of the forests, but also investigations into the employment of forest products for trade purposes. For instance, owing to the work of the Research Institute, paper was now being manufactured from bamboos and from the pulp grasses, and the Department had induced the Railways to begin using the comparatively inferior timbers after preservative treatment, and also to take a number of their hard wood species after similar treatment. There were endless possibilities in that direction.

66099. With regard to his suggestion that no further increment should be given after Rs. 1,250, unless an officer was declared fit to be in charge of a circle, the witness said that did not necessarily imply that a man was unfit to hold charge of a Forest Division, but that he had not sufficient general ability, or was insufficiently active and useful, to hold charge of a Forest circle. He might, however, be a sufficiently efficient officer to deserve the continuance of the pay he was getting.

66100. (Mr. Madge.) In regard to the distinction between the work done by a Provincial officer and the work done by an Imperial officer, the witness said the essence of one man's work was to assist, and the essence of the other man's work was to control major charges.

66101. Supplementary to the view expressed in his written statement that the best training in forestry could not be obtained in India, the witness said there was not the same staff at Dehra Dun as there was at Oxford; there were not the same facilities for instruction. In the next place, India did not possess areas of forest which had been under scientific and proper treatment for two or three hundred years. Efforts were being made to improve the training at Dehra Dun.

66102. (Mr. Sly.) The witness said he would have no objection to the institution of open competition in England and the abolition of the Selection Board if the age of entry was lowered. He was of opinion that a University would be the best centre for the training of probationers. The University training should be adapted to Indian conditions. He did not consider that the whole of the University staff should consist of Indian Forest officers, but certainly some proportion of them should have had experience of forest work in India. For that proportion he would select the best men obtainable, irrespective of whether they were on the active or the retired list. On the whole he thought it would be better to take men from the list with between 15 and 20 years' service.

66103. The witness said that Extra Deputy Conservatorships in the Provincial Service were exactly analogous to the listed posts in the Indian Civil Service, and that just as in the Indian Civil Service one-sixth of the superior posts were supposed to be listed for the Provincial Service, so in the Forest Service one-fifth of the major charges had been handed over to the Provincial Service. Asked for his opinion regarding a scheme for abolishing the posts of Extra Deputy Conservator in the Provincial Service, and adding them to the Imperial Service as posts to be filled by selected Provincial Service officers, the witness said it would be very difficult to transfer men of 20 years' service from one branch to the other. The problem would be where to bring the transferred officers on to the time scale. The time scale for a Deputy Conservator in the Imperial Service began at Rs. 580, and for the Extra Deputy in the Provincial Service it began at Rs. 575. He admitted that there was only a difference of Rs. 5 in the minimum pay of the two posts, and that the result of bring-

ing men straight into the Imperial Service time scale, starting at Rs. 580, would be to remove a good deal of the grievance which was now felt.

66104. He could not say why certain Provinces were unpopular in the Forest Service, but he had heard that a Forest Officer was rather badly treated in Madras. He thought the majority of the men who came to India preferred to obtain a post under the Government of India, with a chance of service in different Provinces, and the extra opportunities of promotion, to being kept entirely in one Province.

66105. Dealing with his proposals regarding the salaries of Imperial Service Officers, the witness said he did not consider that Rs. 1,250 was too low a limit to place on the maximum pay that should be drawn by a Deputy Conservator, but he thought that length of service, and the time that it took for a man to get from one class to the other should be taken into consideration. It was true that the pay of Conservators had been improved during the last 10 or 15 years, but not to the extent that the Government of India desired to improve it. In 1890 the pay of a Conservator started at Rs. 1,100, whereas at the present time it started at Rs. 1,500. The appointment held by the President of the Forest Institute at Dehra Dun was analogous to that of a Chief Conservator.

66106. Every candidate nominated by a local Government for admission to the Provincial Service had to go through a preliminary practical training in the forest before he went to Dehra Dun. Six months' practical training was reasonable, but it should not be less than that period. He thought that it would unnecessarily tie the hands of local Governments to insist on a graduate qualification for candidates aspiring to the Provincial Service. The Provincial Service required special physical and constitutional qualifications, and it was not always necessary that a man should have an Indian University degree. As a matter of fact the Forest Department did not attract graduates from among the more highly educated Indian classes to any great extent.

66107. His proposal that the Provincial Service time scale should be continuous up to Rs. 950 was not put forward on the ground that this would be a reasonable scale of pay for the Provincial Service, irrespective of whether an officer was employed or not as an Extra Deputy Conservator. He did not think it was fair to suspend increments at the top of the Extra Assistant class simply because there were no vacancies in the Extra Deputy class. Perhaps he had gone a little too far in saying that the pay should rise as high as Rs. 950.

66108. To a certain extent, he strongly approved of recruitment to the Provincial Service by promotion from the subordinate ranks, because it was important for the Department to obtain good Rangers, and he suggested that one-third of the vacancies in the Provincial Service should be earmarked for the men belonging to this class. There would, he thought, be no departmental objection to the abolition of the titles "Upper controlling staff" and "Lower controlling staff," and "Extra."

66109. He was in favour of a system of study leave for Provincial Service Officers under the same rules as applied to the Imperial Service.

66110. (Mr. Gohale.) The witness said that the 43 vacancies in the ranks of the Extra Deputy Conservators would be filled as soon as suitable men could be found. He could not say why no steps were taken from 1891 until 1906 to provide for direct recruitment of men to the Provincial Service. The special course of training instituted at Dehra Dun last year was exclusively for the Provincial Service. There was a two years' course for Rangers and a special course for the Provincial Service. It might be possible with a sufficient staff for men to obtain a theoretical training at Dehra Dun similar to that given at Oxford, but the practical training was impossible. He agreed that if an improved system of training was instituted at Dehra Dun and the men who passed there were sent to Europe for special study, the actual training would be nearly equal to that given to officers in the Imperial Service. A proposal for

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. S. HAET.

[Continued.]

the training of the upper controlling staff in India had been put forward several times. It would be theoretically possible, but it would be most expensive to provide the necessary staff for such a purpose. It was true that when the Forest Department was instituted, and for a long time afterwards, both the Government of India and the Secretary of State expressed the opinion that it was a special Department in which the services of Indians should be utilised as largely as possible, but the more highly educated class in India had made no attempt to enter the Service. It was only within the last few years that candidates had been obliged to go to England on the chance of being nominated by the Secretary of State, but for many years previously they had had an equal opportunity with any other man of entering the service by competitive examination. Young men who left their homes and went to England would naturally be attracted by the Civil Service as offering the most highly paid employment, and those therefore who could afford it would naturally endeavour to enter that Service. This did not necessarily mean that if it had been possible for them to enter the Forest Service in India they would not have availed themselves of the opportunity. He did not agree that if the bulk of the appointments in the Department were filled by men who had undergone their training at Dehra Dun, and a few men were brought out from Europe to provide the necessary expert knowledge, that a sufficient European element would be obtained for the Service. Such a European element was undoubtedly necessary. It was essential in his opinion that a large proportion of the officers of the Service should be men with a fondness for outdoor life and work, natural history and science; and certainly so far as had been seen at present those qualities were not possessed by Indians. It did not follow because men in India could be obtained who had the necessary educational qualifications and could be given the necessary theoretical training, that those men would make as good Forest Officers as men who had been through the English Public Schools and Universities. He did not see that any advantage was likely to accrue from the employment of Indians, in consequence of their living in the country after retirement, and being able to place their accumulated experience at the disposal of the Department. The extended employment of Indians might result in a saving of cost, and it would be possible, if the Department was mainly officered by Indians, to have a lower range of salary; but on the other hand if the Department was not efficient a plan of this kind would prove to be extremely expensive. He thought the Government might be prepared to

make a beginning in the direction of developing Dehra Dun and of having Indians and Anglo-Indians trained there with a view to their admission to the upper controlling branch, but he would not be willing, at any rate for the present, to accept any such proposal himself. He much preferred that men should be selected and trained in Europe.

66111. (Mr. Wrafter.) The Provincial Service was recruited for entirely different work from that discharged by the Imperial Service, and therefore the two branches should be kept separate. The conditions of service of the Provincial Officers were based on Indian requirements; it had to be remembered that the Provincial Service was intended for Indians, and anyone who entered it did so with his eyes open.

66112. It was not necessarily the case that before an Extra Assistant was promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy he had to have 15 to 17 years' qualifying service. The rules laid down that promotion to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator was to be by selection from amongst Extra Assistant Conservators. It was within the powers of the local Government to promote any Extra Assistant Conservator to be an extra Deputy. Before he was selected he had to be specially reported on as fitted for a major charge. Then at intervals of three years he had again to be reported on by his Conservator as being qualified for advancement of pay. As to this, the witness said that in his opinion a man who had got into the Extra Deputy Conservator class should be granted his further increments of pay without any special certificate.

66113. (Mr. Hill.) The witness said that although there had been a considerable increase in the emoluments of Conservators in recent years, it was important to remember that Exchange Compensation Allowance had been abolished, and that therefore the increased pay was not so large as it would at first sight appear to be.

66114. He only knew of one case where the son of an Indian Provincial Service Officer had chosen the same profession as his father. If Extra Deputy Conservators were admitted to the Imperial list, they would have a comparatively small chance of rising to administrative posts in that Service, but they would certainly be eligible if once admitted. He did not think they need consider the question whether it would lead to friction with European officers if an Extra Deputy Conservator did rise to an administrative post.

66115. The witness added, with regard to his proposals regarding the pay of the Provincial Service, that it might meet the requirements of the case to continue the present rates of salary subject to a periodic re-adjustment of the number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators.

(The witness withdrew.)

G. O. COOMBS, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, United Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Service, being the corporate views of the Provincial Forest Service of the United Provinces.

66116. (I) *Methods of Recruitment.*—Recruitment for direct appointments should be by an open competitive examination only, exactly as for Provincial Engineers. There should be no nomination as such is not required in a department which is of a professional nature like the Public Works, Survey, and Telegraph Departments.

No recruitment should be made from among Rangers; only such of the Dehra Dun Rangers as have passed out of the Forest College before the opening of the direct appointment class (i.e., before 1907) and have maintained a good record of their work throughout the whole of their service and have been tried in every capacity and are all round fit for the Provincial Service should be promoted. Dehra Dun Foresters should in no case be promoted, and Article 15 (ii) of the Forest Code should be amended accordingly.

66117. (II) *System of Training and Probation.*—The training at present in force is suffi-

cient, but if it is considered in any way inferior, it should be raised so as to bring it on a par with that which probationers for the Imperial Forest Service receive in England. The period of practical training before admission to the Forest College, Dehra Dun, should not be more than three months.

66118. (III) *Conditions of Service.*—As duties and responsibilitiess of Provincial Forest Service Officers are the same as officers of Imperial Forest Service, the whole staff of both Imperial and Provincial Services should be borne on one amalgamated list, and the members of the amalgamated staff designated as Assistant and Deputy Conservators.

Charges of divisions should go ordinarily by seniority in the proposed amalgamated list, unless there be anything against any individual officer and senior member of the Provincial Service should not be placed, as is often the case at present, under a junior member of the Imperial Service.

Every Imperial Forest Officer should be required to remain in actual charge of a range for at least

5 November 1918.]

Mr. G. O. COOMBS.

[Continued.]

one year, and should not be placed in charge of a division before he has had at least four years of active Forest Service in the Province. The same rule should apply also to the Provincial Forest Officers directly appointed from the Forest College, Dehra Dun.

The classification of divisional charges into major and minor should be abolished, and the present practice in the United Provinces of placing Imperial Service recruits of barely one year's service in charge of major divisions, in preference to more experienced Provincial Service Officers who have been holding charges of major and minor divisions for considerable periods, should be abolished. Such Imperial Service recruits do not understand the vernacular, colloquial or written, a knowledge of which is essential for efficient administrative work in India; they do not know the customs and requirements of the people, are ignorant of the inner working of the Forest Department, and—last, but not least—are unacquainted with fluctuations of the timber trade and the commercial conditions of the country, which knowledge is a very important possession for an officer, especially a Divisional Officer, of a quasi-commercial Department like the Forest. The results of this practice must affect adversely the interests of the Department in every respect, and must result in opportunities for unfair practices by both subordinates and contractors. Moreover, many ways of discovering and improving the sources of revenue in a division must remain hidden. Thus it is clear that the appointment of recruits of short service to the charge of divisions is not in the best interests of Government. In emergency cases, only minor divisions might be placed under new recruits; but major divisions should always be held by experienced officers of either Imperial or Provincial Service. As Imperial Officers are expected to possess a superior technical knowledge of forestry, it is suggested that they should be placed in direct charge of important works, demanding such technical knowledge as for instance preparation of working plans, marking of trees for felling under various methods of treatment, cultural operations, fire protection, demarcation, etc., while divisional charges should be held by Provincial Service Officers, who are much better fitted for the purpose.

The present system of "confidential reports" results sometimes in injustice. When the adverse comments are made against any officer he should be supplied with a copy of the comments and an opportunity given him for self-defence.

The division of the "controlling staff" into upper and lower should be abolished, and officers of the proposed amalgamated list should be known as members of the controlling staff.

66119. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The starting pay which an officer gets on his confirmation to the Provincial Forest Service is not low, but the subsequent low increments and a very limited number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators (*i.e.*, three in the United Provinces) are disadvantages which, we submit, should be removed by reconstituting the pay as follows—

Assistant Conservators—

				Rs.
1st year of service	250
2nd	"	"	"	275
3rd	"	"	"	300
4th	"	"	"	325
5th	"	"	"	350
6th	"	"	"	375
7th	"	"	"	400
8th	"	"	"	425
9th	"	"	"	450
10th	"	"	"	475
11th	"	"	"	500
12th	"	"	"	525

Deputy Conservators—

				Rs.
13th year of service	590
14th	"	"	"	620
15th	"	"	"	670
16th	"	"	"	710

Deputy Conservators (*continued*)—

				Rs.
17th	year of service	750
18th	"	"	"	790
19th	"	"	"	830
20th	"	"	"	870
21st	"	"	"	910
22nd	"	"	"	950
23rd	"	"	"	1,000
24th	"	"	"	1,050
25th	"	"	"	1,100
26th	"	"	"	1,150
27th	"	"	"	1,200
28th	"	"	"	1,250
			and onwards	

The scale of pay for the Imperial Service officers may remain the same as at present, but should it be raised, the scale for the Provincial Service Officers should also be increased proportionately.

Rules and practice regarding the giving or stoppage of annual increments or any other disciplinary measures should be the same for both services.

66120. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The changes suggested to be made regarding long leaves for Indian services in G.G.O. No. 674—C.S.R., dated the 19th October, 1912, are all right.

The rule that privilege leave cannot be allowed within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in respect of leave on medical certificate or on bona fide urgent necessity for forest officers, who have often to labour in malarious surroundings and isolation.

66121. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—Invalid and voluntary retirements on one-half of the average salary should be allowed after 20 and 25 years of service respectively.

66122. (VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.—Indians and Anglo-Indians, although not debarred by the rules, are practically excluded from the Imperial Forest Service; it is therefore suggested that 20 per cent. posts of the Imperial Service should be reserved for them, who should be selected by a competitive examination open to all Indians and Anglo-Indians and deputed to England to receive the training which candidates nominated there are required to undergo to qualify themselves for the Imperial Forest Service, selection being made of only the best successful candidates, irrespective of any other distinction. The competitive examination should be based on the same qualifications as required for recruits nominated in England. One of the three conservatorships or circle charges should be thrown open to Provincial Service, the Provincial Service Conservator getting the same pay as the Imperial Service Conservator.

There is no limitation in the employment of non-Europeans in the Provincial Forest Service, except in the case of selection for the service in Burma, for which we suggest that selection should be made from all Indian communities.

The division of the service into Imperial and Provincial having not proved satisfactory, it is suggested that the distinction should be removed altogether.

In view of the suggestions made in paragraph 66116, and to keep up the efficiency of the subordinate service a few posts carrying higher pay may be created for them as follows, and designated "sub-assistant conservators" (upper subordinates):—

		Rs.
Sub-assistant Conservator, 1st grade	...	300
"	2nd grade	250
"	3rd grade	200

66123. (VIII) Relations with Indian Civil Service and other Services.—It is satisfactory and there is nothing to suggest.

66124. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—Colonials who do not allow Indians to enter their colonies should be refused admission to the Forest Services in India.

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. O. COOMBS.

[Continued.]

Travelling allowance for members of the Provincial Forest Service should be the same as for members of the Imperial Forest Service, and the former should be classed among "first-class officers" irrespective of their pay and posting, as is the case with provincial engineers.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Service, being a Supplementary Memorandum on the Provincial Forest Service, United Provinces, by Mr. Coombs.

66125. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—Recruitment for the service for entry through the Dehra Dun Forest College it is suggested should be first by nomination of properly qualified candidates, as required by the rules in force, and then selection from among the nominated candidates by a competitive examination. This would ensure a good class of recruit as regards respectability, character and physical fitness, with the requisite educational qualifications. In fact, the best men available.

66126. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The training given at Dehra Dun is all that is required, and the best that the ablest men of the Imperial Service can devise and impart. The Government of India, in a resolution dated 21st February, 1913, note "The College at Dehra Dun has recently been improved and a Research Institute has been established in connection with it. Indians can here obtain an education in forestry which approximates to that ordinarily obtainable in Europe."

In the "Indian Forester" for April, 1906, there is an editorial (written presumably by Mr. Stebbing, Indian Forest Service, who was the honorary editor of the paper at the time, and who is now Head of the Forestry Department of the University of Edinburgh, Scotland), in which a comparison is made of forestry tuition at Oxford and Dehra Dun. The writer shows that the course given at Dehra compares very favourably with that given at Oxford. The general remarks at the end of the article read as follows:—

"The above brief résumé of the two standards will, we think, suggest to the minds of our readers that the course given at Dehra compares satisfactorily with that given at Oxford, our opinion being that the latter—or, at any rate, the theoretical portion of it, requires stiffening up very considerably. In some ways the Dehra course is perhaps superior to the Oxford one. Undoubtedly the greatest advantage possessed by the Indian Forest subordinate is that he is trained in the country in which his future work is carried out: that he becomes acquainted in his practical course with forests of a similar nature to those in which he will have in future to work, and is thus the sooner able to apply the knowledge he has acquired in the lecture hall. For, instead of having his mind steeped in minute and precise, and perchance narrow and crystallised, methods of forestry, applicable and peculiar solely to highly civilised small States, he is from the first placed face to face with the larger areas and wider interests in which forest conservancy has to be practised in India; he learns the difficulties which confront the Forest Officer in dealing with ignorant native races; he recognises that innumerable rights will have to be defined and treated with circumspection; and discovers the difficulties that exist in growing and extracting his timber and in collecting and disposing of minor produce, etc., etc.

"To the Home-trained probationer these aspects of Indian Forestry remain practically an unopened book, for without a knowledge of the present conditions of the country he must find it difficult to attach the proper relative importance to what may be detailed upon the subject in the lecture room and impossible to apply his theoretical knowledge in the absence of local experience.

"In other respects the courses greatly resemble one another in the home course of tuition, the student does not acquire a knowledge of forest zoology upon the lines most suitable for India,

and he consequently arrives in the country ill-prepared to continue his studies there, while, on the other hand, much of the best work done under this head at present has been carried out by Dehra-trained Forest Officers."

The above will show that the training at Dehra Dun is highly satisfactory, and all that is required for the Forest Department; should there, however, be at any time anything which needs improvement, it will no doubt be done by Government, whose aim should be to keep the Forest Education at Dehra Dun at a sufficiently high standard, so as to leave no room for any doubt as to the qualifications and fitness of the men turned out from the College, and to give the men a fair chance of doing the best possible work for the department. I would also like to add that the men turned out from Dehra Dun under the old rules, say 17 years ago, before the Dehra school was raised to the status of a college, received as thorough a training under the able guidance of some of the best men in the Imperial Service, who had received their training at Nancy and Germany and Cooper's Hill, as they do now, as the old school course was the same as that taught now to the Provincial Service recruits, the Ranger's course having been cut down. The men trained at Dehra Dun therefore deserve every consideration and encouragement, and should not be condemned as a body and have unnecessary barriers placed in the way of their advancement. Good men should be given every opportunity and equal chances of working shoulder to shoulder with the officers recruited in Europe instead of being consigned to a position of subordination, as is the case at present, on the mere assumption that the training in Europe is superior.

The period of probation for the Provincial Forest Service men is at present three years, with two years spent in college; this seems excessive. The Imperial Service Officers when once they are appointed, are not required to serve any probation. After passing out of the College, one year's probation should be sufficient. A period of two years should be allowed for an officer to pass his departmental examinations, failing which his increment should be stopped till he has qualified.

66127. (III) Conditions of Service.—Officers serving in the Forest Department have a hard, knockabout life, camping for practically eight months in the year in all sorts of malarious and unhealthy localities, and throughout the hot weather season very often with no better shelter than that provided by small tents. Provincial Service Officers are trained to do the same work as Assistant and Deputy Conservators of the Imperial Service, but the distinction made between the two services are very great. As a matter of fact, the Provincial Service is created more as an inferior and subordinate service. The Provincial Service man is generally kept as an attached officer for long years, or often in charge of ranges and ultimately may hope to get a small division known as a minor charge. The Imperial Service Officer comes out, and in a year or so finds himself posted to the charge of a large division, placed perhaps over old and experienced men of the Provincial Service. The Provincial Forest Service men by being thus kept down for years in subordinate positions lose in efficiency, while the Imperial Forest Service men benefit by the opportunities they get of gaining experience in control work. Equal opportunities should be given to men recruited in India of showing their worth, and it is suggested that the officers of both services should be borne on one list, and the amalgamated members designated Assistant and Deputy Conservators without the prefix "Extra," which is quite unnecessary and only serves to separate the two services. Charges of divisions should go ordinarily by seniority in the proposed amalgamated list unless there be anything against any individual officer, and a senior member of the Provincial Forest Service should, as far as possible, not be placed, as is often the case at present, under a junior member of the Imperial Service.

Imperial and Provincial Officers should both be

5 November 1918.]

Mr. G. O. COOMBS.

[Continued.]

required to remain in actual charge of a range for at least one year to gain a thorough knowledge of the inner working of the Department, and a near acquaintance with the people they have to deal with and the staff, and should not be placed in charge of a division until they have had at least four years of active forest service in the Province. It is not merely sufficient to place an officer in nominal charge of a range as has sometimes been done in the case of some Imperial Service Officers, the real range work being carried out by the Ranger. The classification of Major and Minor Divisions is again a distinction which tends to separate the Imperial from the Provincial men, the Minor Division being considered the special province of the Provincial Service, and there being only four or five charges, the Provincial Forest Service men remain at a disadvantage, and do not get the same experience and opportunities as the Imperial men. It is suggested that this classification be abolished, and charges allotted accordingly to seniority as far as possible, the more important charges being held, as a rule, by the older and more able and experienced officers.

The practice in the United Provinces of placing young Imperial Forest Service recruits of barely one or two years' service in charge of Major Divisions in preference to Provincial Service men of many years' experience can hardly be in the interests of Government, owing to their inexperience of local conditions, and is also causing much dissatisfaction among the members of the Provincial Forest Service who find themselves kept down in this way.

The division of the controlling staff into upper and lower is another stigma of inferiority attached to the Provincial Service Officer, the duties and responsibilities being the same as regard control work, there seems no necessity for this invidious distinction.

The practice of confidential reports results sometimes in injustice, an officer having any serious comments made on his work or conduct which would result in stopping his promotion or spoiling his future prospects of advancement should be informed of the nature of his faults and given an opportunity of submitting an explanation in his defence. This principle is provided for in the case of Imperial Service Officers (Article 19, Forest Department Code, 7th edition), and the same rule should be made to apply to officers of the Provincial Forest Service. It seems most unfair to punish an officer merely on the strength of a confidential report which may have no real justification, or for which the officer concerned may be able to furnish a very satisfactory explanation.

There is practically no example in the whole of India in which the increment of a member of the Imperial Forest Service up to Rs. 1,250 has been stopped, but several men of the Provincial Service of the United Provinces have been denied the full pay due to them by the rules introduced by the last re-organisation, which has caused much dissatisfaction generally and left many with personal grievances owing to the interests of existing members not being sufficiently safeguarded. As an example, I might instance my own case where, on the introduction of the re-organisation scheme, I had to refund money which I had earned under the old rules, and arbitrarily deprived of my rank as Extra Deputy Conservator, in which post I was officiating.

At present there is only one Extra Deputy Conservator working in the Province, and, consequently, only one major charge is held permanently by the Provincial Service instead of three, and it would be only fair to the Service that the two posts of Extra Deputy Conservator, which have been vacant in the United Provinces since April, 1911, be filled up soon. A second major charge is held temporarily by an Extra Assistant Conservator and five minor charges by Extra Assistant Conservators, a total of seven divisional charges held by Provincial Service Officers against 12 major charges held by Imperial Service Officers. Any increase of establishment

sanctioned for the Department it is suggested should be made from officers trained in India, so as to give them a larger share in the working of the Department for which they are quite competent and well fitted.

66123. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The re-organisation scheme sanctioned in 1911, while introducing a time scale of pay, gave little general satisfaction, as while it provided a better opening for new recruits, it did not safeguard the interests of the existing members of the Service sufficiently, and took no account of the long years of service spent in many cases by men in the subordinate service under the old rules when they were obliged to work as Rangers before entry into the Provincial Service, even though they may have been fully qualified and fit for promotion and recommended for advancement, simply for want of vacancies in the Provincial Service and the special rules in force at the time, and for no fault of theirs. This means that many good men, who are just as able and well qualified as the new recruits, lose the advantage of much past service, which is not counted towards their increment according to the new rules brought into force, and will never rise to the highest grades of pay. This procedure is felt all the more keenly by the better officers, who see their future prospects marred for no fault of theirs; and this might be rectified.

Another point is the low rate of increment and the slow rate of promotion of the Provincial Forest Service when compared with the pay given to the Imperial Forest Service. Although both do the same work, instead of the Provincial Service salary being at least two-thirds of the Imperial, as is the general principle and is the case in the Public Works and Telegraph Departments, we get Rs. 20 a year increment against the Imperial Service Rs. 40 a year, and can only rise automatically up to Rs. 650 in 16 years after promotion to Extra Assistant Conservator, whereas the Imperial Service Officers rise automatically to Rs. 1,250 in 20 years. Further advancement for the Provincial Service needs special orders, and is subject to certain conditions which are liable to be differently applied at different times. It is suggested that the pay of the Provincial Service be reconstituted, as suggested in paragraph 66119, to give them a fair salary and do away with the disadvantages under which the present members of the service suffer.

Provision should certainly be made to give the old members of the Service the benefit of any increased rate of pay allowed by considering the whole of their service, and not only counting such portion since their promotion to the Provincial Service. Under the old rules a man was eligible for promotion from the Subordinate to the Provincial Service after five years of executive work as a Ranger if he passed the Dehra Dun Forestry course without honours, and after two years' service if he passed with honours. If an officer has been kept back longer than this period in the Subordinate Service for no fault of his, but merely on account of want of vacancies, he should in all fairness be allowed to count service for purposes of calculating his salary, according to the new scale, from such time as he was qualified and considered fit for promotion to the Provincial Service. If this provision is omitted deserving men will be greatly handicapped, and the old members of the Service will get little or no immediate benefit by any re-organisation, and will be greatly disappointed.

In the case of the Imperial Service, Assistant Conservators become Deputy Conservators as a matter of course after five years service, and there is no limit to the number of Deputy Conservators. Similarly, Provincial men, it is suggested, should rise to Deputy Conservators when they have put in 12 years' service and reached a salary of over Rs. 550. At present Provincial Service Officers in charge of Divisions are mostly all getting small salaries, and find it very difficult to manage and keep up a proper position. They have all had many years' service, and if a revision of salaries is

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. O. COOMBS.

[Continued.]

granted as suggested it will place them in a better position to support themselves properly, and enable them to meet the Officers of other Departments on an equal footing and keep up the prestige of the Department. In case of Officers getting less than Rs. 550 a month being posted to a division a charge allowance should be given to make up the difference in pay. If the pay of the Imperial Forest Service is increased, that of the Provincial Forest Service should be increased proportionately.

Rules and practice as regards giving and stoppage of increments should be the same for both services.

66129. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The rule that privilege leave cannot be allowed within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in respect of leave on medical certificate or on bona fide urgent necessity for Forest Officers, who have often to labour in malarious surroundings and isolation.

66130. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—Invalid and voluntary retirements on one-half of the average salary should be allowed after 20 and 25 years of service respectively, in consideration of the arduous life of a Forest Officer, who has to work in the forests under difficult conditions.

66131. (VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.—Indians and Anglo-Indians, although not debarred by the rules are practically excluded from the Imperial Forest Service. At present it is impracticable for men in India to compete for these appointments owing to the difficulty and expense of sending boys to England for education, while their parents are domiciled in India. If appointments in the Imperial Forest Service are not thrown open to India-trained Forest Officers without a training in Europe, it is suggested that a certain percentage of the posts be

reserved for the men from India, and facilities given them to qualify for them. It is suggested that Indian educational tests should be recognised and some standard set up in India equivalent to that required in England, and successful candidates deputed for a training in Europe. It is much to be hoped, however, that it will be held that India can give all the education and training necessary for the Department, and that the limitations imposed in 1891 by dividing the Service into Imperial and Provincial may be removed to give men from India a chance of rising to the top of the Service, even to the administrative rank of Conservators, if they can show their fitness, as is the case with the Public Works Department. In any case it is, I think, very necessary that there should be one list for all Officers of the Department, as in the Public Works Department, and equal opportunities given to Provincial Service Officers as their duties are the same as those of Imperial Officers.

66132. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—There is a difference in the scale of travelling allowance allowed Imperial and Provincial Officers, though the conditions of travelling are the same. In the Public Works Department the travelling allowances of both services, Imperial and Provincial are the same. Provincial Assistant Engineers getting the same pay as Extra Assistant Conservators are classed as First-Class Officers, though the latter are not when not in charge of Divisions. It is suggested that this inequality be removed, and the same rates of travelling allowance fixed for the Provincial Forest Service as exists for the Imperial Service.

It would be felt as a great boon if free medical attendance were allowed for the wives and children of Forest Officers, owing to the usually unhealthy places in which they have to live.

Mr. G. O. COOMBS called and examined.

66133. (Chairman). The witness said he attended before the Commission as the representative of the Provincial Forest Service in the United Provinces.

66134. As regards recruitment, his personal view was at variance with the recommendation put forward in the joint written statement. He thought the Service required, in a special degree, other than intellectual qualities, and that nomination would be of assistance in securing candidates with the necessary physical qualifications. There should be no recruitment from among Rangers. He did not think that the men who were now passing through the Ranger's course received the same training, or had the same qualifications as the men who entered the Provincial Service direct, and it would lower the status of the Service as a whole to draft in men from the subordinate ranks. He admitted that it had been the rule and practice to recruit the Provincial Service entirely from the Ranger class prior to 1907, but he thought the standard of training for the Ranger class had been lowered since that date. He did not consider the abolition of promotion from the Ranger class would have any injurious effect upon the recruitment of Rangers.

66135. Provincial officers had not been given the same opportunity as Imperial officers of showing whether they could carry out the work of an important charge. Only one officer in his Department had been placed permanently in a charge of this character. He suggested the abolition of the division into Imperial and Provincial Services, and the establishment of one superior service, although Provincial officers might be allowed two-thirds pay of Imperial officers taking equal length of service into consideration, which is not the case at present. Further promotion after 20 years' service is asked for to give the maximum salary of Deputy Conservators in 28 years against 20 years for Imperial officers, as noted in the written statements.

66136. The witness justified his proposal for a continuous time scale for Extra Assistants and

Extra Deputies on the ground that they did the same work, carried out the same duties, and had the same responsibilities when placed in command of charges. The Extra Assistant did exactly the same work as the Extra Deputy if he was placed in charge of a division. He did not mean to suggest that as a grade the Extra Assistants were taking the same responsibility and doing the same work as the Extra Deputies. What he meant was that Extra Deputies were given charge of major divisions, and Extra Assistants were given charge of minor divisions. The duties were essentially the same, but perhaps a larger division entailed more responsibility and more work. He agreed that one charge was much more limited in scope than another, but in some cases what was called a minor division might, in area, be larger than a major division. He admitted that the scope of importance and responsibility was not judged by area and that a minor charge could hardly be said to be of equivalent responsibility and importance to the major charge. He suggested a continuous time scale without any selection bar. He did not think there should be a point in the time scale where an officer must obtain promotion by selection before securing an advance of salary. The increment could be stopped if the officer was not efficient.

66137. The witness did not think officers in the Provincial Service took the leave to which they were entitled. They preferred to stay at their work.

66138. The ground on which the witness defended his proposal to reduce the term of service qualifying for optional retirement was that, after a period of 25 years, a man would probably find he was not as fit as he ought to be, and would like to retire.

66139. He thought Indians were anxious to enter the Forest Service; indeed it was, to his own knowledge, a popular service.

66140. With reference to his suggestion that one of the posts of Conservator should be thrown open to the Provincial Service, the witness said he felt

5 November 1913.]

Mr. G. O. COOMBS.

[Continued.]

satisfied that the training given in the Provincial Service would qualify an officer to occupy that position.

66141. (Mr. Gokhale.) The witness said he began his career in the Service as a Ranger, that being at the time the only way of entering the Provincial Service. He had had to undergo a training for two years at Dehra Dun before being appointed, and had served four and a quarter years in that subordinate class and two and a quarter years on deputation as Forest Officer of the Alwar State, before being promoted to the Provincial service. Before his promotion he had passed a departmental test as required by the rules which make it obligatory after appointment to the Provincial Service. According to the rules, if there were no vacancies, a man would probably have to wait 19 years before being promoted to an Extra Deputy Conservatorship, but if there were vacancies, he could be promoted as soon as he was found fit. As stated in the memorandum, it sometimes happened that Imperial officers who had had only 1½ year's service were put in command of major charges over the heads of men in the Provincial Service who had long periods of service to their credit. Their grievance was that although Provincial officers had been serving long enough to know their work thoroughly, they were con-

sidered unfit, where as an Imperial officer who had just come out, and who did not know the conditions of the country, was considered fit.

66142. (Mr. Sly.) The witness admitted that the effect of his proposal was to take away from members of the subordinate service the opportunities which they at present possessed of being promoted into the Provincial Service. That might seriously prejudice the subordinate service, but he thought the difficulty would be overcome by allowing subordinate officers to rise to Rs. 300 a month. He agreed that if the Imperial Service were to put forward the same proposal in regard to the Provincial Service, namely, that the Extra Deputy posts should be abolished, with some compensation in the form of salary, the Provincial Service would not like the idea at all.

66143. (Mr. Madge.) The witness stated that his reason for suggesting the abolition of the division into Provincial and Imperial officers was that as they did the same class of work the distinction should be one of salary alone according to the two-thirds rule. He knew it was the case in the Public Works Department that Provincial officers did exactly the same work and had the same responsibilities as Imperial officers, and that the distinction there was only one of salary.

(The witness withdrew.)

L. MERCER, Esq., President of the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun.

Written Statement relating to the Imperial Forest Service.

66144. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—Existing arrangements are not entirely satisfactory. Recruits arrive in India at too advanced an age, their physical efficiency is not always satisfactory, and their qualifications in respect of science degrees are not always of much use to them in their Indian career. Moreover, uniformity in training and in rate of recruitment are not attained.

It is considered that candidates should be selected after their 18th and before their 20th birthday, selection being followed by a strict medical examination, a physical test, and a competitive examination. The successful candidates should then undergo in Europe a course of training in forestry and allied subjects for a period of three years (including one year's practical training on the Continent). Selection under the age of 18 is not desirable as this would mean withdrawal from a public school at too early an age.

Owing to the lonely and frequently trying circumstances under which Forest Officers are obliged to serve, general character, a strong constitution, and a love of outdoor life and sport are of primary importance, and in the long run far outweigh academic distinctions. These qualities were conspicuous in the public school boys obtained under the old regulations. Under existing arrangements candidates are required to possess a university degree in some branch of natural science, which necessitates three years' residence at a university. Consequently a large number of desirable recruits are excluded who are compelled to obtain an appointment at the close of their school career, and who cannot afford the risk of a university education with no certainty of an appointment at its close. School recruits, moreover, reach India at an early age (21-22) years when they are able to adapt themselves more easily to the circumstances under which they have to serve. Such recruits also, as a rule, possessing no private means and no special qualifications for other employment, have no inducement to retire prematurely from the Service.

On the other hand, an advanced knowledge of certain branches of science, e.g., geology, is of little practical value in Indian forestry, while an expert in a particular branch of science is apt to find a large part of his routine forest work in India irksome and uninteresting. Advanced technical knowledge to be of most value in Indian forestry should

be acquired after an officer has obtained experience of Indian conditions, and not before. This is noted under III, below.

66145. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The probationary training should be carried out at one residential centre in England under the supervision of the Director of Indian Forest Studies in order to secure a uniform standard of instruction. The instructors should, so far as desirable, be Indian Forest Officers on the active list, who should be deputed from India for a period not exceeding five years, the period of deputation to count as service for an Indian pension. It is suggested that it be submitted for the consideration of the Home Authorities that the Director of Indian Forest Studies be also appointed their technical adviser. The Crown forests would thus have the benefit of his experience, while he would have a *locus standi* in these forests and would thus be in a better position to arrange for forestry training in Great Britain.

During the Continental training special care should be taken to see that students acquire a thorough working knowledge of a few systems of management which are considered most valuable for India, and of the difficulties met with in their practical application rather than a sketchy idea of a larger number. Either on the Continent or in the British Isles students should also be given, if possible, more individual practical work in forest engineering, especially as regards the laying-out and construction of hill-roads and of mechanical transport.

On arrival in India, recruits should be posted for the first year to those divisions in their respective Provinces which are considered to be the most advanced. The Divisional Officers in charge should be held responsible for seeing that during his first year in the country each recruit is given:—

(a) Facilities for acquiring the knowledge necessary for his departmental examination; and

(b) A thorough practical training in the work of an up-to-date Indian division coupled with an intimate knowledge of the working-plan or plans in force therein.

This procedure necessarily throws considerable extra work and responsibility on the Divisional Officers concerned, and each such selected officer might perhaps be given an extra monthly allowance of Rs. 50 for each recruit in his charge. In this way all recruits will be given an equal and favourable opportunity of adapting themselves to Indian conditions and of acquiring a sound knowledge

of Indian forest work. Lengthy tours in other divisions or other provinces are not required at this stage.

66146. (III) Conditions of Service.—In view of the fact that the management of our forests is daily becoming more intensive, there is a steadily increasing demand for higher technical knowledge on the part of our officers, and it is therefore most necessary that picked officers who have a special aptitude for any particular branch of their work, e.g., working-plans, botany, zoology, and so on, should be encouraged, so far as desirable, to specialise therein during their service. This can be done by allowing such officers to work at these subjects during periods of deputation at the Forest Research Institute, which might be advantageously combined with occasional tours in other provinces and with periods of study leave in Europe. Such special training should not commence, however, until an officer has had five years' service and experience of divisional work. In this way men would be brought forward who would be qualified to fill research appointments at Dehra Dun or in the Provinces, and officers of special promise would not have their keenness killed by the continuous monotony of ordinary divisional work. It is considered that this post—probationary higher technical study—is far more valuable than any attempt at such study during the probationary period. An officer, having acquired a good knowledge of Indian conditions, is in a position to know what the peculiar problems of greatest importance in our Indian forests are, and to what extent methods employed elsewhere are likely to be useful and practicable in India. To give full effect to this suggestion it may be necessary to increase the number of Imperial Service posts.

66147. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—There is a general feeling in the Department that the scale of pay is inadequate, and in certain cases it is below that which was recommended by the Government of India in 1905 and 1906. The quality and quantity of work which is demanded of the average officer, however, is advancing steadily as is also the cost of living. At the same time it is believed that the inadequacy of the pay makes itself felt chiefly by rendering it impossible to save with the object of supplementing the retiring pension. The knowledge that at retirement the pension is totally inadequate to maintain an officer in reasonable comfort and to provide a reasonable education for his children is a burden to the average officer throughout the best part of his service, and is liable to seriously handicap his work. It is therefore believed that a liberal policy in the way of increasing pensions, as suggested in VI. below, is of even greater urgency at present than any scheme of improved salaries.

Under present conditions the pay recommended by the Government of India in their despatches No. 371, dated the 2nd November, 1905, and 389, dated the 1st November, 1906, to the Secretary of State for India, may be regarded as the minimum likely to remove the sense of injustice which is unquestionably felt by the Officers of the Indian Forest Service at present. It is generally understood that the highest posts in the Service have been declined on more than one occasion; if this is so it may be taken for granted that the inadequate pay of the posts in question has influenced the decision of the officers concerned. If this state of affairs, which can hardly be considered as altogether desirable, is to be avoided in future, it seems essential that the increase of pay between executive and administrative ranks, between a Conservator and a Chief Conservator and between a Chief Conservator and the Inspector-General of Forests, should not be less than Rs. 500 per mensem. The present pay of the administrative posts in the Forest Department is insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain in the way they should their position as heads of departments, either with Local Governments or with the Government of India. It is held, therefore, that in future there should be two grades only of Conservator Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000, that

Chief Conservators should receive Rs. 2,500, and that the pay of the Inspector-General of Forests should be Rs. 3,000. Blocks in promotion among senior Deputy Conservators in individual Provinces should be dealt with on their merits.

66148. (V) Conditions of Leave.—As at present with the alterations suggested below:—

(a) A year's furlough to be available after the first four years' service, if the present rules are to be maintained; but it is suggested that they should be abolished and furlough (including combined leave) be granted whenever an officer can be spared. This will allow of much greater elasticity. If excessive furlough be applied for, which is unlikely as an officer's financial position is generally a bar to this, it can always be refused.

(b) A minimum furlough allowance of £400 a year or the salary last drawn on duty, which ever is less, up to a maximum of £1,000 per annum, following the precedent of Article 314, Civil Service Regulations for the Indian Civil Service.

(c) Commutation of long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay to be permitted.

66149. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—It has been pointed out in paragraph 66147 above that the salary does not permit of any material addition to the pension by means of savings during Indian service. The pension on the other hand is quite inadequate to enable an officer to maintain himself and family and to educate his children. The pension rules have not been altered for many years, and the depreciation of the rupee and the increased cost of living are factors which should be considered. The existing pensions and the proposed scale which is considered essential are given below:—

Years Completed Service.	Existing Pension.		Proposed Pension.	
	Class.	Annual Amount.	Class	Annual Amount.
10	Invalid	£ 88	Invalid	£ 120
11	"	123	"	160
12	"	158	"	200
13	"	193	"	240
14	"	228	"	280
15		228		320
16		263		320
17		263		360
18		263		360
19		263		400
20	Retiring	350		400
21		350		440
22		350		440
23		350		480
24		350		480
25		438	Retiring	500
26		438		520
27		438		540
28		438		560
and 3 Years as Conservator.		525		650
Chief Conservator and President, Forest Research Institute.		525		750
Inspector General.		525		800

It is an undoubted fact that a considerable number of officers now in the Service are understood to intend to retire at the earliest opportunity, i.e., after 20 years' service, and this is chiefly due to the fact that such officers see no prospect of obtaining a competence for themselves and families by continuing to serve in India, whereas employment elsewhere, while they still have health and energy, affords this opportunity. If the pensions

5 November 1913.]

Mr. L. MERCER.

[Continued.]

are raised as suggested there is no doubt that many men who, under existing conditions, intend to retire as early as possible, will elect to stay on.

It is held very strongly that all departments recruited in England should have their pensions fixed on a sterling basis, and that no justification exists for paying some England recruited departments on a sterling basis and others on a different basis, nor that such was ever the intention of Government when these pensions were fixed.

If the scale of pensions here proposed is adopted, Government should have the power compulsorily to retire any officer of 25 years' service or more who is considered inefficient.

As the Government of India had decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers could be passed until the Public Services Commission had completed their inquiries and submitted their report, it is urged that the case of all officers who retire subsequently to the date of the issue of the orders referred to and before the orders of Government on these recommendations are issued, retrospective effect should be given

whereby such officers may receive the benefit of any enhanced pensions which may be granted.

66150. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial; and (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—Any alterations are at present considered premature, though some may be necessary when the personnel of the Provincial Service has improved following on the better pay and prospects recently sanctioned for it.

66151. (IX) Other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not dealt with by the preceding heads.—The following points are also suggested for consideration:—

(a) A Service fund for widows and children.

(b) Free medical attendance for wives and families.

(c) Favourable passage rates in vessels.

(d) Actual expenses incurred on transfer, including those in connection with the transfer of an officers' family, should be reimbursed.

Mr. L. MERCER called and examined.

66152. (Chairman.) The witness explained that at Dehra Dun there was a College and an Institute which were quite separate from one another. The training of Rangers was carried out in the College, and Provincial Service officers were trained at the Institute, or would be when the buildings were completed. The syllabi of the two courses were somewhat similar, but the training in Forest subjects at the Institute was more advanced and was, as far as possible, given by experts in their special subjects. There were also two subjects which were included in the Institute course which were not included in the College course; one was Forest Zoology, which had been abolished for the Ranger class, on his recommendation, as being absolutely unnecessary; and the other was Working Plans. Rangers went through a two years' course, and were generally given, on their obtaining the requisite certificate, a post on Rs. 50. The course at the Institute was also for two years, but the classes there were kept entirely separate from the College classes. From the Institute men were appointed as probationary Extra Assistant Conservators; that was to say, probationers in the Provincial Service, the length of time for their probation being left entirely to the discretion of their local Governments. There were at the College quarters for about 80 students. When the Institute buildings were finished, the question of quarters for the students would have to be taken up. Students paid no fees whatever at the Institute and College, and Local Governments had the option of giving Provincial class students a stipend up to Rs. 100 a month, or a bonus on their passing out. The procedure actually adopted varied in the different provinces. In the United Provinces the Government had lately found that there was so large a demand for posts that it was unnecessary to give any stipend. In Burma, on the other hand, the Government had found it necessary to give a stipend. There were also private students who were taken into the Institute when vacancies occurred, and no fee was charged in their case either. These were men who could not obtain a nomination from any Local Government, but who desired a Forestry training in the hope of obtaining, sooner or later, some kind of suitable employment. There were also students from Native States. He had sole discretion as to the admission of students within the maximum number. There were Forestry Schools in the various provinces, but except in Burma and Madras they provided a training only for Deputy Rangers and Foresters, and he believed the instruction was given in the vernacular. He added that no students for Rangerships in Burma or in Madras were taken at Dehra Dun, as Burma and Madras had their own colleges for Rangers. The point to be aimed

at was the establishment of Rangers' colleges in all the provinces, in order to take away the Rangers from Dehra Dun, where they were not wanted. As a rule, Imperial officers did not come to Dehra Dun for further training to specialise in any subjects.

66153. The present courses were satisfactory both in the Institute and in the College. The Institute training was as good as could be given anywhere, except that the training grounds in India were very much inferior to those of Europe. In India there were no forests which had been under systematic management, as now understood, for more than 25 years. However the equipment of the Institute was improved, there would be a difficulty in the technical training for the next 50 years or more, on account of the Institute not having at its disposal forests that had been long enough under systematic management, necessary for the training of students. During the rainy season lectures were given, and the balance of the year was spent in the forests themselves. Apart from the disability he had just mentioned, the course at Dehra Dun was practically the same as that given on the Continent. He had never been enamoured of the system of training men at various centres in England; he thought the best system was to train them at one centre in order to obtain uniformity, with one year's practical training on the Continent. He did not consider that at that central institution all the teachers should be men who had had forest experience in India, but he was of opinion that some of them should be, and even if this could be arranged, he did not think the training system would be as good as that which was formerly in existence on the Continent.

66154. In his judgment, the students sent to Dehra Dun by the various local Governments were often unsuitable for the work they would have to do as Forest officers. He thought in certain cases the men were very indifferently selected, especially in the new Provincial Service class. He had had to complain frequently of the inefficiency of the students and of their want of general education. Last year, out of a class of 15 or 16 he had already weeded out three on account of their inability to follow the course. On the whole, there were very few failures to pass the final examination, but he did not think the final certificate was at all a difficult one. He would not at all object to seeing the educational standard of students joining the Provincial Service class raised. The communities from which students were drawn varied greatly in different provinces. There were very few Muhammadan students. He was inclined to think that there should be a competitive examination before the students were sent to Dehra Dun. In the case of Indian students the right class, if it existed,

5 November 1913.]

Mr. L. MERCER.

[Continued.]

did not seem to have yet been tapped. He thought the Provincial Service did not appeal very much to the right class of Indians; the recruits were often not educationally, socially, or at times physically, fit for the work. Asked whether local Governments had a large field of selection, he replied that the United Provinces Government received a very large number of applications, and he imagined that there were large numbers of applicants in the Punjab and the Central Provinces. In his opinion there was a considerable number of Indians who were desirous of getting appointments as rangers. He did not know what educational tests were in force for Provincial Service candidates; the local Governments had a wide discretion in this matter. It had been proposed that candidates should be graduates or Bachelors of Agriculture, but he was entirely opposed to any such proposal. As a concrete example, he mentioned that for the Rangers' course he had had within the last two or three years three graduates who had failed to get the ordinary Rangers' certificate.

66155. On the question of recruitment in England, the witness expressed the view that there should be a Forest Officer of administrative rank on the Board of Selection. He was not very keen on the reintroduction of the physical test as it used to be carried out, but he would lay some stress on the previous history of the candidate in sports and so on.

66156. The witness was against any scheme for reserving a certain number of posts for supplementary recruitment of Indians in India because he thought the Indian was, as a rule, unsuited to the Imperial Forest Service; he hated isolation, and he was not too fond of hard physical exercise. The Indian Provincial Service Officer so much disliked isolation that he consorted freely with his subordinates, to the weakening of his own authority.

66157. He suggested that officers under whom recruits were posted should be granted an allowance, because the work of instruction involved a good deal of hard work and responsibility. At present the Divisional Officer had so many duties to perform that he had not time to look after recruits properly. He did not say that even if such an officer were paid, a student would be given a thoroughly efficient training, but he thought it would go a long way towards it.

66158. There were rules under which Forest Officers could obtain study leave. They had to send in an application to the Government of India with a statement showing what they proposed to do in Europe. He thought, on the whole, the rules were satisfactory, but not much use was made of them. He was inclined to think it would be a good thing if they were used more freely.

66159. The witness thought that any scheme for the promotion of Indians from the Provincial to the Imperial Service would be premature, because the personnel of the Provincial Service as now constituted was unsatisfactory, and until it was seen how the Provincial Service was going to improve it was difficult to say whether promotions should be made on any large scale.

66160. In order to give effect to his scheme for specialisation in Botany and other subjects it would be necessary to employ an additional officer for each special branch of study.

66161. As regards pay and pension, his idea was that the best way to improve the conditions of the Service would be to increase pension rather than pay. He would not give Government unrestricted power to retire inefficient officers before 25 years' service.

66162. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) The witness said the method of selection of the candidate depended entirely on the various local Governments. If the local Government had a strong Conservator, they possibly left the selection very much in his hands. If it had not a strong Conservator, the

nomination would be in the hands of some high official of Government. He thought it would be more conducive to efficiency if there was in each province a recognised Board of Selection on which a Conservator would serve as ex-officio member, but he thought the Conservator would very likely be overruled by some high official of Government, who had some special man he wished to nominate. He thought a Board of the kind suggested would certainly be of assistance, but doubted whether it would be strong enough.

66163. The witness was of opinion that study-leave would be of great importance and assistance to an officer, and thought it should be given in addition to ordinary leave. If that were done, officers could be encouraged to prosecute their further studies.

66164. (Mr. Madge.) The witness said he had found that some members of the domiciled European and Anglo-Indian community who had not been educated in cities, but in the hills or elsewhere, did possess the qualities requisite for the Forest Service. He had found some most excellent boys in the hill schools. He did not consider that such boys should be handicapped because they did not possess university degrees. He thought it was the smaller proportion of domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians in the Department who came up to the desired standard, but that was not the fault of the boys, but of the method of selection. A better system of selection would attract a much better class of Anglo-Indian and domiciled European, but he did not think he could interfere in any way with the discretion of the local Governments in that respect.

66165. (Mr. Sly.) The witness agreed that the human element in the Forest Divisional Officer was almost of the same importance as the forest in which he was trained, but he thought it would be found that the most advanced divisions were as a rule held by selected officers.

66166. With regard to his scheme which provided for the grant of a maximum pension after 25 years' service, the witness expressed the view that an officer of 28 years' service was bound to have been made a Conservator if he was of any value. If he was not sufficiently good to be promoted to that rank, then he failed to see why he should get a bigger pension than was proposed under his scheme.

66167. With regard to the proposal that Chief Conservators and Conservators should be appointed as Secretaries or Joint Secretaries to Government, he said that in his opinion the local Governments would rather welcome a proposal of this kind, as it would take so much work off their own Secretariat.

66168. (Mr. Gokhale.) The witness said there were comparatively few forests in England that had been under systematic management for any number of years. That was the reason why students who desired to study forestry had to go to the Continent before 1885. With the exception of Oxford, the forestry schools in England were not sufficiently advanced, but latterly the school at Cambridge had made considerable progress. The absence of forests which had been for any length of time under systematic management handicapped the schools in England, and that was why students were sent to the continent. In answer to the question why the same course could not have been adopted in India, he replied that so far as his experience went, not sufficiently good Indian material was forthcoming in India for the Forest Department. The power of selection was vested in local Governments, because each local Government naturally desired to offer appointments to men in their own Province. He did not say it was impossible to find Indians who loved out-door life, but up to the present time he had not, except in one or two instances, found any well-educated Indians of this kind. He did not know whether that was the result of the present system of selection.

5 November 1913.]

Mr. L. MERCEN.

[Continued.]

66169. (Mr. Wrafter.) The witness said that Assistant Instructors performed somewhat similar duties to Instructors in the Imperial Service. He thought there would be no objection to their being termed Instructors inasmuch as their role was to assist the instructors, especially in camp. The expe-

rience of placing Provincial Service Officers in charge of the Ranger class had been tried some years ago, and had been absolutely condemned. The Provincial Officers were found to be absolutely unfit to take charge of the large Ranger class.

(The witness withdrew.)

R. McINTOSH, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Imperial Forest Service, containing the views of the officers of the Imperial Forest Service in the Punjab.*

66170. (I) Method of Recruitment.—The method of recruitment by selection in accordance with qualifications with a competitive examination amongst the selected candidates has given us men as good as any previously obtained from Nancy or Cooper's Hill. The present method, however, is not wholly satisfactory in that recruits now arrive in India at the age of 25 or 26 years, which is much too old. At this age it is not easy for men to settle down to learn the details of their work, often seemingly trivial, yet nevertheless essential; and they are apt to be dissatisfied at not being placed in responsible positions sooner than they are. Also, unless they enjoy perfect health throughout their service the chances are against men who join at such an advanced age being able to serve long enough to get the higher pensions.

Too much stress is laid on probationers having a Science degree, which, to the majority of them, will never be of any use. The advantages of a university education are undoubtedly, but the requirements of the Forest Service, being what they are, it would be preferable to go back to the previous method of recruitment and get youths fresh from the Public Schools, and to give them a special forest training. Such candidates as showed special aptitude for any Science could, if considered desirable, receive an additional year's training in that Science; but it would be better where specialists are needed in any Science, e.g., Chemistry or Zoology or Botany, to obtain them by the recruitment of special men. This method of recruiting candidates of from 17 to 19 years of age, which was tried after Cooper's Hill was closed, failed because at that time a career in the Forest Department was not sufficiently attractive; now that the pay and prospects of the Forest Officers have been improved in many respects, it is thought that there will be no difficulty in obtaining the necessary recruits.

As the life of the Forest Officer is one of greater physical exertion than that of an officer of any other service in India, except perhaps those of the Survey Department, and he has fewer opportunities of obtaining medical treatment or advice, it is essential that he should be constitutionally stronger, and the test of physical fitness of recruits for the Forest Services should therefore be of the strictest. The importance of this point appears to have been overlooked in recent years.

66171. (II) Systems of Training and Probation.—The present system of training Forest probationers at several universities has only recently come into force, so one cannot as yet judge by results; but it does not appear likely to prove so satisfactory as the former system of training all the recruits at one centre, whether Cooper's Hill College or Oxford University. The number recruited annually is so small that it seems improbable that a satisfactory training, suitable for Indian conditions, can be provided at more than one institution. Besides, it tends to the better efficiency of the service if all its members receive the same technical training.

The present practical training in the Continental forests is satisfactory. The probationers should visit as many varieties of forests as possible, and

study their systems of management, modes of extracting and utilising the produce, etc., etc.

As regards the employment of the recruits on first joining in India, there appears to be nothing to add to the general instructions issued by the Government of India on this subject.

66172. (III) Conditions of Service.—It has been mentioned in paragraph 66170 above that a Forest Officer leads a more (physically) strenuous life than an officer of any other service in India, except perhaps the Survey Department, and that he has not the same opportunities of obtaining medical advice and treatment. As a proof of the extraordinary casualties to which the Forest Service is exposed, it is only necessary to refer to an article in the "Indian Forester" for November, 1912, in which it is shown that out of 49 officers recruited between the years 1877 and 1886 20 are dead, five have left the service without pensions, five are drawing reduced pensions, only five are drawing the full pension, and 14 are still in the service. The ages of the officers who joined between the years 1877 and 1886 would range from 49 to 59 years.

Under the conditions of his service the Forest Officer has to spend long periods by himself, and is practically deprived of most of the amenities of social life, added to which, owing to the refusal of the Secretary of State to sanction a second Conservatorship for the Punjab, the work of the present Conservator is of absolute drudgery, and owing to the gazetted staff being undermanned, the officers in charge of the larger divisions are overworked. The present charges in the hill tracts of the Punjab are as large, and at the same time contain forests of such importance from the sylvicultural point of view, that it is quite impossible for the officer in charge to deal efficiently with many important works. In such cases the mere routine work of his charge absorbs a very great part of his time, with the result that important works have time after time and year by year to be postponed for lack of time to carry them out—a state of affairs which must obviously be detrimental to the forests. This state of affairs requires to be remedied as soon as possible if (1) the Forest Officer is to be rendered reasonably contented with his lot and (2) the Province is to be in a position to develop its forest resources to the best advantage. The only remedy that suggests itself is an early increase in the cadre of the Imperial Forest Service in the Punjab. Officers with European training are, it is considered, a *sine quâ non* since the important hill charges of the Punjab contain important coniferous forests, the sylvicultural treatment of which is on general lines precisely similar to that of the large coniferous forests of Europe.

66173. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—No scale of pay below that recommended by the Government of India in their Despatches No. 371, dated 2nd November, 1905, and No. 389, dated 1st November, 1906, can, under the conditions at present prevailing, be regarded as adequate or likely to remove the sense of injustice which, there can be no doubt, is felt by officers of the Imperial Forest Service. It has been stated that some of the highest posts in the service have been refused by Officers on more than one occasion, and if this is the case, the insufficient and, indeed, quite inadequate, pay of these posts has undoubtedly been the largest, or at least a very large, point which has influenced these officers in their decision. It is not possible for Officers of adminis-

* Signed by Mr. J. Copeland, Conservator of Forests, Punjab, on behalf of the Imperial Forest Service officers of the Punjab.

5 November 1913.]

Mr. R. MCINTOSH.

[Continued.]

trative rank to maintain their position as Head of Departments either with Local Governments or with the Government of India on their present pay. Moreover, it is considered essential that there should be a difference of at least Rs. 500 per mensem between the pay of officers of executive and administrative rank, between the pay of a Conservator and of a Chief Conservator, and between the pay of a Chief Conservator and of the Inspector-General of Forests. In the opinion of the Department the pay of Officers of administrative rank should be as follows:—

Conservators (two grades only).—

Per mensem.	Rs.
2nd grade	1,750
1st grade	2,000
Chief Conservator	2,500
Inspector-General of Forests ...	3,000

While admitting that the pay of the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service was considerably improved by the time-scale of pay which was sanctioned by the Secretary of State for India in his Despatch No. 229, dated 21st December, 1906, yet there has prevailed a feeling of some discontent and even irritation on some minor points in the sanctioned scheme. It is thought, in the first place, that the scheme does not err on the side of liberality as regards pay in the early years of an Officer's service. It is generally felt that at least Rs. 400 should be paid to an officer on joining the service, and that his salary should then rise by annual increments of Rs. 50 per mensem until it amounted to Rs. 1,250 in the 18th year of service. Again, there is a great feeling of irritation over the proviso which prevents an officer appointed to the service before the 1st January, 1909, drawing his increment until the 1st of the month following that on which it is earned. Though this may seem a small point, yet the cancellation of the exception to Article 151 (as amended by correction Slip No. 178) of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th Edition, would undoubtedly cause great satisfaction to all Officers affected thereby. The following representation made by Mr. H. M. Glover, Assistant Conservator of Forests, an officer trained at Oxford University, is inserted as expressing a grievance which may be held by other officers of his standing:—

"Prior to 1905 probationers were trained for the Forest Service at Cooper's Hill, and a capable man was able to complete his training and enter service in India by the time he was 21 years of age. In 1905 probationers were recruited from Oxford and other Universities and were desired to take an Honours Degree in Natural Science. This necessitated at least three years at Oxford, and in addition another year had to be spent in Germany in order to obtain a Diploma of Forestry and to qualify for service in India. This actually meant that no probationer could hope to reach India before he was 23 years of age—two years later than he would have done if he had gone through Cooper's Hill.

"He has thus had two years expensive extra training and finds himself two years behind men of his own age already in the service. He feels the effects of this throughout his service as he draws pay on a time scale and suffers a handicap from the very beginning owing to his forced late entry. I would suggest that all men who entered the Forest Service in 1905 and the immediately succeeding years and who did obtain the honours degree asked for be allowed to draw pay on the existing time scale at the same rate as if they had entered the Forest Service two years earlier. In the Army seniority is given to University candidates, and I suggest that the conditions are similar."

66174. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The proposals for the revision of the existing leave rules contained in Government of India letters No. 538 C.S.R., dated 13th September, 1912, and No. 674 C.S.R., dated 19th October, 1912, would be generally acceptable to officers of the Forest

Department in the Punjab with the following further amendments:—

(1) The restriction on the amount of privilege leave earned (*vide proviso* to article 246 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition) should be removed or at least privilege leave might be allowed to accumulate up to six months.

(2) The time taken by an officer to reach Bombay or Karachi, whichever is nearest by the shortest route, should be added to the period of privilege leave, thus putting all officers in India on the same footing.

(3) The suggestions as to the commutation of furlough on half pay to furlough for shorter periods on full pay contained in paragraph 4 of the Government of India letter No. 538, dated the 13th September, 1912, are cordially welcomed by the Forest Department, and it is hoped that some such scheme will recommend itself to the Members of the Royal Commission.

(4) There is a strong feeling throughout the Service that the minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should at least follow the ratio adopted between the Indian Civil Service and other Services for the maximum furlough allowance, *i.e.*, this minimum should be £400 per annum or the salary last drawn on duty whichever is less. This recommendation represents the minimum demand of the service and many Forest Officers are of opinion that furlough allowances should be the same as those granted to the Indian Civil Service. It has been pointed out that the furlough allowance of an officer with eight years' service is under £280 a year and this, it is clear, is not enough to enable an officer to support himself in any comfort while on furlough.

66175. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The present pension rules are most unsatisfactory, and recently nearly the whole of the officers of the Imperial Service have memorialised the Secretary of State for India on the subject. It is believed that these memorials are now in the hands of the Royal Commission. In the year 1870 or thereabouts the pension allowed to all Civil Services after 25 years' service was £500 or Rs. 5,000 a year at which time these sums were identical. Now owing to the fall in the value of silver this pension is only worth £333 a year if drawn in India, and with the value of the rupee fixed at 1s. 9d. if drawn in England £437 10s. Moreover, the present scale of pensions was fixed *more than 35 years ago* since when the cost of living in England has admittedly risen to a very great extent. Moreover, the present scale of pensions for officers of the Imperial Service is disproportionately small compared with that recently sanctioned for officers of the Provincial Service. An officer of the latter service who serves for two years in the highest grade of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests can earn a pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum, that is to say, exactly the same pension as any Imperial Service Officer except the Inspector-General of Forests, a Chief Conservator or a Conservator who has put in 28 years' service. It must surely be considered just that an officer of the Imperial Service who has undergone an expensive training in Europe, who spends his life in a country far distant from his home, often under climatic conditions most trying to and indeed often entirely unsuited to the European, and whose standard of living is necessarily a far more expensive one than that of the native of India, should draw a pension much larger than that drawn by a Provincial Service Officer. Further, the present scale of pensions compares most unfavourably with the sterling pensions paid to other Scientific Departments, such, for instance, as the Indian Medical Service—a Service composed of men of the same social standing as an Imperial Service Forest Officer and of very similar attainments.

There is a strong feeling throughout the Imperial Service that officers should be paid sterling and not rupee pensions. Any pension scheme should be a graduated one so as to give officers sufficient inducement not to retire too early at a time when they are often of most value to Government. The

5 November 1913.]

Mr. R. MCINTOSH.

[Continued.]

following scale of pensions is put forward for the consideration of the Royal Commission: there is a very strong feeling among a large number of officers that, in view of the exceptional conditions under which they work and the large number of casualties that occur in the Imperial Service, the minimum pension after 20 years' service should be £500 per annum:—

Ordinary pensions—	Per annum.
After 20 years' service	£500
After 25 years' service	600
After 28 years' service or 3 years as Conservator	700
Extra for 3 years' service as Chief Conservator or President, Forest Research Institute	50
Extra for 3 years' service as Inspector-General of Forests	100

Invalid pensions would be calculated at the rate of £25 for each completed year of service up to 20 years' service.

If the above pensions are granted, Government should have the power of retiring compulsorily on the pension which he has earned any officer of 25 years' service or more who is deemed inefficient.

As the Government of India has decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers can be passed until the Royal Commission has completed its inquiry and submitted its report, it is urged that in the case of an officer who retires subsequently to the date of the issue of the orders referred and before the orders of Government on the Commission's recommendations are issued, retrospective effect should be given whereby such an officer may receive the benefit of an enhanced pension if such be sanctioned.

66176. (VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing

system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—As there are no limitations placed on the entry of natives of India into the Imperial Service there is nothing to be said on this point. Entry into the Imperial Service is open to Indians under exactly the same conditions as to Europeans except with reference to marriage, where the Indian has the advantage of the European. No alterations are necessary or advisable.

Any increase in the numbers of the Provincial as compared with the Imperial Service is quite inadvertent and would necessarily mean a loss of efficiency since the training obtained in Europe, with its highly organised and developed forest estates, by an Imperial Service Officer, is necessarily of a much higher standard than anything that is at present possible in India, where Scientific Forestry is a science still very much in its infancy.

66177. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and with other Services.—The existing system which makes the Forest Officer for all practical purposes the assistant in forest matters to the District Officer has been evolved after very careful consideration of the subject by the Local Government, and on the whole works with great smoothness. It is not desired that any change in this system be introduced in the Punjab.

66178. (IX) Other points.—Considerable loss is often incurred by officers owing to the inadequacy of the amount of travelling allowance allowed in cases of transfer from one station to another—a long distance away. It is suggested that actual expenses might be paid to Imperial Service Officers subject to provisos which would follow *mutatis mutandis* those which apply to non-gazetted officers on transfer (*vide* article 1009 of Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition)

Mr. R. MCINTOSH

66179. (Chairman.) The witness said he attended before the Committee to endorse the views of his colleagues in the Imperial Service. The memorandum represented the views of the 14 officers at present serving in the Punjab; the Punjab officers at Dehra Dun had not been consulted. The witness saw no objection to the proposal that a certain proportion of probationerships in the Imperial Forest Department should be reserved for Indians selected in India, the Indian probationer taking the same course in England and on the Continent as the European, provided only that the material was sufficiently good. His opinion was that the material obtained so far was not likely to benefit to the full extent by a training in England. He did not think the promoted Ranger, who formed the bulk of the Provincial Service was of the right class. He had no doubt that under the new system of direct recruitment there would be a marked improvement in the class of officers, but it was very difficult to say at present how great that improvement would be. If it was found desirable to give facilities to a certain number of Indians to enter the Imperial Service, he would prefer that they should enter young and be sent to England for their training, and go through the course which the Imperial Service now went through.

66180. He was very much in favour of a reduction of the age for admission to the Imperial Service. At present men came out between the ages of 24 and 25, and their character was already greatly formed, and they were naturally inclined to resent not being given important work at once. He thought the earlier Europeans came out to India the more easily they acquired the language. If men were recruited at the school-leaving age, he did not think it was necessary that all of them should have a training in advanced science. He thought in a great many cases men made comparatively little use of their scientific knowledge in after life. That, of course, did not apply to those who subsequently specialised. A certain training in science was absolutely necessary, but

called and examined.

an Honours degree in Science was not necessary. He would like to see the probationary course extended, partly at some centre where there was a Forestry school and partly on the Continent. He thought there should be at least a year's practical training on the Continent. He did not think seven months was sufficient. He preferred a system of nomination followed by examination for the Imperial Service. The present Board of Selection was quite a competent authority, provided there was somebody on it with an intimate knowledge of recent Forest work in India. He would like to re-establish the physical test. He did not think it was necessary that a probationer for the Imperial Service should spend a portion of his time in India. The course he went through after arrival in India did all that was necessary. There was no advantage in bringing a man out before he had finished what he could learn in England. The conditions of forestry in India were entirely different from those in Europe, but he considered the training that a recruit received in Europe would give him the grounding in the principles of forestry which would enable him to assimilate the different conditions of India with comparative ease in the course of his first year. Newly entered officers were made to pass a Departmental test within two years after their arrival. He thought the examination was adequate.

66181. The witness considered it inadvertent from the point of view of the efficiency of the Service that men should be encouraged to leave the Service after 20 years. It meant that a man had the opportunity of leaving when he was of most value to Government. If the age for entry were reduced, the disadvantage would present itself in a still more accentuated form. In reply to a question whether many officers took advantage of the 20 years concession, the witness replied that he would take as an instance his own year. Out of 11 officers who came out in 1890, three had died, two had retired with 20 years' service, one had resigned, and five were still in the service. He understood from his brother

5 November 1913.]

Mr. R. MCINTOSH.

[Continued.]

officers that many of them were likely to take advantage of the option of retiring at 20 years if the present conditions of service continued. Very few officers remained in the Service after the age of 55. He thought if the scale of pensions were improved, his colleagues would be prepared to come into line with the other Services in regard to the period of retirement. He thought there would be advantages in a system which would provide for payment of retiring allowances, partly in the form of a pension and partly in the form of a lump sum as gratuity. As far as he knew, all the officers in the Punjab contributed 12½ per cent. to the General Provident Fund. He thought a Family Pension Fund would be very popular amongst officers if they were just joining the Service. He did not think many officers of his acquaintance would be prepared to contribute compulsorily to both funds, but he thought if a Family Pension Fund was established, there should also be a voluntary Provident Fund.

66182. (Mr. Gokhale.) The witness said that an average Imperial officer ought to be ready for real work in 18 months after arriving in India. Replying to a question whether he thought the conditions of entry into the Service were the same for Indians and Europeans, the witness replied that at present there was this difference that the examination in the one case was held in the Europeans' native country, and in the case of the Indian it was held in a foreign country. He thought that made a very great difference. If it had been necessary in his own case to come out to India, to take a College course and to appear at an examination, the prospects being what they were, he should not have entered the Service.

66183. (Mr. Sly.) The witness said that in the opinion of the majority of the officers in the department pension should be payable after 20 years' service, and if the 20 years' service rule were abolished it would be considered to be a grievance by the officers in the Department. He had been

specially asked to press that the rule should not be abolished.

66184. In the Punjab the initial selection of candidates from the Provincial Service rested with the Conservator, who recommended names to the local Government. The local Government then made a selection from amongst the men recommended by the Conservator. With regard to the statement made by the President of the Dehra Dun College that the Provincial Forest Service was more popular in the Punjab than in some other Provinces, the witness said his personal opinion was that in the Punjab there was the best material at present for the Provincial Service. He had found some of the hill men excellent. They, of all the different Indian races he had had to deal with, seemed to like an out-door life, and were not afraid of hard physical exertion. Unfortunately, however, their general educational standard was low. So far, candidates had not come forward in the Punjab who possessed both physical and educational qualifications, but possibly if the conditions of the Service were altered, or made sufficiently enticing, a better class of men might be obtained in the Punjab.

66185. He thought the opinion of the officers in the Punjab was that the improvement most urgently required was an increase of pension. So far as he knew the junior officers of the Service would unanimously prefer that their terms of pension, rather than their terms of pay, should be improved, but he was not perfectly sure about that point.

66186. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) The witness said that if, as a boy, he had had the alternative put before him of serving in England in a lower service or of coming out to India to study, with the object of finally returning to England and serving in a higher branch of the Service, he would not have given the matter a moment's consideration and would unhesitatingly have accepted the latter alternative.

(The witness withdrew).

PANDIT GOKUL DAS, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab.

Written Statement* relating to the Provincial Forest Service.

66187. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—Candidates for the Provincial Forest Service should hold a degree of B.Sc. of an Indian University. A reference to paragraph 17 of the Syllabus for the Provincial Service will show that without a preliminary training in Science probationers are not able to complete an advanced course of training within a reasonable time. The selection of probationers for the Provincial Service should then be made by the Conservator. Another alternative is to select the candidates and to hold a competitive examination. The examination should be in English, Mathematics, and Science.

The present system of filling up vacancies in the Provincial Forest Service by competent and clearly deserving members of the Subordinate Service to the extent of 50 per cent. may continue until Forest Rangers recruited under the rules in force before the introduction of the Provincial Service course have been pensioned off, and after that only specially efficient Forest Rangers should be appointed to the Provincial Service by Government, and then there will be no use of any fixed percentage.

66188. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The preliminary course of five months of practical training before admission to the Forest College at Dehra Dun should be reduced to three months. The probationers should then undergo a training for two years at the Forest College,

Dehra Dun, at Government expense. The successful probationers should then be placed for one year in charge of a Range and for one year on special works. During this probationary period of two years they should get Rs. 150 per mensem, as at present.

After this the probationers should be appointed to the Forest Department, without any further period of probation. The period of two years is quite enough to determine whether a probationer is fit for the Forest Department or not. It is worth mention that in the Punjab the number of probationers is greatly in excess of the requirements, viz., there are eight probationers for a Provincial Service cadre of nine posts. When it is considered that 50 per cent. of the posts ought to go to Forest Rangers already in service before the Provincial Service started, the chances of all of the probationers getting permanent posts within a reasonable time are very remote. Why so many probationers were nominated is due to the fact that the revised scheme for increasing the number of Provincial Service posts in anticipation of sanction of which these probationers were nominated was eventually dropped, or is perhaps still under consideration. Under these circumstances it is just and fair that the probationers who are not appointed Extra Assistant Conservators after three years' probation should get a personal allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem to enable them to maintain themselves in a fitting position.

66189. (III) Conditions of Service.—We are of opinion that the Forest staff, comprising both the Imperial and Provincial Services, should be borne on one amalgamated list, as is the case in the Public Works Department. The prefix

* Signed on behalf of the Provincial Forest Service Officers of the Punjab by Messrs. Gokul Das and Fazl-ud-Din, Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests, and Mr. Muhammed Said, Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

5 November 1913.]

PANDIT GOKUL DAS.

[Continued.]

"Extra" is not in use in either of the Medical, Police, Education or Public Works Department. This prefix lowers the prestige of the Provincial Forest Service.

We are also of opinion that officers of the Provincial Forest Service should be eligible for the highest rank at present open only to Imperial Service officers.

The division of the controlling staff into "Upper" and "Lower" should be abolished. This will give great satisfaction to the officers of the Provincial Forest Service.

66190. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The present time-scale pay system of promotion is a great improvement, but, considering the hardships of the Forest Service, the pay is still insufficient. Forest officers have to serve in out-of-the-way places and in localities that are not always healthy and are away from medical aid. Besides, in places where they have to pass the greatest part of their lives there are no educational facilities for their children, and they have, therefore, to send them to schools at places considerably distant from where they live; and, considering the cost of living, which is daily increasing, it is proposed that an Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests should start at Rs. 250 per mensem, rising with an annual increment of Rs. 30 per mensem to Rs. 1,000. Officers should be called Assistant Conservator of Forests up to Rs. 550 grade, and Deputy Conservators of Forests after that.

Under the present rules there are several disadvantages from which the Provincial Forest Service suffers:—

(a) The number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests which have been allotted in several provinces for the Provincial Service officers is very limited, whereas on the Imperial list there can be as many Deputy Conservators as there are officers entitled to the pay of that grade under the time-scale system of increment. This limitation should be removed.

(b) The restrictions laid down in paragraph 11 (c) of Government of India resolution No. 17-F.—77-33, dated the 23rd June, 1911, Revenue and Agricultural Department, regarding the promotion of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests from Rs. 650 to Rs. 700, from Rs. 700 to Rs. 800, and from Rs. 800 to Rs. 850 should be removed. The Local Government has already the power to stop the increment of any officer at any stage.

The Provincial Service Forest Officers feel that the scale of pay of the Imperial Service Forest Officers is rather low. The starting pay at Rs. 380 should be raised to at least Rs. 400 and rise to Rs. 1,500 for Deputy Conservator of Forests. The prestige of a Department is judged from the emoluments of the officers. Besides the increase in the cost of living, it is worth noting that only a very small percentage of officers rise to administrative ranks. The pay of Conservators should be the same as that of an Inspector-General of Police or Chief Engineer, Public Works Department.

66191. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The provisions for the grant of leave proposed in Government of India No. 674 C. S. R. (Finance Department), dated the 19th October, 1912, are generally suitable. But, instead of five years' furlough, we would prefer three years in 25 years' service, provided the whole of it counts towards pension.

Furlough should be admissible at shorter intervals, say, five years, and not eight years, as is the case at present. The grant of furlough of one and a half years on fully pay, instead of three years on half pay, would be better still.

The Provincial Service Officers think that the furlough allowance should in no case be less than three-fourths of the pay which an officer is drawing at the time he takes furlough.

In the case of officers serving in the hills, such as Kulu, Bashahr, etc., the date of departure and arrival should be considered the date when an officer starts from or arrives at the nearest railway station.

The restriction on the amount of privilege leave (vide proviso to article 216 of the Civil Service Regulations) should be removed, or at least privilege leave might be allowed to accumulate up to six months.

66192. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—It is suggested that an invalid pension owing to untimely breakdown of health should be fixed in the following ratio: One-third of salary after 10 years' service, and half after 20 years, and retiring pension after 25 years instead of 30 years.

66193. (VII) Limitation in the Employment of non-Europeans and the Working of the Existing System of Division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.—There are no limitations to the employment of non-Europeans in the Provincial Forest Service, but there are practical difficulties in the way of Indians for entering the Imperial Forest Service. For instance:—

(i) Language.—No provision exists in the present day Indian Educational Institutions for the teaching of French or German. This means that an Indian who wishes to join the Imperial Forest Service should go to England at a very tender age, which is impracticable.

(ii) The condition that a candidate must have passed with honours in a public examination for a degree in some branch of natural science held by a University of Great Britain or Ireland, is another block in the way of the Indians. Unless an Honours degree of an Indian University is recognised by the rules, in the majority of cases Indians have no chance of entering the Imperial Forest Service.

(iii) The age-limit also stands in the way of the Indians. Few Indians take their degrees at 22. The age-limit should be raised to 23.

As we propose only one amalgamated list of Imperial and Provincial officers, the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial should be abolished. There is no doubt that, as at present understood, the Provincial Service is considered to be inferior to the Imperial Service.

66194. (VIII) Relations with other Departments.—The existing system of making the Forest Officer Assistant to the District Officer is working well, and no changes are required.

66195. (IX) Other points.—All officers drawing above Rs. 500, whether they are or are not in charge of a Division, should get first-class travelling allowance.

In cases of transfers, the travelling allowance should be regulated according to the provisions of article 1098 of the Civil Service Regulations. At present considerable loss is caused to married men on account of transfers from one district to another.

PANDIT GOKUL DAS called and examined.

66196. (Chairman.) The witness said the written statement which had been submitted to the Commission contained the views of the large majority of the officers in the Service. He had no opinion to express in regard to recruitment for the Provincial Service other than what was set forth in the written statement, where a scheme was proposed for examination and nomination. He regarded selection as of great importance, but there were some of his colleagues who said that there should be a

purely competitive examination. He desired to see the system of nomination retained because men were sometimes obtained by competition who were not suitable for the Forest Service. Although they might be graduates, they might not be fit on other grounds. He did not think hill men would have much chance of entering the Service by competitive examination, as their education was much below that of the men on the plains. He thought, however, that the hill men were a valuable element in

5 November 1913.]

PANDIT GOKUL DAS.

[Continued.]

the Service, provided they had a sufficient knowledge of English and Mathematics, and also that they were able to follow the course at Dehra Dun.

66197. He did not think that a certain number of vacancies in the Imperial Service should be reserved for recruitment in India. He thought that, so long as the difficulties mentioned in paragraph 15 of the written statement were not removed, men should rise from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service, and that there should be one list only.

66198. The witness said he had been in charge of a major division for the last few years. He had held hill divisions and plain divisions. He had also held the post of Personal Assistant to the Conservator, and had also done some working plans. His responsibilities and powers were the same as those of an Imperial officer. The post he occupied was regarded as an important one among the major charges.

66199. The practical training in Forestry given to selected Provincial candidates before their admission to Dehra Dun, consisted simply of three or four months' attachment to a division, in order to see whether they were fit to work in a forest or not. As to whether the probationary period of training subsequent to the Dehra Dun course was satisfactory, the witness said his proposal was to send the probationers for nine months to Europe. That would be a great advantage, although it was not absolutely necessary for the discharge of a Divisional Officer's duty. There had been Conservators and even Chief Conservators who had had no European training or experience. He had had no European experience, but he thought such experience would have been of great advantage to him. There was no opportunity of taking study-leave to Europe at present. That privilege was confined to the Imperial Service.

66200. Generally speaking, officers of the Provincial Service did not take the leave to which they were entitled, because the leave allowances were so small that officers could not maintain their families. He would very much like to see an improvement in the leave rules. The point was that men required leave at special periods. For instance, when any one of his sons or daughters married, an officer would like to have six months' leave for preparation, and under the present rules he could not get it. It would conflict with the work of the Service.

66201. With regard to pensions, he would like to see a pension equal to one-third of salary after 10 years' service, a pension equal to one-half of salary after 20 years, and a retiring pension after 25 years instead of 30. The opinion of the majority of his colleagues was that 30 years was too long for an officer to serve in the Forest Department, but personally he differed from them. He thought 30 years was not too much for an officer in his own country. He had been serving 32 years. Many

officers died during the period of their service in the Punjab.

66202. Officers, especially those with families, suffered hardship from the present system of transfers and travelling allowances. Transfers were very frequent, especially in the case of junior officers.

66203. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The career of a Forest officer did appeal to Indians, and they liked the life. That was borne out by the number of applications for such posts in the Punjab. Recently there had been 75 applications for five posts of Rangers. For the Provincial Service there had not been any applications during the last two or three years for certain reasons which were set out in his written statement. So far as the Punjab was concerned he thought it was the conditions of Service rather than the nature of the Service that kept Indians from entering it.

66204. (*Mr. Sly.*) Officers of the Service considered that their pay and pension were in most need of reform. He desired the reduction of the practical test prior to entry at Dehra Dun from five months to three months, because really the practical test was no training at all; it was simply a means of finding out whether a man liked the Forest Service or not, and for that purpose three months was as good as five months.

66205. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said his present salary was Rs. 600. If he had been an Imperial Service officer of the same standing his salary would have been Rs. 1,250. He entered the Service under the old rules. He had been in the Provincial Service, strictly so-called, for about 15 years and he had served two years as Extra Deputy Conservator.

66206. He proposed that the distinction between the Provincial and Imperial Services should be abolished, but that the rate of salaries should remain the same. At present the Provincial officers received two-thirds of the salary of the Imperial Service officers. They did not complain of that. If, however, arrangements were made at Dehra Dun for the training of young men who desired to get into the Imperial Forest Service and they were then sent to Europe and were finally admitted to the Service on the same terms as English officers, then he considered they should get the same rate of pay as Imperial Service officers. He certainly thought that if facilities were offered to Indians to rise to the higher appointments, a number of Indians would be forthcoming who were qualified both physically and educationally for those posts.

66207. (*Mr. Hill.*) The witness said that one and a half year's furlough on full pay instead of three years' furlough on half pay would be adequate for an Indian. With regard to his statement that on occasions officers required six months' leave, he thought that privilege leave should be allowed to accumulate up to that period.

(The witness withdrew.)

19 January 1914.]

At Calcutta, Monday, 19th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

WALTER CULLY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SIX, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

J. W. A. GRIEVE, Esq., Deputy Conservator of
Forests.

E. A. C. MODDER, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

H. S. GIBSON, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department,
being a Memorandum on behalf of the Imperial
Forest Service in Bengal.

66205. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—The age at which men are taken as probationers to the Imperial Forest Service is at present so high that it is often difficult for them to put in the necessary service to qualify for the maximum pension. The present stipulation that a man must possess a University Degree in Science should be abolished and the age limits for probationers should be fixed at 18 to 20 years. A lower age is undesirable as the men would not be sufficiently developed by the end of their training to withstand the Indian climate properly.

It is of the greatest importance that all probationers should be required to pass a very strict medical examination in addition to a searching physical test.

Candidates should be selected in order to weed out unsuitable men. If the number of suitable candidates is greater than the number of vacancies to be filled, there should be a competitive examination, open only to such men as have been selected as entirely suitable for the Service.

66206. (II) System of Training and Probation. The present system of training is not satisfactory. In the first place probationers should all be trained together at one residential institution. If it could be done at one of the leading English Universities it would have several advantages. It might not, however, be possible to arrange it under the reduced age limit proposed above.

The course of training should extend over three full years, and should contain much more practical work than at present, especially in surveying and engineering. A short time at the beginning of the course should be spent in a forest of some sort, and the course should conclude with a year's work in continental forests. It would be advantageous if the students could be together for a great part of this time.

An adequate allowance, sufficient to cover all the expenses of the course of training, should be granted to all probationers whose conduct is satisfactory.

No special probationary course in India is necessary. It is far better that recruits should be placed under selected senior officers for their first two or three years in India.

66210. (III) Conditions of Service.—The service should be kept truly Imperial. All tendency towards provincialisation should be checked. Every post should be open to any officer who is competent to fill it. All officers when they first join the service are told that all of the highest posts are open to them, but in actual practice it is not always the case.

More facilities should also be given for the interchange of officers between different provinces. This will make conditions fairer for the officers themselves, as a man posted to a bad province will not then be kept there all his service. Interchange broadens the experience of officers, and gives better

opportunities of testing their work. A man posted to an easy province may gain the reputation of a brilliant officer, when in reality he is not such a good officer as another man who, posted in a difficult province, has only an average reputation. Finally by interchange of officers a province may benefit by the introduction of new methods.

Better facilities should also be granted for men to study Forestry in other countries.

In order to compensate for inequalities in different Provinces more adequate local allowances should be given in expensive and unhealthy provinces. In unhealthy provinces, too, special facilities for leave should be granted, and every officer should be permitted to enjoy two months' recess during the hot weather and rains unless there are urgent reasons why he should not leave his division.

The service should be more adequately staffed than at present to prevent the overworking of officers and to allow of better supervision of the forests. Owing to the present understaffing of the service it is often impossible to grant men leave so frequently as is desirable in order that they may retain their health.

66211. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The Imperial Forest Service is a small service, and holds charge and is responsible for the development of some of the most valuable property of Government. It is of great importance that the best stamp of men should be attracted into the service. It is only fair therefore that its members should be paid on at least the same scale as other services of similar importance. In fact, however, the prospects offered to a man joining the Forest Service are worse than in any other service of similar standing, though several strong reasons can be given for granting Forest men a higher rate of remuneration than is given to men in other services of similar importance.

At the last reorganisation the actual increase in salary for Assistant Conservators was little more than nominal, and many men are worse off under the present system during their first five or six years than they would have been under the old system of grade pay. At the same time the cost of necessaries has increased enormously.

It is agreed, however, by all that the time-scale should be retained. The salaries should be raised sufficiently to compensate for the increased cost of living, and also, in the higher grades, to place the service on an equal footing with other services of similar standing. The initial salary should be Rs. 400 per mensem, increasing annually by Rs. 50 per mensem up to Rs. 1,500 in the 18th year of service. Thereafter persons desirous of increasing annually by Rs. 50 per mensem should be given to officers fit for the position who are fit for whom there is no vacancy, although the salary of Rs. 1,500. Conservators should be fit to a maximum of Rs. 2,000, and the salary of Rs. 2,000 should receive Rs. 1,600, Rs. 1,800, and Rs. 2,000 respectively. Conservators Rs. 2,500, increasing annually by Rs. 100 up to Rs. 3,000; and the Extra Assistant Conservator-General Rs. 3,000, increasing annually by Rs. 100 up to Rs. 3,500. The salary of the Conservator-General should be increased annually by Rs. 100.

19 January 1914.]

Mr. H. S. GIBSON.

[Continued.]

Much hardship is also entailed by placing Junior Assistant Conservators of Forests in charge of a division without any charge allowance. Any Assistant Conservator of Forests placed in charge of a division should receive a charge allowance equivalent to one-fifth of the minimum pay of a Deputy Conservator of Forests or any less amount by which his pay falls short of the minimum pay of a Deputy Conservator of Forests.

66212. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The proposed new leave rules are satisfactory.

Privilege leave should not be allowed to lapse, but it should be possible for an officer to take as much privilege leave as he has earned by active Service. Retrospective effect should be given to this concession, so that officers may have to their credit any privilege leave earned but not taken during the last six years.

There should be a minimum furlough allowance of £400 per annum. Government servants on leave at Home are on the whole worse off than men engaged in commercial concerns. This is not as it should be, as it tends to throw a stigma on Government Service. Men on leave should receive an adequate subsistence allowance, and some concession might be granted to them in the cost of steamship fares.

66213. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The intention of Government in granting a pension is presumably to provide adequate means of subsistence for its retired servants and their families, and enable them to educate their children in a manner suitable to their social standing. The present pension was fixed about 16 years ago, when the value of the rupee was greater and the cost of living far cheaper than at present. Consequently it is now totally inadequate.

The conditions of life in the Forest Service are exceptionally hard, so that when a man retires his health seldom permits him to take up other work. There is little opportunity for saving, so that a retired Forest Officer has to be practically dependent on his pension.

The Forest Officer may then fairly ask to be treated with some liberality in the matter of pension. Few live to enjoy it, and they seldom for very long.

Pensions should not be placed on a contributory basis. They should be paid in sterling.

The minimum pension after 20 years' Service should be £500 per annum, increasing by £20 per annum up to £600 after 25 years' Service. This should be the maximum for officers who do not attain the rank of Conservator. For each year of Service as Conservator an additional £40 should be granted, subject to a maximum of £800 per annum.

Invalid pensions should be granted on the following scale: £20 for each year of Service below 10 years, £250 after 10 years, and £25 for each additional year's Service up to £475 after 19 years.

Mr. H. S. GIBSON

called and examined.

66217. (Chairman.) In the Forest Department in Bengal there was one Conservator of Forests, with headquarters at Darjeeling. Under him there were eight divisions, generally held by either Deputy or Assistant Conservators of Forests. Usually there were eight Imperial officers in charge of divisions, and there were at present two other Imperial officers acting as assistants in divisions. There were six Provincial officers, one of whom was at present temporarily in charge of a division, the remainder being assistants in divisions. One Provincial officer held rather an exceptional position as instructor in a Forest School. There was a considerable number of Imperial officers on leave.

66218. An officer in the Forest Service should be a man of good physique and proficiency in athletics. Brains did not count for everything. The physical test should be revived. He believed the test served an exceedingly useful purpose.

66219. Even if a stiff physical and medical test was imposed, and those who were unsuitable for the rigorous life of a Forest officer were weeded

66214. (VII) Such limitations as exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—The present conditions are satisfactory, and no alteration appears necessary.

66215. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The present relations are satisfactory.

66216. (IX) Other points.—(a) Much hardship is undoubtedly often incurred in transfers. Hardly ever does the present travelling allowance cover the expenses even of an unmarried man. It does not seem just that an officer should be the loser owing to his transfer "in the interests of Government." Some allowance should therefore also be made for the wives of married officers. It should not be difficult to devise a system of allowance based on actual expenses, such as rail fare for an officer and his wife (if married) as well as for two servants and freight on a reasonable quantity of baggage. Even this takes no account of losses owing to the compulsory sale of furniture and other effects.

(b) In some divisions the rate of travelling allowance is insufficient to cover all costs of touring, owing to increased cost of means of transport and keep of horses. In such places the rate of travelling allowance should be increased or no charge made for the use of Government elephants when an officer is on tour.

(c) Adequate provision should be made for skilled European medical attendance in all headquarters stations. This is not always done and officers have suffered in consequence.

(d) The rents which Forest Officers pay for their houses are out of all proportion to the use they make of them. By far the greater part of the year is spent on tour. The Forest Officer then gets no benefit from his house. It is merely a source of extra expense to him, as a chaukidar has to be paid for out of his own pocket. Add to this that the house provided for him is in many cases not a very good one or placed in a remote situation so that even when he is in headquarters the Forest Officer is often not much better off than when he is in camp. Adequate accommodation should be provided in all headquarters stations, for which no rent should be charged, at any rate for the period during which it is not occupied.

(e) The officers appointed in recent years from the Universities joined the Service much later in life than their predecessors. They are therefore at a disadvantage as compared with them, as they both draw less pay at any given age, and it is highly probable that many of them will have to retire before attaining the rank of Conservator, owing to the posts being filled by men senior in Service but younger in age. Special consideration should be given to the case of these men.

66220. He recommended that the allowance to candidates undergoing the probationary course should be £150. All officers when they joined the Service were told that all the highest posts were open to them, but in practice that was not the case. He believed it was practically impossible for a man who was appointed to Bombay or Madras to obtain the post of Chief Conservator, or the post of Inspector General, because the Bombay and Madras Services were kept entirely distinct from the rest of the Service in India. A man from Bengal, for instance, could go as Con-

19 January 1914.]

MR. H. S. GIBSON.

[Continued.]

servator to any other Province except Bombay and Madras, where the Service had become almost provincialised. It was laid down that the Inspector-General of Forests should usually have had experience in Burma, so it was absolutely impossible for a man who was appointed either to Madras or Bombay to fulfil that condition. The whole Service should be Imperial, and there should be free interchange between Provinces.

66221. He had never considered the suggestion put before the Commission that the various Provinces should be grouped under three units, Upper India, Burma, and Madras and Bombay, and that each batch of three candidates in the final order of merit should be obliged to elect for service in one or other group according to their one order of merit, but he saw one very great objection to the suggestion, namely, that a man who was appointed to the North-Western group would be at an immense advantage over all the other men in the Service, because that was the place where the conditions of service were most favourable. On the whole, he preferred seeing the appointments in the Service thrown open to the whole of India. Differences of language presented no serious obstacle as, taking the greater part of India, a knowledge of Hindustani would be sufficient.

66222. At present there was no provision to enable officers to study European forestry. It would be a very good thing for an officer after four or five years' service to go to Europe for that purpose.

66223. With regard to the recommendation for the grant of two months' recess for officers working in unhealthy districts, his colleagues considered that it should be left to the discretion of the officer rather than to the discretion of the Conservator to decide whether or no advantage should be taken of the privilege.

66224. The leave reserve was inadequate. Officers found great difficulty in getting leave on account of the shortage of the staff. He knew of several instances where leave was due, and application for leave had been refused for that reason.

66225. Forest Officers should be paid at least as highly as officers in other Services of equal importance. The Public Works Department for instance, and the Forest Service were recruited from a similar class, and there appeared to be no reason why officers in the Public Works Department should have higher posts open to them than were open to officers in the Forest Department. The Forest Department had the same time-scale as the Public Works Department, but there was no charge bar in the Forest Department as there was in the Public Works Department. The majority of Forest Officers had paid for the whole of their training. It was only in the last year or two that any allowance had been given during the period of training.

66226. He thought it would be better to keep the continuous time-scale than to have two time-scales, one for Assistants, and the other for Deputies, with promotion from one class to the other by selection; he made this suggestion notwithstanding that all the junior officers in Bengal at present would have benefited enormously if there had been promotion to Deputy Conservatorships in vacancies. He did not think it necessary to establish a time-scale for Conservators.

66227. Of the 28 officers who had served, and were serving, in Bengal three were on pension. The next four had died after 23, 11, 17, and 18 years' service respectively. The next three men were still in service, and there was one man who had retired after 25 years' service. There were two more men who had died in service, and in recent years one man had died in service, another had been compelled to retire owing to ill-health after 10 years' service; another also had died in service after five years, and another man had had to retire owing to ill-health after five years' service. It was upon those figures that the claim was based for a more liberal pension. They also showed the arduous and rigorous character of the Service.

66228. His colleagues generally were not very strongly in favour of a family pension fund; what

they would prefer to see would be more liberal provident fund rules, somewhat on the lines of the provident fund on the Indian Railways.

66229. With regard to recruitment of Indians to the Imperial Service, his opinion was that the best method of recruitment of Indians to the Imperial Service was selection from the Provincial Service of officers of from 10 to 15 years standing, who would be sent for study leave to Europe. He regarded that as a better method than the direct recruitment of young Indians to the Imperial Service.

66230. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The new scheme for training Indians at Dehra Dun for the Provincial Service had not been long enough in existence to enable him to form any opinion as to the possibility of Dehra Dun becoming an adequate training ground for Indians, but there was one insuperable objection to the Dehra Dun training as compared with a training which included a tour on the Continent of Europe. In Europe there were forests which had been under systematic management for many years, and a man saw there what a really well-managed forest was like, and he knew what he had to aim at. There were no such forests in India. The theoretical training at Dehra Dun could be brought up to the same level as the training at Oxford.

66231. He saw no objection to promoting picked men from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service, provided that the men were selected entirely on their own personal merits, and that no definite proportion of officers so promoted was laid down. If a man showed himself to be really competent after a trial in the Provincial Service, and capable of managing his subordinates, there would be no objection to his being promoted to the Imperial Service. A period of training in Europe would be decidedly useful in a case of that sort.

66232. (*Mr. Sly.*) So far as Bengal was concerned there was no material difference in the work and responsibility of the different charges, except in regard to area.

66233. He could quote no Government rule to the effect that the Bombay and Madras Forest Officers were precluded from promotion to the post of Inspector-General, but that was the general opinion. He was not aware of the fact that a Bombay Forest Officer had held the post of Inspector-General. Up till recently it had been generally understood that Burma experience was essential for the post.

66234. He thought it reasonable that a Forest Officer should retire on a £500 pension at the age of 42. Statistics showed that a Forest Officer seldom lived to the age of 50. He had not taken the trouble to calculate the capital value of a pension of £500 commencing at the age of 42.

66235. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He had found a knowledge of German absolutely essential in order to profit by his forest teaching in Germany. Therefore if Indians were sent to Europe, and they had to profit by their Continental teaching, they would have to know German. That would be rather an argument against sending Indians to Europe at a late age, but the objection might be partly overcome by letting Indians go with probationers who know German.

66236. He desired to abolish the present qualification of a University degree in science, in order that the age of entry might be lowered. He was not aware whether any special science qualifications were required of German forest officers holding responsible posts; Germans specialised in forestry from the very beginning.

66237. He had gone through quite a short course of surveying and engineering at Oxford. There were no opportunities for practical engineering in Oxford; the engineering school there was purely theoretical. He did not think that constituted an objection to concentrating the work at Oxford, because a man could see a great deal of forest engineering during his tour on the Continent.

66238. He would be in favour of making probationers at Oxford pass the ordinary Oxford Science preliminary examination, as this would show they

19 January 1914.]

Mr. H. S. Gibson.

[Continued.]

had a fair knowledge in ordinary elementary science, and in the witness's opinion that was quite sufficient for the average Forest Officer. He was in favour of recruiting a portion of the Provincial Service from the Ranger class. It should be possible for a Ranger who showed exceptional merit to be promoted to the Provincial Service.

66239. (Mr. Madge.) Oxford provided a special training for the Indian Forest Service. Other men were permitted to enter and receive the same course of training, and there was no reason why those men, for instance, who wished to enter the British Forest Service, should not be admitted.

66239A. Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians trained at Dehra Dun, had worked under him, and some of them had done extremely good work.

66240. (Mr. Grieve.) A Provincial Service Officer would labour under a disadvantage in holding charge of a division where there was a large European community, such as tea planters. It was very difficult for a man who had been entirely educated in India to deal with men of the planter type in the same way as a man who had been educated in England. The planters regarded a man who had been educated in England in a very different way.

66241. An Assistant Conservator should not be placed in charge of a division until he had had at least two or three years' service under a selected senior man, but owing to the smallness of the cadre in Bengal, the actual position was very different. For instance, he himself held charge of the Sunderbans division for five or six months when he had less than $1\frac{1}{2}$ years' service. The next junior man had held charge of a division after $1\frac{1}{2}$ years' service, and had been in charge of a division ever since. The next junior man was put in charge of a division for six months after $1\frac{1}{2}$ years' service, and last year, an assistant who had only been out four

months was placed in charge of one of the largest divisions in Bengal for seven or eight months.

66242. He was once in charge of a division when there were three Provincial officers serving under him, all of whom drew a higher rate of pay than himself, and he had one Imperial Service Officer under him who was nominally drawing Rs. 80 a month less than himself. Owing, however, to the deduction of house rent from his pay and extra expenses incurred by the upkeep of the house and grounds, the junior officer actually received more than he did. This was adduced as an argument for granting charge allowances to Assistant Conservators placed in charge of divisions.

66243. (Mr. Modder.) It would be most unfair to a Provincial Officer if the rule that a Provincial Officer must hold charge of a division before being promoted to the post of Extra Deputy Conservator, was enforced in Bengal. It would be far better that the Provincial officer should have a regular time scale, proceeding right up to the maximum, and that there should be no distinction between Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators. A Provincial Officer could do sufficiently important work as an attached officer.

66244. The Civil Service Regulations laid down that an officer drawing Rs. 500 and over was a first class officer. The maximum pay of an Extra Assistant Conservator was Rs. 550. He did not know any reason why the Extra Assistant Conservator should be classed as a second class officer; he thought it was a great hardship. It was true there were a number of Rangers and clerks getting Rs. 100, who were classed as second class officers. When travelling by train a Provincial Officer had to mix in the same class as his clerks and his Rangers.

(The witness withdrew.)

LALIT MOHAN SEN, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being a Memorandum on the Provincial Forest Service, Bengal.

66245. (I) **Methods of Recruitment.**—The existing methods of recruitment to the Provincial Forest Service in Bengal at present are:—

(a) by promotion of deserving Forest Rangers.

(b) by the selection for direct appointment of candidates who, having successfully passed through the Provincial Forest Service Course at the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun, have rendered not less than three years' satisfactory service as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests.

The promotion of Forest Rangers to the Provincial Service should be very cautiously given, preference being given to Forest Rangers who have obtained higher standard certificates at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, and have afterwards rendered not less than five years' satisfactory service, of which at least three years have been service in executive charge. The maximum number thus appointed must not exceed 25 per cent. of the total number at any time.

In view of the above suggestion and to keep up the efficiency of the subordinate service, a few grades carrying higher pay may be created for the Forest Rangers.

The selection of candidates for training for Provincial Forest Service at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, is done at present by nomination only, the men nominated having certain standard of education.

This should be done: (i) by an open competitive Entrance Examination in English, Mathematics and some branch of Natural Science; (ii) by a physical test (e.g., walking a fixed distance in a particular number of hours) followed by a medical examination by a Civil Medical Officer or by a Medical Board; (iii) on passing the Entrance

Examination and the physical test, and, before being sent to the Research Institute, by a compulsory practical training in the forest for a period not less than four months and not more than six months.

Candidates for the Entrance Examination must hold any of the following educational certificates:—(i) a certificate of having passed at least I.Sc., I.E., or I.A., Examination of an Indian University in a group of subjects including Mathematics; or (ii) the Licentiate of Agriculture Degree of a Government Agricultural College; or (iii) the Cambridge Senior School Certificate (higher than the Cambridge Senior Local).

66246. (II) **System of Training and Probation.**—The training both theoretical and practical given at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, is satisfactory, but if it is considered in any way inferior, it should be raised so as to bring it on a par with that which the Imperial Forest Officers receive in England.

The probationary period of three years, after passing out of the Institute, may be abolished. Men successfully passing the course of training in the Institute should be substantively appointed as Extra Assistant Conservators directly with the usual annual increments.

66247. (III) **Conditions of Service.**—As duties and responsibilities of Provincial Forest Service Officers are the same as officers of Imperial Forest Service, the whole staff of both Imperial and Provincial Services may be borne on one combined list of "controlling staff." The members of this combined controlling staff should be designated as Assistant and Deputy Conservators.

Charges of Divisions should go ordinarily by seniority in the proposed combined list, unless there be anything against any individual officer. The senior member of the Provincial Service

19 January 1914.]

Mr. L. M. SEN.

[Continued.]

should not be placed under a junior member of the Imperial Service as is sometimes done at present.

The classification of Divisional charges into "major" and "minor" may be abolished.

Some picked officers from the senior grades of the Provincial Forest Service may be taken to the Imperial Forest Service.

66248. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The maximum pay for the Provincial Forest Service may be increased to Rs. 1,250. The existing maximum pay for the service with a number of conditions is fixed at Rs. 850.

In the Imperial Forest Service Assistant Conservators, unless very badly reported, can rise to the highest grade of Deputy Conservators with annual increments unconditionally and without any restriction; there can be as many Deputy Conservators as there are officers entitled to the pay of that grade under the title-scale system of increments. But in the Provincial Forest Service the number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators which have been allotted for several provinces (e.g., one in Bengal) is very limited. This limitation may be removed and an (Extra) Assistant Conservator may be allowed to rise to the highest grade of (Extra) Deputy Conservator with uninterrupted annual increments like the officers of the Imperial Forest Service. The pay for the Provincial Forest Service may be constituted as follows:—

ASSISTANT CONSERVATORS.

Year of service.	Rs.
1st	250
2nd	275
3rd	300
4th	325
5th	350
6th	375
7th	400
8th	430
9th	460
10th	490
11th	520
12th	550

DEPUTY CONSERVATORS.

Year of service.	Rs.
13th	580
14th	620
15th	660
16th	700
17th	740
18th	780
19th	820
20th	860
21st	900
22nd	950
23rd	1,050
24th	1,050
25th	1,100
26th	1,150
27th	1,200
28th and onwards	1,250

If the existing scale of pay for the Imperial Forest Officers be raised, the above proposed scale should also be increased proportionately for the Provincial Forest Officers.

66249. (V) Conditions of Leave.—(a) *Privilege leave*.—At present privilege leave can accumulate only up to three months; it may be extended up to six months.

The rule that privilege leave cannot be allowed within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in case of leave on medical certificate or on *bond fide* urgent necessity for Forest Officers who have often to labour in malarious surroundings and isolation.

(b) *Long leave*.—The question of long leave for Indian Services is under the consideration of Government.

As the Provincial Forest Officers have to spend most part of their service in unhealthy localities and are, therefore, more in need of frequent medical leave, these officers when drawing a pay of Rs.

400 or less may be allowed an allowance of Rs. 200, or three-fourths of the salary, whichever is less, when on medical leave.

Under the existing rules an officer can take long leave on half-pay for five years, out of which two years are counted as service towards pension. Forest Officers, specially of the Provincial Service, have to live in out-of-the-way unhealthy places for the most part of their service, and are, therefore, in greater need of taking leave on medical certificate. It is a great hardship on the officers if only two years of the long leave is counted towards pension. At least three years of the long leave may be counted as such in 25 years' service.

66250. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—Provincial Forest Officers who spend most part of their service in unhealthy isolated places may be allowed to retire on one-half of the salary on completion of 25 years' qualifying service, unconditionally or after 20 years' qualifying service with a medical certificate.

These officers may also be allowed to retire voluntarily at any time after completing ten years' qualifying service, in which case the amount of pension should be calculated at two-thirds of the amount of invalid pension for similar length of service.

66251. (VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.—(a) *Limitation*.—There is no limitation in the employment of non-Europeans in the Provincial Forest Service, except in the case of selection for the service in Burma for which it is suggested that selection should be made from all Indian communities.

There is no rule debarring the non-Europeans to enter the Imperial Forest Service.

Graduates with Honours in some branch of Natural Science from any Indian Universities with a fair knowledge of either German or French may be nominated for training in Europe for the Imperial Forest Service.

It has been suggested in paragraph 11 that picked men from the senior grades of the Provincial Service may be taken into the Imperial Forest Service.

(b) *Division of Service*.—The division of Service into Imperial and Provincial has not proved satisfactory. Admitting that a certain number of officers of the Imperial Service is necessary for the maintenance of the British character of the administration of the Department, their number is disproportionately too large in Bengal at present. List of officers on the 1st July, 1913, shows, while there are 15 officers of the Imperial Service, including the Conservator, there are only six officers of the Provincial Service. The preponderating number of the officers of Imperial Service could conveniently be reduced by increasing the similar number of officers of the Provincial Service and by stopping further recruitment of the officers of the Imperial Service until a fair proportion be arrived at.

Thorough efficiency can never be secured without a thorough and complete blending of Indian knowledge. Close, intimate and personal knowledge of the people of the country, their ways, circumstances and habits of thoughts come intuitively to a native; more responsible work should, therefore, fall on the officers of the Provincial Service.

Of the six Provincial Officers in Bengal, none was in charge of a Division up to 1st November, 1913 (since when one officer has been given charge of a Division temporarily). Consequently there was no opportunity for them to distinguish themselves in their administrative and controlling capacities.

66252. (VIII) Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—It is satisfactory and there is nothing to suggest.

66253. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—(a) *Travelling allowance*.—When the "Dailyallowance" was fixed for the Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests in Appendix 25 of the Civil Service Regulations, Extra Assistant Conservators were officers of the "second class"

19 January 1914.]

Mr. L. M. SEN.

[Continued.]

according to Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations, the maximum pay of these officers being then Rs. 350. This pay having now been raised to Rs. 550, Extra Assistant Conservators are now "first-class" officers under that article. Similarly, when in the same Appendix the "Daily Allowance" was fixed for the Extra Deputy Conservators, the pay of the lowest grade of that service was Rs. 450. These officers in some grades were, therefore, officers of the "second class" under the Civil Service Regulations. The pay of the lowest grade of Extra Deputy Conservators having now been raised to Rs. 575, these officers are "first-class" officers in all grades of that Service. It is, therefore, submitted that the officers of the Provincial Forest Service may be classed as "first-class" officers irrespective of their pay and post-

ing, and that the travelling allowance for the officers of the Provincial Forest Service may be the same as for the officers of the Imperial Forest Service.

(b) *Confidential reports.*—These reports, as a rule, are unpopular. If these are to be continued, the officers adversely reported on should be furnished with a copy of the report. Otherwise he does not get any opportunity of rectifying himself or seeking redress. These reports, whether favourable or unfavourable, should be supported by facts by the reporting officer.

(c) *Medical attendance.*—Free medical attendance may be allowed on the wives and children of Provincial Service officers on the ground that they have to live often far from ordinary means of treatment and almost always in unhealthy places.

Mr. L. M. SEN called and examined.

66254. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests. He had 16 years' Service. He had been trained at Dehra Dun.

66255. He recommended that as the duties and responsibilities of Provincial Forest Officers were the same as those of Imperial Forest Officers, the two branches should be borne on one and the same list.

66256. He also recommended that officers from the senior grade of the Provincial Forest Service should be admitted to the higher service. He meant by that, that Provincial Forest Officers as they were now should be eligible equally with Imperial Forest Officers for promotion to the administrative grades of Conservator and Chief Conservator. A junior Imperial man should not be put in charge of a division while there was a Provincial man senior to him in that division.

66257. He regarded it as important that for officers taken to the higher service there should be a course in England to supplement the course given in India. In his opinion the Dehra Dun course for Imperial officers in the superior grades of the Service would not be complete without a course in England.

66258. He recommended that the maximum proportion of Rangers promoted to the Provincial Service should not exceed 25 per cent. Till within quite recently practically all promotions to the Provincial Service had been from the Ranger class. Officers in the Provincial Service underwent a different training from that undergone by officers in the subordinate Service.

66259. With regard to salary for Extra Assistants and Deputies, he suggested a time scale going from Rs. 250 to Rs. 1,250. Provincial officers in charge of a division were actually doing the same work as Imperial officers in charge of a division. He admitted that officers coming out from Europe should be paid upon a higher basis than those recruited in India. There should be something in the nature of a foreign service allowance for officers coming to a foreign country.

66260. With regard to pensions, he suggested that officers should be allowed to retire voluntarily with a pension at any time after 10 years' service. Government already granted invalid pensions to officers disabled after that period of service. But it sometimes happened that an officer could not easily obtain a medical certificate. He did not suggest that an officer after 10 years' service, finding that the Service was unsuitable to him should be allowed to retire and enjoy a pension.

66261. (*Mr. Fisher.*) Before the system of nomination was adopted, candidates entered by competitive examination, and he thought better men were obtained in that way.

66262. (*Mr. Sly.*) After passing the entrance examination, a man should have a practical training in the forest of not less than four, and not more than six, months. There should be no selection, but there should be a physical test.

66263. He desired to abolish the three years probation in the Provincial Service, because it did not count towards increment, although it counted for service, leave, and pension. If the probationary period was on an incremental scale there would be no objection to it.

66264. When in charge of a division the duties and responsibilities of Provincial Forest Officers were the same as those of officers of the Imperial Service.

66265. (*Mr. Grieve.*) Officers complained that they never received a copy of the adverse confidential reports, although the Government rule was that they should be furnished with them.

66266. (*Mr. Modder.*) The reason why he suggested the abolition of the three years probationary course after passing out from Dehra Dun was because a man had had to do six months' probation before going to Dehra Dun, and in those six months Government could decide whether a man was suitable for the Forest Department or not.

66267. His reason for suggesting that the number of Rangers promoted to the Provincial Service should be limited was that at present the Ranger could rise to only Rs. 150 a month, and that salary was not sufficient to attract a good class of men. There was a tendency at present to promote Rangers with long service to the Provincial Service, in order to give them a little more pay; he desired to give them more pay but wanted some other method to be discovered of giving them that increase without recruiting them to the Provincial Service.

66268. With regard to the suggested increase in salary, it was understood that if a man did not do good work his increments would be stopped. The best men only could rise to Rs. 1,250. He did take it for granted that every man, if he did good work, could rise to the very top. If a man did bad work, Government had the power to stop his increments, not only temporarily, but permanently. The recommendation was put forward in order to attract a better class of men to the Provincial Service, and to place the Forest Department on an equal footing with other Services.

66269. As an Assistant to the Divisional Officer the Provincial Officer had the same responsibilities as the Divisional Officer, in regard to sylviculture, engineering and survey work, but he admitted that the Divisional Officer had to take final responsibility for the work.

66270. He suggested that men should be permitted to retire early because at present there were officers in the Department who desired to retire, and it would be in the interests of Government if they did retire. There were men drawing Rs. 550 doing work which could be done for Rs. 100, and the argument was that by making those men retire on a pension, Government would be saving money, and at the same time they would not be blocking the top of the list by keeping useless men on.

(The witness withdrew.)

19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. E. S. CUBITT.

G. E. S. CUBITT, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

66271. (I) *Methods of Recruitment.*—It is generally held that it is more important for recruits to join the Service at the age of about 22 than to possess a degree in science. Some officers consider such a degree almost useless and in any case its possession tends to raise the age of entry into the Department. Thus in Cooper's Hill days the average age of the newly-joined recruit was 22, against an average of 24 for the past five years. At 24 it is difficult for a man to become mentally acclimatised to his new environment, while promotion is now so comparatively slow that men joining at such an advanced age may over be unable to earn the extra pensions granted to officers in administrative ranks. One of the best recruits that ever came to Burma resigned disgusted within a year of his arrival, mainly, I believe, because he joined the Service too old. But assuming that the age difficulty can be got over a very grave objection felt by some to the possession of a science degree as a necessary qualification for entry into the Forest Department is that it limits the field of selection, the limits becoming narrower the more the age is reduced. What the Department wants is unlimited choice from amongst the public school boys: what it gets is a choice limited to those who proceed to a University. I have it nevertheless on unimpeachable authority that the recruits now undergoing training are an exceptionally good lot, while a Burma officer, whose opinion is entitled to great respect and who speaks with personal knowledge, states that he was "struck with the keenness and aptitude shown by the probationers on the Continental forestry tour." It has, however, to be borne in mind that the average recruitment for the Department is 10 or 11 per annum; that we are now recruiting only five or six owing to an excess of officers over the sanctioned cadre; that a large increase in the staff, which will probably raise the annual demand to about 15 men, is inevitable in the near future; and that a system of recruitment which may produce excellent results in present circumstances may, unless the conditions of service are much improved, be a total failure when the requirements are doubled or even trebled.

It is therefore very generally considered, except perhaps by Oxford trained men, that it would be preferable to revert to recruitment between the ages of 18 and 20 by means of nomination followed by competitive examination in a wide range of subjects, and then to train the men in forestry and the allied sciences. The nomination of candidates should be by a selection board, of which at least two members should be Forest Officers on leave or who have recently retired. Some lay stress on the desirability of one at least of the Forest members being an officer in active service.

All officers who have expressed any opinion at all on the subject hold that the physical test formerly imposed should be revived, while there is evidence that the medical examination which candidates now undergo is not sufficiently searching.

66272. (II) *System of Training and Probation.*—The majority of officers naturally have a preference for the particular form of training which they themselves went through, whether this was on the Continent, at Cooper's Hill, or at Oxford; but there is general agreement that recruits should receive their instruction at one and the same residential institution, in the first place because the number of men required annually is too small to make it worth while of more than one institution to provide the very special course of instruction necessary, secondly to ensure a uniform curriculum, and thirdly to foster camaraderie and *esprit de corps*, which certain senior officers consider have of late years sadly declined.

The present system of training is not condemned, and, even if the recruit of recent years does not on the average make so good a forester as his predecessors (which has yet to be proved), it has to be admitted that Oxford has given the Department

some exceedingly able men. More attention should, however, be paid to forest engineering (especially road making) and surveying. I also consider (but this is a personal opinion) that every recruit should have some little knowledge of first aid and the early treatment of the more ordinary tropical ailments.

Opinions vary largely as to the value of the period of Continental training and the differences are probably due to the fact that the training is not done together at one place, and therefore depends largely for efficiency on the German officers under whose supervision the students are placed. I have no hesitation in saying that two-thirds of the six months I spent in Germany were absolutely wasted. I saw no protective forestry of any kind, such as the fixation of sand dunes, the control of mountain torrents, and the afforestation of denuded hillsides; nor was I shown any examples of forest engineering and transport, such as aerial ropeways, timber-slides, sledge-roads, etc.; while the influence of forests on rainfall and climate was practically never mentioned out of the lecture-room. Far more time should also have been spent on the study in the field of important forest industries such as resin-tapping, etc. The practical training, as I knew it, was confined almost entirely to silviculture, and in this respect was on the whole satisfactory, though in my case far too much time was spent in one place, and no attempt was made by the German Forest Officer under whom I studied for five months to teach me anything of German practice in the compilation of working plans. My experience may perhaps be exceptional, but it serves to show that the practical training on the Continent requires the closest personal supervision, and it is considered that this supervision can best be provided by selected officers on the active list on leave who would keep the instruction up-to-date, would ensure students being shown systems and examples applicable to India, and would direct their work generally into useful lines and induce them to take a personal interest in it. It is moreover pointed out by more than one officer that men who have already had practical experience of forestry in India and have had time to realise the responsibilities of their profession would profit far more from a period of study in European forests than students with neither of these qualifications. Therefore, though it is held that the period of Continental training for probationers is still essential and might, some think, even be extended, it is suggested that it would be greatly in the interests of Government if all, or at any rate, selected officers were sent to Europe for purposes of study during, say, their first furlough, which, as urged in section V (iii) below, should be after four years' active service. In making this suggestion the rules regarding study-leave have not been over-looked, but after eight years' continuous and strenuous service the keenest of officers feels the need for thorough rest and change and is as a rule loath to spend his furlough away from home.

The policy of allowing selected students to remain in Europe for an additional year's training in special subjects has already proved of value to the Department, but care should be taken that the subjects selected are such as will be immediately and generally useful or the knowledge of which can easily be kept up-to-date. I venture to think that in one instance at least these points have not been borne in mind sufficiently and that special knowledge acquired at considerable expenditure of time and money is likely to be wasted.

As regards the employment of recruits immediately after their arrival in India it is held that the general instructions recently issued by the Government of India meet the case. These instructions are that during his first year of service an officer is to be considered as still under training and that he should not usually be utilised for the ordinary purposes of forest administration; that his training during this period should be carried out under a selected officer or officers, and should include both active work in a division and a period of work

19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. E. S. CUBITT.

[Continued.]

at the headquarters of a circle; and that he should tour in his own province and possibly visit selected forests in other provinces. In Burma, owing to the hopeless inadequacy of the staff, these instructions are a dead letter, and newly joined recruits, as the detailed information I have received shows, have frequently to be sent out alone into the forest, totally ignorant both of the language and of how to look after themselves, and not infrequently to the detriment of their health.

66273. (III) Conditions of Service.—Seven years ago the staff which is now sanctioned was considered "inadequate even for the needs of the immediate future," and it is hardly too much to say that most Forest Officers in Burma are now trying to do two men's work. Progress under these conditions is impossible, and one of the most urgent demands of the Department in Burma is for an increase in the establishment commensurate with the amount of work to be done. Moreover, forest work in Burma has to be carried out under conditions which are exceptionally arduous and unhealthy, both in comparison with those obtaining in other services in the same province, and in the Forest Service in other provinces. It can be compared only with the work of the Survey Department, but with this great and important difference, that, whereas Survey Officers are in camp only in the dry season, Forest Officers (or at any rate many of them) have to be out in all seasons and all weathers. Moreover, the Survey Officer is frequently transferred from province to province, and the conditions of service are thereby equalised.

It is maintained that the unhealthiness of forest life is fully borne out by the following statistics:

Officers who entered the Department up to the end of 1889 would have been entitled to the full pension admissible after 25 years' service at the close of 1912, provided that they had not taken more furlough than counts towards service for pension. Between the 10 years, 1878 and 1887, the number of officers who joined the Service in Burma was 13, who are accounted for at the present time as follows:

Died while in Service	5
Retired on account of ill-health before earning a pension and now dead	1
Transferred to another Department and died before earning a pension	1
Retired on less than full pension and now dead	2
Still in Service	4

The oldest of these 13 officers, had he lived, would now be only 59 years old.

I do not propose to refer in detail to the peculiar disadvantages of Service in Burma, since they are fully set forth in the Report of the Burma Allowance Committee (1910-11); while the popular idea that the disadvantages are counterbalanced in the case of the Forest Department by an easy and pleasant life with little to do except hunt big game is sufficiently refuted by letters in my possession which are at the disposal of the Commission should they desire to have them.

66274. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The Department in Burma is unanimously of the opinion that the present scale of pay is inadequate and even inequitable, though it is not suggested that any intentional injustice has been done. The claims of the Department are overlooked because its work is not understood, is for the most part in out-of-the-way places seldom visited by other officials, is as a rule inconspicuous and totally unapparent to untrained eyes, and may take generations to come to fruition.

The grounds on which the present rates are considered inadequate are:—

(1) That the conditions of service are peculiarly arduous and unhealthy.

(2) That the nature of the training is highly specialised, and not such as to render it easy for an officer to find other employment, should he, owing to ill-health or other causes, have to leave the Service prematurely.

(3) That the quantity and quality of the work demanded has enormously increased.

(4) That the rate of promotion to administrative rank is much slower than formerly, and is likely to be still slower in future, since increases in the staff will be proportionately greater in the executive than in the administrative grades.

(5) That the cost of living, both in India and in England, has increased largely of late years and is still increasing, and that the present rates of pay of the administrative posts are insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain in the way they should their position as Heads of a Department either with Local Governments or the Government of India.

(6) That they (the rates of pay) are not commensurate with the responsibilities involved. Thus a Chief Conservator who is responsible to a Local Government for the forest policy of a province, and whose professional opinion cannot be ignored without grave risk, gets less pay than a senior Deputy Commissioner in charge of a district. Similarly the Inspector-General of Forests who is responsible to the Government of India for the forest policy of the Indian Empire gets less pay than a first class Chief Engineer under a Local Government, and scarcely more than the Commissioner of a Division. It is also felt by the Department as a slight, if not an injustice, that Conservators should be paid less than Superintending Engineers, who can lay claim neither to superior intellectual ability nor a more expensive training.

(7) That the highest posts in the Service have been refused.

(8) That they (the rates) are actually less favourable in the early years of service than those in force before the introduction of the time-scale, owing to the abolition of officiating promotion and compensation allowance.

(9) That the age of entry into the Department is higher than in former years.

It is therefore held that the pay of the newly joined recruit should be Rs. 400 per mensem, this being the least sum that will compensate an officer for the increased cost of living. Calculating compensation allowance at the rate of 1s. 4d. to the rupee, this is only Rs. 28-2-0 per mensem more than 20 years ago, when the initial pay was Rs. 350. It should further be possible to earn Rs. 1,500 per mensem as a Deputy Conservator, within, say, 23 years of service. If this concession is granted many officers are prepared to restrict the pay of a Deputy Conservator to Rs. 1,250 per mensem if he is considered unfit for promotion to administrative rank; but others consider this restriction unnecessary if Government exercises the general power to withhold increments, which it already possesses, and point out that a man unsuitable for a Conservatorship may be an excellent divisional officer. These proposals involve a proportionate increase in the pay of the higher ranks, and it is held that the scale should provide for a substantial difference between the rates of pay for the different classes of officers, and should rise to a possible Rs. 3,500 per mensem for the Inspector-General of Forests. In no case should the pay be less than that of corresponding ranks in the Public Works Department, whose officers join the Service younger than the Forest Officer, and, under present conditions, have as a rule to spend considerably less on their education. Mainly as a matter of administrative convenience the Inspector-General of Forests is not a Secretary to Government, but his duties are very similar in character to those of the Secretary in the Public Works Department and there seems to be no reason why he should be paid at an altogether disproportionately low rate.

I desire also to point out on behalf of those who have only recently joined the Service that, owing mainly to the inadequacy of the staff, officers are frequently posted to the charge of a division within two or three years of their arrival in the country. It is strongly felt that, if a junior officer is called upon to accept unusual responsibility of this sort, he should be correspondingly remunerated, and it is therefore urged that he should in such circumstances receive a charge allowance and that the rules governing the grant of this

19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. E. S. CUBITT.

[Continued.]

allowance and of attainment to the rank of Deputy Conservator should be assimilated to the corresponding rules for the Public Works Department. The application of these rules to the Forest Department, as is only equitable, would enable an Assistant Conservator in charge of a division to draw a maximum salary equal to the lowest pay of Deputy Conservator, and would compensate him for the losses now sustained by the abolition of officiating promotion. A special allowance should also be granted to personal assistants to Conservators (especially in Rangoon), as in the case of officers serving in similar capacities in other Departments. Apart from the expense of living in Rangoon I know from personal experience that it is necessary to maintain, at a cost of about Rs. 80 a month, and simply to take one to office an otherwise totally unnecessary horse and conveyance. Notwithstanding representations on the subject no compensatory allowance is permissible.

Further, the whole Service and especially those appointed before 1910 are aggrieved by the rules regulating the accrual of increments of pay. In the Public Works Department increments accrue annually from the date of appointment to the Service in England: in the Forest Department they accrue annually, in the case of officers appointed prior to 1910, on the first of the month following that in which they arrived in Rangoon, and in the case of other officers on the date of their arrival. Burma officers are specially affected by the present rules and there are numerous instances in which men who left England on the same date as their colleagues in India have lost almost a month's increment annually for many years, solely because it is a longer journey to Rangoon than to Bombay. It is understood that the local Government recognise the inequity of the present rules and recommended to the Government of India that officers should not be penalised for the mere accident that they are serving in Burma, but redress has only been secured for officers recently appointed to the Service and the Department will not be wholly satisfied until placed on an equality with the Public Works Department.

A more serious grievance still is the exclusion of the Chief Conservator and Conservators from the grant of the Burma Allowance. The justice of their claim to the allowance is obvious, and I have nothing to add to what is said in the Report of the Burma Allowance Committee already referred to, except to point out that Service in the third grade of Conservators, which transfers an officer from some up-country station to Rangoon or Mandalay at a net increase of salary of only Rs. 150 per mensem, inevitably involves financial loss, apart from any consideration of the larger scale on which a Conservator should entertain.

Finally it is held that the Rangoon house allowance should be extended to bachelors.

66275. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The conditions of leave will be much improved if the changes now believed to be under the consideration of the Government of India are effected. Forest officers in Burma desire, however, to draw special attention to the following points:—

(i) Several officers have recently been refused the grant of privilege leave, and have thus forfeited in some cases several weeks of the leave earned. It is therefore held that if, owing to the exigencies of the public service, the grant of such leave is refused, its accumulation from the date of such refusal to the time when it can be granted should be unlimited.

(ii) An officer on leave, other than privilege leave, is as a rule entitled to half his average pay for his last three years of service converted at the rate of 1s. 6d. to the rupee. In the case of the Indian Civil Service leave allowances are subject to a minimum of £500 and a maximum of £1,000 per annum, but whereas the maximum for other Services is fixed at £800, there is no minimum except an exceedingly low sum of £200 in the case of leave on medical certificate. This is totally inadequate, and officers are in consequence frequently compelled to remain on or return to duty who in the interests of their health should be on

leave. Accepting the rate of four-fifths now adopted for the maximum allowance as a fair one, it is considered that the minimum furlough allowance should be £400, but that there are no good grounds for limiting the maximum to £800, if an officer's half pay, converted into sterling at the usual rate would exceed this sum. At the present rates of pay only 10 officers can earn the present maximum of £800, and of these only 1 would be entitled to £1,000, if, as is suggested, this latter amount is the maximum for all services.

(iii) It is considered that it should be possible to go on ordinary furlough after about four years' service. At present no long leave is possible for eight years other than on urgent private affairs or on medical certificate, while privilege leave, to the extent which may now be accumulated, allows of at most two months at home at an expenditure heavy out of all proportion to the benefits derived from it. Eight years' service in Burma almost without a break is detrimental to an officer's health and is far longer than is expected of Europeans employed by mercantile firms.

(iv) It is thought that with suitable restrictions it should be permissible to commute long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay.

(v) In comparison with India Burma is badly supplied with means of communication, while the journey home takes considerably longer from Rangoon than from Bombay. In order therefore to place officers on a more equal footing the beginning and end of all leave out of Burma should count from the dates of departure from and return to Rangoon respectively.

66276. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The widespread dissatisfaction that exists with regard to the amount of pension that can be earned has been amply testified to by the numerous memorials submitted by forest officers on the subject. It is pointed out that the present pensions were fixed long ago when the rupee was worth two shillings, and that owing to the increased and continually increasing cost of living in Europe the actual loss now sustained is far more than is represented by the difference (viz., 12½ per cent.) between the original value of the rupee and the special rate of 1s. 9d. at which the rupee pensions are now converted into sterling. The present pensions also compare very unfavourably with those earned by the members of the Indian Medical Service, who are moreover able, both during their service and after retirement, to add considerably to their income by private practice. Further, it is an indisputable fact that existing pensions, at any rate after 20 years' service, are insufficient to induce an officer who can secure employment at home to remain in India. Improved pensions would induce good officers, who would otherwise retire, to continue in service; would at the same time enable Government to retire inefficients compulsorily without undue hardship; and should encourage recruitment. The principle on which pensions are now granted is that they increase with increased pay, up to half an officer's average emoluments subject to certain maxima. These maxima were fixed at a time when the rates of pay were considerably lower than they are now, and it is consequently held that they should be raised correspondingly, otherwise the provisions regulating the relation of pay to pension become totally inoperative. The raising of their pay afforded no relief in the matter of pensions to officers of the Imperial Forest Service, who now ordinarily earn no more pension than an officer of the Provincial Service who has been two years in the highest grade of Extra Deputy Conservator. This anomaly is likely to be perpetuated by the rule which requires a qualifying service of 28 years before an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 can be earned.

I believe it to be the unanimous opinion of the Imperial Forest Service in Burma that the smallness of their pension constitutes their greatest grievance, and it is desired to recommend it as such to the consideration of the Commission. In a cadre of over 60 officers it is, however, only natural that there should not be complete unanimity as to the exact method of effecting the desired improve-

19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. E. S. CURRIE.

[Continued.]

ments. Some officers propose a scale graduated in almost exact proportion to the length of service; others prefer a scale which would give an officer retiring after a somewhat short service a comparatively low pension and officers of high administrative rank a correspondingly increased one. Particulars of the different suggestions are at the disposal of the Commission should they desire them, but the following principles may be said to underlie them all:—

(i) Pensions should be fixed in sterling, both to avoid complications arising from fluctuation in the value of the rupee, and because they will in practically all cases be payable in Great Britain.

(ii) The value of the ordinary pension should be some 45 to 50 per cent. higher than the sterling value of the present ordinary pension. Of this increase a third represents merely the re-introduction of a two-shillings rate of exchange for the rupee.

(iii) Substantial additional pensions should be given for service in high rank.

(iv) The scale of invalid pensions should be specially liberal, and should in the opinion of many officers, be on a graduated scale from one year upwards, the present system of gratuities for a service of less than ten years being abolished.

If pensions on a liberal scale are granted the Department would welcome the compulsory retirement of inefficients.

As the Government has decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers can be passed until the Public Services Commission has completed their inquiries and submitted their report, it is urged that all officers who retire subsequent to the date of this decision and before the orders of Government on the Commission's report are passed should receive the benefit of any enhanced pension which may be granted.

66277. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial branches.—The Department in Burma is satisfied with existing arrangements and consider they work well, but, without wishing to depreciate the work of the Provincial Officers, considers that any decrease in the proportionate strength of the Imperial Service would mean a loss of efficiency, since the early education of, and the course of special training undergone by, Imperial Service officers are far superior to anything possible in India.

66278. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—These are satisfactory and no changes are considered necessary.

66279. (IX) Other points not covered by the preceding heads.—Transfers invariably involve an officer in considerable pecuniary loss, and it is believed that a revision of the rules is now under the consideration of the Government of India. A great part of the loss is the result of the compulsory sale and re-purchase at very short notice of furniture and other property, so that a mere revision of the travelling allowance rates to cover the actual cost of the journey is insufficient. Considerable relief would be afforded if each headquarters bungalow were provided at Government expense with all essential articles of furniture, for which a small rent might be charged.

Housing.—Prior to 1907 rent was calculated, in the case of houses built and maintained by the

Public Works Department, on the capital cost of the building subject to a maximum of 10 per cent. of an officer's pay. Under the present rules rent is charged at the rate of $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. of an officer's pay irrespective of the accommodation provided. Apart from the fact that a Forest Officer has to pay rent for a house which for the greater part of the year he does not occupy, the new rule is objected to as less favourable than the old one, and unfair in its incidence. It is not known exactly how the rate of $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. was fixed, but it may be noted that the standard of accommodation provided to an officer is dependent on the average pay of his rank; that since the pay of Deputy Conservators has been raised the accommodation has not in all cases been correspondingly improved; and therefore that if, as is believed, the rent is calculated on the assumption that the accommodation is up to the prescribed standard, more than the prescribed interest on capital expenditure is being recovered. Though recently-joined officers may not in the long run be adversely affected by the new rules, senior officers must inevitably be heavy losers, for they have now to pay more than the calculated rental, having already under the old rules for many years paid rent in full. Finally it is amply proved by the evidence recorded by the Burma Allowance Committee that in Burma rents are higher, and the standard of accommodation provided lower, than in India. In view of the fact that the Burma Allowance is insufficient to cover the difference between the cost of living in that country and in India, it is thought by many officers that houses should be supplied for all rent free, but failing this concession it is urged—

(i) That the old system of assessing rent should be reverted to.

(ii) That the rate of interest charged should be reduced, and the accommodation provided be brought up to the Indian standard.

It is also considered of great importance that in the interests of their health, if for no other reason, more attention should be paid to the housing of junior officers not in charge of divisions. Such officers are frequently entirely unprovided for, and either have to live with the Divisional Officer, which may be inconvenient or impracticable, or have at great expense to make the best arrangements they can for themselves.

Family Pension Fund.—Amongst married officers there is a strong desire for a Service pension fund for widows and children. The establishment of such a fund would probably be generally approved if it were optional for present members of the Department to join it and if it did not necessarily involve any withdrawal of subscriptions already made to the Provident Fund. It is therefore urged that the matter should be taken into consideration in consultation with the Department.

Other points raised by some officers are the grant of free medical attendance to their wives and families, and the securing by Government from steamship companies of more favourable rates of passage for Government officials. There is also a general complaint of the inadequacy of the elephant transport provided, which suffices only to carry absolute necessities. On the grounds of health, comfort, and efficiency it is considered that the number of elephants at the disposal of each officer should at least be enough to carry the full Government allowance of tents, and a reasonable number of books pertaining to his profession.

Mr. G. E. S. CURRIE

called and examined.

66280. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Deputy Conservator of Forests in Burma. At present he was in Simla as Assistant Inspector-General.

66281. In the Burma Forest Service there were one Chief Conservator, four Conservators, and 61 Deputy and Assistant Conservators. There were 19 Extra Deputy Conservators and 43 Extra Assistants. That was the cadre list. As a matter of fact, at present there were a few in excess on the Imperial Service list, and a certain number of

vacancies in the Provincial Service list which would shortly be provided for by probationers already in the Service. There were at least eight or nine statutory natives of India in major charges, who had been trained at Dehra Dun.

66282. With regard to recruitment, there was an overwhelming majority in favour of the opinion that candidates should be selected by nomination and competition between the ages of 18 and 20, and that they should then go through a special course of training. Some of the newly-joined Oxford men

19 January 1914.]

Mr. G. E. S. CUBITT.

[Continued.]

preferred the present system. It might be necessary to sacrifice the Science degree, but he thought that to get the men out to India when they were young was more important than a Science degree.

66293. He would have competition after selection in the event of there being more candidates than there were vacancies. In addition to that he would have a stringent medical and physical test.

66294. Recruits in England should receive their instruction at one residential institution, and he thought Oxford would be the best centre. More attention should be given to Forest engineering and surveying. The sort of engineering Forest Officers required to learn was to be seen on the Continental tours. Adequate training could be given if there were proper supervision. He was not altogether satisfied with the present supervision of the probationers during the tour abroad; too much was left to chance. There should be constant supervision by Officers with Indian experience, who could direct the Continental training into the right channels.

66295. Entry to the Imperial Service was open to Indians. The fact that an Indian candidate had to go to London on the chance of getting selected did not, in his opinion, act as a deterrent, because in past years, the conditions of entry into the different Services of India had all been exactly the same. The Indian had not been aided by the State at all. The fact, however, remained, that in past years, although quite a number of Indians had been recruited to other Services, no Indian had till 1909 been recruited to the Forest Service. He inferred from this fact that the Indian did not, as a rule, desire to enter the Imperial Forest Service.

66296. It would be essential for any statutory native of India recruited to the Superior Service direct to have an English training. His training should not begin with his scientific course in Forestry, but earlier, and he should be brought up with the British spirit in him. The public school education was just as much necessary as the subsequent scientific training.

66297. If a man were selected by merit from the Provincial Service for transfer to the Imperial Service on the rate of pay he was then drawing, Government was not likely to make so many bad bargains as they would if a man were selected in India for direct recruitment to the Imperial Service and then sent to England for special scientific training.

66298. He did not desire that interchange of Officers between various Provinces should be so frequent as to disorganise existing arrangements, but if the best men from each province could be, from time to time, transferred, the Department would certainly benefit.

66299. At present an officer was called an Assistant Conservator for five years, and then became Deputy Conservator. There might or might not be differences in the work of the two Officers. The suggestion which was made with reference to that point was not so much in regard to the work done by a Deputy Conservator as with regard to the pay which was drawn by an Assistant Conservator when in charge of a division. The point it was desired to draw attention to was that owing to smallness of staff an Assistant Conservator was doing very responsible work which would normally be done by a Deputy Conservator, but was not given any extra pay for it. In practice it would never happen that an Assistant did an Assistant's work, but received a Deputy's pay.

66300. Under present conditions a certain number of officers took advantage of the privilege of optional retirement after 20 years' service. It would not be at all a good thing for the Service to encourage officers to retire after 20 years' service.

66301. In Burma there was a school for the training of Rangers and subordinates. The English class for Rangers had only been established for two or three years, but the subordinate class had

been going on for many years. The Dehra Dun Provincial Service course was far better than the Burma Rangers' course, but the Dehra Dun Rangers' course was probably no better than the Burma Rangers' course.

66302. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) When he said there might be transfer to the Imperial Service from the Provincial Service, he did not mean to recommend that that should be the only way of filling the Imperial Service. His reason for not objecting to such transfer was that he desired to see merit rewarded.

66303. Assuming it was decided to make the experiment of trying to recruit Indians for the upper branches of the Forestry Service, the best way of getting the right sort of men would be either to improve the conditions of Service in the Department or to recruit men by selection and examination in India when they were relatively young, and to train them for a few years in England, side by side both at school and college with Europeans. To select men from the Provincial Service and send them to England would be impossible, because they would not understand German or French, and would thus not benefit by the course on the Continent.

66304. (*Mr. Sly.*) The want of knowledge of German and French was a very grave obstacle, even if it was not insuperable.

66305. Although he did not object to transfers from the Provincial to the Imperial Service purely on the ground of merit, he did not suggest that that should be an alternative method of recruiting the Imperial Service.

66306. In Burma there was a distinct difference in the work and responsibility of major and minor charges, but it was very difficult to draw a line between the most important minor charge and the least important major charge.

66307. With regard to his statistics about officers recruited between the years 1878 and 1887, he was pretty sure that no Forest Officer died as the result of the Burmese War, which took place in 1885-86, although that was an exceptional time of stress and strife. It might be that that war affected the mortality figures, but he could not say definitely without analysing the causes of deaths. The work was much harder and more strenuous at present than it used to be, although there might be more amenities. Officers at present were more out in the rains than used to be the case.

66308. (*Mr. Fisher.*) There was a very large preponderance of opinion in favour of lowering the age for entering the Service. He had had 46 replies from different men in Burma, including replies from a large number of Oxford men, and only one had dissented from the view that the age for entering the Service should be lowered.

66309. He would not be in favour of having any kind of linguistic test in England, as he did not think it would be the slightest good. He would have the physical test as early as possible. It would not be necessary to repeat it at the end of a candidate's special training.

66310. (*Mr. Madga.*) The present medical examination had been unsatisfactory, judging by results.

66311. The whole of the Provincial Service in Burma was composed of Anglo-Indians, with the exception of two or three Burmans. Certain of the Anglo-Indians were in charge of divisions, and as far as he knew were doing very good work.

66312. (*Mr. Grieve.*) He did not suggest the admission of men in special cases from the Provincial to the Imperial Service as a system of recruitment. As a system of recruitment he would be very averse to it.

66313. (*Mr. Morden.*) He thought that if a certain number of deserving Provincial men were promoted to the Imperial Service if they did good work it would make the Provincial Service more popular. In regard to the time scale, he wanted the Provincial Forest Service to be in all respects equivalent to the Provincial Service of other Departments.

(The witness withdrew.)

19 January 1914.

Mr. R. M. KAVANAGH.

R. M. KAVANAGH, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the corporate views of the Burma Branch of the Provincial Forest Service Association.

66304. (I) **Methods of Recruitment.**—*Imperial Service.*—I am directed to invite the attention of the members of the Royal Commission to the following comments in connection with the system of recruitment of the Forest Service both Imperial and Provincial. As far back as the year 1882, the Editor of the “Indian Forester” expressed an opinion in the October issue, page 199, “that the training obtainable at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, was as good as any received on the Continent,” and recommended that “if the training at Cooper’s Hill, which had just then been started, proved unsatisfactory the members of the Imperial Forest Service should be trained at Dehra Dun.” This opinion was several years afterwards confirmed at a Conference of Imperial Officers held at Dehra Dun. These views are obtainable from the Government of India, while in paragraph 38 of the most recent resolution of the Government of India on Education (No. 301-C.D., dated the 3rd February, 1913), it is distinctly stated that the training in Forestry at Dehra Dun College, approximated the technical Education ordinarily obtainable in England or the Continent.

From the above authoritative statements as well as taking into consideration the gigantic spread of Education which will result from the crores of rupees which are being spent in that branch, my association is of opinion that it is not presumptuous to state that the Provincial Forest man educated at Dehra Dun is technically equal to those at present being trained in England and the Continent, especially as regards practical work.

Recruitment for the Imperial Branch of the Service should therefore as an act of justice be thrown open to men technically educated in India in the proportion of 1 to 2 recruited in Europe.

Provincial Service.—If the continuance of such a Service is considered desirable my association is of opinion that the present system appears unsatisfactory, inasmuch that nomination is required, which rests entirely in the hands of the Conservators. A man may be very suitable for one Conservator, whereas he may be extremely unfit in the eyes of another, while favouritism plays a conspicuous part. It is therefore suggested that certain schools and colleges in India and Burma be selected, and the Principals of those institutions asked to nominate two or more candidates from amongst their pupils, preferably with university degrees. Such nominated candidates should then be passed by the Selection Committee of each Province and be required to pass a competitive examination, on the result of which, final selection should depend. In this way alone can it be assured that the best men in the market will be obtained irrespective of caste or creed.

66305. (II) **System of Training and Probation.**—The present system of education and training at the Forest College, Dehra Dun, is satisfactory. The syllabus might, however, be suitably improved by a more elaborate course in Working Plans and Botany.

If necessary, candidates selected and trained in India for the Imperial Service as proposed under head I. of this memorandum may be despatched to an English University on a year’s probation.

This system is being followed with success in Mysore, Ceylon, and other colonies. The members of this Association are of opinion that members of the Imperial Service should serve their probationerships for a year at Dehra Dun in place of the arrangement prescribed in paragraphs (i), (ii), (iii), (iv.) of Government of India Circular No. 12F—55-2 of 10th May, 1911. Similar method has proved successful with recruits for the Imperial Police.

Provincial Officers should have only one year’s probationership as in the Public Works Department and Telegraphs. Sufficient safeguards for their continuing to do good work after confirmation

are to be found in their bonds and conditions for the grant of their annual increments. The period of probationership should, in the opinion of the members of the Association, be spent at the Provincial Forest School to which a candidate has been posted, in order that he may learn the vernacular, law, accounts, etc., and familiarize himself with the surrounding conditions of labour and work, as well as become acclimatized.

66306. (III) **Conditions of Service.**—These are without doubt exceptionally arduous, and an article on this subject in the “Indian Forester” will be found especially pertinent. Though this article deals with Imperial men only, the same, if not worse, can be said of the conditions of the Provincial men, as they have to stay in the jungles for longer periods, have as a rule to do all the harder and nastier work, and this on far less pay and transport.

The Survey Department, which is practically the only other service which has a taste of real jungle work in the forests of Burma, has a recess every year at a healthy and popular hill station. The officers of the Public Works Department on the other hand, whose training is akin to that of the Forest men, have metalled roads to travel on and substantial bungalows to live in. The Forester has to camp out in the heart of the forest and make himself as comfortable as he can in a tent generally 8 ft. by 8 ft., and has to depend in the hot weather on a small stagnant pool for his drinking water. Supplies from the nearest villages are often refused on the pretext that no fowls, etc., are obtainable in the village, while rice is obtained very often at famine rates.

Even shooting in a Reserved Forest is prohibited unless a licence is taken out, so that he has not even this small privilege granted him. The conditions of work, of travelling and of responsibilities are identical in both branches of this Service up to the rank of Conservator.

This is an admitted fact, an axiom against which no one will gainsay, yet, strange to say, invidious marked distinctions are being continually made. For example, the young Assistant Conservator is entitled to two Elephants for his transport, whereas the Extra Assistant, however senior he may be, is entitled to only one, under the same conditions of living and work. The conditions of service only vary as regards Revenue Ranges. All important Revenue Ranges are managed by Provincial men, some of whom have even obtained the highest honours in Forestry. Very often such officers are kept on such work for several years and usually commended for good work, but when eventually placed temporarily in charge of divisions are adversely commented on. Continued work in a subordinate position is detrimental to ambition and efficiency. On the other hand, his more fortunate brother officer in the Imperial Branch is very often posted to important charges when he is not even qualified in the language, law, accounts, etc., leave alone knowing much about administrative duties or the sylvicultural requirements of the various principal species he has to deal with. It is, therefore, nothing but just that an officer of the Provincial Service should be given a chance of holding charge of a Division after the tenth year of Service.

66307. (IV) **Conditions of Salary.**—*Salaries.*—The members of this Association are of opinion that if the present system of Imperial and Provincial Service is to be retained the present scale of pay for the Provincial branch is highly unsatisfactory, especially when compared with the Public Works and Telegraph Departments, which are sister Services. This unsatisfactory state is all the more accentuated when it is considered that the duties of a Forester are far more arduous and the life much more unhealthy. I am therefore directed to state that my association is of opinion that it would not only be just but extremely necessary for recruitment if the Provincial Forest Service was at least put on identical footing with the sister Services as regards pay and allowances.

19 January 1914.]

MR. R. M. KAVANAGH.

[Continued.]

Under the present system, a Forester *may* rise after 29 years' service to Rs. 850 per month provided he has managed to have successfully passed the several microscopic examinations and *selections* and is lucky enough to have a vacancy to step into. The Public Works Department and Telegraphs on the other hand rise from Rs. 250 to 850 automatically in 20 years, after which they can rise by selection to the important posts of Superintending or even Chief Engineer and Director of Telegraphs. This is unquestionably a great injustice and will not serve to make this Service popular for recruitment, for we have the extraordinary anomaly that the most arduous worked as well as one of the most revenue producing branches of the Public Service is the *worst paid* (to facilitate comparison a table is annexed). I am therefore, on behalf of the Association, directed to strongly recommend that if a Provincial Service is retained that an officer after a period of ten years should at least draw Rs. 550 and be ranked as Deputy Conservator. This should be the only selection in the whole of his service, for when the Local Government has selected a man for a major charge it should have the courage of its convictions and do away with the many unnecessary and harassing *special selections* as at present enforced. Such selected officers should then automatically rise to a maximum of Rs. 1,250 by annual increments of Rs. 50 per mensem. Officers already in the Service should be brought on to the scale thus proposed and if necessary listed posts created by reduction of appointments in the Imperial Branch—which is already far in excess of the sanctioned cadre. It is further proposed that the Government of India's suggestion regarding the opening up of administrative posts to Provincial men should be acted on, and in a large and prosperous province like Burma, one Conservatorship be reserved for this Service and the *full pay* of the grade as well as privileges as regards pensions, etc., be given to the officer selected for the post. My association regrets that a statement was made in paragraph 5 of Government of India Finance Department Circular No. 263, dated 28th October, 1909, to the effect that "none of the officers in the Provincial Service are at present qualified to take their place as Conservators," and considers the statement *unwarranted* as far as Burma members are considered.

Allowances.—The Local and other special allowances should be *identical for both branches of this Service*, for the deductions on account of transport, rest houses, rent for dwelling houses, servants' wages and prices of the daily necessities of life are *identical* and not reduced *a picco* because an officer belongs to the *Provincial Service*. In connection with this question of allowance my association would invite the attention of the members of the Royal Commission to the report drawn up by the Burma Local Allowance Commission, in which it has been conclusively proved that living in Burma is 50 per cent. more expensive than India and that the present allowances are *inadequate*.

Two very pertinent cases in point of allowances are—(1) That a Provincial Forest Officer when stationed in the expensive Town of Rangoon is *not* entitled to any presidency house allowance, although such allowances are liberally granted to Imperial officers, and strange to say to other Provincial Services, such as the Public Works Department and Telegraphs.

(2) In India and the whole of Burma a Provincial Officer drawing a salary of Rs. 500 and over is, under Article 1002, C. S. R., classed as a first class officer for the purpose of allowance, but not so the poor Provincial Forest Officer whose maximum pay of the class is Rs. 550. He, according to the ruling of the Accountant-General, is a second class officer and is expected to travel with his clerks and subordinates, who, strange to say are *entitled to the same accommodation by rail*. Needless to say that such invidious distinctions are incompatible with the social status of such officers and detrimental to discipline. Therefore in the opinion of the members of this association the Service should be placed on the *same footing* as officers of the sister Services, the P.W.D. and Telegraphs, the members of which are recruited from the *same*

source, have a similar training and can travel about far more comfortably, while as regards elephant transport no invidious distinction should be made between the Imperial and Provincial Officer.

66308. (V) *Conditions of Leave.*—Certain alterations in the leave rules have recently been promulgated by the Government of India and it is strongly suggested that the Provincial Forest Service should partake in its benefits. The commutation of long leave on half pay to short periods on full pay is greatly desired, while it is suggested that privilege leave should be allowed to accumulate to the extent of six months so as to enable officers to proceed on leave on full pay, while all furlough, irrespective of whether it is spent in Europe or India, should count towards pension. This being a Service in which the duties are arduous, and both branches of the Service work under *identical conditions* my association considers it fair and equitable that the *same rules* as regards leave should apply to both Services.

66309. (VI) *Conditions of Pension.*—Owing to the extremely arduous life of a Forester, conditions of service, and the extraordinary high death rate, my association is of opinion that the period qualifying for ordinary pension should be reduced from 30 to 25 years including periods *spent on furlough* and a retiring pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum granted at the rate of exchange of 1s. 9d. the rupee, and that if an officer be retained after this period in the interests of the public service, an annual increment of Rs. 400 be given up to the 30th year. After 20 years' service, including furlough, pension on medical certificate be granted on half pay, while an invalid pension to the extent of Rs. 2,000 per annum be granted after 10 years' service, and that this amount should rise automatically by annual increments of Rs. 200 per annum up to Rs. 4,000 after 20 years.

66310. (VII) *Limitations to the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing division into Imperial and Provincial.*—Considering that the duties of officers in both branches of this Service are *identical* the separation of the Service into an Imperial and Provincial is unsatisfactory and a source of grievance, as previous to the re-organisation of 1891 there was no such rigid class distinction and the Imperial door was opened to men in India and those recruited under the old rules have risen to the highest administrative posts in India. I am directed to state that the association considers that the closing of the Imperial door by that re-organisation was cruel, unjustifiable, and tends to prevent the best class of youths from joining the Forest Department. The differentiation of pay and allowances cannot under any circumstances be explained—and it is therefore in the interests of the Service absolutely necessary that this undesirable barrier be broken down. This can only be done by bringing the Provincial Service and the same list as Imperial Officers and dropping the derogatory term "extra" as well as paying the men far better salaries and promoting men of merit (not necessarily the most senior) direct into the Imperial Branch and giving them exactly the same pay as the Imperial brother officer.

66311. (VIII) *Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.*—The only relation between this and the Indian Civil Service is that the Divisional Officer is an assistant to the Deputy Commissioner in Forest matters. There is no relation with other services—under this heading however comparisons may be drawn. In the Civil Service of Burma five appointments are listed for deserving superintendencies in the Imperial Police, while no such post has been created in the Imperial Forest Service in which Service the members of both Services do *exactly the same work*, and as far as their profession goes having received practically the same technical training. At public and even social functions invidious distinctions are drawn which naturally tend to discredit Provincial officers, whether of high or low grade in the eyes of the other Services, more particularly the people over whom in their official capacity they have to rule. Many high officials are above treating Provincial Officers in the manner above described, but there

19 January 1914.]

MR. R. M. KAVANAGH.

[Continued.]

are others who do not hesitate to give precedence to the most junior Imperial Officer over Provincial Officers whose duties and responsibilities alone should entitle them to proper respect. I am therefore directed to state that the members of this Association strongly suggest that officers of whatever branch of the Service who have attained to such recognised positions as Sud-Divisional Officer, Magistrate or Divisional Forest Officer should be given rank and precedence accordingly, and that this can only be done by a recognised ruling from which there should be no deviation. In this connection the Association is also of opinion that it is a mistake on the part of the Local Government to publish periodically translated lists of designations in which attempts to interpret such prefixes as *Extra* usually results in giving agriculturists and residents of the mofussil an impression that officers distinguished as *Extras* are subordinates whose mandates need not be heeded. It is therefore suggested that it would be far better for the prestige of Government officials as a whole if fine distinctions of rank between Imperial and Provincial were left out when not actually required. The charge held by an officer and the powers delegated should stand as his official designation and he be given precedence accordingly.

66312. (IX) Other points.—(1) I am directed to suggest that the members of the Association consider that a great boon would be conferred if the wives and children of officers be given free medical attendance as in the case of Military officers.

(2) Favourable rates be granted to officers and families proceeding on leave by steamers.

(3) That as it has conclusively been proved (*vide* report of the Burma Allowance Commission) that officers on transfer are put to considerable loss, the existing allowances both by rail and steamer be doubled so as to more or less cover expenses, and furthermore officers should not be transferred oftener than absolutely necessary in the interests of the Public Service.

(4) The attention of the Commission is also in-

vited to the fact that in the Provincial Service in Burma there are five existing vacancies in the Extra Deputy grade and 14 in the Extra Assistant Conservators class which have not yet been filled up, while in the Imperial cadre there are five supernumeraries. It is therefore suggested that the existing vacancies should be filled and the present probationers be confirmed as has been the case with many of those who joined the Service in the Indian Provinces.

(5) In conclusion the attention of the members of the Commission is drawn to the resolution of the Government of India Department of Revenue and Agriculture, No. 17F.—37-33, dated Simla, 22nd June, 1911, paragraph 2, clause IVb (iii), regarding the promotion of officers under the new re-organisation scheme who were already Extra Deputy Conservator. In the original resolution as sanctioned it was intended that the officers of the Provincial Forest Service should be dealt with liberally and existing officers treated as if they had been on the new scale of pay throughout their service (*vide* Government of Burma F. D. No. 64—17A-11, dated 6th May, 1912, and the Accountant-General's letter No. Gaz.—3123, dated 2nd November, paragraph 2), but no such liberal treatment has been meted out in Burma to the senior officers of this Service, and although this is now considered a time scale service no allowance has been made for the fact of the first named officer on the list being four years senior to the next and so on downwards, and due promotion withheld in sums varying from Rs. 50 to 100, and this for no fault of these officers, whereas in India officers of similar length of services have in all cases been given the full benefit of the re-organisation.

(6) The members of the Burma Branch of the Association are of unanimous opinion that confidential reports as regards work and character of an officer are unnecessary, and the institution a hateful one, and that it would be far better to make all such charges and reports in the usual official manner so as to give every officer a chance of defending himself publicly.

Difference between Imperial and Provincial.

Engineers and Telegraphs.			Forests.		
Years of Service.	Pay.		Years of Service.	Pay.	
	Imperial.	Provincial.		Imperial.	Provincial.
1	Rs. 380	Rs. 250	1	Rs. 380	Rs. 250
2	420	275	2	420	270
3	460	300	3	460	290
4	500	325	4	500	310
5	540	350	5	540	330
6	580	375			
7	620	400			
8	660	425	6	580	350
9	700	450	7	620	370
10	750	475	8	660	390
Executive Engineer.	Superintendent of Telegraphs.		9	700	410
11	800	535	10	750	430
12	850	570	11	800	450
13	900	605	12	850	470
14	950	640	13	900	490
15	1,000	675	14	950	510
16	1,050	710	15	1,000	530
17	1,100	745	16	1,050	550
18	1,150	780	17	1,100	575
19	1,200	815	18	1,150	600
20	1,250	850	19	1,200	625
Maximum pay.			20	1,250	650
			21 to 23		700
			24 to 26		800
			27		850
				Maximum.	

19 January 1914.]

MR. R. M. KAVANAGH.

[Continued.]

Comparison table of Pay in the three sister Provincial Services.

P. W. D.			Telegraphs.		Forests.	
Serial No.	Per mensem.	Per annum.	Per mensem.	Per annum.	Per mensem.	Per annum.
1	Rs. 250	Rs. 3,000	Rs. 250	Rs. 3,000	Rs. 250	Rs. 3,000
2	275	3,300	275	3,300	270	3,240
3	300	3,600	300	3,600	290	3,480
4	325	3,900	325	3,900	310	3,720
5	350	4,200	350	4,200	330	3,960
6	375	4,500	375	4,500	350	4,200
7	400	4,800	400	4,800	370	4,440
8	425	5,100	425	5,100	390	4,680
9	450	5,400	450	5,400	410	4,920
10	475	5,700	590	6,000	430	5,160
11	535	6,420	535	6,420	450	5,400
12	570	6,840	570	6,840	470	5,640
13	605	7,260	605	7,260	490	5,800
14	640	7,680	640	7,680	510	6,120
15	675	8,100	675	8,100	530	6,360
16	710	8,520	710	8,520	550	6,600
17	745	8,940	745	8,940	575	6,900
18	780	9,360	780	9,360	600	7,200
19	815	9,780	815	9,780	625	7,500
20	850	10,200	850	10,200	650	7,800
21		126,800		126,000	700	106,200
22		+20,400		+20,700	700	...
23	Rising to :—Administrative Posts.				700	...
24		1,200		1,200	800	...
25		1,400		1,400	800	...
26		1,600		1,600	800	...
27		2,750		1,800	850	...

In 20 years alone, an officer joining the Provincial Forest Service loses Rs. 20,700 and has none of the higher administrative posts thrown open to him.

MR. R. M. KAVANAGH called and examined.

66313. (Chairman.) Witness held the position of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests. He had had 22 years' service. He was trained at Dehra Dun.

66314. The training in practical forestry obtainable in India was far better and more useful than any training obtainable by a student in a period of six months spent in Germany, France or America. The length of the Dehra Dun course was two years. Of that period half was spent in practical work in forests.

66315. The theory of forestry which was learnt in Germany or France did not apply to Indian forests as the conditions varied considerably. He did not speak with any personal knowledge of the training in Germany.

66316. He recommended that a third of the vacancies in the Superior Service should be definitely allocated to men recruited in India through the Dehra Dun course. He would allot a certain proportion of that one-third to direct re-entrants, and the remainder to deserving officers of the Provincial Service.

66317. He would give the boys taken direct from the College a European training, but he would not send the promoted men from the Provincial Service to Europe, as he did not think it would be of any value to a man of 15 years' service.

66318. A proportion of the vacancies in the Provincial Service should be filled by Rangers, and the rest by direct recruitment.

66319. He objected to the present system of recruitment by nomination by Conservators for the Provincial Service. It would be far preferable to have a Selection Committee composed of Forest Officers. After five or six candidates had been provisionally selected there should be a competitive examination, any physical fitness and social standing should be taken into consideration. The result of the present method of selection was that there were men at present in the Service who should never have been admitted.

66320. Owing to the re-organisation scheme, men now went direct into Dehra Dun without spending six months' probationary period in the forest. He did not think that system as satisfactory as the former practice, which gave a boy an idea of the sort of life he would have to lead as a Forest Officer.

66321. After the Dehra Dun course, Provincial Officers should be kept on probation for one year only. Sufficient safeguard was to be found in the bond, which laid it down that a man must remain in the Government Service for three years.

66322. Provincial Officers in the Forest Service should be placed on the same conditions as regards salary as the Officers in the Public Works Department. Both received practically the same technical education.

66323. He would regard it as important that an Officer coming from Europe should be allowed in his salary something in the nature of a Foreign

19 January 1914.]

MR. R. M. KAVANAGH.

[Continued.]

Service allowance. The recommendation that the maximum salary of an Extra Deputy Conservator should be the same as the maximum salary of the Deputy Conservator was based on the supposition that the Imperial Service were going to receive an increase as the result of the Commission's deliberations.

66324. No official reason had been given for denying the Rangoon house allowance to Provincial Forest Officers. Nearly every other Department received it.

66324A. He did not know what his colleagues desired in regard to the establishment of a Family Pension Fund, but personally he thought they should be obliged to subscribe to a fund of this sort.

66325. (Mr. Madge.) He had never found that his training at Dehra Dun was inadequate to any responsibility or duty that had been put upon him.

66326 (Mr. Fisher.) While he advocated the abolition of the distinction between the Imperial and the Provincial Service, on the ground that Officers of both Services were doing exactly the same work, he agreed that that proposition would only apply to a limited number of the Provincial Service Officers in the higher grades, i.e., Extra Deputy Conservators. The Extra Deputies would not be entrusted with minor charges, because that would be directly opposed to the Government of India resolution that all Extra Deputy Conservators must be placed in major control. It was very difficult to say what was a major and minor charge, because what to-day was a major charge, might to-morrow be a minor charge, and vice versa. As far as Burma was concerned, it would not be true to say that Extra Deputies were given less responsible work to do than officers of the Imperial Service. He advocated a system under which there should be a selection bar after a period of 10 years' service. There should be no further selection bar, because if a man, after 10 years' service, and one year's probation, had done excellent work, and was selected for a major charge, there would be no necessity for exercising further selection. He did not think that the effect of this would be to put a premium upon inertia, because if a man got slack, his increments could be stopped.

66327. There was very considerable feeling in favour of the abolition of the word "Extra."

66328. (Mr. Sly.) When an officer got into the Extra Deputy grade he was put on a time scale. There were then three further selections. When he arrived at the Rs. 650 grade he could not expect anything further, unless he was specially selected by the local Government. After he had served that period for another year, he was specially selected again for the Rs. 700, and then when he had done the three years he was once more specially selected for the Rs. 800. Such microscopical examinations of record were not in vogue in any other service, and they should be done away with in the case of the Forest Service.

66329. He could refer to no special order abolishing the rule that a man nominated for Dehra Dun had to undergo a period of practical training in the Forest before he was allowed to enter the col-

lege. He did not know of any Extra Assistant Conservator in Burma who had undergone the six months' course in the forest.

66330. (Sir Valentine Chiro.) The educational advantages to be gained from a course at Dehra Dun in future were considerably greater than those he obtained during his own term of study there. Therefore it could be assumed that men who left Dehra Dun in future would be even more competent from the outset than they were in his day, to do efficient work in the department.

66331. If, after five or eight years' service, men were chosen from the Provincial Service, for the Imperial Branch, and were then sent to Europe for a year's training, it would improve their usefulness in the Imperial Service, and that scheme would not offer the same disadvantages as the other scheme which had been suggested by a previous witness, of sending men to England after 15 years' service, when they were at a less receptive age.

66332. A smart young officer who had had five or eight years' actual experience in forestry work would be in a better position to benefit from a European course than a youth who was sent direct to England after a period of training at Dehra Dun without any practical experience of the Service.

66333. (Mr. Modder.) He had had two Imperial officers serving under him, and they had not been able to teach him his work, with all the advantage they possessed of their study in Europe, because they had only just come out to the country. Experience in India went a long way, because after all, forestry was a life study, and not a thing that could be learnt in six months or three years. Men could see in Europe the method by which the forests were worked, but a study of conifers and pines could not help a man to decide what method to adopt for teak.

66334. (Chairman.) His colleagues asked for the period of service for pension to be reduced from 30 to 25 years. There were some officers at present in the Service who were over the age of 50. They were occupying the positions of Extra Deputy Conservators and were discharging exactly the same duties as Deputies.

66335. It did not matter how far a man climbed up the ladder of the Forestry Department, the arduousness of the work was exactly the same. A Conservator's work was just as hard as that of a Divisional Officer. He made the proposal for a reduction to 25 years because he considered the work of forestry was work which became unduly severe after the age of 50. If the term of service was reduced to 25 years on the present basis of recruitment, an officer would retire between the ages of 48 and 50.

66336. One point which he desired to bring before the Commission was the confirmation of the present Extra Assistant Conservators who were on probation in Burma. Many of the men who came out first on the list with honours in forestry, and who were instructors at the local school were still on probation in Burma and had been so for nearly three years, while officers who passed low down on the list had been confirmed in India.

(The witness withdrew.)

29 January 1914.]

At Calcutta, Tuesday, 20th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

J. W. A. GRIEVE, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests.

E. A. C. MONNER, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

T. H. MONTAETH, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa.

*Written Statement relating to the Forest Department,
being a Memorandum* on the Imperial Forest
Service by Mr. H. Carter, Conservator of Forests,
Bihar and Orissa.*

66337. (I) Method of Recruitment. The present system of recruitment under which it is imperative to have a degree in science has not been in force a sufficiently long time to prove or disprove its merits, but it appears to me to have several serious drawbacks. In the first place it forces officers to start their career in India too late in life. Probably they would be at least 22 before they took their degree and with their special training they would be 25 or older before they entered on their duties. I consider that 20 or 21 is more suitable. In the next place a degree in science may or may not be useful. It shows a mental bent in the proper direction, but an officer might specialise and take his degree in some branch which would be of no practical use to him hereafter. Again the present system must prevent many suitable candidates from entering the Service; many men cannot afford to spend the time and money in obtaining a science degree on the chance of their being then selected for the Forest Department, as a failure to get so selected would make them too old and probably unsuitably trained for most other professions.

It would be preferable to revert to a system more nearly resembling that in force formerly. The conditions of service have been improved and probably sufficient candidates would now come forward. I would recommend a system of nomination combined with competitive examination, such examination to be on fairly wide lines and to include all subjects usually taught on the modern side or in the Army class of a public school. I should like the age limit to be 17 to 19 years to be followed by a two or three years' special course; if the cramming system could be avoided by giving nominations to public school boys who had shown a special physical and mental attitude for the Service, so much the better.

66338. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The present system of training under which candidates can go to any of three universities, appears to me wrong. Probationers for the Indian Forest Service require training on special lines apart from the training which would suit Foresters in general. Such training can only be given if there are sufficient students, and with the

* Copies of this Memorandum were circulated to all Imperial Forest Service officers in Bihar and Orissa. The Deputy Conservator of Forests, Singhbhum Division, remarked as follows:—"I beg to inform you that I agree with all the views expressed, except that in regard to the pensions I would propose the following:

	Rs.
After 28 years' service	650
After 28 years' service, of which at least 3 as Conservator	750
After 3 years' as Chief Conservator of Forests	850
After 3 years as Inspector-General of Forests	1,000."

small number recruited annually for India, it would be almost impossible, unless the students are in the same institution. By adopting the latter course *esprit de corps* would be developed, and this is a great asset in promoting keenness in the work of the Department. As regards the actual training, I consider sufficient attention is not paid to engineering, especially on the practical side; as every Forest Officer has much engineering work to do it would be preferable for him to come to India trained therein in place of having to pick it up after he arrives.

66339. (III) Conditions of Service.—These are particularly hard on officers in the Forest Department, as is evidenced by the large percentage of officers who have died on retired or reduced pension. Such hardships cannot be avoided, but they might be mitigated by the transfer of officers from Province to Province as occasion requires. It is hard on an officer who has been appointed to an unhealthy Province, or to one that does not suit his constitution, to be practically obliged to spend all his service there. More frequent transfers would increase his general knowledge and usefulness, and the only real drawback would be the necessity of acquiring a new language.

66340. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—No change appears necessary in the salary of officers below the rank of Conservator, but the pay of the latter is insufficient compared with that of a Deputy Conservator of Forests, and there should be a rise of at least Rs. 500 per mensem on attaining to that rank, and a corresponding rise on attaining to the special billets of Chief Conservator of Forests or Inspector-General of Forests. Although the Conservator has great administrative responsibilities, is a selected officer and generally has the greater expense entailed by living at Government Headquarters as the Head of a Department, his pay as Conservator is only Rs. 250 more than that of a Deputy Conservator of Forests, and in Burma, owing to the former getting no local allowance, the difference is only Rs. 150, and from personal experience I know the Conservator is worse off financially, and cases have occurred in which officers have refused these higher posts, probably because they could not afford to take them. In 1905-06 I believe the Government of India suggested that the rates of pay should be—

Rs. 1,500, 1,750, and 2,000 for Conservators.

Rs. 2,500 for Chief Conservators.

Rs. 3,000 for Inspector-General of Forests.

I consider these rates would be suitable if the Rs. 1,500 grade was abolished.

66341. (V) Conditions of Leave.—With the alternatives proposed by the Government of India these would appear suitable provided that—

(a) The minimum furlough allowance be £400 or the salary last drawn whichever is least. Under present conditions the present allowance may be too small even for a single man to live on, bene-

20 January 1914.]

Mr. T. H. MONTEATH.

[Continued.]

ficially, in England, and as the maximum allowable is £800 the minimum should, on the analogy of the Indian Civil Service, be £400.

(b) The option of commuting long leave on half-pay to half the period due on full pay be given to officers. This would have to be subject to certain limitations but would be a change welcomed by most officers.

66342. (VI) **Conditions of Pension.**—The maximum pension at present obtainable appears inadequate: it (Rs. 5,000) was fixed 25 years ago when the rupee was two, when living was cheaper, and when the amount represented half the pay of a senior Deputy Conservator of Forests. The latter has now been increased as has the cost of living while the value of the rupee is less. I consider that the minima should be £350 after 20 years' service, and £500 after 25 years' service.

The principle of an extra pension for specially selected posts such as the Chief Conservator of Forests has been recognised both in the Forest Department and in other Departments, while it might also be desirable to offer inducements to good men to remain in the Service who had not been fortunate enough to get a Conservatorship. On the other hand such inducements might result in ineffective officers, with no great longing for England, to remain on in the Service and draw their pay to the loss of effective administration. I would therefore recommend compulsory retirement of officers of 25 years' service or more who are deemed inefficient or incompetent, and would give the following enhanced pensions:—

After 28 years' service	£600
After 28 years' service of which			
at least 3 years as Conservator	...	650	
After 3 years' as Chief Conservator			
of Forests	...	700	
After 3 years' as Inspector-General			
of Forests	...	800	

The present invalid pension after ten years' service does not represent a living wage. As the officer concerned has lost his health in Government service and is very unlikely to obtain other employment the minimum invalid pension should be £150 per annum, increasing by £20 annually for each year's service up to 20 years.

66343. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division

of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—At present there are no limitations to the employment of Indians, in fact they enjoy the privilege of prior marriage which is denied to Europeans. I do not think that any changes under this head are called for, nor do the conditions of forest life or the pay appear to appeal to Indians of the best families in the way other Services do. The working of the present system of division into Imperial and Provincial Services is good and no change is advisable, as the present proportion of highly trained and educated officers in the Imperial Service is necessary to maintain the efficiency of the Department.

66344. (VIII) **Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—These are laid down by rule and although the practice varies in different provinces, the system generally is satisfactory in that it recognises the Deputy Commissioner as the head of the district generally while allowing freedom of action in purely professional matters.

66345. (IX) **Other points.**—The question of a family pension fund in addition to or in place of the present provident fund should, I think, be dealt with by an expert and the opinion of the Department generally taken as to the advisability of accepting his proposals.

Other points which, I think, require attention and which affect other Departments as well as the Forest Department are the granting of favourable passage rates on steamers and the increase of allowances on transfer. As regards the former, the present high rates prove a deterrent to many officers whose health demands leave in England, and considering the number of officers who go on leave, the support, and I might say advantages, which the steamship companies derive from Government, the servants of the latter might receive some concession, a concession already enjoyed by persons in some ranks of life.

With reference to increased rates of allowance on transfer, the losses incurred by officers have been represented on previous occasions, and have, I believe, met with sympathetic attention from the Government of India without practical result. I would strongly urge that these allowances be arranged on such a scale that an officer does not suffer pecuniary loss in addition to the discomfort necessarily involved in a transfer.

Mr. T. H. MONTEATH called and examined.

66346. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Deputy Conservator and had 17 years' service. The cadre in Bihar and Orissa was a very small one. There were five officers in the Imperial Service, including one Conservator, and five officers in the Provincial Service in charge of divisions, and two attached.

66347. There was not sufficient provision for leave and training in the cadre.

66348. Ordinarily an Officer in the Forest Department remained in one Province. An Officer could be promoted, to any Province as Conservator, but in the ordinary course of events an officer was not promoted to a Conservatorship except in the Province in which he was ordinarily serving.

66349. Certain Provinces habitually obtained the pick of the candidates. Those who passed first on the list generally went to the United Provinces or the Punjab. Such a state of things was not satisfactory. Officers should not be given a choice of provinces; that should be determined by Government. He did not know whether such a system was advisable, but it was the only alternative he could suggest. An Officer who passed out first was not necessarily the best Forest Officer.

66350. With regard to recruitment in England, he suggested recruitment at the school-leaving age by means of nomination followed by competition. He regarded nomination as important. A severe medical and physical test would not be sufficient without selection. He admitted there were

serious difficulties in practice in the way of selection. For instance, there was the possibility of a good man being rejected, but, on the whole, selection would be an advantage.

66351. He was anxious to see candidates for the Forestry Service trained in the same institution, either Oxford or Cambridge, and he recommended a course of two years' training.

66352. He suggested the abolition of the Honours degree in science first with the object of lowering the age of arrival in India and secondly because a degree was not absolutely necessary. He thought all the subjects in the Honours course were useful to some extent, but it was not absolutely necessary to specialise in science. The chief consideration, however, was to get an Officer out to India younger.

66353. Taking into consideration the arduous nature of the Service, he considered that when a man reached 50 he probably, with the best intentions, was not profitable to the State, so that the reduction of age at entry would have the additional advantage of establishing what he considered to be the economic age for retirement.

66354. He suggested certain improvements in pay, amongst others a rise to Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000 for Conservators. There would be definite advantages, he thought, in having an incremental scale of Rs. 1,750 to Rs. 2,000 for Officers in this grade. He was not in favour of dividing

20 January 1914.]

Mr. T. H. MONTEATH.

[Continued.]

the present time-scale for Assistants and Deputy into compartments.

66355. He could not say whether his colleagues were favourably disposed towards a Family Pension Fund. Personally, he would be more in favour of a Provident Fund.

66355A. Officers at present did not take leave owing partly to the exigencies of the service and partly also to their not being able to afford leave on the present allowances.

66356. With regard to the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial branches, he considered no change was advisable. It was necessary to have a proportion of highly trained and educated Officers in the Imperial Service to maintain efficiency. Certain charges now held by Provincial Officers were similar both in character and in responsibility to those held by Imperial Officers. He would regard it as important that all charges of a similar character should be in the same Service, and such charges as those he had referred to should not be marked as inferior to those held by Imperial Officers. The distinction between the minor and major charges was a very artificial one, and it would be a good thing if it were abolished. To that extent he would be prepared to modify the present organisation.

66357. With regard to the admission of statutory natives of India to the superior Service, there would be advantage in sending statutory natives to England, and making them undergo a similar course to that taken by European candidates.

66358. (Mr. Mudge.) He was of the opinion that an Officer coming out at the age of 23 was sufficiently developed to withstand the rigours of the climate. He was not aware of the fact that it had been proved that the younger a man was when he arrived in India the worse were his prospects of keeping in good health. If that were the case it would affect his opinion about reducing the age at entry. If an officer coming out at 25 years had a very much better chance of keeping his health, it would be a point to be considered.

66359. He did not think desirable men would be excluded if the science degree qualification were abolished.

66360. Under the grade of Conservator the Provincial cadres were kept quite separate. It was an advantage to a man to have as much experience of the different conditions of the country as possible. If the separate lists were retained all Deputy Conservators were shut out from the chance of that wider experience. From that point of view there should be one Imperial list for the whole country.

66361. He did not believe in recruiting for the Imperial Service in India. He did not say that because he believed the training at Dehra Dun was defective, but because the European training must have obvious advantages. The charges under the control of Provincial men were very well worked, and he admitted that it must follow from that that their training in India must have been sufficient to enable them to work in that way, but they laboured under some disadvantage in not having a knowledge of Continental forests. If a Provincial man did the work efficiently, the question was whether an Imperial man would not do it even more efficiently with his wider experience.

66362. He would remove the distinction between major and minor charges, and have uniform charges.

66363. He had had domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians working under him, and he had found they had performed their duties exceedingly well.

66364. Conditions of forest life did not appeal to Indians generally. He judged that from the infrequency of their applications to enter the department.

66365. (Mr. Fisher.) At present a young officer coming out from England was attached to a division, and given, as far as possible, general experience and training in that division under the supervision of a divisional officer. He was then given a range charge for six months, in order to

learn the details of the administration work. That was a sufficient period in which to give him a thorough knowledge of the minor details of the work. Then he was given experience of the ordinary work of a division—road making, buildings, sylvicultural work, marking trees, and so on. The present system of training was adequate. Three years ought to elapse before an officer was promoted to a divisional charge, but it often happened that an officer had the entire charge of a division with much less experience.

66366. Half the Rangers in Bihar and Orissa were trained at Dehra Dun and half at Kurseong. He thought the Dehra Dun man was a more highly educated man, but from the practical point of view there was not very much difference between the two colleges.

66367. (Mr. Sly.) One reason for his suggesting that a man should come out earlier was that the sooner he started the better it was in his own interest. He could retire earlier, and if a man of 22 years found he was not suited to the life of a Forest Officer, he would still be fairly young and could take up other appointments. His recommendation was made in the interests of the officers themselves, and not in the interests of Government or the Service. If the age was reduced in the manner suggested, and the officer was brought out young, he would still consider that an officer with a minimum of three years' service would be capable of holding charge of a division. A man became a Deputy at the end of his fifth year. He did not know what the idea of Government was in fixing that rule. He was not aware that the scheme of recruitment to the Service was that a man should rise to a divisional charge in his sixth year.

66368. Assuming that the age for recruitment was reduced, as suggested, and assuming also that improvement was made in the pension, he still considered his Service should press voluntary retirement at the age of 42. Optional retirement at 42 would be a good system from the point of view of Government. Men of ambition, and men whose health had not suffered, would stay on after 42, and even apart from ambition, they would remain on for the sake of the extra pension. His Service would welcome an improvement in the pension scale even on condition that voluntary retirement at 20 years should be abolished.

66369. He did not know the exact principles laid down by Government for determining major and minor charges. The reason why he described the distinction as artificial was because a charge at one time might be a major one, and at another time a minor one. He did not mean in the least to suggest that on the whole the major charges were of no greater importance than the minor charges.

66370. He had no experience of the men who had joined the Provincial Service under the new system in vogue in Dehra Dun.

66371. Promotion from the Ranger class to the Provincial Service should not be entirely discontinued; there should still be openings for men of the Ranger class, of approved ability to become Extra Assistant Conservators. He would not suggest any fixed proportion.

66372. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) It was too soon yet to judge what the product of Dehra Dun under the new system would be, so that all the opinions he had expressed with regard to the capacity of the statutory native of India, and of the position assigned to him in the Forest Department were based only upon his experience of a system which was in process of complete transformation. He would not rule the statutory native of India entirely out of the Imperial Service, but for the present, as their value was not known, he would only provide for one or two specially selected men of approved ability being promoted to the Imperial Service above their fifth year of service. If promoted they should be placed in the same grade of pay as they had been drawing, and should rank according to their seniority.

66373. He admitted that if a European trained man was placed in a responsible charge at about 26 years of age after three years training, he

20 January 1914.]

Mr. T. H. MONTEATH.

[Continued.]

would have under him a number of natives of India who had been trained at Dehra Dun and elsewhere, very considerably his senior in age, but he did not think that would be a disadvantage. The same thing happened under the old scheme. He did not think the Provincial Service would feel that this reflected on them in any way.

66374. (Mr. Modder.) Formerly he had been in

charge of the Puri Division. At present a Provincial officer was in charge of that division, and had been specially mentioned by the Conservator for good work. He was quite willing to admit that Provincial officers had done some extremely good work. The making of working plans was of great importance, and a fairly well trained man was required for that sort of work.

(The witness withdrew.)

R. G. A. HANNAH, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the corporate Memorandum of the Provincial Forest Service Officers of Bihar and Orissa.*

66375. (I) Method of Recruitment.—The standard of educational qualification deemed necessary has been left in the hands of the Local Government (vide Appendix XI. of the Forest Code 7th Edition), and this arrangement is quite satisfactory and desirable.

The selection of probationers for the Provincial Forest Service should be made by the Local Government as laid down in the Appendix to the Forest Department Code above referred to.

As at present constituted the Imperial Forest Service is solely manned by men recruited in England and practically contains no Indians. On the other hand, it contains several members (Europeans and Anglo-Indians) who have gone home, qualified and entered the Service from England. In the past also often members recruited in India through the Provincial Forest Service were admitted to the Imperial Forest Service and served with distinction.

66376. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The training at present imparted at the Imperial Forest College at Dehra Dun seems sufficient, and the new rule prescribing a separate course for the Provincial Forest Service is an improvement, bringing it into line with that imparted to Imperial Forest Service Probationers. The preliminary course of practical training or primary test before admission to the College at Dehra Dun should be extended to twelve months. The period of training embracing both the preliminary practical test and the two years spent at the College should be treated as Probationary. This would be in accord with the Probationary Rules for the Imperial Forest Service.

66377. (III) Conditions of Service.—Probationers who obtain a Diploma of Forestry at the Forest College, Dehra Dun, and who are pronounced medically fit and free from physical defects and satisfy any other tests as may be prescribed, should be directly appointed to posts of Assistant Conservators of Forests as suggested in paragraph 6 (1).

The whole Gazetted Forest Staff, comprising both the Imperial and Provincial Forest Service in a circle, should be borne on an amalgamated list as is the case in the Public Works Department.

Officers in the Provincial Forest Service labour under the following disadvantages:—

(i) Members of the Provincial Forest Service are termed "Extra Assistant Conservators" or "Extra Deputy Conservators." The prefix "Extra" is unnecessary, as they form an integral part of a permanent service and carry out the same duties as are entrusted to members of the Imperial Forest Service. The prefix is not used in the Public Works Department, for example, and no inconvenience seems ever to have resulted.

(ii) When appointed as Instructors in the Forest College at Dehra Dun Provincial Officers are designated "Assistant Instructors," while Imperial Officers are called "Instructors," although the

former perform exactly the same duties. There seems to be no reason for this distinction. No such distinction is observed in the Indian University Colleges between the Provincial and Imperial Professors, who are all designated "Professors" only.

The Provincial Forest Service is manned by a fairly large proportion of European and Anglo-Indian officers, who have been recruited and have had their training in India. In the past some of them have risen to be Conservators and one also to be Chief Conservator, while all such officers formerly entered the Imperial Forest Service or Upper Controlling Staff by promotion. There seems to be no adequate reason why this should not be made possible still. We would propose that deserving and capable officers of the Provincial Forest Service, after entering the class of Deputy Conservator (as proposed in paragraph 6 (1)) should be selected for entry into the Imperial Forest Service on equal terms as to pay, leave, and pension rules, and should be eligible for the same appointments. The posts of Superintending Engineer and Chief Engineer are not closed to Provincial Engineers, and our proposal is the more reasonable in view of the new separate and improved course sanctioned for the training of members of the Provincial Forest Service.

In the matter of confidential reports on officers, when adverse comments are made against any officers, the latter should invariably receive a copy of such comments, and an opportunity should be given him to explain or meet such adverse remarks in his own defence.

Charges of Divisions should ordinarily go by seniority in the proposed amalgamated list of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Officers, unless there be anything against any individual officer.

Every Imperial Forest Service Officer should be required to remain in actual charge of a Range for at least two years, and no officer recruited from England should be placed in charge of a Division before he has completed five years' active forest service in India. The same rule should apply also to the Provincial Forest Service Officers appointed after two years' training in the Forest College at Dehra Dun.

As already suggested, the Imperial and Provincial Service Officers should be placed on one amalgamated list, and the division into Upper and Lower Controlling Staff should be abolished.

66378. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—Now that the time scale system of promotion has been introduced, the starting pay of Rs. 250 for members of the Provincial Forest Service is perhaps too low. But several disadvantages remain, as for example:—

(i) The long period of further probation after leaving the College at Dehra Dun deters many suitable candidates from entering the Service, and it therefore seems that the period of probation should be the period before entrance at College and inclusive of the two years' training at Dehra Dun as suggested above.

(ii) In the case of Imperial Service Officers there can be as many Deputy Conservators as there are officers entitled to the pay of that grade under the time scale system of increments, and Assistant Conservators in due course, when they have served

* The Memorandum was signed by Messrs. A. H. Mee, J. P. Haslett, and R. G. A. Hannah, Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests.

20 January 1914.]

Mr. R. G. A. HANNAH.

[Continued.]

long enough, become Deputy Conservators. On the other hand, the number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators which have been allotted in several Provinces for Provincial Forest Service Officers is very limited. Thus, all deserving officers of the Provincial Forest Service cannot be promoted; so that an officer purely for the want of a vacancy may never become an Extra Deputy Conservator.

(ii) The rates of increment provided both for Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests compare very unfavourably with those granted to Imperial Forest Service Officers. Members of the Provincial Forest Service are supposed to receive rates of pay equivalent to two-thirds of those fixed for Imperial Service Officers, and the following statement readily shows the heavy loss to Provincial Forest Service Officers on this basis:—

Years of Service.	Rate of pay calculated on a basis of two-thirds of pay granted I. F. S. Officers.	Actual pay permissible to Officers of P. F. Service.	Consequent loss per mensem in each year.	Total loss in whole Service Rs. 63,314, or £4,221.
1	Rs. 253	Rs. 250	Rs. 3	
2	280	270	10	
3	306	290	16	
4	333	310	23	
5	360	330	30	
6	386	350	36	
7	413	370	43	
8	440	390	50	
9	466	410	56	
10	500	430	70	
11	533	450	83	
12	566	470	96	
13	600	490	110	
14	633	510	123	
15	666	530	136	
16	700	550	150	
17	733	575	158	
18	766	600	166	
19	800	625	175	
20	833	650	183	
Remaining ten years' average, omitting pay of Chief C. F. & I. G. F.	1146	790	356	

(iv) The rates of pay provided for Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests compare very unfavourably also with those obtaining for Provincial Service Officers in the Public Works Department, although the former have to discharge duties far more arduous than the latter. Provincial Forest Service Officers should therefore be allowed at least the same rates of pay as for Provincial Officers of the Public Works Department, plus an increase to allow for the more strenuous life and hardships encountered by the former throughout their service. The subjoined statement compares the rates of pay for the Provincial Services in the two Departments, and shows the rates of pay we would propose for the Provincial Forest Service compared with the rates of pay of the Imperial Forest Service. (See Statement A, page 61.)

(v) The scale of Travelling Allowance should be the same for members of both branches of the Forest Service as the conditions under which the allowances are granted are identical. Further, a distinction should be recognised between travelling allowance granted for ordinary touring duty and travelling allowance for journeys on transfer. At present the same rules apply in both cases with the result that the allowance permissible on transfer is notoriously inadequate, especially in the case of an officer with a family.

(vi) An Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests temporarily placed in a "Major Charge" is given

an allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem. This allowance seems to be insufficient and should be raised to Rs. 100 per mensem subject to a maximum salary of Rs. 600 per mensem.

(vii) No distinction is made between an Extra Assistant Conservator attached to a Division and an Extra Assistant Conservator in charge of a Division classed as a "Minor Charge." The former has comparatively no responsibilities, while the latter has the same responsibilities as an officer in a "Major Charge" on a smaller scale. In the latter case an Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests should be given an allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem, subject to a maximum salary of Rs. 550 per mensem.

66379. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The present conditions of leave applying to the Provincial Forest Service are inadequate and should follow the tentative redraft of the Rules in Chapter XIV. of the Civil Service Regulations circulated with India Government No. 674-C.S.R. dated 19th October, 1912, to the address of all Local Governments and Administrations.

It is not always possible to get privilege leave when earned and the result is that such over and above an accumulation of three months when earned lapses and thus very little of it is ever taken. If privilege leave, when earned, cannot be given owing to the exigencies of the Service, or if it cannot be taken for any other reason, it should be given at some other time and not allowed to lapse, subject to an accumulation of not more than six months at a time. This is especially desirable as furlough cannot be taken at lesser intervals than ten and eight years, and also as members of the Provincial Forest Service are practically precluded from taking furlough out of India for lack of funds due to their low rates of pay, the cost of living having advanced so enormously.

The rate of furlough allowances should be fixed at half of the pay drawn at the time of taking furlough instead of half of the average monthly pay for the last three years preceding commencement of furlough.

The condition that an officer cannot avail himself of privilege leave within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in accordance with the proposals of the Government of India referred to in paragraph 13 above.

66380. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—These should be such that it should be possible for all officers to earn the maximum pension admissible by the Civil Service regulations after 25 years' active service. The remedy for any possible failure has been mentioned in paragraph 12 (ii) and (iv). Twenty-five years is suggested as a possible date for retirement on full pension since Forest Officers not only have to serve continuously in the most unhealthy localities, but also have to encounter the same hardships and carry out the same strenuous duties throughout their Service. The form of application prescribed for pensions should be the same for all classes of Gazetted Officers.

We would also suggest that an officer retired owing to an untimely break-down of health should be granted an invalid pension on the following scale:—After 10 years' service, one third of salary; and after 20 years' service, one half of salary.

66381. (VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial.—There is theoretically no limitation to the employment of non-Europeans in the Forest Service, and in the Provincial branch none in practice.

The division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial may or may not be good in theory, but members of the Provincial Forest Service find themselves shut in, there being no openings for good and meritorious service or for any amount of capability or genius. The remedy is proposed in paragraph 7 above.

66382. (VIII) Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The relations of the Provincial Forest Service with other Services are

20 January 1914.]

MR. R. G. A. HANNAH.

[Continued.]

generally satisfactory and there is nothing to suggest.

66383. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads. It is suggested that at Forest Schools and Colleges it is not necessary to employ Imperial Officers as Instructors for Rangers' Classes on the score of economy, and that the change would not in any way detract from efficiency in teaching or training, as officers of the Provincial Forest Service are quite competent to carry on the work under the President or Director of the College or School,

and are usually in a better position to teach and train men of this class.

Members of the Provincial Forest Service when in charge of or attached to Divisions or Ranges should be given the same powers as are allowed to members of the Imperial Forest Service when similarly placed.

Free medical attendance should be extended to the families of members of the Forest Service on the ground that they often have to live far from ordinary means of treatment and very often in very unhealthy places.

STATEMENT A (vide paragraph 66378 iv).

Year of Service.	Provincial P. W. Service	Provincial Forest Service as at present constituted.	Provincial Forest Service as proposed.	Imperial Forest Service as now existing.	Difference in pay of Imperial and Provincial Foreign Service (proposed).
1	250	250	250	380	130
2	275	270	275	420	145
3	300	290	300	460	160
4	325	310	325	500	175
5	350	330	350	540	190
6	375	350	375	580	205
7	400	370	400	620	220
8	425	390	425	660	235
9	450	410	450	700	250
10	475	430	475	750	275
11	535	450	500	800	300
12	570	470	575	850	275
13	605	490	610	900	290
14	640	510	645	950	305
15	675	530	680	1,000	320
16	710	550	715	1,050	335
17	745	575	750	1,100	350
18	780	600	800	1,150	350
19	815	625	800	1,200	400
20	850	650	850	1,250	400
21	850	700	850		
22	850	700	900		
23	850	700	900		
24	850	800	950		
25	900	800	950		
26		800	1000		
27		850			
28		850			
29		850			
30		850			
An Exec. Engineer can then rise to Supdig. Engineer on Rs. 1,200, 1,400 and 1,600, and to Chief Engineer.		A Deputy Conservator should be eligible at any time for transfer and promotion to the Imperial service rates of pay and promotion thereafter in the usual course to Conservator and Chief Conservator.		A Deputy Conservator of the Imperial Forest Service can then rise to Conservator on Rs. 1,500, 1,700 and 1,900, also to Chief Conservator on Rs. 2,150, and Inspector General on Rs. 2,650.	

MR. R. G. A. HANNAH called and examined.

66384. (Chairman.) The witness had 20 years' service in the Forest Department and had been trained at Dehra Dun. He had been in charge of a major division for the past eight years.

66385. The Imperial Forest Service (generally) contained several members, Europeans and Anglo-Indians, who had gone to England, and qualified for admission into the Imperial Service. The scheme he suggested was put forward with a view to placing the Provincial Forest Department on the same level as the Provincial Branch of the Public Works Department. Officers should be on the same list for promotion, and uniform rates of pay should be granted in the highest ranks of the Service. There should, however, be different standards of pay in the grade of Assistant and Deputy; though he did not think there was any

strong reason for making any difference in the scale of salaries as between the European from England, and the officer recruited in India. His proposal for a common list was made with the object of getting rid of the dissatisfaction at present felt in the Provincial Service. He was aware that the list at present in vogue in the Public Works Department had not given complete satisfaction to the officers in that Department, but it was a step towards something better. An ideal state of affairs could not be expected to be reached at once.

66386. The regulation of Government was that 40 per cent. of the major charges should be occupied by members of the Provincial Service. It was difficult for him to say whether the major charges contained in the 40 per cent. were of equal importance to the rest of the major charges, because

20 January 1914.]

Mr. R. G. A. HANNAH.

[Continued.]

he did not know exactly which were the major charges.

66387. In his opinion, the new course at Dehra Dun practically brought the training there into line with that of an Imperial officer. He agreed, however, that the new course had not been long enough in existence to justify any definite pronouncement.

66388. Judging by actual results, he could see no ground for the statement which had been made in evidence to the effect that the training obtainable at Dehra Dun was inferior to the training obtainable in Europe. For his own part, he could see no difference between the two standards. The Provincial officers who had not had an English training held charge of divisions as efficiently as Imperial officers.

66389. As to the limit which should be placed on the promotion of Rangers to the Provincial Service, he was of opinion that the present rules should continue in force.

66390. He proposed that the preliminary course of practical training given to Provincial Service men before being sent to Dehra Dun should last for a year instead of three to five months, as a year would take them through the whole Forest year. He agreed, however, that the object of the present preliminary course was merely to find out whether a candidate had an aptitude for Forest life. From that point of view the present course of three to five months was quite sufficient.

66391. Forest Officers should receive a higher rate of pay than the Provincial Officers in the Public Works Department, on the ground that their responsibilities were equal, and their hardships greater. He would say also that the cost of living of a Forest Officer was higher than that of a Public Works Officer. A Forest Officer was further placed from supplies, had to pay higher wages to his servants, had to keep up a double establishment, and so on. He agreed that the fact that a Public Works Department officer contributed towards the expense of his training should be taken into consideration.

66392. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He claimed better treatment for officers in the Provincial Forest Service first, because they had already proved their efficiency, and secondly, because, as a result of the new course of training at Dehra Dun, they were likely to prove still more efficient. He held very strongly that there was nothing like the same difference between the work done by Provincial officers holding higher charges and the work done by Imperial Officers as there was between their status and pay under the present organisation.

66393. (*Mr. Sly.*) If the Provincial Service Officers were given improved prospects as he suggested he did not think it would be necessary to raise the educational qualifications of the men who entered at Dehra Dun. The present system of selection would be quite sufficient. Government would not select a man below a certain minimum standard of education.

66394. Cases had occurred in which working plans of forests had been made by Provincial Forest Officers, for instance in Angul and Sambalpur.

66395. The statement that camp expenses were very heavy applied equally to Indians and to Europeans. He admitted that nothing was paid by a Forest Officer for fuel or grass, but the Forest Officer's own servants had to collect it, and the Forest Officer must always keep a special servant or grass cutter for the purpose, whereas other

officers in more inhabited and civilised districts could usually buy the grass daily. He did not agree that milk was cheaper in the forests than in other parts of the districts, and the prices of fowls and eggs were much the same. The difficulty was to obtain them at all, the villages being so small.

66396. (*Mr. Fisher.*) A period of 12 months practical training before admission to Dehra Dun would be preferable to the long period of three years which was at present prescribed for a student after passing out of Dehra Dun. He knew the latter system acted as a deterrent to recruitment, at least in one case.

66397. Why he said that an Imperial Forest Service Officer should be required to remain in charge of a range for at least two years was because a range charge gave a very good grounding in Forest work. Two years used to be the rule, but it had been relaxed in recent years. A man was much better for going through that two years training, because he would know exactly how things should be done. A man should not be placed in charge of a division until he had completed five years actual forest service. He regarded that as a minimum.

66398. Better results might have been achieved in the past if that rule had been strictly adhered to. Imperial officers came into responsible Forest charges too soon, and the divisions were suffering in consequence.

66399. (*Mr. Madge.*) Provincial and Imperial Forest officers held the same kind of charges, and worked equally well.

66400. Personally he held the view that there should be equal pay for equal work, but that was not the view of the majority of his colleagues, who preferred the system set out in the written statement.

66401. (*Mr. Gricc.*) He knew the present rule with regard to confidential reports was that any bad remarks recorded against an officer were bound to be shown to him, but confidential remarks were put in three classes in the rules, and only certain classes had to be made known to the individual concerned. Personally he had no reason to suppose that reports were not communicated to officers as prescribed by the rules.

66402. (*Mr. Modder.*) The Bengal Provincial Service officers had been complimented on their good work several times.

66403. He did not think the proposal for amalgamating the Provincial list of Bihar with that of Bengal would be popular with the Service in Bihar. Bihar had much more healthy districts, and more chances of holding charge of divisions.

66404. With regard to the cost of training, at present a student at Dehra Dun whilst undergoing his course was allowed Rs. 60, out of which Rs. 17-8-0 was deducted for house rent and instruments. Forest officers would be quite willing to forego the Rs. 32-8-0 for the sake of being put on the same level as the Public Works Department. The good men Government were looking for would be quite willing to pay their own expenses. The Principal at Dehra Dun had recommended that the stipend of Rs. 50 should be abolished.

66405. With regard to the cost of living, conditions in Bengal were not the same as those prevailing in the Central Provinces. He had always found it necessary to provide his own servants. Provincial officers had to pay the same as other Europeans in the various stations.

(The witness withdrew.)

20 January 1914.]

Mr. W. F. PERREE.

W. F. PERREE, Esq., Officiating Conservator of Forests, Assam.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being a memorandum of the views of a majority of the Forest Officers serving in Assam, ascertained at a conference held at Shillong on 29th September, 1913, the following officers being present:—Messrs. R. M. Williamson and W. F. Perree, Officiating Conservators; Messrs. Doxat, Cavendish and Cooper, Deputy Conservators; Messrs. Owen, Simeon, Meiklejohn, David, Thomas and MacKarness, Assistant Conservators.

66406. (I) **Methods of Recruitment.**—The last regulations for the selection and training of probationers issued by the Secretary of State are contained in Government of India Circular No 21F, dated the 18th October, 1912. The Conference, by a majority of one vote, favoured recruitment between the ages of 18—20, the minority favouring the limits of 19 to 22 at present in force.

The general opinion is in favour of selection, as at present, by a Board appointed by the Secretary of State. A severe medical test to be insisted upon, followed by a competitive examination in the following subjects:—

English composition and dictation; mathematics; the elements of the following sciences:—

Botany, chemistry, physics and geology; free-hand and geometrical drawing; and German. A qualifying minimum to be obtained in English, German, Mathematics and Science as a whole.

Simultaneous examinations in India and in England are unanimously deemed undesirable, it being considered preferable to admit selected men from the Provincial to the Imperial Service. The change in the method of recruitment of Provincial men is, however, of recent introduction, and it is not possible as yet to determine whether the new system will supply a class of officers capable of taking their position on the same footing as the men recruited by the Secretary of State, so that it would be premature at present to make a definite pronouncement. It is held that there should be no absolute bar to the transfer of men of special merit from the Provincial to the Imperial branch, but that such cases must be uncommon or the quality of the Imperial recruits will be seriously affected.

66407. (II) **Systems of Training and Probation.**—The majority of officers at the Conference prefer one central training institution to the present arrangement of distributing the recruits over three universities. Such an institution to be attached to one of the universities, distinct from the colleges, and preferably located at Oxford. The institution to be capable of acting as a training centre for all Indian Services. Considering that the normal annual recruitment for the Imperial Forest Service is ten officers, it is felt that it is not worth while for any single institution to organise and develop the best possible course of training for the moiety of recruits that may select any one of the three centres. Uniformity and a healthy spirit of competition are at present lacking, while *esprit de corps* cannot, as things now stand, be engendered. The period of training to be two years at the central institution followed by one year on the Continent. Not more than three months are considered necessary to learn detailed range work in Europe, a wider experience of forestry under varying conditions being of greater importance.

Following upon the practical course in Europe, a year's practical training in a series of the most typical and instructive forests in India is considered essential. Hindustani to be made a compulsory language to be studied during the Indian course of training.

Stipends to be at the rate of £120 per annum during the course of European training, while ordinary pay and service should commence from the date of arrival in India.

From the foregoing it may be assumed that the present methods of recruitment and training are not considered entirely satisfactory.

66408. (III) **Conditions of Service.**—The present arrangement whereby certain provinces repeatedly attract the men at the top of the list is considered defective, the Conference being in favour of abolishing the present system, whereby the choice of province is allowed, and substituting a system by which each province will in turn be given the men who pass out at the top of the list.

Other conditions in which amelioration is claimed are—

(a) free medical attendance for the families of officers;

(b) travelling allowances on steamers and on transfer to be more liberal, so that officers be not out of pocket;

(c) rent-free house accommodation to all Government servants;

(d) the Assam local allowance to be raised to Rs. 100 per month for Deputy Conservators, and Rs. 75 for Assistant Conservators, while Conservators be also made eligible for local allowances at the higher rate.

66409. (IV) **Conditions of Salary.**—In 1890 the pay of the Imperial Forest Service was as follows:—

	1st grade	2nd grade	3rd grade	4th grade
Conservators	1,500	1,250	1,000	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	550
Assistant Conservators	450	350	250	—

In 1900 the scale of pay had been altered to:—

	1st grade	2nd grade	3rd grade	4th grade
Conservators	1,600	1,350	1,000	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	550
Assistant Conservators	450	350	—	—

Exclusive of extra compensation which was given from 1st April, 1893.

The present scale of pay is as follows:—

Year	1st grade	2nd grade	3rd grade	4th grade	Rs.
1st	380
2nd	420
3rd	460
4th	500
5th	540
6th	580
7th	620
8th	660
9th	700
10th	750
11th	800
12th	850
13th	900
14th	950
15th	1,000
16th	1,050
17th	1,100
18th	1,150
19th	1,200
20th	1,250

	1st grade	2nd grade	3rd grade	4th grade
Conservators	...	1,900	1,700	1,500
Chief Conservators	...	—	2,150	—
Inspector-General	...	—	2,650	—

The existing scale of pay is considered inadequate in order to attract the class of men required for the Service and to admit of the re-introduction of competition among selected candidates. Further arguments in favour of a higher scale of pay are (1) the universal increase in the cost of living both in India and in England, and that (2) India must offer considerably higher salaries as time goes on to attract a class of men willing to serve under the changing conditions of the country, and capable of coping with those changes.

20 January 1914.]

Mr. W. F. PERREE.

[Continued.]

The following scale represents the scale urged by Imperial Forest Officers serving in Assam:—

Year.	Rs.	Assistant Conservator*
1st	400	
2nd	450	
3rd	500	
4th	550	
5th	600	
6th	650	
7th	700	
8th	750	
9th	800	
10th	850	
11th	900	
12th	950	
13th	1,000	
14th	1,050	
15th	1,100	
16th	1,150	
17th	1,200	
18th	1,250	
19th	1,300†	
20th	1,350	
21st	1,400	
22nd	1,450	
23rd	1,500	
Conservator	1,750—2,000	
Chief Conservator	2,500—100—3,000	
Inspector-General of Forests	3,500	

66410. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The following are the principal directions in which amendment of the existing leave rules are considered necessary:—

(a) One year's furlough to be admissible after the first four years of service.

(b) Half the amount of furlough earned on full pay to be optional in lieu of the amount earned on half pay.

(c) Privilege leave to be accumulated up to the full amount earned instead of three months, as at present.

(d) A minimum furlough allowance of £500 per annum and the removal of the existing maximum limits in all furlough allowances.

66411. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—It is maintained that the existing scale of pensions is inadequate. This scale was fixed at a time when the rupee was worth two shillings. The pensions of Rs. 4,000 and Rs. 5,000 thus represented £400 and £500, respectively. Since then the rise in the cost of the living has risen by 20 per cent. at least, so that it is not unreasonable to claim a pension equivalent in value to the pensions now admissible, namely £500 equivalent to Rs. 4,000 and £600 equivalent to Rs. 5,000.

All pensions for services recruited through the Secretary of State should also be paid in sterling money and be proportionate to the length of service. In fixing the relative pay of officers of the Imperial and Provincial Services, the latter has generally been assessed at two-thirds of the former. Under present conditions a Provincial Service officer can earn a pension of Rs. 5,000 which is equivalent to the ordinary pension of an Imperial officer of the same status. Obviously, therefore, the pension of the Imperial men should be improved to cover not only the difference in the pay but the extra cost involved in living in Europe in a fashion quite unlike that in which Indians live in their own country.

The power of superannuating any officer who has completed 25 years' service is also recommended and it is considered that Local Governments should be given full authority to exercise that power.

The following scale is unanimously recommended:—

* Note.—A qualified Assistant Conservator in charge of a division to draw a charge allowance of the lowest pay of a Deputy Conservator in addition to his substantive pay, provided the total does not exceed Rs. 700.

† Limited to officers suitable for Conservator.

	Years.	Invalid Pensions.						£
		10	11	12	13	14	15	
		230	275	300	325	350	375	
		300	325	350	375	400	425	
		425	450	475				
Ordinary Pensions.								
	20	500	520	540	560	580	600	
	21	520	540	560	580	600	620*	
	22	540	560	580	600	620*	650*	
	23	560	580	600	620*	650*	720*	
	24	580	600	620*	650*	680*	750*	
	25	600	620*	650*	680*	720*	780*	
	26	620*	650*	680*	720*	780*	840*	
	27	650*	680*	720*	780*	840*	900*	
	28	680*	720*	780*	840*	900*	960*	
	29	720*	780*	840*	900*	960*	1,020*	
	30	780*	840*	900*	960*	1,020*	1,080*	

It has been accepted that pensions are deferred pay so that an officer who may be invalidated at an early stage of his service should be granted a pension proportionate to the amount which he has earned. The death rate in the past has been so high among forest officers that many are debarred from entering the Department owing to the risks incurred. The possibility of retirement on an adequate pension is therefore considered an essential to the recruitment of the class of men required. Arguing on the understanding that pension is deferred pay, an officer should be allowed to make use of that deferred pay in order to make a provision for his widow or his family. The Conference, therefore, recommend that officers be allowed to commute a portion of the pension, not exceeding one-third, for a lump sum with which to buy an annuity or make such other provision for their dependents as may be possible. The officers present were however unanimous in urging that this be entirely optional.

66412. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—There are no limitations to the entry of non-Europeans into the Imperial Service, provided they are recruited through the Secretary of State and are trained in Europe. The standard of training cannot be lowered below that at present in force, and recourse must continue to be had to European forests for object lessons. The admission of selected men from the Provincial to the Imperial Service as suggested above should act as an incentive to entrants into the Provincial Service to make a supreme effort, and there seems to be no objection to opening to men of special merit a possible means of entry into the Imperial branch. The Imperial and Provincial Services should, however, continue to remain distinct. It is not desirable to improve the status of one branch at the expense of the other. The prefix "extra," as indicative of the Provincial Service, is not without objection and term "Provincial" may be substituted.

66413. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The existing arrangements work satisfactorily, and are in the best interests of the people, so there is no call for remark.

66414. (IX) Other points.—*Provision for leave and training.*—Under existing conditions an officer earns furlough equivalent to one-fourth of his active service (Article 302, Civil Service Regulations). Thus, it would be permissible for 25 per cent. of the staff to be on furlough, and this is the percentage at present admissible as reserve for leave and training. It is urged that this does not make sufficient provision for training, as officers have often to be placed in charge of divisions

* Limited to officers holding the rank of Conservator.

20 January 1914.]

Mr. W. F. PERREE.

[Continued.]

before they have had the necessary training, to the detriment of their own and Government interests. Few officers can prepare themselves for independent charge under three years, and this period should be looked upon as the normal length of training. Assuming that the average length of service is 25 years, the leave and training reserve should be $\frac{1}{4} \times \frac{25}{25} = (25 \times 12)$ per cent. = 37 per cent., which urged should be the future allowance for leave and training.

Provident Fund.—Officers of the Department are

unanimous in pressing for a higher rate of interest than that at present admissible on their Provident Fund. Certain banks allow 4 per cent. compound interest on Savings Bank deposits, while the present prohibition from investments in concerns within their province acts as a serious hindrance to the investment of any savings, and Government should therefore compensate officers by raising the interest in their Provident Funds to 6 per cent., which is not unreasonable in view of the dividends paid by business concerns in India.

MR. W. F. PERREE, called and examined.

66415. (Chairman.) The witness was officiating Conservator of Forests in charge of the Eastern Circle. He had 20 years' service and had served in Bengal, Burma, Assam, and with the Government of India.

66416. In the Assam Service there were 13 Imperial officers, and 12 Provincial Officers. No Provincial Officer was at present in control of a major charge. It was possible for an attached officer to hold a major charge. In an important division there might be a divisional officer with two Imperial Officers, both of whom were considered to be in major control.

66417. There were 11 territorial charges, two of which were held by officers of the Assam Commission. Of the 11 territorial charges only two were minor charges, one of them being occupied by an Imperial Officer temporarily, because of the shortage of Provincial Officers.

66418. There was a very great difference between major charges and minor charges in Assam, but it was not necessarily a permanent difference. The organisation was based on the classification into major and minor charges, and it might be necessary to change a classification even temporarily, from minor to major. Broadly speaking the nomenclature of major and minor charges was dependent largely upon the work which was being, or had to be, carried out within the area of the charge. Those charges which were classed as major charges required the highest trained men.

66419. He thought specially selected men trained at Dehra Dun were capable of assuming control of major charges. His point of view was that the best method of recruitment in India to the Imperial Service would be to select officers from the Provincial Service after some years experience in a minor charge, and to promote them to the Imperial Service. He considered that was a preferable means of recruitment than to appoint officers direct to the Imperial branch from outside the Service.

66420. It was difficult to say how many years a man ought to be in the Service prior to being promoted to a major charge. When a vacancy occurred amongst Extra Deputy Conservators it might be filled from Extra Assistant Conservators of any seniority.

66421. The recent changes had not been long enough in existence to make it possible to judge whether the educational standard of the officer now entering Dehra Dun was high enough to enable him to be placed on an equality with officers of the Imperial Service. He did not consider that the Dehra Dun training was as good as an English training, but he preferred that the present course should be given a thorough trial before any system was adopted of sending statutory natives to England for training.

66422. He thought the present arrangement of recruitment of Imperial men was very unfavourable to certain of the least popular Provinces. His suggestion was that the top men should be posted to the various Provinces in turn.

66423. His proposal in regard to house rent would practically involve putting up salaries by about $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. and that would be in addition to the substantial increase of salaries and of pensions proposed in his memorandum. He thought that was reasonable.

66424. He based the proposal for an increase in

the Assam local allowances on his knowledge of the cost of living in Assam. Assam was in every way as expensive in Burma. He had been in Burma. The local allowance in Assam was Rs. 80 a month, and in Burma Rs. 100.

66425. The existing scale of pay was inadequate to attract the class of men required for the Service. He thought the true test of attractiveness was competition, and for a number of years past it had not been possible, presumably, to introduce competition. The regulations said that first of all there should be selection, and if more than a sufficient number of selected men were suitable, there should be a competitive examination. There had been no competition, and the inference was that the number of suitable men who came forward was not more than sufficient to fill existing vacancies. There had not been a competitive examination for the past seven or eight years.

66426. Officers on probation in India should be given a year's practical training all over India. That was preferable to giving an officer regular work in a forest, taking conditions as they were. It was almost impossible to prevent use being made of an officer immediately on his arrival, owing to shorthandedness; that was to say considerations of his utility rather than of his training prevailed. He did not think the year's training would be of a perfunctory and superficial character, as he would be given object lessons to work up to. An officer required to be taught accurate habits of observation.

66427. With regard to leave, he recommended that officers should receive a year's furlough after four years service, and that they should be given a minimum furlough allowance of £500 a year. Under the present scale of salary an officer in his fifth year of service would get a salary equal to £430, whereas under his scheme of salaries an officer would be receiving a salary equivalent to £480 a year, so that he would be actually getting when on leave more than he would if he remained on duty. He was not sure that that was not the case also in the Indian Civil Service.

66428. (Mr. Madge.) If a man came out after the age of 22 he did not settle down so easily to Indian life, and if men were kept too long in the Service after 50 they lost considerably in bodily activity, and in the Forest Department physical activity was essential.

66429. Changes in the categories of major and minor charges were usually determined by the Conservator and the local Government. They were not made arbitrarily, but only when there was a complete reorganisation of the Imperial and Provincial Services in a Province, say once in 10 years. He did not think his suggestion that each Province should have the top men in turn would have any effect on recruitment if men knew they were liable to transfer after eight or 10 years' service from one Province to another.

66430. He objected to recruitment in India for the Imperial Service, although he would not bar Provincial officers from promotion to the Imperial Service on their merits. If they were promoted they would enter the Imperial Service on their existing pay, and thenceforward continue on the scale of pay authorized for Imperial officers.

66431. (Mr. Fisher.) The three principal criteria for distinguishing major from minor charges were (a) the area of the forest (b) the revenue from the

20 January 1914.]

Mr. W. F. PERRE.

[Continued.]

forest, and (c) the importance of the work actually being discharged, or about to be discharged in the division in question. It was quite possible that there might be a division in which there was actually a very small area of forest, and from which very little revenue was derived, but on which important work of afforestation was about to be carried out. That division would be considered a major charge. It was a fact that in recent re-organisations there had been great trouble over the classification of charges, and proposals had been returned by the Secretary of State for reconsideration on that score. Taking Assam, there was, first of all, a large European community to be considered. The Forest Department had probably closer relations with the tea community than any other department, and it was important, as a rule, to put Europeans in charges where they came into contact with Europeans. Accordingly in a division in which there was a good number of white planters, there would, irrespective of the importance of the forest work, be an Imperial Forest Officer in charge. Such a charge might perhaps also be held by an Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests. He considered it would be more difficult to have three classes—major, intermediate and minor—than the present existing division into two classes.

66432. With regard to the promotion of Provincial officers to the Imperial Service, it would not be

sufficient for an Indian recruited officer to go through the Dehra Dun course, and then to be taken to a German or a French forest. Such a course would not advance a man sufficiently in theoretical forestry. The theoretical training at Dehra Dun was not sufficient, even plus the Continental forest, Dehra Dun plus Continental practice would bewilder a man.

66433. (Mr. Sly.) The best method of recruiting Indians into the Imperial Service was undoubtedly to promote men of tried merit from the Provincial Service.

66434. Why he had left out French in his scheme for an examination for appointments in England was because the practical course was invariably spent in Germany. In France a man was always accompanied by a professor, who could explain and translate things. A knowledge of French was not so important as a knowledge of German, although it was an advantage.

66435. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) With regard to the recruitment of Indians into a proportion of the posts of the Imperial Service, he would not agree to a scheme by which, after a short period of service, a Provincial Officer would be sent to England for two years' training preparatory to his final transfer to the Imperial Service. Ignorance of German would probably preclude this. He would still prefer the other alternative of taking selected men from the Provincial Service.

(The witness withdrew.)

RAJ BAHADUR UPENDRA NATH KANJILAL, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Assam.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the views of the Officers of the Provincial Forest Service as recorded in a Conference held at Shillong on the 2nd October, 1913.

66436. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—It was unanimously agreed that recruitment for direct appointment should be made by an open competitive examination amongst selected candidates. At the time of selection due consideration should be given to, respectability, characters, academic career, physique and such other matters so that the possibility of introducing undesirable sorts will be precluded from the outset. In order to raise the status of the Service the Conference considered it desirable that selection should as a rule be made from amongst University men. New admissions into most other Provincial Services, notably the Provincial Civil Service, are made almost exclusively from among graduates; there is therefore no reason why University education should not be insisted upon in making selections for Forest Service. It was also agreed that under the circumstances at present prevailing in Assam the bar to the selection of non-natives of the Province should not be insisted upon. The candidates should be subjected to severe and searching medical examination before proceeding to Dehra Dun.

After selection the candidates should go through a competitive entrance examination to be held in different centres throughout India under the control of the Principal of the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun. The following subjects were recommended for the Entrance examination:—

(1) English.—Conversation and essay.

(2) Mathematics.—Geometry, Mensuration and Trigonometry.

(3) Science.—Elementary Botany or Physics or Chemistry.

(4) Drawing.—Freehand and geometrical.

The age limit at the time of this examination should not exceed 22 years.

The Conference agreed that it was very desirable to recognise the claims and aspirations of the Subordinate Forest Service and suggested that 30 to 40 per cent. of vacancies in the Provincial Service should be filled up by promotion of deserving

trained Rangers. None should, however, be so promoted before he has put in 5 years' approved service, nor will as a rule any be eligible for promotion after 35 years of age. A Ranger of 35 will have put in about 10 years of service, which period is considered sufficiently long to give evidence of his fitness for promotion.

The Conference was emphatically against shutting the door of the Provincial Service for members of the Subordinate Service, as in its opinion such a course would demoralise a class of officers who are justly considered the backbone of the Department.

66437. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The separate course of training recently introduced for Provincial Service men was approved of. It was, however, unanimously agreed that the preliminary training be limited to only six months, and the majority were of opinion that during this period an attempt should be made to teach the candidates as far as possible some of the subjects they will be taught at the Forest College.

In view of the prospect of improvement of the status of the Service the Conference recommended the raising of the standard of the college course and the extension of the period of training from two or three years. The standard should be raised particularly in the following subjects:—

1. Working plans.

2. Botany.

3. Zoology.

4. Engineering and Surveying.

5. Mathematics.

6. Better facilities for laboratory work in connection with the study of 2 and 3 as also of Physics and Chemistry.

The majority were of opinion that the college should be affiliated to a University, like most of the Engineering and Medical Colleges in India, Forestry forming a separate faculty of that University. Their idea was that the best possible course of education could only be evolved by a University. Should, however, this be not found feasible, at least the subjects of Surveying, Engineering and Mathematics should be taught by professional experts.

The Conference was unanimous that the period

20 January 1914.]

RAT BAHADUR UPENDRA NATH KANJILAL.

[Continued.]

of probationary service he cut down to one year, which ought to be ample to judge the merits of an officer who has successfully gone through all the severe tests that have preceded it.

66438. (III) Conditions of Service.—The majority of the Provincial Service Officers were of opinion that the distinction between the Imperial and Provincial Services should be removed, and that all gazetted officers be borne on the same list as in the Public Works Department, Police and Telegraph Departments. The only difference that need be maintained is in the matter of pay which, it was generally recognised, ought to be higher in the case of officers appointed in England. These officers can be shown in the classified lists with a mark or letter to indicate that they were appointed by the Secretary of State.

Whether this can be given effect to or not the officers felt strongly that the prefix "Extra," which was meaningless and misleading, should be dropped, and that all officers performing duties of the same nature should have the same official designation. A Judge, for instance, is known simply as a Judge, and a Magistrate is called a Magistrate, whether appointed in England or in India.

The other points discussed and agreed upon were the following:—

1. That the charge of Divisions should, as far as possible, go by seniority in the general list.

2. That senior officers should not be posted under junior officers of either Service.

3. That officers of both Services must hold *actual* charge of ranges for at least two years to qualify for a Divisional charge.

4. That no officer should be given charge of a Division before completing 5 years of *actual* service and before passing the Departmental Examinations.

5. That the distinction between "major" and "minor" charges should be removed or at any rate should be clearly defined.

6. That when an adverse confidential report is made against an officer, a copy of it should be given him confidentially to enable him to vindicate himself.

7. That selected India appointed officers be eligible for holding administrative charges.

8. That the relations between India appointed and England appointed officers of the same rank and standing should be improved.

As regards 7, it is to be noted that unlike other Departments there are no "listed" appointments in the Forest Department for officers recruited in India. In many other Departments, officers recruited in India can rise up to the highest appointment in a Province, and in this Department also, India trained officers have risen to be Conservators, and one such officer held the post of a Chief Conservator for years. It cannot be said that the same stamp of men are not to be found from the ranks of men who received similar or perhaps better technical education, simply because they are being shown on a separate list. The Conference felt strongly that no bar should be placed arbitrarily before men of real merit.

As to 8, the officers assembled were of opinion that although they had no complaints to make against the treatment they received from Conservators, they were generally very harshly treated by other Imperial officers even when they were not placed directly under such officers. This was very much to be regretted, but it could not be gainsaid that a mild feeling of antipathy existed which generally resulted in discouragement and discontentedness on the part of the Provincial Service officers.

66439. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The Conference was of opinion that although the starting pay was not low the rate of increment was not adequate as also the present maximum pay, which

they thought ought to be raised to Rs. 1,000. The following scale was considered satisfactory:—

Assistant Conservators.

Year.	Rs.
1st	250
2nd	275
3rd	300
4th	325
5th	350
6th	375
7th	400
8th	425
9th	450
10th	475
11th	500
12th	525
13th	550
14th	575

Deputy Conservators.

Year.	Rs.
15th	600
16th	650
17th	700
18th	750
19th	800
20th	850
21st	900
22nd	950
23rd	1,000
24th	1,000
25th	1,000

In the event of promotion to administrative appointments being sanctioned, the salary of India trained Conservators should be as follows:—

Grade.	Rs.
3rd	1,300
2nd	1,400
1st	1,500

The Conference suggested that the rules affecting increments should be the same for both Services.

The question of travelling allowance having come up for discussion it was agreed that it should be asked that the general rule for classification of officers given in Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations be adhered to, and that officers in charge of Divisions should be allowed to draw daily allowances and mileage at first-class rates irrespective of their salary. The officers also felt that the travelling allowance at present admissible for gazetted officers on transfer was very insufficient, so that a transfer always meant a heavy pecuniary loss.

66440. (V) Conditions of Leave.—It was agreed that the following concessions should be asked for:—

1. That privilege leave may be allowed to accumulate up to six months.

2. That the certificate now demanded of an officer applying for privilege leave that no leave will be taken within six months after the expiry of the leave should be abolished, and that leave be admissible at any time after it has become due.

3. That furlough up to three years be counted as service.

4. That furlough allowance should be half of leaving pay and not half the average pay of last three years as now.

66441. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—It will be readily admitted that service in the Forest Department is of a very arduous nature, and that Forest Officers have to endure hardship and exposure to an extent unknown in most other Departments. In view of this, the Conference urged that the period of service necessary for invalid pension be reduced from 25 to 20 years, and also that for voluntary retirement from 30 to 25 years.

The present maximum pension of Rs. 400 a month or Rs. 5,000 a year was fixed at a time when living was far less expensive, and perhaps the style of living was somewhat lower. In view

20 January 1914.]

RAI BAHADUR UPENDRA NATH KANJILAL.

[Continued.]

of this the Conference urged that the maximum pension for Forest Officers recruited in India be fixed at Rs. 500 a month.

It was also suggested that a prayer should be made to have the rate of interest for amounts deducted from salary for deposit in the Provident Fund be raised from the present rate of 4 per cent. to something like 6 per cent.

66442. (VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.—In Assam there is at present no limitation in respect of employment of

non-Europeans in what is now known as the Provincial Service.

The Conference went a little out of its way to suggest that no Colonials be admitted into the Forest Service of India. It has already been said under III. that the Conference voted against the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial.

66443. (VIII) Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—Relations of Provincial Forest Officers with members of other services were considered generally satisfactory and no improvement was suggested.

RAI BAHADUR UPENDRA NATH KANJILAL called and examined.

66444. (Chairman.) The witness occupied the position of Extra Deputy Conservator. He had 36 years Government service, and had been in the Forest Department for 28 years. He was the senior Forest Officer in the Assam Provincial Service. There were at present only seven officers in the Provincial Service in Assam.

66445. The majority of the Provincial Service Officers in Assam were of the opinion that the division into Imperial and Provincial branches should be abolished. They desired to see a common list established, as in the Public Works Department. He was not aware that Provincial Officers in the Public Works Department were by no means satisfied with the present arrangements. He was, however, certain that they had a much better status than Provincial Officers of the Forest Department.

66446. There should be no bar to the advancement of Provincial Service officers to the highest rank. It could not be said that the same stamp of men as were got from England were not to be found in the ranks of officers who had received similar, or perhaps better, instruction in India. In certain subjects the training given at Dehra Dun was superior to that given in England, although the general training was somewhat lower. His colleagues had suggested that the curriculum should be raised to bring it on a par with the training given in England, so that no excuse might be left for relegating officers recruited in India to a lower status.

66447. The distinction between major and minor charges should be abolished, or at any rate clearly defined. In his opinion it would be quite possible to administer the Department without any classification of this kind. Assuming that all charges were placed on one list, an officer recruited from Europe should be paid on a different scale from the officer recruited in India, simply because the former came to serve in a foreign country.

66448. He suggested that the rate of interest payable for deposits in the General Provident Fund should be raised from 4 to 6 per cent., because 4 per cent. was too small. A better rate of interest could be obtained from investments.

66449. Provincial Officers in Assam did not take the leave to which they were entitled to any very great extent, because many of them could not afford it on account of the furlough allowance being so low.

66450. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) He had never been in Europe. He had never felt in the course of his career that it would have been a great advantage to him to have had some practical knowledge of European methods of Forestry. He had never found himself handicapped in his practical work by his want of European knowledge.

66451. (Mr. Sly.) Ten or fifteen years ago people in the towns and educated centres had no knowledge of the existence of the Forest Department. It was only recently that they were coming to know of it. From his personal experience he could say that every month he received dozens of letters from friends enquiring about the Forest Department, with a view to entering their sons and their relatives into it. The Service was rising in popularity.

66452. It was right in a modified sense to say that the hard isolated conditions of life in the

Forest Department did not appeal much to the educated class of Indians in the towns, and that the country Indians who did not mind isolated and hard conditions of life were, as a rule, not sufficiently educated. But nowadays times had changed a good deal. People were taking more interest in athletics, sports, and outdoor life, and they were beginning to look on forest life with much more favour than they did in former days. From the letters he had received it was evident that the young men for whom their fathers were contemplating a career in the Forest Department possessed good educational qualifications, and were not men who had failed to get into other Departments of Government Service.

66453. Admission to Dehra Dun should be limited to graduates. Preferably they should be graduates in science, but he would not confine admission to that one class of graduates.

66454. Twenty years was the earliest age at which a man could graduate in science in the Indian Universities. A man could not matriculate until 16, and he must then take a four years' course in science. If he was in his 21st year, and had to do a practical test in the forest of six months, it was barely possible for him to go up for the examination if the age was limited to 22, but the Service required the best men, and not those who had failed several times. If a man possessed a degree in science he thought three years at Dehra Dun was still necessary. He thought that even with such a high educational qualification and with three years' training at Dehra Dun, a substantial number of candidates in India would be attracted to Service in the Forest Department, although that Service was as yet not very popular. In the Medical Department, for instance, graduates were now entering, and they had to go through a five years' course. It was not the opinion of those Indians who had come to know the Forest Department that the Medical Service was much more attractive than the Forest Service.

66455. (Mr. Fisher.) If the period of preliminary probation in the Forest for Provincial Officers was lengthened to 12 months, he did not think it would have a deterrent effect on recruitment. Twelve months' probation in a forest might be a good thing, but the difficulty would be to make other details fit in without raising the age limit of entering Government Service.

66456. When he suggested improvements in the system of training and probation at Dehra Dun, he had in view the actual course of training at present in force.

66457. (Mr. Madge.) The promotion of Rangers to the Provincial Service would only be very exceptional, i.e., limited to men of very exceptional merit. Such promotions would have no appreciable effect in lowering the standing of the Department.

66458. His desire for the removal of the distinction between the Imperial and Provincial Services was based on the ground that the men in the two branches were doing the same work, were subjected to the same practical tests of working, and also on the ground that the removal of the distinction would improve the status of Provincial Officers.

(The witness withdrew.)

27 January 1914.]

At Madras, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

H. B. BAYANT, Esq., Conservator of Forests,
Madras.M.R. Ry. V. SUBRAHMANYA AYYAR AVARGAL, Extra
Deputy Conservator of Forests, Madras.

R. R. Scott, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

F. A. LODGE, Esq., C.I.E., Conservator of Forests, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department,
being the corporate opinion of the Imperial Forest
Service, Madras.

66459. (I) Method of Recruitment.—It is considered that although the present method of recruitment has given fairly satisfactory results so far as experience has gone, it means that recruits arrive in India at too advanced an age and with qualifications in the shape of science degrees which do not sufficiently compensate for their late arrival. It would be preferable to revert to recruitment by means of nomination followed by competitive examination in a wide range of subjects between the ages of 18 and 20, and then to train the men in forestry and other allied sciences for a period of three years. The reason why this system broke down in the past was insufficient inducements in the way of pay and prospects. Now that these conditions have been improved in some respects, it is thought that there would be no difficulty whatever in obtaining candidates. Greater stress than at present should be laid on physical fitness and efficiency.

Medical examination should precede the competitive examination.

Recruits should be under 23 years of age on arriving in India; they acclimatise better than when they arrive older, and can put in 30 to 32 years of useful service.

66460. (II) Systems of Training and Probation.—It is highly desirable that the successful candidates should undergo some training common to them all at some residential institution with an Indian Forest Officer in charge of the students before they proceed to India. They should not be permitted to go to different universities or centres. In the first place, the number annually recruited is too small to make it worth the while of more than one institution to provide a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions; in the second place, it is essential that the details of the technical training of the recruits should be carried out on exactly similar lines. The training should be in England and Europe only; any subsequent training in India which may be necessary should be left to the Local Government of each province to decide as is now done.

A period of practical study of forestry in some of the Continental forests is an essential portion of the necessary training.

In this connection, it is considered that at present sufficient attention is not devoted to practical instruction in the important subject of Forest Engineering.

66461. (III) Conditions of Service.—The conditions are exceptionally arduous and unhealthy. It appears from an article published in the "Indian Forester" for November, 1912, that of the 49 officers recruited for all India between the years 1877

and 1886, five left the Service without pension, five retired on reduced pension with less than 25 years' service, five are drawing the full pension, only 14 are still in the Service, while the remaining 20 are dead. As during the period in question, officers joined the Service at an average age not exceeding 22 years, none of these officers could now be more than 58 to 60 years old, and the average age would be about 53 years.

The Department is so scantily manned that off and on for the past 20 years and at the present time, officers are constantly refused the leave which they have earned, and are only granted leave on medical recommendation. Such a state of affairs tells not only very hardly on the health of officers of the Department, but also on the general efficiency of the administration. On this account we cannot too strongly urge an immediate increase in the strength of the Imperial Forest Service with a view to enable the Government to grant to officers the leave to which they are entitled when they apply for it, without forcing them actually to ill-health before leave is granted to them. The unit of area under each officer is too large to allow of thorough control. The special knowledge of Forest experts is largely wasted owing to the amount of ordinary office work which they have to perform. Such untechnical work might be left to office managers.

So far as length of service goes the present conditions are fair and need no change.

Objection has before now been taken to Forest officers comparing their conditions of service, salary, pension, etc., with those of other Services, but such comparisons must naturally be made not only by officers in service, but by parents who have to select a Department for their sons. The natural questions for a parent to ask are—

(1) How much shall I have to invest?

(2) For how long shall I have to support my son?

(3) Have the Departments which entail most capital expenditure advantages over the other Departments commensurate with the increased cost of putting my son into them?

The following table compares the Forest, Public Works and Police departments:—

Forest.

Two or three years' expensive special training, after obtaining a science degree at a university. Period of training does not count as service for leave or pension.

Service begins from date of reporting for duty in India.

Public Works.

Two years' special training, believed not to be so expensive as Forest training.

Period of training does not count as service for leave or pension.

Until 1893 service began from date of appointment in England.

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. Lodge

[Continued.]

Police.

No training after leaving school, before joining appointment.

Training given while in Service, drawing pay. Period of training counts as service for leave and pension.

Service begins from date of reporting for duty in India.

Thus it is evident that the cheapest department to enter is the Police, the least technical of the three.

We solicit a comparison between two candidates, one for the Police, the other for the Forests, passing their entrance examination at the same time. Three years after the examination—

The Forest Officer.

has cost his parents nearly £1,000 in training expenses.

has drawn no pay.

has no service to his credit.

is on his way to India to join his first appointment.

is about to draw pay at Rs. 380 a month.

The Police Officer.

has cost his parents nothing.

has drawn pay for three years.

has three years' service to his credit.

is on his way home on his first three months' privilege leave,

is drawing pay and acting allowance at Rs. 500 a month.

It is believed that the Public Works Officer would occupy a position very similar to that shown for the Forest Officer in the above statement. To continue the comparison, the Forest Officer, ten years after passing his entrance examination will be drawing pay at Rs. 620, while the Police officer will be drawing Rs. 800. Later on in service the Forest Officer may overtake the Police Officer in the way of pay, but he never gets ahead of him enough to make up what he has lost at the commencement of his service. Again, the Forest Officer has to spend much of his time in unhealthy localities, but if he has to retire owing to broken health early in service he receives a smaller pension than the Police Officer (vide articles 474 and 476, Civil Service Regulations) under similar circumstances. The provisions of article 408, Civil Service Regulations (leave counting as service), used to apply only to technical departments such as the Public Works and Forests; they now apply equally to all departments.

Consequently, neither in prospects as regards pay, leave, or amount of pension is no compensation given to the members of the technical services for the time and money spent in qualifying for those services, but in some cases they are worse off than the members of the untrained services, and this is naturally felt to be an injustice requiring alteration. The only point on which favourable terms are given to the technical services is the length of service required to earn a retiring pension, but this is discounted by allowing them smaller pensions up to 24 years' service than can be obtained on medical certificate by officers of other services.

It is felt that the Forests and Public Works are sister services, they both require technical training and are services of experts; they both entail more exposure and more residence in unhealthy localities than other services (of the two, Forests

has the lion's share of unhealthy localities), and for many years the recruits for both services were trained side by side at the same college, and the forest training was the more expensive of the two. It is therefore felt that the conditions of service, salary, allowances, leave and pension in "Forests" should be at least as good as those granted to "Public Works" and distinctly better than those of "Police."

The following actual cases of comparative results of entering the "Forests" and the "Police" emphasise what has already been written:—

In 1882 Fischer passed for "Forests"; Sandell appeared for Forests in 1893 and in 1894 failed; in 1895 he passed into "Police"; Fischer and Sandell came out to India in the same steamer, and both began service on the same date. Ten years later Sandell was drawing better pay than Fischer.

In 1898 Richmond passed for "Forests"; at the same examination Stevenson failed; in 1899 Stevenson passed for Police, came straight to India, counts service from 1899; Richmond came out after training in 1901 and counts service from then.

Evidence that the Service is (a) exceptionally arduous and unhealthy.—In the year 1882, owing to the short-handedness of the Forest Department (a chronic condition even unto the present day), two Civilians were appointed District Forest officers; one of them, Mr. Sim, held the post for three years and therefore had personal experience of the life of Forest officers; his opinion is therefore of some value, and it is recorded in 1904 in the following words:—"Considering that forest work, as a whole, is beyond all comparison, more arduous, responsible and unhealthy than any other Service of Government."

The Government of India in a dispatch to the Secretary of State reported that the position and responsibilities of Conservators were in no way inferior to those of Superintending Engineers, while the risks they ran from exposure in unhealthy climates were perhaps greater.

Of 29 officers recruited from 1881 to 1885 inclusive, nine have retired, six are still in service, four resigned and ten are dead. The resignations were due to broken-down health.

The history of services of gazetted officers does not show the amount of ill-health there is in the Department, for numerous furloughs granted on medical recommendation are shown as ordinary furlough.

In other Departments some sedentary posts exist in which men unfit for strenuous field work can continue on duty and recover their health; in the Forest Department (Madras) not one sedentary post exists; men must carry on their arduous and unhealthy work until they can obtain furlough, or until they break down.

Evidence that the Service is (b) scantily manned.—This is due to want of provision for the natural expansion of the work of the Department. Every time that an increase of establishment is asked for, it has to be based on "immediate requirements," no provision being made for future development. It takes three or four years to get the asked for increase, so that when it comes it is insufficient even for immediate requirements. The growth of the Department is illustrated by the following figures:—

Year.	Conservators.	Deputy and Assistant Conservators.	Sub-Assistant Conservators.	Extra Deputy Conservators.	Extra Assistant Conservators.	Revenue.	Expenditure.
1883	2	24	10	—	—	Rs. 9,03,914	Rs. 6,36,558
1891	3	31	—	—	11	17,95,408	12,53,284
1911	1	27	—	—	31	37,71,940	32,18,552
1912	4	27	—	—	31	42,37,795	34,40,441

27 January 1914]

Mr. F. A. LODGE

[Continued.]

Correspondence regarding the reorganisation of 1891 commenced in 1888, and that regarding reorganisation of 1911 in 1907.

The results of the undermanning of the Department are—

(1) The officers are overworked.

(2) Protection and development of the forests is retarded.

(3) Leave has to be refused.

(4) There are no officers to spare for special works.

(5) No officer is allowed to take up foreign service or service under the Government of India.

(6) Consequent on (5) there is a block in promotion to the class of Conservators.

As regards (1).—In an exceptionally unhealthy Department such as Forests, an extra margin of spare officers should be maintained in order to provide for filling leave vacancies.

As regards (2).—The area of Madras forests brought under regular working plans is only 7,884 square miles, leaving 11,545 square miles to be dealt with; even the area which on paper is under working plans is not really so, as large areas included in working plans are shown as "unworkable."

As regards (3).—Details are given below.

As regards (4).—Madras has not had a working plans officer since 1902, though one is required in each circle, and there should be a controller of working plans.

As regards (5).—The following are instances of Madras officers not being allowed to take up foreign service or service under the Government of India; practically every such post means a substantial increase of salary.

(i) In 1912 the Government of India addressed the Government of Madras with a view to obtaining the services of an Imperial officer from Madras as Assistant to the Sylviculturist at Dehra Dun, and Madras replied that no officer could be spared. Mr. Wimbush applied demi-officially for permission to accept the billet, and was refused.

(ii) In 1906 volunteers for service on the Gold Coast were called for; Messrs Fischer and Cox volunteered but Government refused to spare their services.

(iii) In 1909 Mr. Fischer's services were asked for by India for employment at Dehra Dun, but Madras refused to sanction his deputation.

(iv) In 1910 Mr. Fischer applied for permission to take up a vacant post at Dehra, and the Board of Revenue regretted that it was impossible to spare him. He was again refused permission in 1912.

(v) Volunteers (Latham) for service in Siam and Southern Nigeria were not allowed to take up the appointments owing to Madras being so short-handed.

(vi) In 1902 Mr. Cox was strongly recommended for the post of Conservator of the Malay States, the Madras Government could not spare his services. (The appointment would have doubled Mr. Cox's salary.)

(vii) The Government of Ceylon recently applied for the services of Mr. Richmond or other officer as Conservator, and Madras replied that no officer could be spared.

As regards (6).—There are at present 13 officers out of a sanctioned total of 27, drawing the highest pay admissible to Deputy Conservators, while on the Government of India list the numbers are 24 and 163 and on the Bombay list 4 and 24. Men who joined the Service in 1889 under the Government of India are now permanent Conservators, while the junior permanent Conservator in Madras dates his Service from 1886.

Evidence that (c) leave is constantly refused, and granted only on medical recommendation.—This is the natural result of the undermanning of the Department.

The leave taken by the 20 senior Forest Officers in Madras up to the 31st December, 1912, amounts only to 40 years and 27 days, out of a total service of 463 years 8 months and 29 days, or 8 per cent. against the 20 per cent. to which they are entitled. This includes all officers of over 16 years' service;

for the Civil Service (over 16 years' service) the percentage is 140. For reasons already given [III (d) 5] Forest Officers need leave more than members of the Civil Service.

(i) Mr. Lodge applied for privilege leave when he had earned three months of that leave in 1886, and was refused, owing to shortage of officers.

(ii) Mr. Lodge's application for furlough in 1904 was refused on the same grounds, and he had to take leave on private affairs.

(iii) Mr. Scott applied for one month's privilege leave from 1st October, 1913, and was offered the leave on condition that he carried on his work during his leave.

(iv) Mr. Barry states that he has three times been refused leave, and twice succeeded in getting it by obtaining a medical recommendation.

(v) Mr. Wimbush, after three years and seven months' continuous service, applied for three months' privilege leave from 5th July, 1911; it was refused.

(vi) Mr. Fischer was refused furlough in 1904; granted furlough on medical recommendation in 1905, but for private reasons was unable to take it; was refused furlough in 1907 after twelve years' service without furlough; was refused one month's privilege leave from 1st March, 1912, and again from 7th November, 1912.

(vii) Mr. Cox, after nine years' service and much fever applied for furlough. The Board of Revenue refused to recommend the grant without the production of a medical certificate, but eventually accepted a letter of recommendation from the District Medical Officer, Vizagapatam. Precisely the same thing happened again in 1907 when Mr. Cox was broken down with fever. As Mr. Cox puts it: "I have only twice asked for furlough during 20 years' service, both times on the ground of inability to continue work. Both times I have been informed that I cannot get leave without a medical certificate owing to the Department being very shorthanded."

(viii) Mr. Tireman was refused furlough without medical certificate in July, 1903, and again in December of the same year, and the decision of the Board was upheld by Government. He was again refused leave except on medical certificate in 1910.

(ix) Mr. Richmond was refused eight months' combined leave from March, 1913.

(x) Mr. Murray was refused privilege leave without medical certificate in July, 1906; refused two months' privilege leave in June, 1912; refused again in April, 1913, as there was nobody to relieve him.

(xi) Mr. Bennett was refused furlough in 1912 on account of paucity of officers. Mr. Lodge reported to the Board on this subject in 1907 as follows: "The absence of sufficient provision in the existing cadre has rendered it necessary for some years to refuse leave to officers except when the state of their health rendered leave absolutely necessary; a premium has thus been placed on bad health, while the officers who have kept themselves fit for duty have been unable to obtain the periodical rest and change which are necessary for the prolonged maintenance of health in every Department and especially so in one notorious for the unhealthiness of the tracts in which many of its officers have to work."

The following are orders of the Government and of the Board of Revenue restricting the grant of leave to Forest Officers on account of the short-handedness of the Department. G.O. No. 376, Revenue, dated 30th April, 1902; Board's Proceedings, Forest, No. 76, Routine, dated 13th February, 1903; Board's Proceedings, Forest, No. 175, Routine, dated 5th April, 1906, G.O. No. 2315, dated 16th September, 1907, and D.O. No. 2250-E 11-1, dated 11th October, 1911, from the Secretary to Government to the Forest Member of the Board.

Evidence that (d) the unit of area under each officer is too large to allow of thorough control.—In the Presidency there are 32 Forest districts containing 19,439 square miles of reserved forests and reserved lands; this gives an average of over 600 square miles to each District Forest Officer. On this point Mr.

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. LODGE.

[Continued.]

Beaumont Bryant, late Inspector-General of Forests, remarked: "No officer, however energetic, can work areas like these to the best advantage."

In France, with only 4,609 square miles of State forests, 7,603 square miles of communal forests and 20,209 square miles of private forests, the establishment consists of:—

- 1 Director-General.
- 3 Administrators.
- 32 Conservators.
- 200 District Forest Officers.
- 442 Assistants to District Forest Officers.

The areas of the charges are:—

Madras.	Officer.	France.
4,860 sq. miles.	Conservator.	144 sq. miles.
607 sq. miles.	District Forest Officer.	23 sq. miles.

For comparison with Madras the French Conservator may be considered to hold the place of the Madras District Forest Officer.

66462. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—(1) The conditions of life in India at the present day are much less attractive than they were twenty and thirty years ago, and are daily becoming less attractive.—(i) Englishmen do not like serving under Indian officers.

(ii) There has been an enormous increase in the quantity and quality of work to be done, both in field and in office, by every officer, 2nd to Forest Officers more perhaps than to any other class, office work is uncongenial. The increase in office work may be gauged by the fact that in Anantapur in 1886 the Forest office staff consisted of two clerks whose work was far from heavy, whereas now it takes six clerks to get through the work, and an application has recently been made for an increase of office establishment.

(iii) The Medical Service used to be composed of Europeans, it now contains a large Indian element, and just as Indians object to having European doctors attending the ladies of their families, so do Europeans object to Indian doctors attending their wives and daughters.

(iv) The cost of "home remittances" is 50 per cent. higher than it was with the rupee at two shillings.

(v) The cost of living has increased largely in recent years; servants, labour, transport, horse-food, and every item of household expense has increased in price.

(2) The conditions of salary (combined with present value of the rupee and cost of living) are such that no married man can make sufficient provision for his family out of his savings, or put by enough to enable him to live in comfort after retiring, or afford to take the leave without which he cannot continue at his best.—(i) There are seven officers in service in Madras who have earned their full pension of Rs. 5,000; not a single officer recruited since 1881 has yet retired on full pension. Of the six trained officers recruited before 1881 four retired on full pension; not one of these officers was able to save enough while in service to make, in addition to his pension, a sufficient income to enable him to spend his old age in comfort.

(ii) Although some salaries were increased by the reorganisation of 1907, the benefits of the increase have been swallowed up by the rise in the cost of living in recent years. The rise in the cost of living is probably permanent but not final. i.e. prices of labour, etc., will not fall, but may and probably will rise, and as the recommendations of the Commission will finally fix the pay of officers for the next 20 years or more, it is felt that the fact that some salaries were raised by the reorganisation of 1907 should not be allowed to prevent a full enquiry into the adequacy or otherwise of salaries under existing conditions and under the conditions which can be foreseen as coming into existence within the next 20 years.

(3) The increase in salary resulting from the reorganisation of 1907 and introduction of the time scale of pay was irregularly distributed and partly discounted by the withdrawal of compensation allowance.—(i) Before the reorganisation the recruit from England drew pay at the rate of Rs. 380 plus Rs. 21-14-0

compensation allowance; after the reorganisation he drew Rs. 380, a trifling increase of Rs. 8-2-0, while the men of from two to eight years' service are frequently worse off under the reorganised scale than under the old scale.

(ii) Under the old system, if a junior officer was placed in charge of a district, it was owing to the absence of men on leave, in consequence of which he received acting allowance, which compensated him to some extent for the extra expense of district charge. Under the new (time scale) system the junior officer receives no acting allowance when placed in charge of a district. The pay of an Imperial Service District Forest Officer should never be less than that allotted to junior Deputy Conservators.

(iii) The Senior Deputy Conservators have benefited most by the introduction of the time scale of pay, which has raised the pay of a second grade Deputy of 19 years' service by Rs. 400 or 47 per cent., of a first grade Deputy by Rs. 293-12-0 or 32-64 per cent., whereas the pay of Conservators was increased as follows:—

Third grade by	Rs. 225	0	0	or 17-64 per cent.
Second grade by	„	212	8	0 or 14-28 „
First grade by	„	200	0	0 or 11-76 „

(iv) Under the old system the difference between the highest pay attainable by a district Forest Officer and the lowest pay of a Conservator was Rs. 318-12-0, which was insufficient to cover the extra expenses which an officer in the position of a Conservator has to incur. Under the new system, the above difference has been diminished to Rs. 250, with the result that a senior Deputy Conservator is financially better off than a third or even a second grade Conservator. The difference of pay between the executive and administrative appointments should be not less than Rs. 500.

(v) The pay of first and second grade Conservators is less than the pay recommended by the Government of India in their despatch to the Secretary of State No. 312, dated 1st October, 1890, inasmuch as it is less than the pay of Superintending Engineers of corresponding grades.

(vi) The stoppage of increments from the twentieth year of service is hard on competent officers who would be Conservators were it not for (a) the irregularity with which the Service is recruited, (b) the refusal to allow officers to take foreign employment, (c) the bar existing against any Madras Forest Officer obtaining the post of Inspector-General of Forests, a bar which it is urged should be removed.

It is felt also very strongly that there should be a Chief Conservator in each Province on Rs. 3,000 and the pay of the post of Inspector-General of Forests to the Government of India should be raised to Rs. 3,500 a month and should most certainly be retained. His advice should be made readily available to the Presidency of Madras. It is deemed essential that the increase of pay between executive and administrative rank, between Conservator and Chief Conservator, and between Chief Conservator and Inspector-General of Forests, should not be less than Rs. 500 a month. The present pay of the administrative posts in the Forest Department is insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain their position as heads of departments in the way they should do, either with Local Governments or with the Government of India.

It is further urged that—

(a) Special allowances should be made for special work, such as Working Plans, College, Research work, etc.

(b) Special allowances should be made in special localities, for special unhealthiness, cost of living, etc., and

(c) A special allowance should be made to officers who have their headquarters in a Presidency Town to meet the increased cost of house rent and living, in the same way as is now done to officers of departments other than the Forest Department at the present time.

These items are dealt with in more detail later on.

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. Lodge.

[Continued.]

(4) *The pay of Forest Officers should be at least equal to that of Public Works Officers of corresponding position.*—The Government of India have expressed their opinion on this point, stating that the position and responsibilities of Conservators are in no degree inferior to those of Superintending Engineers, while the risks they incur from exposure in unhealthy climates are perhaps greater, and that they ought therefore to receive an equal rate of salary. But if position and responsibilities of two posts are equal and the risks in one post are greater than those in the other, the former should carry better pay than the latter. Actually the contrary is the case. If the comparison is carried above the class of Conservators, the differences become still more marked, for a Chief Conservator of a Province receives only Rs. 2,150, while Chief Engineers receive Rs. 2,500 and Rs. 2,750, and the Inspector-General of Forests for all India receives less pay than a first-class Chief Engineer of a single Province and is placed far below him in the Precedence list.

After considering all the points connected with the conditions of salary, the Madras Forest Officers are of opinion that the following rates of salary would be fair:—

Rate of pay. rs.	Rate of pay. rs.
1 Assistant Conservators (provided that any officer placed in charge of a Forest district shall draw the pay of the lowest grade Deputy Conservator). 2 400 3 450 4 500 5 550 6 600 7 650 8 700 9 750 10 800 11 850 12 900 13 950 14 1,000 15 1,050 16 1,100 17 1,150 18 1,200 19 1,250 20 Limited to officers declared suitable for the post of Conservator. 21 1,300 22 1,350 23 1,400 24 1,450 25 1,500 Conservators, 2nd Grade 2,000 Conservators, 1st Grade 2,500 Chief Conservators 3,000 Inspector-General 3,500	1 Assistant Conservators (provided that any officer placed in charge of a Forest district shall draw the pay of the lowest grade Deputy Conservator). 2 400 3 450 4 500 5 550 6 600 7 650 8 700 9 750 10 800 11 850 12 900 13 950 14 1,000 15 1,050 16 1,100 17 1,150 18 1,200 19 1,250 20 Limited to officers declared suitable for the post of Conservator. 21 1,300 22 1,350 23 1,400 24 1,450 25 1,500 Conservators, 2nd Grade 2,000 Conservators, 1st Grade 2,500 Chief Conservators 3,000 Inspector-General 3,500

Special allowances should be made for special work such as Working Plans, College, Research work, etc.—The need for these allowances has been admitted by the Government of India in letter No. 312, dated 1st October, 1890, to the Secretary of State; the allowances are given under the Government of India and should also be given under the Government of Madras.

The Principal of a Forest College has numerous extra expenses; for instance, he has to entertain on a larger scale than any other Forest Officer to support the college games, students' library, etc., and to offer prizes for work or sport. When on tour he has to travel over distances as great or greater than those covered by a Conservator and to keep camp equipment suitable for heavy camping in the plains and light camping in the hills. As regards local and travelling allowances the Principal of the Madras Forest College should be placed on a level with the Principal of the Dehra Dun Forest College.

The same remarks apply to the allowances of Instructors.

Officers of other departments called on to serve in the Presidency town are given increased pay or local allowances of house rent, to compensate for the extra cost of living; Forest Officers should be

given similar treatment. The following are some instances of the local allowances granted:—

	Local allow- ance.	House rent.
Under Secretary to Government, Public Works	100	45
Secretary to Government, Public Works	250	—
Joint Secretary to Government, Public Works	250	—
Under Secretary to Government, Irrigation	100	45
Secretary to Government, Rail-way Branch	250	—
Assistant Secretary to Commissioner of Salt and Akbari	150	60
Director of Land Records	211	—
Director of Agriculture	150	—
Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department	100	50
Deputy Commissioner of Police	100	—
Assistant Inspector-General of Police	200	—
Chief Presidency Magistrate		Free house
Domestic Chaplain to the Bishop	75	—
The Archdeacon	130	—
Sanitary Commissioner	100	—

The list is not exhaustive, but is sufficiently comprehensive to show that unless good reasons to the contrary can be produced, Forest Officers should be given similar allowances.

Special allowances should be made in special localities, to compensate for special unhealthiness, cost of living, etc.—This is admitted in all departments, and it is not just to exclude the Forest Department on the grounds that officers joining it know what to expect.

The allowances for travelling on tour by road, for journeys exceeding 20 miles are eight annas a mile for first-class officers whether they carry tents or not; the allowances for Assistant Conservators are four annas and for Deputy Conservators six annas a mile unless they carry tents. There is no reason for this distinction and it should be abolished.

The rates of travelling allowance require revision, to bring them into line with the modern cost of camping, and rates must differ according to the cost of travelling in different districts, or even in different localities of the same district. Journeys "by road" include journeys where no roads exist, and all luggage and camp equipment has to be carried by coolies. Such journeys are more common to Forest Officers than to others and their cost is double or treble the amount of the daily allowance.

The rate of cart hire has increased everywhere; in 1885 carts could be hired at Rs. 18 per month; now in Coimbatore the cost is Rs. 30 and in the Wynad Rs. 50, while in South Carara the carts are so small that double the number of ordinary carts has to be employed.

Forest Officers in Madras have now to pay for occupation of Forest rest-houses, which formerly they occupied free of charge. Breakages of camp furniture, etc., are heavy, especially when camp equipment has to be carried by coolies or elephant or pack bullocks.

In this connection it is urged that the cost of railing horses from one camp to another should be paid by Government. On one occasion Lodge railed his horses from Coimbatore to Tellicherry, and was refused refund of rail charge on the grounds that he might have had the horses walked to Tellicherry. The distance is 158 miles. Hundreds of similar cases could be quoted in Madras, while it is understood that such charges are always passed in Northern India.

The travelling allowance admissible on transfer is limited to double first-class fare which leaves the transferred officer much out of pocket. When two or more transfers follow at short intervals an officer is financially crippled for some time.

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. LODGE.

[Continued.]

The old days when an officer sold all his furniture and horses to his successor have passed away with the spread of railways, and an officer on transfer now-a-days has to take with him a portion of his furniture, all his personal property, in many cases a family, and in all cases some servants. His expenses are greater than when travelling on tour. As instances:—

(1) Wilson was transferred from Coimbatore to South Malabar in June, 1912, from South Malabar to North Salem in September, 1912, and three weeks later from Salem to North Vellore; he was between Rs. 100 and Rs. 200 out of pocket on the transfers.

(2) Cowley Brown transferred from Salem to Coimbatore in 1912; received double first class fare, Rs. 12-6-0; actual cost of moving himself, servants, horse and camp equipment was Rs. 350.

(3) Latham, transferred from Coimbatore to South Canara in 1899, was about Rs. 140 out of pocket.

(4) Bryant, transferred from Kodaikanal to Madras in July, 1911; retransferred to Kodaikanal in November, 1911; transferred again to Madras in February, 1913; was Rs. 150 out of pocket on each transfer.

(5) Lodge, transferred from Kurnool to Coimbatore in 1898 was Rs. 600 out of pocket; his pay at the time was Rs. 800.

(6) Fischer transferred from Coimbatore to Kodaikanal in July 1911 and back to Coimbatore four months later was Rs. 600 out of pocket on the double transfer.

Instances could be multiplied.

It is felt that even if an officer is transferred while on furlough, he should be allowed the cost of moving his household goods from his old to his new station, on his return from leave; he would (or should) be allowed this amount if transferred while on duty, and his household goods cannot walk from one station to another while he is on furlough, or during his subsidiary leave after furlough.

Special provision should be made to recoup an officer the expenses he has to incur when, being on transfer, his destination is changed en route.—For instance, an officer transferred from Kurnool to South Arcot may receive orders in Madras to proceed to Nellore instead of South Arcot. He then receives travelling allowance from Kurnool to Madras, and from Madras to Nellore, but his goods and his horses having been booked to South Arcot cannot be stopped at Madras, and the officer has to pay for their carriage all the way to South Arcot and all the way back to Nellore.

66463. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The following improvements to existing leave rules are suggested:—

(1) The minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should follow the ratio adopted between Indian Civil Service and other services for the maximum furlough allowance, i.e., to be £100, or the salary last drawn on duty, whichever is less.

(2) Commutation of long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay with suitable restrictions.

(3) Accumulation of privilege leave up to six months; it should never be possible for an officer to lose any of the privilege leave he has earned by leave being refused him, and in the event of such refusal, he should undoubtedly be permitted to accumulate his privilege leave up to the time Government can see its way to permitting him to avail himself of it.

Here again it is pointed out how essential it is to increase the cadre of the Imperial Forest Service so as to allow officers to take the leave which they have earned. Leave has been and is constantly refused except on medical recommendation, whereas it ought surely to be encouraged as much as possible in a department such as the Forest Department, the officers of which are apt to suffer severely in health from the very nature of their duties.

No minimum leave allowance for ordinary furlough is fixed for Forest Officers, although the Civil Service enjoy a minimum leave allowance of £500 a year or

full pay, whichever is less. This is apparently a relic of the days when the Forest Department was recruited locally, and is unsuitable for the present conditions of officering the Department. A Forest Officer takes his furlough in England just as a Civil Service Officer does, and should receive such allowances as will enable him to take furlough when necessary and live during his furlough in such a manner that he may return to duty refreshed and invigorated; this is impossible on the furlough allowance admissible to junior officers under existing rules, and still more impossible if an officer is compelled to take leave on medical certificate early in his service; he then has doctor's fees and possibly the cost of an operation and nursing to meet, and the minimum allowance of £200 a year or three-quarters pay, whichever is less, is insufficient. (Compare this treatment with that of the Civil Service minimum, £500 a year or full pay, whichever is less.)

As the maximum leave allowance of Forest Officers is 4-5ths that of Civilians, the same rule should apply to the minimum leave allowance which should therefore be £400 a year or full pay, whichever is less.

The revised leave rules—which, it is understood, have been issued to the heads of various departments for opinion and remarks have not been issued to any Forest Officer. A copy having been supplied in reply to a special request for the same, the following appear to be points requiring alteration:—

(i) Article 301.—It is proposed to credit six months furlough to members of the Civil Service on arrival in India; similar credit should be given to Imperial Forest Officers who have to spend two or more years under training before coming out to India.

(ii) Article 304-b (ii).—It is proposed that if a Service has no special leave reserve, the number of officers absent on leave shall not exceed one-eighth of the strength of the Service. The exceptional unhealthiness of the Forest Service has been shown under "Conditions of Service" and under the same head the difficulty of obtaining leave has been dealt with. The Service has recently lost an officer (Barlow Poole) solely because he was refused leave; he stayed on duty and died. The leave reserve in the Forest Service should be greater than in other services, and should be strong enough to allow of one-fourth of the officers being absent at a time.

(iii) Article 309 (c) makes no provision for minimum furlough allowances of Forest officers.

(iv) Existing article 246 requires modification, so that the privilege leave earned in excess of three months may not be forfeited. Numerous instances could be quoted of Forest officers being refused privilege leave and thereby being deprived of a certain amount of full pay leave which they have worked for.

66464. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The pensions now granted to officers retiring in England are smaller than they were 35 years ago. In the seventies of last century pensions were granted at the rate of "Rs. 5,000 or £500"; the present pensions are granted at 1s. 9d. per rupee, which gives only £437 10s. for Rs. 5,000. Those officers who earn the extra Rs. 1,000 pension (i.e., Conservators of 28 year's service, etc.) receive £525 or an increase of £25 on the pensions of 35 years ago.

The cost of living in England, rents, rates, taxes, education of children, etc., have increased enormously since the maximum ordinary pension was fixed at Rs. 5,000 or £500.

Pensions being deferred pay, an increase in the scale of pay should be followed by an increase in the scale of pension. It has been stated that this does not follow, but a reference to the rules regarding foreign service in the Civil Service Regulations shows that Government calculate on quarter of an officer's pay being deferred to meet the cost of leave allowances and pension, and one-eighth of an officer's pay being deferred to meet the cost of pension alone [vide article 755 (i) and (ii)]; therefore an increase in pay means an increase in the amount of deferred pay put aside to meet the cost of pensions.

Under the old scale of pay one officer drew about

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. LODGE.

[Continued.]

Rs. 1,47,775 salary in the first 20 years of service; under the new scale an officer draws Rs. 1,90,320 for the same period (whole time calculated as being on full pay); on these figures alone the Rs. 4,000 pension on the old scale of pay should become Rs. 5,150 on the present scale; if pay for the 21st to 30th year of service be added the difference would be still greater, for under the old scale an officer drew Rs. 1,48,800 (average) and under the new scale he will draw Rs. 1,95,600 during those years.

The high death rate in the Forest Department decreases the charge for pensions.

The facts pointed out under "conditions of salary" [2 (1)] show that present pensions are inadequate; of the four officers therein referred to as having retired on full pension, not one is able to live in comfort on his pension.

It is more difficult for Forest Officers than for others to obtain employment after retiring, for the work for which they are qualified entails a strenuous active life, which is beyond the power of most men after 30 years' service in India.

The retiring pension of Imperial Officers (excepting Conservators) is the same as that of Provincial Officers, although the Imperial Officer—

(i) draws more pay than the Provincial Officer, and consequently should be credited with more deferred pay.

(ii) retires in England where the cost of living is much higher than it is in India, where the Provincial Officer retires.

(iii) incurs considerable expense over his training for service, whilst the Provincial Officer is given his training free of cost.

Therefore, if the pension which can be earned by Provincial Officers is fair the pension which can be earned by Imperial Officers is unfair.

Under existing rules an officer obtains nothing in return for his deferred pay for service subsequent to the completion of 25 years.—An officer retiring after 25 years' service is entitled to a certain pension; if he continues in service, the capital which supplies the pension is increased by (1) interest on capital (2) annual deferred pay; the deferred pay of a senior officer represents a larger sum than that of a junior officer, consequently the accumulation of capital is comparatively rapid after the twenty-fifth year of service.

The longer an officer stays in active service, the shorter the time for which he will draw pension; in other words the older a man is on retiring the larger the annuity which a given sum will secure. Therefore pensions should increase annually according to the length of service of an officer.

The deferred pay of an officer on the present scale becoming Conservator only in his 24th year of service and allowing for four years' furlough during his service would buy an annuity of Rs. 7,015 if the officer attained 55 after 30 years of service; of Rs. 8,518 if the officer attained 55 after 32 years of service.

Any improvements in pensions which may now be granted should have retrospective effect.—The inadequacy of existing pensions formed the subject of memorials by forest officers to the Secretary of State in the year 1909, which memorials were withheld by the Government of India on the grounds that "the subject of pensions being one of those referred to the Commission, the Government of India are unable to further consider the matter until the report of the Commission is received." Thus the grant of the relief prayed for has been and is being delayed beyond the date on which—but for the appointment of the Commission—it should have been given, and it is felt that it would be unfair to officers retiring between the date of the Government Order above referred to and the date of orders being passed on the recommendations of the Commission, to deprive them of any improvement in the conditions of pension resulting from the report of the Commission. It is therefore strongly urged that all such improvements may be given retrospective effect from the 7th September, 1912.

The invalid pensions obtainable by Forest Officers are inferior to those obtainable by other officers,

although the risk of being compelled to retire on account of broken health is greater in "Forests" than in any other Department. The pensions obtainable are shown in the following comparative table; article 474 applies to all so-called uncovenanted Services except Forests, Public Works and Geological Survey which come under article 476:—

Years of service.	Forest officers' average emoluments.	Annual pension under Civil Service Regulations.	
		Article 474.	Article 476.
10	703	Rs. 1,406	Rs. 1,000
11	750	1,650	1,400
12	800	1,920	1,800
13	850	2,210	2,200
14	900	2,520	2,600
15	950	2,850	3,000
16	1,000	3,200	3,000
17	1,050	3,400	3,000
18	1,100	3,600	3,000
19	1,150	3,800	3,000
20*	1,200	4,000	4,000
21*	1,238	4,200	4,000
22*	1,250	4,400	4,000
23*	1,250	4,600	4,000
24*	1,333	4,800	4,000
25 and above	1,417	5,000	5,000
Total	...	53,556	49,000

* Under Article 476 pensions after 20 years' service are retiring pensions.

† This allows for an officer becoming Conservator after completing 23 years' service.

Thus the Forest Officer compelled to retire before completing 20 years' service on account of ill-health is worse off than officers of other Departments, and if compelled to retire between 20 and 25 years' service on account of ill-health, he would not be allowed the pension admissible under article 474 and would therefore again be worse off than officers of other Departments. The only set off to these disadvantages of the article 476 scale is that no medical certificate is required after 20 years' service, a concession of which very few officers can afford to take advantage. After considering the facts dealt with in the preceding paragraphs it is felt that the following is a fair scale of pensions for Forest Officers:—

Years of service completed.	Sterling pension.	
10	250	
11	275	
12	300	
13	325	
14	350	
15	375	
16	400	
17	425	
18	450	
19	475	
20	500	
21	525	
22	550	
23	575	
24	600	
25	625*	On medical certificate.
26	650*	
27	675*	
27	700*	
29	725*	
30	750*	

If the above pensions are granted, the Government should have the authority of retiring

* Applicable only to officers who have attained the rank of Conservator; £50 to be added for two years as Chief Conservator and £100 for two years as Inspector-General.

27 January 1914.]

MR. F. A. LODGE

[Continued.]

compulsorily on the pension he has earned any officer of 25 years' service or more who is deemed inefficient and incompetent.

A large majority of officers consider that an officer's Family Pension Fund should be introduced instead of the present Provident Fund to which all officers should be required to contribute and pensions payable to a deceased officer's widow and children at a sliding scale according to length of service completed, say, after 5 years, after 10 years, after 15 years, after 20 years, and contributions should cease on retirement. The details of this suggestion must be worked out by an actuary and the terms laid before officers of the Department before such system is introduced.

Officers will be capable of better work when they know that a pension is assured to their families and do not have to worry over attempting to make adequate provision out of inadequate means.

66465. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—To enter the Imperial Forest Service now, the only limitation that exists is that a candidate must be a natural born British subject, and unmarried, except in the case of Indians; there is no necessity to make any change in this rule at present.

The proportion of Imperial Forest Officers in Madras Presidency should be increased, and as a general rule an Imperial Officer should be in charge of every Major Forest Division. It is inadvisable to place a junior assistant or an Extra Assistant Conservator in independent charge of a division.

There is in this Presidency no educated class of Indians to whom a forest life is congenial. Indians as a rule enter the Department in all grades as a means of earning a livelihood; not because they like the work and life, and this must and does tell considerably against zeal and efficiency. The number of Provincial Officers ought not, however, to be reduced as there is plenty of work for them all, and provided the men appointed are properly selected, each should prove of very valuable assistance to some district or other Forest Officer. At present, such assistance is greatly wanting owing to the numerical weakness of the Imperial staff.

66466. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—With the Indian Civil Service, at least in the Madras Presidency, Forest Officers are very intimately connected with regard to Forest administration. An essential addition to the Department of a Professional Head in the appointment of a Chief Conservator of each Province is most strongly urged. One very strong reason for the creation of this post is to ensure improvement in the preparation and control of working-plans, impossible when the sanctioning authority is a layman.

It must of course be definitely understood that selections to Chief Conservator's post as well as to that of a Conservator must be made on meritorious and tried work and ability and not solely by seniority.

The present position of District Forest Officer and Collector in this Presidency.—Although perhaps strictly speaking the following matter is not within the scope of the present enquiry, we desire, however, to take this opportunity of respectfully representing for favourable consideration either by the Royal Services Commission, or at least by the Government of His Excellency the Governor in Council the following:—

The position of a District Forest Officer is altogether anomalous.

He has no direct authority except in trifling matters; experience, good work, admitted ability and long service do not alter his position as defined in the Code one iota, and throughout his service he remains as he began with almost complete responsibility for efficient working but with little or no authority personal to his office. We know of no other service in the world where an officer's authority does not increase *pari passu* with his responsibilities.

The old Code put the District Forest Officer in the position of a Collector's Sheristadar, it made the Collector the executive Forest Officer, and the Conservator an advising authority with no power. The new Code has improved matters very little if indeed at all.

It has done nothing for the District Forest Officer beyond throwing on his shoulders the whole responsibility for execution and efficiency. It has given him no additional authority. The new Code bristles with clauses imposing on the District Forest Officer the various duties he has to perform, and responsibilities which he incurs, while the collector in nine cases out of ten is only mentioned in order to insist that the District Forest Officer is entirely under his orders or to force the former to exert his own authority over the District Forest Officer in all forest matters.

The theory underlying the whole system is that the Forest Officer is not to be trusted and that the relations of the Forest Department with the ryot are so intimate that the Civilian must be the directing authority.

On what this old and deep-rooted distrust is based we have no idea, but so long as it is allowed to continue, so long will the Madras Forest Service suffer in efficiency and self-respect.

The only argument we have ever heard is the personal one of inefficient members of the Service. But there are bad bargains in every service—bad Judges, bad Collectors, bad Engineers, etc., and we are not aware that the Madras Forest Department is any worse off in the way of bad bargains than other Departments.

But the Forest Department has a right to resent the idea that it is out of sympathy with the ryot and we do resent it. Many Forest Officers have a much closer knowledge of the people (especially of the jungle tribes) and a more direct sympathy with them than officers of other services.

It may be said that the present system works well in practice: that the District Forest Officer is permitted by the Collector to run the Department and is seldom interfered with, and that most of the restrictions exist only on paper. That is the case, no doubt, in all heavy districts from sheer inability on the part of the Collector to undertake the complete supervision of detail which the Code demands. It is also due to the loyal and tactful co-operation between Collector and District Forest Officer which has enabled a position which in fairness to both must be admitted is quite untenable and impossible, to have been even made practicable at all. But the fact is rather an argument in favour of abolishing the system than of retaining it, and there is real necessity for defining clearly the duties, responsibilities and authority of each officer.

Admitting that in nine cases out of ten the Collector has little knowledge of the inner working of the Department and no time to acquire it, the absurdity remains that on all forest subjects, technical or otherwise, he alone can address the head of the Forest Department. For instance, the Government require a valuation of a forest or a report on some detail of forest working. The Collector is called upon to report. His report may be a mere copy of the District Forest Officer's Office-note, or a paraphrase of it, or may be entirely his own as he is not bound to consult the District Forest Officer at all nor to follow his advice nor even to state that he does not agree with it. No one knows whether it is the opinion of the Chancellor or the District Forest Officer. The presumption is, that although it bears the name of the former, it is really a production by the latter. The presumption is often entirely wrong, and we have known cases in which the District Forest Officer whose opinion was far more valuable than that of the Collector, disagreed entirely with the opinions expressed.

Forest Officers naturally resent the fact that alone of all quasi-scientific departments, the opinion of officers of the Service on matters to which they devote a great part of their life is usually neither asked for nor indeed often acknowledged.

The want of recognition of the District Forest Officer's real position and the refusal to give him

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. LONGE.

[Continued.]

publicly the authority which he in reality has to exert in order to carry out his work, cause grave discontent in the Service. It has the further serious drawback that a Forest Officer's work is seldom on public record; that the Civilian head of the Department has little guide to the ability of the officers over whom he rules; that appointments are made which every Forest Officer knows to be wrong and likely to bring discredit on the Service; and finally that a District Forest Officer has no encouragement to exhibit any initiative and can idle away his time with perfect impunity under the Collector's sheltering wing.

The present system has also a serious drawback adverted to above, which we have never heard any one attempt to justify, namely, the want of differentiation between the authority of an experienced and an inexperienced officer. Both are treated precisely the same except that the former's responsibilities are increased by heavier and more difficult work.

Can anything be more absurd than to give to an experienced District Forest Officer of many years' standing in charge of a heavy division no more authority than is given to a totally inexperienced Extra Assistant Conservator placed in temporary charge of a district? We are aware that powers can be delegated by the Conservator, but delegation is made so difficult that it was obviously the intention of Government that it should seldom occur.

The following remedies are suggested:-

(i) Abandon the attempt to force on already over-worked Collectors the technical supervision of the Forest Department in their districts.

(ii) Raise the District Forest Officer's position to that of an officer responsible for the forest management in his own district, armed with sufficient personal authority to carry out his work, and independent of the Collector so far that he shall have the right of access to the head of his own Department and the right of having his own views on forest matters placed on record.

(iii) Differentiate the authority of District Forest Officers according to the responsibilities they have to assume. For instance, officers in charge of major charges should have much greater powers than those in charge of minor charges and than junior officers.

We do not consider that the Collector's administrative powers as head of a district should in any way be reduced. No forest matter should be settled without giving him an opportunity of freely expressing his views.

But we would abandon the hopeless attempt to make the Collector the initial authority for forest matters in his district whilst in practice giving the District Forest Officer the entire responsibility. The system is unfair to the Collector and to the District Forest Officer and especially to the latter, and we believe that all experienced Collectors will agree with our opinion on this subject.

A technical head to the Department, working directly under and in touch with Government is much needed. The present head of the Forest Department is the Board of Revenue and for a large number of years, the Forest Member of the Board knew little or nothing of, and cared little for, the Department; consequently no forward step in forest administration which it was thought would at first be acceptable to Government was ever sent up, and nobody upheld the work or the officers of the Department which would have stagnated had it not been for the keenness of its officers. At one time the ignoring of Forest Officers reached such a stage that in the annual report (prepared by the Forest Member) no Forest Officer was mentioned, the praise for all good work being liberally bestowed on Collectors. It is only in recent years that any real progress has been made in placing forests and the officers who work them in their proper position in the economy of the country, and even now numerous mistakes are made, and delays occur because there is no Forest Officer directly under Government to give information and to take an interest in getting forest papers put up for orders in a complete form without undue delay.

The following are a few instances of the results of there being no Chief Conservator or Forest Secretary to Government, occupying a position similar to that held by certain Public Works Officers:-

(1) All "forest" papers are submitted to Government by the Board of Revenue, which does not always quote the opinions of Conservators; Government are therefore unaware whether the statements and proposals are those of a specially trained officer, or of the member of the Board in charge of forests, a subject about which it is possible for him to know very little.

(2) When the "forest" papers reach Government, they are noted on by various people, and all the drawbacks to the proposals are naturally brought forward; no Forest Officer has an opportunity of defending the proposals, which therefore go up for orders with as last word the uncriticised case against them and consequently frequently are not passed, or are so modified as to defeat their original object.

(3) When it was proposed to provide for "Forest Research" in the Madras Forest College, Government enquired of the Board what "Forest Research" consisted of; the Board referred the question to Conservators. With a Forest Secretary to Government, such references would be unnecessary.

(4) In 1907 it was pointed out to the Board by a Conservator that in order to obtain recruits for the Imperial Service, it was necessary to indent on the Secretary of State fully three years in advance. In consequence of this representation an indent was framed that year, but since then (six years ago) not a single indent to meet future requirements has been made.

Within the next three years five Imperial Officers will have to retire under the 55 years' rule, and no steps have been taken to ensure the requisite supply of recruits. This failure to indent for recruits in good time besides upsetting the supply provided for the rest of India, leads to irregular recruiting with eventual periodical blocks in promotion to the class of Conservators.

(5) The disposal of forest papers is delayed partly because extra references are necessary and partly because there is no officer directly under Government interested in getting papers through promptly—

(i.) In February, 1913, Mr. Deadon Bryant, late Inspector-General of Forests, pointed out the need for a Chief Conservator in Madras; no orders have been issued yet.

(ii.) In March, 1912, the Forest Member applied for an increase of establishment; no orders have been issued yet.

(iii.) Until a few years ago the grant of leave to Forest Officers, their posting after return from leave, etc., were frequently in arrears.

(6) In some cases orders have been passed by Government which would not have been passed if they had first heard a Forest Officer on the subject.

(i.) The order declaring the Madras Forest College to be a "Vacation Department" appears to have been issued on a reference from the Accountant-General, Government being in ignorance of the fact that the vacation is only for the students, not for the staff; but the Government order deprived all the staff of privilege leave.

(ii.) In November, 1908, four officers were posted to Malabar in fourteen days.

(iii.) Conservators have been censured by Government for not realising as much for their sandalwood as was realised at the Mysore sales, in ignorance of the facts that (a) the Mysore sales began at rates about equal to those realised by the Conservators, and ran up suddenly and unexpectedly towards the end of the sales; the rise was a surprise to Mysore and to the bidders; (b) the sandalwood from South Coimbatore is less rich in oil than the Mysore sandalwood and therefore commands a lower price.

(iv.) Local allowances were refused to Forest

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. LODGE

[Continued.]

Officers, and even withdrawn from some officers only to be given back eventually after much correspondence.

(7) Continuity of policy cannot be expected when the head of the Department is a stranger to it, and is constantly changed; when one Forest Member goes on leave or is promoted, another Civilian takes up the post; his views may be unformed, or may be diametrically opposed to those of his predecessor. With a Forest Officer at the head intimate knowledge of the Department would be assured.

(8) As a minor point we would bring to notice that under the present system Forest Officers get no say in matters which intimately concern them; suggestions for modifications of the Civil Service Regulations referred by the Government of India are not referred to Conservators; the proposed revised leave rules which, it is understood, were sent for remarks to heads of Departments in Northern India have not been referred to Conservators in Madras; the reason is that Conservators are not heads of departments.

The proposal to place forests directly under Government was made by the Secretary of State in 1891.

The proposal was strongly opposed by the Board of Revenue, because it entailed a reduction in the number of members of that body.

The late Inspector-General of Forests in February, 1913, strongly urged the advisability of appointing a Chief Conservator of Forests in Madras.

66467. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—The necessity for a "Research Institute" in connection with the Madras Forest College cannot be too strongly urged.

Each Imperial Forest Officer should be permitted to go to a hill station at his own expense for a period of six weeks annually to recruit his health. This privilege is already allowed in some provinces and should be extended to Madras. Any officer availing himself of such privilege would remain on duty and continue to carry out all the duties of his office, the only difference being that he would do so in the cooler climate of a hill station instead of in the burning heat of the plains. Such a privilege

would be certain to conduce to higher efficiency and probably to fewer leave vacancies, and it is strongly urged that the duties expected of a Forest Officer are arduous and trying enough to entitle him to this consideration.

Until a few years ago Forest Officers had prior claim to occupation of Forest rest-houses and paid no rent. The Government has now ruled that Forest Officers in this Presidency shall have no prior claim to occupation of such rest-houses, and that they must pay rent. Officers of the department feel that in this respect they are being treated on a different footing to their "confreres" in the whole of the rest of India—*vide* section 16 (II), Government of India Forest Department Code, 6th edition, which allows prior claim and occupation free.

66468. *Imperial Service opinion on Provincial Service—Conditions of Service.*—Pensionable service should be reduced from 30 to 25 years with two years' furlough. An Indian after 25 years is no longer fit for Forest outdoor work. Many of them struggle on, performing indifferent work and eventually die in harness. A few sedentary posts for Provincial Officers are required for the same reasons as in the case of Imperial Officers. The posts suggested are such as Personal Assistants to District and other Forest Officers.

It is recommended that Provincial Officers may be permitted to go to a hill station on duty for six weeks annually as suggested for officers of the Imperial Forest Service. We desire also to point out that the Provincial Service has mainly to be recruited from the subordinate Forest Service. Such being the case, it is essentially desirable to attract the very best class of recruit obtainable for entry into the latter service. We therefore respectfully request that this service may also undergo re-organisation which it sadly needs. The present pay of the lowest grade of Forest Ranger, *viz.*, Rs. 50, is absurdly inadequate for the position and the responsible duties which a Ranger has to fulfil. We are strongly of opinion that the minimum pay of this class of officer should not be less than Rs. 80 per mensem. We venture therefore to put forward this proposal with the earnest hope that it will meet with the favourable consideration which we are confident it deserves.

MR. F. A. LOPEN called and examined.

66469. (Chairman.) The witness held the position of Conservator of Forests. There were four Conservators in the Presidency, each of whom had his own circle. Each revenue district was held either by one, two or three District Forest Officers. The charges were divided into major and minor for purposes of classification. All the eleven minor charges and eight major charges were held by Provincial Officers. Each Conservator had charge of one-fourth of the territory of the Province. Of the eight or nine districts within each circle, some were major and some were minor.

66470. He suggested that recruitment should be by selection combined with competition. He admitted that selection was a difficult task to perform satisfactorily, and that it was not easy to devise any form of machinery for discovering the suitability of a young man at the age of eighteen. Family history, surroundings of his youth, and so on, would help to a certain extent.

66471. He would be in favour of the re-introduction of the physical test. He recommended also that forestry training should be carried out at one residential institution, and suggested Oxford as being the best centre.

66472. Of the three years' training, it would be desirable that one should be spent in France. He thought the training given in France was more useful than that given in Germany. The training in Germany was too theoretical. He himself received his training in France, but in his time there were too many probationers, and the result was that some of the men did not learn enough French to fully appreciate the lectures. That fact,

and the desire to belter up Cooper's Hill, had led to the abolition of the course in France. It was a very good thing to have a senior officer with recruits on the Continent, as a young Englishman wanted one of his own countrymen to control him.

66473. The witness was the senior man on the all-India list, with the exception of one, for the post of Inspector-General of Forests. He had applied for the post, and had been refused on the ground that his experience was limited to Madras. It was contemplated in the re-organisation of 1911 that the Madras Government should supply two Officers for India List Appointments, but the Officers referred to were primarily those at the Research Institute and College at Dehra Dun.

66474. He agreed with the suggestion that, instead of the present system under which Officers were assigned to separate Provinces, the various Provinces should be grouped into three units, Upper India, Burma, Madras and Bombay, and that each batch of three candidates should be allowed to elect for each unit in order of merit among themselves. That would ensure that Madras did not get so many men from the bottom of the list.

66475. There were many difficulties in the way of a system of interchange of forest officers between the various Provinces. The language, the different conditions, and the people of the various Provinces had all to be taken into consideration, and the language difficulty would be especially acute in the case of Madras. From the point of view of administration he thought there was more to be said against such a scheme than for it.

66476. The strength of the Imperial Forest

27 January 1914.]

Mr. F. A. LODGE.

[Continued.]

Service in Madras was very inadequate, and required immediate increase. The present leave reserve was supposed to be six Imperial Officers, but there was so much ill-health in Madras that more than six men required leave every year. The Government had practically said that only four men were to be granted ordinary leave in order that a reserve of two might be kept for sick leave vacancies.

66477. In order to emphasise the necessity for an increased cadre, he had cited in his written statement five instances of officers who had applied for Foreign Service and were refused, and he considered that the cadre should be strong enough to enable officers to be spared for such work. Foreign Service was allowed in other parts of India.

66478. He agreed that when the cadre was fixed no account was taken of the possible appointment of an officer to the Gold Coast or Siam or Southern Nigeria, but if the cadre was strong enough to provide for emergencies owing to sick leave, it would also be strong enough for a man to be occasionally spared for a good billet elsewhere.

66479. One of their grievances was the slowness of their promotion compared with what it was in other parts of India. In other provinces senior men frequently obtained outside appointments, and this expedited the promotion of their juniors.

66480. With regard to his comparison of the forest areas in India and France, he did not think that an Indian subordinate Forest Officer could be expected to do better and harder and more thorough work than a subordinate Officer in France. The conditions of Service in India were much more difficult than in France, where they had all the forests beautifully opened out with roads, inspection paths, and forest guard houses. In India there were fever-stricken forests with very few roads through them. Officers had to fight against organised timber thefts, and the result was that the Indian Forest Service required, if anything, a stronger establishment than the French Service. He agreed that it would be many years before the same intensive system of forest management as was in vogue in France could be applied to all the forests in India. If there was a large increase of staff in India, they would be able to bring under forest management a very much larger area than was at present possible, and the result would be a very much larger revenue to Government. His contention was that an immediate increase in the cadre would correspondingly result in an immediate increase in revenue. He would like to see an increase of 50 per cent. in the staff immediately. Of that 50 per cent. three-fourths should be major charges.

66481. With regard to the conditions of salary, he compared the position of the Forest Service with the Public Works Department, and maintained that it should be at least as well paid as the engineers. As to whether the training of the Forest Officer would cost a considerable sum to the State as compared to the cost of the training of an engineer, it all depended on what contribution the State made during training. At present the State was giving probationers £120 a year, but when the witness joined the Service, the whole of the expense of training fell on the parents of the student. If in one Service the State paid for the training, and in another Service it did not, this consideration should undoubtedly be taken into account when fixing rates of salary.

66482. He agreed that objection might be taken to a continuous time scale without any charge bar on the ground that it had rather a deadening effect on an officer.

66483. He proposed that special allowances should be given in exceptional cases. He referred principally to the Forest College. The officer of that College had not a free house as the officer at Dchrha Dun had. Since the written statement was sent in, the Government of India had sanctioned an allowance of Rs. 150 a month for the Principal

of the Forest College, but had not sanctioned house rent.

66484. With regard to pensions, not much advantage was taken of optional retirement after twenty years' service. From the point of view of the interests of the State, a scheme for optional retirement after twenty years was open to objection. If improved pensions were granted, his colleagues would be in favour of foregoing optional retirement at twenty years.

66485. He recommended the establishment of a family pension fund in place of the present provident fund. He would accept a fund administered by Government, and supported entirely by officers' contributions.

66486. Provincial Officers holding major charges were engaged on work of the same responsibility as Imperial Officers holding major charges, but the work done was not always of the same value. A major charge might at one time be held by an Imperial Officer, and at another time by a Provincial Officer. It certainly would conduce to the contentment of Provincial Officers if all Officers discharging the same work and responsibility and value were included in the same service, but he did not know that it would add to the contentment of the Imperial Officers.

66487. He thought it would be extremely difficult to find suitable Indian recruits for major charges in the future. Forest life was specially arduous, and it was a life for which very few Indians had any real liking, or were really fit. They were not fond of physical exercise for the sake of physical exercise. Apart from that abstract point of view, he agreed that under the present constitution of the Service there were several charges which were in essence of the same responsibility as the charges held by Imperial Officers, and which were occupied by Indians. The best method of recruitment of Indians was direct appointment to the superior service; the selected candidates to be given exactly the same training as the Europeans.

66488. (Mr. Madge.) A European Forest training had to be supplemented by some kind of special training in India before an officer could become quite efficient. They had to learn to adapt their Continental training to local conditions. At present they allowed a year for training in India.

66489. A training solely in India would be inadequate. There were no highly developed forests in India which could be utilised for the training of officers, and the officer who had not seen a Continental forest did not know what he had to aim at in India.

66490. The forest divisions were not co-terminous with the Public Works Department divisions. They overlapped in certain cases. The Public Works Department had six circles in the Presidency, held by Superintending Engineers, and the Forest Service had four circles, held by Conservators.

66491. He had had some experience of the Anglo-Indian and domiciled community, and he must say that he found that they were affected by the languor of the East, and had not the energy required for the life of a Forest Officer.

66492. By concentrating the forest training at one central college, a great waste of resource would be avoided and *esprit de corps* would be cultivated.

66493. (Mr. Fisher.) In order to enter the French Forest Service a man had to possess high academic qualifications.

66494. (Mr. Sly.) Owing to the fact that the cadre of the Provincial Service was below its full strength, officers of the Imperial Service were holding some of the major charges which, according to the reorganisation scheme, should be held by provincial officers. He did not agree that when the provincial cadre was strengthened there would be no necessity for an increase in the leave reserve. The complaint as to leave had been chronic for the last 30 years. The reason why the provincial cadre was short was because men of the required standard were not available to fill the upper posts. He ad-

27 January 1914.]

MR. F. A. LODOE.

[Continued.]

mitted that, in spite of that fact, the number of charges handed over to the Provincial Service had been increased even recently. He contended that the explanation of the present difficulty with regard to leave reserve was that the work had expanded much faster than the cadre.

66495. An Imperial Assistant, before being put in charge of a division, was under training for one year. In addition to that he was for at least six months on tour, among other things visiting other districts than the one in which he received his training. He considered that an Imperial Forest Officer within one and a half years of his arrival in India was fit to take charge of a minor district, but not of a major district.

66496. In asking for special allowances, he was thinking of out of the way places, where the cost of living was higher than in large centres.

66497. With regard to his statement that selection for the post of Inspector-General was confined to officers with experience of Burma, he referred to a letter in which some years ago the Government of India had proposed to place all the Conservators on one list. In asking the Government of Madras to agree to the proposal the Government of India pointed out that if they did not do so, it would probably debar Conservators in Madras from becoming Inspectors-General, as it was considered essential that an officer holding that post should have had experience in Burma. It was the case that an officer from Bombay had held the post of Inspector-General for a time, and that the present Inspector-General had never been in Burma. It was also the fact that an officer was offered a transfer to a Conservatorship in Burma, and refused to accept the offer, but at the same time the offer was about to be withdrawn. The refusal to accept the offer was due to the fact that at that time it was proposed to abolish the post of Inspector-General; the officer refused to go to Burma if it was to lead to nothing better.

66498. At the last Board of Selection there were 20 or 22 candidates of all classes, who appeared for two vacancies in the Provincial Service. As a rule the domiciled European had poor educational qualifications. The Indian candidate had the necessary education, but had not either the physique or the energy, or a real liking for forest life.

66499. He would be in favour of introducing a system of competitive examination combined with selection as a test for entry to the Provincial Service. He was in favour of the system of filling a certain proportion of vacancies arising in the Provincial Service by promotions from the subordinate Service. At present it was very difficult to get a good class of recruits for the subordinate service, and the fact that some of them might get promoted to the Provincial Service would raise the standard. He thought that just as good a recruit for the Provincial Service would be obtained from the subordinate Service as by direct appointment.

(The witness withdrew.)

M.R. RY. RAO BARADUR V. ALWAR CNETTY GARU, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Madras.
Written Statement relating to the Provincial Forest Service, Madras.

66508. *Preliminary.*—The Provincial or Madras Forest Service consists of:—“Extra Assistant Conservators on Rs. 250 rising by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 550 and Extra Deputy Conservators on Rs. 575 rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 to Rs. 650. After an extra Assistant Conservator has attained to Rs. 550 a month, promotion to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator will depend upon the occurrence of permanent vacancies in that class, always provided that no Extra Assistant Conservator will be eligible for promotion as Extra Deputy Conservator unless he is considered by the Local Government to be fit for a major

66500. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) He considered that at present a provincial officer in charge of a major district could never be as efficiently equipped for the duties of that charge as were officers of the Imperial Service, owing to lack of experience of forestry in its highest form. That defect could, he thought, be remedied by recruiting a certain number of officers, direct, and sending them to Europe to be trained for the Imperial Service.

66501. He did not think that the Forest Service was one in which a man's ability could be sufficiently tested by mere examinations before entrance. According to his idea, a competent Board of Selection would include a medical officer, one or two officers with experience of India, a forest officer and a revenue officer.

66502. (Mr. Bryant.) He did not think that the language difficulty would constitute any great objection to the interchange of officers in the administrative grades from one province to another.

66503. The Imperial Forest Service was at present open to Indians in the same way as it was to Europeans.

66504. The Imperial cadre was too small, and consequently the leave reserve also was too small. If there was a larger Imperial cadre, the present percentage might suffice.

66505. He did not consider that the Indian officers of the Department had made sufficient progress to entitle them to claim equality of treatment with Imperial Service officers. There might be exceptional cases.

66506. (Mr. Subrahmanya Ayyar.) He agreed that English was a foreign language to Indians, but he did not admit that it was just as difficult for a native to learn it as German or French, because Indians were taught English from their childhood. It was, of course, not impossible for an Indian to learn German or French.

66507. There was no educated class of Indians to whom a Forest life was congenial. That was not due to the fact that prior to 1911 prospects in the Department were not so good as they were in other Services. Improvement in pay and prospects would not make the work any more congenial. The best students did not enter other Services solely because of the better prospects which those Services held out, but because they offered more congenial conditions. If it were possible to establish Dehra Dun as a central institution for the training of Indian recruits, and it were also possible to collect there a teaching staff of the very highest quality and if the pupils from Dehra Dun could be sent for a year to the continent together with the English probationers, that would be a satisfactory system, but it would be very difficult to send an Indian student with no knowledge of European life straight off with a lot of English students on a foreign tour. If those difficulties could be overcome, the training might be effective.

charge. An Extra Assistant Conservator who has served for not less than three years on Rs. 550 a month, and who is considered by the Local Government to be fit to hold a major charge, but for whom no vacancy exists in the Upper Controlling staff, may, however, be given a personal allowance of Rs. 50 a month, and in the case of officers whom the Local Government considers fit for further increase of pay, this allowance may be augmented to Rs. 100 a month on the expiry of a further period of four years and to Rs. 150 a month on the expiry of a second period of four years. The Local Government may, by special order, in each case promote an Extra Deputy Conservator after one year's service on Rs. 650 a month to Rs. 700 a month for a period of three years and again to Rs. 800 a

27 January 1914.]

RAO BAHADUR V. ALWAR CHETTY.

[Continued.]

month for a further period of three years and may then promote him to Rs. 850 a month until the close of his service; but promotion to Rs. 700, Rs. 800 and Rs. 850 a month should only be made when the Local Government is satisfied at each step that the individual is thoroughly deserving of such promotion."

The recruitment to the Imperial Forest Service is made by the Secretary of State in England. The process is essentially of selection with the aid of a board of advisers, combined under certain circumstances, with a competitive examination.

The Provincial or Madras Forest Service is recruited either by direct appointment of outsiders or by the promotion of officers in the Department. The minimum general educational qualification of the nominees to the former, is fixed at a standard not lower than that of the matriculation examination.

At the outset we must state that this division of the service into Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service is impolitic. Officers who discharge the same duties under similar conditions with identical responsibilities should in the public interest be treated alike. To treat one section of this service as inferior all along the line must inevitably tend to demoralisation. The present system deliberately excludes a whole class of officers from rising to the highest posts in the Department and it is not too much to say that such a method is sure to depress and deteriorate the submerged lot, and it is most undesirable that this state of affairs should be prolonged a moment longer and be allowed to create a natural feeling of intense discontent among the officers. In the course of transfers of officers from one place to another a charge held to-day by an Imperial Forest Service Officer comes under the control of a Provincial or Madras Forest Service Officer. The inferior status of the latter is not lost sight of by not only the members of the other services in the locality but also by the men in the subordinate Forest Service. In actual practical working this difference in status is a handicap for the Provincial or Madras Forest Service Office. But we prefer to rest our position on the higher ground of common fairness and justice that men who discharge the same duties should, as far as possible, be put on the same level.

Our submission is that the division of the Service into Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service should be done away with, and with it the nomenclature "upper controlling staff" and "lower controlling staff," and the prefix "extra" attached to Provincial or Madras Forest Service men should also go. That the dual cadre should be abolished and members of the Imperial Forest Service and the Provincial or Madras Forest Service should be borne on a combined list, as has recently been decided in the Public Works Department.

The distinction between Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service being done away with, there will be one cadre comprising all the officers that now fall under the two heads Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service.

66509. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—To maintain the present proportion of officers recruited in England and also not to weaken the British tone and character imparted by them to the Service, we propose that not more than a third of the number of men required for any year may continue to be recruited in England as heretofore, Indians also being eligible to be selected and admitted. Of the remaining two-thirds not more than a half will be recruited by promotion of officers serving in the Department, and the remainder being not less than a third of the whole number required should be recruited by direct appointment of candidates outside the Department. At present the general educational qualification of the last class of men is the Matriculation examination. The Matriculation examination offers hardly the necessary general educational equipment for an officer who even under the present conditions, will hold a district charge. With

the advance of education in the country in general and of the distinct rise in the educational qualifications of officers in the other Government Departments, it is needless to labour the point that the Matriculation standard is undoubtedly low. The standard of general education must not be lower than that required of candidates recruited in England. A graduate's Diploma in some branch of Natural Science of an Indian University, or probably in some exceptional cases and with regard to certain communities such as Muhammadans and domiciled Europeans, the F.A. or Intermediate standard should be the minimum required of a candidate.

Physical fitness must necessarily form an important element in the selection of men to serve in this Department. After the candidate has satisfied the two requirements of physical fitness and general education, and if the number seeking admission in any one year is more than the number of vacancies to be filled, selection may be made by a special committee appointed by the Local Government. The candidate thus selected should not be more than 23 years old, and will be sent to the Dehra Dun College as at present.

66510. (II) Systems of Training and Probation.—The present system provides adequate training for men recruited by direct appointment in India, but it is desirable to modify it to make it quite on a line with the training received by the men recruited in England. Instruction in riding may be added. The present period of three years' probation after the College course is too long. It works a great hardship. During these three years the full pay is not allowed. For testing the actual fitness of a man for the Service and for discovering the latent qualities of a young man, it is submitted three years is a very long time. A year's probation after the completion of the college course is quite sufficient. The probationary period may be extended in particular cases for special reasons. It must be noted that the Imperial Forest Service men have no probation after they have finished the special training in England. A young man in India of the requisite physique would be 20 or 21 years when he takes a graduate's diploma in a University, and by the time he finishes the Dehra Dun College course he would be 23 or 24 years, and a year's probation would take him to his 24th or 25th year. While we welcome any change in the training in the Dehra Dun College tending to make it more efficient, we consider that the three years' probation is needlessly long.

66511. (III) Conditions of Service.—At present the post of Conservator is barred against the Provincial or Madras Forest Service men. An Extra Assistant Conservator has to serve (exclusive of three years of probation) sixteen years before he can attain the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator, and even then, only if there is a permanent vacancy in that class, whereas, an Assistant Conservator after five years can become a Deputy Conservator. There is a rule that after four years' service an Extra Deputy Conservator's work has to be reported upon specially for further promotion at each step, whereas, a Deputy Conservator rises to the maximum without any impediment. The rates of travelling allowance allowed to the Provincial or Madras Forest Service men are lower than those allowed to the Imperial Forest Service men. These rules cannot be held to be reasonable ones. There are other distinctions which may be termed invidious. Under the method of recruitment proposed above, it would be seen that the men recruited by direct appointment in India, are bound to be of high mental calibre and education and may fairly be presumed to do justice to their positions. It is always within the discretion of Government to keep back a man for bad or unsatisfactory work. The men recruited by promotion from the department generally not being young men, in their case the present conditions work a greater hardship. The cadre should be one for the two sets of men—those recruited in England and those recruited in India, and opportunities should be the same. The department affords a peculiar field for bringing

27 January 1914.]

RAO BAHADUR V. ALWAR CHETTY.

[Continued.]

into play an intimate knowledge of the wants and habits and the needs and requirements of the people, who are not of towns, but of the villages and outlying parts of the country far from the influences of English education. In dealing with such people and trying to meet their needs and requirements, it may safely be said that men born and bred in the country possess an advantage over those of other lands and climes. No less an authority on Indian Forest matters than the late Sir Dietrich Brandis, says in his book on "Indian Forestry," published so far back as 1897, "the larger the number of the natives employed in responsible positions the more forestry will cease to have the character of an exotic plant, or a foreign artificially fostered institution." He further observes in the same book, "the aim should be, gradually, in a few carefully selected districts, say, in Berar, or the Central Provinces to fill all appointments with pure natives of India, and when this has proved a success, to proceed further. It will be a great point gained, when the first native is appointed to the post of the Conservator of Forests in Berar or in one of the forest circles of the Central Provinces." Although it was 16 years ago that one of the most eminent of European Foresters that India ever had as the head of her forests gave expression to the above views, yet not a single Indian has ever been given a chance of being at the head of a forest circle. That Indians have not proved unequal to the duties of such responsible posts may, we venture to hope, be inferred from instances afforded by the neighbouring native States of Mysore, Cochin and Travancore. The Department, therefore, is one in which indigenous talent should be pressed more largely into the service of controlling positions. Our plea for the larger employment in controlling positions of men of Indian birth or domicile is not thus without the support of good administrative reasons. The outlook of the men in the Service must be widened not only to get the best out of the existing men but also to attract to it as good a material as is drawn to the other departments of Government service. The men, after receiving considerable general education, undergo a course of severe training in the Forest College at Dehra Dun. Work in the Department is strenuous. The men's lot is cast in unhealthy localities and just now a number of us are down with malarial and other fevers, the prevailing disease, we may say, amongst us. A considerable amount of tact is required of us in dealing with matters of forest administration, the points arising, as is well known, giving room for soreness and irritation among the people. These are some of the special features of service in the Department. The cadre should therefore be one, promotion being earned by good and approved work. All alike should have equal chances and equal opportunities to rise in the Service.

66512. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The scale of salaries laid down in Sections 20 and 21 of the Madras Forest Code has been quoted above. The conditions are stringent and the chances of a man rising to a higher salary than Rs. 550 are impeded by restrictions unfamiliar in other branches of the Government service. As compared with the men recruited in England, the conditions are palpably harsh. It takes 27 years (exclusive of probation) for an officer recruited in India to become eligible to draw the maximum pay of an Extra Deputy Conservator. And although a salary of Rs. 850 is held out as the ultimate goal of the Provincial or Madras Forest Service men, the road being barred at several stages, it is well nigh hopeless for many a man in the Service to reach it.

We think it should be open to a man recruited in India to reach the maximum pay at the 20th year of service. The whole cadre should carry a uniform pay in each grade, for the reason stated in paragraph 66503 supra—"that officers who discharge the same duties under similar conditions with identical responsibilities should in the public interest be treated alike." If any difference is made in the rate of pay between the men recruited in England and those recruited in India, it will

perpetuate the present attitude of superiority of the former towards the latter. If, however, it is considered that men recruited in England should be paid more than those recruited in India, the excess should be in the form of personal allowance. Our submission is that the pay of the whole cadre should be fixed at Rs. 300 rising to Rs. 1,000 in the 20th year of service, the men recruited in England being granted a personal allowance of 25 per cent. so that the latter may continue to draw their present salary of Rs. 300 plus 75 (the existing starting salary is Rs. 380) rising to Rs. 1,000 plus 250. An officer recruited in India when appointed Conservator should, however, get the present full sanctioned pay of the appointment.

66513. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The present rules regarding leave of the Provincial or Madras Forest Service officers do not meet the special difficulties under which they labour. It is beyond dispute that Forest Officers have to work in very unhealthy tracts of the country and the unhealthiness of the work is therefore greater than in other Departments. If an officer takes leave he comes back after the expiration of the leave in improved health and his outturn of work must be better. Not only in the interests of the officers but also in the interests of the Department, the leave rules should be so framed as to let an officer go on leave when he feels run down in health. We therefore propose that after eight years' service an officer should be eligible to take one year's furlough. Subsequently every five years he would be eligible for a year's furlough, the intervals between two furloughs being reduced to four years. The allowances to an officer on furlough should be half the salary he was drawing just before the commencement of the leave. Many a man in the higher grades hesitates to take leave because the leave allowances are comparatively small and puts off taking leave in order to earn a higher average. This, while injurious to the health of the officer himself, is not advantageous to the Department. There need be no apprehension that more favourable leave rules would bring in a crowd of applicants for leave. The exigencies of the Department and the judgment of the controlling authority will always check applications on unsubstantial grounds.

66514. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—At present a Provincial or Madras Forest Officer can retire, voluntarily, after 30 years' service, and after 25 years if invalided, on full pension. The 30 years' rule is unsuitable to this Department. A man would be past 50 after 30 years' service. The work of an officer of the Department is not at his desk nor does it lie on even ground which he could traverse in a car. His work is literally uphill and a man past 50, however strongly he may be impelled by a sense of duty, cannot really do justice to his work. Here again it is in the interests of the State to let a man voluntarily retire when he thinks that he is not equal to the arduous duties of the Department. But it is too much to expect of a man to invalidate himself and leave the Service at considerable loss because he believes in his conscience that he cannot discharge his duties as efficiently as he did five or six years earlier. There need be no apprehension that the more favourable pension rules would induce any large numbers of men to retire on half pay. From the knowledge and experience of Government in the various departments retirements generally are not quite voluntary. Applications for extensions of service are numerous enough. We therefore propose that after 25 years' service including three years of leave with allowances, an officer should be permitted to retire on full pension, i.e., half his salary and that after 20 years' service he should be permitted to retire if he is invalided. A distinction must be drawn in the pension rules between officers whose work is more at the desk and those whose duties require in addition to vigour of mind capacity to stand a considerable amount of physical endurance and hardship such as Forest Officers are called upon in their usual work to bear.

66515. (VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans, and division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.—Under the heads Pre-

27 January 1914.]

RAO BAHADUR V. ALWAR CHETTY.

[Continued.]

liminary and Conditions of service and salary the limitations in the employment of non-European officers and their disabilities have been set forth and commented upon. It has also been submitted that the terms Imperial and Provincial should be abolished.

66516. (VIII) Relations with Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The District Forest Officer is in many matters subordinate to the Collector. So far as administrative matters go the dependence of the Forest Department on the executive head of the District has worked for good. Apart from the purely technical side of the Forest Officers' work the co-operation and advice and guidance of the executive head of the District makes for smooth working. The one influences the other, and the result is so far satisfactory. If this dependence were removed and the Forest Department thoroughly dissociated from the Revenue the com-

plaints and civil against the Forest Department would increase in volume and vigour. In purely technical matters we do not think officers of the Indian Civil Service have interfered. The Police and Magistracy being under the control of the Collector and District Magistrate their co-operation is also secured to the Department by the present conditions.

In this Province the Conservators are subordinate to the Board of Revenue, one member of which holds the portfolio of forests. The members of the Board of Revenue are Indian Civil Service Officers who had distinguished themselves in District administration as Collectors. The head of the forest administration in this Province therefore possesses in addition to a wide knowledge of the wants and conditions of the people a high degree of administrative ability. This arrangement should in our opinion be continued.

RAO BAHADUR V. ALWAR CHETTY called and examined.

66517. (Chairman.) The witness at present held the position of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests. He was in charge of one of the eight major charges. Any major charge could be given to a provincial officer. His own predecessor was an Imperial officer. Senior Imperial officers were also in charge of minor charges. He had been in the Service 27 years.

66518. He recommended the abolition of the division into Imperial and Provincial branches. He would recruit for the combined superior posts, one-third in England, and the remaining two-thirds in India.

66519. In his opinion the eleven minor charges were posts of as great responsibility as the eight major district charges. The only difference between the major and minor charges was a difference of size.

66520. Of the two-thirds recruited in India, one-third should be drawn from the ranger class, and one-third recruited direct. The qualification he suggested for admission to the superior Service in India would be a degree in Natural Science, and he would also put candidates through an examination after nomination if the number of candidates coming forward was more than the number of vacancies.

66521. He was not in a position to say whether the proposal he made for a very considerable increase in recruitment in India, and therefore a corresponding diminution of the European element, would have any effect on recruitment in England. The general educational standard of the ranger was not sufficiently high to warrant his being given one-third of the posts in the senior Service, but his experience would make up for any lack of educational attainments. A ranger should not be put in command of a major charge; he should only be given a minor charge.

66522. Provincial officers did not receive the leave to which they were entitled. For instance, he himself had served for 27 years, and had been refused furlough. He attributed that to the scarcity of officers. He did not consider that the provincial cadre was inadequate, but there were many vacancies which were not filled up. Out of the eight sanctioned appointments, only six were filled up and of the six officers only four were on active duty.

66523. Very few provincial officers lived long enough to enjoy their pension. Twenty-five years was quite a long enough term to have to serve in order to qualify for pension.

66524. (Mr. Sly.) He was recruited to the Forest Department by selection. He was appointed as Probationary Sub-Assistant Conservator on a salary of Rs. 75. He had never served as a ranger.

66525. (Mr. Fisher.) He approved of the dependence of the Forest Department on the executive head of the Department. His reasons for this view were set out in the written statement. The strict enforcement of the forest laws was unpopular with the people, and the function of the Collector was to look after the interests of the peasantry. Orders which received the sanction of the Collector received better attention from the people than orders which did not.

66526. (Mr. Madge.) Possibly one reason why Imperial officers had been put into minor charges was because they were rather old, and at an advanced age a man could not do such hill-climbing as a younger man. Provincial officers had been entrusted with major charges and had done well. He contended therefore that whatever the theoretical advantage might be of an English training, Indian forest training sufficed for the charge of Indian forests.

66527. (Mr. Bryant.) He considered that Indian district forest officers generally carried out their duties as efficiently as Imperial forest officers. He did not agree there was a tendency on the part of an Indian to fill every subordinate post within his gift with his own relations, or at any rate, with those of his own caste. In his view provincial officers had up to the present shown the same initiative and organising powers as the Imperial officer and this justified their claiming equality with Imperial officers.

66528. He admitted that the Provincial Service as at present constituted was a well paid one for Indians, but it was not as well paid as it ought to be, considering the nature of the Service.

66529. (Mr. Subrahmanyam Ayyar.) He had entered the Department because he had a liking for forest life. At the time he joined he had received from a Collector the offer of an appointment carrying higher pay, so it was not merely a question of salary which decided him in joining the Forest Department.

66530. Until 1899 Indians were not allowed to compete in England for the Forest Service. Since that date he could quote ten instances of Indians who had gone to England and had received a forestry training there.

66531. A knowledge of the very best managed model forests on the continent was helpful for the successful management of Indian forests.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Bombay, Wednesday, 11th February, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHYROL,
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

G. E. MARJORIBANKS, Esq., Deputy Conservator
of Forests, Bombay.

V. D. P. REBEIRZ, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator
of Forests, Bombay.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

G. P. MILLETT, Esq., Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

(I) IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

66532. (1) Methods of Recruitment.—I do not consider that the present method of recruitment is the best. It is an arrangement which was rendered necessary by the failure of candidates to present themselves at the competitive examinations after the system of training at Cooper's Hill had been abolished, and that of training at Oxford University had been introduced. The expenses of the latter method of training prevented the parents from attempting to put their sons into the Forest Service.

Under the present method of recruitment, candidates are selected by the Secretary of State for India acting with the advice of a Selection Committee, after applications for appointments have been made by them. In order to be eligible the candidates must be not less than 19 but under 23 years of age, and they must have obtained a degree with Honours in some branch of Natural Science in a University of England, Wales, or Ireland, or have passed the Final Bachelor of Science examination in pure science in one of the Universities of Scotland, and they must have a fair knowledge of either French or German.

The above is according to the latest regulations which have been published, and the choice of candidates is limited practically to men who have already undergone a University training. The selected candidates have them to undergo a period of probation of two years at one of the Universities, Oxford, Cambridge, and Edinburgh; and for this they are to receive payments at the rate of £120 a year, or £240 in all.

Under the above regulations the average age of the successful candidates can hardly be less than 22 years, and by the time they have finished their training and are ready to proceed to India, the average age will be between 24 and 25 years. It is not advisable that officers should commence their work in India at an age of nearly 25, and I give the following three main reasons for holding this opinion:—

(1) At 25 men are less able to adapt themselves readily to the peculiar conditions of work in the Indian Forests—the solitary life and absence of comfortable surroundings to which they have become accustomed by long residence at a University are apt to be irksome.

(2) An officer who commences his service at the age of 25 has only 30 years to put in before reaching the age of 55, at which he is bound to retire. Under the present regulations he has small chance of earning his highest pension, since to attain this 25 years' effective service in India is required. This only permits him two years' furlough for the whole of his service, which is manifestly too little.

(3) At 25 men are already thinking of settling in life; some come to India already engaged to be married, and numbers of them marry before they have been five years in the country. Early

marriage detracts from the efficiency of Forest Officers since they are unable to tour so freely when single; also they are unable to save money from their pay, and ill health in their families or themselves frequently leads to debt.

In my opinion previous University training and the holding of Science degrees are not of advantage for Indian Forest Officers; what we want are good practical men, of good social standing, fond of sports and of an out-door life. Only a few specialists in Science are required, and these will always be forthcoming in the future as in the past if encouragement for further study is afforded to these men who possess a liking or a genius for the subject. I advocate therefore a reversion to a lower age for recruitment, and for selection by means of competitive examination combined with nomination as was formerly the case. This system has provided an excellent type of officer in the past, and though it failed after Cooper's Hill College had been abolished, for reasons that I have stated, it will now, I am confident, be successful if the period of training at a University after selection is placed at about two years and the present system of payments amounting to £240 in all is maintained, or preferable increased to £300. The limits of age should be not less than 18 nor more than 20, and the subsequent training may be as at present arranged at a University. If the limits of age be fixed as above we shall obtain young men who have just completed their education at a public school, or some of whom have had further tuition at a University or other institution, but who are still young enough to be shaped for an Indian career. Also—which is a powerful consideration—parents will be more ready than at present to bring their sons forward for entrance into the Forest Service if they can do so at an age which will still permit of the boys turning their attention to other professions in the event of failure at the Forest examination. At present many parents whose boys desire to enter the Forest Service are unwilling to take the risk of sending them to a University on the chance that they will obtain an honours degree and be selected subsequently for the service.

In selecting by the competitive examination marks should also be given to candidates who have been in the Officers Training Corps, according to their length of service in it. This training is not only of value to the boy, but the willingness to undergo it affords proof of the boy's liking for out-door work.

66533. (II) System of Training and Probation.—It is a great pity that the Cooper's Hill College was abolished. The training for a Forest career in India that was afforded at that institution was in my opinion superior to that which can be obtained now at a University. The work was centralised and the probationers were collected in one institution; they worked together and developed *esprit de corps*; they had not the temptations to neglect work that exist at a University; and they had not the opportunity which they have at a University to contract habits of ease and

11 February 1914.]

Mr. G. P. MILLETT.

[Continued.]

comfort and to develop into young men of the world. They had already been selected for the Indian Forest Service and knew what was in store for them.

At present candidates for appointments to the Forest Service are apt to apply for them as an afterthought. This of course will not be the case, even if the present system of training at an University is continued, if the candidates are selected at the earlier ages of between 18 and 20 which I have suggested. They will then be at the commencement of a University career and not at the end of it as at present. In the absence of a special college the present system of training probationers at an University must be continued, but I am against the system of having several centres of instruction. For the development of a proper spirit and an intelligent interest in the work they are to do in India, which has been an invaluable agency for good practical work and administration in the past, the selected candidates should know each other and work together during their period of probation. Let Government select one University—Oxford, Cambridge, or Edinburgh—for the training of their Forest probationers. The number of the latter selected annually will rarely exceed 12, and it is bad policy to have the probationers scattered at different Universities, even if the course of study at each is arranged on similar lines.

Owing to the absence in Great Britain of large forests to which the principles of forestry have been applied for a series of years it is essential that the probationers should undergo as at present a course of practical training in the forests of Germany and France. The period of instruction must be of sufficient length to permit of this being carried out. The training at the University should extend over two years, and it should be followed by a practical training of at least six months in Germany or France. The total length of the period of training will thus be about two and a half years. The selection of the candidates should be made in January and not in July or August as at present. The probationers could thus complete their course of training and be ready to proceed to India, after a short stay at their homes, at the beginning of November in the third year following their selection.

66534. (III) Conditions of Service.—Service in the Forest Department is more arduous than in other branches of the administration. Long periods have to be spent in remote parts, for the forests are generally situated in the regions of hills and valleys at a distance from the more civilised portion of the district. Forest Officers are more exposed to malaria and the influences of bad climate, bad water, and often poor food. The mortality amongst forest officers in India has been very great, though Bombay has been less unfortunate in this respect than most of the other Provinces. Married men also have much sickness in their families, and have to leave the latter at headquarters, when visiting unhealthy regions where their work lies—or to send them to England—all of which add to the expense and discomfort of his life. In spite of these drawbacks the Service is liked by the men in it, but they work under the sense that they do not receive adequate compensation in the matter of pay, leave, and pension. Each of these conditions will be dealt with under its head later. But some ways in which the amenities of Service might be improved are the following:

When unhealthy districts have, in addition, an unhealthy place as the headquarters where officers stay during the rainy season, June to October, it should be permissible for an officer to move himself and his establishment temporarily to some more healthy station where, whilst performing his routine work, he can also recuperate his health, which has generally suffered during the working season from November to May.

Owing to the long distances over which transfers have occasionally to be made in the Bombay Presidency, a transfer of an officer is often equivalent to a heavy fine. This, of course, applies also to officers of other departments. The allowances for

the transport of house and camp furniture, family and servants, and horses, etc., should be on a more liberal scale than at present.

In some Headquarter stations the bungalows which have been constructed for Forest Officers have entailed very heavy expenditure, the interest on which implies the fixation of a high rent, and the officer occupying the bungalow may be called upon to pay the maximum which can be taken from him as rent, namely, 10 per cent. of his pay. This is a fair arrangement during the recess season when he is in residence, but is not fair in the touring season, when the officer is away from his Headquarters and incurring other expenses whilst having still to pay the rent of the bungalow. It would be a fair arrangement if only half the ordinary rent due from him should be paid during the touring season, or during the time he may be absent on privilege leave and the bungalow not occupied by another officer.

At present there is no appointment of Chief Conservator in Bomby though it is hoped that the Government of Bombay may shortly apply for and obtain the constitution of that appointment. Bombay Forest Officers feel that under their present conditions of service their chances of obtaining a high paid appointment are not equal to those of their brother officers who serve directly under the Government of India, since not only can they not obtain a Chief Conservatorship, but their appointment to the highest post of Inspector-General of Forests is in fact barred, though not in theory.

Also they consider it hard that the Sind Circle should be constituted a Deputy Conservator's charge instead of a Conservator's charge as was formerly the case. Although not so important as the other Forest Circles, the Sind Circle is still one that requires capable officers. At present it is made the harbour of refuge of an officer who is not deemed worthy of promotion to a Conservatorship. This is bad for the officer and bad for the Service, and there is every reason for restoring a Conservator to Sind and so giving the Bombay Officers a fourth Conservatorship.

66535. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—These have been much improved since the pay of Conservators was raised in 1906 and Time scale pay for Deputy and Assistant Conservators was introduced in 1907. The fixing of the pay of Conservators at Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,700 and Rs. 1,900 instead of at Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000 which are the rates granted to Superintending Engineers in the Public Works Department who correspond in rank with Conservators of Forest has always been a source of dissatisfaction to Forest Officers. Also Rs. 1,500, the pay of the third grade Conservator, is considered as too little for an officer holding such a responsible position, in view of the expenses which he has to incur and the increase in the cost of servants' wages and of living in India generally.

The pay of the third grade Conservator should be raised to Rs. 1,750, and the other two grades should carry pay of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,250 per mensem respectively. The pay of the Chief Conservator should be Rs. 2,500 with annual increments of Rs. 100 up to a maximum of Rs. 3,000.

The incremental pay of Deputy and Assistant Conservators has been fixed at Rs. 330 per mensem on first appointment as Assistant Conservator, with increments of Rs. 40 per mensem for the first eight years when a pay of Rs. 700 is reached, and thereafter Rs. 50 until a maximum of Rs. 1,250 per mensem is attained in the 20th year of service. A Deputy Conservator drawing Rs. 1,250 per mensem can get no further addition to his pay unless and until he is promoted to a Conservatorship. Whilst appreciating the benefits of the Time Scale pay, Junior officers of the Forest Department find that in the first eight years of their service they are generally losers in the amount of pay they draw, compared with the time when, commencing on Rs. 350 as second grade Assistant Conservator, they ordinarily received promotion to first grade Assistant Conservator on Rs. 450 after being about a year in that grade, and thereafter were eligible for acting allowances when officers above them

11 February 1914.]

Mr. G. P. MILLET.

[Continued.]

were absent on leave. The Junior Officers contend that their initial pay should in fairness be Rs. 400 and that their incremental pay should be Rs. 50 per mensem annually thereafter; their maximum pay would then be attained in the 18th year of service, which is the time when promotion to the rank of Conservator should ordinarily be nearing attainment. The promotion to Conservator's rank depends however upon the occurrence of vacancies, and officers who are fully qualified to perform the duties of a Conservator often find their promotion blocked, and that they have to remain for several years longer on the maximum pay—Rs. 1,250—of a Deputy Conservator. After 18 years' service it is possible to judge whether a Deputy Conservator is fit for promotion to a Conservatorship or not. If not fit, then his pay need not be further increased; but if he is deemed worthy of promotion to Conservator on the occurrence of a vacancy then his pay should continue to rise by increments of Rs. 50 to a maximum of Rs. 1,500 in the 23rd year of service unless promoted to a Conservatorship before that date.

66536. (V) **Conditions of Leave.**—The Government of India about a year ago circulated proposals for revising the present leave rules in the Civil Service Regulations. If the new rules suggested are brought into effect, the conditions of leave will be much more favourable than at present and will leave little to be desired. The disabilities which are felt at present in the matter of leave are that though an officer may earn one year's furlough for each four years of service, he may not take any furlough except on medical certificate until he has been eight years in India after first arrival. Also an officer may not take a fresh period of furlough until he has put in three years' service since his last furlough; and if he takes more than six weeks' privilege leave combined with other leave he may not take such combined leave or furlough again until he has put in 18 months' service after his return from the former leave. If the new rules are sanctioned an officer will be permitted to take leave, when such is due to him, at any time when his services can be spared; and this is what officers now desire.

The minimum leave allowance for an officer on furlough is not now sufficient. It was fixed at a time when the expenses of living were much lower at £200 a year. We consider that this should now be raised to £400 a year as this amount is not more than sufficient to permit of an officer living in England when on leave, in such decent amount of comfort as will enable him to recover his health and fit himself for further service in India.

66537. (VI) **Conditions of Pension.**—There is a great deal of dissatisfaction with the present rates of pension. Whilst the pay of officers has been increased, the pensions which can be earned have remained practically at the same amount as they were when the Forest Service was first constituted 50 years ago. Many memorials have been made by Forest Officers, but little redress has been obtained. Originally the highest pension attainable was Rs. 5,000 equivalent to £500. When the exchange value of the rupee declined to about half its former value, the Secretary of State recognised that some redress was called for, and he then fixed the rate of exchange at 1s. 9d. in the case of Indian pensions drawn in England. The value of the Rs. 5,000 pension thus became £437 10s., which was still considerably short of its former equivalent of £500. Later, an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year was granted to Forest Officers who had served as Conservators for not less than three years and who had 28 years of effective service to their credit. This raised the highest attainable pension to £525. A Forest Officer is also allowed to retire voluntarily after 20 years' service of which 18 must be effective on a reduced pension of Rs. 4,000 a year or £350.

With the great rise that has taken place in the cost of living in England and the consequent reduced purchasing power of the sovereign the above pensions have become quite inadequate to afford Forest Officers on retirement the comfortable subsistence in England which was intended when the

amounts were fixed. The ordinary Forest Officer can save little from his pay during his career in India. The Provident Fund which has been established now for 17 years provides for some compulsory saving and the amount thus put by during his service, when taken out on retirement and invested will give him some enhancement of his yearly income. But the Provident Fund serves the purpose more of furnishing some provision for the officer's widow in the event of his predeceasing his wife, than of reinforcing the amount of his pension. The purchasing power of the sovereign having decreased by about 25 per cent, it is fair to conclude that pensions of officers should be increased by a corresponding amount, and Forest Officers consider that they have an equitable claim now to pensions on the following scale:—

	£
After 20 years' service	500 a year
After 25 years' service (provided the officer has attained the rank of Conservator)	600 "
After 28 "	700 "
After 30 "	750 "

It is further considered that in the case of officers who have to retire between the above periods on account of ill health the pension granted should be increased proportionately to the length of their service. This would imply an increase of £25 a year for each year of service, so that an officer retiring on account of ill health after 21 years would receive £525 a year and so on.

Finally we consider that the amount of the invalid pensions which are granted to Forest Officers who are compelled to retire before they have rendered 18 years of effective service, are insufficient. The cases of Forest Officers who have been forced to retire on account of ill health before they have completed the 20 years' service which qualifies them for their first pension have not been numerous in the past, and it need not be expected that they will be numerous in future. There is all the more reason therefore that the allowances in the way of pension should be liberal. A Forest Officer compelled to retire prematurely on account of ill health has very little chance of obtaining employment in England. The present maximum scale of pensions which can be given to an officer drawing his pension in England is as follows:—

Years of completed service.	£	s.
10	87	10
11	122	10
12	158	0
13	193	0
14	228	0
15 to 19	262	10

We submit that an officer who has lost his health under the conditions of his service in India should not be reduced to poverty in England when compelled to retire prematurely. His pension should be on a scale that, with the aid of his savings or any other money he may possess he may be able to subsist with some degree of comfort; and we consider that this cannot be managed unless a minimum pension of £250 be granted to him after 10 years' service, with an increase of £25 for each further year of service up to 20 years, at which period he becomes eligible for his first pension on voluntary retirement. It is not to the advantage of Government that an officer should struggle on in active service when on account of his health having broken down, he is incapable of performing his duties in an efficient manner. But an officer in ill health is at present compelled to do this since the pension he can obtain if he is allowed to retire on medical certificate is totally inadequate for his needs.

66538. (VII) **Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The only limitations which exist to the employment of non-Europeans in the Imperial Forest Service consist in the fact that they must make themselves eligible for appointment by taking

11 February 1914.]

MR. G. P. MILLITT.

[Continued.]

an Honours degree at a University in Great Britain. When we consider the number of Indians who proceed annually to England for purposes of study and who distinguish themselves there at the Universities, we can only conclude from the very small number of them who seek to enter the Forest Service that that Service does not attract them. Non-Europeans have an equal chance with Europeans of selection by the Secretary of State for India and his Selection Board, but they do not appear to present themselves for selection, since only one Indian has joined the Imperial Forest Service under the present regulations, whilst a large number have joined the Indian Civil Service and the Indian Medical Service by means of competitive examinations. Indians of means and social position who proceed to England to study do so with the aim of either joining one of the above Services, or of qualifying themselves for a profession. The nature of the work of the Forest Officer in India, or the prospects of the Forest Service, do not seem to attract them, and it is doubtful if Indians of the above class would be attracted to the Service even if entry to it were made possible in India. In any case it is in my opinion not an experiment which should be tried. Technical training in Europe is essential for the production of an efficient Forest Officer, and a lowering in the present standard of recruiting would result in a serious set-back to Forestry in India accompanied by a permanent loss of revenue. On the other hand the class of men, both of European and Non-European extraction who seek to enter the Forest Department in India find ample scope for their aspirations in the Provincial Forest Service which now offers to them an excellent career.

The scales of salary, leave and pensions fixed for the Imperial Forest Officers are rendered necessary in order to attract to India Europeans of good education and social standing, capable of making good administrators. There would be no justification to pay such salaries, etc., to men who were serving in their native country, under conditions to which they were accustomed, and who had no need to lay by money out of their pay to meet the expenses of their own occasional furlough to England, or of sending their families there, or of educating their children in England. If the present division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial were abolished and the two services merged into one the scale of salaries would in fairness to the people of India who are taxed to pay them, require to be fixed on the basis of living in India. In that case the Europeans appointed as at present by the Secretary of State would require to be given personal allowances and privileges of leave and rates of pension which would place them on the same footing in regard to emoluments, leave and pension, as they are at present or as advocated. If the Indians considered that invidious distinctions were caused by higher rates of emoluments being shown in the Civil Lists for Europeans as compared with Indians, such personal allowances would be omitted and record kept of them only in such manner as Government would arrange—the monthly pay to be drawn by each officer being regulated by pay slips from the Audit Department as at present. But I consider that the present system of dividing the Service into two Branches, viz., an Imperial and a Provincial Service, is satisfactory, and I deprecate any change being made in it. The Provincial Service is recruited mainly from Non-Europeans. The type of recruit which is being obtained for that service is improving, and the rules now in force for the selection and training of the recruits for the Provincial Forest Service will provide for the admission of better officers than has been the case hitherto. The Forest Service is a small Service compared with most of the other Indian Services, but it comes largely into contact with the agricultural population and has to deal with a great amount of valuable property. It makes, therefore, great demands upon its officers for strict probity in their dealings. Careful selection and training of the men required for the Service is essential. Indians are generally found wanting in the capacity to initiate new undertakings for the development of the forests, in the

willing acceptance of responsibility and the power of performing their duties in the face of opposition and pressure brought to bear against them. But they have proved capable of doing good work under the guidance of European Officers. The Protective Establishments—Rangers, Foresters and Guards, who number many thousands, prefer to have European Officers at the head of affairs in their districts, and it is only thus that the full value of their services is obtained. Officers in the Provincial Service will doubtless develop greater capability and reliability for the due performance of Forestry work in the future, and the present conditions of the Service offer scope for such improvement; and it would be inadvisable to attempt to accelerate it by special measures taken with a view to extending the employment of Non-Europeans in the highest offices of control. The course of training which is given to Probationers for the Provincial Forest Service at Dehra Dun is excellent for the purpose for which it has been instituted, but it could never be made to take the place of a European training.

66539. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The only other Service besides the Indian Civil Service with which the Forest Department ordinarily has dealings is the Public Works Department, and the relations of the Forest Service with all other Services are good. In former times there had been a tendency for friction since the Forest Service was young compared with the others, and it took time for the other Services to understand and appreciate the great value of the Forests to the Country and the need for their maintenance and development. The Forest Settlement, which fixed the lands, out of those which had been provisionally gazetted, which were to be retained as Reserved Forest, and which was made by members of the Indian Civil Service, had been followed by the introduction of Working Plans for the forests drawn up by the Forest Officers. The needs of the agricultural population in regard to forests have been borne in mind in carrying out both the above operations, and former conflicting interests between Forest and Revenue Officers in the matter of the public welfare have been eliminated.

A tendency to antagonism between the Forest Department and the Public Works Department, more especially in Sind, where the construction of canals and the regulation of the water supply from the river Indus for irrigating agricultural lands interfered with the conservation of the forests by cutting off their water supply, has given place to one of agreement and a policy of mutual give and take which leaves nothing to be desired.

66540. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—It is not to the interests of efficient administration that officers who have been passed over as unfit for promotion should be permitted to continue in service until obliged to retire under the age rule at 55 years of age. Government should have the power of retiring such officers compulsorily when they have earned the pension for which they are eligible after 25 years' service, i.e., provided their effective service amounts to 22 years. On the other hand, the voluntary retirement of capable officers after 20 years' service when they are generally at the maximum of their utility to the State is much to the disadvantage of the State. Yet such voluntary retirements must be expected to take place if officers at that stage find their promotion blocked.

The Government of India refused to take any steps on the Memorials submitted by a large number of Forest Officers in 1909 on the subject of the inadequacy of their pensions, because the matter would be considered by the Public Services Commission. The benefit of any enhanced pensions which may be sanctioned as the result of the Public Services Commission should in fairness be given retrospectively to all Forest Officers who have retired between the date on which the above order of the Government of India was passed and the date from which the enhanced pensions were granted.

11 February 1914.]

Mr. G. P. MILLETT.

[Continued.]

The introduction in 1896 of the General Provincial Fund for Forest Officers has enabled them to make some provision for their wives and children in the event of their decease in active service. But this is not sufficient, and at present a Forest Officer who dies during his service gets no benefit at all from any pension which he may have earned. We advocate the establishment of a Widows' and Orphans' Pension Fund on similar lines to those already established for the officers of the Indian Civil Service and Indian Medical Service.

The present system of dividing Forest charges into Major and Minor Divisions, of which a proportion of the former and all the latter are to be held by officers of the Provincial Forest Service, is not satisfactory. Even a seemingly unimportant Forest Division requires at times the services of an able officer; and if Minor Divisions are to be held always by the less capable officers there will be an absence of development of their forest resources. The posting of officers should be entrusted to the head of the Department acting in his capacity of advisor to the Local Government, and there should be no arbitrary limitation to the exercise of his powers in the appointment of officers such as now exists by the classification of Divisions into Major and Minor. The fitness of an Extra Assistant Conservator for promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator may be determined upon other grounds than his fitness to hold charge of a Major Division, which is the rule at present.

(II) PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

66541. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—The present Rules for appointment to the Bombay Provincial Forest Service have been printed as Appendix XII. on page 75 of the Memorandum of the Government of Bombay on the Forest Department in the Bombay Presidency. These provide for the recruitment of the Service—(a) by the promotion of trained Rangers after not less than five years' satisfactory service as such, and (b) by the direct appointment of candidates who have completed the two years' Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun.

We have not yet had any experience of the (b) method of recruitment since it has been started only in the last two years and no appointments have yet been made. A candidate has just been selected and will enter the College for training in July, 1914.

The present method of recruitment is the most satisfactory that can be recommended, though I think efforts should be made to keep the Rangers as a separate branch from which promotions should only be made to the Provincial Service as a reward for exceptionally good Service and merit. It is only in this way that the status of the Provincial Service will be raised and that well educated Indians of good local position will be led to come forward to enter the service. At present there is very little difference in class between the candidates who seek to join the Ranger grade and who seek to enter the Provincial Service direct, and a continuous flow upwards to the Provincial Service of the best men from the Ranger grade after about five years' service as Rangers causes a starving of the Ranger branch. It is impossible to provide any immediate remedy for this state of affairs, as the claims of Rangers already in the Service have to be considered. But as the class of candidate for direct appointment improves more dependence should be placed on this method of recruitment. The prospect of promotion after five years' service now held out to Rangers should be withdrawn, and in its place it might be enacted, e.g., that the fifth of each sequence of five vacancies in the Provincial Service shall be filled by the promotion of a Ranger of approved merit and ability. To compensate Rangers for this lowering of their prospects, the pay of the higher grades should gradually be increased to the extent that there should be a grade promotion of Rs. 25 per month from the present highest pay of Rs. 150 up to Rs. 250 per month.

66542. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The course of training which extends

over two years, now provided at Dehra Dun for Probationers for the Provincial Forest Service is very thorough. I consider it to be satisfactory, and I can offer no suggestions for its improvement. The recruits which the College turns out at the end of the course may be expected to be well grounded in the theory, and to a less degree in the practice of Indian Forestry; and subsequent experience should develop them into good practical Foresters. The training also pays attention to their physique and encourages habits of activity which, it is hoped, will be maintained after the recruits take up the appointment for which they have qualified; since it is only thus that the tendency noticeable in the past and to some degree in the present of the Indian officer to become fatter and heavier as his pay becomes greater can be checked.

A period of probation of one year as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators which may be extended to three years or more at the discretion of Government is enforced in the case of recruits to the Bombay Provincial Forest Service. I consider this to be a very useful provision, as the recruit is made to feel from the beginning that his advancement in the Service will depend upon the amount of interest and ability he displays in his work, and habits of application to duty are inculcated from the first. This probationary period is distasteful to many of the officers since owing to the absence of vacancies in the cadre of the Service, the period of probationship may sometimes be prolonged beyond the time when the probationer may have merited a permanent appointment. This cannot be avoided except by under recruiting, and it is provided for in the Rules which permit of increased pay being granted after three years of probation have been spent. If the promotion of Rangers to the Provincial Service is made of rarer occurrence as I have suggested should be done, this tendency to prolongation of the periods of probation will be lessened, since there will be less chance of over recruiting taking place.

66543. (III) Conditions of Service.—The conditions of Service of the Provincial Officer, being as he is in almost all cases, a native of India, are very different from those of the European officer in the Imperial Service. The Provincial Officer, whether European or non-European, is domiciled in the country. He has not to meet the expenses of voyages to and from Europe, for himself, and if married and a family man—for his wife and family. His children are brought up in India where education is cheap, and on retirement he makes his home in the country amongst friends and in surroundings to which he has been accustomed. There is therefore no need for the payment of salaries to officers of the Provincial Forest Service at the rates which are granted to officers of the Imperial Forest Service. The Provincial Service Officer is in fact in the position of the European who takes service in the Civil Service of his own country, and the pay and prospects of higher pay and future pension of a Provincial Officer in India compare very favourably with those of the European situated in similar circumstances in his own country. The European element is as fully necessary in the Forest Service in India as in any of the other Government Services, and more necessary than in most. If the European element however were eliminated the Imperial Forest Service could go also; the present conditions of service of the Provincial Service would be sufficiently favourable for officers who would then compose the Government Forest Department, allowance being made for appointments of Extra Conservators, which do not exist in the Service as at present constituted.

66544. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators receive Rs. 150 per mensem for the three years of probation and thereafter Rs. 200 per mensem.

Extra Assistant Conservators receive on first appointment Rs. 250 per mensem and thereafter annual increments of Rs. 20 up to a maximum of Rs. 550 attained in the 16th year of service. An officer's increments may be stopped by Government if his work has been unsatisfactory.

11 February 1914.]

Mr. G. P. MILLETT.

[Continued.]

After not less than three years at the maximum pay an Extra Assistant Conservator who is to be considered fit for a major charge but who cannot be promoted to Extra Deputy Conservator in the absence of a vacancy may be given a personal allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem which may be increased to Rs. 100 on the expiry of four years and to Rs. 150 on the expiry of another four years.

The appointments of Extra Deputy Conservators are limited to the number in the cadre and are made by selection. On first appointment as Extra Deputy Conservator the officer gets Rs. 575 per mensem, rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 to Rs. 650. After one year on this pay he may be promoted to Rs. 700 and after three years on this pay he may be promoted to Rs. 800 per mensem. After a further period of three years on Rs. 800 he may be promoted to Rs. 850 per mensem, which is the highest pay provided for an Extra Deputy Conservator.

These conditions of salary are a very great advance upon what were formerly obtainable, and are practically equal to those offered to Imperial Officers of the Assistant and Deputy Conservators' grades between the years 1870 and 1907. They afford the means of a comfortable career and are in my opinion sufficiently liberal.

66545. (V) Conditions of Leave.—Privilege leave, which is the same for officers of the Provincial Forest Service as for officers of the Imperial Forest Service, is taken freely and to its full extent by officers of the Provincial Service; leave on medical certificate is taken when necessary, but ordinary furlough is little required by them. The conditions of leave are therefore in a general sense sufficient, but they may be made somewhat more liberal, except in the matter of privilege leave, to meet exceptional cases without causing any appreciable additional charges to Government. The officers of the Service being generally natives of India do not require to take lengthy periods of leave. Instead of one year's leave being allowed after 10 years' service six months might be allowed after five years' service, and one year after ten years' service if the previous leave had not been taken; and thereafter six

months' further leave might be allowed after every four years' service instead of one year after each eight years. The total amount of leave which may be taken in the service of 25 years when an invalid pension can be earned is two years. Also after 30 years' service when voluntary retirement is possible, only two years' service may be counted. The amount of furlough permissible might be raised to three years in the 30 years of service without fear of causing large additional cost to Government, since that amount of furlough would only be taken rarely by officers of the Provincial Forest Service, but it might be necessary to a few officers from bad health.

66546. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The increase in the salary of Provincial Service Officers has been accompanied by a considerable rise in the pensions which they can earn. All officers may expect to attain the full pay of the Extra Assistant Conservator at least. After three years of service on that pay they would be entitled to pensions of Rs. 3,300 a year. If promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator an officer would be eligible for a pension ranging from Rs. 3,450 to Rs. 5,000, the latter being at present the maximum pension which can be earned by an officer of the Imperial Forest Service unless he is able to qualify for the additional pension of Rs. 1,000 which is granted to Conservators after serving three years in that grade. As the above pensions can be earned at the age of 55 by men serving all the time in their native land they compare quite favourably with the pensions granted to their Civil Servants by European countries which can be earned only at the age of 60 or more.

66547. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial. I have dealt with this in my remarks on the Imperial Forest Service (paragraph 66538).

66548. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The remarks I have made under the heading on the Imperial Service (paragraph 66539) apply with equal force to the Provincial Service.

Mr. G. P. MILLETT called and examined.

66549. (Chairman). The witness occupied the position of senior Conservator of Forests. He was in his 30th year of service, and had spent the whole of his career in the Bombay Presidency.

66550. He would not go so far as to say that the candidates obtained under the present system of recruitment were not up to the standard of the men who came from Coopers Hill, but they were a little too old when they first came to the country, and did not really settle down to forest life. They had to be shaped very carefully. He would like to see men come out younger. He did not consider that science degrees were either necessary or useful for forest officers. Some of the work they had to do in order to get a science degree was really of no use to them in their profession, and was apt to make them too theoretical; at least, that was so in the case of an Honours degree in science.

66551. He would like to see the physical test re-introduced. If it were, he would not regard nomination as important.

66552. The training of recruits for the service would be best carried out at one centre, either Oxford, Cambridge, or Edinburgh. He had not compared the syllabuses of these three institutions, but he believed they were framed as far as possible on uniform lines.

66553. He considered the existing system of the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial was satisfactory, and he would deprecate any alteration.

66554. The course of training given to candidates for the Provincial Forest Service fell short of that required of men to fill posts in the Imperial Ser-

vice. He regarded the Dehra Dun course as distinctly inferior to the training given in England.

66555. He would not be in favour of the proposal that a certain number of Indians should be recruited direct to the Service, subject to the condition of their going through exactly the same course of training as European officers. If Government, however, really desired to get non-Europeans into the Imperial Service, then decidedly such a system would be better than promotion to the Imperial branch on the strength of a training at Dehra Dun, followed by a certain number of years' service in the Provincial Service.

66556. The Dehra Dun course was inferior, both on the theoretical side and on the practical side, and he did not think it was capable of much improvement.

66557. There was no lack of *esprit de corps* as between the Provincial and Imperial branches of the Service in Bombay. In Bombay, Provincial officers were not doing the same work as Imperial officers. It was true they were in charge of certain specified divisions, but it would be quite out of the question to put Provincial officers in charge of other and more important divisions. If an Indian could obtain the very best training, equal to that given to the European, he might become in future fully qualified to hold the more important major charges, provided he developed the necessary qualifications in the course of his service.

66558. He would not say that the Forest officer was worse off in regard to serving in unhealthy districts than officers in certain other services, but a forest officer's work in the rains was largely office duty, and his going away to healthier places would not affect his work. There had been cases of

11 February 1914.]

Mr. G. P. MILLETT.

[Continued.]

officers in the Bombay Forest Service who had fallen ill on account of having to stay in unhealthy districts during the rainy season.

66559. The Forest Service was not worse off in regard to transfer allowances than other services.

66560. He recommended that the present maximum of Rs. 1,250 should be retained for Deputy Conservators, but he would allow any Deputy Conservator who was qualified for promotion to Conservator to advance by annual increments of Rs. 50 up to a special maximum of Rs. 1,500. He did not think that was too long a run if it was to meet the case of a qualified officer whose promotion to a Conservatorship was blocked. Some men obtained promotion to Conservatorship after 18 or 19 years' service, whereas other men equally fit might be kept back until their 22nd or 23rd year of service.

66561. His reason for recommending the appointment of a Chief Conservator in Bombay was that there was no official head to the Department at present. The Bombay Government made their senior Conservator do the work of a Chief Conservator. He found that the work which he had to do of the senior Conservator interfered with the discharge of his duties as Conservator, and moreover he had not the powers of administration which he ought to have. For instance, if it came to his knowledge that an officer who had lately been appointed Conservator was following a course which did not seem quite advisable, the witness could do nothing. There would be a full day's work for a Chief Conservator in the Bombay Presidency.

66562. If a fourth Conservatorship was created for the Sind circle, it would be only restoring to the Service what it had before. The post had been abolished in the time of Lord Reay in 1890. The officer who then held the post was a Staff Corps Colonel. That gentleman was asked to report about the work in Sind, and he said he could manage all the divisions in Sind with Indian officers and two Imperial officers. Government agreed, and when the Colonel retired, they decided that a circle which required only two Imperial officers did not require a Conservator in charge, and that a Deputy Conservator would be sufficient.

66563. The staff of the Sind circle consisted of the Deputy Conservator in charge, two Imperial officers, and five Provincial officers. The central circle consisted of seven divisions, five of which had a Provincial officer in addition to the Imperial officer. The southern circle had seven divisions with Imperial officers, and the northern circle was about the same size. The revenue of the Sind circle was slowly increasing, but it was smaller than that of the other circles.

66564. Three officers had taken advantage of the rule which enabled them to retire after 20 years' service. He himself considered that a forest officer was at the height of efficiency after he had completed 20 years' service.

66565. Officers would welcome the establishment of a widows' and orphans' fund, which would be managed but not supported by Government.

66566. He desired that there should be fewer promotions from the Ranger class. Rangers did not make the best Provincial officers. If it was desired to improve the Provincial Service, it should be filled by direct recruitment as much as possible. The Ranger class was certainly being starved by the promotion of so many of its men to the Provincial Service. He would improve the prospects of the Ranger class as a compensation for non-promotion. He would have grade promotion up to Rs. 150 a month as at present, and beyond that it should be in the power of Government to give further promotion to selected men up to Rs. 250 a month. He thought that would satisfy the Ranger class.

66567. He would make a definite distinction between the qualifications of candidates for the Provincial Branch and the qualifications of candidates for the Ranger class, and he would put the Provincial recruit through a different course at Dehra Dun from that which the Rangers had to go through.

66568. (Sir Valentine Chirol). None of the Indians in the Bombay Provincial Service had been through

the new course at Dehra Dun, so that his views as to the capacity of the Indians in the Provincial Service was based upon past experience. In his opinion, however, the new course at Dehra Dun would only slightly raise the standard, as the teachers were practically the same as before, and the revised course of study was only a little more advanced.

66569. With regard to invalid pension, on the Bombay side there was hardly a single instance of an officer having to retire before he had earned his first pension, i.e., after 20 years' service.

66570. (Mr. Madge.) The Bombay Government would, he considered, profit more by having a Chief Conservator than by having an increased cadre.

66571. Judging by his experience of 30 years in the Service, he did not consider there was any need for promotion from the Provincial Service to the Imperial. The Provincial Service as at present constituted was a first-rate Service for the native of India. The officers began on a salary which was double what was paid to a German or a French Forest Officer. A Conservator of Forests in France or Germany received £350, whereas a native of India in the Forest Service could rise to £800 a year.

66572. There might be exceptional cases where an Officer might be promoted from the Provincial to the Imperial Service, but as long as the door was left open, so long would every man in the lower service consider he had a claim for promotion.

66573. In India the Provincial Service did not attract a good class of Europeans, although the pay and prospects were quite good enough. Hardly a single application to enter the Service had been received from a domiciled European.

66574. (Mr. Fisher.) The travelling allowance of Rs. 100 a month for the Provincial Service was quite sufficient.

66575. He did not desire to abolish the present rule under which a certain number of charges were held by Provincial Officers, but he wanted power himself to say whether a charge should be a minor or a major charge, i.e., power to appoint an Imperial Officer to a minor charge if considered desirable in the interests of the charge.

66576. He had not had much experience of the University candidates who now came to India, but he considered that they arrived in India much too old.

66577. (Mr. Sly.) He considered that the examination, which was held at the time he himself was admitted to the Service in 1882, and which demanded a knowledge of the elements of Botany, Geology, Mineralogy and cognate subjects, was a model examination.

66578. The rule which obtained in some Provinces, that Forest Officers should be permitted to spend two months at a hill station if they could do their work conveniently there, would not meet the case of Officers in Bombay.

66579. It was a fact that a Bombay Officer had actually held the appointment of Inspector-General, but the witness knew a great deal about that case which was not on record. The Officer in question, Mr. Wroughton, was put in to act while Mr. Hill, the Inspector-General, was on leave. Mr. Hill died, and it was the first intention of the Government of India to pass over Mr. Wroughton. The witness complained that the Government did not even consider Bombay Officers for the post.

66580. He had had no experience of the selection of recruits for the Provincial Service before sending them to Dehra Dun, but he could say that the class from which candidates were selected was just the same as that which came forward for the Ranger class in the ordinary way.

66581. He would not agree with the opinion that the improvement in the time-scale for Senior Deputy Conservators, was a matter of considerably less importance than an improvement in the pay of the administrative grades.

66582. (Mr. Rebeira.) He was not aware of the fact that the Government of India had stated that the training obtained at Dehra Dun was practi-

11 February 1914.]

Mr. G. P. MILLETT.

[Continued.]

cally as good as could be obtained in some of the European institutions, but even if that were the case, it was not his own opinion.

66583. He agreed there was some ground for the complaint with regard to the length of the period of probation to the Provincial Service, but it was always within the power of the local Government to remedy that; it was not a question for the Commission. It was not considered desirable that a Provincial Service man should hold the post of Conservator. The Conservatorship was a high administrative appointment which required to be filled by an Imperial Officer. It was not a question of training; it was a question of the quality of the officer in the first place.

66584. He would not favour Provincial Officers being deputed for study leave abroad for a period of six months in order to qualify for promotion to the Imperial Service. He did not wish to see

Provincial Officers recruited into the Imperial Service at all.

66585. He would not recommend that Imperial recruits should be trained for six months at Dehra Dun; neither did he think that such a system of training would encourage mutual understanding between the two branches of the Service.

66586. Prior to the formation of the Commission, he had never heard any complaint on the Bombay side as to the division into Provincial and Imperial branches.

66587. The best men in the Provincial Service still fell short of the standard for admission to the Imperial Service, but he would have no objection to the promotion of any Provincial Officer who was duly qualified.

66588. He was in favour of the proposal that Provincial men should retire after 25 years' Service.

(The witness withdrew.)

N. D. SATARAVALA, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the corporate views of officers of the Provincial Forest Service, Bombay.

66589. (I) *Methods of Recruitment.*—(a) The revised rules for appointment to the Provincial Forest Service (Government Resolution No. 10618, dated 19th November, 1912) are acceptable to most officers, with the proviso that two candidates for direct appointment should be selected for training at Dehra Dun for every one selected for appointment from amongst the trained Rangers. Also that a physical test should be imposed before a candidato is finally selected.

(b) One of the present systems of recruitment to the Provincial Forest Service, viz., by direct nomination of selected candidates of high qualifications for special training at the Imperial Forest College at Dehra Dun, has a great deal to recommend itself, and should in course of time be the only source of recruitment if Government is to derive full benefit of the money it spends on this branch of the Service. As it is, this course of recruitment is sadly neglected, for up to this time there have been only two direct nominees, of whom only one remains, the other having resigned and subsequently died. Applications were called for from candidates in one instance, but no one was nominated; hence up to this time we have only one* direct nominee in the Provincial Forest Service of this Presidency since the introduction of the above rule, which could hardly be considered satisfactory if the Service has to be strengthened by fresh and vigorous men of high ideals and good qualifications.

(c) No doubt Government has to look to the claims of old Rangers trained at Poona and at Dehra Dun, and really good men from these should also be taken up as Extra Assistant Conservators; but the men so selected should be really deserving men capable of doing honour to the Service they want to enter. At present every Ranger coming into the first or second grade wants to become an Extra Assistant, and succeeds somehow in getting into the Provincial Forest Service; but he is incapable of doing justice to the work entrusted to him and the whole Service comes into bad odour.

(d) During recent years frequent changes have been made in the mode of recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service, which, judged by results, has proved very detrimental to the well-being of the Service on the whole.

(e) As long as highly educated University graduates with a degree in Engineering were selected for these posts, they were well able to hold their own and give satisfaction to their superior officers, but

when the selection of those graduates was discontinued in favour of the Poona Forest Class men and others with distinctly inferior education, the Service began to lose ground and it has come into such ill odour of late.

(f) The constant change of rules had also another bad effect, viz., all sorts of men began to think that they were fairly entitled to posts in the Provincial Service under one set of rules or other, and, as it was often laid down that vacancies should be filled up by turns, the result was that many men of better parts had to give way before some others coming forward on the ground of "it being their turn" then.

(g) Thus the Service has suffered greatly, and will continue to suffer as long as this mode of selection is not done away with. Their can and should be only one mode of selection, and that of "fitness" alone. Unless fitness is made the *sine qua non* of selection, no better results can be expected.

(h) Fortunately, the system of Direct Nomination has been introduced of late, and these nominees, if properly selected, are expected to prove a source of strength and usefulness to the Service. The nominations, however, should be more frequent, and full 75 to 80 per cent. of the vacancies should be filled up by these men and the remaining vacancies only by a careful selection of men from the Protective Establishment.

(i) As long as this is not done the Provincial Service can hardly hope to acquire the respect or esteem of its brothers in the Imperial Branch, nor can Government be expected to derive full benefit of the money it spends on this Service.

66590. (II) *System of Training and Probation.*—(a) As a special and separate course of training at Dehra Dun has been fixed for the Direct Nominees for the Provincial Forest Service, and since they no longer go through the same course as the Ranger Class men, as they did during the first two years of their training in times past, there does not seem anything special to be said on the subject; for these men will have now to undergo a higher course of training than what the Ranger Class men will have to do, which seems very desirable. The training they receive at Dehra Dun is very good, and will, in course of time, compare most favourably with the training given in Continental Institutions.

(b) Three years' probation after first appointment as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator is altogether too long for the type of men that would be selected for the Provincial Forest Service; one year's probation is quite sufficient for them to grasp the routine of Range Office work and all other details of Forest life. Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators should then be put on special duty to learn any special works going on in

* One more Probationer has been selected since writing the above.

11 February 1914.]

MR. N. D. SATARAVALA.

[Continued.]

their own or in other Circles, or put in charge of Sub-divisions. To keep them longer in charge of Ranges is to frustrate the object with which direct nominations are made.

(e) Again, the period of probation is not fixed. The present rules require that a Probationer must undergo a probation of at least one year, but which "may extend to three years," and he may not be made permanent even after three years' probation if a vacancy does not occur. This is all very vague and indefinite. It may deter suitable candidates from coming forward to join the Service. Moreover, it inflicts unnecessary hardship on a young man without any fault of his if he has to wait until a vacancy occurs. Take, for instance, the case of two men, the first becoming permanent after one year's probation and the next having to wait for three years or more for want of a vacancy. The latter will suffer a pecuniary loss all throughout his service, and even in his pension, so it will be better if the period of probation is fixed once for all, and the probationers are made supernumerary Extra Assistant Conservators after the period of probation is over until a vacancy actually occurs, when they may be absorbed in the regular cadre.

66591. (III) Conditions of Service.—(a) The conditions of service of a Forest Officer in India are very arduous and trying, and there is a general feeling amongst the Provincial Forest Service men that they are not dealt with as liberally as other Provincial Services are in point of pay and prospects. Highest administrative posts are open to other Provincial Services, while they are altogether debarred from them, hence they ought to be put in a line with the other Provincial Services by giving them similar openings. While in the matter of pay, it was expected that they would get two-thirds of the pay drawn by officers of the same length of service in the Imperial Branch, but in practice it was found that the pay drawn by Provincial men was actually much less, which should be rectified by so arranging the scale of pay that it should always be at least two-thirds of the pay drawn by officers of the Imperial Branch of the same length of service. As arranged at present, the maximum pay is out of the reach of over 90 per cent. of the men now in service. Some officers even advocate that the pay of Provincial Service men should be three-fourths or four-fifths of the pay drawn by Imperial men as times and circumstances have so changed since Government had fixed the ratio of two-thirds to one for the two services, but it is for the Commission to determine what should be the proper ratio.

(b) Similar amelioration of conditions in the matter of Furlough, Furlough pay and Pension is called for and it will suffice if the amelioration is carried out on the same lines as for the Imperial Officers.

(c) Compared with the figures in other Provinces the number of Extra Deputies in this Presidency is very small. There are only five Extra Deputies in this Presidency, and lately Government was obliged to have recourse to giving personal allowances to satisfy the claims of a senior man who had had to wait long for want of vacancies. If the number were increased to seven or eight or if the Local Government were, in special cases, empowered to create Extra Deputy Conservators in excess of the sanctioned cadre as supernumerary appointments, this difficulty could be got over and no hardships would be caused in future as was the case in the past, when another Senior Extra Assistant had to wait 10 years before he could be made Extra Deputy, and so was neither able to attain maximum pay nor will he get full pension.

(d) It is considered that the distinctions of Major and Minor Divisions should be abolished, since it causes annoyance and creates a grievance.

66592. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The recent reorganisation of the Provincial Forest Service and the introduction of the Time-scale pay has greatly improved the prospects of the Service, but the improvement is not such as to bring the Service on an equal footing with other Provincial Services, and it is still unattractive to induce men of good training and high qualifications to join it; more so, as it is notorious that the men in this Department

have a very bad time of it on the whole. An initial pay of Rs. 300 per month is advocated, with an annual increment of Rs. 30 or at least Rs. 25 per month.

It is therefore necessary to bring this service also in a line with the other Provincial Services, not only in pay but in prospects also. Highest administrative posts in the Service are open to men in other Provincial Services while the Provincial Forest Service is fully debarred from it.

The present arrangement of the scheme is such that hardly any officer at present in this Service will be able to obtain the maximum pay to be able to earn his full pension. A man having exceptional opportunities may attain the maximum pay, but such instances will be rare. Hence unless the yearly increment is raised from 20 to 25 rupees in the case of Extra Assistant Conservators, and to Rs. 35 or so for Extra Deputies, the scheme won't give much satisfaction. If the Rs. 25 increment were granted to Extra Assistant Conservators, and if the scheme were readjusted so as to bring the maximum of pay within the reach of all men the scheme would become more popular.

As said above, the pay given to the Provincial Forest Service is much behind the other Provincial Services. So all these services should be put on an equal footing and the salary given to Provincial men should in no case be less than two-thirds the pay of Imperial Officers of the same length of service.

The minimum and maximum pay as well as the increment of pay per annum should always be at least two-thirds of that fixed for Imperial men of corresponding length of service; Government reserving to itself the right to stop the promotion of such men as may not be considered deserving. Unless the rate of increments also be kept up in the above ratio, there is hardly any chance for men now in service to be ever able to secure the maximum pay.

66593. (V) Conditions of Leave.—Leave Rules and leave allowances should be modified on the same lines as those for the Imperial Branch of the Service. At present, officers of the Indian Services cannot have Furlough except at intervals of eight years (Article 338, C. S. R.) but this interval is too long, so if it was reduced to three years after the first Furlough as in the case of the European Services (Article 308, C. S. R.) it would prove of material benefit both to the Officers and the State itself.

Some officers make the following suggestions:—

(a) Men in the Forest Department have to undergo great hardships and their work is very trying. They break down in health so often that they require many more facilities for the enjoyment of their leave than are wanted by men in other Departments. Under the circumstances some officers consider that it would not be out of place if they were allowed to accumulate their Privilege leave to six months instead of three as at present, and if they were allowed 30 days of casual leave in a year in periods not exceeding 10 to 15 days at a time.

(b) Privilege leave in excess of three months at a time to be granted in cases of illness or when an officer wants to proceed to Western Countries for purposes of study or general culture.

(c) Furlough may be granted for four years in all. All the four years' furlough may be taken in India and should qualify as service for pension. Except for the above remarks the leave rules will be considered satisfactory if the tentative redraft of rules which accompanies Government Resolution No. 3752, dated 18th December, 1912, is sanctioned.

66594. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—For reasons given above a man in the Forest Department should be allowed to retire early. He has to work in most unhealthy places, and his work is so hard and exacting that his health breaks down at an early age, and he becomes unfit for hard work long before his compeers in other Departments.

Very often he does not live long enough to receive his hard-earned Pension so it is quite necessary that the present limits of 25 and 30 years for invalid and optional retirements should be reduced

11 February 1914.]

Mr. N. D. SATARAVALA.

[Continued]

to 20 and 25 years respectively; for the hard Forest life, involving the ascent of steep hill-sides falls very heavily on a person of advanced age.

If the period of effective service be reduced there need be no apprehension that all officers will take advantage of it and retire early. On account of several causes the tendency is, and will be to go on serving to the end. The concession will be taken advantage of only by those who will be continuing service with shattered health.

It will therefore be a great boon if after 20 years' service invalid pensions are granted at full rates; the amount of invalidating pensions for services under 20 years being calculated at one fortieth of the number of years of active service, as follows:—

Nineteen-fortieths for 19 years' service; eighteen-fortieths for 18 years' service, and so on.

66595. (VII) Working of the existing System of Imperial and Provincial Services.—Though some officers advocate it, it is hardly possible at this stage to do away with the Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial, but it would tend greatly to the raising of the status of the Provincial Service if there were only one list as in the Public Works Department. Men in the Provincial Service being shown with an asterisk or some other mark indicating that they were appointed in India, and their pay being calculated at two-thirds of the pay of Imperial Officers.

66596. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—Very few Officers have made any observations under this head, but some have remarked that it would be just and reasonable if Provincial Services of all Departments were put on an equal footing, and that ordinarily an Officer of one Department with certain service at his back were to receive the same remuneration as one in another Department with like service. This would do away with a

great deal of petty bickerings and all would work more contentedly.

66597. (IX) Other points.—(a) The fitness of an Extra Assistant Conservator for promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator should be based upon grounds other than fitness to hold charge of a Major Division only. That may form one of the considerations, but his previous work, uprightness and antecedents should be the main or sole considerations. It would be no loss to Government if the distinction of Major and Minor charges were done away with altogether.

(b) It is generally considered very desirable by all Provincial Forest Service men that the keeping of only one list will tend greatly to bring the two branches of the Forest Service closer together, and will thereby tend to elevate the tone and status of the Provincial Branch. There is only one list in the Public Works Department, and there should be only one in the Forest Department also.

(c) There is a universal feeling amongst Divisional Forest Officers of the Provincial Branch that the Travelling Allowance they now get, viz., Rs. 100 a month, is not adequate to meet the expenditure that they incur, and that they should be given the same Travelling Allowance as is given to Officers of the Imperial Branch (viz., Rs. 150), both having to do the same amount of travelling. In no other Department less travelling allowance is paid to the Provincial Officers holding similar office as the Imperial Service Officers. This difference exists in the Forest Department only, and may be removed.

(d) The minimum and maximum pay, daily or monthly Travelling Allowance status and the Leave and Pension Rules for the Provincial Service of all Technical Departments, such as the Public Works, Forest, and Survey should be the same.

Mr. N. D. SATARAVALA

called and examined.

66598. (Chairman.) The witness occupied the position of Extra Deputy Conservator. He had 27 years' service. He had been directly recruited to the Provincial Service.

66599. He suggested that in course of time all officers to the Provincial Service should be recruited direct. Promotion from the Ranger class should be gradually done away with. At present the Provincial Service was almost entirely recruited from the Ranger class. Two-thirds of the present Provincial Service were Rangers, and one-third had been recruited direct. A Ranger had not a sufficient training to make a good Provincial Officer. Exceptionally good men of the Ranger class might be recruited to the Provincial Service. In saying this he was referring to the Poona Forest-class-men only. Dehra Rangers got better training and would eventually do better, both as Rangers and as Provincial Officers.

66600. The period of probation did not depend upon the efficiency of the probationer, but upon vacancies. Although a probationer might be found suitable at the end of his first year, if there was not a vacancy he would have to continue as probationer up to three years, and perhaps more, during which period he would be losing his increments of pay and incurring a possible loss of pension at least. The period of probation should arbitrarily be reduced to one year. If all the Services were placed on one list he would be prepared to give the officer recruited from Europe a higher rate of salary than the Officer recruited in India. To some extent the cost of living of the officer from Europe was higher than the cost of living of the Officer recruited and domiciled in India.

66601. Certain openings should be provided for the promotion of Provincial Officers to administrative posts. It was not the fact that it was already in the discretion of Government to promote officers. The present rules did not permit of it.

66602. The number of appointments of Extra Deputy Conservators should be increased. The

present proportion was too small altogether as compared with the proportion in other Presidencies.

66603. He recommended that the initial rate of pay of Provincial Officers should be two-thirds of that paid to Imperial Officers.

66604. He suggested that privilege leave in excess of three months should be granted for the purpose of study leave. If men went to Europe and studied the conditions of Forestry there, they would become better qualified.

66605. Under present conditions a Provincial Officer could not draw full pension until he had done 25 years' service. He could draw pension equal to one-sixth of salary after 10 years, to one-fourth of salary after 15 years' service, and to one-third of salary after 20 years' service. He proposed that a full invalid pension should be given after 20 years' service, and that a man should be able to retire voluntarily after 25 years' service.

66606. He did not know whether his colleagues would be in favour of a Family Pension Fund, but personally he would be.

66607. Five Bombay Provincial Service Officers were holding major charges.

66608. (Mr. Sly.) He had served first in the Public Works Department, and within four months Government transferred him to the Forest Service as a gazetted officer of the Sub-Assistant Conservator class.

66609. At one time in Bombay there was a system for recruiting graduates to the Forest Department. He did not know why that system had been abolished. In his opinion the graduates had proved themselves the better class of officers; they stood out as markedly better than the other men.

66610. All the five Extra Deputy Conservators in Bombay were filled at the present time.

66611. (Mr. Fisher.) In his opinion an engineering degree was far better than any other degree for members of the Provincial Forest Service. He considered that the training for the engineering

11 February 1914.]

MR. N. D. SATARAVALA.

[Continued.]

degree at Bombay was better than the training for the Forestry Department given by the new course at Dehra Dun.

66612. He desired that the distinction of major and minor charges should be abolished, as it caused annoyance and created a grievance, because very often there was no difference between the work of the two charges, except that one might be bringing in more revenue than another, or one might be producing better products than another.

66613. (Mr. Marjoribanks.) He admitted that Indians did not actually incur the same amount of expense when travelling as European Officers, as they could not afford to do so, since they got

much less travelling allowance than European Officers. The reason he asked for the same travelling allowance for Provincial Officers as for Imperial Officers was that this was the rule in all other Departments.

66614. (Mr. Rebecro.) Many of his colleagues who were at the college with him, and who obtained the engineering degree, were now Superintending Engineers in the Public Works Department, but no such appointments were offered to Provincial Officers in the Forestry Department.

66615. It was not his experience that Indians would not go to England in order to be trained for the Forestry Service. He knew of four Indians who had applied for posts in England.

(The witness withdrew.)

D. O. WITT, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

66616. *INTRODUCTION.*—In placing before the Public Services Commission a memorandum relating to the Imperial Forest Service, Central Provinces, as requested in the Joint Secretary's letter, dated the 1st August, 1913, to the Chief Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces, I desire as the chosen representative of the Department in these Provinces to bring to the notice of the Commission that the orders appointing me representative and requesting the submission of a memorandum, were received by me on the 29th September, 1913, that I have been requested to submit the memorandum by 15th

ment of India possess in their State-managed forests. The process is a slow one but none the less sure. Trees do not grow in a season like crops so that the progress is not always easy to detect, but it is there nevertheless.

Knowing this we are confident that any improvements whether in pay or pension which may be recommended by the Commission will at no very distant date be more than compensated for by a corresponding rise in the revenue derived from the State forests. The following statistics relating to the Forest Department in British India bear out the above remarks and may be of interest to the Commission:—

Period.	Area under the Forest Department.	Area under Working Plans.	Revenue.	Expenditure.	Surplus.
1885-86 to 1889-90 ...	94,437	Sq. miles.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1890-91 to 1894-95 ...	113,947	Not available	1,26,90,828	76,24,157	50,66,671
1895-96 to 1899-1900 ...	133,171		1,62,46,077	88,75,505	73,70,572
1900-01 to 1904-05 ...	221,600	18,679	1,81,59,902	1,01,26,418	80,23,484
1905-06 to 1909-10 ...	239,784	31,941	2,06,62,489	1,16,71,964	89,90,525
1910-11 ...	243,478	45,053	2,61,02,330	1,44,96,388	1,16,05,962
		50,183	2,74,05,454	1,52,44,023	1,21,61,431

October, 1913. I have therefore been given a period of 15 days within which to communicate with my brother officers and submit a memorandum, embodying their unanimous views and opinions. It is obviously practically impossible to do so within the limited time given me. I have, however, done my best in the circumstances stated. I desire, however, to reserve to myself the right to modify or add to the opinions expressed in the attached memorandum, in the light of any fresh views or information received from my brother officers between the date of the submission of this memorandum and the date of giving evidence before the Commission.

In the introduction to the memorandum already submitted by Mr. Hill, Chief Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces, attention has been drawn to the main grievances of the Department to which we have little further to add. We would, however, emphasise and particularly draw the attention of the Commission to the arduous and unhealthy conditions of service to which officers of the Forest Department are exposed, which should go a long way to justify the claims we are submitting for consideration. Secondly, we would draw attention to the continually increasing importance to the State of the forests managed by the Forest Department. Only those who have worked for years in these forests and can see the slow but sure improvement that is going on in them can fully realise what a valuable asset the Govern-

66617. (I) *Methods of Recruitment.*—Although the present method of recruitment has given fairly satisfactory results, some improvements are needed. Recruits now arrive in India at too advanced an age. At the time Coopers Hill was closed the average age at which the recruit reached India was approximately 22 years. For the last three years 1910-11-12 the average age was 24 years, while for 1912 it was 24 years 3 months.

One recruit has joined at the age of 25 years, 11 months. Under existing pension conditions it is possible that he may be retired under the 55 years' rule before he has served the 28 years necessary for full pension.

This advanced age is brought about mainly by the stress laid on recruits obtaining science degrees which are not necessarily of use to them in their future career.

It would be preferable to revert to recruitment, if necessary by nomination, between the ages of 18 to 20, followed by competitive examinations, and then to train the men in forestry and allied sciences for a period of 3 years. Much greater stress should be laid on physical fitness than is done at present, and all tests imposed as well as medical examination should precede the competitive examination.

66618. (II) *System of Training and Probation.*—It is highly desirable that recruits trained in England should receive their instruction at one residential institution. In the first place,

11 February 1914.]

Mr. D. O. WITT.

[Continued.]

the number annually recruited is too small to make it worth the while of more than one institution to provide a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions. In the second place, it is essential that the details of the technical training of the recruits should be carried out on exactly similar lines. It was the advantage to be obtained from this system that led to the training of all recruits at Coopers Hill, and this was one of the reasons why the abolition of Coopers Hill was so strenuously opposed by the Government of India. The further concentration of all recruits at one College at the chosen training institution is also desirable. The training of the recruits should be in the hands of, or at any rate, supported by, a lecturer or reader with Indian Service experience.

As regards practical training we agree with what Mr. Hill, Chief Conservator of Forests, has already said in his memorandum.

The period of probation in England should be allowed to count as service, as in the case of the Police. It appears to be an anomaly and is a source of great discontent, especially to those Forest Officers who passed the examination for the Forest Department and Police, and elected for the former, that the Police Officer (who like the Forest Officer is appointed as a probationer) draws pay and counts service to pension, while the Forest Officer is undergoing an expensive training largely at his own cost, and in the case of those who joined the Service up to about 1907, wholly at their own cost. It seems very unreasonable, because the Forest Officer spends his probationary period in Europe while the Police Officer spends his in India, that the former is not permitted to count his period of probation as service towards pension, whereas the latter counts the whole of his probationary period and draws pay at the same time.

66619. (III) Conditions of Service.—We entirely endorse the remarks made by Mr. Hill in his memorandum under this head. We cannot too strongly draw the attention of the Commission to the unhealthful conditions to which the Forest Officer is exposed.

In consequence it stands to reason that the cadre should be of such a strength that there should be no difficulty in replacing casualties and permitting officers to take leave whenever it is due to them and they require it. Such however is not the case. The Service has been persistently undermanned with the result that officers are constantly refused the leave which they have earned and are only granted leave on medical recommendation. Such a state of affairs tells not only very hardly on the health of officers but also on the general efficiency of the Administration.

A further effect of the deficiency in the cadre is that many officers have to hold charge of a Division and draw up a working plan at the same time, a task which not only tends to a breakdown in health but is generally unsatisfactory. Nobody would ever dream of expecting a Deputy Commissioner of a district to carry out a settlement of his district at the same time, though with the number of assistants a Deputy Commissioner always has it would be more reasonable than a Forest Divisional Officer drawing up a working plan for his own Division.

On this account we would strongly urge an increase in the strength of the Imperial Forest Service quite apart from the general increase which must come with increased development and more intensive working of the existing forest area.

In many parts of India Forest Officers are badly housed or not housed at all. Bearing in mind the long periods spent in camp under trying conditions it is very necessary that special attention should be paid to the housing of Forest Officers in headquarters and if necessary a Government bungalow should be provided.

66620. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—Before definitely stating what we consider to be fair and adequate rates of salary it is as well to place before the Commission in a concise form the grounds on

which our opinions are based. They are as follows:—

(1) The continually increasing importance of the Forest Department as a revenue-producing Department as explained in some detail in the introduction to this memorandum.

(2) The exceptionally arduous and unhealthy conditions to which Forest Officers are exposed (see paragraph (1) under (III) "Conditions of Service") call for particularly generous treatment as compared with other Services.

(3) That the pay of the Forest Department should in view of the grounds stated in (2) compare favourably with the pay of such sister services as (a) the Public Works Department (b) the Indian Police.

In comparing the pay of the Forest Department with the Indian Police the fact that the Police Officer is drawing pay and counting service towards pension, while the Forest Officer is paying for his training must be carefully kept in view, also that Indian Police still draw exchange compensation allowance whereas the Forest Department do not.

(4) The present pay of Assistant and Deputy Conservators at the existing rate of exchange is less than it was under the old rates of pay when the rupee stood at two although the cost of living as is well known has more than doubled since that time.

(5) There has been a great advance not only in the quantity but also in the quality of work required of a Forest Officer, and the latter will continue to advance as the forests improve and require more intensive working.

(6) The existing rates of pay, especially amongst officers of Administrative rank compare most unfavourably with those of the Indian Civil Service in corresponding posts.

The following facts illustrate some of the points mentioned above:—

(a) The scale of pay for Assistant and Deputy Conservators before the incremental scale was introduced commenced at Rs. 350 and went up to Rs. 900 per mensem. At the time this scale was introduced these sums represented £420 and £1,080 per annum. The pay of the newly appointed Assistant Conservator is now Rs. 380 rising to Rs. 1,250 corresponding at the present rate of exchange to £304 and £1,000 per annum. But from these sums there are deductions on account of income tax which were not imposed until about 1885. The pay now after deduction amounts to £296 and £974 respectively.

Thus the pay now given when measured in English money is actually less than was considered fair about 40 years ago.

(b) During the first 10 years of a Forest Officer's service his pay compares most unfavourably with that of other Departments. Very considerable discontent is felt by the junior members of the Service on this account, and not without reason. For instance, Mr. J. A. Baker, of the Public Works Department, who left Coopers Hill at the same time (1904) as Mr. P. S. Corbould, was officiating Executive Engineer on Rs. 700 in March, 1908, whereas Mr. P. S. Corbould was only drawing Rs. 500 and had been in charge of a Division for some time.

The explanation is that no officiating or charge allowance is given to Assistant or Deputy Conservators. Public Works Department men on an average officiate as Executive Engineers with four to five years' service; Indian Police officiate as District Superintendents of Police not uncommonly with two to three years' service. The latter at once draw, if first class Assistant, Rs. 700, and if second class Assistant Rs. 600 per mensem.

An Assistant Conservator may be put in charge of a Division after two to three years' service, sometimes even less. He gets no officiating allowance and cannot draw pay at Rs. 700 per mensem until the ninth year of his service.

(c) The present pay of the Administrative posts in the Forest Department is insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain in the way they should their position as Heads of Departments either with Local Governments or with the Government of India.

11 February 1914.]

Mr. D. O. WITT.

[Continued.]

Conservators are Heads of Departments. Their position corresponds closely to that of Commissioner of a Division. A Chief Conservator's position is presumably higher.

Yet at the present moment the writer of this note is serving in a district where the Deputy Commissioner (let alone the Commissioner of the Division) draws higher pay, not only than a first grade Conservator, but even than the Chief Conservator of the Province.

In view of the above we are of opinion that:—

(i) The average pay of all grades should be raised and brought closer to that received by members of the Indian Civil Service.

(2) To alleviate the very real grievance of junior members of the Department officiating allowances should be given to all Assistant Conservators in charge of Divisions.

(3) That by reason of the conditions of their service and the liberality of their education, Forest Officers should receive even more generous treatment than that afforded to the Public Works Department and Indian Police.

(4) That in the event of an incremental time scale of pay being introduced for Executive Officers of the Civil Service the pay of Executive Officers of the Forest Service should be fixed at not less than three-quarters of that scale.

The actual scale of pay based on existing conditions, now proposed by us, is as follows:—

(1) Assistant Conservators should begin on Rs. 400 per mensem rising by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,500 in the 23rd year, with the exception of officers not considered suitable for Conservators. These latter should not rise above Rs. 1,350 which would be reached in the 20th year of service.

(2) A qualified Assistant Conservator in charge of a Division should draw a charge allowance of one-fifth of the lowest pay of a Deputy Conservator in addition to his substantive pay provided the total does not exceed Rs. 700.

(3) There should be two grades of Conservators only, Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000.

Chief Conservators should receive Rs. 2,500 rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,000.

The pay of the Inspector-General of Forests should be Rs. 3,000 rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,500.

66321. (V) Conditions of Leave.—Here again the peculiar conditions of service should be recognised, *viz.*, that from the very nature of their duties officers of the Forest Department are apt to suffer more severely in health than those of other Departments, and treated accordingly.

The following improvements in the existing leave rules are urgently called for:—

(i) The minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should follow the ratio adopted between Indian Civil Service and other Services for the maximum furlough allowance, *i.e.*, it should be £400 or the salary last drawn on duty whichever is less. The present allowance of £200 is quite inadequate and results in officers not taking leave when it would be better for them, as well as for Government, to do so. Similarly on furlough other than ordinary the minimum should be raised from £100 to £200.

(ii) There should be no limit to the accumulation of privilege leave. It should never be possible for an officer to lose any of the privilege leave he has earned by leave being refused to him, and in the event of such refusal he should undoubtedly be permitted to accumulate his privilege leave up to the time Government can see its way to permitting him to avail himself of it.

(iii) The restriction which lays down that an officer must have rendered eight years' active service before he can be granted furlough appears to serve no useful purpose. It would be greatly in the interests of the Service to permit officers to take furlough after four years' active service.

(iv) It should be permissible to commute long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay, with suitable restrictions.

(v) The rule that furlough cannot be taken until an interval of not less than 18 months has elapsed

since last return from privilege leave of over six weeks' duration should be relaxed.

66322. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—It is strongly felt that the present pensions are totally inadequate, and require revision in the light of existing conditions. This matter has been for some time a very great grievance with Forest Officers. Numerous memorials have been submitted on the subject, the lust of which have been withheld on the grounds that the matter would be taken up and considered by the Public Services Commission. We beg to represent that the Forest Department has very special claims to generous pensions on the following grounds:—

(1) The arduous and unhealthy conditions of service to which attention has already been drawn in paragraph 66319 (Conditions of Service). It was calculated about three years ago that the average length of service in the Forest Department (based on actuals of trained men, subjected to specially strict medical examination before admission) is only 22 years, and of these 30 per cent. died on active service.

(2) More than 40 years ago it was laid down that the ordinary limit of an uncovertable pension was £500 or Rs. 5,000 at the then current rate of exchange. Since then the cost of living has increased enormously both in India and England. Yet the normal pension after 25 years' service is now calculated in English money, only £437 10s. or £22 10s. less than was considered reasonable 40 years ago.

(3) That on the present pensions it is impossible to live in comfort and to educate our children in a fitting manner. Forest Officers having no private means have a very hard task before them to make both ends meet on retirement.

(4) Under existing rules an officer of the Provincial Service, who serves for two years in the highest grade of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, can earn a pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum, that is to say, exactly the same pension as an Imperial Service Officer, other than the Inspector-General of Forests, Chief Conservator and Conservator who has put in 28 years' service. This is obviously not just.

(5) The relatively large number of retirements at an early age through ill health call for very generous invalid pensions under 20 years' service.

(6) It is not fair there should be one rate of pension for service from 15 to 19 years, another rate from 20 to 24 years, and a third rate for 25 years and above. For instance, a Forest Officer with 19 years' service gets a pension of Rs. 3,000, whereas officers of other Departments drawing pension under Article 474, Civil Service Regulations, get Rs. 3,800. There should be a graduated scale of pension for each year of service.

We therefore recommend a re-adjustment of the existing pension rules with a scale of pensions as under:—

(i) Pensions for the Imperial Service to be in sterling and not in rupees. This is absolutely essential.

(ii) Pensions to be on a graduated scale for each year of service.

(iii) The invidious distinction drawn against the Forest Department in paragraph 475, Civil Service Regulations, by which a Forest Officer must have completed 28 years' service if below the 1st grade of Conservators to qualify for an additional pension should be withdrawn.

Proposed scale of pension.

Years.	Pension.	Years.	Ordinary Pension.
10 £250	20 £500
11 275	21 520
12 300	22 540
13 325	23 560
14 350	24 580
15 375	25 600
16 400	26 620
17 425	27 640
18 450	28 660
19 475	29 680
		30 (or three years as Conservator) ...	700

Chief Conservators and President, Research Institute, £500, Inspector General of Forests £900.

11 February 1914.]

Mr. D. O. WITT.

[Continued.]

The pension of officers not considered fit for Conservators not to exceed £600.

As the Government of India had decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers could be passed until the Public Services Commission had completed their enquiries and submitted their report, it is urged that in the case of all officers who retire subsequently to the date of the issue of the orders referred to and before the orders of Government on these recommendations are issued, retrospective effect should be given whereby such officers may receive the benefit of any enhanced pensions which may be granted.

66623. (VII) Employment of non-Europeans and working of existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—We have nothing to add under this head to the remarks already made by Mr. Hill, Chief Conservator of Forests, in his Memorandum.

(Mr. Hill's remarks under this head were as follows:—

Entry to the Imperial Service is open to Indians under exactly the same conditions as to Europeans except with reference to marriage. No alterations appear to be necessary or advisable.

The existing system of dividing the service into Imperial and Provincial branches works satisfactorily and no alteration is required. On the whole, the members of the Provincial Service do the work given to them fairly satisfactorily; but any increase in the numbers of Provincial as compared with Imperial Officers must mean a loss of efficiency, since the course of training undergone by Imperial Officers in Europe is of a much higher standard than anything possible in India in the present state of scientific Forestry in the latter country.)

66624. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—We are in accord with the remarks made in Mr. Hill's Memorandum, but we would like to add that in our opinion a mistake was made when it was determined to call the District Forest Officer the "Assistant to the Deputy Commissioner." It would have been quite sufficient to state that in certain matters the Divisional Forest Officer shall not act without consulting or without the assent of the District Officer.

It results sometimes in the anomalous position of an experienced Forest Officer of some 15 to 20 years' service finding himself as an Assistant to a very junior and inexperienced District Officer.

66625. (IX) Other points.—(1) The question of travelling allowance is a permanent source of grievance with Forest Officers. The rates fixed many years ago are no longer adequate. It must be remembered that the Forest Officer spends more time in camp (never less than six months of the year) and frequently longer than any other touring officer. That his work takes him to those parts of a district where the common amenities of life are the most difficult to procure, and that he frequently has to be out at the most trying and unseasonable times of the year. That whereas Public Works Department or Police Officer can often make a tour passing from one bungalow to another along a main road, a Forest Officer has practically always to take his tents, furniture, crockery, etc., along with him involving him in much greater expense. Taking into account the present cost of cart and camel transport, coolies, etc., we consider that the existing daily rate of Rs. 5 should be raised to Rs. 7, so as not to involve an officer in actual loss on his touring expenses. The existing rates for Administrative Officers should be raised in the same proportion. Assistant Conservators should be given the same rate as officers in charge of Divisions. At present Assistant Conservators draw Rs. 4 per day, while Assistant Commissioners draw Rs. 5, a distinction which is hardly fair.

The question of travelling allowance on transfer has frequently been brought up. It affects the officers of all Departments equally. It will hardly be necessary to go into details, but it should be

recognised that officers should not be put to pecuniary loss when transferred in the interest of the Public Service.

(2) Free medical attendance should be provided for the wives and families of officers, as in the case of Military Officers.

(3) The creation of a Family Pension Fund on the principle of the scheme appertaining to the Indian Civil Service would be a source of great satisfaction to the Department. The existing Forest Officers' Provident Fund is not altogether suitable for family provision.

(4) The possibility of arranging for favourable passage rates to assist officers and their families when proceeding home on leave.

(5) It should be recognised that certain Forest Divisions are much more unhealthy than others and local allowances should be attached to them.

Supplementary Written Statement.

66626. In placing before the Public Services Commission this Supplementary Memorandum, I beg to refer the Commission to the introductory remarks made in my memorandum submitted on 15th October last, in which I pointed out that, owing to the hurried manner in which I had been called on to submit a memorandum, I had been unable to consult my brother officers and obtain their views and opinions.

I, therefore, desired to reserve to myself the right to modify or add to the opinions expressed in that memorandum after discussing matters with my brother officers. In accordance with the above, I now beg to place before the Commission the following amendments to the memorandum already submitted.

66627. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—The general consensus of opinion is that recruitment should be by open competition without nomination.

66628. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The statement "The Indian Police still draw exchange compensation allowance, whereas the Forest Department do not" should read "that those members of the Indian Police who were appointed before 6th June, 1907, still draw exchange compensation allowance, whereas no members of the Forest Department do."

Junior members of the Service desire that special attention should be drawn to the insufficient pay which they receive during the first ten years of their service. Some instances have already been given. The grant of officiating allowances to all Assistant Conservators in charge of Divisions has been suggested. The opinion that "the average pay of all grades should be raised" should be amended to read:—"(1) The average pay of all grades, but more especially that of the lower grades, should be raised." The proposal that the salary of officers unfit for Conservators should not rise above Rs. 1,350 per mensem should be cancelled, no officers in these Provinces being in favour of this restriction.

66629. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The scale of pensions proposed from the 20th year of service onwards has not been favourably received by the majority of officers, who consider them inadequate. The general consensus of opinion is that ordinary pensions should not continue to increase after 25 years' service, thus bringing it into line with the regulations applicable to the Indian Civil Service. In consequence the following revised scale of ordinary pensions should be substituted for those already proposed:—

Years.	Pension.
20	500
21	530
22	560
23	590
24	620
25	650

£100 extra for three years' service as Conservator of Forests irrespective of total length of service.

11 February 1914.]

Mr. D. O. WITT.

[Continued.]

£800 for three years as Chief Conservator of Forests and President, Research Institute. £900 for Inspector-General.

The restriction that the pension of officers not considered fit for Conservators should not exceed £600 should be omitted.

66630. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—In connection with the remarks already made under this head the Forest Officers of the Central Provinces wish particularly to point out that, whereas they are aware that in other Provinces their brother officers frequently suffer considerably through the subordination of their authority to that of the District Officer, the same cannot be said to be the case in the Central Provinces, where the relations between the Forest Department and the Civil Service are most cordial. Personally, in 17 years' service I have never experienced anything but the greatest

consideration in official dealings with the District Officer.

66631. (IX) Other points.—With regard to travelling allowance, the opinion is generally held that from the nature of a Forest Officer's duties he should be given a higher rate of travelling allowance than that granted to other Services.

That Assistant Conservators should only be given the same rate of travelling allowance as Deputy Conservators when in charge of a Division, but that in the event of higher rates of travelling allowance not being granted to the Department, an Assistant Conservator should not draw less travelling allowance than an Assistant Commissioner.

That provided improved pay and pension schemes are sanctioned, officers do not lay much stress on (1) Free medical attendance; (2) The grant of favourable passage rates.

MR. D. O. WITT called and examined.

66632. (Chairman.) The witness was a Deputy Conservator in the 18th year of his service. There were three Conservators and one Chief Conservator in the Central Provinces. Each circle in the Central Provinces was divided into seven or eight divisions.

66633. He recommended for recruitment to the Imperial Service a system of nomination, followed by competitive examination, at the school-leaving age. If a careful physical test was imposed along with the medical examination, he would then favour open competition.

66634. He had a preference for Oxford if it was decided that recruits should be trained at one residential University, as the arrangements there seemed to be better than elsewhere.

66635. The advantage of giving a recruit on first coming out to India a tour in the different Provinces was that he was liable later on in his service to be removed to other parts of India.

66636. He suggested that part of the period of probation should be allowed to count as service. It did count as service in other Departments. Of two men passing the same examination, one entering the Police Service and the other the Forestry Service, the former at once came to India and started earning salary, whereas the latter had to remain in training in England and spend nearly £800, and he received nothing in return. Any increase in the number of Provincial Service Officers as compared with Imperial Officers would mean a loss of efficiency in the Service. That assumption was based not only on the belief that the academic training in England was much superior to the training in India, but on considerations of character. It would be many years before the training in India could be raised to the level of the training in England.

66637. If it were desired to recruit Indians to the higher branches of the Service, he would be in favour of promotion from the Provincial Service. No definite proportion of vacancies to be filled by promotion should be laid down; it should be left to the discretion of Government to choose suitable men. He would not give any assurance to Indians that they would have an opportunity of getting into the Imperial Service. The conditions of Service in the Provincial Branch were extremely good. For instance, a senior Indian officer obtained more pension than an Imperial Officer. If a Provincial man was on Rs. 550 in the last years of his service, he could obtain Rs. 5,100 pension, whereas the pension of an Imperial Officer after 25 years' service was Rs. 5,000.

66638. As far as recruitment was concerned, whilst he was strong in his belief that Dehra Dun gave a very inferior training as compared with the University training in England, he would prefer to have in the Service a Dehra Dun trained Indian rather than an Indian trained in England, because an officer during his service in the Provincial Branch would be able to bring himself up to the standard of qualification for admission to the Imperial Ser-

vice. The experience such a man would get in the Provincial Service would make up for any deficiency in his training.

66639. The discontent among the junior officers in regard to their pay chiefly arose from the fact that when they were given officiating appointments they were not given an acting allowance.

66640. He suggested an increase of cadre because officers at present found difficulty in obtaining leave on account of shortage of staff. There was room for a large expansion of the Forest Department in the Central Provinces. In certain cases the divisions were too large, and they would gradually have to be split up into smaller divisions. The revenue from forests in the Central Provinces had been on the increase during the last few years. The more the scientific branches of forestry were developed, the larger would be the revenue obtained from minor products.

66641. An officer should not be placed in charge of a division until he had been in the Service for at least two years. There were instances, however, where officers of under two years' service had been put in charge for short periods. That was very detrimental to efficiency.

66642. Very few officers in the Service exercised their option to retire at 20 years, but a large number had been obliged to retire on account of ill-health. Assuming that there was proper provision for invalid pensions, he would admit that 20 years was a short period. He thought his colleagues would be prepared to forego that privilege if satisfactory invalid pensions were granted. Of the 132 officers who were recruited between 1866 and 1896, 29 per cent. died on active service, 36 per cent. retired, 7 per cent. had resigned, and 30 per cent. were still in the Service.

66643. He advocated the institution of a Family Pension Fund, which should be managed by Government in the same way as the Indian Civil Service Fund was managed.

66644. He laid stress upon the importance of increasing travelling allowances. A Forest Officer had to spend at least six months on tour, he was always in unhealthy parts far removed from towns and villages where the necessities of life were easily obtained, and on the present rates of allowances he was distinctly out of pocket.

66645. He desired to amend the statement that the General Provident Fund was not altogether suitable for family provision. Since the written statement had been sent in he had found that Provident Fund contributions might be applied to the payment of insurance premiums.

66646. (Mr. Sly.) With the reduction of the age limits and admission by competition, he considered the period of probation should be three years. A certain amount of weight should be attached to a science degree.

66647. He agreed that the proposal to give Imperial Officers officiating allowances would practically mean that every Forest Officer after three years' service would get a charge allowance in

11 February 1914.]

Mr. D. O. Wirt.

[Continued.]

addition to his pay under the time scale. In the Central Provinces there had been many instances of quite junior men being put in charge of districts in the Public Works Department and Police Department. What junior Forest Officers in the Central Provinces asked for was a higher rate of pay, or for an allowance if they were put in charge of divisions.

66645. It was the case that a Forest Officer received an extra allowance when he constructed a working plan, but if a man was put on special duty to do working plans he did not receive an allowance. It was giving an officer too much work to do to ask him to run his division, and to make a working plan of the division at the same time. He did not think that was in the best interests of the State. It would be better to have more men in the Service, so as to be able to release officers for special duty on working plans.

66649. All the posts of Extra Deputy were not at present filled, but that was not the explanation of the complaint about the shortage of officers for leave. There were 14 major charges. On the 1st October, 1913, there were only 13 Imperial Officers qualified for holding those 14 posts.

66650. Only one of the present officers in the Provincial Service was fit for promotion into the Imperial Service.

66651. (Mr. Fisher.) His proposal as to unlimited accumulation of privilege leave might tend to make officers defer taking their leave unduly.

66652. Personally he had found the Provident Fund was adequate to his needs, but he did not think the Provident Fund was really more suitable to the conditions of his service than a Family Pension Fund.

66653. It was the general opinion of his colleagues that they should not receive less remuneration than three-quarters of what the Civil Service received, but he himself thought that this was putting their demands a little too high.

66654. (Sir Valentine Chiro.) He suggested that a newly arrived recruit should have a tour of inspection of three months, in order that he should gain at once some idea of the great variety of conditions existing in India. It might be better to let a man take the tour after he had got familiar with the conditions in his own Province, but he himself did not think the matter was a very important one.

66655. If in the course of his work as a Forest Officer questions arose upon which he desired to have the assistance and advice of the Scientific Department, the channel through which he communicated was the Conservator of Forests, who communicated with the President of the Research Institute at Dehra Dun. If any particular line of investigation was started, orders were generally issued that the Research Officer at Dehra Dun should communicate direct with the officer in whose division the work was going on. This arrangement had worked very well.

(The witness withdrew.)

RAJ BAHDUR SRINIVASLU NAIDU, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

4.—IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

66656. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—The rules at present in force for the appointment of probationers for the Indian Forest Service practically exclude His Majesty's Indian subjects from that Service.

Rule 5 of the rules published in Government of India Circular, No. 21-F-280-2, dated the 18th October, 1912, states that the candidates must have obtained a degree with Honours in some branch of Natural Science or an examination of similar standard in any University of Great Britain.

Indian parents cannot, as a rule, afford to send their sons to England before their education in India is so far advanced as to admit of their being taken into the English Universities as Senior Students. As a graduate of an Indian University is given such admission, an Indian degree obtained in any of the Natural Sciences should be recognised as sufficient qualification for appointment to a probationership, provided the successful candidate obtains the Honours degree in some branch of Natural Science in the university of which he becomes a member in accordance with Rule 8 within two years, the period allowed him for obtaining a diploma in Forestry.

This rule was in force in 1911 and a graduate of the Bombay University (Mr. F. R. Madan) got the chance of entering the Imperial Service in the autumn of that year.

As the Honours degree in an English university is taken before the candidates come out to India, there can be no objection to this concession being made in favour of Indians.

Again, Rule 6 makes the holding of a competitive examination conditional on the number of applications received exceeding the number of appointments to be made. This uncertainty should be removed. The probationers should, as heretofore, be appointed by nominations in which the recommendations of the Local Government in India should receive adequate consideration, or invariably by means of competitive examination held simultaneously in India and England in good time before the terms begin.

The age limit should continue to be, as hereto-

fore, 19 to 23 years. The lowering of this limit is likely to adversely affect the chances for Indians.

According to the educational system in India at the present day, a student who has a successful career right through cannot graduate before he is 20 to 21 years old, and about one year is required for preparation to appear for the competitive examination. The maximum limit of 23 years, therefore, does not give an excessive margin.

4.—PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

66657. (I) Method of Recruitment.—The method of nomination for direct appointment is suitable for some time to come, as aptitude for forest work has to be carefully estimated in the candidates, but the minimum standard of educational qualifications should be raised to the obtaining of a certificate of having passed the F.A. or the Intermediate examination of any Indian university. In the case of Rangers specially recommended for direct appointment, whose number, however, should not exceed 25 per cent of the yearly vacancies, their having obtained the Ranger's certificate in any of the Forest Colleges in India or Burma may be accepted as sufficient.

The examination prescribed in Rule 7 of the rules published in Central Provinces, Secretariat No. 98—XIV-1-4, dated the 25th January, 1913, is by itself insufficient, and without some years of training in an Arts College a student will be unable to follow the advanced course of study in Forestry which will henceforth be taught in the Provincial Service Class.

66658. (II) System of Training and Probation.—During the preliminary course of training a probationer is introduced into Forestry and cognate sciences, and his aptitude for forest work is tested. It is important that this test should be thorough before Government is put to the expense of training him. One year's practical course should, therefore, be prescribed, while he should not undergo any further probation when he has obtained the diploma in Forestry at the Dehra Dun College. The Principal of the College is the best judge of the competency of a candidate in every respect. He has not only the opportunity of watching his career for two years but also has the advan-

11 February 1914.]

RAT BAHADUR Srinivasulu Naru.

[Continued.]

tage of comparing his progress with that of several others. In the absence of vacancies a successful probationer could be appointed a supernumerary Extra-Assistant Conservator. This places the newly trained Provincial Service Officer on the same footing as the newly trained Imperial Service Officer. In the case of both the practice of not giving them independent charges till they have become acquainted with local conditions should be followed.

66650. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The minimum and maximum pay fixed by Government for the Provincial Forest Service is in conformity with those sanctioned for the sister services of Provincial Engineering, Provincial Executive and Judicial branches, etc., etc., for the regulation of promotion is not sufficiently liberal and presents striking disparities.

Firstly, the number of appointments (Extra-Deputy Conservatorships), the pay of which is fixed at Rs. 575 to Rs. 850, being limited, an officer could only get the highest rate of pay on the eve of his retirement on rendering 29 years' service, including the two years' probation. The Provincial Service Forest Officer is no less exposed to privation and causes that shorten life than the Imperial Service Forest Officer or even the Provincial Service Engineer, and it is not unreasonable, therefore, that once the Provincial Service cadre is fixed, the promotion should be regulated on the lines sanctioned for them. In the enclosed statement the present position as to promotion is compared with that now prayed for.

Secondly, an officer permanently appointed has now to be specially nervous of his fate four times during his service—once when he reaches a pay of Rs. 550 and has to ascend to Extra-Deputy Conservatorship; a second time when he reaches a pay of Rs. 650; a third time when he reaches a pay of Rs. 700, and the fourth time when he reaches the Rs. 800 stage, in addition to his being solicitous of rendering satisfaction at each annual step. These painful restrictions cannot but have a discouraging or even demoralising effect upon the members of the service. They should, therefore, be removed. They are entirely redundant as Government is always at liberty to stop promotion to any officer at any stage.

Lastly, the members of the Provincial Forest Service are now entirely ruled out of administrative rank while there can be no objection to officers of conspicuous ability being admitted to it like the Provincial Service Engineers and officers of similar other services.

The Provincial Service Officers that have hitherto been deputed to Foreign Service and have had the opportunity of serving in administrative rank have vindicated their intrinsic worth and the valuable training they have received in British service which benefitted them for such employment.

Excluding the special appointments, such as the Inspector-General of Forests, the Chief Conservator of Forests and the President of the Research Institute, there are 21 Circle charges in the whole of India and Burma. Five appointments out of these should be set apart for the promotion of selected Provincial Service Officers, the gift being left in the hands of the Government of India based on the yearly recommendations made by the various local Governments. The salaries would be the same as those given to Superintending Engineers promoted from the Provincial Service, viz., Rs. 1,200, Rs. 1,400 and Rs. 1,600 respectively, for the three grades of Conservatorships.

This would amount to only one officer out of about 45 in the whole of India getting a chance of special promotion, but it would be a practical token of the liberal and generous policy of Government.

Travelling allowance is granted to facilitate the discharge of duties entrusted to officers, and so long as those duties are identical there should be no differentiation in the rates of travelling allowance whatever service the officer may belong to. The present ratio of travelling allowance

granted to the Provincial Service Officer is inadequate and it should be the same as that granted to the Imperial Service Officers.

66660. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The present long leave rules relating to Indian Services are not of much benefit to the Provincial Service Officers.

The initial waiting for 10 years or 16 years if leave on urgent private affairs happens to be taken, combined with the fear that a subsequent period of eight years must elapse before applying for any furlough makes officers, as a rule, postpone taking furlough till very hard pressed by circumstances and even do without any furlough throughout the service. The object of Government, which is to maintain the efficiency of the Services by allowing their officers reasonable facilities to enjoy periods of relaxation from duty, is not hitherto adequately fulfilled.

The simplification of these rules is under the consideration of Government and it is hoped that for all Services these restrictions will be done away with and that leave to the extent of one-sixth of one's active service will be given at any time, subject of course to the exigencies of service and to certain necessary limitations as to periods of leave to be given each time and collectively during the whole of one's service.

66661. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The limit of 30 years' service for retirement fixed more than half a century ago is proving too long for any branch of the Indian Services. It operates particularly hardly on the Forest Service, the members of which, owing to exposure to malaria and adverse climatic conditions, become shortlived. It is, therefore, urged that the age limit for retirement should be reduced to 25 years.

If the comparative longevity of Europeans and Indians is given due consideration Provincial Service Officers richly deserve being treated exactly on the same lines as Imperial Service Officers, the amount of pension at each step being reckoned at two-thirds of that sanctioned for the Imperial Service Officers. Officers who have shown special energy and efficiency during an effective service of three years as Extra Deputy Conservators or Conservators should be entitled to an additional pension of two-thirds of Rs. 1,000 per annum as in the case of Imperial Service Officers, at the discretion of the Government of India.

66662. (VII) Such limitation as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—There are no limitations levied in the employment of non-Europeans but the disabilities represented above will have the effect of practically keeping out Indians from the Imperial Service and administrative rank which is probably not the intention of Government.

Owing to the difference in the initial training and the scope of pay and promotion the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial branches is probably a necessary measure, but the division is too rigid and the Provincial Service is stamped with the ban of inferiority to an undue extent and treated altogether like a disjointed member instead of its being allowed to exist like the branch of a great tree.

Forestry is essentially a science which is mastered in the field for which one's initial training is but an introduction. With the careful training received at the hands of experts, specially chosen for their ability in the Dehra Dun College, and of equally skilful Conservators thereafter, a considerable number of Provincial Service Officers become so proficient and useful to Government that they cannot be said to be much behind their senior brothers in the Imperial Service. If, therefore, a few of the deserving Provincial Service Officers are raised to the administrative rank they form the tissues which fuse the branch into the main stem and the Service would at once rise, not unjustly, in public estimation.

There is yet another measure commended for consideration. It is the abolition of the unsavoury

11 February 1914.]

RAI BAHADUR SRINIVASLU NAIDU.

[Continued.]

prefix "Extra" in the nomenclature adopted for the members of the Provincial Service. It proclaims the ban even to people who want to know nothing about it, while the distinction could be of interest only to the account department.

6663. (VIII) Relations of the Services with the

Statement comparing the present and proposed position of promotion to Provincial Service Forest Officers (vide paragraph 66659).

Year.	Existing position.	Proposed position.	Year.	Existing position.	Proposed position.
	Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
Period of probation	Two years after passing	Nil.	15th	Extra Assistant Conservator	Deputy Conservator
1st	Extra Assistant Conservator ... 250	Assistant Conservator ... 250	16th	... 530	... 675
2nd	Do. ... 270	Do. ... 275	17th	Do. ... 550	Do. ... 710
3rd	Do. ... 290	Do. ... 300	18th	Extra Deputy Conservator ... 575	Do. ... 745
4th	Do. ... 310	Do. ... 325	19th	Do. ... 600	Do. ... 780
5th	Do. ... 330	Do. ... 350	20th	Do. ... 625	Do. ... 815
6th	Do. ... 350	Do. ... 375	21st	Do. ... 650	Do. ... 850
7th	Do. ... 370	Do. ... 400	22nd	Do. ... 800	Promotion to administrative rank only to officers of exceptional merit
8th	Do. ... 390	Do. ... 425	23rd		
9th	Do. ... 410	Do. ... 450	24th	Do. ... 850	Retirement
10th	Do. ... 430	Do. ... 475	25th		
11th	Do. ... 450	Deputy Conservator ... 535	26th	Do. ... 850	Retirement
12th	Do. ... 470	Do. ... 570	27th		
13th	Do. ... 490	Do. ... 605	28th	Do. ... 850	Retirement.
14th	Do. ... 510	Do. ... 640	29th		
			30th		

RAI BAHADUR SRINIVASLU NAIDU called and examined.

6664. (Chairman.) The witness was an Extra Deputy Conservator with 23 years' service. He had been recruited direct to the Provincial Service from Dehra Dun.

6665. He recommended that Indians should be eligible for the Imperial Service on the strength of having obtained an Indian degree in Natural Science. In addition to that he would suggest a physical test. The reason he put forward the first suggestion was that the rules now required that candidates should be graduates of an English University. That rule completely shut out Indians.

6666. All Indian candidates who had taken their degree in Natural Science in India should be sent to England, and should undergo the same course of training as the European probationers.

6667. He would also promote men from the Provincial Service.

6668. Not more than 25 per cent. of the posts in the Provincial Service should be given to Rangers, because the course now instituted at Dehra Dun for a Provincial recruit was of a very much higher standard than the course taken by Rangers. He would improve the prospects of the Ranger class as compensation for non-promotion to the Provincial Service.

6669. Six months was a sufficient period in which to find out whether a young officer was suitable for the Service. He had recommended a period of one year as a substitute for the six months now spent before going to Dehra and the three years after the completion of the Dehra Dun course. He considered that no probation was necessary after passing out from Dehra Dun. If the period after a man was trained was the time for testing whether he was going to be an efficient officer or not, it should be limited to one year. Three years' probation was too long, and he would himself prefer that the whole period of probation after passing out of a college should be abolished.

6670. Officers of the Provincial Service were entirely ruled out of administrative rank. It was not the fact that Government had any discretion in the matter. Five out of the 21 circle charges in the whole of India and Burma should be reserved for selected Provincial Officers. He agreed that at present most of the officers in the Provincial Service were those who started as Rangers, but there were others who started as gazetted officers, and

Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The ill-effects of the rigidity of the division of the Forest Services into Imperial and Provincial described above, are naturally accentuated in the treatment received from services outside the Forest Department.

6663. (VIII) Relations of the Services with the

Statement comparing the present and proposed position of promotion to Provincial Service Forest Officers (vide paragraph 66659).

Year.	Existing position.	Proposed position.	Year.	Existing position.	Proposed position.
	Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
15th	Extra Assistant Conservator ... 530	Deputy Conservator ... 675	16th	Do. ... 550	Do. ... 710
17th	Extra Deputy Conservator ... 575	Do. ... 745	18th	Do. ... 600	Do. ... 780
19th	Do. ... 625	Do. ... 815	20th	Do. ... 650	Do. ... 850
21st	Do. ... 700	Do. ... 800	22nd	Do. ... 800	Promotion to administrative rank only to officers of exceptional merit
23rd	Do. ... 850	Retirement	24th		
25th			26th	Do. ... 850	Retirement
27th			28th		
29th	Do. ... 850	Retirement.	30th		

who had rendered excellent service. There as at present a sufficient number of Provincial Officers to fill five circle appointments.

66671. Owing to differences in training, and also in conditions of pay and promotion, the division between the two branches of the Service must remain, but it need only do so in a modified form. The present division engendered silent antipathy. Both branches rendered the same services to Government, and there ought therefore to be one common list. He did not think that if there was one list his colleagues would in a very short time be making the same complaints as officers in the Public Works Department, as the conditions of the two Services were slightly different.

66672. If invidious distinctions were removed, and an extra allowance were given to the European in virtue of his serving away from his own country, he thought his colleagues would be satisfied.

66673. Twenty-five years was a sufficiently long period for an Indian to serve in the Forest Department, in view of the arduous nature of the Service. He knew of a few instances where officers were suffering from physical afflictions on account of the hard work.

66674. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) When he put in the claim on behalf of the candidate with an Indian Natural Science degree, it was not because he attached very much value to the usefulness of that degree for the work to be done in the Forest Department, but simply in order to place the Indian and European on an equal footing.

66675. (Mr. Madge.) There was a good deal in the ordinary Arts course which was very useful for forestry work.

66676. He desired to press the claim that the best Provincial men should be promoted to the administrative ranks.

66677. (Mr. Shy.) He had been to Europe on study leave, and he had found it a valuable training. He would like a system of study leave for all the Provincial Officers. He would also submit that in view of the small pay given to the Provincial Service, liberal consideration should be given them in the matter of allowances when on study leave.

66678. For both Indians and Europeans he considered a system of nomination in India necessary, provided the candidates had the required University qualification.

(The witness withdrew.)

1 May 1914.]

At the India Office, London, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.

SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

MANADEV BHASKAR CRAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.

ARTHUR RANIM, Esq.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. } Joint Secretaries.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq.

F. C. DRAKE, Esq., Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office.

Written Statements relating to the Indian Forest Service.

(1) Extract from a Memorandum on appointments made by the Secretary of State for India in Council.

66679. The Selection Committee has since 1910 consisted of (i) a representative of the Secretary of State; (ii) the Director of Indian Forest Studies; (iii) a person appointed by the Secretary of State who is not connected with the India Office; (iv) a person nominated by the Government of India. The Committee has been composed as follows:—

1911 and 1912.

- (i) Sir James La Touche, K.C.S.I., Member of the Council of India.
- (ii) Mr. A. M. Caccia, M.V.O.
- (iii) Sir E. Stafford Howard, K.C.B., Commissioner of Woods and Forests.
- (iv) Sir S. H. Eardley Wilmot, K.C.I.E., late Inspector-General of Forests in India.

1913

- (i) Sir James La Touche, K.C.S.I.
- (ii) Mr. A. M. Caccia, M.V.O.
- (iii) Mr. T. H. Middleton, C.B., Assistant Secretary, Board of Agriculture and Fisheries.

- (iv) Mr. F. Beadon Bryant, C.S.I., late Inspector-General of Forests in India.

Only holders of a University degree with Honours in Natural Science, or equivalent degree, are admitted as candidates to appear before the Selection Committee. The regulations provide that "should there be more candidates considered to be qualified in every respect than vacancies to be filled, the Secretary of State reserves the right to require them to pass a competitive examination conducted by the Civil Service Commissioners, on the results of which their final selection would depend." Up to the present no competitive examination has been held.

(2) Supplementary Note by Mr. Drake on selection of probationers for the Indian Forest Service.

66680. A.—Method of Selection.—(1) Between the years 1867 and 1904 forest probationers were selected by a competitive examination. Up to 1890 the examination was held in science subjects, the age limits being 17 to 21 years. In 1891, the examination was reorganised so as to correspond generally with the Indian Police and the Sandhurst examinations (with which at a later period it was amalgamated), and so ceased to be exclusively a science examination; the maximum age was reduced to 20 years. Up to 1884 the probationers went to the Continent for a 2½ years' training; from 1885 to 1890 they had rather over two years' training at Coopers Hill College and on the Continent; after 1891 the training at Coopers Hill and abroad was extended to nearly three years.

66681. The year 1891 therefore marks an important change, namely, the abandonment of the idea of recruiting (at about the school age) candidates with training in the elements of science. The occasion of the change was a dearth of candidates during the years 1887, 1888, and 1889, in each of which it was found impossible to secure ten or twelve candidates, all of whom could pass the—not very exacting—standard of qualification in the examination. The chief reason for this difficulty was no doubt the insufficient pay of the Service—which was accordingly improved—but other reasons may have existed, and the change was made with the view of widening the field of selection by taking in other than science students, with the necessary corollary of an extended period of probationary training.

(2) The Secretary of State for India in Council decided in 1905, on the closing of Coopers Hill College, that as an experimental measure, subject to reconsideration after three years, the forest probationers should be obtained by open competition among candidates between the ages of 18 and 21 who had passed Responsions at Oxford, or an equivalent examination elsewhere, the subjects of the competitive examination being mechanics and physics, chemistry, zoology, and botany; and that they should be trained at Oxford and on the Continent, the length of the course being three years as before. Oxford was selected as the place of training in the United Kingdom on the recommendation of Dr. Schlich, the Professor of Forestry at Coopers Hill.

(3) The Regulations for the recruitment of 1905, as first issued, were based on the above scheme. Certain modifications were subsequently introduced, namely, candidates who had not yet passed Responsions, or an equivalent, were to be admitted to the competition on giving an undertaking that they would do so by October, 1905; and zoology was made an optional subject. Further, the date for receipt of applications was postponed for one month. There were 13 vacancies; only four candidates applied; and of these only two passed the examination. There remained 11 vacancies, which it was decided to fill by means of selection. This was done, 28 candidates being obtained by sending circulars to the Universities of the United Kingdom.

66682. The Regulations for 1906 were practically the same as the revised Regulations of 1905, with the omission of zoology from the list of subjects for the competitive examination. Nineteen vacancies were advertised and the regulations were widely distributed, but only two candidates offered themselves, of whom one passed the examination. As in 1905, a Selection Committee was appointed to fill the 18 remaining vacancies, together with five vacant posts in the Colonies, 23 in all. An advertisement was issued, applications were received from 40 candidates, and 13 vacancies were with difficulty filled. Shortly after this, the University of Oxford waived the requirement of passing Responsions in the case of candidates for the

* The examinations were at that time usually held in November or January.

4 May 1914.]

Mr. F. C. DRAKE.

[Continued.]

Oxford Diploma in Forestry who had been appointed probationers for the Indian Forest Service, provided that such candidates had received a good general education; and in response to a second advertisement issued on these lines 19 candidates offered themselves, and from this and the former list the remaining 10 vacancies were filled.

66683. For the Regulations of 1907 and 1908 the following changes were introduced, as a temporary measure, pending the reconsideration of the whole matter which had been promised by the Secretary of State:—the attempt to obtain candidates for a competitive examination was dropped, selection by a Committee being substituted; the maximum age limit was raised from 21 to 22, and the necessary qualifications were stated as “a good general education, and, if possible, a knowledge of chemistry and of mechanics and physics.” As the result of these changes, 63 candidates offered themselves in 1907 for 22 vacancies in response to advertisement; and 21 vacancies were filled, but with some difficulty, as many of the candidates were entirely unsuitable, or withdrew. In 1908, 76 applications were received, for 19 vacancies, and 19 appointments were made.

66684. (4) To sum up, before 1908 four periods may be distinguished—

(a) 1867 to 1890.—Competitive examination in science subjects. Training, from 1885 onwards, at Coopers Hill.

(b) 1891 to 1904.—Competitive examination. Subjects, those commonly taught in public schools and secondary schools throughout the country. Specialisation after selection, the candidates selected being men with a satisfactory general education. Training at Coopers Hill, at a cost to the candidates of about £550 for the three years. The number of candidates was usually double the number of appointments.

(c) 1905-6.—Abolition of Coopers Hill. Opportunity is taken to substitute a highly specialised examination in order to get recruits already trained to some extent. The experiment was made. Result:—

1905, 13 vacancies, 4 candidates, 2 appointed.

1906, 24 vacancies, 2 candidates, 1 appointed.

(d) 1905-8.—In 1905 and 1906, selection necessary to make up deficiencies of competition. In 1907 and 1908, selection adopted as temporary system. Result:—

1905, 11 vacancies, 28 candidates, 11 appointed.

1906, 23 vacancies, 59 candidates, 23 appointed.

1907, 22 vacancies, 63 candidates, 21 appointed.

1908, 19 vacancies, 76 candidates, 19 appointed.

66685. (5) In 1908 the systems of selecting and of training probationers were reconsidered, in accordance with the undertaking referred to in paragraph 1 above, by a committee under the chairmanship of Mr. (now Sir R.) Munro Ferguson. The Committee recommended that candidates should appear before a Board of Inquiry, with a view to the elimination of those falling below the standard in respect of physique or character; that preference should be given to candidates possessing a degree or diploma in forestry or a degree in science; and that if the number of candidates satisfying the Board of Inquiry exceeded the number of vacancies, a competitive examination should be held among the approved candidates to determine the selection of probationers.

66686. (6) The Regulations for 1909 and later years were based generally on these proposals, and contained provisions to the following effect:—

(i) Two classes of candidates were provided for, viz., those with an Honours degree in Natural Science (it was decided not for the present to accept a Forestry diploma as a special qualification); and those without a degree but possessing “good general education.” The former were given preference, but it was not until 1911 that they applied in sufficient numbers to fill the vacancies and to render unnecessary the appointment of candidates with the lower qualifications. In the Regulations for 1912 the distinction was abolished, all candidates being required to have an Honours degree, or equivalent degree, in Natural Science.

(ii) A Selection Committee examines the applications, and the Secretary of State reserves the right to require candidates to sit for a competitive examination if the number of candidates considered by the Committee to be qualified in every respect exceeds the number of vacancies. Arrangements for holding such examination, if required, have been made with the Civil Service Commissioners, but no examination has up to now been held.

66687. (7) I submit the following conclusions:—

(a) Competitive examination of candidates at the school-leaving age, in the subjects of general education, worked fairly satisfactorily as a means of recruiting probationers to be trained at Coopers Hill; when, after the closing of Coopers Hill, the examination was confined to science subjects in 1905 and 1906 it failed altogether to secure candidates. This may have been partly due to the fact that the Oxford authorities at that time insisted on the requirement that probationers should have passed Responsions, or an equivalent, involving a knowledge of Greek.

(b) On the question whether probationers should be recruited at the school-leaving age or the University leaving age, there are the following considerations:—

(i) Schoolboys would need a three years' probation in forestry, unless the standard of training hitherto accepted were lowered.

(ii) There would be more risk of getting unsatisfactory men if the probationers were selected at the less mature age, and the need for supervision of their studies would be such as to necessitate their being trained together at one centre.

(iii) The three years' course would entail larger expenditure in probationers' allowances from Indian revenues.

(iv) The only argument in favour of the school-leaving age is that it might enable the probationers to go to India a year earlier. This is examined in the next paragraph.

(c) The present maximum age limit—22 on the 1st January (i.e., about 22½ at the time of selection)—is designed to catch men just three years after their leaving school, this being the time required for taking their degree. An increasing number of the candidates who come up have already taken a forestry degree or diploma besides the Honours Science degree. For such probationers one year of probation should be ample, to enable them to comply with purely Indian requirements. Therefore, by selecting candidates at the school-leaving age² and putting them through a three years' course, only one year could ordinarily be gained in their age on arrival in India; and this only if none but candidates who have just left school were accepted, with a maximum age limit of 19 on the 1st January in the year of competition.

66688. In the case of the probationers who have gone out in the last three years (excluding six men who for exceptional reasons had been kept in this country for an extra year) the mean of the ages on arrival in India was 24 years, the oldest being 25 years and 10 months (after 3 years' probation) and the youngest 21½ years. All these had at least two years' probation after their selection. As has been remarked there is reason for holding that in future one year of probation will be sufficient, in respect of the increasing number of candidates who have already taken a degree or diploma in Forestry.

66689. Of the 18 candidates who presented themselves in 1913 (all with Honours degrees in Science) the ages ranged from 21 to 22½ years on the 1st July in that year. In eight cases, including three of the men appointed, the age did not exceed 22 years. Under present regulations, therefore, if the probation can be reduced to one year, the men can

* N.B.—By “school-leaving age” I mean the age at which boys in the highest forms, who stay on to work for scholarships, leave school. Since it is our object to get the best material, it cannot be desirable to take boys who either are not of this class or who have, in order to get an appointment, sacrificed the last and most valuable year of their school career.

4 May 1914.]

Mr. F. C. DRAKE.

[Continued.]

arrive in India at an average age not exceeding 23 years.

66690. *B.—Training.*—(1) On the details of the training of probationers I do not offer remarks, as these are matters for the Director of Indian Forest Studies. It may, however, be convenient to summarise the facts as to the action of the India Office regarding the centres at which the training is conducted.

On the closing of Coopers Hill in 1905, Oxford was selected as the place of training in the United Kingdom, on the recommendation of Sir William Schlich, and the Regulations, up to and including those for 1911, provided that probationers would be required to obtain the Oxford Diploma in Forestry. This provision was from the first stated to be subject to reconsideration, and in 1911 orders were passed allowing probationers to be trained at any University possessing a Forestry School approved for that purpose by the Secretary of State in Council. As a result of this it was decided that the payments made to Oxford University in respect of the Forestry School, that had been made since 1905, amounting to £395 a year, should be discontinued after the year 1913.

Cambridge and Edinburgh were invited to furnish evidence that their course was a suitable one; and Cambridge made arrangements that met with approval. Edinburgh, where the course for the Forestry degree takes three years, has for that reason not been able to comply with the requirements in the same way, and there is no question of sending probationers, having no forestry training, to spend their probationary period at Edinburgh; but the Secretary of State has made

“ will admit of the selection of graduates, who have also

taken part of the final examination for the degree in Pure Science.

66691. (2) Of the probationers selected in the last three years (five in each year) two went to Cambridge for their probationary period in 1911, three in 1912, and one in 1913. The rest went to Oxford.

Of the 18 qualified candidates who came forward in 1913, 11 had taken their degree at Oxford, three at Cambridge, one at Bangor, one at Bristol, one at Edinburgh, and one at University College, Dublin. It seems probable that, under the arrangement just noted, the number of candidates from Edinburgh will be higher in future.

66692. (3) The Secretary of State has thus advanced some way in the direction of availing himself of all the high grade forestry teaching that has been established in this country in recent years. Ultimately it may perhaps be possible to appoint Forest Officers, as the result of a competitive examination in Forestry, with a short probationary course following selection. It would seem a retrograde step to revert to the Coopers Hill plan of a State subsidised school for the training of Indian forest probationers, whether at Oxford or elsewhere; except in the event of the establishment in this country of a Central Forestry School that would take the place of the Universities in this respect. But there is, I understand, not the slightest prospect at present of such a school being established. The only thing that is being done is to develop the School in the Forest of Dean, which has hitherto trained woodmen only, so that it may supply part of the practical training of high class foresters, in place of part of their practical training in Germany. There is no idea of turning it into a school that would offer the teaching now obtainable at the Universities.

Mr. F. C. DRAKE, called and examined.

66693. (*Chairman.*) The witness was secretary in the Revenue and Statistics Department of the India Office. In that capacity he was a member of the Committee of Selection for many Services, and was also concerned with the selection of candidates for other Services for which no formal Selection Committee had been constituted. In filling vacancies in the Factory and Mines Department, the India Office had usually endeavoured to obtain men from the Home Office inspection staff, as it was considered that the Government of India wanted men who had had experience of inspection in this country, and selections were usually made with the advice of an officer on leave from India. It was very important in making selections to have the advice of someone with Indian experience.

66694. The witness put in a return relating to the Agricultural, Veterinary, and Geological Services, showing the number of appointments made to those Services and the proportion of European to non-European candidates. Only three or four appointments had been made to the Mines Department and to the Factory Department. No Indian had been appointed to the Veterinary Department, and so far as he knew, no Indian had ever applied for appointment.

66695. In the selection of candidates for the Geological Department, as for other Departments, an attempt was always made to obtain the advice of an expert who was not connected with India as well as of one connected with India.

66696. Candidates for the Veterinary Department were interviewed by Colonel Queripel. The number of vacancies was very limited, and Colonel Queripel's practice was to keep in touch with Sir John McFadyean, the Principal of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons in London, who knew all the good men likely to come forward. Colonel Queripel had a knowledge of India, as he was Inspector-General of the Department a good many years ago, but he had no recent experience of Indian conditions.

66697. The witness had no suggestions to make for the improvement of the machinery of selection. He had been trying to improve the system during the last year or two, and he thought it had become more systematised. They required on the one hand an independent expert, with an intimate knowledge of the conditions governing the supply of candidates in Great Britain, and on the other, a man who had actual experience of the Department in India. It was of value to have up-to-date experience, and that experience was not at present available in connection with the Veterinary Department.

66698. There was no Selection Committee for the Agricultural Department, but of recent years Mr. Middleton, of the Board of Agriculture, had been asked to go through the applications, and when possible an officer of the Agricultural Service on leave was called in to advise. Last year Mr. Coventry, the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India, assisted in the selection of candidates. There were two agricultural posts to be filled in the course of a month or two, and it would be necessary then to ascertain whether there was a member of the Agricultural Department in England; if not, no doubt Sir Edward Maclagan, who had been Secretary of the Revenue Department, would help.

66699. There were two chains of communication between the India Office and the various institutions from which candidates were obtained for the Agricultural Department. In the first place, advertisements were put in all papers that were thought of value for the purpose, but that resulted in obtaining very few good candidates. In the second place, a notice was sent round to the heads of colleges and institutions asking them to bring the matter to the notice of their men, and if they knew of any good men to send up their names. Even that was very disappointing, as professors seemed to pay little attention to the notice. As a rule application was made to the Professor of Agriculture or the Professor of Botany as well as to the head of the college. The letter sent out was always couched in more or less conversational

* This return will be found in the Notes at the end of the Minutes of Evidence relating to the Agricultural, Veterinary and Geological Services (Volumes XV and XVIII).

4 May 1914.]

MR. F. C. DRAKE.

[Continued.]

form; it was not a printed circular, but a letter explaining that a vacancy was available, and asking them to be good enough to assist the Secretary of State if they knew of any candidates. The letter practically constituted the professors and principals agents of the Department. It might be that there were no candidates forthcoming, but he could not help feeling that more might be done. A list was kept of applicants and their qualifications, so that when a request was received from the Government of India for a specialist in any branch of agriculture the list could be immediately referred to, but the appointment would not be made without advertising afresh.

66700. With regard to the Forest Service, an increasing number of candidates now had a diploma in Forestry. At Oxford, where the diploma involved a considerable amount of practical work, the men who came up with a view to becoming probationers would not actually have taken the diploma, but would have only taken the two years theoretical work. They missed the practical work necessary for the diploma, thinking that as they would have to do the practical work in their probation it was not worth while doing it at their own expense, at a cost of something like £70. At Edinburgh the students were given a good deal of time on the Continent, but much of that time was spent in attending lectures given by a German forest officer, who lectured in English. The same remark would apply more or less to Cambridge. The course for the diploma lasted three years at Edinburgh and two years at Oxford and Cambridge.

66701. With regard to the age of candidates, he had worked out the figures for the men who had gone out to India during the last three years—a great number of whom had undergone a three-years' probationership after taking their degree—and he found that the average age was almost exactly 24. In any case, two years was the maximum now for men with a science degree, so that it might be reckoned that the average age in future would be 23½, and if men could be obtained with one year's probation it certainly ought not to exceed 23.

66702. The reason for insisting on a science degree was that it was desired to cut down the period of probation. Formerly, and as would be the case again if selection were made at the schoolboy age, it was necessary to give probationers a three-years' training. Sir William Schlich had said that if a man came up with a pretty good knowledge of botany, chemistry, or some other science, he could do the work in two years. The present regulations certainly resulted in getting very good men, who had come out well at the university, and who were old enough to know their own minds and competent to select their career. If a man in his three years at the university had taken not only his degree but also his forestry diploma, as would be the case in a great many instances, it was all to the good, as he could be sent out to India at the age of 23.

66703. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The field open to a man who had studied forestry was not a very large one outside India, and yet a considerable number of men went up to Oxford, and most of them obtained forestry appointments elsewhere. The number of candidates undergoing a forestry course at Oxford last year was something like 40, out of which not more than 10 were destined for India.

66704. The selection of candidates was not restricted to men who had taken the diploma in forestry: it was only restricted to men who had taken an honours degree in some subject of natural science. He would not himself suggest any restriction to men who had taken a diploma, but he would give them preference. His real objection to a schoolboy examination was the expense of training the candidate. Also, if schoolboys were selected they would have to be sent to a place where they would be under proper supervision, and that would involve the establishment of one central school. It would be necessary to establish and endow a school somewhere or other, possibly at Oxford. It would be no doubt within the realms of possibility

to have a schoolboy examination with a condition that the boys should take their diploma at one of the three universities, under the direction of the Director of Forest Studies, but the supervision would be inadequate, and it could confidently be anticipated that there would be a number of failures.

66705. A large number of people now took their diploma without the prospect of going out to India. At Edinburgh a good number of men took up forestry with a view to obtaining employment on estates in Scotland.

66706. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He did not wish to make a definite complaint that it was difficult to interest people connected with universities or agricultural institutions in Great Britain in the selection of candidates, as he believed it was simply an oversight on their part. He felt quite sure that some of the people circularised had a knowledge of the extremely interesting work done by the Agricultural Service in India. For instance, the Professor of Agriculture at Edinburgh, Professor Wallace, was intimately acquainted with the conditions of Indian agriculture. The real reason why candidates were not available might be that Professors and Principals did not keep very closely in touch with a great many of their men after they had left the colleges.

66707. (*Mr. Ahdur Rahim.*) When Indian candidates applied they were always considered with the other candidates, but no special steps were taken to secure Indian candidates for any of the Services. No advertisement was issued specially with a view to obtaining Indian candidates, and no request for Indian candidates was made to the heads of the universities and colleges. Indian students coming to England generally applied to the secretary of the Indian Students Department, and from him would obtain full information as to the various Services open to them. So far as he was concerned, no advice was given to any Indian students to study for particular Services. Indians had every facility for studying forestry in England, either at Oxford or Cambridge or Edinburgh, and could obtain facilities for practical work.

66708. He could not remember any Indian candidates who had come up for the Veterinary Department, and did not believe that Indians came to any of the veterinary colleges in Great Britain. As regards the Agricultural Department, one Indian had been appointed last year, and a few applications from Indians had come in. There were two applicants last year, and for two vacancies which would soon occur one of last year's men had applied again. There were very few Indian applicants for the Forest Service, but one Indian Forest Officer was appointed about two years ago.

66709. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said he was not a member of the Selection Committee for the Forest Department.

66710. (*Mr. Sly.*) He could not say why the physical test which used to be in force for candidates for the Forest Department was abolished, but it was a test of absolutely no value; it depended more on whether a man had a good pair of boots than anything else. Candidates were taken out for a 20 miles run in one day, and if a man happened to be off colour on that day he came in late. He could only explain the evidence in India in favour of the test by saying that as people grew old they always looked back with favour upon the things of their youth, but it did not seem to him a reasonable and sensible way of finding out a man's physical condition. It was much better to see if he had been in the Rugby team of his school or prominent in the school sports.

66711. He thought that a probationer for the Forest Department who had obtained a science degree at a university and a diploma in forestry, and had subsequently undergone one year's probation, could get out to India about the age of 23½. The usual course now was for men to take the degree and the diploma in three years after leaving school, and the ordinary age of leaving school was between 18 and 19. Taking the average age of entrance to the university as nearly 19, and adding three years, with a further year for probation,

4 May 1914.]

Mr. F. C. DRAKE.

[Continued.]

made the age 23. The men who went up to Oxford went up in October, and as they went out to India in November they would go out just about the age of 23. It might be true that the statistics for Oxford showed that only two out of six students taking the diploma of forestry last year were 22 years of age or less, and that the year before only three out of 12 were 22 years of age or less, but one or two candidates were obtained last year under the new arrangement with Edinburgh, and he quite anticipated there would be several men this year with the Edinburgh forestry degree. He did not think the scheme suggested by him would restrict recruitment to Edinburgh men.

66712 A man could take the theoretical course at Oxford and postpone his practical course. The practical course at present consisted of about six months altogether, spent in Germany; two months in the first long vacation, a month at Christmas, a month at Easter, and two months in the last vacation. He thought they would usually take it with Mr. Caccia, the Director of Indian Forest Studies.

66713. If a man had a full theoretical training he could certainly take his practical training in one year. The full theoretical training for the diploma of forestry at Oxford was adequate for the Indian Forest Service, and was the qualification actually taken. In addition, one or two Indian subjects were required, but those could be taken up in the probationary year.

66714. With regard to his objection to recruitment at the school-leaving age on the ground of increase of cost, the probationer's allowance at present was £120 a year. He was not aware that there was a monetary advantage in getting candidates out to India at an earlier age.

66715. With regard to the Agricultural Service, Mr. Middleton was not nominated by the Board of Agriculture, but was personally asked to advise. He did not think that the Agricultural Service occasionally missed very good men who had applied for service in India but who had been unable to obtain an appointment on account of there being no vacancy. The vacancies occurred fairly regularly once or twice a year. It was conceivable that a good botanist who might be willing to go out to India could not do so owing to no post being available for some years, but his experience did not confirm that. Irregularity of recruitment was, however, a distinct factor in decreasing the number of candidates. When the Department became larger, as it would no doubt do in course of time, and the number of vacancies was sufficient to justify a regular rate of recruitment, it would undoubtedly be easier to obtain candidates. He did not think any proposal had ever been made for a regular rate of recruitment to the Agricultural Service up to the present.

66716. The only case in which a gentleman employed to assist in the selection of candidates was paid a fee was the case of Colonel Queripel, who, under an old standing arrangement, received a fee in respect of each candidate selected.

66717. (Mr. Chauhan.) The change made in the standard of the competitive examination for the Forest Department, owing to the dearth of candidates, was not a change from a higher standard to a lower; it was a change from an examination in science to an examination in general education. The standard of education in science required for the examination did not give a sufficient number of candidates, and therefore a standard of general education was introduced.

66718. The technical scientific knowledge required for the purposes of the Indian Forest Service no doubt could be as easily acquired in India as in England, but there were no facilities for teaching the higher branches of forestry in India. Possibly, forestry might be introduced as a subject of study in some of the existing institutions in India, but he could not say that practical experience in India was more valuable for an officer who was going to serve in India than practical experience in Europe. The opinion of Forest Officers who had spoken to him on the subject was that practical experience in Germany was essential for a high-class Forest Officer. The matter had been discussed at very great length during the last few years, and it was said that the Indian forests had not been attended to for a sufficient length of time to make it possible to obtain the education from them that could be obtained from German forests, which had been under management for hundreds of years. It was, however, a point on which he hardly felt competent to give an opinion. He did not think it was possible to obtain men trained in India who would turn out quite as capable officers as the officers turned out under the present system. In the first place, there was no staff available competent to teach forestry in India; the only possible staff were the Dehra Dun professors, who were expert laboratory officers, advisors to the Government, and it had been established in the course of discussions that those officers could not duplicate the work of training Forest Officers *ab initio* and, at the same time, carry on their advisory work.

66719. (Sir Theodore Morison.) He did not wish to put forward the present system of selection as perfect, but it was as perfect as they had at present been able to devise. The India Office would welcome any suggestions that would give them a selective system above suspicion, but he thought that requirements in this respect were already met by the arrangements in force for the publication of vacancies. The vacancies were usually advertised in about three issues of several daily papers, and, if time permitted, in three issues of several of the more important technical journals, though he did not think advertisement was of very much use in obtaining the kind of men usually required for expert Departments. The appointments made were always published, but he did not think it possible to publish the names of all the candidates, as very often men came up who were employed by firms and did not want their names made public. The only possible form of publicity was to announce in the papers that so-and-so had been appointed to examine candidates and to advise the Secretary of State in the selection.

(The witness withdrew.)

5 May 1914.]

At the India Office, London, Tuesday, 5th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.

SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUDHARI, Esq., C.S.I.

ARND RAHM, Esq.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.I.E. } Joint Secretaries.
R. R. Scott, Esq.

Sir WILLIAM SCHLICH,* K.C.I.E., Professor of Forestry, University of Oxford, called and examined.

66720. (Chairman.) The witness said he had been Professor of Forestry at the University of Oxford since 1905, and before that was Inspector-General of the Indian Forest Department. For many years prior to going to Oxford he was a professor at Cooper's Hill. During those years a great number of candidates for the Forest Department had passed through his hands, and he thought he was approximately correct in saying that out of the 220 officers of the Imperial Forest Staff about 212 had been his pupils.

66721. With regard to the comparative merits of the present method of recruitment and recruitment at the school-leaving age, he impressed upon the Commission that it was a mistake to send men out too young. It should be remembered that the Indian forest officer, besides being an expert in his own line, was also to a very considerable extent an administrative official. The Indian Forest Department managed 240,000 square miles of forest—i.e., one-quarter of the total area of India—and many places in that area were rarely or never visited by a superior officer of the ordinary administrative establishment. Under those circumstances he considered that forest officers should be men and not boys when they arrived in India, as the contentment and happiness of millions of people depended upon the Forest Officer being a man of considerable tact. Accordingly it was of the greatest importance that men on their arrival in India should be fairly well-developed. The age at which they went out ought to be sufficient to allow of a thorough education and to a considerable extent the formation of character, and he put that age at from 23 to 24; in fact, they should be about the same age as civilians. It was true they were not in the same position as the civilians, but they had many duties to perform which were really similar to those performed by the Civil Service. On the forest officer reaching India, after having gone through a complete course of training in England, he had not more than one year's probation, and was then posted to some isolated subdivision.

66722. He laid great stress on a university education for forest officers. Although he considered it desirable, on account of the development of character which was always involved in the process of a man taking an honours degree at a university, there was no absolute necessity to insist upon a science degree, provided that young men chosen at the school-leaving age were sent to a university and went through a course of not less than three years. If a complete university career was prescribed there was practically nothing to choose between the present method of recruitment and recruiting at the school-leaving age with a career at the university. If recruitment at the school-leaving age meant that no university course was to be taken, he should prefer the present system of an honours course at a uni-

versity. Men should go out at about 23, or better still 24. The present staff in India had been all recruited under the school-leaving age system, and might therefore be possibly in favour of the younger age. Those who had gone out since 1908 had not enough experience probably to be called to give evidence on the subject.

66723. He had always held the opinion that it was a disastrous mistake to scatter a handful of men over a number of universities. He warned the Committee that sat at the India Office three or four years ago that men should be sent to Oxford or Cambridge, or to Edinburgh, he did not care where, but that it was of the utmost importance to keep them together, because whatever universities might say at the present moment, it could not be expected that satisfactory arrangements would be made at a number of universities for one or two probationers a year. Up to the present only a few men had gone to Cambridge and none to Edinburgh. He had no positive information, but from what he heard he believed that up to the present time only Oxford had a School of Forestry up to the required standard, but on that point the Commission might usefully examine the Director of Indian Forest Studies. Under any circumstances, he would have all the candidates at one university. Some of the universities had said that they would make all the necessary arrangements, but the question was how far that had been done. By keeping the men together it would be possible to make sure that proper arrangements were made for a good standard of education.

66724. If men were recruited at the school-leaving age there was not much on which they could be judged, but when men had spent two or three years at the university there was something to go upon in seeing whether the men who applied for appointments were the kind of men required. He had always advocated a preliminary nomination by interviewing all the applicants, and if there were more candidates than the number of appointments a competitive examination might be held of those who were considered in other respects qualified. He was inclined to make the very bold statement that if Great Britain was to keep India she would have to send out men of a certain class, and if she did not do that the greater the danger of her not keeping India for ever. It was a mistake to send out any men except those who were thoroughly qualified for the duties they had to undertake. In the Forest Department he would rather develop what was now called the Provincial Service than send out men who were not of the very highest calibre. There would have to be a great extension of the Provincial Service because the area was far too large to be managed by the Imperial staff now in India. The revenue was rising, the management becoming more minute, and the demands on the staff were becoming greater and greater. Therefore he advocated that for a number of years to

* This witness did not submit a written statement, but see Appendix XI.

5 May 1914.]

SIR WILLIAM SCHLICH.

[Continued.]

come the Imperial Forest Service might be kept at its present strength, and additions, as far as possible, made by the development of the Provincial Service.

66725. With regard to the school-leaving examination, he had always advised parents who came to him to let their boys have a classical education up to the standard of Responsions at Oxford or the previous examination at Cambridge. Anyhow, he would insist on one of the old languages, especially Latin. There was a good deal of talk about the abolition of Greek, but a man who was going in for science, although he did not want an intimate knowledge of Greek, would find it a great help to know something of both Latin and Greek, as it would enable him to understand scientific expressions. Therefore, the education of candidates up to the time of leaving school should be a classical education and under any circumstances should include Latin. In the competitive examination a certain knowledge of chemistry and physics might be added. He would not ask students to spend their school time on botany or zoology, but to concentrate on their classical education so as to be as well prepared as possible for the specific course of instruction in their university training.

66726. With reference to the allocation of time to practical and theoretical work in the university course, the course had been two years theoretical and one year practical, but owing to the pressure brought to bear by the Committee of the India Office three or four years ago the practical course had now been reduced to six months. A certain amount of practical work was done during the time set apart for theoretical instruction. The practical part should under no circumstances be less than six months, and it might usefully be more. When he first started the course it was nine. Although there might possibly be room for some small improvements the practical course abroad was on the whole thoroughly satisfactory. The men were stationed with Continental forest officers. They had to keep a diary, which was submitted every Saturday to the forest officer, who discussed it with them, and at the end of each month the diaries were sent to him at Oxford and he went over them and wrote to the forest officer if there was anything he was not satisfied with. That was done throughout the whole of the practical course. Until he met with an accident which interfered somewhat with his walking powers he invariably at the end of the course spent the last six weeks with the students, taking them to different districts to study certain conditions under his direct control. He did not see how a better control than that could be established unless a special officer was appointed to be with them throughout the whole year. During the last few years he had visited them every year, generally twice, in the Easter holidays and in the summer, and had made enquiries on the spot into the general condition of things and given them advice on their work. It was very important whilst the students were in the German forests that there should be at headquarters an officer who was thoroughly conversant with the language.

66727. With reference to the possibility of a change to the school-leaving age affecting recruitment, the witness stated that in the first two or three years after the change in 1905 was made there were very few applicants. In the first year after the change there were four candidates, two of whom qualified; in the second year there were two, of whom one qualified. Therefore a system of selection had to be devised, and he canvassed the university and obtained in that way the number of men required. During the last six years, when things had settled down, there had been more candidates than were required for the appointments, and there were a considerable number of others who had not taken a degree. For some 10 appointments there were 50 or 60 applicants every year, so that at present the field was quite wide enough.

66728. He considered the allowances which were given to candidates during their probationary period at present to be adequate. It was

calculated at the rate of £150 a year, which included about £30 for fees to the instructors while on practical work. That sum, he thought, would attract quite a sufficient number of applicants, because after all parents were expected to do something towards the education of their children.

66729. Assuming that the candidates were brought together in one university, and a course was arranged with regard to the requirements of India, it would naturally be expected that the Government should make some contribution. He could only speak of Oxford, and he thought he was justified in saying that Oxford would be quite ready to fall in with such an arrangement, and would be willing that the men selected as professors should be selected by a joint committee of the University and the India Office. If the India Office would find the salary of one officer he believed the university would find the remainder, but the matter would have to go before Convocation. When the Oxford University was given its congé by the Secretary of State in 1911 there were 26 forest students who were not probationers for India, and the university then had to make some arrangement for them.

66730. Two natives of India had passed through the course at Oxford and gone out to India as members of the Imperial Forest Service, one having been appointed to Madras and the other to Bombay. Seven others had been sent to Oxford from native States, and several had taken the diploma and a degree and joined the Forest Service of the native States. At the present moment there were four natives of India under instruction, two having been sent by native States and two coming of their own accord. One was 35 years of age. Some of these had done very well indeed.

66731. (Sir Murray Hammick.) With regard to men of the Provincial Service being allowed study leave for the purpose of attending a course of instruction in Europe, the witness said that out of the seven men who had gone back to India five were men who had been at Dehra Dun. They had been for some years in the service of native States and then had come to Oxford and taken the diploma, including the theoretical and the practical work. On the whole it was very useful for Indians to come to England, but a great deal depended upon how the forest teaching at Dehra Dun developed. Indians coming to Europe should do one of two things; they should either come to Oxford, or some other University, and go through the regular course, or be placed for six or nine months under a Continental forest officer who knew English. During the last ten years he had trained by the latter method upwards of 30 officers, quite apart from his Oxford work, for Colonial appointments. They went for three months to Kew to pick up the special botany of the country they came from, and then were placed under a German forest officer for a six months' course. In Ceylon and the Malay States the conditions of the Imperial staff had been improved and officers who were already in the Service were given the option of going through the course if they wished to be promoted to higher appointments. As things were at present arranged, ignorance of the French or German language by Provincial officers would not be an obstacle to their training to Europe for a six to nine months' training on the Continent.

66732. (Sir Valentine Chirch.) It is very difficult to say whether the two years' course at Oxford or the six or nine months' course on the Continent or an extended course at Dehra Dun should be made an essential condition for promotion from the Provincial Service to the Superior Service. If the Imperial Service of 220 members trained in Europe was kept up to the proper standard it would be better to extend and improve the school at Dehra Dun. On the whole he would rather improve the Dehra Dun course for the Provincial Service so long as the Imperial forest staff was kept up to the proper standard. The present Imperial staff recruited from Europe might be kept as at present, and if any additions were made there was no reason why they should not be made from men who had received an extended training at

5 May 1914.]

SIR WILLIAM SCHLICH.

[Continued.]

Dehra Dun, and who had proved by meritorious work afterwards that they deserved such promotion. It was not essential that a man belonging to the Provincial Service in India and promoted into the Superior Service should have practical training on the continent of Europe, as the 220 Imperial Service men recruited in England would furnish the European experience and provide the necessary teachers at Dehra Dun or other Indian schools. Such teachers should, however, be selected from the best men in the Service. If recruitment in Europe was cut off a very serious mistake would be made.

66733. (*Mr. Aldur Rahim.*) Most of the Indians who had been trained at Oxford did very well in their studies, and they also showed appreciation of the practical work they had to do, although they were not so good in practical work as they were in theoretical work. They generally did better in the theoretical examinations. He had had cases where a native of India had stood at or near the top in the theoretical work, but had not come out on top in the practical work, while others had done very well in practical work. He would not exclude Indians from the Imperial Service, but would make sure that they were fully qualified to enter it.

66734. He always took care to make it known to Indian students as well as European students that the Forest Service was open to them and was a profitable Service to study for. One reason why perhaps Indians did not go in so much for the Forest Service was that it was far more difficult to take the diploma in forestry than any other diploma at Oxford. There was a saying in Oxford that forest students had more work to do than any others. Many of the Indians who came to the university preferred something which was a little easier.

66735. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) It was absolutely necessary that forest students should go to the Continent for their practical work at present, as the development of forestry in Great Britain was not sufficiently far advanced to give the required training.

66736. He laid great emphasis upon a classical foundation for a forest officer's training. A student need not be a scholar in Latin, but he certainly should know a certain amount. Having regard to the fact that most of the public schools now had fairly well-equipped laboratories, it might be possible to include a certain quantity of chemistry and physics, and in any examination at the school-leaving age he should restrict the science part to those two subjects, especially chemistry. His long experience had shown him that the knowledge boys had on leaving school of botany, geology, and zoology did not help them very much. They had to go over the same ground again in a more satisfactory manner.

66737. (*Mr. Fisher.*) If boys were chosen at the school-leaving age and had to pass through a three-years' course in a forest school at one university he should give to those who had fulfilled the other conditions the chance of taking a science degree with their diploma. They would not all do it, but there would be probably men who had been already a year at the university and who had taken up chemistry and physics, and they ought to be given a chance of obtaining a degree, which they could do in three years. At Oxford there was an arrangement whereby a student taking the diploma was excused all preliminary examinations; in fact, if he took only Part I. of the diploma examination he was excused all the preliminary examinations for the science degree, and had only afterwards to take one subject for his final. For an intelligent boy it would not be an extra strain to take a degree in science as well as the diploma, but of course a three-years' residence would be required. Moreover, a student who had taken the diploma in forestry was excused two groups out of three for a pass degree.

66738. With regard to engineering training for forest officers, if an endeavour was made to make an engineer of a student he would probably turn out an indifferent forest officer. The course at present was pretty full, and even a boy who came at the

school-leaving age for three years had as much as he could do. Perhaps a little engineering might be added in connection with the construction of bridges, culverts, etc. That added to the course of instruction would increase the expense by about £20. If additional knowledge was required in road-making there would be an extra charge of about £50 or £60, because the instructors would have to be specially paid. In the early years, when forest officers did more engineering, he had received a complaint from the Head Conservator of Madras that the men who were being sent out were far more engineers than foresters.

66739. (*Mr. Sly.*) With regard to the comparative merits of training at Cooper's Hill and at Oxford, the witness on the whole was in favour of a university education, as it broadened men's minds. Cooper's Hill trained for three different branches of the Service, and in that way the men were brought into contact with each other. Training at a university developed men much better in the long run. At Oxford the students were first of all given a thorough grounding in the first year in botany, spending nine hours every week on that subject alone, also in geology, which was preceded by a certain amount of instruction in chemistry and physics for those who had not come with any knowledge of those subjects. In the second year they had another six hours a week in forest botany and nine hours a week in zoology, including forest entomology, etc. They were also given a certain amount of instruction in geometric drawing, engineering, and surveying, and those subjects were taught very well indeed. The course of instruction in forestry at Oxford was as high as ever it was at Cooper's Hill, and probably higher. Many of the men who were not probationers for India took, during the first two years, the diploma in forestry because that exempted them from a preliminary examination, and then in the third year they prepared for an honours degree in science. Out of the 33 who were not probationers for India and had taken the diploma, 13 had taken the science degree as well. Out of the 84 probationers for India, 51 had taken both the diploma and science degree, and 33 had taken only the diploma. If they had a chance they liked to go in for the science degree as well, especially natives of India.

66740. In the Oxford diploma course every facility was given for practical work. There were small excursions during term time and generally one excursion during the first year to French forests. That excursion usually lasted three weeks, and just gave them an idea in the middle of their course of the systematic management of forests. Then they had a minimum of six months on the Continent, generally in Germany, and sometimes in Switzerland. During that six months the professor of forestry had them under his supervision whether they were Indian or European students.

66741. Until within the last year or two probationers for India had done no extra work at all, but now that the Director of Indian Forest Studies had undertaken to supervise the practical course himself he was very likely to extend it, if he had not done so already. At Oxford they had some work in Indian botany and Indian geology and forest law in the ordinary forest course; for the probationers for India it was obligatory. If any additional course was necessary for students who had passed the ordinary Oxford school he would not have a general additional course all round, but would select men who showed a special tendency in a certain direction and give them some extra instruction in that line. To make men spend a great portion of their time on engineering when they might not have any engineering work to do throughout their lives would be a great waste, but those who took the extra course might be specially employed in forest engineering. The alternative to splitting them up in that manner would be to let them come home after some years service for the extra study.

66742. When the whole Department was transferred from Cooper's Hill to Oxford the India

5 May 1914.]

SIR WILLIAM SCHLICH.

[Continued.]

Office paid £397 a year for expenses, plus the salary of the professor and assistant professor, but now they paid nothing. When the Government withdrew their support there were 26 forest students at Oxford who had to be provided for in the middle of their course, and, as there was no endowment for a professorship, rather than see the whole thing broken up he offered to go on for a little while until arrangements could be made, even if no salary was paid to him at all. The University did not accept that and found £300 from what was called the Common University Fund, and appointed him as reader with the status of a professor. Then the Council sent a round-robin to the colleges, and a number of the colleges provided another £300 a year. When Mr. Caccia ceased to help in the instruction the Committee of the Chancellor's Fund provided another £250 for an assistant for three years. In order to put the thing on a more permanent basis he himself started an endowment fund for a professorship and up to date had received £4,000. At present the Oxford Forest School was on a temporary foundation, as the £4,000 was not sufficient to establish it permanently.

66743. It was essential in training officers for the Indian Forest Department at one university to have professors with Indian experience.

66744. Any control which might be exercised by

(The witness withdrew.)

A. M. CACCIA, Esq., M.V.O., Director of Indian Forest Studies.

Written Statement relating to the recruitment and training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service.

66748. (1) *RECRUITMENT.*—Experience has shown that there are two practicable methods of recruitment:—

(1) By competitive examination at school-leaving age from candidates with a good school education (in force from 1891-1904), and

(2) By selection at university-leaving age from candidates who have obtained a university degree in some branch of science.

66749. Under the latter method of recruitment, which is at present in force, candidates are obtained who have already received a good grounding in science, and who have received some training in scientific methods. Such candidates have already passed certain prescribed university examinations in science subjects. It is therefore possible to determine with greater certainty the qualifications of the candidates appearing for probationerships.

66750. As a result of the university training, the candidates so obtained are better able to assimilate and to follow the specialised forestry courses. On taking up their probationerships, such candidates have already reached a more responsible age. They are generally more anxious to learn, and almost without exception take a personal interest in their training. It is therefore possible to deal with the requirements of each probationer separately, without that constant personal control which is so necessary in the case of youths first joining a university with an assured appointment. The qualifications of such probationers at the time of their appointment, as regards a knowledge of forestry, are, however, very unequal. Thus, while some probationers have no knowledge of forestry, others may have more or less completed the course of theoretical instruction required for the forestry diploma at Oxford or Cambridge, or for the forestry degree at Edinburgh, etc. The probationers consequently require differential treatment both as regards their theoretical and practical forestry course. This greatly increases the difficulty of arranging for satisfactory probationary training, though the difficulty is by no means insurmountable.

The one objection which appears to have been almost unanimously raised against the present

the India Office would depend on the arrangements made by the Secretary of State with the university. His own idea was that there should be an arrangement between the university and the Secretary of State to determine who was to be the professor, and that professor should be certainly a man with an Indian experience.

66745. (*Mr. Chauhan.*) Out of the three years' probation he would not advise that any period should be spent in India. He would rather not send men out at all than send them out without proper training. After the probationary course in England they would go straight into the Service, the first year being spent in becoming acquainted with local conditions and local matters, as in all the other Services.

66746. He had spent 20 years in India and Burma, and had an extensive knowledge of the duties of Forest Officers in that country.

66747. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) He was not against a competitive examination, but it should be combined with a preliminary nomination. Men should be interviewed, and only those allowed to go on to the examination who were considered in other respects suitable for the Service. A system of nomination had been actually in force for about ten years now, and if there was an examination he should like the same system of preliminary nomination to continue.

method of recruiting from university graduates is the question of *age*. Probationers recruited at a university-leaving age are, at the time of their proceeding to India, somewhat older than when recruited at a school-leaving age, and though the difference is not very great, yet this occurs at a period in the officer's life when every additional year probably tells very seriously on his capability to adapt himself readily to the somewhat trying conditions of life in the Indian Forest Department. Moreover, late recruitment is more likely to lead to discontent later on, owing to the impossibility of reaching the Conservator grade. The remedy for this evil would appear, however, to be promotion to the administrative grades by "selection" instead of purely by "seniority," as at present.

66751. Recruitment from candidates at a university-leaving age would, in all cases, have to be followed by one or two years' additional special forestry training. Probationers so obtained would, therefore, have to undergo, firstly, a three or four-years' university training in order to obtain a science degree, followed by one or two years' special forestry training, as compared with three years' forestry training to be prescribed in the case of recruitment at school-leaving age. In both cases, the age at which candidates would, in the first instance, proceed to the university would be about the same.

66752. *Conclusion.*—The question of recruitment cannot be disassociated from the question of training. Considered independently, both methods of recruitment (whether at a university- or school-leaving age) possess certain important advantages, and both methods can be made, under certain conditions, to work satisfactorily. It is obvious, however, that youths recruited at a school-leaving age require constant personal supervision during the whole period of their training, and such supervision could only become possible when the probationers are all trained together at one centre under the direct control of a staff appointed for the purpose by the India Office.

66753. On the other hand, with recruitment at a university-leaving age, the candidates have already reached a more responsible age, and they may already have qualified in a number of the subjects prescribed in the forestry degree or diploma courses. Consequently, each candidate must be

5 May 1914.]

Mr. A. M. CACCIA.

[Continued.]

dealt with separately, and the necessity for bringing all the probationers together at one centre is not so insistent.

66754. (II) TRAINING OF PROBATIONERS.—To arrive at a correct conclusion on the subject of the training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service, due consideration should be given to the following points:—

(1) There is, at present, no thoroughly equipped School of Forestry in the British Isles where a satisfactory high-class training in Forestry, such as is required by the Indian probationers, can be given. The demand, in so far as home forestry is concerned, is, and for many years to come will continue to be, chiefly for elementary instruction suitable for agricultural students and others desiring appointments as land-agents, etc.

(2) Sufficient money is not at present available for the adequate organisation of the Forestry Schools at Oxford and Cambridge (which have been approved by the India Office), and, even granting that these schools will develop in the future, their development will proceed on the lines best suited to meet the requirements of home forestry, and not of Indian probationers.

(3) The theoretical instruction now given at Oxford and Cambridge is very unequal, and the Director of Indian Forest Studies has at present no power in any way to supervise or control these courses, although they constitute the essential basis for the practical training for which he is responsible. Inspection of a printed syllabus, moreover, obviously affords no criterion of the suitability or otherwise of a course of instruction.

(4) Apart from the fact that a generally higher standard of instruction is required, certain subjects which are not considered to be of importance to students of home forestry are considered to be necessary for Indian forest probationers. Such are Indian forest engineering, Indian geology and soils, systematic botany with special reference to the Indian forest flora, Indian forest working plans, forest law, silviculture of Indian trees, book-keeping.

(5) The Schools of Forestry at Oxford and Cambridge possess no provisions for giving instruction in practical forestry. Apart from this, however, work in and visits to selected continental forests under proper supervision are essential in the case of the Indian probationer. This practical training requires the closest personal supervision, and the University Readers in Forestry have no means of personally supervising the practical training of the probationers, even if they possess sufficient knowledge regarding suitable continental practical training grounds.

66755. It follows from the above that the instruction given at the universities will always have to be supplemented by special theoretical and practical instruction for which the India Office must make itself responsible. The exact manner in which this additional instruction should be given must, however, depend very largely on the method of recruitment, e.g., whether the probationers are recruited (i) at a university-leaving age or (ii) at a school-leaving age, and on the amount of special Indian theoretical courses which it may be considered necessary to prescribe for the Indian forest probationers, *vide* (4) above.

66756. (i) Recruitment at university-leaving age.—In this case the present arrangement of appointing a Director of Indian Forest Studies, who is responsible for the practical training of the Indian Forest Service probationers will continue to work satisfactorily, provided the Director is a good linguist and has been given an opportunity to acquire a thorough knowledge of suitable continental training grounds. Provided also that he has opportunities of keeping constantly in touch with the work going on abroad.

In addition to this, however, it is essential that the India Office should make suitable grants of money to the approved universities, contingent on the fulfilment of certain definite conditions to be laid down by the India Office. The vital points to be insisted on should be: (a) a voice in the selection of the University Forestry Instructor,

and (b) a right to inspect the schools and to insist on the special subjects required by the Indian forest probationers being taught in a satisfactory manner.

The annual grant to be made by the India Office would depend to a great extent on the special requirements of the India Office, and in some cases (e.g., instruction in Indian forest botany) a portion of the assistance to be rendered to the universities may take the form of a temporary instructor paid for and appointed by the India Office.

In this connection it may be mentioned that the necessity for prescribing a large number of special Indian subjects would appear to be open to question. It is suggested that many of these subjects (especially systematic botany of Indian trees, Indian geology, Indian forest working plans), could be far better dealt with by prescribing a departmental examination to be passed by recruits within a certain period of time after joining the Service in India. The recruits would, as a result of their training in England, be quite capable of carrying out these simple studies independently, in conjunction with any other work that might be given to them during their first year of service. On the other hand, provisions could easily be made, provided funds are supplied to the universities, to extend the course of studies in forest engineering, and in other selected subjects.

66757. (ii) Recruitment at a school-leaving age.—Under this method of recruitment, all the probationers without exception would, at the commencement of their probationary period, be on the same footing, and they would all be required to follow the same prescribed course of studies (e.g., as regards an approved curriculum). But, owing to the youth of the probationers, they would be required to be kept under proper control and supervision during the whole of their probationary period. This could only be done satisfactorily by establishing approved Indian Schools of Forestry at one or more centres. The exact constitution of a University Indian School of Forestry, as above contemplated, need not be entered into here; but in view of the fact that the University Professor of Forestry will always be required to devote himself more especially to home forestry and to the training (it may be of a very large number) of other than Indian forest probationers, and bearing in mind the necessity for the India Office to maintain some control over the management of such a school, the following scheme is suggested, namely:—

(i) The Director of Indian Forest Studies should be made responsible for the training, theoretical and practical, of the Indian Forest Service probationers. With this object in view, he should be attached to such university as may be prepared to agree to the establishment of an Indian School of Forestry, and to give the Director of Indian Forest Studies an official position in the university by recognising him as the University Professor for Indian Forestry.

(ii) The Indian Forest probationers, whilst under training, should then be placed under the orders of the Director of Indian Forest Studies who, in consultation with the university authorities, would prescribe the course of study in each subject to be followed by the Indian Forest probationers. Advantage would be taken as far as possible of the existing university lecture courses. But the Director of Indian Forest Studies himself would be required to give lectures in Indian forestry and to arrange for special lectures in other subjects as required.

(iii) The Director of Indian Forest Studies would be responsible for the practical training of the Indian forest probationers.

(iv) The Director of Indian Forest Studies should only be permitted to lecture to Indian Forest Service probationers, to Indian students, and to such other students from India as may be deputed by the Government of India. He should not be permitted to take part in the training of other university students.

(v) The above arrangement would necessarily entail the training of all the Indian Forest Service

5 May 1914.]

Mr. A. M. CACCIA.

[Continued.]

probationers at one and the same university, unless a Director or Assistant Director of Indian Forest Studies is appointed at each of the selected universities. In view of the small number of probationers annually appointed, it appears difficult to justify the latter procedure.

(v) The period of training, including the practical training, should be three years.

66755. Conclusion.—It would appear that two methods of recruitment and training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service are possible, viz.:-

(i) Recruitment by competitive examination at school-leaving age from candidates with a good (modern side) school education, followed by a three years' course of training at an approved Indian School of Forestry to be established at one (or more) university centres, under the direct control of the India Office. The three-years' course of training to include the necessary (Continental) practical training under the closest personal supervision. In view of the small number of probationers annually recruited, the establishment and endowment by the India Office of more than one Indian School of Forestry could not be justified. It is essential for the success of this method of training that the probationers should, during the whole of their probationary period, be kept under careful control.

(ii) Recruitment by selection at university-leaving age from candidates who have passed some recognised university science examination. Candidates so recruited will require individual attention, both as regards their further theoretical and practical training. This can be given by an officer specially appointed for the purpose by the India Office (e.g., a Director of Indian Forest Studies), who would be responsible for the practical training of the probationers, and also for arranging the course of studies to be followed by the probationers at the approved centres. Further, in order that the theoretical training of the probationers at the selected centres may be satisfactorily given, it is essential that certain grants be made to the approved universities, contingent on the fulfilment of certain definite conditions to be laid down by the India Office.

66756. Though both methods are practicable, I am personally, on the whole, in favour of recruitment at a school-leaving age, followed by a regular prescribed three-years' course of studies at one centre for the reason (i) that recruits will proceed to India at an earlier age, (ii) that much of the best material for the Forest Department which was obtained under the older regulations will no longer be excluded owing to the fact that many parents cannot afford the expense of a university education with no certainty of an appointment at its close, and (iii) that it would be possible then to arrange for an approved university course of study, applicable to all probationers alike, and confined merely to those subjects which bear immediate application to a forestry training.

It must be clearly understood, however, that in my opinion the balance turns in favour of

this scheme only on the distinct understanding (a) that a satisfactory Indian School of Forestry can be established at one university centre on a sound, permanent footing, a controlling voice in the management of the same being retained by the India Office; (b) that suitable provisions can be made for the supervision of the probationers during their course of training; and (c) that satisfactory arrangements are made for the carrying out of the practical training under the closest personal supervision.

Otherwise, if these vital conditions cannot be fulfilled, recruitment from university graduates, with its undoubted inconveniences, should be continued, for the reason that better material is obtained, and the graduate has sufficient experience to enable him to profit from a further university training without constant personal supervision, except as regards the practical course.

66760. (III) APPOINTMENT OF PROBATIONERS.—(i) Recruitment at school-leaving age.—Recruitment should be by competitive examination, so arranged as to cover all those subjects which a boy who has received a good modern-side education may be expected to know. Experience has shown that no useful purpose is served by introducing a large number of science subjects in an entrance examination designed for candidates recruited at school-leaving age.

(ii) Recruitment at university-leaving age.—Recruitment should be by selection from candidates who have passed some recognised university science examination. At the present moment this is confined to candidates (i) who have obtained a degree in natural science in a university of Great Britain or Ireland, and (ii) to graduates in forestry at the University of Edinburgh. It is possible that the field of recruitment may in the future be advantageously extended to candidates who have obtained university degrees in the applied sciences.

66761. Regulations or suggestions as to the manner in which selection should be exercised would appear to be called for. At the present moment, the greatest stress appears to be laid on academic, scientific attainments, physical qualifications being only given secondary consideration, and a desire generally appears to exist to apportion the appointments as far as possible to various university centres.

I would suggest that in making selections from university graduates for probationers in the Indian Forest Service attention should be paid, first and foremost, to the candidates "personality," and, secondly, to academic qualifications. Under the first head (personality) I would include—

- (a) Experience in dealing with fellow students (e.g., captains and secretaries of athletic and social clubs, etc.);
- (b) Physique (e.g., share taken in games, athletics, etc.);
- (c) Possession of a sense of discipline (e.g., membership of the O.T.C. or School Cadet Corps, etc.);
- (d) Indian connections.

Mr. A. M. CACCIA, called and examined.

66762. (Chairman.) The witness occupied the position of Director of Indian Forest Studies, which he had held for two and a-half years. It was a five years' appointment. Previously he had spent 23 years in India in the Indian Forest Service. For three years he had been at Dehra Dun as instructor, four years at the Research Institute, and for nine months was President of the Research Institute and College at Dehra. Altogether he had spent seven years at the Research Institute and 16 years in divisional work as an ordinary Forest Officer. His main duty now was to carry out the practical course of training, to consult with the students about their theoretical training, and to supplement the training which they received at the universities. At the present moment there were men at Cambridge and at Oxford, but none

had yet been allowed to go to Edinburgh after being selected as probationers, as Edinburgh insisted on a three years' course and the Department wished to have a two years' course. Men could be taken from Edinburgh when they came up with their Forestry degree for appointment as probationers, but none had yet been selected. He understood that in the present year there would be three or four candidates from Edinburgh. He had not visited the Edinburgh School lately, but he understood it was not sufficiently equipped to meet the requirements of the Department, and the training there would have to be supplemented by practical training on the Continent.

66763. The average age at which men went to India now was 24, but in future it would vary between 23 and 24. The particular course they

5 May 1914.]

Mr. A. M. CACCIA.

[Continued.]

now underwent would enable men to go out at 23. Under the present regulations when a man had already done part of his forestry course his subsequent course on appointment as probationer could be cut down to one year instead of two.

66764. At present there were two men at Cambridge and two more Cambridge men were undergoing practical training. The syllabus at Oxford and that at Cambridge was exactly the same, but the question was how far the syllabus was followed. Cambridge was now in a transition stage; certain new regulations were before the Senate to establish the school on a proper basis. The great trouble at all the universities was the question of funds.

66765. Apart from the supervision that he had over the probationers in the different institutions, he had also to accompany them on their tours abroad. At present the practical course consisted of two parts. In the first part they had to learn the conditions of one particular forest division, and for that purpose they stayed about three or four months in one place and were directly under the orders of the Forest Officer, himself visiting them and staying with them for a certain time, but not the whole time. In the second part, when the students visited particular places, he went with them if it could possibly be managed. It was always necessary to have someone looking after the students and supervising their work in the forests in Germany, as otherwise they were liable to waste their time. Now that a Director of Indian Forest Studies had been appointed there would be always someone to assist them in their work. He did not think that the continuous presence of the Director was so necessary during the first part of the practical training provided that the men the students were sent to were carefully selected. The selection of the men under whom the students were placed was made by himself, and he was in touch with many of the leading Forest Officers in Germany.

66766. The total time occupied in the tours varied between seven and eight months. For about three or four months they were allowed to remain in one place and for three or four months they were visiting different places. They were not abroad continuously, because the practical training in most cases was now done in the vacations. In the summer vacation the students could be abroad for two and a half months, but at Christmas and Easter only for five weeks. He thought the period was quite adequate. In details it was always possible to go on making improvements, particularly in the selection of new training grounds, but generally the practical course was as good as it could be made.

66767. On the whole, balancing the two forms of recruitment, he favoured that at the school-leaving age provided an Indian School of Forestry was provided. That would mean a change in the present system which had been in force for about two years. Every change naturally dislocated recruitment for a certain time. Whether more recruits would be obtained at the school-leaving age depended altogether on what the cost would be after recruitment. If recruitment was made at the school-leaving age a number of candidates would be obtained who would otherwise not have been able to go up to a university on the chance of obtaining an appointment, whereas in recruiting graduates there would be a number who had taken a science degree and made up their minds to go in for the Forest Department. If the training expenses were covered probably more candidates would be obtained at the school-leaving age. His only reason for advocating a change was that it might be possible to obtain a proper school of forestry, such as was required by the Indian probationers, which he saw grave doubts of obtaining under the present conditions. Under the system now in force, if the candidates were graduates, the instruction given at the universities could be supplemented, but he believed there would never be a proper school of forestry within reasonable time unless the India Office assisted in establishing one. He laid very great stress on a school of forestry

for India definitely controlled and subsidised by the India Office, and if such a school was established it would be absolutely necessary to go back to the school-leaving age, as if recruitment was made from graduates men would be obtained who had already done forestry courses elsewhere. A man who had taken a forestry degree at Edinburgh could not be asked to proceed to Oxford or Cambridge and go through a two or three years' course at that university. Young men taken at the school-leaving age had done no forestry and therefore could be sent to an approved school. He had no objection to the India Office establishing three or four forestry schools, but it was a question of whether it was worth while to run three good schools for twelve men. He did not think one school would limit the area of selection if the recruitment was at the school-leaving age.

66768. With regard to allowances during the probationary period, if the candidates were recruited at the school-leaving age £100 a year might be sufficient, but that would probably limit the number of recruits. He calculated that the expenses of training in forestry at the university could not possibly be less than £175 to £200 a year, including the continental practical course. Therefore to cover the whole of the expenses the allowance would have to be £200, but the recruits might well be expected to pay half of that themselves.

66769. With reference to the cost of a school of Indian Forestry at Oxford, two professors were formerly paid for by the India Office, including their travelling allowance, which was a very important point, and in addition there was a grant of about £500. At that time the grant was not nearly enough, although it might be sufficient now, as the university required to have a School of Forestry apart from the India Office. The actual cost of establishing an Indian Forest School could only be settled by going into details, but roughly it might be said to correspond with the pay of two professors, with an additional £500 a year.

66770. There were certain things that might be better learned in India than in England, as, for example, forest engineering in certain practical directions, and that was becoming an essential element in forest work, especially in connection with roads. He had made inquiries at Oxford and Cambridge, and he thought that for an additional £100 or £150 a year it would be possible to obtain all the forest engineering required.

66771. The remark in his written statement that the Director of Indian Forest Studies should be made responsible for the training, theoretical and practical, of the Indian Forest Service probationers was not intended to mean that he must himself give the instruction, but that he must supervise. His position would be rather like that of a tutor at a university, and he would see that the students did what they ought to do.

66772. It was of great importance that there should be officers of Indian experience in the forest school.

66773. (Lord Ronaldshay.) In recruiting at the school-leaving age it was difficult to have any form of selection. Under the present system the candidates had been to the university for three years more or less on their own responsibility, and had passed recognised public examinations, and therefore there was a good deal to go on as to their suitability, whereas if candidates were recruited from public schools it would be more difficult to apply the method of nomination. With an open competitive examination, and no previous nomination, there was a possibility of a certain number of candidates being successful who would not be considered suitable in other respects. That was what happened during the whole time of recruitment at Cooper's Hill. He was certainly in favour of selection if any suitable scheme could be worked out, but he saw difficulties in devising a feasible scheme at the school-leaving age. He would reject a candidate subsequent to the examination if he did not follow the course prescribed for him. He laid much stress on selection when dealing with recruitment at the university.

5 May 1914.]

Mr. A. M. Caesar.

[Continued.]

leaving age, because at that time it was possible to judge, but for school boys he did not see how it was to be managed.

66774. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) There were several arguments against probation at Dehra Dun if boys were chosen at the school-leaving age. In India the forests were being developed from their abnormal condition into a more normal condition and the transformation would occupy a very large number of years and there was no place in India where it was now possible to see the objects and results of a fully-developed system of forest management. There was also the objection that it would not be good to take schoolboys and send them out to India for training.

66775. A forest officer should have a sound scientific training, which could be better acquired at the universities. Summing up briefly, the forests in India were not suitable for demonstration purposes, scientific training in Dehra Dun could not be made equal to that of the training of the universities, and it was undesirable that boys should go out to India for their preliminary training. No doubt professors could be sent out to Dehra Dun, but even then there would not be the scientific atmosphere which was to be found in the universities in England.

66776. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had heard the opinion expressed by Sir William Schlich that the scientific course of forestry for the Oxford diploma at present was a higher standard than that which used to be given at Cooper's Hill. The forestry course as established at Oxford by the India Office on the abolition of Cooper's Hill was a forestry course such as he himself contemplated for an Indian School of Forestry. The kind of course that Sir William Schlich spoke about was the course that had been arranged by the India Office, i.e., a school equipped and financed and controlled by the India Office, as Oxford was up to a few months ago. Owing to the generosity and public spirit of Sir William Schlich, who was willing to continue that course at Oxford without payment, the School of Forestry at Oxford was in existence at present, but should Sir William Schlich disappear the school would in all probability disappear also. That was what he meant when he said that no thoroughly equipped School of Forestry existed at the present moment.

66777. The ordinary diploma course followed by the various students, irrespective of Indian requirements, did not include Indian subjects, which were optional. The witness put in the syllabuses of Edinburgh, Oxford and Cambridge, which he said were all practically alike.* In the case of Cambridge and Oxford, all the Indian subjects were optional. They were taught in a way, though he did not think the word "taught" could at the present moment in all cases be used in its literal meaning except in connection with Oxford.

66778. The practical course of training followed by students of the Oxford school on the Continent was not satisfactory on account of lack of supervision. Sir William Schlich had an enormous knowledge of forests in Germany and a great acquaintance with German forest officers, and therefore could arrange a quite satisfactory course, but in the hands of any other Professor the whole thing would most probably collapse. If supervision was required on the part of the university Professor of Forestry it would be necessary to pay his travelling expenses, and there was no money at the university to do that. Then again, he thought it would be found that the university Professor of Forestry would not always be prepared to give up the whole of his vacations to go abroad in order to superintend the studies of probationers unless he was paid for doing so.

66779. With regard to the suggestion that the Indian Forest Service should be recruited from candidates who had qualified in forestry by taking a diploma at a recognised school, very few persons would be found to go to a university and study forestry, because there was no employment for them at the present moment. The number of pri-

vate students taking the diploma in forestry was exceedingly small. There was an arrangement at Oxford whereby the science subjects of the forestry diploma course could be taken as a preliminary for a science degree, and consequently any man who had a liking for forestry or a desire to enter the Forest Service might take the preliminary course for his science subjects in forestry, and that tended to swell the number taking the forestry course, but the students did not go on to the diploma unless they were appointed probationers, except in the case of one or two Rhodes scholars.

66780. The probation necessary to qualify men who were recruited at the university age and had taken the diploma in forestry would be one year, which would be sufficient to give the additional theoretical instruction required in Indian subjects plus the additional practical instruction required on the Continent.

66781. His scheme contemplated that one of the professors at the university would be appointed and paid for by the India Office. There was a parallel for such a proceeding, as a certain number of professors at universities were appointed and paid for by outside bodies. There were several cases in which the university accepted subventions from bodies subject to certain conditions. Up to a few months ago there were two Professors of Forestry appointed and paid for by the India Office, and he thought the university would agree to a scheme of that kind. The supervisor would not be able to dictate to the universities, but would be there more or less as a tutor, and if any special lectures were required he could arrange for them, the India Office paying. The cost to the India Office would not be very much greater than it was at present, because they already employed a Director of Forest Studies. It was a great pity that the whole scheme should be spoilt for a few pounds. Large sums of money were spent on training for the Provincial Service, and he did not see why something should not be done for the training of Imperial officers.

66782. Amongst the conditions of service that specially influenced the decision of candidates for the Forestry Department, he should think the chief consideration was initial salary. Men required enough to live on when they went out to India, and that was the first thing they looked at. Also they would like to come home fairly early for their first leave, the present limit of eight years' service being rather too long. There was also an impression that the present rates of pension were not sufficient. In some cases the fact that they could take a pension at 20 years' service was looked upon very favourably, as most men thought it very nice to be able to retire after 20 years' service, although very few of them were able to do it when the time came. The abolition of the 20 years' rule would not affect recruitment substantially, but the rule was a very cheap inducement as very few could afford to retire on £300 a year.

66783. (*Mr. Fisher.*) On the balance of considerations, he was in favour of recruitment at the age of 19; assuming that an Indian School of Forestry was established. Considering recruitment simply, he thought better men were obtained as graduates, and there was more certainty in the officers thus obtained. Assuming that recruitment was at 19, if an exceptionally good man was obtained it would be better for him to take an honours school as well, but he did not think all men could do it. If they could, he would be in favour of it. In view of the fact that a large part of the forestry course really coincided with scientific studies taught in the universities, it would be an economy for the forest school to make as much use as possible of the course. To obtain an honours degree at Oxford it was necessary to specialise during the last year in one subject, and it required a very good man to be able to specialise in that subject in addition to such other subjects as might be included in the forestry course. He had a probationer now, who, in addition to the forestry course, had taken up the botany school and had

* Not printed.

5 May 1914.]

Mr. A. M. CACCIA.

[Continued.]

obtained a first-class certificate, and that was a thing he would encourage.

66784. A probationer recruited at the school-leaving age would require a great deal more supervision than was required under the present regulations. Most undergraduates when they came up to the universities, especially if they had an appointment in their pockets, were apt to sow their wild oats during the first year or two, and they might come a crash in their examination. The temptations would be greater than they would be at such a place as Cooper's Hill.

66785. He was decidedly in favour of direct appointments of Indians to the Imperial Service rather than by promotion from the Provincial Service. To begin with, he did not think the Provincial Service in the past had been getting quite the right stamp of man required for Imperial appointments. If men were promoted from the Provincial Service the question would arise as to how long a man would have to wait before being sent to England for his training. A man who had been a long time in the Provincial Department could not be expected to make a good Imperial officer, although there might be some exceptions. Selection was always a matter of difficulty, but if a system of proper selection could be devised he would be in favour of bringing some Provincial men to England and putting them through a practical training, which was very necessary before they entered the Imperial Service. That practical training would have to be on the Continent. He had not had much experience of Indians recruited to the Imperial Service. One man was recruited last year and had gone out in the present year, but had somewhat broken down in health during his course of training.

66786. (Chairman.) There was no supervision by the Director of Indian Forest Studies of the men sent over from the native States.

66787. (Mr. Macdonald.) He could not speak with any decided authority as to what was being done at Edinburgh at the present time, as the course there had been rearranged. It was a three-years' course, and the last five months of it was carried out on the Continent. It was only in the sense that no Forestry School in Great Britain was as yet complete on its practical side that he said Edinburgh was not fully equipped, although he could not speak with authority regarding the theoretical training at Edinburgh.

66788. In Germany every stage of education was controlled by Government, so that a boy was obliged to go through certain definite stages, the standard of which was set by Government. A man going in for the Forest Service in Germany would have to reach a stage corresponding to the university stage. In Bavaria students had to go to a forestry school at a university. In Prussia there were special forestry schools not connected with the university. There was a great controversy at the present moment in Germany as to whether the forestry school should be at a university or at a separate centre. In Saxony the school was separate. The courses lasted about four years, and the students had also to go to a university for lectures on law and subjects connected with jurisprudence. In Germany also the students were permitted to change about from one school to another. Very many of them took two years at one forestry school and another year at another school. The course was a lengthy one, and all the recruits had to reach the same standard of qualification.

66789. (Mr. Abdur Rahim.) There were no fully developed forests in India for the purpose of demonstration, but there was no reason why a student should not obtain a very good theoretical training in India. He believed the theoretical training at Dehra Dun was quite good enough for the Provincial Service, though not good enough for the Imperial Service. It was defective, for instance, in the study of management, valuation, finance, and similar subjects, which were very important points from the fully trained forest officer's point

of view. Then again, a large number of different methods of management had been worked out in various parts of Europe, and they had to be observed in connection with the lectures. It was of little value lecturing to beginners on forestry subjects unless examples could be shown. The theoretical and practical training might be separated to some extent, but not altogether. Taking as an example the group system of regenerating forests, it was quite possible to lecture on the subject, but if proper examples could not be shown the lecture was largely wasted. At the present moment, in the case of the Universities, in one term lectures were given on certain cultural systems, and when the students next went abroad they went into the forests and were shown examples, and had to write reports. That would not be a practicable system in India, and consequently the only course at present for Indian students would be to come to Europe. He did not think a system of scholarships would bring about a very large increase in the number of Indian forestry students, as forest life did not on the whole appeal to them, and probably the pay of the Service was not as good as they could get elsewhere.

66790. He believed Indian students were quite well aware that a career was open to them in the Forest Service.

66791. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) It might be that in thinking of the Provincial Service he was thinking of it rather as it had been in the past than as it had been since the course at Dehra Dun had been re-organised, and to that extent the answers he had given had to be modified.

66792. When acting as Director in India he insisted very strongly on having direct appointments to the Provincial Service, as it was impossible to get good men by promoting rangers who had reached an advanced age, as was then the normal practice.

66793. He did not think that for years past the various Governments of Germany had devoted an enormous amount of thought and study to the promotion of forestry education; the greatest advancement had been brought about by forestry experts themselves, people like Hartig and Heyer, who had done a tremendous work in establishing the training on a proper basis. Undoubtedly forestry training had been recognised and encouraged by the State, as all education in Germany was encouraged.

66794. (Sir Murray Hammick.) The final position of probationers was not entirely governed by the marks obtained in the final examination. Fifty per cent. was given for practical work and 50 per cent. for the final written and oral examination. The marks for the practical course were largely based upon reports of work the men had done abroad. For instance, the students had to make a working plan and received marks for that, and they had to write reports on specific subjects they had studied. They received no marks for class work, which was somewhat of a drawback under the present system, but as long as there were men at Cambridge and men at Oxford it was impossible to place a proper value on any marks, even if the universities would give marks. At the end of the course a special examination was held by an Examining Board consisting of two forest officers on leave and the witness himself, and the candidates had to pass that examination in addition to the university examinations.

66795. (Chairman.) The Director, proposed in his scheme ought to be made a professor of the university, as that would give him more power of supervision. At the present moment, according to his orders, he was not supposed to supervise or control the courses of studies at the Universities. It would be necessary for the Director to have up-to-date experience. He did not think there would be any difficulty whatever in having an official with this status at the university. Already professors of Indian law were there, and there was someone, he believed, looking after the Indian civilians.

(The witness withdrew.)

5 May 1914.]

At the India Office, London, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.

SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

MANADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.

ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., O.I.E. } Joint Secretaries.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq.

Sir J. D. LATOUCHE,* K.C.S.I., Member of the India Council, called and examined.

66796. (Chairman.) The witness said he had been Chairman of the Selection Committee for the Forest Department for the last three or four years. 66797. He thought the present system of recruitment was working very well, the chief difficulty being that men went out to India too old. Men recruited at the age of 25 or later did not adapt themselves readily to Indian conditions, and did not easily accept the position of a subordinate. For all the Services he thought it would be a good thing if men came out not later than 23, but he could not say that it would be a good thing to take boys from school and send them out to India at a very early age. Under the present arrangements men were obtained who had been up to the University. It was suggested at one time that more value might be given to a diploma in forestry, and if that was done he did not think it was necessary to keep the men on probation so long. If it could be arranged to reduce the probation in England on account of the fact that the men had been doing in the universities the kind of work they would do on probation, then he thought they could be sent out to India earlier, or at the same time they might take a higher course of education in the universities before they came up for selection or examination. It was necessary to have a certain amount of practical experience on the Continent, but he believed a year would be enough.

66798. All the Committees with which he had had to deal had included a retired Forest Officer, and they had been generally up-to-date in their knowledge of India. In choosing candidates an endeavour was made to obtain men who were suited both by physique and character for the particular Service and men who would take kindly to the hardships of a lonely forest life. The Committee had nothing to do with their intellectual qualities. The Committee examined the certificates which were given to the candidates before seeing them, and when the candidates came up inquired into their record in the way of games, and noticed whether they were manly in appearance and likely to do well. Men who were accustomed to judge of men could make up their minds on questions of that kind very quickly. The candidates were classified in three grades, A, B, and C, and when all the candidates had been seen the Committee compared their notes and generally found no difficulty in discovering the best men of the lot. The medical test came afterwards, but the Committee had nothing

to do with that. At one time there was a walking test and a riding test and the latter was still taken into consideration. The former physical test was a very good thing, as it showed that a man was vigorous.

66799. It was not a function of the Committees to keep themselves in personal touch with the Appointments Boards of the universities. The present rule was that no one could come before the Committee unless he had taken his degree, and a list of all the candidates who had taken degrees was made up. During the last few years, there had only been about five appointments a year and about 20 candidates had appeared each year. If the number of candidates was larger the system of selection would be rather difficult. There was a rule by which candidates could be made to pass a competitive examination, but that rule had never been exercised as there was no real difficulty in coming to a final decision without the further test of an examination.

66800. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) It was important that the candidates should show they had taken a keen interest in things connected with country pursuits.

66801. Mr. Abdur Rahim.) No Indian had been appointed by the Secretary of State to serve on the Committee. Mr. Caeccia was always appointed, or Sir William Schlich, and generally the Chairman of the Revenue Committee, an ex-Forest Officer who knew the class of men required, and also someone from the Home Civil Service. He certainly thought it would be an advantage to have an Indian on certain Committees.

66802. (Mr. Sly) The Ex-Forest Officer was a man who had had recent Indian experience.

66803. The number of Indian candidates for the Forest Service did not exceed three a year at the outside.

66804. (Sir Theodore Morison.) The Selection Committee was appointed every year, and was not a standing Committee. They merely made recommendations to the Secretary of State which the Secretary of State could accept or not as he chose. He thought there would be a little difficulty in getting a representative of the universities to serve on the Committee.

66805. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) The Secretary of State sometimes modified the recommendations of the Committee to a slight extent.

(The witness withdrew.)

* This witness did not submit a written statement.

17 June 1914.]

At the India Office, London, Wednesday, 17th June, 1914.

PRESENT:—

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
 SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
 SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
 SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
 MAHADEN BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.

ARDUR RAHIM, Esq.
 GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.
 WALTER CULLY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
 FRANK GEORGE SLX, Esq., M.P.
 JAMES RAMESAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. } Joint Secretaries.
 R. R. SCOTT, Esq. }

WILLIAM DAWSON, Esq., University Reader in Forestry, University of Cambridge.

Written Statement* relating to forestry teaching at Cambridge University, and also to the selection and training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service.

66806. *Description of Course of Study, etc.*—The course for the Diploma in Forestry extends over two years. It has recently been re-organised, and considerably extended, and is now conducted on the modern line of training adopted at the old established Forest Schools and University Departments in Germany. The examinations for the Diploma are held in two parts. For Part I the subjects are:—

- (a) Principles of Forestry.
- (b) Forest Botany, Part I.
- (c) Silviculture.
- (d) Forest Entomology, Part I.
- (e) Forest Engineering and Surveying, and
- (f) Geology.

In Part II the subjects are:—

- (a) Forest Management.
- (b) Forest Botany.
- (c) Forest Utilisation.
- (d) Forest Protection, and
- (e) Forest Entomology.

Candidates must also have devoted a minimum period of six months to Practical Forestry in a forest. Arrangements have been made for part of this practical work taking place on an estate in England, where it will be carried out under the direction of the school. Part of the time may also be spent on the continent, where specified work will be done under approved direction. The whole course is designed to give a thorough training in the theory and practice of forestry, on which there may be superimposed the special technical knowledge demanded by the practice of forestry under any conditions.

66807. The School of Forestry at Cambridge occupies buildings which have been erected by the University at a cost of £7,500. They contain lecture rooms, laboratories, research rooms, an Indian Forestry room, a library, a workshop, and private rooms for lecturers. The building is well adapted for the work and is now in process of being equipped.

The school has the advantage of the uses of the University Botanic Gardens, which are excellently equipped with specimens of all the common trees, native and exotic, and also with many of the rarer species. Arrangements have been made for the starting of a small forest nursery adjoining the Gardens in the coming season. In the neighbourhood of Cambridge there is a variety of woodlands, partly in the hands of some of the Cambridge colleges, and partly privately owned, which are used for excursions with the students throughout the course.

The school is already actively engaged in research work in various branches of forestry. Several bulletins have been published within the

last year, and others are in preparation. Investigations on a number of subjects are now in progress, but they have not yet been long enough on hand for definite conclusions to be formed.

66808. The staff of the school consists of:—

Reader in Forestry (Silviculture, Forest Management, Forest Botany, etc.)—W. Dawson, M.A.

Lecturer in Forest Utilisation, and Director of Timber Research.—E. R. Burdon, M.A.

Lecturer in Botany.—F. T. Brooks, M.A.

Lecturer in Entomology.—C. Warburton, M.A.

Lecturer in Engineering.—R. H. Adie, M.A.

Lecturer in Indian Forestry.—H. Jackson.

Lecturer in Indian Geology.—T. D. la Touche.

Assistant Investigator in Timber.—A. P. Long, B.A.

Adviser in Forestry.—Charles Hankins.

66809. *Special Provisions for Indian Forestry.*—The University of Cambridge has conformed with the regulations issued by the India Office on 2nd February, 1911, which took effect as regards probationers selected in or after 1912.

A Lecturer on Indian Forestry was appointed on 14th May, 1912, to give lectures on Indian Silviculture, Indian Trees, and Indian Forest Law. Mr. H. Jackson, ex-Conservator of Forests in India, was appointed to the position. He has recently completed 25 years' service in different parts of India, and was engaged for three years at the College at Dehra Dun as Deputy-Director, and principal Instructor in Forestry. The University has recently raised the status of the post to that of University Teacher. Mr. T. D. la Touche, an ex-member of the Indian Geological Survey, gives special courses of lectures on Indian Geology for Indian Forest students.

Special collections of materials for the teaching of Indian Forestry have been formed, or are in course of formation. There is an exceptionally good series of Indian timbers in four-feet planks, and the herbarium will be completed before long. A room in the new Forestry School is set aside for the Indian Forestry work, and will be used for the special teaching needed for this branch. These arrangements have been made, and the collections formed, by the University out of the general funds of the Forestry School, since the present regulations issued by the India Office took effect three years ago. The Forestry Committee of the University further contemplate extension of the general teaching in directions which will have a direct bearing on Indian Forestry. This applies specially to the course in Forest Engineering.

66810. *Selection of Probationers.*—The best type of forestry student is found to be the man who has already received a broad education, and who has studied a variety of subjects, preferably not science subjects. His mind is trained, and he approaches the subject from the proper point of view, and learns quickly.

For the Forest Service, either in India or at home, the best type of man can be got from those who have had a chance of proving themselves at

* See also Appendix XI.

17 June 1914.]

MR. WILLIAM DAWSON.

[Continued.]

general work, and then by inclination have taken up the study of forestry. Under a system by which the probationers were selected, on leaving school, candidates would come forward not so much on their own choice, as on the recommendations of their teachers. The candidate at the early age would not be qualified to exert his own judgment, and might start a course of training for specialised work, which he would afterwards find he was not suited for, and might even cordially dislike, and the fact of his having taken a specialised training, before he has completed a broad general education, would place him at a grave disadvantage in other work. Thus there is the chance of harm, both to the Service, and to the individual. Candidates who have already received a wide general University education are likely to benefit more by the specialised training in forestry, and also, from the greater breadth of education, to make better officials.

66811. The system of selecting from men who have so far proved themselves during their University course gives a much bigger selection, and the field might with advantage be still farther opened by accepting as a qualification a degree in branches other than natural sciences. Many men who are eminently suited to forestry work start their University careers in subjects other than natural sciences, and before they can fulfil the present conditions have passed the age limit.

The objection is often raised to the present system of selection and training that the men are too old before reaching India. This seems to be based on the fact, not that it makes for inefficiency in the Service, but that under the present pensions scheme individuals often have difficulty in putting in the period of service which entitles them to the full pension before they arrive at the age at which they are compulsorily superannuated.

66812. As far as the centre at which the special forestry training is given is concerned the matter is not of importance, provided the school at which the training is given is efficient. The advantage of accepting existing centres is that the training can be got from the organisation which the Universities are providing. The courses of instruction for any diploma or certificate in Forestry ought to aim at the inculcation of the general principles

of the science of forestry and not merely at the teaching of rules and precepts which will suit any particular set of circumstances. The latter is apt to happen at any institution set up for a special purpose, and all the more so when the students in attendance are young. The existence of more than one possible centre of training also makes for increased efficiency in the individual institutions, and affords an enormous convenience to the probationers, many of whom have associations with one or other of the many British universities.

66813. From the point of view of a School of Forestry the reduction in the number of students resulting on their withdrawal from the school would be comparatively insignificant, but the fact remains that the schools are now in existence, and are firmly established, and are becoming steadily more efficient and thorough. They thus provide a means by which the men for any special Service can receive their general training, and, in addition, Cambridge University, out of its own funds, has made special provision for the complete training of the probationers for the Indian Service. If it were decided that probationers were not to receive their training in the University, the school would thus be left with special teachers and special equipment which are not required in the general work of the school.

Already six probationers have received their training at Cambridge.

66814. Under the present system:—

(i) A large selection of suitable candidates is available.

(ii) The men receive a broad education and are likely to make good officials.

(iii) The probationers have the advantage of the teaching in complete Forestry Schools established and being developed by the Universities, besides of the special teaching which these institutions have provided voluntarily to meet their special needs.

(iv) The objection to the comparatively late age at which probationers proceed to India, not being founded on any suggestion that this is detrimental to the Service, but on the ground that the men themselves suffer some disadvantage as regards pensions, can be met by altering the present pensions scheme.

Mr. WILLIAM DAWSON,

66815. (Chairman.) The witness was University Reader in Forestry at Cambridge University, to which post he was appointed in May last year. He was in charge of the school, which was founded seven years ago, but which had been completely re-organised within the last 12 months, new courses and a new diploma having been instituted. A sum of £7,500 had been spent by the University on buildings and equipment within the last year.

66816. The number of students had never been large. From the books he found that the average number was about 10 or 11; at the present time there were 10 students, but he knew of a large number who were coming up next year, and the prospect was hopeful.

66817. Since the present regulations for recruitment to the Indian Forest Service came into force six probationers had gone to Cambridge for their training, i.e., an average of two per annum.

66818. Mr. Jackson, an ex-Conservator of Forestry in India, had been recently appointed as Lecturer on Indian Silviculture. Mr. Jackson left the Service about three years ago. The witness had general charge of the students preparing for the Indian Service, Mr. Jackson merely giving the special lectures instituted for Indian probationers.

66819. Formerly the men took their practical work mostly abroad, and the school did not undertake the actual direction of the work, but he was now instituting a system by which, on an estate of which he had charge, the men could be kept under his own eye for their practical training, at any rate for a considerable part of the six months, and the rest of the time they might spend abroad for further experience. The experience gained by a student

called and examined.

in the forests of Great Britain would not be of equal value to that which could be obtained abroad as far as finished forestry was concerned, but the principles of forestry could be taught in an incomplete forest in Great Britain. From the students' point of view there was perhaps as much to learn in an English forest for a certain part of the time as in a forest abroad.

66820. The main reason why an English course was instituted was that it made it possible to have someone in direct control of the students. Students going abroad were not accompanied by a member of the teaching staff; the Indian forest probationers were under the direction of the Director of Indian Forest Studies, but it was hoped to institute a system by which it would be possible for the University to look after them abroad as well as at home.

66821. When students were in Germany they were put under the charge of a German forest officer, who would see that they carried out certain works and performed certain exercises; generally the German forest officer would act under the direction of the school, and that would be sufficient.

66822. With regard to the relative values of German and English training, he himself had had five years' experience of German training and was prepared to say that a student could be taught in an English forest, in the earlier part of his career at any rate. There were now certain estates in England where good principles of forestry were to be seen. The place he had in mind was in the county of Sussex, and there was also an estate in Aberdeenshire. Those estates would serve well

17 June 1914.]

Mr. WILLIAM DAWSON.

[Continued.]

from a training point of view, but would not do for a training in finished forestry.

66823. Unless the number of students for the Indian Forest Service were large it would hardly be possible for Cambridge to make arrangements by which students going abroad would be under the control of an English officer, as it would be a serious expense on the school to send someone with the students. The school had already incurred considerable expense in connection with the teaching of Indian Forest students, and unless the Government guaranteed the expense it would be impossible for the school to send a man abroad with a small number of students. It might be possible to place the men under the charge of the Director of Indian Studies, as at present. Mr. Caccia now took the students both from Oxford and Cambridge during the time they were abroad, and he understood, though he did not know, that Mr. Caccia was with them during the whole time. There would be no difficulty in making an arrangement whereby students from two or three schools, Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh, could all go simultaneously to the same forest, and in that case the number would be sufficient to justify placing a British officer over them.

66824. The Cambridge course was a two years' course, but those two years were actually employed in applied forestry work. The Edinburgh course was three years, including preliminary scientific subjects. The Cambridge course was really a five years' course, as compared with Edinburgh, because the Cambridge man had already studied three years for the Natural Science Tripos before taking up the study of forestry, and the two years for the diploma of forestry was spent exclusively in forestry work. The Oxford school would be the same as Cambridge as regards time.

66825. The question whether a diploma in forestry would be a sufficient qualification for the Service depended upon the preliminary qualifications demanded. Cambridge had now brought out new regulations in which considerable qualifications in pure science were demanded before men were admitted to the diploma, and in that case he thought the qualification would be sufficient.

66826. The number of students he believed would increase very largely in the near future. It was proposed that a special examination should be instituted at Cambridge for a B.A. degree in forestry, and that would be certain to attract large numbers of men. This would be separate from the diploma course which was at present in force.

66827. (Lord Ronaldshay.) He did not attach much importance to a man having taken a science degree before he went to the School of Forestry, and he would throw the school open to candidates who had taken any degree. Very good students were often obtained who had specialised in classics to begin with. Such students would have to go through the scientific work afterwards, but they would do that work much more quickly. If men came to the school who had only taken a classical degree, or some other than a scientific degree, they would have to prepare themselves for the preliminary work for the diploma. According to the new regulations the men must have passed the preliminary examination in science, or the first M.B. examination, or a certain number of parallel examinations with a basis of scientific subjects.

66828. On the subject of the age limit, he thought the present limit of 22 excluded a number of excellent men, especially those who came to the University and started a course of study without knowing specially what to go in for, and then, too late in the day, desired to prepare for the Forest Service. He had met several such men within the last year who would have been very suitable. The old limit of 23 years would cover such cases.

66829. (Chairman.) The present regulation, 19 to 22, was not by any means unsatisfactory, but it would open the field a little more, and might get one or two good men, if the limit was raised to 23. He would not, however, suggest that that should be done.

66830. (Sir Theodore Morison.) If men entered at the maximum age with the two years period of probation, they would be 24 before they had finished their education in forestry in England. The majority of men entered Cambridge at about 19, and a good many at 18, and they generally took the Natural Science Tripos examinations in two years and had the third year free in which to start forestry work; so that a man entering at 19 could finish both branches by the age of 23 and might finish by the age of 22 if he started with the idea of going into the Forest Service. If those limits of age were specified in the regulations one or two men might qualify, but the numbers would not be large unless the men were selected, to begin with, with the definite idea of entering the Forest Service; they would have to be earmarked and put through the course. With schoolboy or pre-university selection it would not be possible to obtain a large field of candidates who had got their degree and diploma at the age of 22.

66831. Under the present regulations the practical training abroad was given by the Director of Forest Studies and was the same for probationers coming from all the Universities. He thought there would be no difficulty in one man mauaging the students coming from different Universities. Two regulations he proposed would apply to all students, not merely to those coming under the regulations for Indian forestry work. The training of the Indian probationers was as complete as it could be made in a student's course, and compared favourably with the training which was given in any of the German schools to the officers of the German Service. German students had greater facilities for practical training than could be found in England, but in the University of Munich, where the Bavarian officers were trained, the training was entirely theoretical and in no way directly associated with woodlands. The men received their academic training and then put in a period of six months practical work in a forest, not necessarily continuous work. Under the new regulations at Cambridge the Indian forestry probationer would have to put in six months practical work, as that was insisted upon for the Cambridge diploma. The Indian forest probationer had to take the Cambridge diploma within two years of being adopted as a probationer.

66832. With regard to the staff of the Cambridge Forestry School, the whole-time men were the Reader in Forestry, himself; the Lecturer in Forest Utilisation and Director of Timber Research, Mr. Burdon; the Lecturer in Indian Forestry, Mr. Jackson; the Assistant Investigator in Timber, Mr. Long; and the Adviser in Forestry, Mr. Hankins. The Lecturer in Botany, Mr. Brooks, was Lecturer on Plant Pathology in the School of Botany in Cambridge. The Lecturer in Entomology, Mr. Warburton, was Lecturer on Entomology in the School of Agriculture. The Lecturer in Engineering, Mr. Adie, was Lecturer in Engineering in the School of Agriculture, and Mr. la Touche, the Lecturer in Indian Geology, was attached to the School of Geology. They were part-time officers employed to give special courses.

66833. (Mr. Chauhan.) The School of Forestry in Cambridge was founded seven years ago, and the school at Oxford a little before. After the schools were founded a special course for Indian forestry was added. The schools were started as university departments for general forestry, and special provision was made for the teaching of foresters for India. No contribution was received from the State towards the expenses of training Indian probationers.

66834. (Mr. Sly.) The normal course of students taking the diploma of forestry was three years in the science course plus two years in actual diploma work, or five years at the University at the present time, but a man could arrange to do it in less time. The witness promised to send in statistics showing the number of students who had taken the diploma and the age at which they had taken it, in order to show how many men with diplomas were available for selection for the Indian Service.

17 June 1914.]

Mr. WILLIAM DAWSON.

[Continued.]

66835. With regard to the whole-time or part-time teachers in the school of forestry, the Adviser in Forestry had no teaching to do in the school. The others were all engaged in teaching and gave their whole time to the forestry school. The primary duty of the Assistant Inspector in Timber was investigation, but he also took part in the teaching. Each member of the staff was engaged in research work for a certain part of the time, but their services were available for teaching, and especially for tutorial work. The Investigator in Timber was an official of the school, not of the Government. A grant was given by Government, but the teachers were appointed by the school and were under the direction of the school. The responsibility for the work was on the school, which had to devise schemes and carry them out. The only two members of the staff having experience of India were Mr. Jackson, who had had experience of Indian forestry, and Mr. La Touche, who had had experience of Indian geology.

66836. According to the regulations the practical course hitherto had consisted of ten weeks abroad and ten weeks in England, but under the new regulations passed by the Senate in the previous week the men would now have to spend a full period of six months in forests approved by the Committee, either abroad or at home. The Continental training might be substantially less than six months. A student might spend the whole of his six months on the Continent or might receive permission to spend them at home. There was no hard and fast rule as to the period which must be spent at home and abroad.

66837. For the proposed B.A. degree in forestry there would be two special examinations. The examination would correspond to part 1 of the diploma of forestry and was especially intended for young landowners and would not affect Indian forestry. It was designed to give an elementary knowledge of forestry to landowners and not to turn out a trained forester, so that the B.A. course would be of no use for Indian purposes. The question of starting a regular course in higher forestry *ab initio* from the time of entrance to the University had been considered during the last year, but the general University regulations would hardly admit of a special degree being provided. However, in order to meet the case the scope of the teaching for the diploma had been considerably increased within the last year.

66838. At present the regulations provided for five years at the University. A man could concentrate it into four without any difficulty, provided he made up his mind in time, but to do the work thoroughly the period could not be less than four years. It would not be necessary to extend it to five in order to include special Indian instruction as the whole of it could be done without difficulty in the four years.

66839. (Mr. Macdonald.) With regard to the reason for the change in the regulations as to the redistribution of time between Germany and England, the witness explained that the long vacation was the one period when there was no actual work going on in a forest, so that a man might spend his period of practical work in a British forest without seeing any work performed. Also it was compulsory upon students to reside for a period of ten weeks in France or Germany, which it was highly desirable they should do, but for a British diploma in forestry it seemed a little out of place to insist on men being taken by Continental foresters. The school had no jurisdiction over the forests, and if anything arose which caused France or Germany to say they would not take the men no one would be able to obtain the diploma. Students ought to see as much of Continental forestry as possible, but the principles of forestry could be learned in a British forest, as the British forests were now being put under decent management and brought into order. While it might not be absolutely essential that the men should go either to France or Germany to complete their

training, they would gain valuable experience by doing so.

The case was comparable with what was done in the medical profession. Men from the medical schools frequently went to Vienna although the schools in England were efficient. Whilst it might be advisable for a man to go to France or Germany or India or Timbuctoo in order to widen his experience it was not essential for him to do so before he obtained his diploma. The regulations had been changed partly because it was the opinion of the Cambridge school that the facilities for practical training at home were increasing and would ultimately be sufficient, and partly because the regulations formerly in force were extremely complicated. Under the new regulations the curriculum had been much simplified and the scope of the teaching had been considerably extended. A series of new classes had been started.

66840. Forest work was seasonal, and in order to see it a student had to be in the forest in the particular seasons when work was going on. There was no difficulty in placing students in forests in France or Germany at a time when the maximum profit might be gained, the authorities being willing to take students at the time which was considered best for their training.

66841. With regard to the steps that had been taken by Cambridge University to make the teaching in Indian forestry efficient, since the school became a recognised centre for the teaching of Indian forestry in 1912 it had voluntarily got together material which would make the teaching efficient, the work having been done under no promise from the India Office or the Government, and with no encouragement that amounted to a pledge. It was a purely voluntary development on the part of the school itself.

66842. (Mr. Madge.) It was quite possible for a student to obtain a complete training in forestry in Great Britain. The principles of forestry had been known in Great Britain for many years, but they had not been applied. Now, however, on a large number of estates the correct principles of forestry were being applied, and the more or less natural woods were being brought into order. That had been going on for a period of twenty years or more, especially on certain Highland estates in Scotland where there were records of actual work on the forests for over twenty years. There was one estate in Scotland, N—, which was better than most English estates in that there was a variety of woodlands and a variety of soil, and this afforded an excellent training ground for general forestry.

66843. An imperfectly managed forest which had been brought into order was as useful a training ground as an immaculate forest which had been kept in order for a very long time.

66844. On the estate now under his management a good training could be obtained, quite as good as could be obtained anywhere. If there was the same teaching organisation in India the training could be obtained there, and he had mentioned in his memorandum a particular locality in which the teaching was given.

66845. With regard to the age at which a man should go to India, a man of mature years was more satisfactory than an extreme youth.

66846. He was rather in favour of having several forest schools as centres of training than one at either Oxford or Cambridge, and would not give preferential treatment to any.

66847. (Mr. Abdur Rahim.) At present in the Cambridge school there were two English students who had been accepted for the Forest Service. There was only one Indian student. He had just taken his diploma and was not a probationer. The Indian Forest Service was extremely popular amongst English students.

66848. There was no regular State Forest Service in England, but the Board of Agriculture took a man now and again. Practically all the forests in Great Britain were private estates, not more than 2 per cent. of the forest area being in the hands of the State.

17 June 1914.]

Mr. WILLIAM DAWSON.

[Continued.]

66849. The course of teaching at Cambridge was mainly intended to benefit the land-owning class, the proposed special examination in forestry was intended to give that class a slight training in the economics of forestry. The two years' course was a complete training for a forester, and there was also a shorter course. There was not much demand for a completely trained forester except for foreign service.

66850. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) In the School of Forestry at Cambridge the students had to pass the ordinary diploma examinations throughout the course, and at the end had a final examination on the results of which they were placed in classes. The final examination was partly oral, partly practical, and partly in written papers. At present 200 marks were given to the paper examination and 100 to the oral. There were two papers each of which was given 100 marks. At the end of the course the student could not possibly be a complete forester; however good his college course might have been he had only learned the rudiments of the industry. A student needed a great deal more than the six months practical training demanded in order to give him all the experience he required of practical forestry. The course was merely intended to put him on the right lines.

66851. He was satisfied with the relative importance given to theoretical knowledge and practical knowledge, because the theoretical knowledge was largely based upon practical experience. The questions asked were based on the knowledge required by the students in practice, or at all events dealt with things they had seen in practice. For testing a knowledge of forestry a competitive examination might be satisfactory, but it would not determine whether a man would be a good officer or not. Personality was very important, and it was difficult to test that by examination.

66852. (Chairman.) He had no Indian forest experience himself, his career having been confined to Europe.

66853. The fees of students attending the Cambridge School of Forestry would amount to a little over £20 a year, over and above the cost of living at the University.

66854. (Sir Theodore Morison.) The Forestry Committee of the University had put forward suggestions to the Senate that a degree should be instituted and that degree would be an ordinary degree with forestry as a special subject.

66855. (Mr. Sly.) The Cambridge Forest School was designed to meet the requirements of English landowners, which were entirely different from the requirements of the large State forests of India.

From his experience of Continental forests and British forestry, and his knowledge of the needs of a student in forestry, he believed that a man could obtain the instruction be required in an imperfectly managed British forest and could derive as much benefit from it as he would from staying in a bigly developed German forest. The Continental training simply widened the students' experience. As he had said, the forest student was in much the same position as the medical man who after receiving his training in England was none the worse for having a Continental experience. Just as a medical man could be made an efficient doctor by his English training so an efficient forester could be made out of his training in British forests. English forests were continually improving. It was true that they would take another century before they would be in the same condition as the German forests, but that was a matter only affecting financial results. A man could be taught upon an unfinished subject quite as well as upon the finished, and could see enough of the best models and practical results of the principles to suit his case. He could mention four estates in England and Scotland where a complete training in forestry could be given suitable for the great State forests in India. Those estates were being raised to the highest standard of forest management.

66856. (Mr. Macdonald.) If he had been giving evidence to the Commission ten years ago it would certainly not have been as strong as it was at present in favour of a British training, and he believed that if he had to give evidence ten years hence it would be much more strongly in favour of the British forests than the evidence he was giving to-day. The advance in British forestry during the last five to ten years had been very marked, and consequently a man who had been out in India during that time would not be in touch with British development. At the time he took his own training he had to go abroad for his practical work.

66857. (Chairman.) A forest in its complete form simply gave better financial results; as a medium of teaching it was of value at any period of its development, once the right system was started. A forest could be moulded into a good training ground in a comparatively few years. The American schools within the last few years had become extremely efficient institutions, yet less than ten years ago the men had to be sent to Europe for training. He did not wish to say that a man ought to dispense with a Continental training, but he maintained that he could receive his actual training in British forests. He did not regard a Continental training as indispensable.

(The witness withdrew.)

E. P. STEBBING, Esq., Head of the Department of Forestry, University of Edinburgh.

Written Statement* relating to Forestry Education in the University of Edinburgh.

66858. The last few years have witnessed a great development in forestry in this country. With the generous aid accorded by the Agricultural Departments and the Development Commissioners this great advance has, it is thought, proceeded upon sound lines. It was clearly recognised that the first essential was to place forestry education throughout the British Isles upon a firm basis.

The University of Edinburgh began to teach forestry in 1888, Dr. Somerville being appointed Lecturer in Forestry in that year. Some two years later he was succeeded by the late Colonel F. Bailey. The latter resigned in 1910, the writer being appointed to the post. A course of lectures was delivered annually during the Winter Session up to Colonel Bailey's retirement. The course was chiefly taken by students proceeding to the Degree of Agriculture within the University.

During the above period up to 1906 the only courses in advanced forestry in all its branches delivered in this country were given by Sir William Schlich, K.C.I.E., and the late Prof. W. R. Fisher at the Royal Indian Engineering College, Cooper's Hill.

From 1906 onwards the position of affairs materially changed.

66859. The Ordinance for the Degree of B.Sc. in Forestry at Edinburgh.—So impressed were the University of Edinburgh authorities with the importance of providing forestry students with a full curriculum of study based on a scientific foundation, together with the necessary practical training, that they prepared an ordinance which prescribed regulations for a course of study extending over three years and with two series of examinations, which, on being passed successfully, would empower the University to confer the Degree of Bachelor of Science in Forestry. The ordinance was approved by His Majesty in Council

* See also Appendix XI.

17 June 1914.]

Mr. E. P. STEBBING.

[Continued.]

in 1906, and the University authorities thereupon made provision for the requisite courses of study and examinations. Special lecturers in Forest Botany and Forest Entomology were appointed in 1905, and other special courses were arranged for in Forest Engineering and Forest Chemistry.

66860. *The Curriculum for the Degree.*—As regards the curriculum for the Degree of Forestry at least one year of study of pure science subjects (Botany, Zoology, Chemistry, and Natural Philosophy) is required before candidates can complete the first examination; and not less than two additional years are required to enable candidates to complete their study of the applied science subjects (Forest Botany, Forest Mycology, Forest Zoology, Forest Engineering, Surveying, Forest Chemistry, and Geology*), including forestry, elementary and advanced, in all its branches, theoretical and practical; these subjects are taken at the second or final examination. The courses in practical forestry are extensive. The first courses, which are taken in Scotland, are designed to ensure that each student should thoroughly learn the manual part of forestry labour, such as work in the nursery, planting, felling, thinning, etc. Several weeks are spent by the students in performing these operations with their own hands under suitable guidance. The advanced practical courses are taken partly in Scotland and partly in Germany. These practical courses cover a period of six to seven months in all.

66861. *Graduates in Forestry.*—As at least three years had to elapse before the education for the degree in forestry could be completed no degrees were conferred until 1911, when three candidates received it, and up to the present 12 degrees have been granted. It is expected that five to seven more will be given in July next. The forestry graduates have mostly received appointments in the Colonial Forest Services, or at home, or in commercial companies in the East. One is in the Indian Forest Service.

66862. *Students in the Department.*—The number of students entered in the University registers as aspirants for the forestry degree according to the latest return is as follows: In the first year, 21; in the second year, 13; and in the final year, 16; altogether 50 students. Three of the final year have graduated since the return was made up. Several of these students are working with the

* Geology is a pure Science Subject.

Mr. E. P. STEBBING called and examined.

66866. (Chairman.) The witness was the head of the Department of Forestry in the University of Edinburgh, having been appointed to that post on the 1st May, 1910. He was a member of the Indian Forest Service, and was due to retire on pension in July next. He was placed by the Department on foreign service at Edinburgh.

66867. In recent years a considerable sum of money had been spent on the Forestry School at Edinburgh, money which had been drawn from the Agricultural Department, the Development Commissioners, and the University itself. There were at the present time 50 students on the books. Two of those students were presenting themselves this year for the Indian Forest Service, and there were two or three prospective candidates in their second year. He could not say how many first year men would present themselves as they were still engaged in doing their first science course.

66868. The Edinburgh course occupied three years. The first year was devoted to pure science and the other two years to forestry and applied sciences. As a matter of fact very few students took the course in three years as the first science course nearly always occupied a year and a half, so that it was nearer four than three. The men entered the University at any time after 17 years of age, the average age being probably 18 to 18½, though some came as late as 19. The men who

object of qualifying themselves for selection as probationers in the Indian Forest Service, Edinburgh having received from the Secretary of State the distinction of being approved as a training school for probationers in that Service.

66863. *Indian Students from Native States.*—Other students (there are some ten in the three years) are Indian students from Native States in India. They have come to Edinburgh with the sole object of obtaining the degree in forestry, and so qualifying for employment in the Forest Departments of their own States. These students and others are attracted to Edinburgh owing to its cheapness, both as regards University fees and living expenses.

66864. *Equipment and Staff.*—The University authorities, impressed with the importance of improving the building accommodation and equipment and of enlarging the staff of the department, applied through the Treasury to the Development Commissioners for a grant of money to enable improvements to be effected. £4,500 was voted for a new building with lecture rooms, museums, laboratories, and rooms for research, on condition that the University provided at least an equal sum. The building is now completed. £2,000 was also voted for furnishings and equipment, which have now been placed in their appropriate rooms. The building is now in occupation, and the museums are now being fitted up. £500 a year for five years was promised for the payment of additional teachers, and a lecturer-assistant and demonstrator-assistant have been appointed. £2,000 was also voted for a forest garden, a site for which is now being acquired.

66865. *Training of Indian Forest Probationers.*—Graduates in forestry of Edinburgh, who have at the same time passed a public examination of the University of an honours standard in some branch of natural science, are qualified, being of suitable age, to present themselves as candidates for probationership in the Indian Forest Service.

At the desire of the Secretary of State arrangements have been made to deliver within the University to accepted Indian Forest probationers (holding the degree of B.Sc. in Forestry of this University) courses in the systematic botany of Indian Trees, Forest Law, Geology of India, Indian Forest Working Plans and German, vide letter of 22nd October, 1913, from the Vice-Chancellor and Principal, University of Edinburgh, to the India Office.

came at 18 in the ordinary course would be trained and ready to go to India between the ages of 21½ and 22. If men entered at 17 and got their first science in a year they would be able to leave at 20½ years with their degree.

66869. With regard to the facilities offered by the school for students who anticipated entering the Indian Service, the Secretary of State had asked whether the University would be willing to give courses to probationers, to men who had already taken their forestry degree, and arrangements had been made to deliver the courses which the India Office desired, i.e., in Forest Botany, Indian Geology, Indian Forest Law, and Indian working plans. There was a very complete course of Forest Engineering, and as an Indian Forest officer he could not say that any addition would be required to the present course in Forest Engineering, which was laid down by the present Dean of the Faculty of Science, Professor Hudson Beare. None of the subjects were taught by men with Indian experience except Indian Forest Law, for which he believed arrangements had been made with a retired Indian civilian, and Indian working plans. Indian Forest Geology would be taught in the Geological Branch by Professor Geike or one of his assistants, and Indian Forest Botany would be given probably by the present lecturer in Forest Botany in the Botanical Department at the Royal Botanic Gardens. There would probably be no

17 June 1914.]

Mr. E. P. STEBBING.

[Continued.]

difficulty in arranging with Prof. Bayley Balfour to have a course of Indian Botany given by one of his assistants who had Indian experience.

66870. Six to seven months were allotted to practical work, part of which was done in Scottish forests and part in Continental forests. For the practical work throughout the theoretical curriculum there was no doubt that some of the Scottish areas around Perth were extremely good for the training of a forester. He did not think they could be better for that part of the course because it was necessary to give students elementary work, nursery work, planting, sowing, felling, and so on; and he considered it was possible to give them a better course in that part of the training in this country than they could obtain abroad, owing to the fact that the German forest officer to whom they went had not time to devote to the work. For parts of the higher training the German training was very good. At Edinburgh the men, after they had had their advanced theoretical forestry course and before they graduated, went abroad. That was indispensable at present. One great value of foreign experience was the training it provided in forest engineering. In Great Britain it was impossible to see any large export works, large timber slides, water slides, works that had been put up in the mountains to prevent erosion and avalanches, and so on; but these could be seen on the Continent and they were indispensable to the Indian Forest Service probationer. So that on that score alone it would be necessary for the Indian forest probationer to go abroad.

66871. In the course of University training only a certain number of weeks could be devoted to practical work as a man had to be at the University during the session. At Edinburgh a minimum of ten weeks' practical work abroad was fixed for a degree, and the student had to spend those ten weeks in Germany or in France, doing the rest of his practical work at home. Up to now Germany had been always selected. At present there were eight men from Edinburgh in German forests under his supervision. Between April and July he would spend a considerable part of the summer vacation in Germany or France inspecting the men. He did not leave one of his assistants with the men when he himself was not there. It was questionable whether it was necessary to have an assistant constantly there, because the men were sent to a German forest officer with whom arrangements had been made, and it was rather difficult, even unnecessary, for another person on the spot to interfere. He quite agreed that a periodical inspection should be made, but while the inspector was there the students were probably doing what might be called show work. Provided the students were brought into touch with a German forest officer and placed on the right lines it was not necessary to have a man always there supervising them. For a man to be constantly there and do any good he would want to take charge of the area himself. This used to be the case in India in the old days when the head of the forest school was also conservator of the circle.

66872. The forests in India had not undergone a sufficient amount of treatment to make them suitable for a complete training, and he did not think they would reach that position for another 50 years. Throughout the greater part of India, when the forests were taken over by the Department, large portions of forest were more or less in a ruined condition. After the Mutiny, when railways were started, throughout the Central Provinces and Central India, the forests were simply cut to pieces for sleepers. The contractors went into the woods with bags of rupees and the native tribes hacked down the trees by the thousand and large numbers were never taken out. There was a tremendous boom and the amount of timber which was cut could not be used in the time. In many parts of the country the forests were ruined in that way, and a ruined forest required considerably more than 50 years to get into good condition again. Scientific conservation in the forests was not

started when they were taken over, as years were spent in demarcation work; so that it was only within comparatively recent times that the real principles of forestry had been put into force. The forests were being gradually brought back into fair condition, but they were forests which even before being hacked about were only primeval forests. There had been similar conditions in America. It was true that a certain amount of training was being given in the American forests, but he believed it would be found that a good many of the best American foresters also came to Europe; at any rate, they were thoroughly acquainted with the European forests and made extensive tours through them. It would be rather putting the cart before the horse if an Indian forest probationer were entirely trained in India and did not see a properly managed European forest until he came home on his first furlough. At such a time he could not assimilate what he could assimilate as a student.

66873. All the elementary part of the training and parts of the more scientific training could be given in forests in Scotland, although the forests there were not absolutely under scientific treatment. The elementary part of forestry, nursery work, planting, methods of cutting down trees, etc., was done as well in Scotland as anywhere else in the world. The Scotch forester was a very good man indeed; it was only in the scientific branches of knowledge that he was backward, and portions of these scientific branches could be studied better in Germany than in Scotland. Then there was also the method of managing well-ordered forests by means of working plans, which was almost unknown in Great Britain.

66874. At Edinburgh the whole of the University fees for a forestry degree were calculated by the University head clerk to amount to £65, from beginning to end. That was the cost of being at the University and taking the course in the forest school and obtaining a forestry degree, covering a period of three years. It was possible for a very careful man to take his degree at Edinburgh for £300, including living expenses and everything, and he certainly could do it for £350. The £65 was the sum the University obtained from any man who desired to take a forestry degree, from the moment he matriculated until he took his degree.

66875. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) The course at Edinburgh did not conclude with a competitive examination. There was a system of class examinations which came before the examination for the degree. The class examinations were competitive. A medal was given and also certificates for honours or pass according to the position of the men in the class, so that at the end of any particular course the men were placed in order on the results of the special class examinations. Practical work formed a considerable part of the examinations, the practical course gaining half again as many marks as the theoretical; if the marks for the theoretical were 100 the marks for the practical course would be 150. There were two practical courses, the first elementary and the second advanced, and a medal was given for each. He attached very great importance to practical work, and it was stated almost at the beginning of the course and went right through. The whole of the practical work in Scotland was done under the supervision of the forestry staff. A competitive examination on those lines might test the relative value of candidates for the Forestry Service, especially if it included practical work. He did not think a competitive examination consisting of only two or three papers in forestry would be of any value from the Indian Forest Service point of view, but he saw no difficulty in adding examinations in which practical work could be thoroughly tested. Such an examination might form only one of the tests required, as it would not discover the personal qualifications of the men for the Service. No mere examination test could do this. When he himself went up for the Forest Service he had to appear first at the India Office to be inspected and then to go for a 2½ mile walk. That eliminated one or two of the

17 June 1914.]

Mr. E. P. STEBBING.

[Continued.]

candidates, and the medical examination which followed eliminated more. After that there was a fortnight's competitive examination.

66576. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) If those tests were held to begin with and a competitive examination followed a good class of men might be secured.

66577. In the last three years there had been ten Indian students from Native States and one from British India, a Mr. Masters of Bombay, who hoped to present himself as a candidate for the Indian Forest Service when he was qualified. There was also Mr. Das from the Punjab and Mr. Chandy from Madras. Mr. Das had not quite made up his mind whether he would try for the Agricultural Department or Forestry and Mr. Chandy was going to try next year for the Indian Forest Department. The greater number of the Indian students came from Travancore. His explanation of the fact that a comparatively large number of students came from Native States was that the Native States during the last few years had been turning their attention to obtaining better trained men than they had had in the past, and they had discovered that by sending men home they could get a good article which was worth the money. Probably half of the men came with scholarships, the other half paying their own expenses.

66578. The work on the Continent came at the end of the course. The men now in Germany would graduate on the 10th July if they did well. The Continental work was part of the work for the forestry degree. The heavy expense of the practical courses was an important factor. He proposed next year to take men in their second year, who could afford the expense, abroad in the summer vacation. At present, in their second year they did six weeks' practical work in the summer vacation, and that might be done in Scotland or abroad. He proposed spending a fortnight of it abroad.

66579. There were undoubtedly some good examples of forestry at Dehra Dun and throughout the United Provinces. The forest conservancy there was probably on the whole more advanced than it was in many other parts. There was a denser population and a smaller area of woods.

66580. With reference to the statement that American forestry schools were now independent of European experience, America might go ahead but could not force Nature to make the trees grow quickly. It was impossible to get a forest into order even in America in a short time. It was well known that American forests had been lumbered and cut to pieces, and they could not be got into order in ten years.

66581. For some time the Forest Department in India was engaged in demarcation work before taking up real forestry work, which was taken up the moment the demarcation was finished. He could not say the exact date at which forestry work commenced in India, but it would be probably 35 or more years ago.

66582. (*Mr. Mudge.*) The training in Scotland was as good as could be obtained anywhere else. A man to become a competent forester required to have the elementary parts of the course, including the elementary practical work, rubbed into him thoroughly, and unless a man did that part of the work as a junior student he would never do it afterwards. Therefore, the Scottish student had an advantage over the student whose practical training was entirely in Germany. A man might be sent out to India with a first-class knowledge of scientific forestry, but if he had not learned all the elementary practical and theoretical work thoroughly he was not as good a man when he came to instruct his own subordinates.

66583. Afforestation in India on scientific lines varied in the different provinces. The United Provinces would probably show as good a collection of forests as could be found in the whole of India, but that might be a matter of dispute as other conservators would no doubt declare they could show something there would be perfect forests in India, but it was rather difficult

to speak on the subject. There had been steady advance towards the goal.

66584. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The Forest School at Edinburgh kept in touch with the forests in Scotland and knew what forests were being worked scientifically. In Edinburgh they more or less kept to that side of Scotland because there was a Forestry School at Glasgow Agricultural College, and also one at Aberdeen. That, however, did not prevent students being taken anywhere in Scotland. There were a fair number of forests in Scotland now working on scientific plans properly plotted out for periodicity, and some of those forests were now approaching the completion of their periodicity, and in some cases had been cutting and planting scientifically. He had been to Novar and a good many other places, but he could hardly say that they were up to the Continental standard yet, although they were on the road to it. As a professional forester he could not subscribe to the opinion that Novar was as good as the forests of Germany for higher scientific training purposes. Another drawback was that the areas in the Scotch forests were very small compared with the areas in Germany. Also on the Continent one could study the different silvicultural systems over thousands of acres, showing the growth of different species on a very large scale. Experience of large forests like that was very desirable for an Indian forest probationer. When students were sent to Germany very definite instructions were given as to the things they must do and see, and amongst those things were always included the preparation of a working plan, proper systems of road making, the export of timber in difficult country, the method of running tramways and sledges, and so on. The drawback to a practical course entirely in Germany, apart from its being now-a-days unnecessary, was that the men were not allowed to do the work with their own hands; the German forest officer would not undertake the risk and the German Government would hardly want to have 16 or 20 students working in their woods. An English student simply saw what was being done and had no chance of doing any work with his own hands. If a student wanted to specialise in forest engineering he would do so after he had taken his degree, and if the Government wanted a specialist in forest engineering, or in any other branch, they could train him quite easily at Edinburgh.

66585. (*Mr. Sly.*) A candidate for admission to the Indian Forest Service had to have a degree in forestry and, in addition, to take honours in one branch of natural science. The pure science degree in Edinburgh consisted of honours in three branches, but forestry students had to take honours only in one. To take honours in one branch of natural science meant a year's work. If a man were smart enough he might take his forestry course in three years, but ordinarily speaking it would take four, including the one year's extra pure science. Consequently, in order to be qualified to become a candidate for the Indian Forest Service a man had to serve anywhere between three and a half and four years at the Edinburgh University.

66586. The witness promised to put in some statistics showing the number of students who had taken the forestry degree and the ages at which they graduated during the last three years.*

66587. Edinburgh was recognised as a place where an Indian forest probationer might undergo his probationary course. In 1913 the University was recognised as a suitable training place for probationers, but, as a matter of fact, there had been no probationers at Edinburgh yet. The probationary course had not been quite fixed. If a man had a forestry degree already and was only required to take an extra Indian course the chances were that it might only occupy a year, but that matter rested with the Secretary of State.

66588. Assuming that entry to the Indian Forest Service was made at the school-leaving age, as was the case in the days of Cooper's Hill, the selection might be restricted to students who had passed

* See Appendix XI.

17 June 1914.]

Mr. E. P. STEBBING.

[Continued.]

through the modern side of school education, as that would be best from the forest point of view, but he fully recognised the value to the forester, or to any scientific man, of Latin and Greek. His own recommendations would be that the boys should be taken from the modern side of a public school with some knowledge of Latin.

66899. The opinions he had given regarding training on the Continent related solely to the course gone through by Edinburgh student for the degree of B.Sc. in forestry and had nothing to do with the probationary course for the Indian Forest Service. The practical courses obtained by present day students were more than he had himself. As things advanced practical training was increased, but there must be a limit to the amount of practical training that could be given.

66900. With regard to the future training of the forest probationer, his belief was that when a man had been accepted as a probationer with a forestry degree the best training that could possibly be given would be in India, at Dehra Dun. A man would do more in a year in India than he could do in Europe, and it seemed difficult to see how it could be otherwise because the subjects to be taught were Indian subjects. It was surely preferable that a man studying Indian forest botany should go out into the Dehra Dun jungles and into the Himalaya close by to do his practical work than go to Kew. At the same time they had the equipment and were prepared to give the training at Edinburgh, if required.

66901. Personally he considered the Continental training of ten weeks which the Edinburgh students obtained, added to the 4½ months practical training they had in Scotland, was sufficient for the Indian Forest Service. It was a continuous period of ten weeks, during which the men lived at one centre and paid visits to desirable types of woods. At present the whole of the training was in Germany, none of the men having yet visited French forests.

66902. (Mr. Chauhan.) It was possible to teach Indian students at Dehra Dun the elementary portion of the work done by students at Edinburgh, i.e., the ordinary nursery work, the use of tools, and so on. Two or three years ago Dehra Dun was ahead of Edinburgh, but during the last two and a half years Edinburgh had received considerable sums of money and had now got together a very complete equipment, and also a new and commodious forestry building. He would not go so far as to say that all the training and instruction which Edinburgh students received before going to Germany could be given at Dehra Dun or at any other place in India. He did not think it was a hopeless dream to think of giving the same instruction to Indian boys in India as was now given in Edinburgh. From his knowledge of India as it was when he left four years ago he did not think it could have been done then at Dehra Dun, but it was only a matter of years before India would have a well ordered forest conservancy which would be as good as could be found in any other part of the world. In some directions it might be possible now to do as well at Dehra Dun, but in others not so well. Assuming that Dehra Dun was placed on a proper footing and young men were trained there up to the required standard (which would be possible when the forests had been brought into well-ordered management), and then brought over to Europe to see the Continental forests, he saw no reason why such a course should not be quite as efficient as was provided by institutions in England and Scotland.

66903. (Sir Theodore Morison.) Probationers for the Indian Forest Service from Edinburgh would have had ten weeks practical work on the Continent under his supervision, and on becoming probationers would, under existing arrangements, have a

further period under the direction of Mr. Caccia. The only advantage he could see in the further period was that the student would have a more extended knowledge of Germany; it would be difficult for a student to learn more in the extra ten weeks, as he had reached a stage where it was necessary that he should go into the forest as an assistant to a divisional officer. The State might pay for the luxury of giving him another 10 or 15 weeks, but it was not required, and, he thought, was a waste of money. The forestry centres had laid down a course which if worth anything should be good enough to produce forest probationers ready-made. That was what was aimed at in Edinburgh, and that was, he believed, what was being done. Men had been already taken from Edinburgh by the Colonial Office and sent out to join their appointments straight away, two men having gone in the last few months. In other words, in his opinion, the Indian forest probationer could now be obtained by the Government of India free of cost in the open market ready made. The forestry centres did not now depend for their existence, as formerly, on supplying forest probationers to India. Other demands had sprung up and the number of probationers required annually for the Indian Service was too small to affect the well-being of the larger training centres one way or the other. Edinburgh, whilst keenly desirous to assist the Government of India in this matter, looked to a wider field.

66894. The number of men studying forestry in the Edinburgh University had increased very much during the last two or three years. The total number of men in the final year at Edinburgh was now about 18 each year. Probably the number of graduates (including diplomas) from all the forestry schools each year would be about 30.

66895. The witness said he had received applications from men in the Provincial Forest Service in India who wished to go to Edinburgh to take part of the forestry degree in order to improve their position, and it seemed to him that that was a point of some importance.

66896—68043. (Chairman.) During the last year he had received at least five applications, and he had recommended the University to accept the men. Some of them were endeavouring to get grants and others were coming on study leave. It was a matter well worth considering, because it would considerably improve the value of the men to the Department. Three of the men he had known in Dehra Dun when he was there, and he supposed their ages would be 27 or 28, and they would be men with about five years' service, perhaps more. It struck him as being a very good thing indeed, to encourage smart men, and it would be very valuable for them to see well-orderer Continental forests. It was true that in a two years' course they would be repeating a great deal of the work they had presumably done in India, but on a more advanced standard, and also true that the arrangements at Dehra Dun for teaching were approximating to the British standard, and it might be that one year's course would be sufficient, but if a man were willing to take a year's furlough and was allowed another year the Service would not lose, as the man's value to the Service would be much increased if he took the full course for the degree. The Provincial Service now was very different from what it was when he joined the Forest Department. Men in the Provincial Service now had charge of divisions, and the course suggested would qualify an Indian to attain to a position in the superior Service, and he saw no reason why a Provincial man who had taken a forestry degree course should not be able to occupy a position in the Imperial Service, as he would have had a training in Europe.

(The witness withdrew.)

LIST OF APPENDICES.

	PAGE.
I.—Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, No. 447 (Forests), dated the 29th October, 1913, relating to the Forest Department	118
II.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh relating to the Forest Department	120
III.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Forest Department ...	121
IV.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Forest Department	123
V.—Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Forest Department ...	126
VI.—Note dated the 9th April, 1913, by the Hon. Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Forest Department	128
VII.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Forest Department ...	134
VIII.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Forest Department ...	137
IX.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Forest Department ...	145
X.—Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Forest Department	148
XI.—Statistics furnished by the Forestry Schools of the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, and Edinburgh regarding the students who have taken the degree or diploma in Forestry at those Universities during the last few years	150
XII.—Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Forest Service	153
XIII.—Regulations as to the Appointment of Probationers to the Indian Forest Service, 1914 ...	156
XIV.—Officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their inquiry into the Forest Department, but who were not orally examined ...	158

APPENDIX I.

APPENDIX I.

Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab and its Dependencies, No. 477 (Forests), dated Lahore, the 29th October, 1913.

SIR,—In continuation of my letter* No. 422 (Forests), dated 11th October, 1913, I am directed to forward herewith 20 copies of a letter No. 3249 (B.O. 151—11) of the same date, from the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, and of its enclosures, giving the further information required by the Royal Commission about the organisation, etc., of the Forest Department in the Punjab.

Letter from W. Mayes, Esquire, Imperial Forest Service, officiating Conservator of Forests, Punjab, to the Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab, No. 3249 (B.O. 151—11), dated Lahore, 11th October, 1913.

I have the honour to reply to your endorsement No. 2216 S., Home, dated the 23rd August, 1913, forwarding a copy of a letter dated the 1st August, 1913, from the Joint Secretary to the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India, to your address, regarding further information required by the Commission about the organisation, etc., of the Forest Department in the Punjab. I give below the information required as far as possible under the heads enumerated in the Joint Secretary's letter.

2. *Head (i).*—The officers of the Imperial Forest Service are recruited in England under covenant

with the Secretary of State, according to regulations issued yearly by the India Office. With regard to the general suitability of the regulations, I would refer the Commission to paragraphs 1—6 of the memorandum submitted with my letter No. 274, dated the 14th April, 1913, to the Revenue Secretary to Government, Punjab. The Provincial Service is recruited from two sources—(a) from candidates selected for direct appointment, and (b) from amongst members of the Subordinate Service (Forest Rangers), who are considered specially suitable in accordance with Article 15 (ii) of the Forest Department Code, 7th edition. The regulations for direct appointment are contained in Forest Department Code, 7th edition. The regulation of 30th April, 1908, a copy of which is attached (*vide* Annexure). Since this notification was issued the course of training for direct appointment nominees at the Imperial Forest College has been reduced from three years to two. At present the Service is recruited by direct appointment nominees and promoted Forest Rangers in equal proportions. The existing system of recruitment is on the whole satisfactory.

3. *Head (ii).*—The following statement compares the rates of pay for the Imperial Forest Service in force in the years 1890, 1900, and 1913:—

Grade of Officers.	Pay in rupees per mensem.		
	In 1890.	In 1900.	In 1913.
Conservator—Grade I.	1,500	1,600	1,900
Do. do. II.	1,250	1,350	1,700
Do. do. III.	1,000	1,100	1,500
Deputy Conservator of Forests—Grade I.	900	900	From Rs. 580 to Rs. 1,250, rising by an annual increment of Rs. 40 per mensem up to Rs. 700, and thereafter by an annual increment of Rs. 50 per mensem.
Do. do. II.	800	800	
Do. do. III.	650	650	
Do. do. IV.	550	550	
Assistant Conservator of Forests—Grade I.	450	450	Rs. 380 to Rs. 540 by annual increment of Rs. 40 per mensem.
Do. do. II.	350	350	
Do. do. III.	250	Grade abolished	

NOTE.—In 1907 grade pay among Deputy Conservators of Forests and Assistant Conservators of Forests was abolished in favour of a system of annual increments.

A similar comparison of the pay of the Provincial Forest Service is as follows:—

Grade of Officers.	Pay in rupees per mensem.		
	In 1890.	In 1900.	In 1913.
Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests—Grade I...			
Do. do. II.	600	550	From Rs. 575 to Rs. 850, subject to the conditions laid down in Government of India resolution No. 17 F.—77-33, dated 23rd June, 1911, paragraph 2.
Do. do. III.	550	500	
Do. do. IV...	450	350	
Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests—Grade I...	350	300	
Do. do. II.	300	250	From Rs. 250 to Rs. 550, by an annual increment of Rs. 20 per mensem
Do. do. III.	250	200	
Do. do. IV.	200	..	
Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests (see paragraph 2 of Punjab, Government notification No. 241, dated 30th April, 1908, annexed to this Appendix).			150

Note (i).—An Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests placed in a "major" charge is entitled to an allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem.

Note (ii).—Attention is specially invited to paragraph 2 (i) (c) of Government of India resolution No. 17 F.—77-33, dated the 23rd June, 1911, on the subject of personal allowances to deserving Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests whose promotion is blocked.

* Not reprinted. The letter referred to forwarded the Written Statement by Officers of the Provincial Forest Service in the Punjab, which has been reproduced as Mr. Gokal Das's written statement.—*Vide* paragraphs 66, 187-95.

APPENDIX I. (continued).

As regards the adequacy of the existing scales of pay in the two Services, attention is invited to paragraph 8 of the memorandum submitted to Punjab Government with my No. 274, dated the 14th April, 1913, and to my criticism of the memorandum of the Provincial Forest Service submitted to Punjab Government with my letter No. 3050, dated the 20th September, 1913. There are two additions which I wish to make to the proposals regarding the pay of the Imperial Forest Service. The pay of Deputy Conservator of Forests should rise from Rs. 1,250 in the 18th year of service to

Imperial Forest Service in the Punjab is necessary. Officers with European training are essential for the charge of the important hill divisions; in addition the extension of irrigated plantations in the plains will involve an increase in the number of charges for which Provincial Forest Service officers are suitable. I consider that the cadre for the Punjab, exclusive of the Conservator, should consist of 15 Imperial Forest Service officers and 17 Provincial Forest Service officers; and I give below a statement showing how these figures are arrived at:—

MAJOR CHARGES.

Divisions.	Divisional Forest Officers.	Assistants.
Hazara (North-West Frontier Province)	1	2
Rawalpindi	1	1
Chenab-Shahpur	1	†1
Chamba State	1	1
Kangra	1	1
Kulu	1	*1
Bashahr	1	1
Simla	1	
Lahore	1	†1
Montgomery-Multan-Pir Mahal	1	†2
Direction	1	
Working Plans	1	
Total ...	12	10

MINOR CHARGES.

Divisions.	Divisional Forest Officers.	Assistants.
Jhelum	1	...
Baluchistan	1	...
Punjab Forest School	1	...
Total ...	3	...

* For Mandi State.

Rs. 1,500 in the 23rd year. I make this proposal because it appears probable that in the future an officer will not rise to the rank of Conservator before his 23rd year of service; and I think it undesirable that he should remain on Rs. 1,250 per mensem for a period of five years. Secondly, an Assistant Conservator of Forests holding a "major" charge should receive an allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem, subject to the proviso that his salary (including the allowance) does not exceed Rs. 650 per mensem. I have nothing to add regarding the pay of the Provincial Forest Service.

4. (Head *(ii)*).—The present cadre of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Service in the Punjab is as follows:—

Conservator	1	Total Imperial Forest Service	12
Officers of the Imperial Forest Service below the rank of Conservator and exclusive of one post which still remains for transfer to the Provincial Forest Service	11		
Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests	2		
Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests	7	Total Provincial Forest Service	9
	21		21

There is a provision of 14 per cent. for leave and training in the Imperial Forest Service cadre, but no provision in the Provincial Forest Service.

5. Head *(iv)*.—The following statement shows the officers holding appointments outside the authorised cadre of the Punjab:—

Imperial Forest Service.

Dr. A. D. Blascheck, Sec. D. (Munich), Deputy Conservator of Forests.	On deputation to the Imperial Forest College.
Mr. R. N. Parker, Deputy Conservator of Forests.	
Mr. C. F. C. Beeson, Assistant Conservator of Forests	

6. Head *(v)*.—I have already stated in paragraph 7 of the memorandum submitted to Punjab Government with my letter No. 274, dated the 14th April, 1913, that an early increase in the cadre of the

† For new irrigated plantations.

ABSTRACT.		
<i>Imperial Forest Service.</i>		
80 per cent. of 12 major charges...	...	10
Officer for Government of India...	...	1
Officer for research work...	...	1
25 per cent. for leave and training	...	3
Total	15

Provincial Forest Service.		
20 per cent. of 12 major charges	...	2
All minor charges	3
Assistants in major charges	10
14 per cent. for leave and training	...	2
Total	17

ANNEXURE TO ABOVE.

FOREST DEPARTMENT.

The 30th April, 1908.

No. 241.—*Notification.*—The following rules for the appointment, training, and promotion of candidates for direct employment in the Punjab Provincial Forest Service are published for information:—

RULES.

1. For the present five posts in the Punjab Provincial Forest Service will be filled by direct appointment. Candidates for these appointments will be sent to the Imperial Forest College at Dehra Dun, United Provinces, to follow the ordinary curriculum for a period of two years, during which they will receive a stipend of Rs. 50 a month. If, at the end of this period, they have obtained the Higher Standard certificate of the College, they will follow the third years' course at the College, receiving a stipend during that year of Rs. 100 a month.

2. On the expiry of the third year's course, provided the Principal of the College gives them a certificate that they have satisfactorily completed their training, they will enter the Punjab Forest Department as probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests on Rs. 150 a month. After three years' approved service on probation they will be appointed permanently to the Punjab Provincial

APPENDICES I. (continued) AND II.

Forest Service on the occurrence of a vacancy in one of the posts reserved for them. These posts carry pay varying from Rs. 200 a month to Rs. 550 a month, promotions from grade to grade being regulated by seniority combined with practical efficiency. Proposals for the improvement of the pay of the Provincial Forest Service are now under consideration.

3. Applications must be forwarded to the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, through the Deputy Commissioner, or the Divisional Forest Officer, of the district in which the candidate resides. They must reach the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, not later than the 1st July each year.

4. Nominations will be given by the Lieutenant-Governor on the recommendation of the Conservator of Forests, Punjab.

5. Candidates for direct appointments must possess the following educational qualifications. They must have passed either:—

(i) the B.A., F.A., B.Sc., or Licentiate of Agriculture Examination; or

(ii) the matriculation examination, where no school final examination exists; or

(iii) the school final examination, provided the candidate can show that he has qualified in English and Mathematics up to the matriculation standard, or, for European candidates, a certificate of having passed the High School Examination with a similar proviso.

They must also satisfy the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, by means of an interview, that they have sufficient command of the English language to be able to understand the Dehra Dun College lectures.

6. They must also have the following qualifications:—

(a) A candidate must be a native of India, as defined in statute 33 Vic., chapter 3, section 6, or a subject of a Native State in India; he must be domiciled in the Punjab or a Native State under the political control of the Punjab Government, and must have recently resided for not less than three years in the Punjab or such Native State; or he may be a European British subject who has resided for not less than three years in the Punjab.

(b) He must not be less than 18 years of age, nor, except in special cases, more than 25 years of age* on the date on which he actually enters the College.

(c) He must have a health certificate in the form prescribed by article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 4th edition, signed by the Civil Surgeon of the district through whose Deputy-Commissioner or Divisional Forest Officer the application of the candidate is forwarded, and testifying to the candida-

* These words were substituted for the original wording by Notification No. 383, dated 24th August, 1908.

date's sound constitution, good vision, and hearing, as well as to his general physical fitness for a rough outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of small-pox.

(d) He must give satisfactory evidence of (i) good moral character; (ii) good physique; (iii) habits of personal activity; and (iv) gentlemanly bearing.

(e) If Urdu is not his vernacular, he must have passed the examination in that language by the Lower Standard, as laid down in the Army Regulations, India. If it is his vernacular, he must give satisfactory evidence that he can read Urdu fluently and write the Persian character with facility.

7. In addition to the qualifications mentioned in Rule 6, the applicant must possess at least one of the following further qualifications—that is to say, he must either—

(a) a member of a family of tried loyalty and distinguished service; or

(b) a person of good social status and influence in the country; or

(c) a member of a class whose introduction into the public service the Government desires specially to encourage.

Explanation.—Clause (a).—The mere fact that a man's father or other relation has served with credit as an official does not give a claim under this clause. Such claim arises only by reason of really distinguished services, or some conspicuous act of loyalty performed by the father or grandfather or other very near relative.

Clause (b).—A claim under this clause does not arise from mere respectability of status, or influence, such as that which a member of a municipal committee may have in his town, but from high social status, such as that of a member of a family having an unofficial seat in Darbar or territorial influence due to great wealth.

8. Should it happen that there are not sufficient vacancies at the college for all the students nominated for the third year's course immediately they have completed the first two years' course:—

(a) they will be allowed to take the third year's course immediately vacancies occur; and

(b) while they are waiting for such vacancies they will be appointed as Forest Rangers on the Punjab Establishment on the pay of Rs. 80 (rupees eighty) a month, for the first year they may be kept waiting, and thereafter they will receive pay at the rate of one hundred rupees a month until they are sent to the college for the third year's course.

9. With five direct appointments one may be expected to fall vacant every four years; should the number be extended, vacancies will of course occur with greater frequency.

W. M. HAILEY,
Secretary to Government, Punjab.

APPENDIX II.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh relating to the Forest Department.

A.—IMPERIAL FOREST OFFICERS.

I.—METHODS OF RECRUITMENT TO SERVICE, AND II.—SYSTEM OF TRAINING AND PROLATION.—The Lieutenant Governor agrees with the proposal made by the majority of the members of the Imperial Service to alter the present method of recruitment. In view of the smallness of the number of candidates and the probationers in each year His Honour agrees that it would be better that the training should be carried out at one residential institution; preferably the Oxford University.

II.—CONDITIONS OF SALARY.—His Honour is of opinion that the scale of pay for assistant and deputy conservators should be the same as that of the assistant and executive engineers in the Public Works Department (Imperial branch), and that there should be three grades of Conservators on Rs. 1,800, Rs. 1,800, and Rs. 2,000. The Chief Conservator should draw Rs. 2,500 and the Inspector-General Rs. 3,000.

V.—CONDITIONS OF LEAVE.—No need for a change has been disclosed.

VI.—CONDITIONS OF PENSION.—His Honour cannot agree to support any increase in pension charges.

VII.—LIMITATIONS IN THE EMPLOYMENT OF NON-EUROPEANS, AND THE WORKING OF THE EXISTING SYSTEM OF DIVISION OF SERVICE INTO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL.—This matter has been dealt with in regard to the Provincial Service. There seems no case for altering existing arrangements.

VIII.—RELATION OF THE SERVICE WITH THE INDIAN CIVIL SERVICE AND OTHER SERVICES.—This subject does not call for any remarks.

IX.—ANY OTHER POINTS WITHIN THE TERMS OF REFERENCE TO THE COMMISSION.—The only proposal which His Honour proposed to support is for the creation of a family pension fund, provided this can be established on

APPENDICES II. (continued) AND III.

a sound actuarial basis, and without extra cost to the State.

B.—PROVINCIAL FOREST OFFICERS.

I.—METHODS OF RECRUITMENT.—His Honour considers that nomination by the Conservator and final selection by Government is the soundest principle. He is not prepared to agree to the suggestions in the Memorandum. As regards the proposal that 20 per cent. should be fixed as the maximum of vacancies in the Provincial Service to be filled by promoting rangers of tried ability and probity, His Honour is of opinion that no change is required. This opinion covers the suggestion made in the revised joint Memorandum as to the promotion of rangers. As regards the promotion of foresters who hold the certificate of the old vernacular course, Dehra Dun (D. D. Fs.), His Honour considers that the existing system should be maintained.

II.—SYSTEM OF TRAINING AND PROBATION.—The period of practical training before admission to the Forest College at Dehra Dun should be at least six months. There does not appear to be any sufficient reason for altering the present period of three years' probation after the completion of training at the College.

It must obviously be a matter of time to raise the training in India to the level of that of the officers of the Imperial Service.

III.—CONDITIONS OF SERVICE.—The present division into Imperial and Provincial Service should be maintained. The time is not yet ripe for any alteration. The Provincial Service has recently been reorganised and the pay now is good, but the duties and responsibilities of officers of Provincial and Imperial Services are not the same, and in the opinion of His Honour, Provincial Service men cannot be found at present fit to rank with the Imperial Service Officers.

The charges of divisions must necessarily go by efficiency. Seniority even in the Imperial Service is not recognised as a claim to any particular division. There is no objection to the proposal that both Imperial and Provincial Forest Officers should remain in actual charge of a range for at least one year so far as this can be arranged with a due regard to the administrative necessities. As regards the suggestion in the revised Memorandum

that the distinction between major and minor divisions should be abolished and that the more important divisions should be allotted only to senior men, whether in the Imperial or Provincial Service, His Honour is of opinion that the distinction should be maintained. He considers that there is a marked difference between the qualifications and class of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Officers—that the Imperial Officers should hold charge of the more important divisions. In practice no officer is placed in independent charge until he has passed his examinations.

Confidential reports.—His Honour has accepted the principle that adverse comments likely to affect promotion should be communicated to the officers concerned.

IV.—CONDITIONS OF SALARY.—The present scale of pay was fixed only in 1911. There is no reason for a revision at present. Further, His Honour is unable to agree to any scale which would give automatic promotion all the time.

V.—CONDITIONS OF LEAVE.—The proposal as to privilege leave has been dealt with generally for all Services.

VI.—CONDITIONS OF PENSION.—The present rules seem sufficiently liberal. His Honour cannot agree to any increase of non-effective charges.

VII.—LIMITATION IN THE EMPLOYMENT OF NON-EUROPEANS AND THE DIVISION OF SERVICE INTO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL.

The present principle, whereby charges are divided into major and minor and one-fifth of the former and the whole of the latter are reserved for the members of the Provincial Service, satisfies all present requirements. There is no evidence at present to show that it will be possible to obtain suitable Indians for higher administrative ranks in the Forest Department. The proposal made in paragraph 16 of the revised Memorandum to throw open one of the three circle charges of the Province to the Provincial Forest Service is premature.

IX.—ANY OTHER POINTS WITHIN THE TERMS OF REFERENCE TO THE ROYAL COMMISSION NOT COVERED BY THE PRECEDING HEADS.—The proposal as to travelling allowance cannot be supported. This allowance is meant only to cover the extra cost of touring, and it is not a matter of prestige.

APPENDIX III.

*Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Forest Department.***(I) THE IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.**

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—The officers of the Imperial Forest Service are appointed under covenant with the Service are appointed under covenant with the Secretary of State either under the regulations laid down from time to time by the Secretary of State or in such other manner as may be approved by him. Candidates must not be less than 19 and more than 23 years of age. Every candidate must be a natural born subject of His Majesty. He must be prepared to give an undertaking, if selected, that he will not marry before he reaches India. A native of India, however, is not barred by early marriage in accordance with the customs of his race. Candidates for appointment in the Imperial Forest Service must have obtained a degree with honours in some branch of natural science in a University of England, Wales or Ireland, or have passed the final Bachelor of Science examination in pure science in one of the Universities of Scotland. A degree in applied science is not considered as fulfilling these conditions. Candidates are also required to produce evidence that they have a fair knowledge of either German or French.

The Secretary of State for India in Council appoints probationers for the Indian Forest Service in accordance with the advice of a selection committee. Any University in the

United Kingdom which possesses a Forest school approved by the Secretary of State, is permitted to train Forest probationers, and for this purpose he has approved of the Forest schools existing at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh. The ordinary period of probation is two years; during that time probationers are required to pass through the Forestry course at one of the Universities named above, becoming members of that University, if not so already, to obtain the degree or diploma in Forestry which it grants and to satisfy such other tests of proficiency as may be deemed necessary.

The only objection which has been raised to the present system of recruitment is that it results in men coming out to India at too late an age. The Governor in Council has considerable sympathy with this point of view, which he has recently supported in connection with the Indian Civil Service. There can be no doubt that, as a rule, men of 25 are less pliable and find greater difficulty in settling down to their work in India than officers who come out four or five years earlier. At the same time the possession of a science degree is of great advantage to most Forest Officers, now that forest work in India is expanding and developing on scientific lines, and if a University training in natural science is considered essential it will be impossible to select candidates at a much earlier age than at present.

APPENDIX III. (continued).

It is understood, however, that certain Universities, such as Oxford and Edinburgh, offer facilities to candidates for undergoing the theoretical portion of the course for the diploma in forestry in conjunction with the course for the science degree, and the Government of Bengal would be glad to see this arrangement developed, if possible, so as to enable the period of probation after selection to be reduced ordinarily to one year. It has also been suggested that the physical test now imposed on candidates is not sufficiently stringent, and that the old test of a lengthy cross-country run, which was abandoned some years ago, should be reinstated. In view of the life of exposure and hardship which Forest Officers have to undergo during their service, particularly in a Province with climatic conditions like those of Bengal, the Government of Bengal consider this suggestion worthy of consideration.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The rates of pay in 1890 and 1900 were as follows:—

	Appointment.		Salary.	
	1890.	1900.	Rs.	Rs.

Assistant Conservator of

Forests—

3rd grade	250	Abolished.
2nd	"	"	350	350
1st	"	"	450	450

Deputy Conservator of

Forests—

4th grade	550	550
3rd	"	"	650	650
2nd	"	"	800	800
1st	"	"	900	900

Conservator—

3rd grade	1,000	1,100
2nd	"	"	1,250	1,350
1st	"	"	1,500	1,600

At present, on appointment to the Indian Forest Service, an officer is styled "Assistant Conservator" and draws pay at Rs. 380 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 to Rs. 700 a month, and thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 up to a maximum of Rs. 1,250 a month, which is reached in the twentieth year of service. Until he has passed the examination prescribed in the Forest Department Code an Assistant Conservator is not entitled to draw pay at a higher rate than Rs. 460 a month. On passing the examination he is entitled to resume drawing pay under the time scale at the rate to which his length of service entitles him. Whilst drawing pay up to and including Rs. 510 a month an officer is styled "Assistant Conservator," and when drawing pay at Rs. 580 to Rs. 1,250 a month he ranks as "Deputy Conservator."

Promotions to the rank of Conservator are made by the Government of India on the recommendation of the Local Government. There are three grades of Conservators carrying salaries of Rs. 1,900, Rs. 1,700 and Rs. 1,500, respectively.

Forest Officers are admissible to certain special allowances which are governed by article 39 of the Forest Code, 7th edition.

The Government of Bengal consider that the pay of Conservators is inadequate in view of the responsibilities of their work and position as advisers to the Local Government in Forest matters, and administrators of the Local Forest Department. An increase of Rs. 250 a month is not sufficient recognition of the greater responsibilities and expenses which fall upon a Deputy Conservator who is promoted to be Conservator, and it is accordingly suggested that the pay of the lowest grade of Conservators should be raised to Rs. 1,750 and of the other two grades to Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,250 respectively.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*

The existing cadre of the Imperial Forest Service in Bengal consist of one post of Conservator and 11 posts of Deputy and Assistant Conservators (the latter including one India list appointment). Two posts have been provided in the cadre for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—Mr. F. Trafford, Deputy Conservator of Forests, is acting as Conservator of Forests in the Central Provinces.

Mr. E. P. Stebbing, Deputy Conservator of Forests, is on deputation to the Edinburgh University pending retirement.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The present cadre of the Imperial Service in Bengal is sufficient, provided 20 per cent. of the major charges are held by Provincial officers as required by the existing orders on the subject. But the conditions of the Bengal forests are such that great difficulty is experienced in finding suitable Provincial officers to hold charge of the major forest divisions, and consequently the Imperial staff is barely sufficient for present actual requirements. An addition to the staff will probably be required shortly to cope with developments which are taking place in regard to the commercial working of the Bengal forests.

(II) THE PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Provincial Forest Service consists of—

Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators.

Appointments to the Provincial Forest Service are made—

(a) By the promotion of Forest Rangers of long service and tried probity, irrespective of the educational qualifications they may hold;

(b) By the selection for direct appointment of candidates who must successfully pass through the Provincial Forest Service course at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, and thereafter render not less than three years' satisfactory service as probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests before being confirmed.

Candidates for nomination to the Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute must possess the following minimum educational qualifications:—

(a) A certificate of having passed the I.Sc., I.E. or I.A. examination of an Indian University in a group of subjects, including mathematics, or

(b) The Licentiate of Agriculture degree of a Government Agricultural College, or

(c) If a European, the Junior School certificate awarded in connection with the Cambridge Local examination in a group of subjects including algebra, geometry and trigonometry:

Provided that in the case of candidates who were above the age of 16 years on the 31st December, 1910, other certificates may be accepted if they show the candidates to possess knowledge of English sufficient to follow the course and also knowledge of arithmetic, algebra—up to and including quadratic equations and simple problems, geometry—the first three books of Euclid and the elements of trigonometry, including the solution of triangles and the use of logarithms.

On the nomination of candidates they are required—

(a) To sign an agreement binding themselves to work diligently while at the institute and to serve Government for not less than five years after passing out of the institute;

(b) To find two sureties to execute a bond in the prescribed form guaranteeing that, under special circumstances therein detailed, they will refund all money expended by Government on the nominee's behalf, etc.

These regulations were only brought into force in March last. They were devised after very careful consideration, but it is too early to come to any definite conclusion as to their working.

APPENDICES III. (continued) AND IV.

2. The rates of pay in the Provincial Forest Service in 1890 and 1900 are noted below:—

Appointment.	Salary.	
	1890. Rs.	1900. Rs.
Sub-Assistant Conservator of Forests—		
4th grade	... No post of 4th grade	200
3rd "	... 150	250
2nd "	... 200	300
1st "	... 250	350
Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests—		
4th grade	... No post of	450
3rd "	... Extra Deputy Conservator	500
2nd "	... Conservator	550
1st "	... of Forests.	600

The existing rates of pay are as follows:—

On appointment an officer is styled Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, and draws pay at the rate of Rs. 250 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 550 a month in the sixteenth year of service.

On reaching a salary of Rs. 550 a month an officer may be promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator, provided he is considered fit to hold a major charge. An Extra Deputy Conservator draws pay at the rate of Rs. 575 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 to Rs. 650 a month.

After one year's service on this pay the Local Government may, by special order in each case, promote an officer to a pay of Rs. 700 a month for a period of three years and again to a pay of Rs. 800 a month for a further period of three years, and finally to a pay of Rs. 850 a month until the close of his service. Promotions to these three higher rates of pay will, however, be made only when the Local Government is satisfied at each step that the individual officer thoroughly deserves it.

These rates of pay which were introduced in 1911 are satisfactory.

3. The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.—There are no grades. Pay is drawn according to time-scale, as stated above.

The Bengal Provincial Forest cadre consists of one post of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests and six posts of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

For leave and training provision has been made for one post in the Provincial Forest Service.

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.—None.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—The cadre is at present sufficient, but additions will probably be necessary in the near future for the reasons given in the case of the Imperial Service.

APPENDIX IV.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Forest Department.

A. IMPERIAL SERVICE.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—The regulations are the same as for the rest of British India. The Local Government are generally satisfied with them and have no recommendation to make.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.—The present rates of pay are the same as those obtaining throughout British India. It is unnecessary to discuss the rates previously obtaining as this Province came into existence in April, 1912. There are no local allowances in force generally in the Province but a special allowance is granted to the Divisional Officer and staff in Angul to compensate for the inaccessibility of the district.

The present rates of pay are generally adequate, but the Local Government would recommend that the salaries of administrative officers be assimilated to those now obtaining in the administrative ranks of the Public Works Department. At present they compare as follows:—

Public Works Department.

	Rs.
Superintending Engineers, 3rd grade	1,500
Ditto	2nd "
Ditto	1st "
Chief Engineers, 2nd grade	2,250
Ditto	1st "
	2,750

Forest Department.

Conservators, 3rd grade	... 1,500
Ditto	2nd "
Ditto	1st "
Chief Conservators of Forests	2,150

Inspector-General of Forests ... 2,650

The principle was accepted in paragraph 7 of the Government of India's Despatch, No. 312 of 1890, to the Secretary of State that Conservators should receive equal rates of salary with Superintending Engineers, and the inadequacy of the remuneration of the Inspector-General of Forests was recognised in the Government of India's Despatch, No. 389, of 1906, to the Secretary of State.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave or training.—The present sanctioned Imperial cadre is that which was transferred from Bengal on the formation of this Province with the addition of a post of Conservator and consists of:—

1 Conservator.
4 Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests.

The present cadre does not include sufficient provision for leave and training (vide 5 below).

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.—One Assistant Conservator of Forests out of the four Deputy and Assistant Conservators is on deputation temporarily to the Feudatory States of Orissa, and the deficiency has been made good by the addition of a Provincial officer to the staff employed within British territory. A supernumerary Assistant Conservator has been posted to this Province.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—The present cadre is insufficient and proposals have been submitted to the Government of India, for strengthening it, vide letter No. 3505R, dated the 24th July, 1913, from this Government, a copy of which is attached (Annexure 1).

B. PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—The present regulations for Bihar and Orissa were framed in 1912 and are contained in the Notification of the Local Government, No. 3581R (B), dated the 6th November, 1912, an extract from which is attached (Annexure 2). Government are satisfied with the present regulations but consider that the educational qualifications demanded of candidates should be gradually raised in the manner contemplated in paragraph 2 of the Secretary of State's Despatch No. 8 Revenue of the 19th January, 1912, as the standard of the Provincial Service is raised more nearly to the level of that obtaining in the Imperial Service and the improved prospects recommended in paragraph 2 below attract a higher type of candidate.

APPENDIX IV. (continued).

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.—The rates of pay and allowances drawn by Provincial Forest Officers in this Province are those sanctioned in the Government of India's Resolution, No. 17F—77—33, of 23rd June, 1911. The Local Government regard with general sympathy the suggestion that the Provincial Service be reconstituted on the same basis as the Provincial Service of the Public Works Department. Such reconstitution would improve the pay and allowances of Provincial Officers, raise their status and remove many of their existing grievances.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.—The cadre as transferred from Bengal consists of two Extra Deputy Conservators and six Extra Assistant Conservators. It does not include sufficient provision for leave and training (vide paragraph 5 below).

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.—In addition to the two posts of Extra Deputy Conservator there is one temporary post in that grade which has been created to make good the deficiency in the strength of the Imperial Service cadre due to the deputation of an Imperial officer to the Feudatory States in Orissa. Of the two posts of Extra Deputy Conservator one is held by an officer deputed to the Mayurbhanj Feudatory State in Orissa.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—The present cadre is insufficient and proposals have been submitted to the Government of India for strengthening it, vide letter No. 3505R, dated the 24th July, 1913, cited above.

Ranchi.

Dated the 24th October, 1913.

ANNEXURE I.

No. 5305R, dated Ranchi, the 24th July, 1913.

From.—The Hon'ble Mr. H. McPherson, I.C.S., Secretary to Government of Bihar and Orissa, Revenue Department.

To.—The Secretary to the Government of India, Department of Revenue and Agriculture.

I am directed to refer to the correspondence ending with Mr. Holme's letter No. 918F—297-3, dated the 31st of October, 1912, and to submit, for the consideration and orders of the Government of India, the following proposals for the revision of the cadre of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Services of Bihar and Orissa.

2. In accordance with the distribution of the Forest cadres between Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, and Assam sanctioned in your letter No. 412F—126-9, dated the 24th April, 1913, a staff of four Imperial and eight Provincial officers, excluding the Conservator and two probationers, has been allotted to this Province. The apportionment follows the arrangement made by the Government of Bengal that each of the Forest Divisions falling within the territory of Bihar and Orissa should be transferred to this Province with the whole of its staff as it stood on the 1st of April, 1912. Since the formation of the new Circle one supernumerary Imperial Officer has been added to the cadre. The adequacy of the staff has been carefully examined by the Conservator of Forests with reference to the requirements of the circle and his recommendations have been duly considered by the Lieutenant-Governor in Council.

3. In accordance with the principles laid down in the Government of India's Circular No. 35F—388-1, dated the 11th October, 1907, the Conservator has classified the posts in his circle into seven major and six minor charges as follows:

Major.	Minor.
1. Direction.	1. Sambalpur.
2. Singhbhum.	2. Santal Parganas.
3. Chaibassa.	3. Mayurbhanj.
4. Angul.	4-6. Three attached officers in the
5. Puri.	Singhbhum
6. Palamau.	Division.
7. Orissa Feudatory States.	

In doing so he has made four changes in the classification accepted in connection with the re-organisation of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Services of Bengal which was sanctioned in the Secretary of State's Despatch, No. 6-Revenue, dated the 15th January, 1909. These changes consist of the addition of the Chaibassa Division and the Orissa Feudatory States to the major charges, and of attached officer for the Singhbhum Division to the minor charges. The ("Singhbhum") has recently been enlarged by the transfer to it of two ranges from the Singhbhum Division. It now includes 160 square miles of reserved forest and 207 square miles of protected forest, and the receipts during the current year are estimated at Rs. 55,200. It has been placed under the charge of an Imperial Officer since October, 1911, and in view of its importance the Lieutenant-Governor in Council is satisfied that it should in future be classified as a major charge. The addition of a minor charge within the Singhbhum Division is necessary because a third attached officer is required to supervise the important timber depots on the railway.

4. The Lieutenant-Governor in Council has given his careful consideration to the proposal of the Conservator that permanent provision should be made in the cadre of the Forest Department for one major and one minor charge within the Feudatory States of Orissa, and is fully convinced that there is an overwhelming case for the acceptance of the proposal. It is unnecessary to reiterate the arguments which were adduced in the Government of Bengal's letters No. 2233P., dated the 25th March, 1907, and No. 2441P.D., dated the 6th November, 1909, to the Foreign Department of the Government of India in support of the proposal that an officer of the Imperial Forest Department should be deputed to assist the Political Agent in supervising the working of forests within the Feudatory States, a measure which was necessary alike in the interests of the States themselves and for the protection of the adjoining British territory. These arguments were accepted and the necessity of the appointment recognised in Mr. Wood's letter No. 11431.B., dated the 16th June, 1910. While, however, the necessity was recognised as permanent and continuing, financial considerations rendered it impossible to make full provision for the charge, and an arrangement was sanctioned whereby the deputation of an Imperial officer was made good by the addition of a Provincial officer to the staff employed within British territory. The financial difficulty no longer exists, and in considering what are the total requirements of the Province as a whole for the purposes of the present re-organisation scheme, the arrangement of 1910 must be ignored. The Feudatory States appointment is a major charge, and its recognition as such does not affect the classification of charges within British territory.

There remains the proposed addition of a minor charge for the forest administration of the Mayurbhanj Feudatory State. The services of Mr. A. H. Mee, an Extra Deputy Conservator, were lent to this State at the particular request of the late Maharaja. The arrangement will hold good during the minority of the present of the present Maharaja, who is only 14 years of age, and there is every reason to believe that it will be continued indefinitely after he attains his majority. Mayurbhanj, the largest of the Feudatory States, has an area of 4,110 square miles, and includes 1,054 square miles of reserved forest and 741 square miles of protected forest. The most valuable portions of these have been leased to a contractor for 30 years, and the services of a competent forest officer are necessary to control this lease alone. Apart, moreover, from these considerations based on the special requirements of Mayurbhanj, there is no reason to expect that the time will ever come when the services of an additional Provincial officer will cease to be required within the Feudatory States. On the contrary, there is every likelihood that the demand for such officers will increase in the near future, for the subject of forest con-

APPENDIX IV. (continued).

servation is receiving enhanced attention, and the Chiefs are rapidly becoming alive to the importance of the interests at stake.

An extract from the Political Agent's Report for 1911-12, which shows the excellent work done by the Agency Forest Officer and the ever-increasing interests of the Chiefs in the better administration of their forests, is annexed to this letter for the information of the Government of India (Enclosure No. 1).

5. The following calculation, which is based on the above classification of charges, shows that a total staff of eight Imperial and eight Provincial officers might fairly be claimed for the Province :-

Imperial.

80 per cent. of major charges	6
25 per cent. for leave reserve	1
1 officer for the India List	1
			—
Total	8

Provincial.

20 per cent. of major charges	1
6 minor charges	6
14 per cent. for leave reserve	1
			—
Total	8

The Conservator, however, having regard to the principle enunciated in paragraph 6 of Circular No. 35F.—388-1, dated the 11th October, 1907, does not desire to press for the full complement of Imperial officers, but proposes that in lieu of one Imperial post an additional post of Extra Deputy Conservator should be created in the Provincial Service, making a total of seven Imperial and nine Provincial officers. The net result of these proposals, in which the Lieutenant-Governor in Council concurs, would be an increase of two Imperial officers and one Provincial officer over the staff shown in paragraph 2 of your letter No. 412F.—126-9, dated the 24th April, 1912.

6. As regards the grading of these posts, the seven Imperial officers have been shown in the accompanying proposition statement (Enclosure No. 11) as consisting of one Conservator on an average pay of Rs. 1,700, and six Deputy and Assistant Conservators on an average pay of Rs. 817 a month. The nine officers of the Provincial Service have been distributed in the proportion of four Extra Deputy Conservators to five Extra Assistant Conservators. In fixing this proportion regard has been had to the principles laid down in paragraph 2 (ii.) of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Revenue and Agricultural Department, No. 17F.—77-33, dated the 23rd June, 1911, which requires that Provincial officers shall not be promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator unless they are fit to hold major charges, and that Extra Deputy Conservators shall, except for special reasons, actually be placed in charges classed as major. At present in this Province three major charges (Puri, Angul and Palamau) are held by Provincial officers, of whom one only (Mr. Hannah) is an Extra Deputy Conservator under the temporary arrangement sanctioned in Mr. Holme's letter No. 918F.—297-3, dated the 31st October, 1912. The two others are Extra Assistant Conservators who have administered their major charges with credit, and are considered by the Local Government eligible for promotion to the upper controlling staff. The two permanent Extra Deputy Conservators at present on the staff of the Province (Messrs. Mee and Haslett) are employed on minor charges (Mayurbhanj and the Santal Parganas) which, for special reasons, require to be administered by officers of superior rank. In these circumstances, and in view of the facts that a disproportionately small number of Imperial officers has been allotted to Bihar and Orissa as compared with the number allotted respectively to Bengal and Assam and that it has been proposed in paragraph 5 to surrender one Imperial post, the Lieutenant-Governor in Council does not consider it unreasonable that the Conservator should ask

for four appointments of Extra Deputy Conservators. Any other distribution of the Provincial staff will cause stagnation of promotion and militate against the efficient administration of the Department.

7. The ultimate additional annual expenditure involved amounts to Rs. 14,123-4-0, as shown in the proposition statement; but in view of the immediate needs of the Province the Conservator does not wish to ask for the additional Imperial officer at present. He proposes to leave a vacancy against the India List appointment, and His Honour in Council agrees that the existing staff of six Imperial officers, including the supernumerary officer as a permanent appointment, is sufficient for present purposes. Against the increase in cost it will appear from the accompanying statement (Enclosure No. II) that the revenue derived from the circle is growing steadily, and there can be little doubt that more adequate control and improved supervision will bring about considerable further expansion.

8. In conclusion, the Lieutenant-Governor in Council requests that should his proposals meet with the approval of the Government of India, he may be permitted at his discretion to fix the date from which they will take effect according as funds permit.

ANNEXURE II.

The 6th November, 1912.

No. 5431R(B).—The following revised rules are published for general information in supersession of the rules published under Notification No. 1010T.R., dated the 23rd June, 1910:—

* * * * *

III—Rules for the recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service in Bihar and Orissa.

1. Subject to the satisfaction of the claims of persons already qualified under the rules hitherto in force, appointments to the Provincial Forest Service shall be made:—

(a) by the promotion of Forest Rangers of long service and tried ability and probity, irrespective of the educational qualifications they may hold;

(b) by the selection for direct appointment of candidates who must successfully pass the two years' course at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, and thereafter render a term of service as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, the length of which will depend among other things upon the quality of work done by them during the course.

Government reserves to itself the right to fill all vacancies in such of the two ways described, as it may consider best, in the interests of public service.

2. Candidates for direct appointment will be nominated by the Local Government with special reference to high educational and social qualifications and to physical fitness for work in the Forest Department.

3. The pay of the Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests will be Rs. 150 per mensem during the period of their probation and thereafter Rs. 200 per mensem until they can be appointed to vacancies in the sanctioned cadre of the Provincial Forest Service.

4. Selected candidates may, during the two years' course at the Research Institute, receive a stipend which will be dependent upon their work and progress. Such stipend will in no case exceed Rs. 2,400 for the two years, i.e., shall not exceed an average rate of Rs. 100 per mensem.

5. Except for special reasons, and under the special orders of the Local Government in each case, candidates must be between the ages of 18 and 25 on the 1st November in the year in which the course begins.

6. The Inspector-General of Forests has the power to relax the above rule.

The following certificates must be forwarded with applications.

APPENDICES IV. (continued) AND V.

(a) A certificate that the candidate is a "Native of India" within the meaning assigned to these words* by section 6 of 53 Vict., Cap. 3.

N.B.—This certificate may be omitted in the case of private students and of students deputed by the British Colonies.

(b) A certificate of age.

(c) A health certificate in the form prescribed by article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th Edition, signed by a Civil Surgeon or such other qualified Medical Officer as may be approved by the President, and testifying to the candidate's sound constitution, good vision and hearing and general physical fitness for a rough outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of smallpox.

(d) A certificate showing that the candidate is of good social standing and good moral character. The certificates (c) and (d) must bear date not further back than the 1st January of the year previous to that in which the candidate desired admission to the College.

(e) A certificate that the candidate possesses a thorough knowledge of colloquial English which will permit of his following a highly technical course, and is generally of good education.

* "Native of India" means any person born and domiciled within the dominions of His Majesty in India, or within the territories of Indian Princes tributary to or in alliance with His Majesty, of parents habitually resident in India and not established there for temporary purposes only (Art. 37. Civil Service Regulations).

Certificates (d) and (e) must be signed by a Conservator of Forests, District Officer, Political Agent, or a British Government Gazetted Officer of high standing.

The Inspector-General of Forests may, should he consider it desirable, relax any of the conditions imposed under this rule.

(f) A certificate of having passed one of the following examinations, viz.:—

(1) The B.A., F.A., B.Sc., or Licentiate of Agriculture.

(2) The Matriculation where no School Final Examination exists.

(3) The School Final Examination, provided the candidate can show that he has qualified in English and Mathematics up to the Matriculation Standard or, for European candidates, a certificate of having passed the High School Examination with a similar proviso.

7. Nominated candidates will be required (a) to execute a bond and agreement as attached, (b) to undergo a preliminary practical training in such Forest Divisions as the Conservator of Forests Bihar and Orissa, may direct in order to prove his fitness for Forest work. Such training may extend to a period of not more than six months. During this preliminary training candidates will receive such consolidated allowance as may be ordered by the Local Government.

* * * * *
J. F. GRUNING,
Secretary to the Government of Bihar and Orissa.

APPENDIX V.

Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Forest Department.

A.—IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—The regulations regarding recruitment, training and probation are those prescribed by the Secretary of State in the Government of India's Circulars No. 21 F.—280-2, dated the 18th October, 1912, and No. 13 F.—85-2, dated the 10th May, 1911. The Chief Commissioner's opinion on these regulations will be found in his note dated the 9th April, 1913, already submitted to the Commission.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.—The rates of pay of the Imperial Forest Officers in 1890 were as follows:—

	1st grade. Rs.	2nd grade. Rs.	3rd grade. Rs.	4th grade. Rs.
Conservators	1,500	1,250	1,000	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	550
Assistant	450	350	250	—

The scale was modified in 1891 and the rates of pay in 1900 were accordingly as follows:—

	1st grade. Rs.	2nd grade. Rs.	3rd grade. Rs.	4th grade. Rs.
Conservators	1,600	1,350	1,100	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	—
Assistant	450	350	—	—

The present rates of pay of Conservators are:—

	Rs.
First grade	1,900
Second grade	1,700
Third grade	1,600

In 1907 the grading of the officers below the rank of Conservators was abolished and a time-scale introduced in its place. According to this scale an officer of the Imperial Forest Service starts with a pay of Rs. 350 per mensem rising by annual increment of Rs. 40 to Rs. 700 per mensem, thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to

Rs. 1,250 per mensem in the twentieth year of service.

In 1908 the Secretary of State sanctioned the grant of local allowances to Forest Officers below the rank of Conservators, serving in Assam districts other than Sylhet and the plains portion of Cachar. Under these orders an officer in charge of a forest division receives an allowance at the rate of Rs. 80 per mensem and other officers at the rate of Rs. 50 per mensem.

As regards the pay of Conservators of Forests, the Chief Commissioner considers that these officers should get the same pay as Superintending Engineers, except in the case of provinces where there is no Chief Conservator, where an allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem should be given to them. The rates of pay and allowances of the other officers appear satisfactory.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.—There are at present two Conservators of Forests and thirteen (including two supernumerary) Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests in this province in the sanctioned cadre. When the cadre of the Forest Department was last revised in 1909, a provision of 25 per cent. was made for vacancies for leave and training.

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.—One officer has recently been placed on foreign service under the Manipur Darbar for seven months.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—The present cadre is insufficient for the needs of the province. A proposal, which has been submitted by the Conservators of Forests for the increase of the number of Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests from 11 to 20, is now under consideration.

B.—PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—Recruitment is made by promotion in exceptional cases from the Rangers class under

APPENDIX V. (continued).

Article 15 of the Forest Department Code, 7th edition, and more ordinarily from candidates selected for direct appointment. The selected candidates undergo at the Forest College, Dehra Dun, a course of training which is regulated under the rules approved by the Government of India. On their successfully completing the College course the candidates are appointed as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests for a minimum period of one year in the case of those who obtained certificates with Honours from the Forest College, and of two years in the case of others. After the probationary period the candidates are eligible for permanent appointment on the occurrence of vacancies in the cadre. A copy of the rules issued by the Local Administration containing extracts from the Dehra Dun Forest College rules is enclosed herewith.

The rules as to recruitment, probation and training appear to the Chief Commissioner to be satisfactory.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.— In 1890, the rates of pay of these officers, who were then designated as Sub-Assistant Conservators, were Rs. 175, Rs. 200 and Rs. 250. The scale was revised in 1891, and the rates in force in 1900 were accordingly as follows:—

	1 st grade.	2 nd grade.	3 rd grade.	4 th grade.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Extra Deputy Conservators	600	550	500	450
Extra Assistant Conservators	350	300	250	200

With effect from the 1st March, 1911, a time-scale has been introduced under which an officer appointed to the Provincial Forest Service on a permanent appointment receives a pay of Rs. 250 per mensem which rises by annual increment of Rs. 20 per mensem until it reaches Rs. 550 a month after 15 years' service. If an officer is considered fit to hold a major charge he is promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservators on a pay of Rs. 575 per mensem rising by an annual increment of Rs. 25 per mensem to Rs. 650. He may then, after one year of service, be specially promoted to Rs. 700 per mensem for a period of three years and then to Rs. 800 per mensem for a further period of three years and finally to Rs. 850 per mensem (vide Government of India Department of Revenue and Agriculture Resolution No. 17 F.—77-3, dated the 23rd June, 1911).

Local allowances varying from Rs. 40 to Rs. 80 were sanctioned for these officers, serving in districts other than Sylhet and the plains portion of Cachar, in 1908.

The present rates of pay and allowances are sufficiently liberal as regards the ordinary Provincial Service Officer. In Sir Archdale Earle's opinion, however, as explained in his note of the 9th April, 1913, an officer of this Service, who is promoted to a divisional charge, should be allowed to enter the time-scale of the superior Service.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.— There are at present two Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests and ten Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests in the sanctioned cadre of this province. At the last revision a provision of 14 per cent. was allowed for leave and training.

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.— No appointments are held by any officers outside the cadre, but an Extra Deputy Conservator has been placed on special duty for 22 months in connection with the preparation of descriptive lists of trees in Assam.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.— Additions to the cadre are required. A proposal, which has been submitted by the Conservators of Forests to increase the number of Extra Deputy Conservators from two to four and of Extra Assistant Conservators from 10 to 17, is under consideration.

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

The 17th September, 1913.

No. 6366R.—The following rules, relating to the recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service in Assam and the selection of Assam candidates for deputation to the Ranger's Service Course at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, are published for general information:—

(I) RULES FOR THE RECRUITMENT OF THE PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE IN ASSAM.

Extract from the Rules of the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun relating to the Provincial Service course.

15. The maximum number of students that will be admitted in any one year will be decided by the President, subject to the orders of the Inspector-General of Forests. Within this number, nominations will be assigned to the various provinces by the President who, after satisfying their requirements, may also assign vacancies to British Possessions, Native States, etc. The President is empowered to refuse an application for a nomination without assigning any reason.

16. All applications for nominations must be communicated to the President by the 15th October of the year preceding that in which the course will commence. All nominations will be allotted and communicated to Local Governments, etc., concerned by the 1st November. Should any nomination not be accepted, the President should be informed by as early a date as possible so as to permit of his transferring the nomination to some other Local Government, Native State, etc.

17. It is left to Local Governments to prescribe what educational qualifications they please, including any examination, competitive or otherwise, for candidates that it is proposed to depute to the Provincial Service course. The attention of Local Governments is, however, invited to the fact that the President is authorised to hold an examination in English and Mathematics of any candidate on arrival at Dehra. Experience has shown that even candidates, who have graduated at some Indian University, have often a wholly inadequate knowledge of both English and Mathematics. Unless, therefore, a candidate is thoroughly conversant with these subjects, as indicated in Rule 18, it will be merely waste of time to send him to the Institute.

Local Governments will also no doubt bear in mind the importance of giving a preference to candidates who are in all respects qualified by previous examinations to follow and profit by the course of instruction, it having been found that without a preliminary training in Science, probationers are not able to complete an advanced forest course within a limited time.

18. The President is authorised to hold an examination of any candidate on arrival at Dehra in English and Mathematics.

Candidates are expected to know sufficient English to follow the course, and in Mathematics should know Arithmetic, Algebra, up to and including Quadratic Equations and simple problems, Geometry—the first three books of Euclid, and the Elements of Trigonometry, including the solution of triangles and the use of Logarithms.

The President is authorised to refuse admission to any candidate who, in his opinion, does not possess sufficient knowledge of these subjects to properly follow the course.

19. *Physical test.*—Candidates, on arrival at Dehra, will undergo such physical tests as may be prescribed by the President, to be followed by a medical examination before a Medical Board.

Local Governments should take every precaution to ensure that the candidates selected by them will be such as will be able to pass these tests.

N.B.—At present the physical test is a walk from Dehra to Mussoorie and back, distance some 26 or 28 miles, to be completed within the number of hours that may be prescribed.

20. There are four categories of students—
(a) Private students.

APPENDIX V. (continued).

(b) Government probationary students, stipendiary or non-stipendiary.

(c) Students deputed by Native States and British Colonies.

(d) Students already in Government service.

21. (a) *Private students* can only be admitted if there are vacancies for such after satisfying the demands of (b), (c), (d) above. Their chief *raison d'être* is to meet a possible demand on the part of large landowners who may wish to place their forest areas under professional management.

(b) *Government Probationary students* are those nominated by a Local Government for direct appointment to, or as probationers for the Provincial Service.

(d) *Students already in Government Service* may be deputed at the discretion of Local Governments, provided that they pass the examination prescribed in Rule 17.

22. In the case of *Private students*, application for nominations must be made to the President direct, supported by a certificate from a Conservator of Forests, District Officer or Political Agent, that the candidate possesses the necessary social qualities and a good general education and appears likely to make a good executive Forest Officer.

23. In the case of *Government Probationary students* and those already in Government Service, applications must be made to the President direct by Local Governments concerned.

24. In the case of students from *Native States* and *British Colonies*, applications must be made to the President direct by the State Durbar, countersigned by the Political Agent, or by the Governor of a Colony or his representative.

25. *Age*.—Except for special reasons and under the special orders of the Local Government in each case, candidates must be between the ages of 18 and 25 on the 1st November in the year in which the course begins.

The Inspector-General of Forests has the power to relax the above rule.

26. *Certificates*.—With applications must be forwarded the following certificates:

(a) A certificate that the candidate is a "Native of India" within the meaning* assigned to those words by section 6 of 33 Vict., cap. 3.

N.B..—This certificate may be omitted in the case of private students deputed by British Colonies.

(b) A certificate of age.

(c) A health certificate in the form prescribed by Article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition, signed by a Civil Surgeon or such other qualified Medical Officer as may be approved by the President, and testifying to the candidate's sound constitution, good vision and hearing, and general physical fitness for a rough, outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of smallpox.

(d) A certificate showing that the candidate is of good social standing and good moral character. The certificates (e) and (d) must bear date not further back than the 1st January of the year previous to that in which the candidate desires admission to the College.

(e) A certificate that the candidate possesses a thorough knowledge of colloquial English, which will permit of his following a highly technical course, and is generally of good education.

Certificates (d) and (e) must be signed by a Conservator of Forests, District Officer, Political Agent, or a British Government gazetted officer of high standing.

The Inspector-General of Forests may, should he consider it desirable, relax any of the conditions imposed under this rule.

* "Native of India" means any person born and domiciled within the dominions of His Majesty in India, or within the territories of Indian Princes tributary to or in alliance with His Majesty, of parents habitually resident in India, and not established there for temporary purposes only. (Article 37, Civil Service Regulations.)

27. *Preliminary training*.—It is left to the discretion of Local Governments, etc., to test the suitability of their candidates for a forest career by a period of practical training in forests before they enter the service. Such training candidates will receive such consolidated allowance as may be ordered by the Local Governments, etc.

28. *Stipends or scholarships*—

(I) *Government Probationary students*.—It is left to Local Governments to award stipends or scholarships in such manner as they please, provided that the total for 24 months' course does not exceed Rs. 2,400, i.e., does not exceed an average rate of Rs. 100 per mensem. In the event of scholarship being awarded, the general method of assigning such will be—

(a) A stipend not exceeding Rs. 100 per mensem for the duration of the course or a portion thereof.

(b) In lieu of the above, a lump sum to be paid on a candidate's successfully obtaining such certificate as may have been agreed upon.

(c) Partly the one, partly the other of the above.

(II) *Students already in Government Service*.—Such officers will, while at the Institute, draw the pay and travelling allowances of their grade in the service, or a stipend not exceeding Rs. 100 per mensem in place thereof as the Local Government may decide.

* * * * *

43. *Travelling allowance of Government Probationary students*.—Such students will not ordinarily be entitled to travelling allowance, being expected to defray their expenses when on tour; but it is left to Local Governments to sanction the payment of actual expenses for journeys by rail or steamer.

Rules for the recruitment of Candidates for the Provincial Forest Service in Assam.

1. Appointments to the class of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests will be given by the Local Government.

(a) To candidates specially selected for direct appointment to the Provincial Service, or to Rangers, who have satisfactorily completed the course of training prescribed for such candidates at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun, and who have obtained from the President of the Institute a certificate to that effect;

(b) In exceptional cases to Rangers of long service and tried ability and probity, irrespective of the educational certificates they may hold.

2. Candidates must be between 18 and 25 years of age on the 1st November of the year in which the course begins, and must possess sufficient knowledge of English, mathematics and science to follow the College course.

3. Applications for appointment should be submitted to the Conservator of Forests, Western or Eastern Circle, Assam, either direct or through a Deputy Commissioner or a Divisional Forest Officer of rank not below that of a Deputy Conservator and should be accompanied by the certificates prescribed by rule 26 of the College Admission Rules and by certificates indicating the educational qualifications of the candidate. The Conservator should, on each occasion on which nominations are called for, consult the Principals of the Cotton and Murariehand Colleges as to whether they have candidates to recommend. From the applications received the Local Government, in consultation with Conservators of Forests, will select those to be deputed to the course in the ensuing year, giving preference to candidates born or domiciled in Assam. Candidates so selected will be required to undergo a preliminary course of practical training which will ordinarily extend to one year under the direction of the Conservator of Forests. During this course candidates will be granted a consolidated monthly allowance of Rs. 100 inclusive of travelling allowance. The Local Government will remove any candidate whose work or conduct during this period may prove unsatisfactory, or who is not considered likely to make a good Forest Officer. Candidates who have undergone

APPENDIX V. (continued).

the preliminary course of training to the entire satisfaction of the Conservator of Forests will be eligible for nomination by the Local Government for training at the Forest Research Institute and College at Dehra Dun.

4. While at the Forest College candidates will be given a monthly stipend of Rs. 100, subject to satisfactory progress. Rule 54 of the College Admission Rules authorises the President to reduce or withdraw the stipends if necessary. Students already in Government service will, while at the College, draw and pay and travelling allowances of their grade in the service, or a stipend not exceeding Rs. 100 per mensem in place thereof, as the Local Government may decide.

5. The actual expenses incurred by probationary students on journeys by rail or steamer while proceeding to and from the college and while undergoing the course, will be defrayed by Government. For the purpose of this rule, probationary students will be considered as officers of the second class under Article 1002, Civil Service Regulations.

6. Before proceeding to the Imperial Forest College, candidates will be required:—

(i.) To sign an agreement in the form prescribed in Appendix A to these rules, binding themselves to work diligently while at the college, and to serve Government for not less than five years after passing out of the College.

(ii.) To find two sureties to execute a bond for Rs. 1,500 in the form prescribed in Appendix B to these rules, guaranteeing that, under special circumstances therein detailed, they will refund the total amount that has been drawn as stipend and travelling expenses.

7. A Forest Ranger selected for appointment to the Provincial Service will be appointed in the first instance to officiate as Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests for a period which shall be at the discretion of the Local Government, and will not be eligible for confirmation in that class until he has passed the departmental examinations prescribed in Article 40, Forest Department Code.

8. Candidates who have fulfilled the conditions prescribed in rule 1 (a) above will be appointed by the Local Government as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on a salary of Rs. 150 per mensem.

9. A Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests who has rendered two years approved service in that class and has passed the following departmental examinations, viz.:—

(1) Vernacular by the Lower Standard in one "principal" language of the Province, as may be prescribed by the Local Government;

(2) Land Revenue;

(3) Forest Law;

(4) Procedure and Accounts;

will be eligible for permanent appointment to the class of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on the occurrence of a vacancy. In the case of a Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, who obtained a certificate with Honours in the Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute and College, the minimum period of probation will be one year, and the passing of the above departmental examinations before permanent appointment will not be required.

Pending the occurrence of a vacancy in the class of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, a probationer in the class who is thus eligible for permanent appointment and has completed three years' satisfactory service on probation, will draw pay at the rate of Rs. 200 per mensem provided that his work continues to be satisfactory.

10. The rates of pay and the promotion of officers in the Provincial Service are regulated by Articles 14 and 38, Forest Department Code, subject to the condition that the increments admissible under Article 14, Forest Department Code, shall not, except as provided in rule 11 below, be drawn by an officer until he shall have passed by the Higher Standard the examination in the vernacular prescribed under rule 9 above.

11. An Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests who obtained a certificate with honours in the Provincial Service Course at the Forest Research Institute and College will not be entitled to draw the increments admissible under Article 14, Forest Department Code, until he shall have passed all the departmental examinations prescribed in rule 9 above, nor to draw a higher pay than Rs. 270 per mensem until he shall have passed by the Higher Standard the examination in the prescribed principal language.

12. The above rules are framed under the prescriptions of the Forest Department Code and Government of India Resolution contained in Circular No. 10F.—76-3, dated 22nd June, 1912, and should be read with the rules issued to regulate the constitution of, admission to, and studies and discipline at, the Forest College and Research Institute, Dehra Dun.

(II) RULES FOR THE SELECTION OF ASSAM CANDIDATES FOR DEPUTATION TO THE RANGER SERVICE COURSE AT THE IMPERIAL FOREST COLLEGE, DEHRA DUN.

Extract from the Rules of the Forest College at Dehra Dun relating to the Ranger Service Course.

* * * *

5. The total number of students of each category, who can be admitted into the College each year, will be limited to such number as the President, subject to the orders of the Inspector-General of Forests and the Government of India, may decide, from time to time, can be educated at the College. The number of studentships to be allotted each year to the respective provinces, as well as the number of nominations to be made by the President, will, with due regard to the total prescribed, be decided by the latter not later than the 1st August, after consultation with the various Administrations as to their requirements, and communicated to them.

6. In allotting nominations to Local Governments, Colonies, or Native States, the President will allow a margin for possible casualties between the dates of nomination and actually entering the College. And when a Local Government, Colony or Native State cannot for any reason utilise the full number of studentships allotted, it should immediately inform the President, so that the vacancies may be filled up with other candidates in time to permit of the prescribed preliminary training being undergone.

7. There are four categories of students:—

(1) Private students;

(2) Government probationary students, stipendiary or non-stipendiary;

(3) Students deputed by Native States and British Colonies;

(4) Students already in Government service.*

8. Private students comprise all those students who are without appointments in any Forest service, who have not entered into an agreement to serve any Government or Administration, and whose object it is, by becoming possessors of the Forest College certificates, to obtain employment either in the Forest Service of the Government of India, or in that of a Native State or some other owner of forest property.

Government Probationary students comprise those who have been selected by any Government for an appointment in its Forest Service. They may be stipendiary or non-stipendiary.

(i) Candidates for admission to the Ranger class of the Forest College as private students or Government probationary students, or students deputed by Native States must not be less than 18 or more than 25 years of age on the 1st April of the year in which they desire admission to the College, and in the case of students from British India, their applications must be sent to a Con-

* Vide rules regarding Native Non-commissioned officers of His Majesty's Army.

APPENDIX V. (continued).

servator of Forests,[†] either direct or through a Divisional Forest Officer of rank not below that of a Deputy Conservator, or through a Collector or officer in charge of a district, in such time that the applications may reach the President not later than the 1st August in each year. None of the abovementioned officers need belong to the Forest Circle or Province in which the candidate seeks employment; but Divisional Forest Officers, Collectors, or other officers in charge of a district may not forward to Conservators applications unsupported by the five certificates enumerated below.

In the case of Native States, candidates should submit their applications supported by the same five certificates to, and in the manner prescribed by, their respective Durbars:—

(a) A certificate that the candidate is a "Native of India" within the meaning assigned to those words by section 6 of 38 Vict., Cap. 3.

(b) A certificate of age.

(c) A health certificate in the form prescribed by Article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition, signed by the Civil Surgeon of the district in which the said Divisional Forest or District Officer's duties lie and testifying to the candidate's sound constitution, good vision and hearing, and general physical fitness for a rough outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of smallpox.

(d) A certificate of respectability and good moral character from two or more persons whose social or official position can be accepted as a guarantee of reliability.

The certificates (c) and (d) must bear date not further back than the 1st April of the year previous to that in which the candidate desires admission to the College.

If any person giving certificates as above under (c) and (d) is in a position to mention anything more to the credit of the candidate than the certificates actually called for, he may do so.

(e) A certificate of having passed one of the following examinations, viz.:—

The B.A., F.A., B.Sc., or Licentiate of Agriculture.

The Matriculation, where no School Final Examination or school-leaving certificate exists.

The School Final Examination, provided the candidate can show that he has qualified in English and mathematics up to the Matriculation standard, or, for European candidates, a certificate of having passed the High School Examination, with a similar proviso.

The school-leaving certificate, as prescribed in the United Provinces, Central Provinces and Bombay.

(f) A certificate that each candidate has a sufficient knowledge of colloquial English to assimilate lectures delivered in that language without the aid of dictation.

The President is authorised to admit candidates.

[†] Conservator of Forests, Bengal Circle, at Darjeeling.
Conservators of Forests, Assam—

Eastern Circle at Shillong.

Western

Conservators of Forests, United Provinces of Agra and Oudh—

Eastern Circle at Naini Tal.

Western

Conservators of Forests, Central Provinces—

Southern Circle at Nagpur.

Northern „ at Jabalpur

Berar „ at Amracti.

Conservator of Forests, Punjab Circle, at Lahore.

Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa, at Ranchi.

Northern Circle at Banda.

Central „ at Poona.

Southern „ at Belgaum.

Deputy Conservator of Forests in Charge, Sind Circle, Karachi.

[‡] "Native of India" means any person born and domiciled within the dominions of His Majesty in India, or within the territories of Indian Princes tributary to or in alliance with His Majesty, of parents habitually resident in India, and not established there for temporary purposes only. (Article 37, Civil Service Regulations.)

as an exceptional measure, who for some valid reason (such as being the subjects of a Native State or foreign country) have had no opportunity of securing any of the certificates mentioned above, provided that, in his opinion, the candidate possesses the educational qualifications necessary to profit by the College course.

The Inspector-General of Forests may, should he consider it desirable, relax any of the conditions imposed under this rule.

(i.) Upon the receipt by the Conservator of any application in respect to which the preceding conditions shall have been observed, that officer may reject the application without assigning any reason for so doing; but if he accepts it and the applicant is a candidate for Government service, he should be seen by a Conservator of a Forest Circle, when this can be conveniently arranged, or by some officer of the Imperial Forest Service, who should record his personal opinion in regard to the suitability of the candidate.

(ii.) Those candidates who have been approved will, with the permission of the Local Government in the case of Government probationary students, and under the Conservator's recommendation in the case of private students, and that of the Durbars in the case of candidates from Native States, be eligible for nomination to the College.

(iv) *Preliminary training.*—All candidates not already in the service of Government, who have been accepted by the President for admission to the College will be required to undergo, before joining the College, a course of practical training in the forests of the province from which they come, lasting at least three and a half months. Such candidates will not be allowed to join the College unless they can produce a certificate signed by the Divisional Officer under whom they have served, and countersigned by the Conservator of the Circle, or in the case of Native States by the Durbar, that they have undergone the course of practical training in a satisfactory manner, and are likely to become useful Forest officers. The President may exempt a candidate from the whole or a portion of the practical course above prescribed, after satisfying himself that the omission to complete the minimum prescribed term was due to no fault of the candidate, and that the Conservator, under whom the candidate had undergone part of this period of training, has certified that he has given promise of making an efficient Forest officer.

(v) *Stipends or Scholarships.*—It is left to Local Governments to award stipends or scholarships in such manner as they please, provided that the total for the 24 months' course does not exceed Rs. 1,200, i.e., does not exceed an average rate of Rs. 50 per mensem. In the event of scholarships being awarded, the general method of assigning such will be—

(a) A stipend not exceeding Rs. 50 per mensem for the duration of the course or a portion thereof;

(b) In lieu of the above a lump sum to be paid on a candidate's successfully obtaining such certificates as may have been agreed upon;

(c) Partly the one, partly the other of the above.

(vi) *Allowances.*—Government Probationary students, while under training in the forests of the province from which their names have been sent up, will receive travelling allowance at the rate of Rs. 25 per mensem to enable them to defray their travelling expenses during the course of the practical training referred to in (iv). This allowance will be met from the budget grants of the Local Forest Departments, and will be paid only under the countersignature of the Conservator of the Circle concerned.

9. Candidates in Government Service, who may be deputed to the Forest College, will be ordinarily—

(a) Forest Rangers who have not previously obtained the Higher Standard certificate of the College and who desire to qualify themselves for further promotion in their own or to a higher class.

Such officers may be deputed by Local Governments, provided that they are certified by the Conservator under whom they are serving to possess a knowledge of English and general edu-

APPENDIX V. (continued).

cation and ability sufficient to enable them to profit by the course. They must not be above 30 years of age on entering the College, and need not go through the practical training referred to in rule 8 (iv). While at the College, they will draw the pay of their grade and travelling allowances to which they may be entitled under the Civil Service Regulations.

(b) Other members of the Subordinate Forest Service (Deputy Rangers, Foresters, and other subordinate officials) similarly desirous of qualifying for promotion, who may be deputed by Local Governments, provided that:—

(i) They have been in the service for not less than two years;

(ii) They are under 25 years of age on entering the College;

(iii) There is accommodation at the College and that the President is satisfied that the candidate possesses the necessary qualifications.

Note.—The Inspector-General of Forests is empowered to relax rules (i) and (ii).

Such officers will, while at the College, draw the pay and travelling allowances of their grade in the service, or a stipend not exceeding Rs. 50 per mensem in place thereof as the Local Government may decide. They will not be required to undergo the practical training.

* * * *

43. *Travelling allowance of Government Probationary students.*—Such students will not ordinarily be entitled to travelling allowance, being expected to defray their expenses when on tour; but it is left to Local Governments to sanction the payment of actual expenses for journeys by rail or steamer.

Rules for the selection of Assam candidates for deputation to the Ranger's Course at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun.

1. The number of candidates to be selected annually will depend on the requirements of the Department. Applications from bona-fide natives of Assam, or from candidates domiciled in Assam, will alone be considered.

2. Candidates for these appointments should apply to the Conservator of Forests, Western or Eastern Circle, Assam, through the Deputy Commissioner or the Divisional Forest Officer of rank not below that of a Deputy Conservator of the district in which the candidates reside. Applications should be accompanied by the certificates prescribed by rule 8 (i) of the Rules of the Forest College relating to the Ranger's Course.

From the applications received the Conservators of Forests will make a preliminary selection of not more than twice the number of men to be deputed to the Ranger's course at the Forest College in the ensuing year, and candidates so selected will be required to undergo the preliminary training which is referred to in rule 8 (iv) of the College Rules relating to the Ranger's course, but which will ordinarily extend to one year. While undergoing this preliminary training, candidates will be granted a consolidated monthly allowance of Rs. 50, inclusive of travelling allowance.

The Conservators of Forests will remove candidates whose work or conduct at any time during this training is unsatisfactory.

The final selection of candidates for deputation to the Forest College will be made by the Conservator of Forests, subject to the approval of the Local Government in accordance with the results of the preliminary training, candidates who are not considered likely to make good Forest officers being rejected at this stage.

3. While at the Forest College the selected candidates will be granted a monthly stipend of Rs. 50, subject to satisfactory progress. Rule 54 of the admission rules authorises the President to remove or withdraw the stipend, if necessary. Selected candidates will be required to execute the agreement and security bond for Rs. 1,000 prescribed by Government, in the forms shown in Appendices A and B to these rules.

Note.—Copies of the agreement and security bond to be executed under rule 3 can be obtained from the offices of the Conservators

of Forests, Western and Eastern Circles, Assam.

4. The actual expenses incurred by probationary students on journeys by rail or steamer, while proceeding to and from the College, and while undergoing the course, will be defrayed by Government. For the purpose of this rule, probationary students will be considered as officers of the third class under Article 1002, Civil Service Regulations.

5. Candidates who obtain the Higher Standard certificate of the Forest College at the completion of the two years' course, with or without "honours," will be appointed Rangers on monthly salaries of not less than Rs. 50. Under similar circumstances, candidates who obtain the Lower Standard certificate will be appointed Deputy Rangers on monthly salaries of not less than Rs. 30. Such appointment will, however, be conditional on the existence of permanent vacancies in the establishment. In the absence of vacancies, and pending their occurrence, successful candidates will be employed as supernumeraries on the pay which they would otherwise draw if appointed to the permanent establishment.

ANNEXURE A.

Form of Agreement to be executed by students already in the service of, or in receipt of stipend from, Government, previous to entry into the Forest College, Dehra Dun.

ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT made and entered into this 19. day of

BETWEEN

of

of the first part

of

son of the said of the second part, and the Secretary of State for India in Council, hereinafter referred to as the Secretary of State, of the third part. Whereby each of the parties hereto so far as the covenants and conditions on his own part are to be observed and performed covenants with the other of them as follows:—

1. The said hereby of his own free will and consent and with the approbation and consent of the said , testified by the execution by him of these presents, agrees with and to the Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns, that he, the said shall well and faithfully pursue his studies at the Government Forest College, Dehra Dun, and use his best endeavours to qualify for the Forest Service of the Government of British India or of any Local Government.

2. The said shall after completing his studies at the said Forest College, and if so required to do, serve the Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns in the Forest Department of the Government of British India, or of any Local Government, for a period of not less than five years, and shall during the whole of such period diligently and sufficiently do all acts and discharge all duties which may be required to be done by him in his capacity as an officer of the said Department.

3. The Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns hereby engages to educate the said

at the Dehra Dun Forest College in all matters relating to forest science, forest work and forest administration that it may be deemed necessary by the President of the said College to teach the said

4. The Secretary of State shall pay the said during the whole period of his stay at the said College at and after the rate of Rs. per month and thereafter while the said shall faithfully and diligently serve

as an officer of the said Forest Department at and after the rate of not less than Rs. per month, and the said

shall be entitled to all the rights and privileges in respect of pay, pension and promotion accorded to officers of the said Depart-

APPENDIX V. (continued).

ment for the time by the Rules and Regulations of the Department.

5. Lastly, it is hereby agreed and declared that the Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns shall be at liberty to rescind this agreement on account of the negligence, failure to attend to duty, idleness, or any insubordination or misconduct on the part of the said.

, and to dismiss him from the said Forest College or the service of the said Department, and the said

shall not be entitled to any of the privileges hereby granted to him, but the said

shall

thereupon refund to the Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns the total amount paid to the said as stipend and travelling allowance while at the said College by the Secretary of State or his successors in office or assigns in respect of the education of the said at the said College. In witness thereof, the said parties to these presents have hereunto set their respective hands and seals the days and year first above written.

Signature and seal of _____

SL.

Signature and seal of _____

SL.

Signed, sealed and delivered by the above-named in the presence of —

} Signature of two witnesses.

Dated —

— Signature of Deputy Commissioner.

ANNEXURE B.

Form of Bond to be executed by students already in the service of, or in receipt of stipends from, Government, previous to entry into the Forest College, Dehra Dun.

KNOW ALL MEN by these presents that we,

of _____, (principal obligor) _____, of _____, and _____

(sureties) are jointly and severally bound to the Secretary of State for India in Council in the sum of Rs. _____ to be paid to the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns, or his or their certain attorney or attorneys, for which payment well and truly to be made we bind ourselves, our heirs, executors, administrators and representatives, and each of us binds himself, his heirs, executors, administrators and representatives firmly by these presents sealed with our seals and dated this _____ day of _____.

Whereas the Secretary of State for India in Council for himself and his successors in office and assigns has engaged to educate the said

at the Dehra Dun Forest

College in all matters relating to forest science, forest works and forest administration that it may be deemed necessary by the President of the said College to teach the said

, and has also agreed to pay him during the whole period of his stay at the said College at and after the rate of _____ rupees per month, and whereas in consideration of such education and pay to be given to the said

as aforesaid by the said Secretary of State and his successors in office and assigns the said has agreed with the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns that he will after completing his studies at the said College, and if required to do so, serve in the Forest Department of the Government of British India for a period of not less than five years, during the whole of which time he will diligently and efficiently do all acts and discharge all duties which may be

required of him to be done in his capacity as an officer of the said Department.

And whereas the Secretary of State has also on his part agreed that the said

shall be paid for such service at and after the rate of not less than Rs. _____ per month, and shall be entitled to all the rights and privileges in respect of pay, pension and promotion accorded to officers of the said Department for the time being by the Rules and Regulations of the Department.

And whereas for the purpose of securing and indemnifying the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns against all loss and damage which he or they might or may in any way suffer by reason of the said

being dismissed from, or leaving without permission, the service of the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns in less than five years after the completion of his studies at the said College, and for the purpose also of securing the refund to the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns of the total amount paid to the said

as stipend and travelling allowance while at the said College by the said Secretary of State, or his successors in office or assigns in respect of the education of the said

at the said College; and in consideration of the payment and education so as aforesaid to be made and given to the said at the said College, and as one of the conditions of the admission of the to the said College, it has also been agreed that the said and the said

and _____ as his sureties, should execute the above-written Bond, subject to the condition hereinafter contained.

Now the condition of the above-written Bond of

obligation is such that if the said shall well and faithfully and diligently pursue his studies at the said College and qualify for the said Forest Service, and shall also after completing his studies at the said Forest College, and if so required to do, serve the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns in the Forest Department of the Government of British India, or of any Local Government, for a period of not less than five years, and shall during the whole of such period diligently and efficiently do all acts and discharge all duties which may be required to be done by him in his capacity as an officer of the said Department, and if the said and

, or either of them, their or either of their heirs, executors, administrators and representatives shall well and truly indemnify the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns against all loss and damage which he or they might or may in any way suffer by reason of the said giving cause for dismissal either while at the said College or while in the service of Government thereafter, or of his leaving the service of the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns without permission in less than five years after the completion of the studies of the said

at the said College, and if the said and

, or either of them, their or either of their heirs, executors and administrators or representatives shall also pay to the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns all sum or sums in any way expended, paid or incurred by the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns in respect of the education of the said at the said College, then the above-written Bond of obligation shall be void, otherwise the same shall remain in full force and virtue.

Provided always, and it is hereby expressly agreed and declared, that these presents shall be treated and considered as entered into under the orders of the Government of India for the performance by the said and

APPENDICES V. (continued) AND VI.

of a public duty, and an act in which the public are interested within the meaning of section 74 of Act IX. of 1872 of the Legislative Council of India.

In Witness whereof the said parties to these presents have hereunto set their respective hands and seals the day and year first above written.

Signature and Seal of principal obligor SL.

Signature and seal of first surety SL.

Ditto second surety SL.

Signed sealed and delivered by the above-named in the presence of—

 } Signature of two witnesses.

Date _____

 } Signature of Deputy Commissioner.

A. W. BOTHAM,
Offg. Second Secretary to the
Chief Commissioner of Assam.

APPENDIX VI.

Note, dated the 9th April, 1913, by the Hon. Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Forest Department.

4.—IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *Recruitment of Indians to the Imperial Service.*—Indians are eligible to this service, and on general principles I am of opinion that they should be so appointed whenever suitable candidates are forthcoming. It is *prima facie* probable that in this way a class of Indian officers best suited to hold the important posts held by members of the Imperial Service will be obtained. I consider it essential, however, that, in nominating Indian candidates, the Secretary of State should bear in mind, as far as possible, the due representation of the various communities of India. It is generally undesirable to send to a province an officer recruited from another province. In the Assam Valley, for instance, any Indian other than an inhabitant of that Valley, would be regarded as a comparative foreigner. Scope should also be left for the appointment to the superior service of specially selected Indian officers of the Provincial Service. Such appointments would, however, be the exception. It may also be added generally that, in view of the large European non-official population with which the Forest Department has to transact business, the recruitment of Indians to the superior service must necessarily be limited for the present.

2. *System of recruitment to the Imperial Service and training.*—As regards recruitment to the Imperial Service and the training of Imperial Officers, I cite the views of Mr. Perrée, Officiating Conservator of Forests, with which Mr. Monroe, Conservator of Forests, is in accord:—"I am strongly in favour of a special training at an institution with an Indian atmosphere and traditions, where some *esprit de corps* can be engendered. I saw a good deal of the Forest probationers both at Oxford and Cambridge, when last at home, and I was struck with the lack of efficient control and supervision over their work. The duties of an officer in India demand the early acquisition of a strict sense of duty and habit of work. It will not do to make up arrears periodically by burning the midnight oil! For these reasons I consider the Universities unsuitable for our purpose.

"A central institution thoroughly equipped to train officers for the Indian Civil Service, Public Works, Forest, Telegraph and perhaps Police Departments would, I feel sure, supply this country with recruits much better equipped in every way (not excepting manners) than present arrangements. The value of such an institution to Indian recruits is of importance. Indians who go to England do not make the best use of their opportunities at present, they hold aloof and keep too much to themselves. The closer intercourse necessitated by the conditions of a central institution would be specially beneficial to them and probably to the others. I am, therefore, entirely in favour of a central institution and the training of Forest probationers there after selection.

"As regards recruitment, I think that competition after nomination within age limits of 18 to 20 would be the best; the examination to be in English composition and dictation, mathematics and elementary science subjects, and German to be made a compulsory language. The entrance to Coopers Hill prior to 1890 was somewhat on the above lines, but was changed, on agitation from Public Schools, because the subjects required could only be obtained at a 'crammer's'. It is imperative, however, that Forestry, which is based on the sciences, should be properly understood from the outset, and the disadvantages, if any, that existed prior to 1890 outweighed the advantages that were supposed to have followed, because the very elements of each science had to be taught, and much time taken up thereby which could have been devoted to the applied part of the sciences. After selection, the course at the central institution, which would include forestry, botany, engineering, organic chemistry, geology and physics, should extend over five terms, followed by a six months' course in Germany, or a total training of 27 months in Europe. Following this course, I recommend a full year in India, where conditions require special study. During this period important subjects like surveying and forest engineering should be taught, and typical Indian forests inspected. The results of any measures could be observed and explained. The actual condition of Indian forests and their present or future requirements could be brought home to the probationer. Much of the present rawness would be obviated, and Indian ideas would naturally be acquired, instead of by the present crude method of finding European theory and practice inapplicable, and having to work out some problem unaided, or finding out things by trial and error.

"The syllabus should be drawn up in consultation with the Government of India, who have recently elaborated a scheme of training for provincial officers, and the Imperial recruits will have to compare favourably in their training with the provincial men.

"At present the Dehra Dun Rangers have a superior training in survey and engineering to the Imperial men.

"Practical training in England is practicable only to the extent of excursions to a few private estates. For an exposition of scientific forestry recourse must be had to the Continent, especially Germany, where the different States afford examples of very highly developed forests fulfilling local demands, whether as physical or economic assets. This is of extreme value for India, where conditions vary enormously, and the true position of the forests in the future economy of the country is scarcely yet realised. The course in India, following upon practical illustration in Europe, should therefore be of special value. According to my proposals, a young man would ordinarily enter the service at 22, which is a suitable age."

APPENDICES VI. (continued) AND VII.

The above views fully accord with the proposals which I have made in connection with the Indian Civil Service and other services. I approve of competition after nomination on general grounds, and in the case of Indians also because a fair representation of the inhabitants of the different provinces of India is impossible under a system of competition.

3. *Pension for officers of the Imperial Service.*—I gather that a large number of memorials are pending on the subject of pensions, but I can say nothing in regard to these, as I am not acquainted with their contents.

B.—PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *Recruitment and pay of officers of the Provincial Forest Department.*—I have no remarks to offer under the head of recruitment. As regards pay, a Provincial Service Officer receives a salary which approximates to two thirds of the pay of an Imperial Service Officer, and this is sufficiently liberal as regards the ordinary Provincial Service Officer. When an officer of the Provincial Service is promoted to a divisional charge, his salary can be advanced from Rs. 550, by stages, up to a maximum of Rs. 850 (excluding local allowance), as compared with Rs. 1,250 (excluding local allowance) given to an Imperial Service Officer. On general principles, I am of opinion that officers considered qualified for promotion to such important charges as major divisions should be allowed to enter the time-scale of the superior service on their own pay or the nearest pay of the superior time scale, and thereafter to receive increments in the same way as an officer of the superior service. Officers so specially promoted should, I think, be eligible for any post in the superior service. I do not think that more than this is required at present.

2. *Number of officers of the Provincial Forest Service to be promoted to the superior Service.*—Mr. Monroe, Conservator of Forests, is of opinion that if promotions are made save in the case of ex-

ceptional officers, there will be loss of efficiency, and to avoid this, the number of Circles will have to be increased. He writes: "Any Provincial Service Officer fit for a charge, receives one, but it is impossible to lay down mathematically the number of charges which can be held by Provincial Service Officers and fix the Imperial and Provincial cadres accordingly; it may be that, with the great improvements in pay and prospects of the Provincial Service, the average officer will be more efficient and able to take larger responsibility than in the past, but I strongly deprecate any forcing in the matter. Local Governments and Conservators are very ready and willing to put Provincial Service Officers into charges as they are fit for them. It is much better to leave it at that. In a few years' time it will be more possible than at present to say whether the members in the two cadres can be re-adjusted." As I have advocated in the case of other services, we must, I think, recruit the best class of Indians direct to the superior service, and give promotion to Provincial Service men only when they prove themselves fully qualified. At any rate, as regards this province, the rule prescribed by the Government of India that 20 per cent. of the major charges should be held by Provincial Service Officers is more than adequate at present.

3. *Status and nomenclature.*—I think that the term "Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators" might suitably be dropped, and that the officers of the Provincial Service might be called Deputy Conservators and Assistant Conservators.

C.—GENERAL.

The Forest Department list.—As in the case of other services, I recommend a single Forest Service list with Divisions comprising (1) officers recruited by the Secretary of State, to consist of Conservators, Deputy Conservators, and Assistant Conservators, (2) locally-recruited Deputy Conservators and Assistant Conservators, and (3) the Subordinate Staff of Foresters and Rangers.

APPENDIX VII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Forest Department.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory. — *Imperial Service.* — The Imperial Branch of the Department consists of the Chief Conservator, Conservators and Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests. The Imperial Branch of the service is recruited solely in England, and is appointed under covenant with the Secretary of State. Candidates must be over nineteen and under twenty-three years of age, natural-born British subjects and unmarried. At present they are appointed on the nomination of a selection committee, and are allowed to undergo their training at any University which possesses a Forestry School approved by the Secretary of State. Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh Universities have been so approved already. The period of training extends over two years, and includes seven months abroad for the study of practical forestry. An allowance of £120 a year is made to Probationers during this period, and a passage allowance to Burma of £43. The regulations have been found to give satisfactory results, but they are susceptible of improvement in the following directions:—

(1) The officers now joining the Department arrive at an age at which their characters and dispositions are too fully formed to allow of their accommodating themselves to the new environment in which they find themselves. The age limit at time of selection should therefore be reduced.

(2) The experience gained in the last few years shows that the medical examination to which probationers are now submitted is not nearly searching enough. It is most essential that Forest Officers should have exceptionally good physiques,

as they have to undergo, throughout the greater part of their service, hardships and exposures which no other branch of the public services in India are called upon to endure. The physical test which was formerly insisted upon should most certainly be re-introduced.

(3) The University Degree in a branch of Natural Science is unnecessary and is of no practical value to a Forest Officer. Specialists in any particular branch of Natural Science are not wanted, but men with a good all-round knowledge. The old system, where sufficient knowledge of Natural Science was required from candidates for admission to the service to allow of their following the more advanced courses of Natural Science, which formed part of their training, and thoroughly assimilating the science of Forestry, is better than the new system, and should be reverted to.

(4) The existing bodies in Great Britain who teach Forestry do not give a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions, and cannot afford to engage a lecturer qualified to give such a course for the very small number of men who join the Indian Forest Department. A special course of this nature is necessary, and can only be obtained by sending the recruits for the Indian Forest Department to the same institution and appointing properly qualified men to teach them, replacing the present Director of Indian Forest Studies. Another advantage of being trained at the same institution would be the wholesome spirit of "camaraderie" or "esprit de corps" which used to be very strongly marked, and resulted in Forest Officers taking a pride in their work and in bringing credit on the institution in which they were trained. Of late years there has been a very distinct falling off both in the matter of "esprit

APPENDIX VII. (continued).

de corps" and "discipline" owing to the officers being practically strangers to one another, instead of friends of some years' standing, when they join the service.

(5) The six months' practical training on the Continent has not been as profitable as it should have been, because the probationers have not been properly supervised and taught by an officer who has had Indian experience, who can direct the work of the students into useful lines, and can induce them to take personal interest in it. This defect can be easily remedied by sending the students to one and the same place and in charge of a selected Indian Forest Officer (who may be on leave).

(6) There can be no doubt that men who have done no practical Forestry and who have no sense of responsibility do not profit nearly so much by what they see as men who have both these qualifications, and it would therefore be very greatly in the interests of Government to send all the men of the same year to the Continent to study selected forests and forest problems for six months, after they have been out here three years, and do realise the seriousness of their profession. Even three months spent on the Continent with a competent experienced Indian Forest Officer as a guide would be of infinitely more value than six months spent with their eyes unopened in Continental forests before they come to India.

(7) The present training in Forest Engineering and Surveying is most inadequate.

Provincial Service.—The Provincial Branch of the Department consists of Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests. The Sub-Assistant Conservators at the date of the 1887 Commission were recruited partly by promotion of Rangers and partly by direct appointment of candidates with F.A. qualifications. After the re-organisation of 1891 the Sub-Assistant Conservators became Extra Assistant Conservators, and subsequent appointments to this service were made exclusively from among promoted Rangers. In 1906 a system of direct recruitment, concurrently with the promotion of Rangers, was re-introduced. The same training was laid down for officers recruited by both methods, viz., a special third year's course at Dehra Dun after the completion of the ordinary two years' course for Rangers, but in the case of promoted Rangers this rule might be relaxed where length and excellence of service as a Ranger warranted an exception. From November, 1912, a further development has been made by the institution for Provincial Service candidates of a two years' course at Dehra Dun entirely distinct from the course prescribed for Rangers; but appointments as Extra Assistant Conservators may still be given to Rangers not more than 30 years of age and with not less than five years' satisfactory service (three of which must have been in executive charge), who have obtained the higher standard certificate at Dehra Dun or at the Burma Forest School. Such Rangers must be sufficiently acquainted with English to carry on their correspondence and keep their accounts in that language. It may be added that a recruit to the Provincial Service on satisfactorily completing the two years' training at the Forest Research Institute and College is required to complete two years' satisfactory service as a Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on Rs. 175 per mensem and to pass the departmental examination in Burmese by the Lower Standard before he can be appointed as an Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on Rs. 250 per mensem.

The present system of recruitment is satisfactory. The improved prospects of the Provincial Forest Service are beginning to be more generally appreciated, with the result that the class of men entering the service has improved considerably, and will continue to do so. There will be no dearth of suitable candidates for this branch of the service in the future. The present system of a special two years' course of instruction at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun, is also satisfactory, and a great improvement on the old method of training.

2a. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time.*—The information required under this heading for both the Imperial and Provincial Services is given in the statement below.

—	Imperial charges.	Imperial Reserve (25 per cent.).	Provincial charges.	Provincial Reserve (10 per cent.).
New scale ...	45	11	55	5
Increase	13	4	26	2

2b. *Whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—*Imperial Service.*—The rates of pay drawn by the Inspector-General of Forests, Chief Conservators and Conservators are too small considering the amount of work and responsibility these posts involve. A Deputy Conservator of Forests drawing Rs. 1,250 plus a Burma allowance of Rs. 100 is much better off financially than a Conservator, 3rd grade, on Rs. 1,500 without a Burma allowance. Deputy Conservators who are considered fit for promotion to Conservators should be given an annual increment of Rs. 50 per mensem up to a maximum of Rs. 1,500 or until such time as they reach administrative rank. Assistant Conservators of Forests placed in charge of Divisions should be given a charge allowance on account of the increased work and responsibility involved. The present scale of pay of Assistant and Deputy Conservators is adequate. The subject of a Burma allowance has been specially dealt with by the Burma Allowance Committee, and is, therefore, not touched upon here.

Provincial Service.—The time scale of pay sanctioned for this service is quite adequate, taking into consideration the intellectual and educational qualifications of the officers at present in the service. The local allowances of officers of this service should be regulated in accordance with the rates of pay drawn as suggested in the case of Imperial officers. (Provincial) officers stationed in Rangoon should be granted house allowances as in the case of Imperial officers.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The number of officers in the Forest Department and the number in each grade, where there are still grades, are shown below—

Chief Conservator of Forests (ungraded)	..	1
Conservators, 1st grade	..	2
Conservators, 2nd grade	..	Nil
Conservators, 3rd grade	..	1 sub pro tem.

Deputy and Assistant Conservators 61

Extra Deputy Conservators .. 19 } On time-scale
Extra Assistant Conservators 43 } of pay.

The table in paragraph 2 of the General Memorandum shows the provision made in the Imperial and Provincial Service cadre for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily or otherwise by officers of the various services.*—One of the instructors at the Imperial Forest College is an Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests from Burma (Mr. G. T. Wrafter). This post is not included in the Burma Provincial Service cadre sanctioned in 1907. Mr. Wrafter remains seconded on the Burma list.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The sanctioned cadre in 1909 was as follows:—

Imperial charges	...	45
Reserve (25 per cent.)	...	11
		— 56
Provincial charges	...	55
Reserve (10 per cent.)	...	5
		— 60

APPENDIX VII. (continued).

Burma contributes five officers to the India list, thus raising the total Imperial cadre for the Province to 61 officers. The total Provincial cadre was raised to 62 officers by the inclusion of the entire Provincial staff of the Andamans in 1910. The classification of charges for which this cadre was sanctioned has been found to be not in accordance with the orders on the subject. Conservators have now re-examined the position with a view to rectifying this error. In doing so they have taken advantage of the opportunity to revise the scheme on which the sanctioned cadre is based in the light of recent experience in so far as regards the total number of Divisional and other charges that are likely eventually to be required. The Conservators' proposals show that 81 major charges and 90 minor charges are required, including two major charges on account of a fifth circle, necessitating the following revised cadre:—

86 Deputy Conservators of Forests and Assistant Conservators of Forests.

18 Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests.

103 Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests.

The Chief Conservator is of opinion that the present cadre is inadequate for the work required of it and calls for material strengthening. He considers that the additions proposed by the Conservators are absolutely necessary, and has advanced the following grounds in justification of his views.

A fifth Circle should be constituted at once and a sixth Circle as soon as the necessary staff can be recruited and buildings for them constructed. The majority of the existing Divisions are much too large to allow of their being efficiently administered. Practically the whole of the efforts of officers attached to Divisions is devoted to girdling teak trees for purchase contractors, i.e., the removal of the marketable materials standing in the forests. The removal of timber-producing trees from unclassed forests is practically not controlled in any way for want of staff, and this class of forest in many parts of Lower Burma, at any rate, has been practically denuded of all marketable timber by timber-dealers and by villagers for domestic purposes in a most wasteful manner, and unless steps are promptly taken to make reserves in the more thickly populated and more developed districts in Lower Burma, the unclassed forests in the course of a few years will not be capable of meeting even the requirements of the agricultural population, much less the demands of the larger villages and towns who depend upon local timber-dealers to meet their requirements.

Working plans and felling schemes are everywhere urgently required to prevent forests from being overworked, and so to ensure a supply of forest produce in the future, but cannot be made for lack of officers.

Rates of pay and allowances of Imperial and Provincial Officers in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time.

	1890.		1900.		1912.	
	Pay.	Local Allowance	Pay.	Local Allowance.	Pay.	Local Allowance.
IMPERIAL SERVICE.						
Chief Conservator of Forests	Rs. ...	Rs. ...	Rs. ...	Rs. ...	Rs. 2,150	Rs. Nil
Conservators, 1st grade	1,500	Nil	1,600	Nil	1,900	Do.
" 2nd grade	1,250	Do.	1,350	Do.	1,700	Do.
" 3rd grade	1,000	*100	1,100	†Rs. 100 in Upper Burma.	1,500	Do.
Deputy Conservators, 1st grade	900	100	900	100	100	Time-scale rates of pay.
" 2nd grade	800	100	800	100	100	
" 3rd grade	650	100	650	100	100	
" 4th grade	550	100	550	100	100	
Assistant Conservators, 1st grade	450	100	450	100	100	100
" 2nd grade	350	100	350	100	100	
" 3rd grade	250	100	

* The Conservators in Lower Burma ceased to enjoy local allowances in 1891.

† The Conservators in Upper Burma ceased to enjoy local allowances in 1901.

|| The time-scale starts from Rs. 350 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 a month to Rs. 700; thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,250 in the 20th year of service. Whilst drawing pay up to and including Rs. 540 a month an officer is styled "Assistant Conservator," and when drawing pay at Rs. 560 to Rs. 1,250 a month he ranks as "Deputy Conservator."

APPENDICES VII. (continued) AND VIII

Rates of pay and allowances of Imperial and Provincial Officers—continued.

	1890.		1900.		1913.	
	Pay.	Local Allowance.	Pay	Local Allowance.	Pay.	Local Allowance
PROVINCIAL SERVICE						
Sub-Assistant Conservators on	250	†Nil				
" "	200	Do		
" "	175	Do				
Extra Deputy Conservators, 1st grade			600			
" "	2nd grade	..	550			
" "	3rd grade	..	500	§ Rs 50 in Lower Burma		
" "	4th grade	..	450	Rs. 50 in Upper Burma.		
Extra Assistant Conservators, 1st grade			350			
" "	2nd grade	..	300			
" "	3rd grade..	..	250			
" "	4th grade	..	200			
					¶ Time-scale rates of pay	65

† They got allowances called "local allowances," at the following rates—Rs 60 when in charge of a Division, Rs 30 when in charge of a Sub division. These allowances were more in the nature of "charge" than "local allowances."

§ Extra Assistant Conservators got an additional local allowance of Rs 50 when placed in charge of major forest divisions, but the number of officers entitled to this allowance was limited to eight for the whole of India.

¶ The time-scale starts at Rs 250 a month, and rises by annual increments of Rs 20 a month to Rs 550 in the 16th year of service. Promotion to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator is made by Local Government by selection. An Extra Deputy Conservator begins to draw Rs 575 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs 25 a month to Rs 650 a month. Subsequently, by the special orders of the Local Government in each case, an Extra Deputy Conservator's pay may be raised to Rs 700, Rs 800, and Rs 850 a month respectively. Extra Assistant Conservators temporarily placed in major charge receive an additional local allowance of Rs 50 per mensem.

APPENDIX VIII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Forest Department

For the PUBLIC SERVICES COMMISSION.

(I) ADMINISTRATION OF THE FOREST DEPARTMENT.—The general administration of the forests in the whole Presidency is under the control of the Board of Revenue, which is, therefore, the head of the Forest Department, Madras. Collectors and Conservators are subordinate to, and receive their orders and instructions from, the Board in its Forest Branch. The orders of the Government on forest business are issued from the Revenue Secretariat, to which all correspondence on such matters is addressed.

2. The Collector is the head of the Forest Department in his own district, and, as such, has the control of, and is responsible for, the general management of the forests situated therein, the District Forest Officer being the Collector's Assistant in forest matters.

3. The Conservator is the Chief Forest Officer in the circle under his charge, and, though an inspecting and advising officer, he has powers of direct control over the District Forest Officer in certain departmental and technical matters. In matters of finance, the Conservator exercises a general control over the revenue and expenditure of his circle. He is responsible for the audit and control of accounts, and is vested with independent authority in the matter of the appointment, transfer and punishment of the forest sub-ordinate of certain classes and with special functions connected with the preparation and control of working plans. The Collector is in no way under the orders of the Conservator, but on all important matters the Conservator should be consulted before definite action is taken.

4. A Conservator's charge or circle is ordinarily divided and sub-divided into—

- (a) Forest districts or controlling charges.
- (b) Sub-divisions and ranges or executive charges.
- (c) Beats or protective charges.

The unit of management is the range which comprises a number of beats. A forest district usually coincides with a revenue district, though, in some cases, the latter includes two or more separate

forest districts. Each forest district is divided into a number of ranges, and a group of ranges is styled a sub-division.

(II) CONSTITUTION AND ORGANIZATION OF THE FOREST SERVICE.—5. Prior to the Public Service Commission of 1886-1887—At the time of the appointment of the Public Service Commission of 1886-1887 the Forest Department comprised three branches, viz.—

(i) Control—including (a) Conservators, (b) Deputy Conservators, and (c) Assistant Conservators.

(ii) Executive—including Sub-Assistant Conservators and Forest Rangers, and

(iii) Protective—including Foresters and Forest Guards.

6. The members of the controlling staff were ordinarily appointed by the Secretary of State in England. But deserving Sub Assistant conservators could be promoted to the class of Assistant Conservators by the Governor in Council on the special recommendation of Conservators, but they could not, save in cases of exceptional merit, rise to the class of Deputy Conservators. The district charges were ordinarily held by the Deputy and Assistant Conservators. Sub-Assistant Conservators could not by virtue of their office hold charge of districts. But Sub-Assistant Conservators and even Rangers had held charge of districts, in rare cases, for want of Deputy and Assistant Conservators.

7. Proposals of Sir D. Brandis.—In 1886, about the time of the last Public Service Commission were prosecuting their inquiries in India, Sir D. Brandis submitted certain proposals to the Secretary of State for India regarding the organisation of the Forest Service. As some of these proposals helped to shape the policy of Government in officering the Department, it seems necessary to refer to them here. His proposals were briefly as follows:—

(1) That any increase in the number of officers to direct the executive management of the forests must not be met by augmenting the number of the

APPENDIX VIII. (continued).

controlling staff, but by employing the less expensive agency of the executive staff.

(2) That some prospect of earning promotion to the ranks of the superior or controlling staff must be held out to the executive staff, as every instance in which it might be possible to make such promotion would tend to elevate the aims and character of this staff, and to increase its efficiency:

(3) That the Home authorities should resist any tendency on the part of the local authorities in India to meet the expansion of work by addition to the superior staff, and that the necessity should be impressed upon the Government of India of expanding the operations of the Dehra Dun Forest School, of employing on a larger scale native officers trained at that institution, and of more rapidly completing the organisation of the executive forest staff in the different provinces: and

(4) That as the duties of the controlling staff consisted chiefly in initiating all important measures and in exercising a proper supervision over the operations of the Department, the men sent out from England should have undergone a more thorough professional training and have learnt the practice and science of Forestry.

8. *Recommendations of the Public Service Commission of 1886-1887.*—These recommendations were as follows:—

(1) That the staff be divided into an Imperial Branch and a Provincial Branch;

(2) That, as in the Imperial Civil Service, the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service should be a *corps d'élite* limited to the number of officers necessary to fill the superior controlling appointments and such a proportion of the Assistant Conservators' posts as would ensure a complete training for the junior officers;

(3) That the Imperial Branch should be recruited in England;

(4) That the conditions of service as to leave and pension should be assimilated to those of the Imperial Branch of the Public Works Department;

(5) That the rule regarding marriage should be modified, inasmuch as it might operate to debar native candidates from competing for appointments in England; and

(6) That the Government should keep in view the policy of training the India men qualified to take charge of the higher administrative appointments so as to avoid, as far as possible, the necessity of expanding the Imperial Branch of the Service.

9. *Reorganization of 1891.*—Prior to 1891 the Imperial Service officers provided the whole of the upper controlling staff; but in that year, in order to meet the proposals made by Sir D. Brandis in 1886 and the recommendations of the Public Service Commission in 1887, proposals for reorganising the Forest Service in order to supply the recognised deficiency in the numerical strength of that service—chiefly by providing for the gradual development of indigenous agency—were approved by the Secretary of State. The service as reconstituted was as shown below:—

(1) Upper controlling staff for major charges consisting of (a) Imperial officers, who included Conservators, Deputy Conservators and Assistant Conservators; and

(b) Provincial officers who were styled Extra Deputy Conservators.

(2) Lower controlling staff for minor charges and sub-divisions consisting of Extra Assistant Conservators.

(3) Executive staff for Range charges consisting of Rangers and certificated Foresters; and

(4) Protective staff consisting of uncertificated Foresters and Forest guards.

10. The Imperial officers of the Upper controlling staff were to be recruited in England under covenant with the Secretary of State for India. The Provincial officers of the Upper controlling staff were to be recruited in India by promotion from the Lower controlling staff. It was ordered that they should have obtained the Higher Standard Certificate in Forestry of the Dehra Dun Forest School or of the Poona College of Science,

and that they should have done good service of not less than five years as Extra Assistant Conservators in either of the two Upper grades of that service. It was further provided that, at the outset, the Upper controlling staff should comprise only officers of the Imperial Branch, but that, as opportunities occurred, they should be replaced by officers of the Provincial Branch up to a limit of 20 per cent.

11. *Reorganisation of 1896.*—In 1896 the Forest Service was brought into line with the other Services by being classified as follows:—

(1) The Imperial Service—comprising that part of the Upper controlling staff which was recruited in England;

(2) The Provincial Service—comprising the rest of the Upper and the whole of the Lower controlling staff; and

(3) The Subordinate Service—comprising Rangers, Deputy Rangers, Foresters, and Forest guards.

By the above classification a definite line was drawn between the Provincial and the Imperial Services. But the former Service was not complete, as no transfers were made from the latter as contemplated in the reorganisation of 1891. In order to effect these transfers automatically the Government of India directed the institution of what is known as the "Pilot" system. It seems unnecessary to describe this system here as it did not answer the purpose originally in view, and was done away with in 1907. A self-contained cadre of the Provincial Service, consisting of Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators was subsequently sanctioned under the reorganisation of 1911, which is described below.

12. *Reorganization of 1911.*—The object of this reorganisation was only to augment the controlling Forest Service, the constitution of the Service as established in 1896 being followed in its entirety. The need for the augmentation was recognised as due to the rapid development of the forests in the Presidency, the redistribution of districts under Sir W. Meyer's scheme, the sub-division of heavy districts into two or more Forest divisions, and the contemplated establishment of a Forest College at Coimbatore. The following principles were followed in this reorganisation:—

(1) That, in accordance with the declared policy of His Majesty's Government to foster the larger employment of the indigenous agency in the administration of the forests:—

(a) The major charges should be divided between Imperial and Provincial officers in the proportion of 75 and 25 per cent, respectively, instead of the usual 50 and 20 per cent.

(b) The proportion of the minor charges should be greatly enlarged.

(2) That the Presidency should be divided into four circles instead of three.

(3) That the Madras Government should supply two officers to fill certain appointments on the India list, such as Inspector-General, Assistant Inspector-General, Staff of the Forest College, Dehra Dun, etc., whenever called upon to do so.

This reorganisation provides for the staff required for the Madras Forest College, Coimbatore.

(III) *THE IMPERIAL SERVICE.*—13. *Recruitment.*—The Imperial Branch of the Forest Service is recruited solely in England. Its officers are appointed under covenant with the Secretary of State, either under the regulations which may from time to time be laid down by him or in such other manner as may be approved by him. The regulations for the appointment prescribe that every candidate must be—

(a) A natural-born British subject, and

(b) Unmarried.

The former term has been held by the Government of India to be equivalent to a natural-born subject of His Majesty and to include natives of India. Similarly, as regards marriage, the rule attracted the notice of the Public Service Commission of 1886-87 as unsuited to natives of India, and the Secretary of State, in 1899, decided that a native

APPENDIX VIII. (continued).

of India was not barred by early marriage in accordance with the customs of his race. The regulations have been amended in order to make this clear. As yet there has been not a single case of an Indian belonging to this Presidency having qualified himself for entry into the Imperial Service.

14. *Training and selection of probationers.*—(i) In 1885 a course of instruction in Forestry had been inaugurated at the Royal Engineering College, Coopers Hill. In 1905, when the Coopers Hill College was closed, the Secretary of State for India in Council decided, as an experimental measure, subject to reconsideration after three years, that the forest probationers should be obtained by open competition as before, held by the Civil Service Commissioners, among candidates who had passed Responses at Oxford, or an equivalent examination elsewhere, the subjects of the competitive examination being mechanics and physics, chemistry, zoology, and botany; and that they should be trained at Oxford and on the Continent.

(ii) Three years afterwards the Secretary of State appointed a committee to "enquire into and report on the present system of selecting and training, after selection, candidates of the Indian Forest Service, and to make recommendations." The committee's report was considered in consultation with the Government of India, and in 1911 the Secretary of State formulated and approved certain resolutions with regard to the arrangements for the selection of probationers and their training in England and on the Continent of Europe. These resolutions, fifteen in number, mainly provide—

(1) That any University in the United Kingdom which possesses a Forest School approved by the Secretary of State should be permitted to train forest probationers, and for this purpose he approved the forest schools existing at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, and Edinburgh.

(2) That a course of training in practical forestry in Germany or elsewhere, a certain standard of knowledge in an Indian vernacular, and any other special qualification required by the Secretary of State should be imposed on all probationers.

(3) That their studies should be controlled by a paid Director of Indian Forest studies, who should be a selected officer of the Indian Forest Department.

(4) That for the purpose of reporting on the qualification of candidates for appointment as probationers, the Secretary of State should constitute in each year a Board of Enquiry which should select probationers, provided that, should there be more qualified candidates than vacancies, the Secretary of State should reserve the right to require the candidates to pass a competitive examination conducted by the Civil Service Commissioners, on the result of which their final selection would depend.

15. *Period of training of probationers.*—Originally the period of training was confined to two years, but in 1888 a change was introduced by which the senior students were placed in charge of Sir D. Brandis during an annual tour on the Continent of Europe after they had completed the two years'

course at Coopers Hill. In 1890 the course was further extended to three years, the greater portion of the last year being spent on the Continent in practical training. At present it ordinarily extends to two years, including seven months abroad.

16. *Grant of allowances to probationers during training.*—The cost to the probationers of the whole training, including fees, board and lodging while at the Coopers Hill College and the payment for the Continental course, but not including pocket money, clothes or out-of-term expenses was £27 in 1889 and rose to £576 in 1901. No allowances of any kind were granted to the probationers during their training except free passage to India, which was discontinued in 1905, but during the years 1905-1908 each probationer received on signing his agreement an allowance, the amount of which varied from £50 to £100 according to the proficiency and diligence shown by him during his Continental training. Since 1909 this allowance was raised to £120 a year, or a total of £240 in two years, and it was granted only to such probationers as possessed a degree in Natural Science or a Diploma in Forestry. This condition has, however, been abolished from 1912 and a passage allowance is also now paid to each probationer on appointment to the Indian Forest Service to the amount of £37 10s. for a passage to Calcutta, Madras or Bombay and £48 for a passage to Rangoon.

17. *Age of probationers.*—The age limits for admission as probationers in 1887 were 17 to 21 years and from 1891 to 1904 17 to 20 years. In 1905 they were raised to 18 to 21 years. In 1907 the maximum age limit was raised from 21 to 22, in 1909 to 23 and the minimum age to 19 in 1912. In 1914 and following years the age limits will be 19 and 22 on the 1st January of the year in which the selection is made.

18. *First appointment of probationers.*—Probationers who successfully pass the course are appointed Assistant Conservators. Prior to the introduction of the time scale of pay, Assistant Conservators were as a rule appointed to the third grade on Rs. 250, and they were not eligible for promotion successively to the second (on Rs. 350), and the first (on Rs. 450) grades, unless they passed certain examinations and obtained the necessary certificates of qualification from the Conservator. Assistant Conservators of the third grade who were not qualified for promotion to the second grade were not ordinarily placed in charge of a District Forest Office, but were posted to do duty under an experienced Forest officer, and generally placed in charge of a Forest range. Since the introduction of the time scale of pay probationers are appointed to the class of Assistant Conservator, their seniority being reckoned from the date on which they were made permanent in the class of Assistant Conservator. Special instructions have been laid down for the training of Junior Assistant Conservators and about the vernacular examinations to be passed by them.

19. *Pay of Imperial officers.*—At the time of the Public Service Commission of 1886 the pay of the Controlling Staff was as follows:—

	First grade.	Second grade.	Third grade.	Fourth grade.
Conservators ...	Rs. 1,250-1,500	Rs. 1,000-1,250	Rs. —	Rs. —
Deputy Conservators ...	900	800	650	550
Assistant Conservators ...	450	350	250	—

In 1891 the scale was altered to the following:—

	First grade.	Second grade.	Third grade.	Fourth grade.	Remarks.
Conservators ...	Rs. 1,600	Rs. 1,350	Rs. 1,100	Rs. —	Exclusive of exchange compensation allowance which was given from 1st April, 1893.
Deputy Conservators ...	900	800	650	550	
Assistant Conservators ...	450	350	—	—	

APPENDIX VIII. (continued).

In February, 1906, exchange compensation was abolished and the pay of Conservators was fixed at Rs. 1,900, Rs. 1,700, and Rs. 1,500. In January, 1907, the grading of officers below the rank of Conservator was abolished and a time scale introduced. The scale starts from Rs. 350 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 a month to Rs. 700 a month; thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,250 a month in the 20th year of service. No officiating grade promotions are now permitted within the class of Deputy and Assistant Conservators.

20. Leave and pensions.—The leave and pensions of the officers of the Imperial Branch are regulated by Chapters XIII and XIX of the Civil Service Regulations, under which they obtain the benefit of the European leave rules and may receive a retiring pension after 20 years' service (article 476). There has been no change in respect of the leave and pension rules since 1887 except in the matter of study leave (introduced in 1892) and special pensions under article 475. Conservators of the second and third grades were added on certain conditions in 1908 and the present orders are contained in this article as revised on 1st December, 1910.

21. Number of officers and Provident Fund.—(Please see paragraphs 29 and 30 under Provincial Service).

(IV) PROVINCIAL SERVICE.—**22. General.**—This Service comprises the Lower controlling staff as organised in 1891 after the report of the Public Service Commission and that portion of the Upper controlling staff which was not recruited from the Imperial Service. It consists of officers who are designated Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators. The term "Extra" in the designation of these officers was prefixed in 1891 when a definite line was drawn between officers recruited at Home and those recruited in India.

23. Recruitment.—Prior to 1891 there were only Sub-Assistant Conservators and these were recruited from the class of Rangers. Before promotion to the class of Sub-Assistant Conservator a Ranger should have passed (1) the language test, (2) the surveying test and (3) the departmental test, and be reported to be otherwise properly qualified, active and intelligent and capable of carrying out the duties of a District Forest officer. The language test was dispensed with in the case of men who had passed at least the Middle School Examination in the first class or the Matriculation Examination with the Handwriting Test. In 1891 the Government of India laid down that Extra Assistant Conservators should be recruited chiefly from the class of Forest Rangers, subject to the following conditions:

(a) who had obtained at the Dehra Dun Forest school the certificate in Forestry (Higher standard) with honours, and who had afterwards rendered not less than two years' satisfactory service as Rangers in executive charge; or,

(b) who had obtained this certificate without honours, and had afterwards rendered five years' satisfactory service as Rangers in executive charges; or,

(c) in exceptional cases who were members of the department on 1st December, 1891, and who had done specially good and faithful service for at least five years as Rangers, and who had received a good general education and possessed a sufficient knowledge of English.

Provision was also made for direct appointment, in exceptional cases, to the class of Extra Assistant Conservators of selected candidates while undergoing training at the Forest School.

In 1906 the Government of India laid down the following rules for recruiting to the Provincial Service:

(1) The Provincial Forest Service will be recruited either by direct appointment of candidates outside the department or by the promotion of officers in the department:

(2) candidates for direct appointment should be—

(c) persons under 25 years of age educated up to

a standard not less than that of the Matriculation Examination.

(b) Native Commissioned Military officers possessing a sufficient general education, provided that they undergo the three years' course of training at the Dehra Dun College.

Candidates may be selected either before or after completion of the ordinary two years' course at Dehra Dun, but, before being allowed to enter on the third year's training, they must have obtained the Higher Standard certificate of the College, and on its completion must have received from the Principal a certificate that they have satisfactorily completed the third year's course.

(3) Appointments in the Provincial Forest Service which are filled by promotion of officers in the department will be given to—

(a) Rangers who have obtained the Higher Standard certificate at the close of the second year's course at Dehra Dun, and have thereafter obtained a certificate from the Principal that they have satisfactorily completed the third year's course; and

(b) Selected Rangers of long service and tried probity and ability, provided that no Ranger under 40 years of age shall be so promoted until he has undergone the third year's training at Dehra Dun and obtained the necessary certificate.

These rules are now practically in force except that, instead of the two years' training along with the Rangers and a subsequent one year's training, a separate course of two years' training for the Provincial Service candidates has been established at Dehra Dun.

24. Training and selection.—As already stated, candidates for the Provincial Service, whether Rangers or others, must have passed through a course of training at Dehra Dun College. A Forest school had been started at Dehra Dun in 1878, and previous to 1906 this school provided only a two years' course for the training of Rangers. In 1906 a third year's course was added at Dehra Dun, which was prescribed in addition to the two years' course for such Rangers as desired to enter the Provincial Service by this means and for all candidates for direct appointment. From November, 1912, a further development has been made by the institution for Provincial Service candidates of a two years' course at Dehra Dun entirely distinct from the course prescribed for Rangers. The direct appointments introduced in 1906 were intended to attract "men of good education and good social standing," but no express qualifications, educational or other, were then prescribed by the Government of India, and the latest orders for the nomination of such candidates leave the Local Governments considerable freedom as regards the age and qualifications of candidates for direct appointments. The arrangements recently prescribed are as follows:

(1) It is left to Local Governments to prescribe what educational qualifications they please, including any examination, competitive or otherwise, for candidates it is proposed to depute to the Provincial course.

(2) Local Governments are to bear in mind the importance of giving a preference to candidates with a previous knowledge of science who are in all respects qualified by their education to follow and profit by the course of instruction, it having been found that without a preliminary training in science, probationers are not able to complete an advanced forest course within a limited time.

(3) Candidates are expected to know sufficient English and Mathematics to follow the course. The President of the Forest College is empowered to subject any candidate about whom he has a doubt to a special examination in these subjects, and as a result of the examination, or at any time during the course, to remove from the College any candidate whom he considers unable to follow the course prescribed.

(4) A physical test is undergone by candidates on arrival at Dehra Dun, followed by an examination by the Medical Board.

(5) The number of candidates to be sent for instruction will be fixed for each year for the Local

APPENDIX VIII. (continued).

Government, and so long as the number of candidates prescribed is not exceeded, Local Governments will be at liberty to send either candidates for direct appointment or Rangers already in service.

25. *Period of training.*—After selection candidates for direct appointment undergo a preliminary training under a District Forest Officer for a period of about one year before proceeding to Dehra Dun. After completing the course at Dehra Dun they undergo a further practical training for one year under the supervision of a District Forest Officer.

26. *Grant of allowances to probationers during training.*—During the period of their preliminary training candidates for direct appointment are paid an allowance of Rs. 40 plus a conveyance allowance of Rs. 25. Until recently they were paid a monthly stipend of Rs. 100 during the course of training at Dehra Dun, but not actual expenses by rail or steamer while on tour. But recently it has been ordered that they should receive only a monthly stipend of Rs. 80 plus actual expenses by rail or steamer, and that a bonus of Rs. 480 should be paid on completing the course successfully to help them to purchase their equipment. On return from Dehra Dun these men are styled Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators on a pay not exceeding Rs. 150 per mensem until they are absorbed into the regular line as Extra Assistant Conservators. If they are not confirmed within three years after completing the course they could be paid at Rs. 200 per mensem.

27. *Pay of Provincial Officers.*—The rates of pay of Sub-Assistant Conservators who were subsequently merged into and designated as Extra Assistant Conservators were originally as follows:—

	Rs.
Sub-Assistant Conservator, 1st grade ..	200
Do. 2nd " ..	175
Do. 3rd " ..	150

In 1891 the pay of this class of officers and officers of the Provincial service belonging to the Upper controlling staff was fixed as follows:—

	Rs.
Extra Deputy Conservators, first grade ..	600
Do. do. second grade ..	550
Do. do. third grade ..	500
Do. do. fourth grade ..	450
Extra Assistant Conservators, first grade ..	350
Do. do. second grade ..	300
Do. do. third grade ..	250
Do. do. fourth grade ..	200

Note.—A local allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem was granted to officers of the Lower Controlling staff (Extra Assistant Conservators) who were placed in charge of major forest charges, but the number of officers entitled to this allowance was limited to two in this Presidency.

Since 1st April, 1911, a time scale of pay has been introduced for this service, which approximates to nearly two-thirds of that for the Imperial Service. It starts at Rs. 250 a month and rises by annual increments of Rs. 20 a month to Rs. 550 in the sixteenth year of service; thereafter promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator is by selection. On appointment to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator an officer is paid Rs. 575—25—650. After one year's service on Rs. 650 a Local Government may by special order in each case promote an officer to a pay of Rs. 700 a month for three years and again to Rs. 800 for a further period of three years and thereafter to Rs. 850 until the close of his service.

Note.—Extra Assistant Conservators temporarily placed in a major charge could now receive a local allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem, but not any officiating allowances, without any limit as to the number of such officers.

28. *Leave and pension.*—The leave and pension of this branch of the Forest Service are regulated by Chapters XI, XII, XIV, and XIX of the Civil Service Regulations.

29. *Number of Imperial and Provincial Officers.*—(i) In 1886 the superior controlling staff consisted of the following officers:—

Conservators	2
Deputy Conservators	14	
Assistant Conservators	12	
	—			

Sub-Assistant Conservators	13
-------------------------------	-----	-----	----

The Sub-Assistant Conservators at this time belonged only to the Executive staff. But as they formed the nucleus of the Provincial Service their strength is mentioned here.

(ii) Under the re-organisation of 1891 the service was divided into the Provincial and Imperial branches for the first time. The cadre of the two branches was as follows:—

Imperial—		Nos.
Conservators	3
Deputy Conservators	21
Assistant Conservators	10
	—	34

Provincial—

Extra Deputy Conservators	Nil.
Extra Assistant Conservators	11

(iii) Subsequent to this there was no comprehensive scheme of re-organisation but appointments were created whenever necessity arose. Thus in 1898 one Extra Assistant Conservator was added to provide for the post of Forest Assistant to the Board of Revenue. In 1899 one Deputy Conservator and one Extra Assistant Conservator were added to provide for officers for Coorg. In 1904 one Extra Assistant Conservator for the new district of Guntur was sanctioned. In 1905 two Deputy Conservators were added temporarily for five years. Under the scheme for the transfer of appointments from the Imperial to the Provincial Service formulated under the scheme of 1898 it was ordered that three appointments of Deputy Conservators and four appointments of Assistant Conservators should be transferred to the Provincial service, but of these seven appointments only three were actually transferred until the "Pilot" system was abolished in 1907. It must also be mentioned that two appointments of Assistant Conservators were transferred from the Punjab to the Madras list under the orders of the Government of India (1 in 1903 and 1 in 1905). Thus prior to the final reorganisation of the Provincial and Imperial services in 1911 the cadre stood as follows:—

Imperial—		No.
Conservators	3
Deputy Conservators	15*
Assistant Conservators	8
	—	26

Provincial—

Extra Deputy Conservators	7†
Extra Assistant Conservators	18
	—	25

(iv) The reorganisation of 1911 fixed the cadre of the service as follows:—

(a) <i>Imperial.</i>	No.	Pay.
Conservator, first grade ..	1	1,900
Do. second grade ..	2	1,700
Do. third grade ..	1	1,500
Deputy and Assistant Conservators ..	27	(Time scale of pay.)
Total ..	31	—

(b) <i>Provincial.</i>		
Extra Deputy Conservators ..	8	(Time scale of pay.)
Do. Assistant do. ..	31	—
Total ..	39	—

* This excludes four pilot posts which remained to be transferred to the Provincial service and the two posts temporarily sanctioned for a period of five years in 1905.

† This includes four pilot posts which remained to be transferred from the Imperial Service.

APPENDIX VIII. (continued).

(v) There are at present 32 Forest divisions in the Presidency—21 being major and 11 minor. The 70 officers are intended to hold the above charges as well as other special appointments as shown below:—

Imperial Officers.

Major district charges	13
Coorg	1
Forest College	2
Leave and training reserve (25 per cent.)	6	
Conservators	4
Working plans duty	3
India posts	2
		Total	31	

Provincial Officers.

Major district charges	8
Minor do.	11
Coorg	1
Forest College	3
Leave and training reserve (14 per cent.)	5	
Board's Forest Assistant	1	
Assistants to District Forest officers	8	
Minor district charges under contemplation	...	2		
		Total	39	

30. *Provident fund for Imperial and Provincial officers.*—A Forest Officers' Provident Fund was instituted in 1896, to which all officers of the Imperial and Provincial branches of the Forest Service were permitted to subscribe. In the case of officers in Government service on 1st July, 1896, the subscription was not obligatory, nor was it so in the case of officers of the Provincial branch who were not of European or Eurasian descent. It was made obligatory in the case of all officers joining the Imperial branch and all European and Eurasian officers joining the Provincial branch after the above date. In 1909 a General Provident Fund was established on the basis that contribution is compulsory up to 6½ per cent. on salaries with voluntary contributions of not more than a further 6½ per cent. The Forest Officers' Fund has been closed to future entrants and officers in whose case subscription to this fund was optional or compulsory have been permitted to join the new fund as optional or compulsory subscribers while for those who do not exercise the option of joining the new fund the rules applicable to them remain unchanged.

II.

Additional Statement called for in the Joint Secretary's letter dated 1st August, 1913.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.

(a) *Imperial officers.*—The present regulations as to recruitment, training, and probation were framed after full consideration only five years ago, and there is no reason to revise them at present. But, in view of the large expenditure incurred annually on forest roads and buildings and the possibility and desirability of introducing wherever possible systems of mechanical transport for timber, it is desirable that greater attention than at present should be paid to practical instruction in Forest Engineering.

(b) *Provincial officers.*—The present regulations as to recruitment, training, and probation have so recently been introduced that it is premature to express an opinion whether they are satisfactory. But so far they have apparently resulted in the recruitment of a better class of men than formerly.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

(a) *Imperial officers.*—The rates of pay in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1912 are shown in the subjoined Annexure. The scale of pay for the Imperial Forest officers having been fixed only in 1906-1907, there are no very cogent reasons for altering it or

for holding it to be not satisfactory. As regards allowances, the existing rules provide for the grant of local allowances to officers deputed for the preparation of working plans. The grant of local allowance has recently been sanctioned for the Principal of the Forest College, Coimbatore, and the question of extending a similar concession to the Instructors of the College has been referred to the Government of India.

(b) *Provincial officers.*—The rates of pay in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1912 are shown in Annexure I. The prospects of the Service have been so greatly improved at a very recent date that it is quite unnecessary to do anything more at present.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.

The cadre of the Service is at present as follows:—

(a) Imperial.	No.	Pay. Rs.
Conservator, first grade	...	1 1,900
Do. second grade	...	2 1,700
Do. third grade	...	1 1,500
Deputy and Assistant Conservators	27	(Time scale of pay.)
	Total	31

(b) Provincial.

Extra Deputy Conservators	...	8
Do. Assistant	do.	31
	Total	39

The cadre provides 25 per cent. (i.e., six officers) as leave and training reserve for the Imperial Service and 14 per cent. (i.e., five officers) for the Provincial Service. It has been found by experience that the reserve of 25 per cent. is inadequate in the case of the Imperial Service. At the present time the Provincial cadre is not by any means at full strength and for some years to come a very large proportion of the Service will consist of probationers, either at Dehra Dun or under training in this Presidency, and consequently until the Service is at full strength the reserve for leave and training for the Provincial Service will be insufficient. But when the cadre is fully established the reserve should be adequate.

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the Forest Service.—There are no appointments outside the authorised cadre held temporarily or otherwise by the Imperial officers; but one of the Provincial officers has been lent to the Travancore Durbar for employment as Conservator of the State Forests.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—The great need for a revision of the re-organisation sanctioned in 1911 has been pressed upon Government by the Inspector-General of Forests (Mr. Beeson Bryant), who considered that many of the minor charges in this Presidency should be raised to major charges and that many of the present charges are too large and unwieldy and will have eventually to be subdivided. Another reason why an addition to the Imperial Service is found to be necessary is that there are at present very few officers in the Extra Assistant Conservators class fit for promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservators and in consequence Imperial officers are now in charge of divisions which ought to be held by Provincial men. The compilation of working plans is also at a standstill and the Government of India have recently been addressed to lend this Government three Imperial officers for the prosecution of this important work. Until, therefore, better qualified men reach the top of the Provincial Service the proportion of Imperial officers will have to be increased. As regards the Provincial Service, until the cadre is full, and that will not be for many years, it is impossible to say whether or no the cadre is adequate.

APPENDIX VIII. (continued).

ANNEXURE TO PRECEDING ADDITIONAL STATEMENT.

Cadre of the Forest Department (Higher Grades) on 1st April, 1886, 1890, 1900 and 1912.

Comparative statement showing the cadre of the department with the number of posts and the pay of the Imperial grades and Provincial grades:—

Designation of the posts.	Grades.	Sanctioned cadre.		Actual cost of the establishment as it stood on 1st April, 1886, 1890, 1900 and 1912.		Remarks.	
		Number.	Pay of grade.	Details.	Total.		
1886.							
<i>Imperial Service.</i>				Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Conservators, 2 ...	1st grade ...	1	1,250—1,500	1 × 1,400	1,400		
	2nd " "	1	1,000—1,250	1 × 1,150	1,150		
		2					
Deputy Conservators, 14...	1st grade ...	3	900	2 × 900	1,800		
	2nd " "	3	800	3 × 800	2,400		
	3rd " "	4	650	4 × 650	2,600		
	4th " "	4	550	4 × 550	2,200		
		14					
Assistant Conservators, 12.	1st grade ...	5	450	5 × 450	2,250		
	2nd & 3rd grades	5	350	5 × 350	1,750		
	Supernumeraries	2	250	2 × 250	500		
		12					
					18,050		
<i>Provincial Service.</i>						Excludes Rs. 250 drawn by T. Muhammad Ali Sahib who was only <i>acting Assistant Conservator</i> in April, 1886.	
Sub-Assistant Conservators, 13.	1st grade ...	6	200	4 × 200	800		
	2nd " "	7	150	4 × 150	600		
				1 × 100	100		
				1 × 90	90		
		13					
					1,590		
1890.							
<i>Imperial Service.</i>				Rs.	Rs.		
Conservators, 2 ...	1st grade ...	1	1,250—1,550	1 × 1,500	1,500		
	2nd " "	1	1,000—1,250	1 × 1,250	1,250		
		2					
Deputy Conservators, 14...	1st grade ...	3	900	3 × 900	2,700		
	2nd " "	3	800	3 × 800	2,400		
	3rd " "	4	650	4 × 650	2,600		
	4th " "	4	550	4 × 550	2,200		
		14					
Assistant Conservators, ...	1st grade ...	5	450	5 × 450	2,250		
12.	2nd & 3rd grades	5	350	3 × 350	1,050		
	Supernumeraries	2	250	2 × 250	500		
		12					
Sub-Assistant Conservators, 13.	1st grade ...	6	200	2 × 200	400		
	2nd " "	7	150	7 × 150	1,050		
		13					
1900.							
<i>Imperial Service.</i>				Rs.	Rs.		
Conservators, 3 ...	1st grade ...	1	1,600	1 × 1,600	1,600		
	2nd " "	1	1,350	1 × 1,350	1,350		
	3rd " "	1	1,100	1 × 1,100	1,100		
	Total ...	3					
Deputy Conservators, 15...	1st grade ..	2	900	3 × 900	2,700		
	2nd " "	3	800	4 × 800	3,200		
	3rd " "	5	650	6 × 650	3,900		
	4th " "	5	550	7 × 550	3,850		
	Total ...	15					

APPENDIX VIII. (continued).

ANNEXURE I.—cont.

Comparative statement showing the cadre of the department, etc.—cont.

Designation of the posts.	Grades.	Sanctioned cadre.		Actual cost of the establishment as it stood on 1st April, 1880, 1890, 1900 and 1912.		Remarks.
		Number.	Pay of grade.	Details.	Total.	
1900—cont.						
Assistant Conservators, 8...	1st grade ...	5	Rs. 450	5 x 450	Rs. 2,250	
	2nd " ...	3	350	3 x 350	1,050	
	Total ...	8				
<i>Provincial Service.</i>						
Extra Deputy Conservators, 6.	1st grade ...	1	600	
	2nd " ...	1	550	
	3rd " ...	2	500	
	4th " ...	2	450	1 x 450	450	
	Total ...	6				
Extra Assistant Conservators, 16.	1st grade ...	4	350	2 x 350	700	
	2nd " ...	5	300	5 x 300	1,500	
	3rd " ...	3	250	3 x 250	750	
	4th " ...	4	200	4 x 200	800	
	Total ...	16				
1912.*						
<i>Imperial Service.</i>						
Conservators, 4 ...	1st grade ...	1	1,900	1 x 1,900	1,900	*NOTE.—The rates of pay on 1st April, 1913, were the same as those on 1st April, 1912.
	2nd " ...	2	1,700	2 x 1,700	3,400	
	3rd " ...	1	1,500	1 x 1,500	1,500	
		4				
Deputy Conservators, 22†	Rs. 580 to 1,250	10	1,250	10 x 1,250	11,250	†Deputy and Assistant Conservators—sanctioned Nos. number 27 Supernumeraries—G.O. No. 3,024, Revenue, dated 11th October, 1911 3
		4	1,200	4 x 1,200	4,800	
		2	1,100	2 x 1,100	2,200	
		1	1,050	1 x 1,050	1,050	
		1	950	1 x 950	950	
		1	850	1 x 850	850	
		1	800	1 x 800	800	
		2	660	2 x 660	1,320	
		22				
Assistant Conservators, 8...	Rs. 380 to 540 ...	2	540	2 x 540	1,080	
		4	500	4 x 500	2,000	†Excludes Mr. J. S. Battie shown as Conservator, 3rd grade, above.
		2	380	2 x 380	760	
					33,860	
<i>Provincial Service.</i>						
Extra Deputy Conservators, 8.	Rs. 575—25—650	3	Vacant.	
	Rs. 700, 800, 850.	1	700	1 x 700	700	
		3	600	3 x 600	1,800	
		1	In foreign service.	
		8				
Extra Assistant Conservators, 31.	Rs. 250—20—550.	1	550	1 x 550	550	
		1	490	1 x 490	490	
		1	470	1 x 470	470	
		4	450	4 x 450	1,800	
		1	390	1 x 390	390	
		1	370	1 x 370	370	
		3	350	3 x 350	1,050	
		2	290	2 x 290	580	
		8	270	8 x 270	2,160	
Probationers	7	...	2 x 150	300	
Vacant	2	...	5 x 100	500	
<i>Special appointments.</i>						
Special Forest Officer, Parlakimedi Malihabs, 1.	Rs. 350—30—500.	1	...	1 x 440	440	Excludes the pay (Rs. 600) of Mr. M. Rama Rao in foreign service.
Special Veterinary Inspector, 1.	200	1 x 200	200	

APPENDIX IX.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Forest Department.

IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—Forest Officers appointed to the Bombay Presidency receive their appointments from the Secretary of State for India. A copy* of the regulations relating to the appointment of Probationers to the Indian Forest Service in 1914 is appended.

2. *With regard to the probation of the officers after their arrival in Bombay, it is recognised that a period of probation in India of about a year's duration is essential, mainly in order to give the new arrivals an opportunity for learning the vernacular, for gaining a general acquaintance with the conditions for working the local forests, and for acquainting themselves with the systems of forest and revenue laws and with the details of forest office work and accounts; and the following general principles have been adopted:—*

(i.) *That during the first year of service in India the youngest Forest Officer should be considered to be still under training and that during this period he should not usually be utilised for the ordinary purposes of forest administration.*

(ii.) *That the training should be under a selected Officer or Officers.*

(iii.) *That it should include both active work in a division, and a period of work at the headquarters of the Circle for the purposes mentioned above.*

(iv.) *That some arrangement should be made for Officers under training to tour in their own Provinces, and possibly for visits to selected Forests in other Provinces.*

3. *As at present advised, the Governor in Council considers that the regulations regarding recruitment, training and probation are satisfactory.*

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The 1st April has been taken for each of the above years in the following schedule. The Provincial Service is included for facility of comparison:—

RATES OF PAY.

Imperial Forest Service.

	1890.	1900.	1913.
Conservators—	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1st grade ...	1 on 1,500	1 on 1,600	1 on 1,900
2nd grade ...	1 on 1,250	1 on 1,350	1 on 1,700
3rd grade ...	1 on 1,000	1 on 1,100	1 on 1,500
Deputy Conservators—			Time-scale (19 appointments).
1st grade ...	2 on 900	2 on 900	4 on 1,250
2nd grade ...	3 on 800	4 on 800	2 on 1,200
3rd grade ...	4 on 650	7 on 650	2 on 1,150
4th grade ...	7 on 550	5 on 550	1 on 1,100
			1 on 1,000
			2 on 950
			1 on 850
			1 on 800
			1 on 750
			1 on 700
			2 on 620
			1 on 580
Assistant Conservators—			Time-scale (8 appointments).
1st grade ...	5 on 450	5 on 450	1 on 540
2nd grade ...	1 on 350	2 on 350	1 on 500
3rd grade ...	4 on 250	—	2 on 460
			3 on 420
			1 on 380

* *Vide Appendix XIII.*

Provincial Forest Service.

	1890.	1900.	1913.	Time-scale (32 appointments).
Extra Deputy Conservators—	4th grade.	Rs.	Rs.	Extra Deputy Conservators—
	1 on 450	—	1 on 850	1 on 850
			2 on 700	2 on 700
			2 on 650	2 on 650
Extra Assistant Conservators—	Sub-Assistant Conservators—	Rs.	Rs.	Extra Assistant Conservators—
1st grade	3 on 200	4 on 350	3 on 550	1 on 450
2nd grade	4 on 175	6 on 300	1 on 510	4 on 390
3rd grade	6 on 150	6 on 250	1 on 490	4 on 370
4th grade ...	—	5 on 200	1 on 470	1 on 350
				4 on 330
				2 on 310
				1 on 250
Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators—				1 on 200
				3 on 150

ALLOWANCES.

1890.

Travelling Allowances.—Conservators were allowed a permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 200 per mensem and Deputy and Assistant Conservators were allowed a permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 150 per mensem. But Assistant Conservators did not become entitled to this allowance until they had passed their first Vernacular examination.

Acting Allowances.—Officers were allowed to officiate in a higher grade when vacancies were caused by a senior officer being absent on leave or deputation. They then drew the pay of the higher grade, and the difference between their substantive pay and that of the higher grade was termed acting allowance.

Charge Allowances.—Officers who were employed in making Working Plans of forests were granted a special allowance of Rs. 100 per month in consideration of the more arduous nature of the work they had to perform.

1900.

Travelling Allowances.—As in 1890, except that the Deputy Conservator of Forests in charge Sind Circle, which had been reduced from being a Conservator's charge, was also allowed Rs. 200 per month, i.e., the permanent travelling allowance of a Conservator.

Acting Allowances.—As in 1890.

Charge Allowances.—Officers who were employed as Working Plans Officers were granted an allowance not exceeding the rate of Rs. 100 per month for the period occupied in the preparation of a Working Plan, after the Plan had been sanctioned by Government, provided that Government was satisfied that the Officer had undergone exceptional exposure or incurred additional expenditure.

Local Allowances.—An allowance of Rs. 100 per month was granted to the officer employed as Professor of Forestry at the College of Science, Poona.

1913.

Travelling Allowances.—As in 1900, except that Assistant Conservators are eligible for permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 150 per month when they are placed in charge of forest divisions, or when they have passed their first Vernacular examination.

Acting Allowances.—A Deputy Conservator, who is appointed to act as Conservator in the vacancy caused by the absence of an officer on leave or

APPENDIX IX. (continued).

deputation, draws the pay of a 3rd grade Conservator. Conservators officiating for the same reason in a higher grade draw the pay of that grade. Owing to the introduction of Time-Scale pay for Deputy and Assistant Conservators acting allowances to these officers are no longer admissible.

Charge Allowances.—As in 1900, except that a charge allowance of Rs. 100 per month was granted to the Deputy Conservator of Forests in charge Sind Circle. The grant of the allowance was sanctioned by the Government of India in 1905 with a view to making the two appointments in the 1st grade of Deputy Conservators available for grade promotion and to preventing hardship in the case of a 2nd grade Deputy Conservator appointed to the charge of the fourth Circle.

2. As at present advised the Governor in Council considers that the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The sanctioned cadre of the Imperial Forest Service, Bombay, on 1st April, 1913, and the number of posts in each grade was as follows:—

A. Sanctioned cadre:—

Conservators	...	3	{ 1st Grade 1 2nd " 1 3rd " 1
Deputy and Assistant Conservators on time-scale	24		On time-scale.
Total	...	27	

B. Actual number of posts in each grade was—

Conservators	{ 1st Grade 1 2nd " 1 3rd " 1
Deputy Conservators	19
Assistant Conservators	8*

2. Up to the year 1907 no provision had been made in the cadre for leave and training. In October, 1907, the Secretary of State directed that the policy of developing a Provincial Branch of the Service should be strictly adhered to, that proposals for adding to the Imperial Branch should not be submitted for his sanction without careful inquiry as to the possibility of providing for the increased operations of the Forest Department by strengthening the Provincial Branch, and that the ratios of 80 and 20 per cent., which were adopted in 1890 for distributing the cadre of appointments of the superior or upper controlling establishments between the Imperial and the Provincial Branches, should not be departed from without special reason. In accordance with instructions from the Government of India, in calculating the total strength of the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service 25 per cent. of the number of posts required to fill the 80 per cent. of the major charges which were to be held by Imperial Officers was added to allow for officers on leave or on training. As this 80 per cent. of the major charges required 20 officers, the provision of additional posts made in the cadre on account of leave and training was 5, and it has remained at this number since that date. In addition to these 25 appointments, there are two appointments in the Bombay cadre which are required to fill two appointments on the India list.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—No appointments were held by Bombay Imperial Forest Officers outside the authorised cadre on 1st April, 1913, except the three appointments of Assistant Conservators which have been referred to under (III) as due to over-recruitment. Since 1st April, 1913, one of

* The excess in the number of officers in this Grade on the above date was due to the arrival of new recruits. This over-recruitment was caused by the necessity of providing appointments for the whole number of the successful Probationers of 1911 who were due to come to India. The number of candidates to be selected annually in England for training will be reduced until the supernumerary appointments have been absorbed.]

these supernumerary Assistant Conservators has been absorbed into the authorised cadre by the retirement of a Deputy Conservator. An appointment outside the authorised cadre has since the above date been given to an officer of the Bombay Forest Service who has been lent temporarily to the Government of India as an Assistant in the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Government consider the appointment of a Chief Conservator of Forests is needed in this Presidency, and have decided to move the Government of India and the Secretary of State in the matter.

PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The regulations have been stated fully in Government Notification* No. 10618, dated 19th November, 1912, and as at present advised the Governor in Council considers that they are satisfactory.

RATES OF PAY.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—1890.—The officers were all classed as Sub-Assistant Conservators. There were three grades with pay as follows:—

1st Grade	200	per mensem.
2nd Grade	175	"
3rd Grade	150	"

1900.—The officers were now classed as Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators. There was only one appointment of Extra Deputy Conservator. The rates of pay were as follows:—

Extra Deputy Conservator, 4th Grade	...	450	Rs.
Extra Assistant Conservator, 1st Grade	...	350	
Do.	do.	2nd Grade	300
Do.	do.	3rd Grade	250
Do.	do.	4th Grade	200

1st April, 1913.—Grades had been abolished and rates of pay were as follows:—

Extra Deputy Conservator	850	per mensem	Rs.
Do.	700	" each.	
Do.	650	"	
Extra Assistant Conservators were on time-scale, and the Officers were drawing pay as under on 1st April, 1913:—			
Extra Assistant Conservators	...	Rs. 250 per mensem on first appointment, rising by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 550.	

Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators 3 on Rs. 150 and one on Rs. 200.

The circumstances under which these rates of pay are granted were that in 1908-09 the Government of India considered that the conditions of service in the Provincial branch as then existing had failed to secure an adequate supply of candidates of the quality required for the responsible duties entrusted to Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators, and that it was necessary in the interests of recruitment to make the prospects of the Forest service approximately as favourable as those of other Provincial Services.

ALLOWANCES.

1890.—*Travelling Allowances* were permanent and were Rs. 100 per month to officers in charge of Forest Divisions and Rs. 60 per month to officers in charge of Sub-divisions.

Charge Allowances were given only to officers who were employed on Working Plans under the Imperial Working Plans Officers, and were at the rate of Rs. 50 per mensem.

1900.—*Travelling Allowances*—Permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 100 per month was granted to an

* Vide Addendum.

APPENDIX IX. (continued).

Extra Deputy Conservator and of Rs. 75 per mensem to an Extra Assistant Conservator in charge of Forest Divisions. Forest Officers who were in charge of Sub-divisions were allowed Rs. 60 per mensem as in 1890.

Charge Allowances.—These were of two kinds.

(a) Allowances drawn by Working Plans Officers which were the same as those allowances in 1900 for Imperial Officers under similar circumstances.

(b) Allowances for being in charge of a Forest Division. There were two allowances only of Rs. 50 each of this description, the recipients of them being determined by Government.

1913.

Travelling Allowances were as in 1890, viz., Rs. 100 per month to officers who were in charge of Forest Divisions and Rs. 60 per month to officers who were not in charge of Divisions.

Local Allowances are granted at the rate of Rs. 50 per month to Extra Assistant Conservators who are placed temporarily in charge of major Divisions and are drawn by the officers only during the time that they hold such charges. The charge of major Division can be held by Extra Assistant Conservators only when exceptional circumstances demand that such appointments should be made. On 1st April, 1913, such Local Allowances were being drawn by three officers in the Bombay Forest Department.

Personal Allowances.—The rule for the grant of these allowances is as follows. An Extra Assistant Conservator who has served for not less than three years on Rs. 550 per mensem and who is considered by Government to be fit for a major charge but for whom no vacancy exists in the Upper Controlling Staff (as Extra Deputy Conservator) may be given a permanent allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem. In the case of officers whom the Local Government considers fit for a further increase of pay this allowance may be increased to Rs. 100 per month on the expiry of four years, and to Rs. 150 per mensem on the expiry of another period of four years. On 1st April, 1913, one officer of the Bombay Forest Department was drawing a personal allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem.

(2) As at present advised the Governor in Council considers that the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.—Number of posts.—The posts were as follows:—

1890. Appointments.

Sub-Assistant Conservator, 1st grade	3
" " 2nd "	4
" " 3rd "	6
Total ..	13

1900.

Extra Deputy Conservator, 4th grade	1
Extra Assistant Conservator, 1st ..	4
" " 2nd ..	6
" " 3rd ..	6
" " 4th ..	5
Total ..	22

1913.

Extra Deputy Conservator ..	5
Extra Assistant Conservator ..	23
Probationary ..	4
Total ..	32

(2) No provision had been made in the cadres of 1890 and 1900 for leave and training.

In the cadre of 1913 an addition of 14 per cent. of the posts—Major (5) and Minor (20) charges combined—which were to be filled by Provincial Service Officers was made to the total number of posts included in the cadre to provide for leave and training. The actual number of these posts was three. As this proved to be insufficient in practice, the number of Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators, which had been fixed at two when the above cadre was sanctioned and introduced, was increased to four.

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the

various Services.—No appointments were held as above on 1st April, 1913. The services of one officer had been transferred to the Rājpura State from 20th May, 1897; and in October, 1913, the services of another officer have been similarly transferred to the Junāgadh State. The names of these officers have been retained on their places in the list of the Bombay Provincial Service Officers, but they are removed from the cadre in so far that other officers have been appointed to the vacancies temporarily caused by their transfers.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—No addition to the cadre is considered necessary at present.

ADDENDUM.

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

Bombay Castle, 19th November, 1912.

No. 10618.—The following revised rules for appointment to the Provincial Forest Service of Bombay are published for general information, in supersession of those promulgated in Government Notification No. 10632, dated 29th October, 1907, printed at pages 1815 and 1816 of the *Bombay Government Gazette* of the 31st idem, Part I:—

REVISED RULES FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE BOMBAY PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. The Governor in Council is pleased to direct, in supersession of all previous rules and orders regulating admission to the Provincial Forest Service of Bombay, that subject to the satisfaction of the claims of persons already qualified under the rules hitherto in force, from the date of publication of these rules appointments to this Service shall be made:—

(a) By promotion to Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests of Forest Rangers of approved efficiency and satisfactory conduct who have passed through the course of training at the College of Science, Poona, and have obtained a Ranger's certificate or its equivalent; or who have obtained the Higher Standard certificate at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun, and thereafter rendered not less than five years' satisfactory service as Rangers;

(b) By direct appointment of candidates who have completed the two years' Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun.

2. The Governor in Council reserves to himself the right to fill all vacancies in either of the ways described in Rule 1 as he may consider best in the interests of the public service, and in such order as may be deemed advisable.

3. The senior Conservator of Forests will keep a list showing the names of all Rangers in order of seniority for the whole Presidency, and their general qualifications for promotion as recorded from time to time by each Conservator or Deputy Conservator in charge of a circle.

4. When Government propose to nominate to a direct appointment notice inviting applications will be given in the *Bombay Government Gazette*.

5. A candidate for direct nomination must be not less than 18 nor more than 24 years of age. He will be required to produce the following certificates:—

(i) A certificate that he is "a Native of India" as prescribed in section 6 of 33 Victoria, Chapter 3.

(ii) A certificate of age.

(iii) A health certificate in the form prescribed by Article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations (Fifth Edition), signed by a Commissioned Medical Officer or by a Medical Officer in charge of a Civil Station and certifying to the nominee's sound constitution, good vision and hearing and general physical fitness for an outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears marks of successful vaccination or of small-pox.

(iv) Certificates of the examinations which have been passed by him.

(v) A certificate of respectability and good moral character from two or more persons whose social or official position can be accepted as a guarantee of trustworthiness.

6. In selecting from amongst the candidates a person for direct nomination, very great weight will

APPENDICES IX. (continued) AND X.

be given to high educational qualifications, and only candidates who are in all respects qualified by previous education, more especially in Science, English and Mathematics, to follow the course of instruction will be nominated. The scope of the candidate's actual attainments, more especially in English, Science and Mathematics will, if necessary, be tested at the time of selection. In Mathematics the candidate should know Arithmetic, Algebra up to and including Quadratic Equations and simple problems, Geometry (the first three books of Euclid) and the elements of Trigonometry including the solution of triangles and the use of logarithms.

7. (i) A candidate selected for direct nomination will be required:—

(a) To find two sureties to execute a bond guaranteeing that under special circumstances they will refund all monies expended by Government on the candidate's behalf, etc.;

(b) To undergo a practical training extending over not less than six months in such forests as may be prescribed to him in order to give proof of his fitness for forest work. Such course of training will ordinarily commence on 1st November, i.e., one year before entry to the College, and the candidate's final selection for nomination will depend upon the proof which he gives during this training of his suitability for service in the Forest Department.

(2) While undergoing the training prescribed in clause (1) of this rule the selected candidate will receive a stipend of Rs. 50 per mensem and will be entitled to travelling allowance under the Civil Service Regulations.

8. A candidate finally selected under rule 7 (1) (b) will be required:—

(a) To proceed to the Forest Research Institute College, Dehra Dun, and go through the two years' Provincial Service course at the College;

(b) To sign an agreement binding himself to work diligently while at the College and to serve Government for not less than five years after passing out of the College.

9. A selected candidate may on arrival at the College be required to undergo an examination in English and Mathematics. Failure to pass this examination will entail the cancellation of his nomination.

10. While at the College the selected candidate will receive a stipend of Rs. 100 per mensem payable from the date of his entry into the College. The stipend is not payable for periods of vacation. Should the periodic report of the nominee's progress or conduct be unsatisfactory, the payment of the stipend will be stopped until improvement is reported, and should the periodic reports continue to be unsatisfactory, the nomination will be cancelled and the nominee will not be allowed to complete the course.

11. After the conclusion of the Provincial Service course a selected candidate who is certified to have passed it satisfactorily will be appointed to the Bombay Provincial Forest Service as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, on probation for a period of one year, which may be extended to three years or more at the discretion of Government. A Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator will be placed in executive charge of a Range or Forest Sub-Division, and will receive during the first three years of his probation a salary of Rs. 150 per mensem, and thereafter Rs. 200 per mensem until he is appointed to a vacancy of Extra Assistant Conservator in the sanctioned cadre of the Provincial Forest Service.

12. Every officer appointed to the Provincial Forest Service, whether by promotion or by direct nomination, will be required to pass, if he has not already passed, an examination according to the Higher Standard in at least one language of the Presidency other than his own vernacular.

By order of His Excellency
the Honourable the Governor in Council,
G. CARMICHAEL,
Chief Secretary to Government.

APPENDIX X.

Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Forest Department.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—(a) Imperial Forest Service.—The present regulations as regards the Imperial Forest Service of India are given in the Government of India's Circular No. 2-F.—280-2, in the Department of Revenue and Agriculture, dated the 18th of October, 1913.

(b) Provincial Forest Service.—The regulations for the Provincial Service in the Central Provinces are contained in the pamphlet entitled "Rules for the selection of candidates for the Provincial Forest Service in the Central Provinces" of which a copy is attached.

(c) Remarks.—For the Imperial Forest Service the present method of recruitment has, in the Chief Commissioner's opinion, proved fairly satisfactory, but he is inclined to think that recruits arrive in India at too advanced an age and that it would be preferable to resort to recruitment by means of nomination, followed by competitive examination, of candidates between the ages of 18 and 20, and then to train the men selected for a period of three years. Sir Benjamin Robertson considers that

great stress should be laid in the selection of candidates of physical fitness.

As regards training and probation the Chief Commissioner thinks it advisable that the recruits trained in England should receive their instruction at one residential institution. He favours the suggestion of the Chief Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces, that on their arrival in India the successful probationers should make a tour of inspection of some of the more important types of Indian Forests for three months, so as to gain a general insight into Indian conditions at the outset of their career.

With regard to the Provincial Forest Service Sir Benjamin Robertson considers that the regulations for its recruitment, training and probation, which were framed so recently as February, 1913, are generally satisfactory.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.—

(a) Imperial Forest Service.—The following statement gives the required information in respect of the years 1890 and 1900:—

Year.	Inspector General of Forests.	Conservators, Grade,			Deputy Conservators, Grade,				Assistant Conservators, Grade.		
		1st	2nd	3rd	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	1st	2nd	3rd
1890	Rs. 2,000—100—2,500	Rs. 1,500	Rs. 1,250	Rs. 1,000	Rs. 900	Rs. 800	Rs. 650	Rs. 550	Rs. 450	Rs. 350	Rs. 250
1900	Rs. 2,000—100—2,500	Rs. 1,600	Rs. 1,350	Rs. 1,100	Rs. 900	Rs. 800	Rs. 650	Rs. 550	Rs. 450	Rs. 350	Rs. 250

NOTE.—In 1900 Exchange Compensation allowance was drawn.

APPENDIX X. (continued).

The rates of pay at the present time are as follows:—

		Rs.
Inspector-General of Forests	...	2,650
Chief Conservator of Forests	...	2,150
Conservators of Forests	1st Grade	1,900
	2nd "	1,700
	3rd "	1,500
Deputy Conservators of Forests.	From Rs. 580 (in the sixth year of service) to Rs. 1,250 (in the 20th and following years of service) with a yearly increment of Rs. 40 up to Rs. 700 and afterwards of Rs. 50.	

Assistant Conservators of Forests start on Rs. 380 and with an annual increment of Rs. 40 rise to Rs. 540 in the fifth year of their service.

No Exchange Compensation Allowance is given.

(b) *Provincial Forest Service.*—The information required for the years 1890 and 1900 is given in the table below:—

Year.	Extra-Deputy Conservators, Grade,				Extra-Assistant Conservators, Grade,				Sub - Assistant Conservators.
	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
1890	250	200	150	100	
1900	600	550	500	450	350	300	250	200	

Under the present regulations for the Provincial Service emoluments are fixed according to a time-scale. The provisions of the scheme, which relates to the whole of India, are given in the Government of India's Circular No. 17-F—77-33, in the Department of Revenue and Agriculture, dated the 23rd June, 1911.

(c) *Remarks.*—An incremental rate of pay having been fixed for both the Imperial and Provincial branches of the Service after mature consideration, within recent years, the Chief Commissioner does not consider that the time has come for reopening the question of the pay of either branch. For officers holding administrative rank he would, however, support the recommendations for increased emoluments made in the Government of India's Despatch to the Secretary of State, No. 371, dated the 2nd November, 1905.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—(a) *Imperial Forest Service.*—Chief Conservator.—There is one post of Chief Conservator and this post is not a graded one.

Conservators.—There are three posts of Conservators sanctioned for these Provinces. The grades are always varying according to the officers who are posted to the Provinces by the Government of India.

Deputy and Assistant Conservators.—Twenty posts of Deputy and Assistant Conservators have been sanctioned for these Provinces. The time-scale pay system is in force for these officers, and hence they are not classified by grades. These 20 posts include two posts for India List appointments.

(b) *Provincial Forest Service.*—The sanctioned scale of this Service for these Provinces is five Extra-Deputy Conservators and 20 Extra-Assistant Conservators, the time-scale pay scheme being also in force for this Service.

A provision of 25 per cent. in the Imperial Service, and of 14 per cent. in the Provincial Service, has been made for leaving and training reserve.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—In the sanctioned cadre of the Imperial Service a provision of two posts has been made for the India List appointments, while at the present time the following Imperial and Provincial

Officers are serving outside the Provinces or are holding other appointments:—

(1) Mr. A. M. Caccia, Conservator of Forests, at Oxford, as Director of Indian Forest Studies.

(2) Mr. R. S. Hole, Deputy Conservator of Forests, at Dehra Dun, as Forest Botanist in the Forest Research Institute (at present Officiating President of the Institute).

(3) Mr. J. Donald, Deputy Conservator of Forests, at Dehra Dun, as an Instructor in the Forest College.

(4) Mr. E. Benskin, Assistant Conservator of Forests, at Dehra Dun, for training in Forest Economics at the Forest Research Institute.

(5) Mr. W. G. Gilmore, Extra-Deputy Conservator, at Indore, as Conservator of Forests of the Indore State.

(6) Mr. F. J. Langhorne, Extra-Assistant Conservator, Dewan of the Bastar State.

(7) Mr. Ghansiyam Prasad, Assistant Conservator, at Dehra Dun, as an Instructor in the Forest College.

(8) Mr. Shiyam Sunder Lal, Extra-Assistant

Conservator, at Indore, as a Divisional Forest Officer in the Indore State.

(9) Mr. Nazir Abbas, Extra-Assistant Conservator, at Bhopal, as Forest Officer of the Bhopal State.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The present cadre for both branches of the Forest Service was sanctioned in 1898 in the Secretary of State's Despatch No. 27 (Revenue), dated the 19th February, 1909. But for the large number of officers on deputation outside the Provinces the existing cadre would suffice. On account of the depletion of the cadre by these deputations, considerable difficulty is being experienced in carrying on the administration of the forests.

RULES FOR THE SELECTION OF CANDIDATES FOR THE PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE IN THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

1. Nominations for direct appointment to the Provincial Forest Service will be made by the Local Government. Applicants for such nominations must not be less than 18 years or more than 23 years of age on the 1st of July in the year in which their applications are submitted.

2. Applications must be accompanied by the certificates noted in paragraph 26 of the Forest College Rules, and must be submitted to the Conservator of a Circle or the Commissioner of a Division, not later than the 30th of June in each year. The officer to whom the application is submitted will forward it to the Local Government, through the Chief Conservator, with an expression of his opinion regarding the candidate's qualifications.

3. On the 30th June in each year each Conservator will report to the Chief Conservator the name of any Forest Ranger serving under him whom he may consider deserving of deputation to the special Provincial Service course at the Imperial Forest College, and of subsequent direct appointment to the Provincial Service. No Forest Ranger should be recommended who is not educationally qualified to follow and profit by the course of instruction.

4. Candidates are expected to know sufficient English to follow the course, and in mathematics should know arithmetic, algebra, up to and including quadratic equations and simple problems, geometry, the first three books of Euclid, and the elements of trigonometry, including the solution of

APPENDICES X. (continued) AND XI.

triangles and the use of logarithms. In addition, candidates should possess a substantial knowledge of one or more branches of natural science.

5. Nominated candidates will be required to undergo a preliminary course of five months' practical training under the orders of the Chief Conservator, and their nominations will be cancelled should they fail to pass through this course satisfactorily or should it be considered that they are physically unsuitable for the Forest Department. Ordinarily this course of instruction will extend from the 15th November to the 15th April, commencing in the year in which the candidates are nominated. During this practical course candidates will be given a consolidated allowance of Rs. 40 per mensem.

6. During the course of instruction at the Imperial Forest College, candidates will be granted the following monthly stipends to assist them in meeting their expenses while at the Imperial Forest College:—

During the first year a stipend of Rs. 50 per mensem.

During the second year a stipend of Rs. 75 per mensem.

This increased stipend in the second year of the College course will not be given unless the President of the College considers that the candidate's general conduct and progress with his studies are satisfactory.

In addition any candidate who obtains the Honour Certificate of the College will be granted a bonus of Rs. 300.

Forest Rangers selected under Rule 3 will draw the pay of the grade during their stay at the College, subject to a minimum of Rs. 75, and travelling allowance under the ordinary rules.

7. On arrival at Dehra Dun and before the commencement of the College course, candidates or Forest Rangers selected under Rule 3 may be called

on to undergo a special examination in English and mathematics, a physical test and a medical examination. Failure to satisfy any of these tests may involve removal from the College under the orders of the President. The President is also empowered to remove from the College at any time during the course any candidate selected under Rule 1 or 3 whom he considers unable to follow the course prescribed.

8. The Agreement and Security Bond to be executed by candidates nominated under Rule 1 above, or by Forest Rangers deputed under Rule 3, are as appended to these rules.* They shall be executed before the candidates or Forest Rangers concerned join the Imperial Forest College, and shall be submitted to the Local Government by the Chief Conservator.

9. Candidates who fulfil the conditions of the Agreement referred to above will be eligible for substantive appointment to the Provincial Forest Service after two years' service as Probationary Extra-Assistant Conservator of Forests and on the occurrence of an actual vacancy in that Service. If, owing to no actual vacancy occurring, they are not so appointed after two years' satisfactory service on probation, their pay will be raised to Rs. 200 per mensem. Any period of training or probation served after candidates attain the age of 23 years may be allowed to count as service for pension. Forest Rangers who are deputed to the Provincial Service course at the Imperial Forest College, and who similarly fulfil the conditions of their Agreements, will be eligible for substantive appointment to the Provincial Service on the occurrence of a vacancy in that Service, and without any period of service as a Probationary Extra-Assistant Conservator, provided that they are also eligible under Article 30 (b) of the Forest Department Code.

* Not reprinted as similar forms appear in Appendix V.

APPENDIX XI.

(*Vide the Evidence of Sir William Schlich, Mr. W. Dawson, and Mr. E. P. Stebbing.*)

Statistics furnished by the Forestry Schools of the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh regarding the students who have taken the degree or diploma in Forestry at those Universities during the last few years.

Telegrams, dated 20th June, 1914, addressed to—

- (a) Sir William Schlich, Professor of Forestry, Oxford University.
- (b) W. Dawson, Esq., Reader in Forestry, Cambridge University.
- (c) E. P. Stebbing, Esq., Head of Forestry School, Edinburgh University.

Royal Commission on Indian Public Services would be much obliged if you could let them have as soon as convenient a statement showing for each of the last six years, or shorter period, if statistics are not available for six years—(i.) the number of students at Oxford (b. Cambridge, and c. Edinburgh) who have taken the degree or diploma in Forestry; (ii.) the age of each student at the time of taking the diploma or degree; (iii.) whether such students have or have not in addition a science or other degree. It would be convenient if the statistics in regard to Indian Forest Service probationers could be shown in a separate statement.

(a) *Letter from Sir W. Schlich, dated Oxford, June, 21st, 1914.*

In reply to your telegram of the 20th instant I have the honour to forward herewith a Statement showing the ages at which Probationers for the Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Natural Science and the Diploma in Forestry during the last six years.

As regards other students, who took the Diploma in Forestry during the last six years, I beg to point out that there is no age limit at which the Diploma must be taken; hence these students vary very much in age as the following remarks will show:—

In 1908 four students took the Diploma in Forestry at ages ranging from 23 to 26 years. All four took the Honours Degree in Science.

In 1909 eight took the Diploma in Forestry at ages ranging from 22 to 33 years. Three of these took an Honours Degree in Science and three a Pass Degree.

In 1910 four took the Diploma at ages ranging from 22 to 25 years. One of these took an Honours Degree and one a Pass Degree.

In 1911 seven took the Diploma at ages ranging from 22 to 34 years. Four of these took an Honours Degree in Science.

In 1912 six took the Diploma at ages ranging from 22 to 30 years. Four of these took an Honours Degree in Science, one took the B.Sc. degree and one a Pass Degree.

In 1913 four took the Diploma at ages ranging from 21 to 29 years. Of these one took an Honours Degree in Science, one a Pass Degree and the other two are taking an Honours Degree this year.

APPENDIX XI. (continued).

Enclosure in above.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE AGE AT WHICH PROBATIONERS FOR THE INDIAN FOREST SERVICE TOOK AN HONOURS DEGREE IN SCIENCE AND THE DIPLOMA IN FORESTRY.

Name.	Honours Degree in Science, Age.	Diploma in Forestry, Age.	Remarks.
<i>Diploma taken in 1908.</i>			
Clear, T.	21	22-4	
Dawkins, C. E. E.	23	26-4	
Gaunt, C. C.	23	24-1	
Gibson, H. L.	22	24-0	
Glover, H. M.	22	23-2	
Miller, W. A. H.	23	27-6	
Milroy, A. J. W.	22	25-2	
Minchin, A. A. F.	—	21-1	
Smythies, E. A. H. D.	22	23-9	
Wilson, C. C.	22	23-2	

Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—22 years.

Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—24 years and 1 month.

Diploma taken in 1909.

Benskin, E.	—	21-5	
Butterworth, G. S.	—	22-2	
Carr, J.	—	24-2	
Clarence, G. C.	24	24-7	
Davis, A. P.	—	22-5	
Fields-Clarke, W. H. T.	—	21-10	
Herbert, V. A.	—	26-3	B.A. Pass Degree.
Holland, J. B.	—	24-10	B.A. Pass Degree.
Lawton, W.	23	23-1	
Milner, C. E.	—	22-8	
Oliphant, J. N.	—	22-7	
Owden, J. L.	—	21-10	
Sitzler, E. A.	23	23-8	
Wright, H. L.	21	22-11	
Young, J. V.	24	25-4	

Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—23 years.

Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—23 years and 3 months.

Diploma taken in 1910.

Alington, G. H.	22	23-8	
Bradley, W.	—	23-7	
Collier, J. V.	—	24-1	
David, A. N.	—	22-0	
Goldberg, G. H. A.	—	23-0	
Greswell, E. A.	—	25-6	B.A. Pass Degree.
Gwyer, C.	—	24-11	B.A. Pass Degree.
Hiley, A. G.	—	23-0	
Inder, R. W.	22	25-4	
Lewis, H. T.	—	25-3	Honours Degree in History.
Lyall, J. H.	—	25-4	Honours Degree in History.
Mason, L.	—	24-4	B.A. Pass Degree.
Meiklejohn, W.	—	24-0	
Meridith, H. R.	—	21-10	
Nixon, A. B.	—	25-0	Honours Degree, History.
Shirley, G. S.	—	22-5	
Silvanus, D. H. M.	—	24-7	
Simcon, G. N.	—	22-8	
Villar, A. R.	26	26-6	

Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—23 years.

Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—24 years and 1 month.

Diploma taken in 1911.

Beeson, F. C.	22	23-9	
Bourne, R.	21	21-10	
Brooks, J. B.	22	21-10	
Cheyne, G. C.	—	24-11	
Clifford, M. W.	24	25-11	
Cooper, G. M.	—	21-7	
Gent, J. R. P.	—	24-9	
Hargreaves, C. K.	—	22-11	
Harlow, C. M.	20	22-11	
Howard, S.	24	24-7	
Mackenzie, J. M. D.	20	22-7	
Madan, F. R.	22	23-7	
Marriott, R. G.	—	25-8	B.A. Pass Degree.
Milne, W. C.	—	25-2	M. A. Aberdeen.
Moodie, A. W.	—	24-7	M.A. and B.Sc. Edinburgh.
Ogilvie, G. H.	—	24-10	B.Sc. Edinburgh.
Patterson, C. B.	—	25-1	B.A. Pass Degree.
Sothers, D. B.	20	22-7	
Starte, H. W.	24	24-10	
Thomas, A. R.	—	23-11	
Unwin, R.	21	24-0	
Walters, O. H.	23	25-3	

Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—22 years.

Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—24 years

APPENDIX XI. (continued).

Name.	Honours Degree in Science, Ago.	Diploma in Forestry, Ago.	Remarks.
<i>Diploma taken in 1912.</i>			
Bailey, W. A. ...	23	24·6	
Cochrane, R. A. ...	22	24·9	
Glasson, A. K. ...	21	23·2	
Hay, E. F. A. ...	—	25·0	
Jenkin, R. T. ...	23	25·4	
Jollye, H. C. B. ...	22	24·3	
Mackarness, C. G. M. ...	—	22·8	
Makins, F. K. ...	22	23·5	
Millers, J. T. ...	23	25·0	
Nicholson, A. R. ...	22	24·4	

Average age at which Honours was taken—22 years.

Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—24 years and 3 months.

Diploma taken in 1913.

Carroll, E. W. ...	22	23·2
Eden, A. E. ...	20	22·1
Sathé, D. L. ...	22	24·5
Shepherd, W. S. ...	21	22·10
Siminons, C. E. ...	22	24·9
Trotter, H. ...	—	23·1

Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—21 years and 5 months.

Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—23 years and 5 months.

(b) Letter from Mr. W. Dawson, School of Forestry, Cambridge, dated 23rd June, 1914.

I now forward the particulars asked for, regarding the age and qualifications of the candidates for the Diploma in Forestry. I have been able to get records for the last three years only—

Diploma in Forestry—In 1914 two Diplomas in Forestry were granted. One candidate possessed the Honours Degree in Natural Sciences, and one the Ordinary Degree. The ages of the candidates were 23 and 24 years.

In 1913 three Diplomas were granted. All three candidates possessed the Honours Degree in Natural Sciences. The ages of the candidates were 22, 22, and 23 years.

In 1912 two Diplomas were granted. Both candidates possessed the Honours Degree in Natural Sciences. Both candidates were 23 years of age.

(c) Letter from Mr. E. P. Stobbing, Indian Forest Service, Head of the Department of Forestry, University of Edinburgh, dated 23rd June, 1914.

With reference to your telegram, dated 20th June, 1914, asking for a statement detailing the number of students who have graduated in Forestry at this University during the last six years, their ages, and other degrees taken by them, I have the honour to forward herewith a memorandum giving the information required for the four years ending July, 1914—

2. The first degree in Forestry was conferred in this University in March, 1911.

3. Two of the graduates were selected as Indian Forest Probationers. At the time of their selection as Probationers, however, neither had completed his courses for graduation at this University. As Edinburgh had not at the time been recognised as a centre for the training of Indian Forest Probationers, the two students in question proceeded to Oxford, the first in 1909, the other in 1910.

Enclosure in above.

LIST OF BACHELORS IN SCIENCE OF EDINBURGH UNIVERSITY.

Name.	Date of Birth.	Year of Graduation in Forestry.	Age when Graduated in Forestry.	Other Degrees taken.
J. Lyford-Pike	1877	March, 1911	34	B.Sc. in Agriculture.
J. W. Munro	1888	July, 1911	23	" "
*G. H. Ogilvie	1888	October, 1911	23	
*G. F. Gordon	1887	March, 1912	25	B.Sc. in Agriculture.
J. W. Newton	1889	March, 1912	23	" "
Robert Veitch	1890	March, 1912	22	
James Fraser	1891	July, 1912	21	B.Sc. in Pure Science.
R. N. Chrystal	1891	July, 1913	22	
S. Lauchlan ..	1891	July, 1913	22	
P. T. Pillai	1890	March, 1914	24	M.A.
R. A. W. Taylor	1892	March, 1914	22	B.Sc. in Agriculture.
G. A. Whyte	1888	March, 1914	26	

The following will graduate B.Sc. in Forestry on 10th July, 1914:—

I. D. Macpherson ...	1892	July, 1914	22	
R. D. Robertson	1891	July, 1914	23	
H. C. Smuth ..	1893	July, 1914	21	Honours in one branch of Natural Science.
J. A. Master	1892	July, 1914	22	
P. R. Pillay ..	1884	July, 1914	30	B.A., Madras University.
H. V. Lely ..	1891	July, 1914	23	" "
W. A. Fraser	1893	July, 1914	21	

* Indian Forest Probationers, ride below.

INDIAN FOREST PROBATIONERS.

The following two students took the existing Forestry Courses for the Degree at Edinburgh University in 1908-1909 and 1909-1910 respectively. Before completing their courses for graduation they were selected as Indian Forest Probationers and proceeded to Oxford. Both men subsequently came back to Edinburgh to sit the examinations necessary to enable them to graduate B.Sc. in Forestry:—

Name.	Date of Birth.	Year of Graduation in Forestry.	Age when Graduated in Forestry.	Other Degrees taken.
G. H. Ogilvie ...	1888	October, 1911	23	
G. F. Gordon ...	1887	March, 1912	25	B.Sc. in Agriculture.

APPENDIX XII.

APPENDIX XII.

Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Forest Service.

TOTAL STATEMENT.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.																
	Total.		Europeans.		Anglo-Indians.		Brahmans (including Shawars).		Khatiyas.		Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).		Other Hindus (i.e., other than those shown in cols. 6 to 9).		Total Hindus (cols. 6 to 10).		Sikhs.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.	
Rs.																	
200—300	28	—	10	5	—	—	—	—	—	13	—	—	13	—	1	3	
300—400	61	13	9	5	19	5	—	—	—	29	—	—	31	1	1	3	
400—500	69	43	13	5	4	2	—	—	—	7	—	—	3	1	1	1	
500—600	51	29	9	4	1	—	—	—	—	2	—	—	9	1	1	1	
600—700	34	16	7	2	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	4	1	1	1	
700—800	26	18	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	
800—900	20	12	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	2	—	—	4	—	—	—	
900—1,000	9	9	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	
1,000—1,200	29	29	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	11	—	—	—	
1,200—1,400	46	46	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
1,400—1,600	8	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
1,600—1,800	8	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
1,800—2,000	6	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
2,000—2,500	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	
Total	397	239	62	37	7	3	3	8	9	67	—	8	775	6	10	5	

DETAILS BY PROVINCES.

I.—Madras.

Rs.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
200—300	11	—	4	1	—	—	—
300—400	5	3	3	2	—	—	—
400—500	8	5	1	—	—	—	—
500—600	7	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	3	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	2	1	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	3	3	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	13	13	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—
Total	60	33	10	4	1	—	—

II.—Bombay.

Rs.	18.	19.	20.	21.	22.	23.	24.	25.	26.	27.	28.	29.	30.	31.	32.	33.
200—300	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
300—400	16	1	5	2	9	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
400—500	8	—	5	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	7	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	5	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	3	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	6	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total	58	31	—	13	1	—	—	—	—	5	19	—	6	25	—	2

APPENDIX XII. (continued).

III.—Bengal.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.																														
	Total.		Europeans.		Anglo-Indians.		Brahmans (including Shervis).		Kshatriyas.		Kshyasthas (including Prabhus).		Baniyas and Vaishyas.		Sudras.		Other Hindus (i.e., other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).		Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).		Sikhs.		Parsis.		Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 15).		Muhammadans.		Indian Christians.		Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.															
Rs.																															
200—300	1																														
300—400	4																														
400—500	4																														
500—600	3																														
600—700	2																														
700—800	1																														
800—900	1																														
900—1,000	1																														
1,000—1,200	1																														
1,200—1,400	4																														
1,800—2,000	1																														
Total	21	17	—	—	2	—	1	—	—	1	4	—	—	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—				

IV.—Bihar and Orissa.

Rs.																											
200—300	1																										
300—400	3																										
400—500	3																										
500—600	2																										
600—700	2																										
700—800	3																										
800—900	1																										
1,000—1,200	1																										
1,400—1,600	1																										
Total	15	6	7	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	

V.—The United Provinces of Agra and Oudh.

Rs.																											
300—400	6	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
400—500	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
500—600	6	4	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
600—700	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
700—800	4	4	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
800—900	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
1,000—1,200	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
1,200—1,400	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
1,600—1,800	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
Total	31	22	1	1	2	2	1	1	—	1	6	—	—	6	—	—	6	1	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	

VI.—Punjab.

Rs.																											
200—300	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
300—400	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
400—500	4	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
500—600	4	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
600—700	4	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
700—800	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
800—900	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
1,000—1,200	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
1,200—1,400	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
1,600—1,800	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
1,800—2,000	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
Total	22	14	—	—	2	2	—	1	1	—	6	—	—	6	—	—	6	1	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	

APPENDIX XII. (continued).

VII.—Burma.

Number of Employes in each Grade or Class.

Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).

Pay.	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shewa),	Kshatriyas,	Kalyasthas (including Prabhus),	Banijas and Vaishyas,	Sudras,	Other Hindus (i.e., other than those shown in cols. 6 to 9),	Total Hindus (cols. 6 to 10),	Sikhs,	Parsis,	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muslims,	Indian Christians,	Buddhists.	
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.	
Rs.																	
200—300	6	1															
300—400	11	2														1	4
400—500	28	20															
500—600	15	7															
600—700	8	5															
700—800	10	4															
800—900	5	3															
900—1,000	4	4															
1,000—1,200	10	10															
1,200—1,400	12	12															
1,400—1,600	1	1															
1,600—1,800	1	1															
1,800—2,000	2	2															
2,000—2,500	1	1															
Total	114	72	34	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	2	5

VIII.—The Central Provinces.

Rs.	5	1	1	2	1	1	1	1	1	4	4	4	4	1	1	1	1
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.	
200—300	5	1															
300—400	10	2	2	3	1	3	1	1	1								
400—500	7	1	1	2	1	1	1	1	1								
500—600	4	1	1	2	1	1	1	1	1								
600—700	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1								
700—800	3	3	3	5	1	1	1	1	1								
800—900	5	4	4	1	1	1	1	1	1								
900—1,000	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1								
1,000—1,200	4	4	4	4	1	1	1	1	1								
1,200—1,400	4	4	4	4	1	1	1	1	1								
1,400—1,600	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1								
1,600—1,800	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1								
2,000—2,500	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1								
Total	54	28	10	10	1	1	1	1	1	13	1	1	14	2	—	—	—

IX.—Assam.

Rs.	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	2	1	1
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.	
200—300	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	2	1	1
300—400	3	1	5	5	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
400—500	5	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
500—600	3	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
600—700	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
700—800	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
800—900	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
1,000—1,200	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1	2	6	—	6	6	6	6	6
1,200—1,400	1	1	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total	22	16	—	4	—	—	—	—	2	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

APPENDIX XIII.

APPENDIX XIII.

Regulations as to the appointment of Probationers to the Indian Forest Service, 1914.

1. *Appointments.*—The Secretary of State for India in Council will, in the summer of 1914, make not less than five appointments of Probationers for the Indian Forest Service, provided that so many candidates are considered to be in all respects qualified.

In making these appointments, he will act with the advice of a Selection Committee.

2. *Applications for Appointment.*—Applications for appointment must be made on a printed form to be obtained from the Secretary, Revenue Department, India Office, Whitehall, London, S.W., and to be returned to him not later than Wednesday, the 1st July, 1914. Candidates must be prepared, if called upon, to attend at the India Office, at their own expense, for a personal interview with the Selection Committee within three weeks from that date.

3. *Age Limit.*—Candidates must be not less than 19 but under 22 years of age on the 1st January, 1914.

Note.—For the year 1914 only, candidates who have taken honours course (or other course specified in paragraph 5) which, under the Regulations of the University, occupies four years, will be subject to the age limits which have hitherto been in force, *viz.*, 19 and 23 on the 1st July of the year in which selection is made.

4. *Nationality, etc.*—Every candidate must be a natural-born subject of His Majesty. He must be prepared to give an undertaking, if selected, that he will not marry before he reaches India. If he does so, he will forfeit his appointment. He must be of good physique, and must produce evidence of character to satisfy the Secretary of State for India in Council that he is suited for the Indian Forest Service.

5. *Qualifications.*—Candidates must have obtained a degree with Honours in some branch of Natural Science* in a University of England, Wales, or Ireland, or have passed the Final Bachelor of Science Examination in Pure Science in one of the Universities of Scotland.† A degree in Applied Science will not be considered as fulfilling these conditions. Candidates will be required to produce evidence that they have a fair knowledge of either German or French.

Note.—Applications for appointment will be accepted from candidates who, on the 1st July, 1914, have already sat at an examination for a degree as mentioned above, but have not learned the result of the examination.

6. Should there be more candidates considered to be qualified in every respect than vacancies to be filled, the Secretary of State reserves the right to require them to pass a competitive examination conducted by the Civil Service Commissioners, on the results of which their final selection would depend. Particulars of this examination which would be held in August, will be found in Annexure I.

7. *Medical Examination.*—Selected candidates will be required to undergo a strict examination by a Medical Board at the India Office, at which par-

* A Moderatorship in Natural Science or in Experimental Science at the University of Dublin will be considered as fulfilling these conditions.

† Graduates in Forestry at the University of Edinburgh are regarded as satisfying the requirements of this paragraph if they pass the Final Examination of that University in some one branch of Natural Science embraced in the degree in Pure Science.

ticular stress will be laid on good vision and hearing, and to satisfy the Secretary of State for India that they are physically fit for service in the Indian Forest Department (see Annexure VI).

Candidates who do not satisfy the Secretary of State for India that they are physically fit for appointment to the Indian Forest Service will not be admitted to the competitive examination mentioned in Regulation 6.

8. *Period of Probation.*—Before appointment to the Indian Forest Department, a probationer will be required:—

(i) to have obtained, either before selection as probationer or within the period of two years' probation, the degree or diploma in Forestry at one of the Universities named below.*

(ii) to have undergone a special course of instruction in Forestry, under the direction and supervision of the Director of Indian Forest Studies appointed by the Secretary of State for India in Council, in such British and Continental localities as may be selected for the purpose;

(iii) to have passed an examination in certain special subjects, namely, Systematic Botany of Indian trees, Indian Geology, Forest Law, Indian Working Plans, and, if required, an Indian vernacular language;

(iv) to have undergone a final competitive examination in Forestry (see Annexure II);

(v) to have satisfied the Secretary of State, in such manner as may be determined, of his ability to ride.

The period of probation will in ordinary cases be two years. The Director of Indian Forest Studies will instruct probationers in each case as to the order and manner in which they should fulfil these various requirements.

9. *Charges.*—The Probationers will be required to defray all expenses of lodging, board, tuition, and excursions, while at the University, and on practical instruction in Great Britain and on the Continent, with the exception of fees payable to local Forest Officers in Great Britain and on the Continent.

10. *All allowances.*—The Secretary of State for India in Council will make payments to each probationer at the rate of £120 annually, not exceeding a total of £240 (besides the fees to local officers mentioned above). These payments will ordinarily be made on the following dates in each year:—

	£
On the 1st December 30
On the 1st March 30
On the 1st June 60

The cases of probationers whose probation does not extend over the full two years will be specially considered.

The grant of the allowances is subject to the following conditions:—

(a) That the progress of the probationer in his studies is satisfactory;

(b) That the probationer gives security to refund the payments in respect of this advance, as well as such payments not exceeding £60 in all, as may have been incurred by the Secretary of State on the probationer's behalf in respect of fees to local Forest Officers, in the event of his failing to qualify for an appointment in the Indian Forest Service, or not signing the articles of agreement as specified in paragraph 13, or failing to join the Indian Forest Service at the end of the period of probation.

* Cambridge, Oxford, or Edinburgh.

APPENDIX XIII. (continued).

11. *Conduct.*—Every Probationer will be required to conduct himself during the period of probation in a manner satisfactory to the Secretary of State, and to give evidence of satisfactory progress in his studies in such a manner as may be required, failing which, or in the event of serious misconduct, he will be liable to have his name removed from the list of Probationers.

12. *Appointment and Seniority.*—Probationers who comply with the requirements of Regulation 8 within the sanctioned period of time, and also satisfy such other tests as may be prescribed, will be appointed Assistant Conservators in the Indian Forest Department, provided they are of sound constitution and free from physical defects which would render them unsuitable for employment in the Indian Forest Service. Their position in the Provincial Forest Lists will be determined by the Secretary of State for India in Council on the report of the Director of Indian Forest Studies; but in making selections for the post of Conservator, officers joining the Service in the same year are reckoned as equal in seniority unless the Secretary of State for India in Council shall for special reasons have directed otherwise in any particular case or cases.

Probationers will be allowed at the end of the period of probation to state their preference in respect to the Provinces to which they desire to be allotted; but the distribution will be made to the several Provinces according to the needs of the public service, at the discretion of the Secretary of State for India in Council. Officers are, however at all times liable to be transferred from one Province to another at the pleasure of the Government of India.

13. *Articles of Agreement.*—A Probationer is required, on qualifying for appointment as Assistant Conservator, to sign articles of agreement setting forth the terms and conditions of his appointment; he must embark for India when required to do so by the Secretary of State, and must engage his own passage. Failure to embark at the stated time will, in the absence of satisfactory explanation, lead to forfeiture of appointment.

14. *Passage Allowance.*—An allowance on account of passage to India will be paid to each probationer on appointment to the Indian Forest Service, to the amount of £37 10s. for passage to Calcutta, Madras, or Bombay, and £43 for passage to Rangoon.

Note.—The above is the normal rate of passage allowance. In consequence of the surtax of 10 per cent at present charged by shipping companies in respect of passages to India the above rates of passage allowance have been raised to £41 5s. and £46 5s. respectively. Should this surtax be removed, these rates will be reduced to those given in paragraph 14.

15. *Salary.*—An Assistant Conservator of Forests will draw pay at the rate of Rs. 380 a month (equivalent to £304 a year, when the rupee is at 1s. 4d.) from the date of his reporting his arrival in India.

16. *Promotion, Leave, Pension, and Provident Fund.*—Promotion, leave, and pension will be governed by the Regulations laid down by the Government of India, and applicable to Forest officers, such regulations being subject to any modifications or alterations which may be made in them from time to time by the Government of India, and their interpretation in case of any doubt arising being left to that Government. A copy of the existing regulations can be seen on application at the India Office.

Certain information regarding appointments in the upper controlling staff of the Indian Forest Service, the pay of which has been recently improved, will be found in Annexure III.; a summary of information regarding leave is contained in Annexure IV.; and regarding pensions and the provident fund in Annexure V.

INDIA OFFICE,
October, 1913.

ANNEXURE I.

COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION

In the event of the Civil Service Commissioners being requested by the Secretary of State for India in Council to hold an examination in any year of candidates nominated by him to compete for appointment as Probationers for the above Service, the following will be the subjects in which such candidates will be examined.—

	MAXIMUM MARKS.
1. English Composition	100
2. German or French	100
3. Elementary Chemistry	50
4. Higher Chemistry ..	100
5. Physics	100
6. Geology	100
7. Botany	100
8. Zoology	100

Not more than three of the subjects numbered 4 to 8 may be offered.

Candidates must pass to the satisfaction of the Civil Service Commissioners in the first three subjects.

In the subjects numbered 4 to 8, only marks showing real attainment will be counted towards the order of merit, so that a candidate who has a thorough knowledge of one or two of the optional subjects may obtain on that knowledge alone as many marks as a candidate who offers the maximum number of the optional subjects on a lower standard.

SYLLABUS

Languages.—The examination in German and French will include translation, composition, and conversation.

Sciences.—The standard of the examination in Higher Chemistry, Physics, Geology, Botany, and Zoology will be that of the Honours Schools of the Universities.

The examination in Elementary Chemistry will consist of a written paper on the more elementary parts of Inorganic Chemistry, together with the outlines of Organic Chemistry.

ANNEXURE II.
FINAL EXAMINATION

1. With a view to the allocation of the annual Currie Scholarship for Indian Forest Students (value about £35), and to facilitate the allotment of probationers to the several Provinces in accordance with paragraph 12 of the Regulations as to appointments in the Indian Forest Service, probationers who have completed their prescribed course of training will be required to undergo a competitive final examination in Forestry.

2. A list of the probationers in order of merit will be prepared by adding together (a) the marks obtained at the final examination, and (b) the marks obtained during the course of practical training in forestry under the control of the Director of Indian Forest Studies. The maximum of marks obtainable under (a) will be the same as under (b).

3. The final examination will consist of an oral examination and three or more papers, as follows:—

(i.) One or more papers in Silviculture, Forest Protection (including Forest Botany and Forest Entomology), and Forest Utilisation (including Forest Engineering).

(ii.) One or more papers in Forest Management, Forest Mensuration, Forest Valuation, and Forest Administration.

(iii.) A paper in General Forestry (Practical) dealing with the work done and with the forests visited during the course of practical training.

4. The final examination will be held at the beginning of October. Arrangements as to the date and place of examination will be made by the Director of Indian Forest Studies. Probationers will not be required to pay any fee for the examination.

APPENDICES XIII. (continued) AND XIV.

ANNEXURE III.

LIST OF APPOINTMENTS OPEN TO MEMBERS OF THE IMPERIAL BRANCH OF THE INDIAN FOREST SERVICE.

[NOTE.—*This list is liable to alteration at any time.*]

Appointment.	Salary. Rs.
(a) 1 Inspector-General of Forests	2,650 a month.
(b) *1 Assistant Inspector-General of Forests	2,150 "
(c) 2 Chief Conservators (Burma and Central Provinces)	1,900 "
(d) 22 Conservators, in three grades (including President, Forest Research Institute and College)	1,700 " } 1,500 " } respectively.
(e) 187 Deputy and Assistant Conservators	Rs. 380 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 a month to Rs. 700 a month; thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,250 a month, in the twentieth year of service.
Total 213†	
These appointments are included in (d) and (e). {	5 Foreign Service appointments { 16 Officers employed at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun {

ANNEXURES IV. and V. (not reprinted).

[Note.—Annexures IV. and V. are intended merely to show the principal leave and pension rules in the Civil Service Regulations at present applicable to officers appointed to the Indian Forest Service by the Secretary of State from the United Kingdom, without going into minute details,

and do not profess to deal with every case that may arise. The rules are subject to alteration, and any disputed question must be decided with reference to the authorised text of the Civil Service Regulations for the time being.]

ANNEXURE VI.

GENERAL PHYSICAL REQUIREMENTS (not reprinted).

* The officer holding this appointment draws in addition to the pay of his grade a minimum local allowance of Rs. 200 a month.

† These appointments are allotted to the various Provinces as follows : Burma, 68; Madras, 31; Bombay, 27; Central Provinces, 24; United Provinces, 19; Punjab, 12; Bengal, 12; Assam, 13; and Bihar and Orissa, 5; and 4 Imperial Instructor at Dehra Dun.

‡ Until he has passed the prescribed Departmental Examinations, an Assistant Conservator is liable to stoppage of increments of pay. On passing the examinations

he will resume drawing pay under the time scale at the rate to which his length of service entitles him.

§ These draw a local allowance of Rs. 150 a month in addition to their grade pay, with the exception of the President, Forest Research Institute and College, in whose case the allowance is at the rate of Rs. 200 a month. Of these 10 appointments, the four posts of Imperial Instructors have been sanctioned for five years from 1912, for the present.

NOTE.—Under the improved scale of salary shown above, no Exchange Compensation Allowance is granted.

APPENDIX XIV.

Officials who furnished written Evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Forest Service but who were not orally examined.

1. R. S. Hole, Esq., Offg. President, Forest Research Institute and College (Imperial Forest Service.)

2. Officers of the Imperial Forest Service at Dehra Dun.

3. Officers of the Provincial Forest Service at Dehra Dun.

4. Faiz-ud-din, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Chenab Forest Division, and five other officers of the Punjab Provincial Forest Service.

5. E. E. Slane, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Chittagong Division

6. F. W. Collings, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Shwegyin Division.

7. H. R. Meredith, Esq., Assistant Conservator of Forests, Kado Division, Moulmein.

8. L. E. S. Teague, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Chittagong Hill Tracts Division.

9. J. W. Ryan, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.

10. Cyril Hopwood, Esq., Deputy Conservator, Lower Chindwin Division, Burma.

11. J. L. Heffernan, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.

12. T. W. Forster, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests.

13. E. M. Buchanan, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Myitkyina Division.

14. C. W. Allan, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Henzada-Maabin Division, Pegu Circle, Burma.

15. V. H. T. Fields-Clarke, Esq., Assistant Conservator of Forests, Myittha Division.

16. R. L. Pocock, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, South Tenasserim Division, Tavoy.

17. A. J. Butterwick, Esq., Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator, Pegu.

18. D. A. Allan, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Burma.

19. E. B. Powell, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Burma.

20. F. P. Thomson, Esq., Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Burma.

21. H. B. Bryant, Esq., Acting Conservator of Forests, Central Circle, Madras.

22. A. N. Master, Esq., Senior Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

23. R. H. Madan, Esq., Licentiate of Civil Engineering (Bombay), Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

Forest Department.

A

Administrative Posts:

Additional pensions advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Gibson*, 66213; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Monteath*, 66342; *Lodge*, 66464; *Witt*, 66622, 66629.
no Bar advocated to advancement of Provincial Service officers, *Gohar Das*, 66189; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66446; *Sataravala*, 66601, 66614; *Srinivasulu*, 66659, 66670, 66676.

Interchange from one province to another, language difficulty would not constitute objection, *Lodge* ... 66502
Pay should be assimilated to that of Public Works Department ... p. 123, p. 126 (see also Chief Conservators, Conservators, and Inspector-General of Forests.)

Allowances (see under Leave and Pay).

Alwar Chetty Garu, M. R. Ry., Rao Bahadur, evidence of 66508-31
Anglo-Indians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... 153
Anglo-Indians and domiciled community not suited to, *Lodge* 66491, 56498

Assam:

Administration, memorandum by ... p. 129-133
Bar to selection of non-natives of Province should not be insisted on, *Kanjilal* ... 66436
Candidates for deputation to Ranger Service Course at Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, rules for selection 129-131

CHARGES:

Great difference between major and minor, *Perree* 66418
Major, no Provincial officer in, *Perree* ... 66416
Minor, two temporarily occupied by Imperial officers, *Perree* 66417
Number, *Perree* 66417

LOCAL ALLOWANCES:

Conservators should be made eligible for, at higher rate, *Perree* 66408
Increase advocated, *Perree* 66408, 66424 (see also subject headings.)

Assistant Conservators:

Duties, *Hart* 66086
Placed in charge of division should receive charge allowance, *Gibson*, 66211, 66242; *Cubitt*, 66274, 66289; *Witt*, 66620, 66647, 66649; p. 119.
Promotion to Deputy Conservator, dependent entirely upon length of service, *Hart* ... 66086

B

Baniyas and Vaisyas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

Bengal:

Charges, divisional, no material difference in work and responsibility of different, except in regard to area, *Gibson* 66232
Extra Deputy Conservators, promotion to, rule that charge of division must be held, enforcement unfair, *Gibson* 66243
Forest Department, organisation, *Gibson* ... 66217
Government, memorandum by ... p. 121-3
Provincial Service, complimented on good work several times, *Hannah* 66402 (see also subject headings.)

Bihar and Orissa:

Government, memorandum by ... p. 123-6

PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:

Amalgamation with Bengal would not be popular with service in Bihar, *Hannah* ... 66403
Rangers, half trained at Dehra Dun and half at Kusseong, *Monteath* 66366 (see also subject headings.)

Bombay:

Appointment to Inspector-General of Forests barred in fact, though not in theory, *Millet* 66534, 66579

Charges, major, number held by Provincial officers, *Sataravala* 66607

Chief Conservator, appointment recommended, *Millet* ... 66534, 66581, 66570

Extra Deputy Conservators, all five appointments filled at present time, *Sataravala* ... 66610

Former system of recruiting graduates to Forest Service, *Sataravala* 66609

Government, memorandum by ... p. 145-148

PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:

not Doing same work as Imperial Service, *Millet* 66557 (see also subject headings.)

Brahmans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

Buddhists, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

Burma:

Allowance, exclusion of Chief Conservator and Conservators from, serious grievance, *Cubitt* 66274

Charges, major and minor, distinct difference between, *Cubitt* 66296

CONDITIONS OF SERVICE:

Mortality figures, *Cubitt* 66273, 66297

Peculiar disadvantages, *Cubitt* 66273

Extra Assistant Conservators on probation, confirmation advocated, *Kavanagh* ... 66312, 66336

Government, memorandum by ... p. 134-7

Housing:

of Junior officers not in charge of divisions, more attention should be paid to, *Cubitt* 66279

Old system of assessing rent should be reverted to, *Cubitt* 66279

Rate of interest charged should be reduced, and accommodation brought up to Indian standard, *Cubitt* 66279

Leave, beginning and end should count from dates of departure from, and return to, Rangoon respectively, *Cubitt* 66275

PAY:

Increments, rules regulating accrual of, unsatisfactory, *Cubitt* 66274

Reorganisation, officers have not been given full benefit, *Kavanagh* 66312

PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:

Vacancies in cadre not yet filled, *Kavanagh* 66312

Wholly composed of Anglo-Indians, with exception of two or three Burmans, *Cubitt* 66301

Burma—continued.

RANGOON HOUSE ALLOWANCE:

Extension to bachelors advocated, *Cubitt* 66974
no Official reason given for denying, to Provincial officers, *Karanagh* ... 66324

Selection from all Indian communities advocated, *Coombs* 66122

School for training Rangers and Subordinates, *Cubitt* 66291

Training on first arrival in India, instructions a dead letter owing to hopeless inadequacy of staff, *Cubitt* 66272

(see also subject headings.)

C

Caccia, A. M., M.V.O., evidence of ... 66748-66795

Cadre:

Appointments held outside, Assam, pp. 126-7; Bengal, p. 122; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 123-4; Bombay, pp. 146-7; Burma, p. 135; Central Provinces and Berar, p. 149; Madras, p. 142; Punjab, p. 119.

Increase advocated, *Hart*, 66097; *Mercer*, 66146; Assam, pp. 126-7, *Perree*, 66414; Bengal, pp. 122-3, *Gibson*, 66210, 66224; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 123-5; Bombay, pp. 146-7; Burma, pp. 135-6, *Cubitt*, 66273; Central Provinces and Berar, p. 149; *Witt*, 66619, 66640, 66649; Madras, p. 142, *Lodge*, 66461, 66476-8, 66480, 66494, 66503; Punjab, p. 119, *McIntosh*, 66172; United Provinces, *Clutterbuck*, 66059.

Number of posts in each grade, and the provision for leave and training, *Hart*, 66086, 66093; Assam, pp. 126-7, *Perree*, 66414; Bengal, pp. 122-3; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 123-4, *Monteath*, 66346-7; Bombay, pp. 146-7; Burma, p. 135, *Cubitt*, 66281; Central Provinces and Berar, p. 149; Madras, pp. 141-4; United Provinces, *Clutterbuck*, 66063.

Cambridge, School of Forestry:

Buildings, equipment, etc., *Dawson* ... 66807, 66815

Date of foundation, *Dawson* 66933

DIPLOMA:

Course of study, etc., *Dawson* 66806, 66824, 66834, 66838, 66849-51, 66855
Syllabus same as other universities, *Caccia* 66777

Fees, *Dawson* 66953

INDIAN PROBATIONERS:

no Contribution received from State towards expenses, *Dawson* 66933

Number having received training at, and number at present, *Dawson* 66813, 66817, 66847

PRACTICAL TRAINING COURSE:

in England instituted, and relative value of German and English training, *Dawson* 66819-20, 66822, 66842-4, 66855-7

no Hard and fast rule as to period which must be spent at home and abroad, *Dawson* 66836

Proposed B.A. degree in forestry, *Dawson* 66826, 66837, 66854

Special provisions for Indian forestry, *Dawson* 66809, 66818, 66833, 66841

Staff, *Dawson* 66803, 66832, 66835

Statement showing age at which probationers for Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Science and the Diploma in Forestry 66821

TRAINING ON CONTINENT:

not Possible to make arrangements for control of students by English officer unless number large, *Dawson* 66823

Redistribution of time between Germany and England, *Dawson* 66836, 66839-40

Students put in charge of German forest officer, *Dawson* 66821

STUDENTS:

Increase in number anticipated, *Dawson* 66826

Number, *Dawson* 66816

Central Provinces and Berar, Administration, memorandum by pp. 148-150
(see also subject headings.)

Charges:

Administrative (see Administrative Posts).

Changes in category of minor and major not made arbitrarily, *Perree* 66429

DISTINCTION BETWEEN MAJOR AND MINOR:

Abolition advocated, *Coombs*, 66118, 66127; *Sen*, 66247; *Monteath*, 66356, 66362, 66369; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66447; *Sataravala*, 66591, 66597, 66612.

Difference of size only, *V. Alwar Chetty* ... 66519 should be Maintained p. 121

Divided into major and minor, *Hart* ... 66096

DIVISIONAL:

not Co-terminous with Public Works Department divisions, overlapping in certain cases, *Lodge* 66490

Duties and responsibilities of Provincial Forest officers same as those of officers of Imperial Service, *Sen* 66264, 66269

should be Held by Provincial officers ... 66118

Period which should elapse before officer should hold, *Hart*, 66086, 66118; *Gibson*, 66241; *Monteath*, 66365, 66367; *Hannah*, 66337; *Kanjilal*, 66438; *Witt*, 66641.

Placing of junior assistants or extra assistant Conservators in independent charge inadvisable, *Lodge* 66465

Promotion to, by efficiency, advocated ... p. 121

Provincial Service officer would labour under disadvantage in holding, where there was large European community, *Gibson* ... 66240

Same powers should be given to Provincial officers as to Imperial, *Hannah* 66383 by Seniority, advocated, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Sen*, 66247; *Hannah*, 66377; *Kanjilal*, 66438.

MAJOR:

Certain percentage set aside for best officers in Provincial Service, *Hart* 66087

Eighty per cent. held by Imperial officers, *Hart* 66086

Held at one time by Provincial and at another by Imperial officers, *Hannah*, 66399; *Lodge*, 66436; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66526, 66575.

should be Held by Imperial officers as a general rule, *Lodge* 66465

Provincial officer in charge never as efficiently equipped for duties as Imperial officers, *Lodge* 66500

Rangers should not be given, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66521

Rule that 20 per cent. should be held by Provincial officers, *Hannah* 66386

Service necessary prior to assuming control, question difficult, *Perree* 66420

Specially selected men trained at Dehra Dun capable of assuming control, *Perree* ... 66419

Suitable Indian recruits will be extremely difficult to find in future, *Lodge* 66487

Three principal criteria for distinguishing from minor, *Perree* 66431

MINOR:

Officers of Provincial Service have not been given opportunity of showing whether they could carry out work of important charge, *Coombs* 66134

Proportion held by Provincial Service, *Hart* 66086

Time elapsing before Imperial officer fit to hold, *Lodge* 66495

RANGES:

Period officers should be required to hold, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Hannah*, 66377, 66397-8; *Kanjilal*, 66438; p. 121.

Same powers should be given to Provincial officers as to Imperial, *Hannah* 66383

Senior officers should not be posted under juniors of either service, *Kanjilal* 66438

Special, *Hart* 66086

(see also under name of province.)

Chetty, Garu, M. R. Ry., Rao Bahadur, evidence of 66508-31

Chief Conservators:

Appointment to each province advocated, *Lodge* 66466
 Duties, *Hart* 66086
 Local Governments would welcome proposal that appointments of Secretaries should be held by, *Mercer* 66167
 Pay, scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047, 66070; *Hart*, 66074; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Mercer*, 66147; *Gibson*, 66211; *Monteath*, 66340; *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66620; p. 120, p. 135

Civil Appointments at Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, on 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Clutterbuck, P. H., evidence of ... 66044-66070

Conditions of Service, Imperial Forest Service:

Allotment of recruits to provinces, method, alteration desirable, and groups suggested, *Hart* 66073
 Arduous and unhealthy, and life solitary, *Clutterbuck*, 66047; *Hart*, 66073; *McIntosh*, 66172; *Gibson*, 66210, 66223, 66227; *Cubitt*, 66273; *Monteath*, 66339; *Lodge*, 66461; *Millett*, 66534; *Witt*, 66619.
 Arrangement by which certain provinces repeatedly attract men at top of list defective, and alternatives suggested, *Hart*, 66104; *Monteath*, 66349; *Perree*, 66408, 66422, 66429; *Lodge*, 66474.

Comparison with Public Works and Police Departments, *Lodge* 66461
 one Imperial list for whole country advocated, *Gibson*, 66210, 66230-1, 66233; *Monteath*, 66360.
 Interchange of officers between various provinces, difficulties in way, *Lodge* 66475

Specialisation, encouragement advocated, *Mercer*, 66146, 66160; *Gibson*, 66210.

Temporary removal of officers from unhealthy places to healthy stations should be permitted, *Millett* 66534, 66558
 Transfers of officers from province to province, more frequent, advocated, *Hart*, 66073; *Gibson*, 66210, 66220; *Cubitt*, 66288; *Monteath*, 66339.

Conditions of Service, Provincial Forest Service:

Arduous and unhealthy, *Coombs*, 66127; *Kavanagh*, 66306; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66511; *Sataravala*, 66591.

Confidential reports, injustice sometimes resultant, and officers should see copies, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Sen*, 66258, 66265; *Kavanagh*, 66312; *Hannah*, 66377, 66401; *Kanjilal*, 66438; p. 121.

very Different from those of European officer in Provincial Service, *Millett* 66543

Extremely good, *Witt* 66637

Marked distinctions from Imperial Service made, and should be removed, *Kavanagh*, 66306; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66511; *Sataravala*, 66591.

Prefix "Extra," abolition advocated, *Kavanagh*, 66327; *Perree*, 66412; *Hannah*, 66377; *Kanjilal*, 66438; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508; *Srinivasalu*, 66662; *Earle*, p. 134.

Confidential Reports (see under Conditions of Service).

Conservators:

Assistant (see that title).

Chief (see that title).

Deputy (see that title).

Duties, *Hart* 66086

Extra Deputy (see that title).

Two grades only suggested, and salaries advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047, 66058, 66070; *Hart*, 66074; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Mercer*, 66147; *Gibson*, 66211; *Monteath*, 66340; *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66620.

Local Governments would welcome proposal that appointments of Secretaries should be held by, *Mercer* 66167

Officer not promoted to, in ordinary course of events, except in province in which ordinarily serving, *Monteath* 66348

One post should be thrown open to Provincial Service, *Coombs* 66140

Conservators—continued.

Pay, scale advocated for three grades, *Millett* 66535; pp. 120, 122
 Personal assistants to, special allowance should be granted, *Cubitt* 66274

Post should be held by Imperial officer only, *Millett* 66583
 Controlling Staff, division into upper and lower should be abolished, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Gokul Das*, 66189; *Hannah*, 66377; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508.

Coombs, G. O., evidence of 66116-66143

Cubitt, G. E. S., evidence of 66271-66303

D

Dawson, William:

Evidence of 66806-66857
 Statistics furnished by pp. 150, 152

Dehra Dun Forest Research Institute and College: Affiliation to a university advocated, *Kanjilal*. 66437

Communities from which students drawn varied, *Mercer* 66154

Competitive examination before sending students to, would be an advantage, *Mercer* ... 66154

Compulsory practical training before admission advocated, *Sen* 66245, 66262

Cost of training, *Hannah* 66404
 Distinct courses for Rangers and Provincial

Service advocated, *Millett* 66567

Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians trained at, standard of work satisfactory, *Gibson* 66239A

Final examination, very few failures, but examination not at all difficult, *Mercer* 66154

Form of agreement to be executed by students already in service of, or in receipt of stipend from, Government previous to entry into

p. 131-3

Indian students, right class not yet tapped, *Mercer* 66154

Inferior training to that given in England, *Perree*, 66421; *Millett*, 66554, 66556, 66582; *Caccia*, 66775.

Inferior training to that obtainable in Europe, no grounds for statement, *Hannah* 66387-8

INSTRUCTORS:

Assistant, duties somewhat similar to Instructors in Imperial Service, *Mercer* 66169

Distinction between Provincial and Imperial officers unnecessary, *Hannah* 66377

Insuperable objection to training as compared with training on Continent of Europe, *Gibson* 66230

Modification of system to bring it in line with training received by men recruited in England advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty* ... 66510

very few Muhammadans, *Mercer* 66154

Particulars, *Mercer* 66152

no Probationary period spent in Forest before admission, *Kavanagh* 66320, 66329

Provincial Forest Service, new rule prescribing separate course, and improvement, *Hart*, 66110; *Hannah*, 66376.

Raising of standard course and extension of period from two to three years advocated, *Mercer*, 66154; *Kanjilal*, 66437, 66446, 66454, 66456.

Ranger class, experiment of placing Provincial officers in charge of, tried, but absolutely condemned, *Mercer* 66169

no Reason why training should not in future be as efficient as that provided by institutions in England and Scotland, *Stebbing* ... 66892

not Same facilities for instruction as at Oxford, *Hart* 66101, 66106

Students sent by Local Governments often unsuitable, *Mercer* 66154, 66164

Training equal to that on Continent, *Kavanagh* 66304, 66314-5, 66325, 66330, 66333

Training grounds, disability in that India has no forests which have been under systematic management for more than 25 years, *Mercer* 66153

Training of Imperial recruits at, not advocated, *Millett* 66585

Dehra Dun Forest Research Institute and College

continued.

Training satisfactory, *Hart*, 66091, 66110, 66111;
Coombs, 66126; *Mercer*, 66153; *Sen*, 66248;
Karanagh, 66305; *Hannah*, 66376; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66510; *Millett*, 66542; *Sataravala*, 66590; p. 135.

Deputy Conservators:

Classed as fitted to hold administrative rank, and of more than 18 years' standing, should continue to draw increments, *Clutterbuck*, 66047; *Millett*, 66335, 66560.

Duties, *Hart* 66096

Extra (see that title).

Division into Imperial and Provincial Branches:

Abolition advocated, and establishment of one superior service, *Coombs*, 66122, 66131, 66135, 66143; *Gokul Das*, 66193, 66206; *Karanagh*, 66310, 66326; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66442, 66445, 66458; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66505, 66515, 66518.

Abolition hardly possible at present stage, *Sataravala* 66595

Amalgamated list for whole of Imperial and Provincial Services advocated, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Gokul Das*, 60189, 66197; *Sen*, 66247, 66255; *Karanagh*, 66310; *Hannah*, 66377, 66385; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66445; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508, 66511; *Sataravala*, 66595, 66597, 66600; *Srinivasulu*, 66671-2; *Earle*, p. 134.

Maintenance advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66050, 66054, 66060; *Hart*, 66077, 66090, 66111; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Manteath*, 66343, 66350; *Perce*, 66412; *Millett*, 66533, 66553; *Witt*, 66623; p. 121.

Provincial Service shut in, and no openings for good and meritorious service, *Hannah* 66381

Retention necessary, but modified form advocated, *Srinivasulu* 66671-2

Divisions (see under Charges).

Drake, F. C., evidence of 66079-66719

E

Earle, Hon. Sir Archdale, note by ... p. 133-4

Edinburgh School of Forestry:

Debate in Forestry:

Applications received from Provincial Service, and considered important, *Stebbing* 66895-6
 Forestry Curriculum, *Stebbing* 66860, 66868, 66875-6

Graduates in, *Stebbing* 66861

Diploma course, syllabus same as other universities, *Caccia* 66777, 66787

Equipment and staff, *Stebbing* ... 66864, 66867

Fees, *Stebbing* 66874

Indian students from Native States, *Stebbing* 66863, 66877

Practical work partly in Scotland and partly on Continent, *Stebbing* 66970-1, 66973, 66878,

66882, 66884, 66889, 66890, 66890-2

Statement showing age at which probationers for Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Science and the Diploma in Forestry p. 152

Students, number, *Stebbing* ... 66862, 66867, 66894

Training of Indian Forest probationers, *Stebbing* 66865, 66869, 66885, 66887, 66893

Europeans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Extra Deputy Conservators:

Abolition of posts in Provincial Service and adding them to Imperial Service as posts to be filled by selected Provincial Service officers would be difficult, *Hart* ... 66103

Analogous to listed posts in Indian Civil Service, *Hart* 66103

Appointments: not all filled up, *Hart* 66086
 Number of, should be increased, *Sataravala* 66602

Number of posts dependent on number of major charges, *Hart* 66092

Vacancies will be filled as soon as suitable men can be found, *Hart* 66110

would have comparatively small chance of rising to administrative posts in Imperial Service if admitted to Imperial list, *Hart* ... 66114

Extra Deputy Conservators—continued.

PROMOTION TO:

Fitness should be based upon grounds other than fitness to hold charge of major division only, *Sataravala* 66597
 Requirement of certificate of fitness to hold major charge, *Hart* 66096
 Rules laid down, *Hart* 66112
 not doing same work nor undertaking same responsibilities as Deputies, *Clutterbuck* 66054

F

Family Pension Fund:

Institution advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66052, 66059; *Hart*, 66079, 66093; *Mercer*, 60181; *Gibson*, 66228; *Cubitt*, 66279; *Kavanagh*, 66324A; *Manteath*, 66345; *Lodge*, 66464, 66485, *Millett*, 66563; *Sataravala*, 66606; *Witt*, 66625, 66643, 66652; p. 120-1.

Voluntary provident fund should be established also, *McIntosh* 66181

Furlough (see under Leave).

G

General Provident Fund (see under Provident Fund).

Germany, forestry courses, *Caccia* ... 66788, 66793

Gibson, H. S., evidence of ... 66208-66244

Gokul Das, Pandit, evidence of ... 66187-66207

H

Hart, G. S., C.I.E., evidence of ... 66071-66115

Hannah, R. G. A., evidence of ... 66375-66405

Hindus, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Horses, cost of railing from one camp to another, should be paid by Government, *Lodge* ... 66462

House Accommodation:

HEADQUARTERS BUNGALOWS:

Half rent only should be paid when officer absent on privilege leave and during touring season, *Millett* 66534

Provision at Government expense of all essential articles of furniture advocated, *Cubitt* 66279

in Headquarters, special attention should be paid to, and, if necessary, a Government bungalow provided, *Witt* 66619

Rent free, advocated, *Perce* ... 66408, 66423

Rent out of all proportion to use made, and adequate accommodation should be provided at all headquarters stations, *Gibson* ... 66216

(see also under Burma, Madras.)

Imperial Forest Service:

List of appointments open to p. 158

Suggested placing of officers in direct charge of important works demanding technical knowledge 66118

Indian Christians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Indians:

Conditions of service do not appeal to, *Clutterbuck*, 66051; *Hart*, 66077, 66090, 66106, 66110; *Mercer*, 66154, 66168; *Gokul Das*, 66203; *Manteath*, 66364; *Lodge*, 66465, 66487, 66507; *Millett*, 66538.

Considerable number desirous of getting appointments as Rangers, *Mercer* 66154

English a foreign language to, but not as difficult for native to learn it as French or German, *Lodge* 66506

Forest Department popular with, *Coombes*, 66139; *Kanjilal*, 66451-2

LIMITATIONS IN EMPLOYMENT:

Change in existing regulations unnecessary, *Hart*, 66077; *Mercer*, 66151; *McIntosh*, 66177; *Gibson*, 66214; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Manteath*, 66343, 66356; *Lodge*, 66405; *Witt*, 66623; p. 121.

None theoretically to Imperial Service and none in practice to Provincial Service, *Hannah*, 66381; *Kanjilal*, 66442.

Indians—continued.

One case only known of where son had chosen same profession as father, *Hurt* ... 66114

RECRUITMENT TO IMPERIAL SERVICE:

If Admitted on same terms as English officers should get same pay, *Gokul Das* ... 66206
Advantage in sending statutory natives to England and making them undergo similar course to that taken by European candidates, *Monteath* ... 66357

Age limit 19-23 advocated, *Srinivasalu* ... 66656
Difference in conditions of entry from Europeans, *McIntosh* ... 66182, 66186

Diploma in forestry far more difficult to take than any other, and probably one reason for small numbers, *Schlitz* ... 66734

Direct appointment preferred to promotion from Provincial Service, *Miltett*, 66555; *Caccia*, 66785; *Earle*, p. 133.

Exclusion not advocated, but qualifications should be required, *Schlitz* ... 66733

Indian university degree should be recognised, *Srinivasalu* ... 66656, 66665

Limitations in employment:

Entry to Imperial Service open under exactly same conditions as Europeans except with regard to marriage, *Clutterbuck*, 66050; *Hart*, 66077; *McIntosh*, 66176; *Sen*, 66251; *Cubitt*, 66285-6; *Monteath*, 66343; *Perree*, 66412; *Lodge*, 66465, 66503; *Miltett*, 66538; *Witt*, 66633.

Practically excluded, although not debarred by rules, *Coombs*, 66131; *Gokul Das*, 66193; *Hannah*, 66375; *Srinivasalu*, 66656, 66662.

by Nomination and competition advocated, *Hart*, 66090; *Srinivasalu*, 66656.

Number having taken advantage of opening, *V. Alvar Chetty*, 66530; *Sataravala*, 66615; *Drake*, 66708; *Schlitz*, 66730, 66733; *La Touche*, 66903.

Physical test advocated, *Srinivasalu* ... 66665
Practical difficulties in way of entering, *Gokul Das* ... 66193

Reservation of posts in India:

Advocated, selected candidates to be sent to Europe for training, *Coombs*, 66122, 66131; *McIntosh*, 66179; *Cubitt*, 66293-4, *Lodge*, 66487; *Srinivasalu*, 66666.

not Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66066; *Mercer*, 66156; *Gokul Das*, 66197; *Monteath*, 66361; *Perree*, 66430.

Simultaneous examination in England and India:

Advocated, *Srinivasalu* ... 66656
not Advocated, *Perree* ... 66406

no Special steps taken to secure, but always considered with other candidates, *Drake* 66707

Undesirable to send officer to province other than that in which recruited, *Earle* ... p. 133 (see also Promotion from Provincial Service under Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service.)

Relations with Europeans of same rank and standing should be improved, *Kanjilal* 66438

Inspector-General of Forests:

Pay, scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047; *Hart*, 66074; *Mercer*, 66147; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Gibson*, 66211; *Cubitt*, 66274; *Monteath*, 66340; *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66620; pp. 120, 135.

Selection confined to officers with experience of Burma, *Lodge* ... 66473, 66497

K

Kalyasthas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

Kanjilal, Rai Bahadur Upendra Nath, evidence of 66436-66458

Kavanagh, R. M., evidence of ... 66304-66336

Kshatriyas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

L

La Touche, Sir J. D., evidence of ... 66796-66805

Leave, Imperial Forest Service:

Allowances, scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66048; *Hart*, 66075; *Mercer*, 66148; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Gibson*, 66212; *Cubitt*, 66275; *Monteath*, 66341; 66355A; *Perree*, 66410, 66427; *Lodge*, 66463; *Miltett*, 66536; *Witt*, 66621.

Commutation of long leave on half pay to shorter period on full pay advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66048; *Mercer*, 66148; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Cubitt*, 66275; *Monteath*, 66341; *Perree*, 66410; *Lodge*, 66463; *Witt*, 66621.

Conditions p. 140

Concession in cost of steamship fares advocated, *Mercer*, 66151; *Gibson*, 66212; *Monteath*, 66345; *Perree*, 66408; *Witt*, 66625.

Credit of six months' furlough on arrival in India should be given, *Lodge* ... 66463

FURLough:

after Four years' service advocated, *Cubitt*, 66275; *Perree*, 66410, 66427; *Witt*, 66621.

Grant whenever officer can be spared advocated, *Mercer* ... 66148

PRIVILEGE:

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Hart*, 66075; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Gibson*, 66212; *Cubitt*, 66275; *Perree*, 66410; *Lodge*, 66463; *Witt*, 66621, 66651.

Rule re not allowing taking of furlough within interval of 18 months after return to duty should be relaxed, *Witt* ... 66621

Time taken by officer to reach Bombay or Karachi should be added to period, *McIntosh* 66174

Proposed new rules satisfactory, *Clutterbuck*, 66048; *Hart*, 66075; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Gibson*, 66212; *Cubitt*, 66275; *Monteath*, 66341; *Miltett*, 66536.

Reserve should be greater than in other services and should allow of one-fourth of officers being absent at a time, *Lodge* ... 66463

Study, rules considered satisfactory, but not much use made of, *Hart*, 66093; *Mercer*, 66158.

Leave, Provincial Forest Service:

Allowances, scale advocated, *Hart*, 66083; *Gokul Das*, 66191; *Sen*, 66249; *Hannah*, 66379; *Kanjilal*, 66440; *V. Alvar Chetty*, 66573.

Changes suggested satisfactory, 66120; *Gokul Das*, 66191.

Commutation of long leave on half pay to short period on full pay advocated, *Gokul Das*, 66207; *Kavanagh*, 66308.

Conditions p. 141

Conditions in general sense sufficient, *Miltett* 66545

Concession in cost of steamship fares advocated, *Kavanagh* ... 66312

Date of departure and arrival of officers serving in the hills should be considered when starting from or arriving at nearest railway station, *Gokul Das* ... 66191

FURLough:

Four years, should qualify as service for pension, *Sataravala* ... 66593

One year at end of eight years' service advocated, *Hart*, 66083; *V. Alvar Chetty*, 66513.

at Shorter intervals advocated, *Gokul Das* 66191

Officers do not take amount to which entitled owing to inadequacy of allowances, *Coombs*, 66137; *Gokul Das*, 66200; *Kanjilal*, 66449.

Officers do not receive amount to which entitled owing to scarcity of officers, *V. Alvar Chetty* 66521

One-sixth of active service at any time advocated, *Srinivasalu* ... 66660

PRIVILEGE:

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Hart*, 66083; *Gokul Das*, 66191, 66207; *Sen*, 66249; *Kavanagh*, 66308; *Hannah*, 66379; *Kanjilal*, 66440; *Sataravala*, 66593.

Rule not allowing taking of, within six months after return to duty from, should be relaxed, 66120; *Coombs*, 66129; *Sen*, 66249; *Hannah*, 66379; *Kanjilal*, 66440.

for Study leave, advocated, *Sataravala* 66593, 66604

Leave, Provincial Forest Service—continued.

Same as Imperial Service advocated, *Karanagh* 66308
Same rules for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* 66597

STORY:
Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66066; *Hart*, 66109;
Screer, 66163; *Srinivasulu*, 66677.
no Opportunity at present, *Gokul Das* ... 66199
Three years in 25 years' service, provided whole counts towards pension, preferred to five years' furlough, *Gokul Das* ... 66191
Three years should count as service, *Hart*, 66083;
Sen, 66219; *Kanjilal*, 66440.

Lodge, F. A., C.I.E., evidence of ... 66459-66507

M

McIntosh, R., evidence of 66170-66186

Madras:

Civil appointments at Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on 1st April, 1913 p. 153

FOREST DEPARTMENT:

Administration p. 137
Organisation, *Lodge*, 66469; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508.

Government, memorandum by ... pp. 137-144
Hill stations, Imperial and Provincial officers should be permitted to spend period of six weeks at, on duty annually, at own expense, *Lodge* 66467, 66468

Promotion, slowness, compared with other parts of India, *Lodge* 66479

Rest houses, decision of Government that Forest officers no longer have prior claim to, and that rent must be paid, *Lodge* 66467
(see also subject headings.)

Madras Forest College Research Institute, establishment advocated, *Lodge* 66467

Medical Attendance, free, for wives and children advocated, *Coombs*, 66132; *Alcerer*, 66151; *Gibson*, 66216; *Sen*, 66253; *Cubitt*, 66279; *Karanagh*, 66312; *Hannah*, 66383; *Perree*, 66408; *Witt*, 66625.

Mercer, L., evidence of 66144-66169

Millett, G. P., evidence of 66532-66588

Monteath, T. H., evidence of 66337-66374

Muhammadans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

O

Organisation:

Constitution of department, *Hart* 66077
Constitution and organisation, history p. 137-8
Technical head, working directly under and in touch with Government much needed, *Lodge* 66466

Oxford, School of Forestry:

DIPLOMA:
Course, and every opportunity given for practical work, *Schlich* 66739-41
Syllabus same as other universities, *Caccia* 66777

Statement showing age at which probationers for Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Science and the Diploma in Forestry p. 151-2

Transfer from Coopers Hill, arrangements made, *Schlich* 66742

P

Parsis, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Pay, Imperial Forest Service:

should Commence from date of arrival in India, *Perree* 66407

Comparison of rates in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1913 pp. 118, 122, 123, 126, 135, 136-7, 142, 143-4, 145-6, 146-7, 148-9

Pay, Imperial Forest Service—continued.

Conditions p. 139-40
Higher than officer recruited in India, *Sataravala* 66600

Increments, cessation at Rs. 1,250 and Rs. 1,400 to officers not definitely declared suitable for promotion to administrative rank advocated, *Hart* 66074, 66099

Local allowances for service in Presidency town, grant advocated, *Lodge* 66462

Leave allowances (see under Leave).

Satisfactory p. 146

Scale inadequate, and increase advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047, 66058, 66070; *Hart*, 66074, 66092, 66105, 66113; *Mercer*, 66147; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Gokul Das*, 66190; *Gibson*, 66311, 66225-6; *Cubitt*, 66274; *Monteath*, 66340, 66354; *Perree*, 66409, 66425; *Lodge*, 66462, 66481-2; *Millett*, 66535, 66560, 66581; *Witt*, 66620, 66628, 66639, 66653; pp. 118, 120, 122, 135.

SPECIAL ALLOWANCES:

for Special unhealthiness, cost of living, etc., advocated, *Lodge*, 66462, 66496; *Witt*, 66625.

Special work, grant advocated, *Lodge* 66462, 66483

TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:

Distinction between Assistant and Deputy Conservators should be abolished, *Lodge* 66462

Revision of rates advocated, *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66625, 66631, 66644.

on Transfer:

Inadequate, and actual cost should be covered, *Hart*, 66079; *McIntosh*, 66178; *Mercer*, 66151; *Gibson*, 66216; *Monteath*, 66345; *Perree*, 66408; *Lodge*, 66462; *Millett*, 66534; *Witt*, 66625.

Service no worse off than other services, *Millett* 66559

Pay, Provincial Forest Service:

Allowances, same as Imperial Service advocated, *Karanagh* 66307

on same Basis as Public Works Department, advocated p. 124

Comparison of rates in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1913 pp. 118, 123, 127, 135, 136-7, 142, 143-4, 145-6, 146-7, 149

Comparison with Imperial rates, and with Imperial and Provincial rates in Engineers and Telegraphs, *Karanagh* p. 43

Comparison with three sister Provincial Services, *Karanagh* p. 44

Conditions, *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508; *Millett*, 66544; p. 141.

Increments, low rate, and slow rate of promotion as compared with Imperial Service, and promotion asked for, *Coombs* ... 66128, 66135

Local Allowances, should be regulated in accordance with rates of pay drawn p. 135

Provision should be made to give old members of service benefit of any increased rate, *Coombs* 66128

REORGANISATION SCHEME:

Increments stopped by, *Coombs* 66127

Little satisfaction given, as interests of existing members not safeguarded, *Coombs* 66128

Revision not needed p. 121

Rules and practices should be same for both services, 66119; *Coombs*, 66128; *Kanjilal*, 66439.

SAME AS OFFICERS RECRUITED IN ENGLAND:

Advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66512
not Advocated, *Millett* 66543

Same for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* 66597

Scale inadequate to, *Clutterbuck*, 66065; *Hart*, 66092; *Millett*, 66544; pp. 127, 134, 135, 146.

Scale advocated, *Coombs*, 66119, 66128, 66135-6; *Gokul Das*, 66190, 66204, 66205; *Sen*, 66248, 66250, 66265; *Karanagh*, 66307, 66322-3, 66328; *Hannah*, 66378, p. 51, 66391-2, 66400; *Kanjilal*, 66439; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66512, 66528; *Sataravala*, 66592, 66603; *Srinivasulu*, 66659, p. 91.

Specific disadvantages, and removal advocated, *Gokul Das* 66190

TIME-SCALE:

Continuous, advocated, *Hart*, 66082, 66092, 66107, 66115; *Coombs*, 66128, 66136.

Officers fit for promotion to major charges should be put on, *Earle* p. 134

Pay, Provincial Forest Service—continued.**TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:**

Officers classed as second class, those drawing above Rs. 500 should get first class, *Coombs*, 66124; *Gokul Das*, 66195; *Gibson*, 66244; *Sen*, 66253; *Kavanagh*, 66307; *Kanjilal*, 66439; *Sataravala*, 66397, 66618; *Srinivasulu*, 66659.

Same for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* ... 66597

Sufficient, *Millett* 66574 on Transfer, cost should be covered, *Gokul Das*, 66195, 66202; *Kavanagh*, 66312; *Hannah*, 66378; *Kanjilal*, 66439.

Pensions, Imperial Forest Service:

Conditions ... p. 140 should be Fixed in sterling, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Hart*, 66076; *Mercer*, 66149; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Gibson*, 66213; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Perree*, 66411; *Witt*, 66622.

Inadequate, and scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Hart*, 66076, 66094; *Mercer*, 66149, 66161, 66166; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Gibson*, 66213, 66227, 66234; *Cubitt*, 66276, 66290; *Monteath*, 66342, 66353, 66368; *Perree*, 66411; *Lodge*, 66464; *Millett*, 66537, 66540, 66564; *Witt*, 66622, 66629, 66642.

Increase not advocated p. 120

Invalid, inadequate, and scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Hart*, 66076; *Mercer*, 66149, 66161, 66166; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Gibson*, 66213; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Monteath*, 66342; *Perree*, 66411; *Lodge*, 66464; *Millett*, 66537, 66540, 66569; *Witt*, 66622, 66629, 66642.

Option of commuting advocated, *Perree* ... 66411

Pensions, Provincial Forest Service:

Conditions ... p. 141 Invalid, scale advocated, *Hart*, 66084; 66121; *Coomb*, 66130; *Gokul Das*, 66192, 66201, 66204; *Sen*, 66250, 66260; *Kavanagh*, 66309; *Hannah*, 66380; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66514; *Sataravala*, 66594.

Retrospective effect should be given to any improvements which may be sanctioned, *Mercer*, 66149; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Lodge*, 66464; *Witt*, 66622.

Rules sufficiently liberal, *Millett* 66547; p. 121 Same rules for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* ... 66597

Scale advocated, *Hart*, 66084; 66121; *Coomb*, 66130, 66138; *Gokul Das*, 66192, 66201, 66204; *Sen*, 66250, 66260, 66270; *Kavanagh*, 66309, 66334-5; *Hannah*, 66380; *Kanjilal*, 66441; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66514; *Sataravala*, 66594; *Srinivasulu*, 66661.

after 20 and 25 years advocated, *Lodge*, 66468; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66514, 66523; *Sataravala*, 66594, 66605; *Srinivasulu*, 66661, 66673.

Perree, W. F., evidence of 66406-66435

Probation and Training, Imperial Forest Service:

Allocation of time to practical and theoretical work, *Schllich* 66726

Candidates selected and trained in India, deputation to an English university on a year's probation advocated, *Kavanagh* ... 66305

Comparison with German training, *Dawson* 66622, 66831

ON CONTINENT:

Care should be taken that students acquire thorough working knowledge of few systems of management considered most valuable for India, *Mercer* 66145 given by Director of Forest Studies, and same for probationers coming from all universities, *Dawson* ... 66831

Extension of period advocated, *McIntosh*, 66180; *Gibson*, 66209.

Giving up, would be bad thing, as ideal conditions of forestry can be studied, *Clutterbuck* 666471

in France, one year advocated, *Lodge* ... 66471 Importance of, *Hart*, 66089; *Lodge*, 66460; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66531; *Millett*, 66533; *Schllich*, 66735; *Earle*, p. 133.

One year adequate, *La Touche* ... 66797 after Period of service in India advocated p. 135

Probation and Training, Imperial Forest Service**—continued.****ON CONTINENT—continued.**

Satisfactory, *McIntosh* 66171 Supervision necessary, *Cubitt*, 66272, 66284; *Caccia*, 66777; *Dawson*, 66823, 66831; *Stibbing*, 66871; p. 135.

Supplementing by some special training in India necessary, *Lodge* 66488 not more than Three months should be spent in first place visited in Germany, and more time spent in French forests, *Clutterbuck* 66045

Departmental test, open to men to pass as soon as they can, and considered sufficient, *Clutterbuck*, 66057; *McIntosh*, 66180, 66182.

Diploma course, Indian subjects not included, but optional, *Caccia* 66777 Director of Indian Forest Studies should be made responsible for, and should be made professor of university, *Caccia*

66757, 66771, 66795 in Engineering, would probably turn out indifferent Forest officer, *Schllich* 66738

in England, schools handicapped by absence of forests, and, with exception of Oxford, not sufficiently advanced, *Mercer* 66198

no thoroughly Equipped School of Forestry existent at present moment, *Caccia* 66776

in Europe, stipend advocated, *Perree* 66407 Extra instruction to selected men advocated, *Schllich* 66741

Final examination, regulations p. 157 Final position of probationers not entirely governed by marks, *Caccia* 66794

ON FIRST ARRIVAL IN INDIA:

Concentration on language and local conditions advocated, *Hart* 66089 General instructions recently issued by Government of India meet case, *Cubitt* 66272

Method, *Monteath* 66365 Recruits in India should be posted to divisions considered to be most advanced and allowance given to Divisional Officer, *Mercer*

66145, 66157 Tour in different provinces, advantage of, *Witt* 66635, 66654

IN INDIA:

Advocated, *Perree*, 66407, 66426; *Earle*, p. 133. not Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66057, 66068; *Hart*, 66072, 66089, 66101; *Lodge*, 66480.

not Considered possible to turn out as capable officers as present system, *Drake* ... 66718 no Facilities for teaching higher branches of forestry, although technical scientific knowledge could be as well acquired as in England, *Drake*, 66718; *Caccia*, 66789.

Forests not suitable, and would not be for fifty years, *Stibbing* ... 66872, 66879-81, 66883

AT ONE RESIDENTIAL INSTITUTION:

Advocated, preferably Oxford University, *Clutterbuck*, 66045, 66057, 66062; *Hart*, 66072, 66089, 66102; *Mercer*, 66145; *McIntosh*, 66171; *Gibson*, 66209, 66237-9; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66284; *Monteath*, 66338, 66351; *Perree*, 66407; *Lodge*, 66460, 66471, 66492; *Millett*, 66538, 66552; *Witt*, 66618, 66634; *Schllich*, 66723; p. 120; *Earle*, pp. 133, 134-5, 148.

Definitely controlled and subsidised by India Office advocated, *Caccia* 66767, 66769-70, 66781 Government contributions would naturally be expected, *Schllich* 66729

not Important, provided school at which training is given is efficient. *Dawson* 66812-3, 66846

Professors with Indian experience necessary, *Schllich* 66743-4, 66772

Period p. 141 Policy of allowing selected students to remain in Europe for additional year's training has already proved of value, but care should be taken in selection of subjects, *Cubitt* ... 66272

PRACTICAL: should in no Case be less than six months, *Schllich* 66726

on Continent, course, *Drake*, 66712; *Schllich*, 66726; *Caccia*, 66765-6.

PROBATIONARY PERIOD: Allowances adequate, *Schllich*, 66728; *Caccia*, 66768.

should be Allowed to count as service, *Witt* 66618, 66636

Probation and Training, Imperial Forest Service*—continued.***PROBATIONARY PERIOD—continued.**

in India unnecessary, *Hart*, 66072; *McIntosh*, 66180; *Gibson*, 66208; *Schlitz*, 66745.
Period advocated, *Witt*, 66646; *Drake*, 66687, 66685, 66713; *Caccia*, 66780; *La Touche*, 66797; p. 122.

PROBATIONERS:

Age limits p. 139
First appointment p. 139

Grant of allowances, *Gibson*, 66220; p. 139.
Period of training of p. 139

of Recruits at university or school-leaving age, methods advocated, *Caccia* ... 66756-60

Sound scientific training at universities advocated, *Caccia* 66775

System, *Clutterbuck*, 66057; *Hart*, 66072; *Caccia*, 66762; *Drake*, 66690-2; p. 139.

System satisfactory pp. 142, 145

System unsatisfactory, *Perree* 66407

Two years at Residential Institution, followed by period on Continent, advocated, *Perree*, 66407; *Millett*, 66533.

University, supplementary, special theoretical and practical instruction for which India Office must make itself responsible advocated, *Caccia* 66754-5
(*see also* Cambridge, Edinburgh, and Oxford Universities.)

Probation and Training, Provincial Forest Service: on Continent of Europe, sufficiently good Indian material not forthcoming, *Mercer* 66168

Departmental examination, two years should be allowed for passing, failing which, increments should be stopped until qualified, *Coombs* 66126

no Handicap from want of European training, *Kanjilal* 66450

Method and rules pp. 140-1

Period embracing preliminary test and two years spent at college should be regarded as probationary, *Hannah* 66376

PRELIMINARY COURSE BEFORE ADMISSION TO DELHA DUN:

Extension to twelve months advocated, *Hannah*, 66376, 66390, 66396; *Srinivasal*, 66658, 66669.

Limited to six months advocated, *Kanjilal*, 66437, 66455; p. 121.

Reduction to three months:

Advocated, 66117; *Gokul Das*, 66188, 66204 not Advocated, *Clutterbuck* 66064

Suitable, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Hart*, 66091.

PROBATIONARY PERIOD:

Reduction to one year advocated, *Hart*, 66081; *Coombs*, 66126; *Sen*, 66246, 66265, 66266;

Karanagh, 66305, 66321; *Hannah*, 66377; *Kanjilal*, 66437, 66455; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66510; *Sataravalai*, 66590, 66600.

Three years advocated p. 121

Unnecessary, and abolition advocated, *Srinivasal*, 66658, 66669

Useful, *Millett* 66542, 66583

Probationers, grant of allowances p. 141

Satisfactory p. 148

Study leave (*see under* Leave).

Two years at Delha Dun at Government expense, followed by one year in charge of range and one year on special works advocated, *Gokul Das* 66188, 66199

(*see also* Delha Dun.)

Provident Fund:

Conditions p. 142

Considerable number of officers contribute more than compulsory 6*l* per cent., *Clutterbuck* 66059

Interest, higher rate advocated, *Perree*, 66414; *Kanjilal*, 66441, 66445.

Provincial Forest Service:

Cadre adequate, but many vacancies not filled up, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66522

Considered inferior to Imperial Service as at present understood, *Gokul Das* ... 66193

Constitution, *Hart* 66088; p. 140

Difficult to judge what value would be in future recruited as at present, *Hart* 66036

Equality of treatment with Imperial officers, sufficient progress not made to justify, *Lodge* 66505

Provincial Forest Service—continued.

Excellent work done under direct supervision, but for independent charges found very wanting, *Clutterbuck* 66054

great Extension advocated, *Schlitz* 66724

Extremely good work done by, *Monteath* ... 66374

Increase in number as compared with Imperial officers would mean loss of efficiency in Service, *Witt* 66636

Precedence given to most junior Imperial officers whose duties and responsibilities alone should entitle them to proper respect, *Karanagh* 66311

Promotion to Imperial Service (*see under* Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service).

Recruited for entirely different class of work from that discharged by Imperial officers, *Hart* 66086, 66100, 66111

Same initiative and organising powers shown as Imperial officer, *V. Alwar Chetty* ... 66527
(*see also* Conditions of Service, Leave, Pay, etc.)

Punjab:

Government, memorandum by ... pp. 118-120

Probationers, number greatly in excess of requirements, *Gokul Das* 66188

PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:

Method of recruitment, *McIntosh* ... 66184 more Popular than in some other provinces, but candidates have not yet come forward possessed of both physical and educational qualifications, *McIntosh* 66184

(*see also* subject headings.)

R**Rangers:**

Classes, employment of Imperial officers as Instructors unnecessary, Provincial officers quite competent to carry out work, *Hannah* 66383

Creation of a few grades for, carrying higher pay, advocated, *Sen* 66245

Promotions to Provincial Service (*see under* Recruitment, Provincial Service).

Reorganisation of service advocated, *Lodge* 66168

Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service:**AGE LIMIT:**

18-20 advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66044, 66055; *Hart*, 66071, 66088, 66102; *Mercer*, 66144; *Gibson*, 66208; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66282; *Monteath*, 66337, 66350, 66352, 66358, 66367, 66373; *Perree*, 66406, 66428; *Lodge*, 66459; *Millett*, 66532, 66550, 66576; *Witt*, 66617, 66633; *Earle*, pp. 133, 148. Recruits reach India at too advanced age under present system, and reduction advocated, *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *La Touche*, 66797; pp. 121-2, 134, 148.

School-leaving a. university-leaving age, *Drake*, 66087-9, 66701, 66704, 66711, 66714; *Schlitz*, 66721-3, 66727, 66737; *Caccia*, 66748-60, 66763, 66767, 66773-4, 66753-4; *La Touche*, 66707; *Darson*, 66810-11, 66828-30, 66845; *Stibbing*, 66838.

Candidates, qualifications requisite, *Drake*, 66679, 66700, 66702, 66703, 66704, 66705; *Schlitz*, 66725, 66736.

COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION:

Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66014, 66054, 66055, 66058, 66062; *Hart*, 66071, 66088, 66102; *Mercer*, 66144; *Gibson*, 66208; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66282, 66283; *Monteath*, 66337, 66350; *Perree*, 66406, 66434; *Lodge*, 66459, 66470; *Millett*, 66532; *Witt*, 66617, 66627, 66633; *Schlitz*, 66724, 66747; *Earle*, pp. 133, 148.

Provision for but none yet held, *Drake*, 66679, 66686; *La Touche*, 66799.

Conditions specially influencing decisions of candidates, *Caccia* 66782

DIPLOMA IN FORESTRY AS SUFFICIENT QUALIFICATION:

Dependent upon preliminary qualifications demanded, *Dawson* 66825

not Practicable, *Caccia* 66779

Linguistic test in England not advocated, *Cubitt* 66299

Method, *Clutterbuck*, 66054, 66062; *Hart*, 66071; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508; *Millett*, 66532; *Drake*, 66650-6, 66717; pp. 118, 121, 134, 138.

Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service—continued.
PHYSICAL TEST:

Importance of, and revival of test advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66044, 66056; *Hart*, 66071, 66058; *Mercer*, 66144, 66155; *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *Gibson*, 66208, 66218; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66299-300; *Perree*, 66406; *Lodge*, 66459, 66471; *Millett*, 66551; *Witt*, 66617, 66633; pp. 122, 134, 148.

Valueless, *Drake* 66710

PROMOTION FROM PROVINCIAL SERVICE:

Advocated, *Gibson*, 66220, 66231, 66235; *Sen*, 66247, 66256; *Cubitt*, 66287, 66292, 66295, 66302-3; *Hannah*, 66377, 66385; *Srinivasalu*, 66667.

not Advocated, except in cases of exceptional merit, *Perree*, 66406, 66412, 66419, 66432-3, 66432; *Millett*, 66571-2, 66584, 66587; *Earle*, p. 134.

Course of training in England advocated, *Sen*, 66257.

after Five or eight years' service advocated, *Kavanagh*, 66331-2; *Monteath*, 66372.

Improvement of course at Dehra Dun advocated, *Schlisch* 66732

Proportion advocated, *Kavanagh*, 66304, 66316-7

Only one officer at present fit for, *Witt*, 66650

Schemes premature, *Mercer* 66159

Proportion advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66050, 66069; *Hart*, 66110; *McIntosh*, 66176; *Sen*, 66251; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Monteath*, 66343, 66356; *Lodge*, 66465; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66518.

Rate of, *Hart* 66072, 66089

Recently joined recruits having entered service later in life than predecessors should receive special consideration, *Gibson* 66216

Regulations as to appointment of probationers to Indian Forest Service, 1914 ... p. 156-7

Science degree, stipulation should be removed, *Clutterbuck*, 66044; *Hart*, 66088; *Mercer*, 66144; *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *Gibson*, 66208, 66236; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66282, 66283; *Monteath*, 66337, 66352; 66359; *Lodge*, 66459; *Millett*, 66532, 66550; *Witt*, 66617; *Dawson*, 66927; p. 134.

SELECTION:

Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66044; *Hart*, 66071; *Mercer*, 66144; *McIntosh*, 66170; *Gibson*, 66208, 66218; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66282, 66283; *Monteath*, 66337, 66350; *Perree*, 66406; *Lodge*, 66459, 66470; *Millett*, 66532; *Witt*, 66617, 66633; *Schlisch*, 66724, 66747; *Earle*, pp. 133, 148.

Candidates:

Classified in three grades, and no difficulty in discovering best men, *La Touche* 66798

Degree, requisite qualification, *La Touche* 66799

Committee:

Appointed annually, and not a standing committee, *La Touche* 66804

Constitution, 1911, 1912, and 1913, *Hart*, 66071; *Drake*, 66679.

Constitution advocated, *Mercer*, 66155; *Cubitt*, 66271; *Lodge*, 66501.

not Function to keep in personal touch with Appointments Boards of the universities, *La Touche* 66799

no Indian yet appointed, *La Touche* ... 66801

Recommendations made to Secretary of State which he could accept or not as he chose, *La Touche* ... 66804, 66805

Representation of universities on, would probably be difficult, *La Touche* ... 66804

Retired Forest officer always included, *La Touche* 66798, 66802

Importance of sending out men of certain class, *Schlisch* 66724

Intellectual qualities of men not part of, *La Touche* 66798

Medical test not within province of, *La Touche* 66798

Men suited by physique and character, aimed at, *La Touche* 66798, 66800

Men with obvious disqualifications would not be selected, *Clutterbuck* 66054

System as perfect as can be devised at present, *Drake* 66719

System satisfactory, *Hart*, 66071; *Dawson*, 66812-4; pp. 123, 142, 145.

System unsatisfactory, *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *Perree*, 66407; *Millett*, 66532; *La Touche*, 66797.

Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service—continued.

Uniformity in training and in rate of recruitment not attained, *Mercer* 66144

Vacancies advertised, *Drake* 66719

Recruitment, Provincial Forest Service:

AGE LIMIT:

22 advocated, *Kanjilal* 66436, 66454

23 advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66509

Competitive examination advocated, *Coombs*, 66125; *Gokul Das*, 66187, 66196; *Kavanagh*, 66304, 66319; *Lodge*, 66499; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66520.

Direct nomination of selected candidates for special training at Dehra Dun should, in course of time, be only source, *Sataravala* 66589, 66599

Direct appointments advocated, *Caccia* ... 66792

Europeans, good class not attracted, *Millett* 66573

Frequent changes in method to detriment of well-being of service, *Sataravala* ... 66589

Method and rules, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Sen*, 66245; *Millett*, 66541; pp. 118, 123, 127, 135, 140.

Method suitable for some time to come, *Srinivasalu* 66657

NOMINATION:

Advocated, *Srinivasalu*, 66878; p. 121.

not Advocated, 66116; *Kavanagh*, 66304, 66319.

OPEN COMPETITION:

Advocated, 66116; *Sen*, 66245, 66261; *Kanjilal*, 66436,

not Advocated, *Clutterbuck* 66064

Qualifications advocated, *Sen* 66245

Physical test and medical examination advocated, *Sen*, 66245, 66261; *Kavanagh*, 66319; *Kanjilal*, 66436; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509; *Sataravala*, 66589.

PROMOTION OF RANGERS:

Advocated, *Lodge*, 66499; *Srinivasalu*, 66657.

not Advocated, *Clutterbuck* ... 66064; 66116;

Coombs, 66134, 66142; *Caccia*, 66792.

has not Ceased since division of service into Imperial and Provincial, *Clutterbuck* ... 66067

of Great importance, *Hart* 66091, 66108

Limitation to exceptional merit advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Gokul Das*, 66187; *Monteath*, 66318; *Kanjilal*, 66457; *Millett*, 66541, 66566; *Sataravala*, 66559, 66589; *Srinivasalu*, 66657.

Present rules should continue in force, *Hannah* 66389

Proportion advocated, *Sen*, 66245, 66258, 66267, 66318; *Kanjilal*, 66436; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66520; *Sataravala*, 66589; *Srinivasalu*, 66657, 66668; p. 121.

Rules, *Coombs* 66141

Proportion advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66518, 66521; *Sataravala*, 66589.

Regulations, Assam, pp. 127-9; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 125-6; Bombay, pp. 147-8; Central Provinces and Berar, pp. 149-50; Punjab, pp. 119-20.

Regulations satisfactory, but educational qualifications of candidates should be gradually raised p. 123

SELECTION:

Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Coombs*, 66125;

66134; *Gokul Das*, 66187, 66196; *Kanjilal*, 66436;

Lodge, 66499; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509; p. 121.

Board, reorganised, in each province, desirable, *Mercer* 66162

Class of candidates, *Millett* 66580

Field, question as to extent, *Mercer* ... 66154

Indian University Degree:

should be Required, *Gokul Das* 66187, 66196

Requirement not always necessary, *Hart* 66106

Method dependent on various Local Governments, *Mercer* 66162, 66164

Reason for power being vested in Local Governments, *Mercer* 66168

Standard of educational qualification left in hands of Local Governments, and satisfactory, *Hannah* 66375

from University men advocated, *Kanjilal*, 66436, 66453; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66520; *Sataravala*, 66611; *Srinivasalu*, 66657, 66674-5.

System satisfactory, *Hart*, 66091; *Hannah*, 66393-4; pp. 127, 135, 143.

Relations with other Services:

Dependence of department on executive head approved, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66525

Relations with other Services—*continued*.
 Ill-effects of rigidity of division into Imperial and Provincial, naturally accentuated in treatment received from services outside Forest Department, *Srinivasalu* ... 66663
 Mistake in calling District Forest Officer Assistant to the Deputy Commissioner, *Witt* 66624

Position of District Forest Officer and Collector, particulars, *Lodge* ... 66466
 Putting Provincial Services of all departments on equal footing would benefit, *Sataravala* 66596

Satisfactory, *Clutterbuck*, 66051; *Hart*, 66078; *Coombs*, 66123; *Mercer*, 66150; *McIntosh*, 66177; *Gokul Das*, 66194; *Gibson*, 66215; *Sen*, 66251; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Monteath*, 66343; *Hannah*, 66392; *Perree*, 66413; *Kanjilal*, 66443; *V. Alcar Chetty*, 66516; *Millett*, 66539; *Witt*, 66630.

Retirement, Compulsory for Inefficiency:
 Advocated, *McIntosh*, 66175; *Lodge*, 66464.
 Unrestricted powers should not be given, *Mercer* ... 66161

S

Sataravala, N. D., evidence of ... 66589-66615
Sen, Lalit Mohan, evidence of ... 66245-66270

Schllich, Sir William, K.C.I.E.:
 Evidence of ... 66720-66747
 Statistics furnished by ... pp. 150-2

Sikhs, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

Sind Circle:
 Conservator, appointment recommended, *Millett* 66534, 66562
 Staff, *Millett* ... 66563

Srinivasalu Naidu, Rai Bahadur, evidence of 66656-66678

Stebbing E. P.:
 Evidence of ... 66858-68043
 Statistics furnished by ... pp. 150, 152

Subordinate Service:

Creation of few posts carrying higher pay advocated, *Coombs* ... 66122
 Lower, small schools in provinces for training, *Hart* ... 66091
 Promotion to Provincial Service (see under Recruitment, Provincial Service).
 (see also Rangers.)

Sudras, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

T

Training (see Probation and Training).

Travelling Allowances (see under Pay).

U**United Provinces:**

Charges, practice of placing Imperial Service recruits in charge of major divisions in preference to more experienced Provincial Service officers should be abolished, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127, 66141.

Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians, character of work, *Clutterbuck* ... 66097

Extra Deputy Conservators:
 Holding major charge of comparatively very minor importance, *Clutterbuck* ... 66054

Posts vacant because no one could be certified as fit for holding major charge, *Clutterbuck* ... 66054

Two posts vacant and should be filled up, *Coombs* ... 66127

Government, memorandum by ... pp. 120-1
 (see also subject headings.)

W

Witt, D. O., evidence of ... 66616-66655.

Work (see under Conditions of Service).

APPENDIX
TO THE
REPORT
OF
THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	192
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	193
APPENDICES	257
INDEX	278

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

At DELHI, Tuesday, 11th November, 1913.

	PAGE.
J. MACKENNA, Esq., I.C.S., Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India and Director of the Agricultural Research Institute, Pusa	193
... 	
G. CLARKE, Esq., Agricultural Chemist, Indian Agricultural Service, Cawnpore	201
... 	
Lala MADAN MOHAN LAL, Esq., Assistant Professor of Entomology, Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur	205
... 	

At CALCUTTA, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

E. J. WOODHOUSE, Esq., Principal of the Sabour Agricultural College, Bihar and Orissa	212
Jatindra Nath CHAKRAVARTI, Esq., Agricultural Supervisor, Rangpur, Bengal	220

At MADRAS, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.

C. A. BARBER, Esq., M.A., D.Sc., Government Sugar-cane Expert	223
M. R. Ry. Rai Bahadur K. RANGACHARIAR AVANGAL, Government Lecturing Botanist, Agricultural College, Coimbatore	227

At BOMBAY, Tuesday, 10th February, 1914.

G. F. KEATINGE, Esq., C.I.E., I.C.S., Director of Agriculture, Bombay	229
Dr. H. H. MANN, Principal, Agricultural College, Poona	233
... 	
S. L. AJREKAR, Esq., Assistant Professor of Mycology, Agricultural College, Poona	238
... 	
E. J. BUTLER, Esq., Imperial Mycologist	241
... 	
S. MILLIGAN, Esq., Imperial Agriculturist	241
... 	
C. E. LOW, Esq., C.I.E., I.C.S., Director of Agriculture and Industries, Central Provinces	246
... 	

At LONDON, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

F. C. DRAKE, Esq., Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office	255
... 	

At LONDON, Tuesday, 5th May, 1914.

T. H. MIDDLETON, Esq., C.B., An Assistant Secretary to the Board of Agriculture and Fisheries	254
... 	

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT,

At Delhi, Tuesday, 11th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

GOPAL KRISHNA GORHALE, Esq., C.I.E.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.I.E.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

B. C. BURT, Esq., Deputy Director of Agriculture, Central Circle, Cawnpore.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

J. MACKENNA, Esq., I.C.S., Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India and Director of the Agricultural Research Institute, Pusa.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68044. In this memorandum I propose to deal with the various points of reference as affecting the following branches of the Service:—

(1) The Imperial Staff at Pusa and serving under the Government of India.

(2) The Imperial Staff in the Provinces.

(3) The Provincial or Gazetted Subordinate Staff at Pusa.

(4) The Provincial Staff in the Provinces.

(5) The Subordinate Staff.

To take these in order: the terms of reference apply equally to the Imperial staff at Pusa and that in the Provinces.

(I AND II) IMPERIAL STAFF AT PUSA AND IN PROVINCES.

68045. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—The Indian Agricultural Service is recruited by the Secretary of State in England, and Indians possessing the necessary qualifications may be selected by the Secretary of State. It was decided in 1910 that the time had not yet come for the Government of India to make appointments to this Service by direct selection in India as is done in the case of the Enrolled List of the Finance Department and certain other Services, but the Government of India have, since January, 1912, arranged, on the occurrence of a vacancy, to ascertain before addressing the Secretary of State whether Local Governments have any recommendations to make on behalf of the members of the Provincial Services.

The qualifications required from candidates for appointments are laid down in rules (copy attached) prepared by the Secretary of State in 1910. Candidates must ordinarily be between 23 and 30 years of age, and preference is given to British-born subjects and to distinguished graduates of some University in the British Empire. Officers selected are on probation for three years and must (unless specially exempted) pass an examination in a vernacular language within two years.

These arrangements have worked satisfactorily and have on the whole secured a good class of men. But, as other qualifications than mental capacity and practical experience are necessary for successful work in India, I would suggest that the Secretary of State be assisted in his selection by one or two Anglo-Indians—either members of the Indian Civil Service or of the Indian Agricultural Service—who might help in gauging the general aptitude of candidates and the likelihood of their success in an Indian career.

The above remarks apply to first appointments.

With regard to the recruitment of a staff for Pusa, I consider that the appointments at Pusa should be considered the prizes of the Service and that, when vacancies occur there, the best men from the Provinces should be selected to fill them. This principle should be applied also in officiating vacancies of six months or over. It is absurd (though in some cases inevitable) that a Supernumerary of a few months' service should, as has happened, officiate as an Imperial Expert.

11 November 1918.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA.

[Continued.]

68046.—(II) System of Training and Probation.—In theory recruits for the Department join as Supernumeraries on probation and receive a considerable amount of training either at Pusa or in a Provincial Department before they are posted to an independent charge. In practice, however, it has been found practically impossible to do this and, in many cases, men have had to learn local conditions as they could; being posted to independent charges almost immediately on arrival.

Agricultural recruits should, as a rule, be trained in the Provinces to which it is intended to post them ultimately. They can thus begin at once the study of the language. If possible, they should also put in at least three months at Pusa.

Other specialists, e.g., Chemists, Botanists, Entomologists, etc., should have at least one year's training at Pusa before they are posted to provinces. Probationers if not found suitable should be dispensed with and not be retained for the full period of probation.

68047. (III), (V), and (VI) Conditions of Service, Leave, and Pension.—These, except in individual cases governed by special agreement, are determined by the European Service Leave Rules and the ordinary Pension Rules of the Civil Service Regulations. Representations on these points, asking for an improvement in the Leave Rules and a pension after 25 years together with a Family Pension Fund on the lines of the Indian Civil Service Fund, have been made by various members of the Service, but it is presumed that the decision of these points as affecting the Agricultural Service will follow the general recommendations made with reference to other Services similarly constituted. As in the case of the Indian Educational Service (Article 403, Civil Service Regulations), a member of the Indian Agricultural Service, if appointed at an age exceeding 25 years, should reckon as service qualifying for pension (Superannuation) the number of completed years by which his age may at the time of appointment have exceeded 25 years.

It should be open to a probationer and to Government to terminate his services before the expiry of the due date on three months' notice on either side and a return passage should be given to him.

The members of the Indian Agricultural Service enjoy the benefits of the General Provident Fund.

68048. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—At first the pay of each officer was determined according to circumstances as he was recruited, but in 1903 a general scale of pay was adopted which followed the lines of that in force in the Education Department. For the first three years the pay was fixed at Rs. 400—30—460 and afterwards at Rs. 500—50—1,000, no exchange compensation being allowed. The bulk of the Imperial officers and all officers in charge of Colleges were given in addition a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem. Officers serving in Burma are given a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem provided their aggregate pay and allowances do not exceed Rs. 1,000 per mensem.

Special arrangements have, however, been made in certain cases, either (a) by the addition of personal allowances, or (b) by granting special rates of pay. There is no fixed pay for the Head of the Department; that enjoyed by the first Inspector-General of Agriculture being put at Rs. 1,750—100—2,250 for him personally, and that now drawn by the Agricultural Adviser being Rs. 2,000. Special terms outside the ordinary rates are also prescribed for Agricultural Engineers.

The scale of pay for Imperial Officers at Pusa and for Imperial Officers in the Provinces is the same; but, as will be seen from paragraph 19 of the rules for appointments to the Indian Agricultural Service, officers filling appointments directly under the Government of India are eligible for local allowances on the following scale:—

Per mensem.

	Rs.
From 4th to 10th year of service	100
From 11th to 15th year of service	150
Over 15 years' service	200

In some cases also personal allowances are given.

I do not consider that the present arrangements as to pay are satisfactory. As at present arranged, a member of the Indian Agricultural Service reaches his maximum pay after 13 years; or probably before he is 40 years of age; and has to continue serving till 55 on the same scale of pay. This is very apt to damp enthusiasm and produce discontent, if not actual indifference. I think, therefore, that the scale of pay should be revised somewhat as follows:—

Probationary years.

	Rs.
1st	400
2nd	430
3rd	460
Confirmed 4th to 13th	500—50—1,000
14th and 15th	1,000
16th to 20th	1,050—50—1,250
21st to end of Service	1,300—50—1,500

The local allowances at Pusa and for Principals of Colleges and the Burma allowance should be retained and the right to grant personal allowances in very exceptional cases when the maximum of salary had been reached might be reserved. In view of the very great importance I attach to Pusa attracting the very best men in the service, I would raise the local allowance to Rs. 250 per mensem irrespective of length of Service.

With regard to Supernumeraries: Officers in the Supernumerary grade should draw the pay of the grade so long as they remain Supernumeraries. But should they, while still Supernumeraries, be gazetted to officiate in a substantive post, they should draw a salary of Rs. 500 per mensem. At present the scale of pay for Supernumerary Officers is Rs. 400—30—460, with rent-free quarters or equivalent house allowance. If the officer is confirmed he is promoted to the grade of Rs. 500—50—1,000, but in this grade 10 per cent. is deducted for house rent, the result being that in the 4th year of his service he draws at least Rs. 10 per mensem less than in his third year. I would suggest that in his 4th year or first year of confirmation an Officer should be exempted from the payment of house rent.

Considerable dissatisfaction has been felt by members of the Service on account of the recruitment of various Officers—in some cases their contemporaries at Cambridge and below them in the class lists—on special rates of pay higher than men of equal standing, who joined the Service in the ordinary way as probationers, are drawing. Without, however, an adequate reserve to meet leave vacancies and to fill permanent vacancies that may occur it is perhaps difficult to prevent this. If a direct appointment has to be made to fill the post of Agricultural Chemist, Entomologist or Economic Botanist it is only natural that a more senior man with some experience should be required; and naturally he expects a higher rate of pay than a probationer. The grievance will disappear as the Service grows older, i.e., as the staff recruited as probationers grow older the chance of pay higher than or as high as they draw being offered to a newly-appointed Officer will become less and less. But up to the present it certainly has been a source of irritation to some of the junior members of the Department.

68049. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—It may be said that no limitations exist in the employment of non-Europeans. Whenever suitable Indians are available their cases are considered, and it may be said that this is a policy which will be steadily pursued. But there are natural limitations which have, up to date, militated against a large employment of Indians. Most of the Indian gentlemen who have obtained the necessary educational qualifications come from the literary and not from the cultivating classes, and in consequence are somewhat deficient in the sympathy which is absolutely essential to success.

11 November 1913.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA.

[Continued.]

ful working with cultivators. For the same reason the efficiency of an Indian Agricultural Officer is greatest when he is employed in the province to which he belongs. Considerations of language, customs, religion, etc., lessen his efficiency when he is taken out of his local conditions. I am of opinion that, for the present, the educated Indian agricultural expert can best be employed on the teaching side or on scientific research: though in the latter case this will mostly be confined to the more accurate sciences like chemistry. The present Mendelhian cult in botany requires a scientific imagination, which can only be stimulated by long residence in the scientific atmosphere where it flourishes, and although I am far from suggesting that an Indian student is incapable of acquiring this bent we have not as yet found any instances of its acquisition.

Similarly, I consider that for the present the driving force necessary to stimulate agricultural development must come from Deputy Directors recruited in Europe. That the Department will ultimately contain many Indian gentlemen in its higher grades I have no doubt, but the necessary recruitment of Europeans should not be stopped on that account. The Department must expand, and in a few years the bulk of the recruitment will come from Indian graduates. But at the beginning the leaven must be supplied by European officers till an indigenous agency is available. But expansion should not be delayed till this local material is available.

It is, however, I may say, the fixed policy not only of the Government of India, but of Provincial Departments of Agriculture to recruit Indian candidates whenever suitable ones can be found: and, even at present, there are one or two suitable candidates who will probably receive early appointments.

With regard to the working of the existing division of service into Imperial and Provincial, it may be said that in most Provinces the Provincial Service has not yet been finally graded, but that proposals for revision will come up for sanction as Departments expand and the qualifications of members of the Service become better standardised: at present the Provincial Service is recruited from the best graduates of the Agricultural Colleges of India and, in the higher grades, by men who have had a European or American training.

The members of the Provincial Agricultural Service are not barred from appointment to the Indian Agricultural Service if selected by the Secretary of State, but there is no regular promotion from the Provincial to the Imperial Service, nor are there any "listed" posts. Posts ordinarily held by the Indian Agricultural Service may be held by members of the Provincial Agricultural Service or Subordinate Agricultural Service, but such tenure does not connote promotion to the Indian Agricultural Service, the officers holding the posts remaining as before in the inferior services, and receiving an allowance for the charge. The Provincial Services for Pusa and for the different Provinces are each on a distinct cadre, and Provincial and subordinate officers are recruited and transferred, etc., entirely by the Local Government concerned. It may be added that it is from the Provincial Service that promotion of Indians to the Imperial Service will, as a rule, be made. In the Provincial Service they receive that further practical training which proves their initiative and worth: and obtain the local experience which qualifies them to be useful officers. Promotion from these grades is, I think, on the whole, in the case of Indians, preferable to direct appointment from an English University.

68050. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—The relations with the Indian Civil Service are very close, as, since 1906, Provincial Directors of Agriculture have been members of the Indian Civil Service. In 1911 it was decided that the post of the Director should, for the present, be filled by Civilians, but that it should not be specially reserved for them,

and that Agricultural Officers should be tried in officiating vacancies as opportunities occurred.

There is now an unanimous demand from the service that Directors of Agriculture should be recruited from the members of the Indian Agricultural Service, the main argument being an analogy with the Forest Public Works Department, Police, etc. This, in my opinion, is no analogy at all. The Departments with which a comparison is made deal with one branch of work only, in which the technical supervision and administrative control can easily be exercised by a member of the Department. In the Agricultural Service we have many branches—Agriculture, Chemistry, Botany, Entomology, Veterinary Science, etc. From what branch are we to take our Director? But apart from the administrative control, the functions of a Director are quite different from those of the head of any other Department. It is in the relations with the general agricultural community that the necessity for a Civilian Director is justified. There is no Department that has such close relations with the people; and, to establish these relations, it is desirable to have an officer who has, by settlement training, got an intimate knowledge of local requirements, a sympathetic appreciation of difficulties and, above all, a thorough knowledge of the vernacular. I do not say that these qualifications cannot be obtained by members of the Agricultural Service, but it seems to me somewhat strange that there should be such a general desire to abandon the special scientific work for which they were recruited in favour of administration. In certain cases when chemists have been appointed principals of colleges they have, on their own admission, done practically no research work; and the administrative duties of a Directorship will practically mean that the officer appointed will absolutely abandon the special line of work for which he was appointed. We must have specialists in administration as well as in science. In agriculture this is especially necessary. It is the link between the research work of the Agricultural Expert and the cultivator that we want to forge, and for this an experienced Indian civilian is, I think, the best qualified.

I do not wish to suggest that inter-sectional jealousy might seriously affect efficiency; though I think there is reason to anticipate this. There is considerable resentment on the part of the Civil Veterinary Department at the idea of being subordinated to an officer of the Indian Agricultural Service—a junior Service—though they accept a member of the Indian Civil Service as a solution of the position. In my opinion any success achieved up to date has been due to the unity of purpose which has been possible by having a disinterested head. Where this has not been achieved things would have been much worse if a member of the Agricultural Service had been Director.

In my opinion it will be a much better thing for the Department and the agriculture of the country if the legitimate ambitions of the Service are met by a suitable enhancement of pay which will permit of research under conditions of security and contentment. But, if the Civilian Director is retained, there are certain qualifications which should be insisted on. He should be an Officer of about 10 to 12 years' service, who has proved a successful Settlement Officer, well up in the vernacular and known for his sympathy with the people and interest in rural problems. It would be an advantage if he had some training in the principles of agriculture, and he should hold the appointment for five years.

The importance of the question of Rural Development in India appears to me to be assuming such proportions that it is for consideration whether it would not justify the creation of a post of Rural Commissioner in all provinces with a similar appointment in the Government of India. Under this Officer would be placed the Departments of Agriculture, Veterinary Science, Co-

11 November 1918.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA.

[Continued.]

Operative Credit, Industries and Famine or Scarcity. In the provinces he would have such junior assistants for each branch as are necessary; he would continue to be Director of Agriculture, but would be given as Personal Assistant a senior member of the Agricultural Department with a substantial personal allowance, he would be Registrar of Co-operative Credit Societies, and would have, as assistants, a sufficient number of trained juniors.

In the Government of India, the Directorship at Pusa would be revived and given to one of the members of the Pusa Staff. In Veterinary matters the Rural Commissioner would be advised by a senior member of the Civil Veterinary Department to whom, as to the officer at Pusa, an allowance of say Rs. 200 per mensem would be given. In this way the work of the Indian Empire on the lines of rural development would be systematised, and steady and uniform progress along definite lines guaranteed.

I am aware that these proposals go somewhat against the principles of decentralisation; but the development of measures for rural progress is one which must be co-ordinated and studied as a whole and for this reason a centralised controlling agency seems desirable.

Of the other departments of Government with which the Agricultural Department has relations, the Education and Irrigation are the most important. There has been a gratifying amount of collaboration with these Departments in questions which concern both, and the tendency is on the increase.

(III) THE PROVINCIAL (OR UPPER SUBORDINATE) SERVICE AT PUSA.

68051. *GENERAL.*—With the expansion of the Agricultural Department in the superior ranks from 1903 onwards it became necessary to add assistants to experts, but the men then appointed had not for the most part received any previous agricultural training, and it was not possible to lay down any general scale of remuneration. The pay given was fixed tentatively for only a few years ahead, and not infrequently was personal to individual officers and based on their individual merits. This method has not even yet been wholly departed from, and no complete Provincial Service with fixed prospects from recruitment to pension yet exist either in the Imperial Sections or in any province. Some whose position approximates to that of a Provincial Service have been given gazetted rank, but even so the dividing line between "Provincial" and "Subordinate" service is not clearly defined. The reasons for this state of affairs are, briefly, that it cannot yet be said what conditions must eventually be offered to attract suitable candidates, and the present assistants have not reached a stage at which it can be said that they will be qualified to fill the highest posts that would have to be created to make the complete service attractive.

It has been considered unnecessary and impossible to create high posts in a service to which no present officers could hope to rise for a considerable number of years and to fill which it is not certain that they will be qualified. The present position is, therefore, inchoate.

In connection with the Pusa Institute, in 1904 the following staff was sanctioned:—

	Rs.
1. Assistant Agricultural Chemist	250—300
2. Assistant to the Cryptogamic Botanist	200—5—250
3. Assistant to the Entomologist	200—5—250
4. Assistant to the Economic Botanist	200—5—250
5. Veterinary Graduate	200—5—250
6. Teacher of Physics and Mechanics	200—5—250
7. Surveyor	150—5—200

These posts were created on the condition that they should not be filled until the actual necessity arose. The rates of pay were then considered to be the maxima rates for such men as were then

obtainable, and it was proposed to employ them on a probationary pay of Rs. 100 per mensem for three years in the first instance and to give them a training for the work required.

Experience, however, showed that it was not necessary to keep the men recruited on the long probationary status, as they were found qualified, and consequently they were confirmed and given the sanctioned scale of pay, viz., Rs. 200—5—250. When it was decided that Pusa should give only post-graduate courses instead of the complete course of five years (three years ordinary and two years post-graduate) the posts of teachers of physics and of surveying were kept vacant for a time and ultimately absorbed.

With the development of the work of the Institute additional posts of assistants on lower scale varying from Rs. 50—75 and Rs. 75—125 were created. In 1907 proposals were made for raising the pay of the subordinate officers, on the strength of development indicated in two Memoranda drawn up by the Imperial Entomologist and the Imperial Mycologist, in which these officers submitted proposals for a Provincial Service on the following scale:—

Pusa.	Rs.
10 Assistants
10 Do.
5 Do.
6 Do.
<hr/>	
31 (total)	—

These proposals were not, however, considered by the Government of India because they thought that as the Agricultural Department was in an experimental stage, it was difficult to find suitable candidates for the highly paid posts, and that it was no use creating theoretical posts. It was left to the Inspector-General of Agriculture to employ good men on suitable salaries as they became available, and to submit proposals for such increases as he might consider necessary, treating each case on its own merits and not appointing them on posts created as a general scheme.

Thereafter, on various occasions, the heads of the Sections proposed that the appointments of First Assistant in each Section of the Pusa Institute should be made of sufficient standing, both as regards emoluments and status, to attract the most highly qualified students available in the Science Faculties of Indian Universities or from Agricultural Colleges. As at first constituted, these posts were non-gazetted and carried a pay ordinarily of Rs. 200—5—250. In 1908 the pay of the First Assistants in the Botanical, Mycological and Entomological Sections was raised and that of the First Assistant in the Chemical Section was raised in 1909, the promotion being regarded as personal to incumbents. A scale of Rs. 200—20—500 was sanctioned for each of the First Assistants in the Mycological Section (Mr. Basu) and in the Botanical (Mr. Shevde) who had specialised in English Universities. The same scale was granted for the First Assistant in the Chemical Section (Mr. Sen) as his high Indian University qualifications were considered equal to those of men who had studied in European Universities. The pay of the First Assistant in the Entomological Section (Mr. Misra) was raised to Rs. 200—10—400, and a similar personal rate of pay was also granted to the Second Assistant in the Chemical Section (the late Mr. Kar). Thus the increase varied according to the qualifications and the duties of the Assistants concerned. At this time all the posts of First Assistants and also of the Second Assistant in the Chemical Section were, with a view to improve the status, admitted to gazetted rank. The First Assistant in the Mycological Section subsequently resigned, and the post has been filled up by a fresh recruit, who was at first appointed on Rs. 200—5—250 and subsequently promoted to Rs. 200—20—300. The post of First Assistant in the Botanical Section has been brought under reduction. The First Assistant in the Agricultural

11 November 1913.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA.

[Continued.]

Bacteriological Section, who was originally appointed on the sanctioned scale of Rs. 200—5—250 in 1910, was granted subsequently the increased rate of personal pay of Rs. 200—20—300. At present there is no senior gazetted Assistant in the Section of the Imperial Pathological Entomologist, as this Section is not yet fully developed.

Personal rates of pay of Rs. 150—10—200 were also granted to the 2nd (Mr. Ghosh), 3rd (Mr. Dutt) and 4th Mr. Nowroji) Assistants in the Entomological Section, and the 2nd Assistant (Mr. Mitter), and the 3rd Assistant (Mr. Mitra) in the Mycological Section, who were originally in the grade of Rs. 75—10—125. Thus it will be seen that so far the appointments and the pay have been given on the principle of actual requirements and personal considerations.

Thus, so far, no regular graded Provincial Service has been sanctioned for Pusa. The subordinate staff now consists of men on varying scales of pay, shown in the attached statement (A), from which it will be seen that there are at present 12 different scales:—

				No. of posts.
(1)	Rs. 200—20—500	1
(2)	Rs. 200—20—400	1
(3)	Rs. 200—20—300	3
(4)	Rs. 200—10—300	1
(5)	Rs. 200—5—250	1
(6)	Rs. 150—10—200	5
(7)	Rs. 100—10—200	1
(8)	Rs. 100—10—150	1
(9)	Rs. 75—10—125	15
(10)	Rs. 60—8—100	1
(11)	Rs. 50—5—75	1
(12)	Rs. 50	1
				32

The question of pay and prospects of the subordinates of the Agricultural Department was referred to the Board of Agriculture of 1908 for opinion (*vide* paragraph 43 of the Proceedings)—“The Board considers that the present prospects in the Agricultural Department are insufficient to attract the right stamp of men for the upper subordinate posts, such as First Assistants, Assistants to Experts, Superintendents of Experimental Stations and the like. That the prospects of the upper subordinate staff should be somewhat better than those offered in the Provincial Executive Service, in view of the fact that the service is new and specialised.” The Government of India passed no orders on this recommendation, and it was left to Local Governments to take action according to their needs.

68052. No scale has yet been fixed for the pay to be given to officers of the Provincial Service in the Agricultural Department, but the Secretary of State for India has authorised the Government of India to create appointments for the Provincial Agricultural Service on a higher pay than Rs. 400, subject to the financial powers of the Government of India. The pay now given in different Provinces is not uniform, as will be seen from the printed statement of appointments prepared for the Board of Agriculture of 1911 (copy attached). The maximum pay given in the Provinces does not exceed Rs. 400, exceptions being, the two posts of Extra Deputy Directors in Bombay on Rs. 350—50—2—550, and the post of Assistant Director of Agriculture in the United Provinces on Rs. 400—700.

68053. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—As a rule, distinguished science graduates or diplomates of Provincial Agricultural Colleges, or those who have qualified themselves by special training in Indian or foreign universities are selected for appointments for the upper subordinate posts. In some cases, however, men trained in the Department showing special aptitude are, as stated above, promoted to these posts from the lower grades.

This arrangement is satisfactory, but as in the case of the Imperial Service, I would make the

higher posts at Pusa the prizes for the best men of the Service, so that from there they may have a prospect of promotion to the Imperial Service. In like manner it is hoped that the provinces will indent on Pusa for its scientific staff to an extent.

68054. (II) System of Training and Probation.—Newly appointed men are kept on probation for periods varying from six months to one year, and only such men as give promise of following a scientific career and evince sufficient interest in the work of the Department are confirmed in their appointments.

68055. (III), (V), (VI) Conditions of Service, Leave and Pension.—Follow the usual rules in the Civil Service Regulations and the Civil Accounts Codes. Any modifications should follow the general decision arrived at for similar grades in other services of like standing, e.g., education.

68056. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—As explained above no regular Provincial or Subordinate Services have been organised for Pusa; the members of the upper subordinate staff are given rates of pay based on special and personal considerations.

The time is, however, rapidly approaching when it will be possible to have a fixed grading, with the understanding that the possibility of promotion to the Imperial Service lies beyond, and the grading might be somewhat on the following scale:—

A.—PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

(Teaching Assistants.)

II Grade.—4 posts on 200—20—500 (16 years).

I Grade.—1 post on 500—30—300.—Very special merit should be insisted on for appointment to this grade.

Should such men not be available the post should not be filled up, and one appointment should be made in the lower grade in lieu of it.

Qualifications necessary for appointment to this Service:—

D.Sc.’s, First Class M.Sc.’s, the best L. Ag.’s who have successfully undergone a post-graduate course at Pusa, or men of equivalent educational qualification, will be eligible for appointment to this Service. Meritorious men may be appointed on promotion from the Subordinate Service—their merit being judged from the standard of their work.

B.—SUBORDINATE SERVICE.

(Laboratory Assistants, Farm Overseers, Veterinary Overseer, etc.)

25 posts on Rs. 75—10—125; 125—5—150; 150—10—250, i.e.:—

Rs.

1st to 6th year of service	75—10—125
7th to 12th year of service	125—5—150
13th to 23rd year of service	150—10—250

Efficiency bar at the stage of Rs. 200. To have gazetted rank on promotion to Rs. 200 stage. One or two posts on Rs. 300 might be placed on this grade for exceptional qualifications.

Qualifications necessary for appointment to this Service should be the B.Sc. or the L.Ag. degrees. Meritorious men from the Lower Subordinate Service may also be promoted to this Service. But the number of such men in the Service must not ordinarily exceed one-fourth of the strength of the establishment. Those of the present incumbents who do not satisfy the conditions should continue in their present grades.

68057. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—This part of the note deals with the Provincial Service only which is wholly manned by Indians. The limitation of the employment of Europeans and non-Europeans does not therefore come under consideration.

11 November 1913.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA.

[Continued.]

(IV) PROVINCIAL (OR UPPER SUBORDINATE) SERVICE IN THE PROVINCES.

68058. (I) and (II) Recruitment and Training.—In the Provinces, particularly in Bengal, Central Provinces, United Provinces, Bombay, Punjab and Madras where the beginnings of a separate Provincial Agricultural Service exist, recruitment may be either by promotion from below, by direct recruitment from outside, or by seconding from other services. As far as is known no definite rules have yet been laid down. Those recruited direct from outside have generally special qualifications acquired either in India, in Europe, or in America or Japan. Some have been deputed to Europe and America at Government expense to fit them for the Service. The Agricultural Colleges at Pusa, Sabour, Coimbatore, Poona, Nagpur, Cawnpore, and Lyallpur are, however, being now more generally utilised for training of candidates for the Service.

It is difficult to see how a competitive examination could be instituted for the Agricultural Service, which needs specialists in different sciences, and selection must remain the only feasible method of recruitment.

When agricultural knowledge is of first importance, that is, for posts on the strictly agricultural side, only distinguished graduates of the Agricultural Colleges or distinguished officers of the Subordinate Agricultural Service should be eligible for appointment.

When, however, an advanced knowledge of a particular science is necessary, other men possessing the necessary qualifications and university distinction, e.g., a graduate with Honours in Chemistry or Botany, may be appointed. In such cases they should undergo special training at Pusa for a period of from one to two years.

The present course of training provided at the Agricultural Colleges, together with some practical experience, seems adequate.

68059. (III), (V), (VI) Conditions of Service, Leave and Pension.—The members of the Provincial Service of the Agricultural Department are under the Indian Leave and Pension Rules, as embodied in Chapters XIV to XIX of the Civil Service Regulations.

It is presumed that any conclusions which the Public Services Commission may come to with regard to these Rules will apply also to the Provincial Agricultural Service.

68060. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—*Pay under Local Governments.*—From 1909 to 1911 the Secretary of State's orders were held to preclude creation of any Provincial Agricultural Service post in the Provinces on pay exceeding Rs. 400 per mensem, but the limit has now been removed. The Provinces in which an approximately distinct Provincial Agricultural Service exists are noted separately below:—

(i) *Bombay*.—In 1907, a Provincial Agricultural Service, consisting of Divisional Inspectors and Assistant Professors, was sanctioned, the pay being graded from Rs. 200, rising by biennial increments of Rs. 30 to Rs. 350. In 1911 the appointment of two Extra Deputy Directors of Agriculture on a salary of Rs. 350—50—2—550 was sanctioned.

(ii) *Madras*.—The Service as originally constituted in 1902 was as follows:—

	Rs.
Managers, 1st grade ...	100—10—150
Managers, 2nd grade ...	50—5—100
Assistant Manager ...	25—5—50

In 1909, the appointment of two Assistant Directors of Agriculture on pay of Rs. 250—15—400 was sanctioned by the Government of India.

(iii) *Bengal*.—In 1910, a Provincial Agricultural Service was sanctioned, consisting of:—

Rs.

5 posts on 250—10—400
3 posts on 150—10—250

(iv) *United Provinces*.—The Service as originally constituted in 1906, consisted of an Upper Division with grades of Rs. 250, 200, 175, 150 and 125.

In 1911 this was superseded by a scheme under which 2 years would be spent on probation on Rs. 200; on confirmation the pay would be Rs. 250—20—500. In the same year one special appointment of Assistant Director with personal pay of Rs. 400—100—3—700 was sanctioned, and 3 other posts of Assistant Director on Rs. 250—20—500. A charge allowance of Rs. 100 is given when an Assistant Director holds charge of a Circle.

(v) *Punjab*.—The staff sanctioned in 1908 consisted of:—

Rs.

5 Assistant Professors ...	150—10—300
1 Assistant Director ...	300—10—400
2 Assistant Directors ...	150—10—300

The pay of Assistant Professors was subsequently raised to Rs. 150—12—8—400.

(vi) *Assam*.—The staff consists of three Agricultural Supervisors on Rs. 200—10—400, sanctioned in 1906.

(vii) *Central Provinces*.—The staff originally sanctioned in 1907 consisted of fixed grades on Rs. 150, 175, 200, 250. In 1911 an enlarged staff on higher pay was sanctioned, consisting of 12 appointments as follows:—

Rs.

Two years' probation ...	100—150
On confirmation ...	200—10—250
And thereafter ...	30—2—400

(viii) *Burma*.—

Rs.

1 Superintendent of Farm	150—15—250
3 Overseers ...	75—5—100
4 Sub-Overseers ...	50—5—75
2 Probationers ...	30
6 District Agriculturists ...	50—5—100
3 Specialists Assistants ...	150—10—200
2 Junior Assistants ...	75—15—150

I do not think that any general scale can be laid down for the Provincial Services. The rates of pay must be decided by Local Governments. But in any case, they should not be less than those in the Educational Department, and good men should have an opportunity of rising to the Imperial Service by merit.

The other heads of references as regards the Provincial Service do not, in my opinion, call for any remarks.

(V) LOWER SUBORDINATE SERVICE.

68061. Besides the Subordinate and Provincial Services referred to above there are other posts such as those of Assistants, Fieldmen, Laboratory Attendants, Setters, etc., on lesser rates of pay ranging from Rs. 10 to Rs. 50, and rising to Rs. 75. It is unnecessary to consider this part of the Service in detail. It may, however, be mentioned that such men who, after experience and training, show special aptitude for scientific or field work are promoted to the Subordinate Service. The subordinate ranks of the Settlement Department form the best recruiting ground for this grade.

Mr. J. MACKENNA called and examined.

68062. (Chairman.) He had occupied his present position since the beginning of March of the present year. He joined the Indian Civil Service in 1905, since when he had been closely in touch with the economic development of agriculture in India. The Imperial Branch of the Agricultural Department consisted of 65 to 70 officers, two-thirds of

whom were engaged in research, and one-third in practical work as Deputy Directors of Agriculture. In the Provinces research and professional functions were combined. For instance, the agricultural chemist was not only engaged in research, but was also a Professor of Agricultural Chemistry. The Deputy Directors had generally been selected

11 November 1913.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA.

[Continued.]

for district work alone, though in one or two cases they might also be employed as Principals of Colleges and Lecturers on agriculture. It was not desirable that one officer should perform double duties; and he thought the positions should be separated. He would like to see Pusa undertaking higher research work, pure and simple, and teaching reduced to a minimum except in the case of very advanced post-graduate Indian students. He had no objection to a very good post-graduate student coming from a Provincial college to work in the Pusa laboratories under specialists. It did not interfere to a great extent with the ordinary work of the laboratories, and it was a great incentive to an Indian student to work under such men as Dr. Butler, Dr. Leather and Mr. Howard. Beyond that, however, he would not have any regular course of teaching at Pusa. He thought it would handicap the work of the specialists there if they had to give set courses of lectures.

68063. Recruitment for the Imperial Service was made by the Secretary of State, who gave weight in his selection to certain qualifications such as a University degree in Arts and Science, or the diploma of a recognised school of agriculture, or practical experience, according to the nature of the vacancy to be filled. He thought the method of selection at present employed was fully satisfactory, provided that the advice of an agricultural officer on leave from India was taken at the time the selection was made. As a matter of fact, that was generally the present practice.

68064. He should recruit Deputy Directors entirely from the sons of English farmers. He did not think the instinct for Deputy Directors' work, except in very exceptional cases, would be acquired unless a man came from the agricultural class in England, and had worked on a moderately sized farm. A man with the practical experience of a farmer's son and a Bachelor of Science degree in agriculture was the best material which could be obtained for the Service. A very large percentage of the present Deputy Directors in the Department were sons of farmers, and performed their work satisfactorily. In the case of Scotsmen, he would prefer them to take an M.A. degree before taking their Bachelor of Science degree. He did not think it was necessary that a chemist should have gained any practical experience in England before being sent to India. A good chemist would soon adapt himself to Indian agricultural chemistry with the help of the special course he had taken in England. It was advisable that a botanist should have been at Cambridge. He suggested that a man arriving from England should be placed under an experienced teacher, in order to obtain the local colour.

68065. Up to the present time, neither in teaching, nor in the research branch, nor in the outdoor work of the Department, was the Indian officer doing the same standard of work as the Imperial Officer, except in one or two special appointments like those of Extra Deputy Director in Bombay where he imagined the powers were almost the same as those of the Deputy Director. The Provincial Service was below the standard of the Imperial Service, and was under the guidance of Imperial Officers. Such a state of affairs was not unnatural because the Service was quite young. The Provincial Service Officer was in charge of one or two farms at the most, while the Deputy Director probably had control of seven or eight farms in a circle. There was at present one Indian in the Imperial branch. He obtained entry by taking a degree at Cambridge, and was selected by the Secretary of State in the ordinary way. Since the written statement had been sent in, the Secretary of State had appointed another Indian from the Punjab to the Imperial Service, with a diploma of the Royal Agricultural Society. A certain number of Indians did apply to the Secretary of State in England for appointment. The Service had attracted a good deal of attention during the last seven or eight years, largely from sections of the community who had no particular connection with agriculture. The acquisition of an agricultural degree in England was not a matter of very

great difficulty, and was not of much use unless a candidate had other qualifications. He looked forward to the time, a few years hence, when a considerable proportion of Indian graduates would come into the Service, and his idea was that the Department would best be recruited if some means could be devised for educating the sons of landholders.

68066. He would prefer to make the selection in India, and then send the selected candidate to England to take a special course which would fit him for a post in the Imperial Service as a Deputy Director.

68067. He would not care to make any comparison between the Indian standard of teaching in agriculture and the English standard. He had no doubt that the standard of lecturing was as good in the Indian colleges as in the English colleges. The whole question of agricultural teaching had been giving a great deal of trouble, and it was going to be discussed by the Board of Agriculture in December. He emphasised his desire to see one large centre purely for research. At the present time there were six teaching colleges, one at Cawnpore for the United Provinces, one at Poona for Bombay, one at Nagpur for the Central Provinces, one at Lyallpur for the Punjab, one at Sabour for Bengal and Bihar, and one at Coimbatore for Madras. These colleges were supposed to be teaching up to a standard prescribed by the Board of Agriculture, but some of them did not get very many students to teach. He advised a re-casting of the whole Educational policy, and a multiplication of short courses for actual cultivators, accompanied, if possible, by an alteration of the general educational system of the country; but he had not worked out the details of this. In some ways a college of an up-to-date character, furnishing the best skilled teaching, and of sufficient size to accommodate any number of students, would be preferable to distributing the work over six Provinces; but, after all, a boy liked to study near his own home, and it was necessary to take into account considerations of language and environment. He would hope that a degree from one of the agricultural colleges would sufficiently qualify an Indian for service in the Imperial Branch, but the mere acquisition of a degree was not a difficult task.

68068. He did not know whether the amalgamation of the post of Inspector-General with that of the head of the Pusa establishment was due to considerations of economy. He thought it was part of a policy following the findings of the Decentralisation Commission. The duties of the Inspector-General of Agriculture or Advisor, necessitated a good deal of touring all over the country. He was at present occupied to a very small extent with college work. Things had settled down at Pusa fairly well. All the big administrative problems had been worked out, and the Director was able to devote a large portion of his time to inspection and touring. He thought the two functions could efficiently be combined. If a very difficult point in scientific controversy arose, it might be advisable to have a scientific head who could solve it, but up to the present time there had not been any such problem.

68069. The number of officers now in the Service under the Government of India was certainly not sufficient for teaching and research and outdoor work. He thought the number of Deputy Directors should be largely increased. Some of the larger Provinces would probably require to dissociate teaching and research, and to duplicate their chemists and botanists. He was quite well satisfied from his experience in India that since the Department had been organised, and the post of Deputy Director had been established, there had been an appreciable rise in the standard of agricultural methods owing to the introduction of better varieties of seeds and implements, and improved methods of well-boring and cultivation. There was room for a large increase in the number of experimental farms mainly for seed distribution. There were no scientific seed merchants in India, and for many years to come the Government must

11 November 1913.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA

[Continued.]

fill that position. The supply of seeds was the vital crux of Indian agriculture. It was essential that there should be an adequate number of Deputy Directors, as apart from mere agriculture, these officers had to do a great deal of administrative work in keeping in touch with the people, either through seed societies or co-operative credit societies. In a word, he considered that in the interests of the country, and especially of the agricultural industry, there was room in the immediate future for a very considerable extension of the Department.

68070. The Director of Agriculture was the head agricultural officer in each province. He (the witness) had no provincial control at all. He visited the Provincial Directors of Agriculture, and advised them on any matter regarding which they required advice. He did not think there was any necessity for the interchange of teachers and Deputy Directors between the various Provinces. The question whether it was better to have an outside officer as head administrator or an officer from inside the Department was complicated. He could not imagine a botanist or chemist coming out from England, and, after four years, clamouring for an administrative appointment. He did not see why a good chemist or a good botanist should have any desire for such a position, and he did not know whether such men would make good administrators. A scheme had been drawn up for his own Province of Burma, which, on general lines, would be applicable to other Provinces.

68071. He took the view that the economic development of the country was of as much importance as its administrative development, but agriculture, co-operation, veterinary arts and crafts, were at present lumped together, and for administrative purposes put under a Financial Commissioner or a Board of Revenue, who probably knew nothing about such subjects. He thought every Government ought to have a senior officer to control the rural development of the country. He would like to see a Commissioner at the head of each Province. He thought a post of Rural Commissioner should be created. The various branches which he had just mentioned would derive advantage from a scheme of this kind because the Commissioner would know something about the subject; he would be more or less an expert under whom the agricultural and co-operative and veterinary branches of the work would be placed. He would have no objection to the senior veterinary officer in the Province being attached to him as adviser. In the Agricultural Department difficulty would arise from the fact that the number of chemists and botanists was not very large, but he thought if their pay was sufficiently increased and they were given the prospect of a Pusa appointment, they might be satisfied. The Deputy Director's work was largely administrative, and he thought when there were three or four Deputy Directors in each Province, there was no reason why a senior Deputy should not be called a Director of Agriculture, simply advising on agriculture and not touching chemistry or other scientific subjects.

68072. He would not bring co-operative officers into the agricultural cadre, because the agricultural man had quite enough to do without gaining the technical knowledge necessary for co-operation. The linking up of these two Departments was the main object at the present moment of all Governments that were progressive. He desired to co-ordinate all kindred branches which were working towards the same economical development. The post of Rural Commissioner would normally be held by an Indian Civil Service officer.

68073. With regard to the period of training, he thought in the case of chemists and botanists six months at Pusa under a good man would be sufficient. As regards the agriculturist, he thought it would be as well if he had about a year's training in the Province in which he was to be posted before beginning actual work.

68074. The present training reserve was not

adequate. It was with the greatest difficulty that officers obtained leave.

68075. The present time scale was at first adequate to attract a good class of men, but there was now the greatest possible difficulty in the matter of recruitment. He thought the question of pay might have something to do with that.

68076. He would be very much in favour of special regulations with regard to study leave.

68077. There was a general demand for a Family Pension Fund on the same basis as the Indian Civil Pension Fund. He thought the demand put forward by some of the officers of the Service for a pension after 25 years' service was reasonable. They would then retire about 50 to 52. At present men entered the service at an average age of 21 to 26. If optional retirement was allowed after 25 years the Government should have the discretion to retire an officer after the same term of service.

68078. (Mr. Golhale.) There was practically no difference between the duties of the Inspector-General and the office which he held at the present moment. The salary of the Inspector-General rose to Rs. 2,250, and the salary of the post of Agricultural Adviser was Rs. 2,000. He did not know that the local Governments had objected strongly to an officer from one Province advising other Provinces in agricultural matters. His whole service had been spent in Burma, and he admitted that he might feel it inconvenient to criticise operations in Bombay.

68079. There had been a suggestion in the past that Pusa should inaugurate a post-graduate course, but personally he was glad that it had not materialised. He thought it would be bad for the college if some of its best men were tied down to a curriculum. So far, there had not been seen in Indians any evidence of research capacity without supervision. There were some very good Indian Assistants in Pusa, and some very sympathetic specialists, but the general opinion was that Indians were capable of excellent work only if they were supervised. He had heard of Indians who were doing distinguished work in Physical Science in Calcutta, and also of Indians who had proceeded to America and had distinguished themselves in agricultural colleges, and had done excellent research work there. He agreed there might be an advantage in the fact that after retirement Indians would remain in the country, and would push forward scientific agriculture in every direction, but on the other hand Indians desired to obtain a pension at the earliest possible date. Provided that the method of selection which he had mentioned was adopted, he was absolutely in favour of the best Indians being selected and sent abroad with scholarships rather than that the country should be fed constantly with men from outside, who retired at the first opportunity.

68080. (Mr. Sly.) There had been several cases of selected men of the Provincial Service being sent to England for training either at the end of their college career or a few years later. The result in one case had been exceedingly promising, and in the other exceedingly doubtful. In the former case the man came from a cultivating class before he entered the agricultural college. He supposed there might be strong objections from the scientific side to a proposal to send Indians to England to be trained in agriculture under conditions which were absolutely different from those of India, but the argument would apply also to Europeans sent out to train Indians. He thought a scheme under which Indians should be wholly trained in India at a high class institution with post-graduate research, such as was contemplated at Pusa, was preferable to a course in England.

68081. In some cases under existing conditions a Deputy Director got into as close touch with the agricultural community as the Director, but in other cases he did not, and never would do so. The objection that an officer appointed to the Directorship from within the Department would have to give up research work in order to take on administrative work would not be valid in cases

11 November 1913.]

Mr. J. MACKENNA.

[Continued.]

where an officer had performed the bulk of his research work by the time he was appointed. If the appointment was to be filled from within the Department instead of by a Civilian, he thought it must be thrown open to all the branches of the Service.

68082. With regard to leave, it had not been brought to his notice that the rule that leave could not be taken until after eight years' service was a serious obstacle to satisfactory recruitment. The present position in regard to the leave reserve of the Department was as follows. There had been a considerable increase in some Provinces in the number of Deputy Directors. The Central Provinces and Madras had said that if they could obtain the numbers of officers they desired they would make their own leave arrangements. The reserve for his own Department, which used to consist of three agriculturists, had now been reduced to two. That might be sufficient when the Provincial Service had been strengthened to the extent contemplated.

68083. At the present moment the supernumeraries were all fully employed. It would depend upon what duties a man was required to perform whether he was recruited direct to the Provincial Service from the agricultural colleges, or direct

from the science graduates of universities. On the agricultural side he thought a student should come from the provincial agricultural colleges, and for the post of Assistant in Botany or Chemistry, a good degree candidate should be selected and be given a special course.

68084. The only College which had been affiliated to a University was Poona. He had not considered the question whether agricultural colleges should or should not be affiliated to a University, but he did not think there was any particular advantage in it. The policy of the Government of India was at present against affiliation, the argument being that dual control was not yet desirable.

68085. (Mr. Madge.) In his opinion there was no kind of farming in India which corresponded in any measure with the farming in England. He had never, yet seen a man who owned 600 acres in India driving a plough. He should like to see the agricultural student recruited from the sons of zamindars, but the difficulty was to get sufficient agricultural equipment in the ordinary village school, which would bring the son of a cultivator more or less into line with the student at the colleges. His Department were trying to provide that link.

(The witness withdrew.)

G. CLARKE, Esq., Agricultural Chemist,

Written Statement containing the corporate opinion of the officers of the Indian Agricultural Service, United Provinces.*

68086. (I) **Methods of Recruitment.**—Under the present conditions, the appointments to the Indian Agricultural Service are made by the Secretary of State, without reference to any board of technical advisers, as is the case in other technical services. This system of appointments is unsatisfactory, as it does not provide for the experience and knowledge, necessary to form a correct judgment of the scientific training and qualifications of candidates. Recruitment to the Agricultural Service, therefore, should be by a small Board appointed by the Secretary of State, consisting of agricultural and scientific men of established reputation. One or more officers of Indian experience, preferably from the Agricultural Service, should be on the Board to judge of the probable suitability of a candidate to work under Indian conditions. In any special case this committee should be supplied with full details of the nature of the vacancy to be filled.

68087. (II) **Systems of Training and Probation.**—It has been customary for supernumeraries to be posted to Pusa to undergo a period of training. This has been found in practice to be unsatisfactory. It is suggested that a leave reserve be organised on a provincial basis, in which Provinces with similar conditions are grouped into units. Postings would, in general, be made to this leave reserve, and the period of probation would thus be passed under conditions which the probationer will, in all probability, for some years have to work. It is not by this intended to exclude transfer from one unit to another on appointment to a substantive post. Suitable units would be—(a) Punjab, Central Provinces, United Provinces, North-West Frontier Province, Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, Assam; (b) Madras, Bombay, and (c) Burma. Under present conditions an officer has to pass an examination in a vernacular language within two years of his appointment. This examination is merely qualifying. The present higher standard examinations are not suitable and there is, therefore, little inducement to pass them. It is suggested that the period for passing a qualifying examination be

* This statement was signed by the following officers:—Messrs. H. Martin Leake, A. W. Fremantle, G. Clarke, A. E. Parr, B. C. Burt, and A. Wilson

Indian Agricultural Service, Cawnpore.

reduced to one year, during which period facilities should be given for learning the language and inducements offered for passing a suitable higher standard examination.

68088. (IV) **Conditions of Salary.**—The present sanctioned pay of the Service is at the rate of Rs. 400, 430, 460 during the first three years in the case of supernumeraries, and after that the pay of the regular establishment rises by annual increments at the rate of Rs. 50 per month, from Rs. 500 to 1,000, reached at the end of 10 years. The Service at present suffers a marked disability in that all officers reach their presumed maximum pay in from 10 to 13 years' service. In this respect the Indian Agricultural Service is worse off than any other Imperial Service. In the Public Works Department Imperial Engineers have a practical certainty of rising to Rs. 1,500, a very fair chance of reaching Rs. 1,800, and a considerable proportion have the opportunity of becoming Chief Engineers on Rs. 2,500. If the Indian Agricultural Service is to continue to attract suitable recruits it must offer approximately equal prospects. It must be remembered that appointments to the Service are, or should be, from men fully qualified professionally. They have had to bear the entire cost of their training. This is not the case in certain other services, e.g., Forests and Police. The injustice of the present scale has been admitted, and some attempt to remedy it has been made by granting a limited number of personal allowances. This system is unfair and would be difficult to administer. It would be impossible to form a fair judgment of the relative claims for allowances of officers performing such diverse duties as Entomologist, Agricultural Chemist and Principal of an Agricultural College. With increase of the number of posts in Home and Colonial Services for men with a scientific training, competition is on the increase. The present pay and prospects, though perhaps sufficient at the time of introduction, fail now to attract to the Service the best men available, and fail to keep good men after they have performed a few years' service.

The following scale of pay is considered sufficient to meet the present disabilities—

Supernumerary.—Rs. 400-430-460.—Officers under this head would only draw the pay of the grade so long as they remain supernumeraries. If gazetted to a substantive post, they should commence drawing salary at the rate of Rs. 500 p.m. from the date of gazetting.

11 November 1913.]

MR. G. CLARKE.

[Continued.]

Establishment.—The time scale as at present in force should be extended to a maximum of 1,500, and, excluding the post of Director of Agriculture, dealt with under section VIII, a provision made for a small percentage of posts at a higher pay.

68089. (V) *Conditions of Leave.*—The revised rules, as notified under G.G.O. No. 538 C.S.R., dated 13th September, 1912, and now under the consideration of Government, appear satisfactory. In no branch of Government service is frequent leave so important as in a scientific service if officers are to maintain their touch with current work in other countries. It is therefore recommended, in addition, that provision be made for study leave on lines similar to that granted in the case of the Indian Medical Service.

68090. (VI) *Conditions of Pension.*—Under present conditions voluntary retirement can only take place after 30 years' service, or on the attainment of the age of 55. That these terms are severe is generally admitted, and it is strongly recommended that voluntary retirement should be possible, after 25 years' service for pension, as defined in the Civil Service Regulations. It would further add to the attractiveness and, hence, the efficiency, of the service if a system such as is in force in the Indian Medical Service and Forest Service, of progressive pensions which would start after 17 years, were introduced.

68091. (VII) *Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans.*—The Service is broadly divisible into two sections, that mainly devoted to research and that mainly devoted to practical agriculture, including the district work.

There is at present no institution, at least in these Provinces, teaching up to the standard required for research. The difficulty arises very largely from the weakness of the elementary education which spoils the student before he comes to college. There is little chance, therefore, even when the college teaching is satisfactory, of his being able to take up research. The difficulty being so deep rooted there does not seem to be any immediate prospect of employing in research any person trained in these Provinces.

As regards the other branch, suitability depends not only on the standard of attainment but on the class of man. It is useless to send a man of the literary classes to instruct cultivators in agricultural procedure. Whatever his attainments, there is small chance of his being acceptable. In that education is now almost entirely limited to the literary classes there seems small chance for the present of recruiting suitable men for this branch. An attempt to attract men for the Agricultural classes and to give them a training which will fit them either for the Service or to return to their own estates is a most promising line of development. This is, however, hardly the place to develop such a scheme. It suffices to say that for the present no commencement has been made along these lines.

There does not appear therefore to be any immediate possibility of throwing open the Imperial Service to men trained in India. It cannot be too clearly stated that a short course such as an Indian takes when sent to England does not give a broad enough outlook to form a qualification for the Imperial Service. The system of scholarships to England for special training is to be deprecated, and the employment of non-Europeans is therefore limited to men who have spent their early years in England, the Continent, or America. It is possible that at some future date men of sufficient promise will be trained out here. Such men would first enter the Provincial Service, from which opening to the Imperial Service might be given by submission of qualifications, to be considered by the advisory board recommended under I, along with other applications, to the Secretary of State.

While natives of India are at present unsuited for independent charges, they are of considerable value as subordinates, and, in order to attract the best class of men, the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Agricultural Service should be improved. This can be done by the improvement of the initial pay (Rs. 40 per month), and by the creation of better paid posts, with the prospects of rising to the pay and status of Deputy Collectors, for men who can hold semi-independent charges.

68092. (VIII) *Relation with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.*—The Service is a highly professional one and it is not merely essential, but inevitable, that its head should be drawn from the Service itself. For a member of the Service holding the appointment of Director, it is recommended that the emoluments be the grade pay with a personal allowance of Rs. 400 per month. It is also suggested that this post be added to those quoted in Article 475, C.S.R., rendering the incumbent eligible for an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 per annum.

Arising out of the mode of origin of the Department from a Department of Land Records and Agriculture, in which the Director was the entire Department, a system has arisen by which the Director in person assumes the role of Professional Advisor. References on professional matters from Government come to him; he may or may not, at will, consult his staff, and, even if he does so, he may in his reply go directly against their opinion. It is his opinion and not that of his staff which goes to Government and is accepted by them as the professional opinion of the Department. This system of what are, in practice, confidential reports is wrong. The Director should in such matters forward the opinion of his staff, and, as a matter of procedure, forward copy of his covering remarks to the officers of his staff who are concerned. This procedure is doubly necessary so long as the Director is not taken from the ranks of the Service, but it is a principle which requires to be permanently accepted.

A minority are in favour of pointing out the obvious danger of adopting the principle, stated in the 1st paragraph of this section, at too early a date. The age of the Agricultural Officers in the United Provinces with scientific technical training in no case exceeds 35 years, and if any one of these were appointed Director at an early date, he would ordinarily hold the appointment until his retirement 20 years hence. If the appointment was only partly a success change would be difficult, and, in any case, a prolonged tenor of such appointment is undesirable. The minority are in favour of adopting as a guiding principle in this matter the view that the appointment should not be held for a longer period than five years.

68093. (IX) *Other points not covered by above.*—It is only natural that, in a young Service, undergoing gradual evolution, certain minor points for dissatisfaction should arise. In that these lead to preferential treatment and consequently give grounds for personal grievances, they are objectionable and require to be removed. The chief are:—

(1) *Allowances.* No allowances should be granted for the normal work of a post. Allowances should only be given where extra work or extra expense (e.g., entertainment) is involved.

(2) *Lack of uniformity in titles.* To ensure uniformity similar posts should throughout the Provinces be given identical titles, and all officers should be gazetted and referred to in official publications as officers of the Indian Agricultural Service. This, for instance, is not done at present in the United Provinces Quarterly Civil List, where some of the titles differ from those used in other Provinces and where the names of officers of the Service appear with those of the Indian Civil Service, Civil Veterinary Department, and Subordinate Services.

11 November 1913.]

MR. G. CLARKE.

[Continued.]

MR. G. CLARKE called and examined.

68094. (Chairman.) Witness said he was an officer of the Indian Agricultural Service and posted to the United Provinces as Agricultural Chemist to the Department of Land Records and Agriculture. He also carried out the duties of Professor of Chemistry at the Provincial Agricultural College. He attended before the Commission to represent the views of the Imperial officers serving in the United Provinces. He did not represent the Provincial Service.

68095. He was generally satisfied with the regulations for recruitment, but desired to see a Board set up to advise the Secretary of State. The present system of selection by a permanent official of the India Office was considered unsatisfactory, as the permanent official did not possess the necessary qualifications to judge of a candidate's suitability. He would like to see a regular Board of Selection established, consisting of men of known agricultural and scientific reputation. He had been seven years in the service, coming out at the age of 28. He should say the average age at which officers were at present recruited was 25 or 26. He considered 26 a more suitable age than 28, because a man of 26 could have gone through the whole of his course in England and have done original research work, which was very important in the case of specialists.

68096. He would like to see a change in the organisation of the Agricultural Department with regard to the employment of Indians. He would propose to have the service recruited in India divided into two distinct parts. There should be a purely subordinate service, consisting of what might be described as fieldsmen, persons drawn from the cultivating castes, and skilled in agricultural operations, beginning at a salary of Rs. 20, rising to Rs. 80. For such a class he suggested that only a vernacular educational test was necessary. Then he would like to see an entirely distinct Provincial Service, divided into two branches, a Lower Provincial Service and an Upper Provincial Service. The Provincial Service would be recruited from distinguished graduates of the Agricultural Colleges, on the nomination of a Selection Committee consisting of the Director of Agriculture, the two senior Deputy Directors of Agriculture, and one or more officers attached to the research section. The lower Provincial Service would have charge of circle farms, act as assistants in the research laboratories, and do the general work of an Upper Sub-ordinate Service. The Upper Provincial Service would consist of men promoted from the Lower Provincial Service after three years' service. The idea was that the best of the Lower Provincial Service men should be passed by selection into the Higher Provincial Service. After serving in the Higher Provincial Service for a number of years, an officer would be eligible for selection for the Imperial Service, and should undergo a course of training at a central college in India providing the highest type of agricultural education, equal to that obtainable in American and English Colleges. He considered the training received in a college of that kind by an Indian who came into direct contact with the agricultural conditions that prevailed in India, was an infinitely superior method of training to that received in an entirely foreign environment, such as the American and English agricultural colleges. Assuming such a central college were established in India, he would not admit the Indian direct into the Imperial Service; he would prefer him to go into the Provincial Service for three years, and then to serve five to seven years in the Higher Provincial Service. That meant that a boy would go to the agricultural college at 17 years of age and pass out at 21; serve three years in the Lower Provincial Service, five to seven years in the Higher Provincial Service, and would then be eligible for selection to the Imperial Branch when he reached the age of 29 or 30, by which time a very fair estimate could be formed of his capacity. Pusa seemed to be the best place for establishing a central institution. He did not think if Pusa was

converted to such a purpose it would be lost to India as a research centre. He thought its specialists could undertake the training of a limited number of students in addition to their laboratory research work. It might prove necessary to increase the staff. What he was trying to emphasise was the importance, in his judgment, of the establishment of a first-class college in India with the Indian environment. He thought a young Indian would receive a better training in such an institution than if he were sent to England.

68097. The present salaries paid to officers were affecting recruitment. There was tremendous difficulty in finding officers to come out to India who had really done research work. People who had just left college, and had not learnt methods of research, could be obtained, but when they arrived in India they had to be taught their business. He thought the low prospects offered in the Agricultural Department was the reason for that state of affairs. It compared very unfavourably with any other service requiring a professional training. He thought if the present time scale was raised to Rs. 1,500, with a special increase up to Rs. 1,700 for 25 per cent. of the officers, the disability under which officers were at present labouring would be removed. He felt sure that a concession of this kind would react on recruitment in England.

68098. Facilities for study leave were also asked for. He thought that specialists in particular should keep in touch with the progress of research. In India they were absolutely isolated.

68099. With regard to pensions, he considered 25 years' service was a sufficient period for an officer in the Agricultural Service. The only justification for the proposal that an officer should be given an opportunity of voluntarily retiring after 17 years' service was that it would add to the attractiveness of the Service. For 20 years he thought a very good case could be made out.

68100. The ground for the argument that the head of the Service should be drawn from within the Service was that a scientific head was more sympathetic in dealing with scientific workers. It did not necessarily follow that a specialist in a particular branch of an industry had no faculty for administration. He knew men of highly specialised knowledge in the Department who were great administrators. He did not think an officer drawn from another Service and selected to be head of the Department would normally attribute due importance to the preliminary "spade-work" that the Agricultural Service was doing for agriculture.

68101. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) It would be absolutely necessary for the head of the Department to have special knowledge, in order to appreciate both the importance and the value of the work done by officers.

68102. No great expenditure would be required in order to give effect to his scheme for a central college. The organisation already existed; it merely needed utilising. Pusa was at present a central institution for research. Formerly, it was an institution for teaching and research, but the teaching branch had been abolished. Under his proposal the teaching branch would be revived, and Pusa would again become a college for the highest agricultural training. He considered the original Pusa scheme failed because the Provinces did not support it as a teaching institution. Under his scheme it would be compulsory for all Provinces to send to Pusa the men whom they wished to promote to the Imperial Service.

68103. (Mr. Madge.) In his opinion there was no reason why a training in chemistry should not be given in India side by side with a training in agriculture. The objection to having an Imperial head for the whole of the country he understood was that he would be unable to keep in the closest possible touch with local conditions. He did not think any advantage was gained by sending Indians to England to study. Facilities should be

11 November 1913.]

MR. G. CLARKE.

[Continued.]

offered in India for giving a scientific and practical training equal to that given in England.

68104. (Mr. Sly.) It was not an absolute necessity, but it was a distinct advantage for a chemist or botanist or mycologist to have a bent for agricultural work. On the assumption that the best chemist was at Pusa, he would send a specialist in chemistry there for one year's training in preference to training him in the Province to which he was to be attached, but it was difficult to lay down any hard and fast rule. He was not in favour of a scheme whereby a certain proportion of specialists, instead of being recruited for the Imperial Service in India, should be engaged for short terms at special rates of salary for the investigation of particular problems in India. He thought if Government desired a man to do his best work in India, it should attract him to an Indian career. It would not be well for the country for a man to come out merely to make as much scientific reputation and money as he could, and then clear out. He did not think there would be any objection to having an efficiency bar, say, at Rs. 1,000 or even at Rs. 1,200, provided that some provision was made to ensure that an officer's case was fully considered by the higher authority. To leave the matter to the caprice of any one person acting without consultation, he thought, would be very much resented. If such a scheme were adopted, Local Governments should be compelled to call in the advice of the Agricultural Adviser.

68105. He thought the scheme for a leave reserve suggested in the written statement was a good way of providing such leave with a minimum of expenditure. It was not an ideal scheme; it was a "halfway house." The ideal system seemed to be far beyond the reach of public funds. He thought a separate leave reserve was required for every particular branch of the Department. The unanimous opinion of the Imperial Officers of the United Provinces was that the strength of the Imperial Service must be increased. Assuming funds, and the present rate of expansion of the Department, there should be room for an addition of twelve officers to the Imperial cadre, half of whom should be Indians. The present number was six. That would simplify leave arrangements considerably.

68106. The unanimous opinion of the Department was that the Directorship should be held by a member of the Department, the particular reason being that it was difficult for a civilian to keep thoroughly in touch with the scientific work of the Department, because he had, as a general rule, no knowledge of science, and could not differentiate between good and bad work. A civilian who had taken honours in science supplemented by an agricultural course, and possessed the same qualifications as were laid down in the rules for recruitment to the Imperial Service might, however, be suitable for the post. Witness added that personally he had not met such. He thought educated Indian agriculturists could be found in the United Provinces suitable for recruitment to the Imperial Service, but he was speaking without experience, because the agricultural college in the United Provinces had been entirely wrongly organised, and was now only beginning where the other Provinces began seven years ago. Very careful selection was required for the Provincial Agricultural Service. He thought the prospects held out by his scheme of three years' service in the Lower Provincial Service and five years in the Higher Provincial Service, with subsequent training and promotion to the Imperial Service, would attract a large number of educated Indians, even although other Provincial Services held out much better prospects and paid a higher initial salary. He thought a sufficient number would be attracted to the Higher Provincial Service, from which he hoped a very good proportion of the Imperial officers would be obtained in the future. He did not think an initial salary of Rs. 125 was too low. He thought the number recruited from the Provincial to the Imperial Service would be a con-

siderable percentage, if it was borne in mind that the Provincial Agricultural Service would always be a small body compared with other Provincial Services.

68107. The course he contemplated for his proposed central Indian college for Provincial officers would be on similar lines to the diploma course in Agriculture at Cambridge. It would be a post-graduate course, partaking of the nature of study leave. It was true that a post-graduate course at Pusa had been tried, and generally condemned as a failure, but he did not think the causes of the failure had been properly enquired into. One of the chief causes was that the courses of instruction were not suitably arranged, and another that the Provinces were not compelled to send selected candidates for the Imperial Service, as should be the case. He considered the course of instruction given at Cawnpore could easily be made equal to that given in the Agricultural Department of the University of Cambridge, and that the work done in the chemical section compared with any bio-chemical work which was being done in any part of Europe. The scientific atmosphere at Cambridge and in England generally was a thing of recent origin, and he did not see why it should not be created in India. He thought every effort should be made to do so.

68108. (Mr. Gokhale.) The ideal system would be a first-rate agricultural college in each Province, but until sufficient funds were available for that purpose, he thought one central college should be formed, and Pusa might be so reorganised as to serve for the purpose. The difficulty arising out of different conditions in different provinces could be overcome by the Pusa officers touring in the country, and thus acquiring acquaintance with various local conditions. He did not think if Pusa was utilised in the way he suggested there would be any taint of inferiority in the education. The whole essence of his scheme was that the education given at the central college should not bear the taint of inferiority. If it did, then his scheme at once failed. He did not think it would be possible for India to supply her own needs in agricultural science for many years. He could give no definite reason why he suggested there should not be more than 50 per cent. of Indians in the Imperial Service, except that he considered scientific qualifications were not at present highly developed in Indians, and it would take a large number of years to develop them. Many English agricultural officers were showing distinct scientific aptitude in special Departments in India. Many of them were doing a large volume of original work which would bear comparison with the best work that was being done in any part of the world.

68109. (Mr. Burt.) Beyond supplying the fullest details of the qualifications required, he did not think the Indian Government should have any voice in the selection of candidates.

68110. It was a fact that the present scale of pay had always been held out as a purely temporary measure, and that every officer on joining had received more or less definite assurances that it was not intended to be the maximum. He, personally, had been told that unofficially. Want of definite prospects above Rs. 1,000 per month had already caused one or two men to leave the service just when they were becoming useful officers.

68111. As far as his personal knowledge went, the Agricultural and Civil Veterinary Departments were at present the only Departments in the United Provinces with a Civilian at the head, except the Judicial, Excise and Revenue Departments, which were purely administrative. In every other country in the world the Agricultural Department had a specialist in charge. With regard to the argument as to the extreme variety of the work in the Agricultural Department he pointed out that the same conditions prevailed in the Forestry Department, which had a specialist at the head, so that this objection to appointing a member of the Indian Agricultural Service to the

11 November 1913.]

MR. G. CLARKE.

[Continued.]

post of Director disappeared altogether. He thought that Mr. Mackenna's statement that the Director formed the link between the expert and the cultivator was not correct. From his own experience he should say that the Deputy Director was the connecting link. One point in favour of having a central college was that it was desirable that a man, after working in a Province for several years under certain men, who were working along certain lines, should have the advantage of a further course of training, and of doing research work under men working in another school of thought and along different lines. This fresh experience could be better acquired in a central college than in the Provincial colleges.

68112. (Sir Valentine Chiro.) He thought it was only a temporary advantage to the Service to have

its interest and claims represented by a man who did not actually belong to the Department. A reasonable Government ought soon to learn the value of an expert opinion. As things were at present, he should say that nobody's views would be received so well as a Civilian's, and it was useful to have a Civil Servant at the head of the Department as a temporary measure until this changed.

68113 (Chairman.) Witness considered that Mr. Mackenna's scheme for placing all the kindred branches of work concerned with the rural development of the country under the control of a Rural Commissioner was quite practicable, but he would prefer that the officer in charge of all these branches should also be a Secretary to Government.

(The witness withdrew.)

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL, Assistant Professor of Entomology, Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur.

Written Statement* containing the views of the members of the Provincial Agricultural Service, Punjab.

PREAMBLE.

68114. Before giving our evidence under the nine heads mentioned in the Press *Communique* of the Government, Punjab, dated 3rd March, 1913, we wish to explain that our aims regarding agricultural service in India are (a) efficiency of management; (b) efficiency of training, so that the Department of Agriculture may find men in its own ranks to fill up the highest posts; and (c) popular agricultural development in the light of modern scientific discoveries, so that India may occupy an honoured place among the advanced agricultural countries of the world.

Efficient management may be obtained by employing imported scientists, but it is also attainable under qualified Indian scientists. Efficiency of training and popular agricultural development, however, will not be brought about, unless:—

(1) The best Indian intellect is attracted towards agriculture. The term "Indian" applies to all statutory natives of India; .

(2) The men of substance find it worth while spending large sums of money in giving their boys specialised scientific training. Adequate scientific training not being obtainable in India, Indian parents sending their boys to foreign countries incur greater expenses for the same training which European boys can get more cheaply in their own countries.

It should be recognised:—

(1) That no lucrative agricultural career is open to the Indian youth; and

(2) That the majority of Indian landowners educate their boys not for managing their own lands, which may sometimes not be considered extensive enough for a man to devote himself entirely to them, but usually the profits derived from them under the management of an agent are regarded as sufficient. They educate them instead for entering into some department of public service, in which alone they find "Izzat." We find no reasons to hope that any number of foreign scientists will ever bring about the desired result, viz., the agricultural development of India on an extensive scale. They may carry on experiments, and may establish valuable data, or solve some problems of economic interest, but this will be far short of the progress of the Indian people as a nation. We therefore think (a) that side by side with the employment of foreign scientists, which

must more or less continue at present, steps should be taken to induce the development of Indian scientists in large numbers; (b) that under the present circumstances this development will not be induced unless Indian intellect and money are attracted towards agriculture; (c) that this attraction can only be exerted by Government's ensuring that Indian agricultural scientists in Government employment will have a career about as lucrative as that in any other department of public service; and (d) that the best way of doing this would be to have a general Agricultural Service in India, not divided into Imperial and Provincial, so that Indians of merit and character will have the incentive of expecting to rise to the highest post in the Service. This, as we will explain later on, would present no administrative difficulties.

On all these considerations the basis of our evidence therefore is:—

(1) That the present division of the Agricultural Service into Imperial and Provincial is harmful to Indian development, and should be abolished; a purely scientific Department such as that of Agriculture does not possess administrative needs in favour of such a distinction;

(2) That other measures may be taken to promote the growth of Indian scientists; and

(3) That gradually as these measures succeed the importation of foreign scientists into India should be checked, and ultimately stopped. If a special case should afterwards arise, when it may be advisable to import a foreign scientist, it can be treated specially.

68115. (1) Methods of Recruitment.—Before dealing with the method of recruitment, we wish to say a few words about the recruiting ground.

The Recruiting Ground.—There is at present no adequate recruiting ground, i.e., specialists are not available in sufficient numbers in India for agricultural service to start independent work immediately. Even many of the imported scientists are no better in this respect and need just as much training as an intelligent Indian would before they are fit for an independent charge. The aim, therefore, should be that India may become exclusively the recruiting ground for all agricultural appointments, exceptions occurring only when importation may be specially desirable. A proper recruiting ground for the agricultural service should have adequate provisions for general education as well as for specialised training. The Indian recruiting ground, therefore, should be:—

(1) The lower grades of service in the Agricultural Department, which should be so systematised that men in the lower ranks will have opportunities to make themselves fit and show their fitness for higher posts;

(2) Men outside the Department, consisting of Indian scientists of merit and character, who will have got their training at their own expense and

* This statement was signed by Messrs. Kharak Singh (Assistant R. Gopal (Assistant Professor of Chemistry), Madan Mohan Singh (Assistant Professor of Entomology), all of the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur; and by Jagat Singh, for M. Fateh-ud-Din (Assistant Director of Agriculture, Punjab).

11 November 1913.]

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL

[Continued.]

responsibilities. We will speak about the lower grades of Agricultural Service under head II., but concerning the provision for scientific training of Indians in India, we would suggest (a) that each Indian University should have a Faculty of Agriculture, and every Agricultural College should be affiliated to some such University; (b) that the only degree in Agriculture which these Universities may award to successful students should be that of Bachelor of Agriculture (B.Ag.), so that post-graduate work may not come to be regarded as preparatory for a higher degree examination, but may remain to be judged by the quality of the work done; and (c) that the Faculty of Agriculture should have its own matriculation examination, so that on students attaining the middle school standard of education their parents may have to choose the future line of training for them. Thus Indian boys will start specialised training fairly early, which would surely produce a better average agricultural graduate than if the choice is made at a comparatively later stage.

Method of recruitment.—No competitive examination can be instituted for Agricultural Service, which needs specialists in different sciences, and selection must remain the only feasible method of recruitment. It is a general principle that the number and quality of prizes being adequate, the wider the field for selection, the keener will be the competition, for every one will try to do the very best one can do as to excel among many. Such a keen competition tends to produce a better average candidate, and we would recommend—

(1) That selections for all posts carrying a maximum salary higher than Rs. 250 per mensem, whether they be promotions from lower grades of service or direct appointments, should be made for the whole of India by a Selection Committee, which should be composed of—The Agricultural Advisor to the Government of India (President), the Directors of Agriculture of Provinces and the Principals of Agricultural Colleges (members). The selected candidates may be usually appointed to their own respective Provinces, but there should be nothing to prevent their being sent to another Province.

(2) That selections for all posts, the maximum salary for which does not exceed Rs. 250 per mensem, may be made by each Director of Agriculture for his own Province, on the recommendation of a Deputy Director of Agriculture or Principal of an Agricultural College, according as the post may be under one or the other of these officers. These men will remain in their own Provinces until they happen to be selected for a post carrying a higher maximum salary than Rs. 250 per mensem, when they may, if necessary, be sent to another Province.

(3) That for the recruitment to the posts at present held by the Indian Agricultural Service men who are recruited abroad, a method should be introduced by which Indian youths may be selected as probationers and sent abroad for two or three years to work in the most up-to-date laboratories under eminent scientists, on the understanding that if they should work there satisfactorily they will be retained to serve another year of probation in India, which, if satisfactorily completed would entitle them to be made permanent. Our subsequent recommendations regard-

ing allowances to these men will show that this experiment will cost only about as much as importing European young men on Rs. 400—30—400 per mensem on three years' probation, but will give a strong impetus to the development of India. We believe that while this method will not be an extravagant one, it will have far-reaching effects in inducing Indians (who can afford the expenses to go abroad on their own account and become specialists, which they cannot do inside India), so that they may be available for selections when opportunities arise. They will have got into scientific work sufficiently, however, not to give it up, if they do not get Government appointments, and they will certainly do their best to find scientific work elsewhere. As the above advocated method of recruiting Indians may succeed, the recruitment from abroad of young European graduates should be curtailed and ultimately stopped. In time (say, in 20 or 30 years) even such recruitment of Indians involving their being sent abroad on probation, would stop altogether. The impetus for scientific learning will have been given, and fully qualified Indians who will have gone abroad and widened their knowledge at their own expense and responsibility will be available for recruitment under the usual rules concerning probation.

68116. (II) Systems of Training and Probation.—Under this head we would recommend—

(1) That where a man is promoted from a lower to a higher grade of Service, it should be understood that he has had the requisite training for the higher post, and he should not be required to serve another period of probation. He should also receive the salary of the permanent grade from the date of his appointment to the higher post.

(2) That in cases of direct appointments the system of training and the period of probation should vary according to the grade of the post, viz.—Concerning the Indian graduates directly recruited as experts to spend part of their probation period abroad, their training would consist of work in Western laboratories under eminent scientists for a period of two or three years, as the case may be, and in India for a period of one year. The probation period should in these cases be calculated to begin from the time the recruit leaves his home, and on his being made permanent it should count towards furlough and pension. Concerning direct recruits to other posts, a probation period of two years, as at present, which counts towards leave and pension (if the appointment is made a permanent one) is satisfactory.

68117. (III) Conditions of Service.—The conditions of the Agricultural Service should be such that the best Indian intellect will labour for it, and after entering remain therein. Also they should be such that men of means will spend freely in giving their boys the best agricultural training which cannot be obtained without very considerable expense, inasmuch as the aspirants will have to go abroad. The present conditions of the Provincial Agricultural Service men compare very unfavourably with those of other Services, for instance, the Provincial Civil Service, as the following table will show—

Service.	Starting salary per mensem.	Maximum per mensem.	Average number of years taken for reaching the maximum.	Average number of years for reaching the grade of Rs. 400 per mensem.
Provincial Civil Service (Extra Assistant Commissioners, Sub-Judges, Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioners)	Rs. 250	Rs. 800	20 years	... 4—7 years.
Provincial Agricultural Service (Assistant Professors and Assistant Directors)	150	400	—	20 years for Assistant Professors, 25 years for Assistant Directors.

11 November 1913.]

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL.

[Continued.]

The data for the Provincial Civil Service has been obtained from the quarterly Civil List of the Punjab, volume CLX-II., corrected up to 1st January, 1913.

In the Provincial Education Service of the Punjab which was organised in the seventies or eighties the starting salary for Assistant Professors was fixed at Rs. 200 per mensem, but for the Provincial Agricultural Service, organised within the last ten years, it was brought down to Rs. 150 per mensem, while the standard and cost of living has greatly increased since that time.

Inside the Department the responsibilities and duties of Officers of the Provincial Agricultural Service are such as to place them high above the subordinate men in the Service; but their position in other matters (e.g., the distinct mark of inferiority attached to the Provincial Agricultural Service, resulting in the absence of friendly intercourse between the Provincial Agricultural Service and Indian Agricultural Service men; their being in some cases assigned such limits, by their immediate Officers as make them (the Provincial Agricultural Service men) look small and reduce them to all appearances to the level of subordinate non-gazetted assistants, some of whom may be only 3rd class Officers drawing less than Rs. 100 per mensem salary; and their being 2nd class officers (even as some subordinate assistants) their position in other matters, we say, is of such inferiority, that they feel themselves in an uncomfortable situation. The Provincial Agricultural Service men in the College are also without a proper number of assistants due to the under-manning of the Department, so that they are seriously handicapped in attending to research as much as they desire, and which it is very important that they should do.

The Provincial Agricultural Service men, when they were made gazetted Officers, were like the Officers of the Provincial Educational Service, put in the Provincial Government's list, but sometime ago they were transferred to the Financial Commissioner's list, in which their names appear together with those of the Tahsildars. This has affected the status of the Provincial Agricultural Service adversely.

The conditions of salary are such that those who are married cannot afford to give their children even the same standard of education which they themselves have attained.

Their conditions of leave are so rigid that they can get no proper recuperation of their energies, so necessary if one is engaged in teaching which may extend through one's lifetime. It is down on paper (see Director of Agriculture Punjab's letter No. 2904, dated 15th September, 1910), that the Provincial Agricultural Service men are eligible for the experts' posts, but their opportunities to improve themselves under the present conditions are practically nil. We are suggesting proper improvements under the respective heads of Salary and Leave.

The need for larger salaries is felt in the various Departments of public service owing to—

(1) increased cost of living due to (a) dearness of food; Rs. 2 with difficulty go as far as one rupee did some years ago; (b) a general rise in the standard of living; and (c) a rise in servants' wages. Servants who could be engaged on Rs. 4 per mensem with food are now obtained at Rs. 10 per mensem, with food and clothing.

(2) increased expenses of travelling, the railway fares, too, have recently been increased by 50 per cent.;

(3) higher expenses of educating one's children. A student's expenses in an Indian College now average Rs. 45 per mensem, whereas some years ago Rs. 20 or Rs. 25 per mensem was enough.

For men busy with scientific work, this need for increased incomes is rendered still greater by—

(4) scientific hobbies being expensive:

(5) need to go abroad occasionally to widen one's own knowledge and get into line with the latest researches. This need is felt by all scientists, in-

cluding the Indian Agriculture Service men now imported into India;

(6) the fact that the scientific education of their children, combined with post-graduate work and special training, which for higher posts cannot at present be obtained in India and necessitates going abroad, would be much more costly than any other education in the Arts Colleges of India, and costlier than the same scientific education of European children, who have not to go far, and are in many ways helped to obtain their training on comparatively easier terms.

It is only proper to expect that scientists will try to give their children the best scientific education they can afford. In fact, on that hope would rest the future scientific development of India, for if those who would be knowing science intimately may not be inclined to let their boys follow the footsteps of their fathers who else would? In time India will be able to train most of her scientists at home. We would therefore recommend—

(1) that the prospects of the Agricultural department as a whole should be improved;

(2) that there should be no division into Imperial and Provincial Agricultural services, so that differences will consist in the kind of work and scale of pay without the attachment of an indelible mark of inferiority to one grade of service. The abolition of this division would result in greater harmony throughout the service and its single-hearted devotion to one common good—the agricultural development of India;

(3) that the department should from top to bottom be open to Indians, so that the expectation of rising to the highest post in the service would be strong in the hearts of men serving in the lower ranks of the department, and will be an incentive for greater exertions both to them and to students preparing themselves as specialists. There can be no question of listed appointments in the agricultural service, as no administrative needs exist herein (as they do in the Civil Service) rendering a minimum of British officers necessary;

(4) that the different grades in the Agricultural Service should so approach each other that in no case a change from a lower grade into a higher one should appear to be a revolutionary one;

(5) that the present Assistant Professors and Assistant Directors should be made first class officers with an increased starting salary, rising by annual increments to within the first class limits (i.e., above Rs. 500 per mensem). We have suggested a scheme under head IV., and there should be at least one Professor or Assistant Director, first grade, according to that scale for each province;

(6) that rules concerning leave and leave allowances may be so modified as to enable the men to go abroad occasionally on their own responsibility and expense in order to fit themselves for better work. These special rules may be rendered applicable to Indians only when the applicants desire to actually go out of the country;

(7) that there should be no difference in the pay and prospects of Indians and Europeans in the Agricultural Service. We have already shown that the needs of Indian scientists in several important respects (e.g., the scientific education of their children) are higher than those of their European brethren;

(8) that the present posts of Assistant Professors should be styled Professorships. Similar posts in all the private colleges and in some Government institutions are styled Professorships;

(9) that the present "Teaching and Research Assistants" should be styled "Assistant Lecturers and Demonstrators," and one should be attached to each Professor (now styled Assistant Professors);

(10) that men should get up to the maximum of their respective grades, automatically, by annual increments;

(11) that promotions should be on merit and not on mere seniority;

(12) that it may not be essential for a man to wait until he should obtain the maximum of his grade before being appointed to a higher grade.

11 November 1913.]

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL.

[Continued.]

Thus really capable men will be able to rise quickly, and, at no time will there result a block in promotions either for the exceptionally clever or for the average man.

For lower grades than those of the present Assistant Professors and Assistant Directors we would recommend—

(1) that men who have drawn a salary of Rs. 150 per mensem in the general agriculture line for three years be eligible for Tahsildarships;

(2) that men who have drawn a salary of Rs. 250 in the general agriculture line for five years may be eligible for Extra Assistant Commissionerships. We believe that these men, on account of their intimate knowledge of the agriculture of the province, would make good revenue officers. This will also be a harmless additional attraction for Indians to turn towards agriculture.

GS118. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—We have already shown that the conditions of salary of the present Provincial Agricultural Service compare

very unfavourably with those of the Provincial Civil Service, for instance. It is essential, however, that the best Indian youths should come forward to join and remain in the Agricultural service. We also explained why there should be no differentiation in the pay and prospects of Indians and Europeans employed in the department. Our recommendations concerning conditions of salary fall under three heads—

(1) For the present Provincial Agricultural Service men;

(2) for the Indians to be directly recruited as experts according to the method recommended in suggestion (No. 3) under method of recruitment;

(3) for the Agricultural Service, as a whole, incorporating the above two.

(1) For the present Provincial Agricultural Service men, to be styled Professors and Assistant Directors as already recommended, we would suggest that their posts be divided into four grades as under:—

Grade.	Scale of pay.	Time taken to reach maximum salary of scale.	Permanent grade or probationary period.	Recruitment.
IV.	Rs. 250—20—270	1	2 years probationary...	Direct.
III.	275—25 600	13	Permanent ...	From other lower grades of permanent service by selection on merit and from grade IV.
II.	600—50—800	4	Ditto	From grade III by selection on merit.
I.	800—100—1000,	2	Ditto	From grade II by selection on merit.

This scheme presents the following advantages:—

(i) Probationers would be only 2nd class officers during the two years' period of their probation.

(ii) When made permanent they will be 1st class officers, and will therefore be able to mix more freely with officers still higher in rank. Thus there will be closer friendly relations between the two classes, which will be a decided advantage. On the other hand, they will not be far removed from the officers below them, for in the majority of cases they will have been recruited from among them, and in cases of direct appointment to Professorships and Assistant Directorships, the men will have served as 2nd class officers during their two years of probation.

(iii) Apart from the higher salaries, the travelling allowances of College Professors will be negligible. The cases of the present Assistant Professor of Entomology and the Assistant Director of Agriculture, however, who have to do considerable touring, will be different. But they already deserve to

be given 1st class travelling allowances on the same considerations as hold good for Superintendents of Post Offices and for Sub-Divisional Officers who, no matter what their salaries may be, draw 1st class travelling allowances.

(2) As for the Indians to be directly recruited as experts, who should serve part of their probationary period abroad under training, as already recommended, we would suggest the following conditions of salary:—

Rupees 250 per mensem plus travelling expenses (2nd class steamer and rail) and all tuition fees during the whole period of their absence from India.

Rupees 400 per mensem during their one year's probation in India.

Rupees 500 in the grade of Rupees 500—50—1,000, on being appointed permanent.

(3) Incorporating the above suggestions we would recommend the following scheme for the whole of the department:—

—	Grade.	Permanent or probationary.	Scale.	Time taken to rise to maximum salary of scale.
Demonstrators or Assistants in Colleges and Agricultural Assistants	III.	Probationary, two years ...	Rs. 60—5—65	Years.
Do.	II.	Permanent ...	75—5—100	5
Do.	L	Do.	105—9—120	5
"Assistant Lecturers and Demonstrators" or Sub-Assistant Directors	II.	Probationary, two years ...	150—5—155	1
Do.	I.	Permanent ...	160—10—250	9
Professors and Assistant Directors	IV.	Probationary, two years...	250—20—270	1
Do.	III.	Permanent ...	275—25—300	13
Do.	II.	Do.	600—50—800	4
Do.	I.	Do.	800—100—1,000	2
Experts	IV.	(a) European probationary in India for three years	400—30—460	2
		(b) Indian probationary abroad	Rupees 250 per mensem and travelling expenses and tuition fees	Pay fixed for two or three years as the case may be.
		(c) Indian probationer on return to India for one year	Rs. 400	
Experts	III.	Permanent ...	500—50—1,000	10
Do.	II.	Do.	1,000—100—1,500	5
Do.	L	Do.	1,500—100—2,000	5

11 November 1913.]

LALA MANAN MOHAN LAL.

[Continued.]

The Imperial experts at Pusa may be in any of the three permanent grades given for experts. The Directors of Agriculture of Provinces and the Agricultural Advisor to the Government of India, however, should be appointed from among the experts, 1st grade, and given such acting allowances as may be considered to be sufficient in the respective cases.

It will be seen from the suggested scheme that direct appointments may be made to four grades carrying starting salaries of Rupees 60, Rupees 150, Rupees 250, and Rupees 400 per mensem, respectively, so that there will be sufficient latitude for dealing with all grades of intellect when Indians will have specialised themselves in India or abroad on their own expense, and will want to get into Service.

Professors and Assistant Directors of the 3rd grade, viz., those in the grade of Rupees 275—25—600 should be eligible for experts grade III. (Rupees 500—50—1,000), and Professors and Assistant Directors of the 2nd and 1st grades should be eligible for experts grade II. (Rupees 1,000—100—1,500).

68119. (V) Conditions of Leave.—We have already spoken about the importance of going abroad for all scientists. The need is realised by the Indian Agricultural Service men concerning themselves. Much more do Indians stand in need of the same, for simply their living in India will never make them scientists. The conditions of leave under the Civil Service Regulations for the Provincial Services in all departments of public service are not so lenient as for the Imperial Services on the basis, we suppose, that Indians who through the *provincia* services have not to go so far to their homes as the Europeans, who practically monopolise the *Imperial* ranks. That basis is a reasonable one so far as it goes, for a good many departments of public service, but for scientists, whether they be Indians or Europeans, their needs, as we have already shown, are practically the same, with the balance slightly in favour of Indians, if it leans at all. Indians will be going away from their homes into foreign lands, and their expenses on such trips may in many cases be even more than those of people returning to their homes.

We are therefore of opinion—

(1) That the Civil Service Regulations concerning leave, study leave, and furlough now current and as they be modified in future for the Imperial Services, should be applicable to all officers of the Agricultural Service, the maximum salary of whose grades may be at least Rupees 400 per mensem. A reservation may be made that advantage may be taken of those rules only when the applicants are to actually go out of India. In other cases the rules made for Indians in the Provincial Services should apply;

(2) that for all men drawing less than Rupees 500 per mensem the minimum leave allowance should be Rupees 250 per mensem when they go out of India;

(3) that experts, whether Indians or Europeans, should be treated equally for leave and in all other respects. Concerning officers employed in colleges we would submit that the duties connected with teaching are very exacting, so that they stand in special need of recuperating themselves when vacations begin. The European experts go away to the hills, when summer comes, and are all right, but the Indian members of the staff are not allowed to leave the place, where they have been labouring so that they might also get refreshed by a change of surroundings. We do not find it necessary in the interest of work, nor do we regard it of any ultimate advantage that the Indian members of the staff should be compelled to stay in the College throughout the vacations. If any special work requires their presence they would always be found willing to stay, and it will be their own interest that they should spend their vacations so well that it will help them towards their fitness for better employment. We would, therefore, recommend that the same rules should apply as regards vacations in the Agricultural Colleges as are current for the Educational Service in Arts

Colleges, viz.:—(i) that college vacations should be allowed on full pay; (ii) that privilege leave, if necessary, may be taken at other times on half pay. It is, however, only occasionally that officers in the Educational Service take any privilege leave besides enjoying the vacations; and (iii) that college vacations may not be combined with privilege leave, on half pay, except in exceptional cases.

68120. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—Considering that the average age in India as compared to that in the British Isles is very low, and that Indians age comparatively early so that many of them do not live to draw any pension at all, and many of those who fortunately see that day are not able to enjoy their pensions for any considerable length of time; we would suggest:—

(1) that Indians may be allowed to retire on pension at the age of 50 on medical certificate, and at 55 without medical certificate;

(2) that a service of 20 years with medical certificate, and of 25 years without medical certificate should entitle Indians to a pension amounting to half the average salary for the last three years.

In accordance with suggestions made under other heads we would recommend—

(1) that the period spent by Indian Agricultural Officers abroad under the rules usually applied to the Imperial Services should count towards pension;

(2) that the period of probation spent abroad by Indian graduates recruited directly for experts' posts should count towards pension.

68121. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services in Imperial and Provincial.—Non-Europeans are at present practically excluded from the Imperial Agricultural Service. The reason for this exclusion does not appear to be a difference in educational qualifications, for there have been Indians who have had similar European qualifications to those of many of the European graduates appointed to the Imperial Agricultural Service, but they have been excluded from the Imperial rank just as much as those possessing only Indian qualifications. We believe that the division of Services into Imperial (recruited from abroad) and Provincial (recruited within India) with a distinctive mark of inferiority attached to the latter, naturally creates the impression in people's minds that the Imperial Service is meant exclusively for Europeans and the Provincial Service for Indians. The distinction, coupled with the fact that higher officials soon get so accustomed to meeting only Europeans in the Imperial grades, that the suggestion of any change in that respect gives them an unpleasant start. We believe that officials in the highest places who can and do take a statesmanlike view of things are free from such prejudice, but it does exist in the lower ranks, and the attitude of responsible recommending officials is often able to neutralise the good intentions which may exist in higher quarters.

Another limitation which exists in the employment of Indians for higher appointments is that in many cases they are denied those posts on the excuse of their being too young, while men considerably younger and with less experience are continually imported for those very posts from abroad. It has become a general rule that before an Indian should be appointed to a post in the Imperial grade he must get pretty nearly old. It seems to us that at the back of it all is the fear that if an Indian is appointed to a higher post while he is in the vigour of his manhood, he may become a very senior officer before the time of his retirement should approach. There can be nothing else against it except that some junior European officers may feel it as an unpleasant situation.

The working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial is not satisfactory as a system. It brands one service as inferior, rendering it of a very low status and leading many men in the Imperial Service to treat the Provincial Service men with insufficient consideration. Exceptions do occur in this respect, but they

11 November 1913.]

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL

[Continued.]

only prove the rule. There is thus no friendly intercourse between the two services, and a common *esprit de corps* is not created.

We believe that the abolition of the distinction into Imperial and Provincial Agricultural Services, and the having of one general Agricultural Service for India which would include posts in various grades of salary, as already suggested, would meet the difficulty, and ensure the service being such a contented one that not only will it reflect itself in an evident popularisation of the department, but a decided start of the Indian people in the path of agricultural progress will soon become manifest.

68122. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—We have submitted that in our opinion men employed in the general agriculture line would make useful Revenue Officers. We have suggested that from among these men (i) officers who have been drawing a monthly salary of Rs. 150 (the maximum of their scale of pay) for three years, should be eligible for Tahsildarship; (ii) officers who have been drawing Rs. 250 per mensem salary (which may be the maximum of their scale of pay) for five

years should be eligible of Extra Assistant Commissionership.

68123. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.—Lately Government has issued a rule that those serving in the Civil Departments of service as opposed to the military, will in future not be awarded any agricultural land on their retirement from service, as was done previously. We believe that in many cases it will be a good thing for agricultural officers to be given agricultural land on their retirement, to which they may continue to devote their attention in their old age. In many cases their boys too will be found to have interested themselves in agriculture, so that the awarded land will usually remain in good hands. In our opinion, therefore, it would be well if Government would make that rule inapplicable to the Agricultural Service. It will also be a desirable thing, in our opinion, if men employed in the Agricultural Service are treated as "agriculturists" under the Punjab Land Alienation Act, so long as they continue in, or retire on pension, from that service.

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL called and examined.

68124. (Chairman.) Witness was an Assistant Professor of Entomology and also did research work. He had only been in the Service about two years. He had spent one year at Pusa. He had not been to Europe, but obtained his specialised training in Entomology at Pusa.

68125. He would like to see India made the exclusive recruiting ground for the Agricultural Service. He did not suggest any immediate reduction of European Scientists, but only gradually as the measures for promoting the growth of Indian Scientists succeed. A great deal must be done to give further facilities than at present existed for that advanced teaching which was necessary to qualify an Indian for higher posts of independent original work in the Agricultural Department. He must be sent abroad for a couple of years to receive a scientific training as soon as he showed any special capacity for scientific work. At present the Agricultural Service was not popular among Indians, owing to the lack of prospects. Other departments of public service offered better lucrative careers for Indian youths. He agreed with the view that in selecting Indians for primarily practical agricultural posts, e.g., Deputy and Assistant Directorships and Professorships and Assistant Professorships of Agriculture, preference should be given to those who had lived on the land and to those who have gained by education an intimate knowledge of the land. But no very close association with land is essential for specialised sciences such as Entomology or Mycology. He thought most of the sons of landowners received a good type of education at the Indian universities, but they did not do so with a view of entering the Agricultural Department. Given the opportunity and a fair field and open prospects, he thought they would turn their minds in that direction. He had derived full benefit from the year he had spent at Pusa. He did not think it would have benefited him to stay there longer. In his opinion, the man who had received his general agricultural education in India, or had passed through a regular university course in science and then had undergone a post-graduate course at Pusa and in England, would become the best officer for the Service. Thus at present two methods of recruiting Indians in the Imperial Service are available in India:—

(i) Education at the Agricultural College plus Pusa training for directly agricultural posts.

(ii) Education at the universities plus post-graduate work at Pusa, for posts in specialised subjects as Entomology, Mycology, Chemistry, etc.

68126. In both cases European training should be given. With regard to the proposal that Pusa should be made into a central training institution and facilities should not be given to Indian youths

for going abroad for scientific studies, he did not think there was in India the same scientific atmosphere as there was in European and American countries, and men got wider views by going abroad. In the interests of proper scientific development in India, Indians should be encouraged to go abroad as often as possible. There was no professor of Entomology in his college, so that he was carrying out the whole work of the Province in the Entomological branch. In other branches where there were professors, the assistant professors had to do most of the teaching work. They did about three or four hours' lecturing every day, with the result that there was practically no time left for research. Practically, the professors were doing the research work and the assistants were doing the teaching.

68127. With regard to the suggested scale of salaries proposed in his written statement, his idea was that the Provincial Agricultural Service men who are gazetted officers should rise automatically to Rs. 600. At present they go up to Rs. 400 only and remain second-class officers. They should be made first-class officers; it would improve their status, which is very desirable, as some of them, e.g., the Assistant Directors of Agriculture and the Assistant Professor of Entomology daily come in contact with the District Officers all over the Province.

68128. Beyond Rs. 600 rise to second and first grade should be on ability. Only men who show special capacity would get to them.

68129. He recommended that pension should be payable to officers after 25 years' service because the work of the Department was so exacting, and Indians in India became comparatively old at an early age. Most Indians died before they had enjoyed their pensions many years. He believed the average age of recruitment to the Provincial Service at the present time was 24 to 25, so that the average age for a Provincial Officer on retirement was about 55. A comparatively small proportion of Indians survived that age.

68130. He desired to see the amalgamation of the Imperial and Provincial Services into one general Agricultural Service for India, which should be divided into four grades, carrying starting salaries of Rs. 60, Rs. 150, Rs. 250, and Rs. 400 per mensem, respectively. Recruitment into each of those grades would be from the next lower class, as well as by direct entry. The double entry would be a distinct gain, as it gives latitude for dealing with all grades of intellect. The scheme involved a considerable upheaval of the present system. But it would overcome all practical difficulties of the amalgamation of the Imperial and Provincial Services. An imported European would always begin in the highest grade

11 November 1913.]

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL.

[Continued.]

— the grade of experts—hence under the scheme he was recommending the amalgamation of the two services would not adversely affect his status. And an Indian who comes in the Provincial Service now would begin in the humble grade of Rs. 250 and he would go into the higher grades only when he earns it by hard meritorious work. And this gradation of the Service would improve the status of Indians. The idea was that the Indian element in the higher Agricultural Service must be strengthened. And there should be no such invidious distinction between the Europeans and Indians in the service, as the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial necessarily creates. Agriculture was domestic industry, and if Indians were available, they should be given an opportunity of service. The present grades of pay for the Indians in the Service were very low and did not attract a suitable class of man to stick to the Service. He comes to the Department for a short period to gain experience. If the prospects were made better, if there was no division of the Service into Provincial and Imperial, and if there was no invidious distinction between men in the same grade, Indians of higher education would be attracted to the Department and stick to it. He admitted that those objects could be in part at any rate attained without such a complete reconstruction as he suggested. The chief thing was to encourage scientific training along with agricultural studies amongst Indian youths and the abolition of distinction into Imperial and Provincial Services, so that Indians could expect to rise to higher posts, and in the opinion of the members of the Provincial Service the scheme they have suggested regarding posts in various grades of salary will give about the best and most practical solution of the problem.

68131. (Mr. Gokhale.) The reason why Mr. Gopal had not attended before the Committee was because he had left the Service for another appointment in Kashmir. Mr. Gopal had been in the Agricultural Provincial Service, and his qualifications were excellent. He was an M.A. of the Punjab University and an M.R.A.C. and N.D.C., etc., of England. He had left the Department because the prospects were not good enough for him. His grade here was Rs. 250—Rs. 400, yearly increment Rs. 12-8. His salary in Kashmir started at Rs. 400, rising to Rs. 800. Witness, himself, before he joined the Department, took a Bachelor of Science Degree in the Punjab Institute, getting into the second class. He was then deputed by the Government to undergo a course of training at Pusa while he was holding the post of Assistant Professor. All the research work in the Department was performed by himself, in addition to which he had to do five hours' teaching work a week. A European with European qualifications holding the post witness at present held would have been designated Professor and would have been in the Imperial Service.

68132. It would be of great advantage to the country that qualified men after retirement should stay in the country. The practical experience they had gained during their term of office would not be lost to the country. Thus an Indian could serve his country even after retirement and could do work which would be useful to the country. He admitted having made a mistake when, in answer to the Chairman, he said most men connected with the land received a good education. What he meant was that the big landowning class who derive their income from land, mostly through agents, give their boys good education and seek careers for them in the Public Services of the country, and a sufficient number of these young men could be available for the Agricultural Department. But the vast majority of men who in practice are directly connected with land, who work on it, do not send their boys to Universities or to higher

schools. He drew a line between these two classes who have connection with land. One has only an indirect connection while the other has a real and direct connection. The vast majority of such men did not go to the Universities, but stayed at home. He saw the necessity of developing some one institution in India, so that Indians could cease to depend altogether upon foreign countries for their training, but under the present conditions there was no such institution in India. He would, therefore, institute a number of scholarships to send suitable young men to foreign countries, and fill whatever vacancies occurred in the Department from among the scholarship-holders. He believed such a scheme would give satisfaction to the young men of the country. There was considerable dissatisfaction amongst men of his own class who felt that a sufficient number of practical careers were not open to them.

68133. So far as he was aware, the Agricultural Colleges were not full. The instruction was given in English. The education at these Colleges was too expensive for the small zemindars and the large zemindars did not seem to be attracted by it. It does not pay them to educate their boys for managing their lands and so they send them to schools and Universities which offer better prospects for getting out into service. He believed if the course of instruction was made satisfactory, and if better Government appointments, both in the Agricultural Department and in the Revenue Service, were thrown open to College diplomas who show interest in land, they might be attracted to the Colleges.

68134. (Mr. Sly.) He had not been connected with the land prior to starting his career, nor did he find at the Punjab University any large proportion of students directly connected with the land; there were some sons of cultivators, but not a very large number. One reason why that class had not been attracted to the Agricultural Colleges was that the Department, during the comparatively short period of its existence, had not been able to any great extent to win the confidence of the cultivating classes. They also desired Government appointments, and they would accept positions in the Indian Agricultural Service provided the prospects were good enough. In India, owing to economic conditions, there could be very few workers in the field of science outside the ranks of Government officers.

68135. The course of Entomology at the College was very elementary; it did not compare with the course that had been laid down with regard to Chemistry. That was the reason why there was only an Assistant Professor for this particular subject, but he has all the Provincial work and an Imperial Service man in his Provincial capacity is not called a Professor but an Economic Entomologist or Economic Botanist or Agricultural Chemist, as the case may be.

68136. (Mr. Madje.) The only suggestion he could put forward for attracting zemindars to join the Department was the affiliation of the Colleges to a University. Under present conditions scope is very limited for Agricultural students, but if they be given a University degree they can get out into all branches of the Public Services. There were small vernacular classes for small landholders in the Colleges meant for those who cannot afford much time and money on education.

68137. At Lyallpur he performed research, professional and provincial work. By the last he meant popularising the work of his section amongst the people. When an experiment had been carried out, he tried to introduce it amongst the people. A couple of zemindars were selected in the beginning to test the method, and if it was successful, it spread from place to place. That work was done under his advise and supervision. Most of the administrative work was performed by the Director of Agriculture. He (the witness) undertook provincial work under the Director's supervision.

(The witness withdrew.)

22 January 1914.]

At Calcutta, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

E. J. WOODHOUSE, Esq., Principal of the Sabour Agricultural College, Bihar and Orissa.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department, being letters from E. J. Woodhouse, Esq., Principal, Agricultural College, and Economic Botanist to the Government of Bihar and Orissa, to the Director of Agriculture, Bihar and Orissa. (A) No. 287, dated Sabour, the 5th-10th March, 1913; and (B) No. 1,330, dated the 13th July, 1913.

(A)—LETTER OF 5TH-10TH MARCH, 1913.

68138. On behalf of the members of the Imperial Agricultural Service stationed in this province I have the honour to request you to be kind enough to address Government on the subject of the pay and prospects of our Service with a view to the discussion by the Civil Service Commission of the disadvantages under which we labour. I would suggest the following points for consideration:—

(1) The present sanctioned pay of the Service is at the rate of Rupees 400, 430, and 460 during the first three years in the case of supernumeraries, and after that the pay of the regular establishment rises by annual increments at the rate Rupees 50 per annum from Rupees 500 to Rupees 1,000 at the end of ten years, but it has been always more or less hoped that this was a temporary measure only intended to tide over the first years of the existence of the Service. At the present time this scale of pay is augmented by extra allowances in the case of some few officers who have reached the maximum and have particular qualifications for bargaining with Government.

(2) Under the present system candidates are either appointed as supernumeraries on Rupees 400, 430, and 460 with a view to their undergoing further training in India before being posted to the regular establishment, or are appointed on Rupees 500 direct to posts on the regular establishment. It might be expected that when supernumeraries have completed their training and been posted to substantive appointments similar to those held by persons appointed on the Rupees 500 grade, they should also be promoted to this grade pay, but this has not been the case. Supernumeraries have frequently been promoted to substantive posts, but are always retained on the pay of the supernumerary grade, and so continue throughout their Service to draw Rupees 150 per mensem less than other officers, who have in some cases been appointed to precisely similar posts at the same time and after the same length of service.

(3) Again, in the case of those who commence on the Rupees 400, 430, and 460, grade free quarters are allowed, but house rent is deducted from officers on the Rupees 500 grade, with the result that when supernumeraries have served three years and are judged worthy of confirmation in the Service on the Rupees 500 grade they find that they are drawing less pay than in the previous year. In my own case I drew (Rupees 460 less income tax Rupees 10-7-6) Rupees 449-8-6 per mensem in my third year and (Rupees 500 less Rupees 50 house rent and Rupees 11-6-1 income tax) Rupees 438-9-11 per mensem in my fourth year. It would seem hardly fair that officers should suffer in pocket from receiving nominal increases of pay.

(4) Under the present rules officers reach their maximum pay (Rupees 1,000) in from 10 to 13 years of entering the service and then they remain on that pay until the date of their retirement, while

the pay of officers of equal standing in other services is steadily increasing. It is believed that the Secretary of State had decided to consider the whole question when a sufficient number of officers are within reasonable distance of the maximum. Whether this is admitted or not, however, it does not alter the fact that there is at present nothing to tempt good men to remain in the Department for more than the time necessary to enable them to show their worth with a view to obtaining appointments elsewhere. Some of the best men have already left the Service on obtaining more satisfactory posts elsewhere. Moreover, the present low rates of pay are bound to influence recruiting adversely. There are perhaps always a very large number of applicants for appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service, but it is obviously very difficult to obtain candidates of the required standard.

(5) I would also point out that the smallness of our numbers precludes any addition to our pay by frequent appointment to posts on a higher grade, while officers of that grade are on leave. In other services it is found that the income of officers is sensibly augmented by such acting allowances.

(6) In addition to these considerations it must be remembered that prices are steadily rising, and so even apart from the above considerations pay that might have been considered adequate before 1905 is not adequate at the present time. Reference to the official figures for prices and wages in India will show that the price of common rice at Patna stood at an average of Rupees 2-8 per maund during the years 1901-1905, when the organisation of the Department was being worked out and recruiting was first commenced, while the price has since risen to an average of Rupees 4 per maund for the years 1906-11, an increase which has, of course, also influenced the price of labour.

(7) That the Service is beginning to justify its existence can be readily seen from a perusal of the published reports of the Agricultural Departments. In the case of this province, for example, the work done against one insect pest alone has enabled the cultivators over an area of ten thousand acres to reap a full crop for the first time for some fifteen years. The annual saving of some three or more lakhs of rupees as a result of one piece of the Department's work would seem to justify liberal treatment of the Service responsible for this result.

(8) In view of the above considerations I would put forward the following tentative proposals for improving the pay and prospects of the members of the Indian Agricultural Service.—

(i) That officers only draw pay on the supernumerary grade until such time as they are gazetted to substantive posts.

(ii) That the maximum pay of the Service be increased from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 1,750 in the marginally-noted grade.

Supernumerary Rs. 400, 430 and 460.

Establishment grade 3 Rs. 500-50-1,000.

 " 2 Rs. 1,000-50-1,500.

 " 1 Rs. 1,750.

(iii) That the post of Director of Agriculture be thrown open to members of the Service on an additional allowance of Rs. 300 per month, with such other local or house allowances to which heads of other Departments are entitled.

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. WOODHOUSE.

[Continued.]

(iv) That the maximum pension be earned after 25 years' service (and not after 30 years as at present) and that a smaller pension be granted after 20 years' service, as in the case of the Forest and other Departments.

(v) That the amount of the pension be increased in proportion to the increase in salary proposed in paragraph 3) and that additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 now granted only to the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India be granted also to holders of the posts of Provincial Directors of Agriculture and to a proportionate number of those who have devoted themselves with marked success to research rather than to the no more arduous duties of administration.

(B)—LETTER OF 13TH JULY, 1913.

(9) I have the honour to address you on the subject of the work that has been placed in my charge as Principal of the Sabour Agricultural College and Economic Botanist to the Bihar and Orissa Government. The duties of Principal were added to my other duties from 18th June, 1911, and since then my time was taken up largely in getting to understand this branch of work, and studying the problems involved. As a result of the experience that I have gained, I should like to inform you that I am thoroughly dissatisfied with the present state of affairs at Sabour, and to warn you that no useful results whatever are likely to be obtained under the present conditions.

(10) *ECONOMIC BOTANIST'S WORK.*—Before discussing the College work, I propose to deal briefly with that of the Biological Section.

Botanical work up to 1911.—Previous to my appointment as Principal, I had been able to devote all my time to botanical work, and was producing satisfactory results on the following lines. As soon as I arrived in Bhagalpur in April, 1908, I took steps to start plant-breeding work without delay. In the absence of any suitable paddy land at Sabour at that time, I devoted myself to the study of the millets and pulses, and later took up sugarcane work with Mr. Taylor. Up to the present time this work has resulted in the publication of a Memoir on Soybeans, a short note on *Setaria Italica*, besides which sufficient material has been collected for Memoirs on sugarcane and the genus *Phaseolus*, which will be published whenever I have any time available to write up my notes.

In addition, I was placed in charge of the work of reorganising the exhibitions, and as a result of three years' work, during which time I collected samples of and compiled information concerning all the crops of the province, and made a careful study of the results obtained by the Department and the best methods of attracting and retaining the interest of the public in the Department's recommendations, I worked out an efficient system of conducting exhibitions, and prepared summaries of the Department's recommendations, and also two handbooks containing full directions for the conduct of exhibitions for the use of Secretaries of Exhibitions and the Department's officers. Owing to the neglect of my recommendations as regards the staff required by any scheme for getting into touch with the public, no further progress has been made since I relinquished the supervision of the work in 1912.

The crop-pest work of the Department was placed under my charge from its initiation, and in addition to the publication of a handbook on the pests of the province, the field work has resulted in the prevention of the destruction formerly caused each year by *Agrotis* on 15,000 bighas of the Mokameh Tal (the value of the crop saved being $2\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs of rupees), and in the introduction of a method of storing potatoes to prevent the very considerable losses caused by the potato moth at Patna and elsewhere.

The teaching work necessitated the formation of a botanic garden, the collection of materials for teaching morphology and the compilation of a descriptive and biological account of the local flora—all of which was making steady progress up to June, 1911.

Position in 1911.—At the time when I was called

upon to take over charge of the Principal's duties it was my intention to complete the scientific side of the plant-breeding work on soybeans and sugarcane as soon as possible, and to take up the subject of paddy as soon as I had put the teaching work on a satisfactory footing by the preparation of a text book or a series of lecture notes, and by the publication of a local flora. The organisation of a commercial market garden and a nursery garden (attached to the Botanic Garden) for the supply of seeds and plants of ornamental varieties would also be required if the horticultural teaching was to be made a practical success. The crop-pest work only required extension on the same lines.

(11) *Present position.*—Since June, 1911, I have attempted to carry on the above programme of botanical work, but I have found it quite impossible to give sufficient time to it to enable the efficiency hitherto attained to be maintained. I have been able to continue the crop-pest work already in hand but in a very much less thorough manner. Very little field-work in plant-breeding has been possible, with the result that I am not able to follow up the results already obtained. The only time available has been devoted to the preparation of reports or to the routine work of carrying on my cultures until such time as I may be able to deal with them. A vegetable garden has been started, but I am not able to give proper attention to it or to the Botanic Garden. No time can be devoted to the improvement of the courses of instruction or to the training of the staff.

(12) It will be seen from the above that, whereas between May, 1908, and June, 1911, I was able to place the Biological Section of the Department's work on a sound footing and to produce results of value (it will be found that about three-quarters of the original papers published by the Department in recent years have originated in my section), since June, 1911, I have only been able to write up the results previously obtained, and to carry on some of my unfinished work, but in a much less efficient manner. It is not surprising, therefore, to find that this branch of the work no longer affords me any satisfaction, and can produce no further results likely to be of economic value. If it is desired to continue both the plant-breeding and teaching work on efficient lines, I should recommend that two botanists be stationed at Sabour, one of whom will do plant breeding and the other supervise the teaching and crop-pest work. Such a scheme is, I believe, already in operation in Madras. I should of course prefer to continue my plant-breeding work, as I consider that there are great possibilities before it. While the botanical work has only recently given cause for dissatisfaction, the same cannot be said of the college work which would appear to have been founded upon a misapprehension. To understand the difficulties of the situation it will be necessary to study the College work in all its bearings.

(13) *PRINCIPAL'S WORK.*—*Duties of Principal*—I was placed in charge of the College work in June, 1911, in place of Mr. Dodds transferred to Pusa. I undertook this branch of the work in addition to my own duties, as it appeared to be obvious that the problem of the College teaching was then the largest problem before the Department and on it depended the future of the Department.

The amount of miscellaneous work which has to be done by the Principal is very large; in the first place, there is a considerable amount of administrative work in connection with the management of the estate. This work is greater than it should be on account of the delays that have occurred in laying out the estate due to the absence of funds. In the second place, the routine work of organising the teaching work, managing the hotel, checking the accounts and answering correspondence is heavy. This amount of work is quite sufficient to occupy the Principal's time, in addition to the supervision of the teaching of his own subject; and it is quite impossible for him to carry out satisfactory research work as well. The clerical staff is by no means large, and the pay offered has not been sufficient to attract really first-class men, so that an unnecessarily large part of my time has to be devoted to routine work which

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. WOODHOUSE.

[Continued.]

should be done by an efficient head clerk. The appointment of a head clerk on Rs. 100 per month would undoubtedly take a great deal of unnecessary routine work and worry off my shoulders, and would leave me free to tackle the larger problems.

In addition to his routine duties, the Principal is presumably expected to work out a proper scheme of education for the College and it is because I am certain that the policy which has led to the founding of the College on its present lines is a hopeless one that I am addressing you now. To make my position clear, it will be necessary to preface a statement of my views with a brief account of the history of the College.

(14) *Objects of the College.*—As regards the origin of the College I have always thought that the Provincial Agricultural Colleges scattered over India were founded by Lord Curzon as a part of his general scheme for providing facilities for technical education with the object of encouraging the educated classes to turn their attention to a business life rather than to Government service. The policy laid down for these colleges, has not, however, followed these lines hitherto. The standard curriculum drafted by the Board of Agriculture at Pusa, in 1906, laid down that the object of the colleges was to turn out students (*vide* proceedings of the Board of Agriculture, 1906, item 5a) "with a general knowledge of agriculture which would fit them for upper subordinate posts in the Agricultural Department and for employment as Managers of Court of Wards and private Estates." Subsequent experience modified the opinion of the Board, and in 1908 the Board made the following alteration in the above sentence (*vide* proceedings of the Board of Agriculture, 1908, item 73)—"which would fit them for managing their own or private estates, for employment as Managers of Court of Wards Estates, and for upper subordinate posts in the Agricultural Department."

In his speech, made on the occasion of the opening of the College in August 17th, 1908, Sir Andrew Fraser touched on the importance of technical education and drew attention to the uselessness of attempting to train men who were not hereditary agriculturists, but he laid particular stress on the fact that it was experts and executive officers for the Agricultural Department that it was expected to train at the College. In addition, he hoped that land stewards for zamindars' estates would come to the college and that short courses for zamindars would be established at the College or in schools staffed by passed students of the College. The next official pronouncement as regards the purpose of the College will be found in Government Resolution No. 770, of February 19th, 1910, in which it is stated that "the training in the College is not intended to provide an avenue to the Provincial and Subordinate Executive Services and that Government will not recognise the agricultural degree as a qualification for appointment to those services or for the management of an estate under the Court of Wards. The gist of this pronouncement was incorporated in the prospectus, paragraph 3." "The training will fit students for employment in the Agricultural Department and on private estates The diploma will not be regarded as a qualification for Government employment outside the Agricultural Department."

(15) *Curriculum of Diploma Course.*—A standard curriculum for the Provincial Agricultural Colleges in India was first prepared by the Board of Agriculture, in 1906, and this was slightly modified at the subsequent Board Meeting in 1908. In 1909 it became necessary to consider the curriculum for the Sabour College and it was decided to follow the spirit of the Board's recommendations (*vide* resolution 9), that the preliminary science training should occupy the first two years of the course and the technical instruction in Agriculture should be given in the later years (*vide* Mr. Dobbs' demissio, No. 528, of 5th June, 1909). These proposals were accepted by Government. Mr. Dobbs was transferred in 1911, and Mr. Sherrard expressed himself incapable of undertaking the sole charge of the

students in the third year, so that it became necessary to alter the Time Table to that given in the standard curriculum, page 1. In June, 1912, Mr. McGowan took over the agricultural teaching.

(16) *Previous proposals of increasing popularity of College.*—In the course of my work I could not fail to notice that the students were extremely dissatisfied with the openings before them on leaving the College, and that it was likely that the numbers of students admitted would therefore decrease. On this account, in February, 1912, I wrote a note on the policy of the Department with regard to the College, in which it was shown that the number of admissions to other agricultural Colleges appeared to depend almost entirely on the number of posts under Government that were available. In the absence of such inducements to enter this College the passed students would have to depend on private service, and so I proposed that an Appointment Bureau should be created for the purpose of bringing together land-holders and students requiring posts as land-stewards. At the same time the steady fall in the numbers of admissions due to the uncertain prospects made it appear necessary to take steps to ensure that the Department obtained sufficient recruits annually to replenish wastage and to fill new posts, as they were necessitated by the development of the Department. It therefore appeared to me to be advisable to publish some three years in advance an approximate list of the prospective annual vacancies. These suggestions were not accepted. I have also consulted various people regarding a scheme for starting one of the students on a farm at Government expense, but in view of the difficulty of obtaining lands and the chances of failure in our present state of knowledge and the harm such an occurrence would do, I have not pushed it.

(17) *Short Courses.*—A short vernacular course in Agriculture was first organised by Mr. McGowan in August, 1912, for the purpose of teaching improved methods of agriculture to cultivators and zamindars. The course lasted six months. In addition to the practical field work a few lectures were given in Botany, Horticulture, Surveying, Zamindari and Veterinary work, as it was considered not to be advisable to keep the students working in the field continuously. Nine students attended the course, of whom only one did not know English. The course has been continued during the present year and has been divided into two three months' courses covering the *bhado* and *rabi* seasons, respectively. It was also intended that the English-speaking students who would take both courses should be given some instruction in elementary science, but only one student has availed himself of this. There are seven students taking this course at present.

(18) *Admission of students into Diploma Course.*—In selecting students for admission into the first session of the College care was taken by Mr. Dobbs to impress on each candidate that Government service was not guaranteed to successful students. Since then, this policy has been continued and all applicants for admission are informed that Government service is not guaranteed to passed students of the College, but they are expected to make use of their knowledge in farming or in the management of private estates. The figures for admission give a good indication of the relative popularity of Government service and private enterprise. In 1910 there were 550 applications for 20 vacancies, but these were reduced to 190 when it was understood that there were no prospects of employment outside the Agricultural Department. Eventually 24 students were admitted of whom two were wards of Government. In 1912, 39 applications were received for 40 vacancies and 12 students entered the College. In 1913, 31 applications were received for 40 vacancies and six students, including two scholars, eventually joined, of whom one student and one scholar have since left. A large proportion of the applicants only desire Government service, and on being informed that such employment is not guaranteed to passed students they immediately find that

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. WOODHOUSE.

[Continued.]

family or other reasons prevent them from attending the College.

It is probable that a slightly larger number of students would seek admission if the last date for receiving applications for admission was postponed until June, and the commencement of the first session till July, in order to enable students who have just passed the Matriculation to apply and to take the course immediately after passing the Matriculation. This suggestion was made by Mr. Taylor in May, 1912, but was not accepted. In any case, the increase in the number of students is likely to be small. It is difficult, therefore, to consider the figures cited above as anything but a proof of the unpopularity of the College.

(19) *Reason for failure of College.*—The figures for admissions show clearly that the College has steadily decreased in popularity since it has been realised that it is not likely to be an avenue to Government Service. The absence of any demand for agricultural education can be ascribed to numerous causes. First, as regards the artificial demand caused by appointments in Government Service:—

(1) The diploma given by the College is of no value as a qualification for service outside the Agricultural Department; in 1910 the applications were reduced from 550 to 190 when this was made known.

(2) No statement has ever been made as to the number and pay of the appointments that are likely to fall vacant in the cadre of the Agricultural Departments of the Provinces concerned, so that there is no encouragement for prospective candidates for such posts to attend the College.

In the absence of any definite proposals for appointments in Government Service the guardians of prospective students must naturally consider very carefully the prospects of employment which are likely to result from the three years spent in obtaining the diploma. Such prospects of employment can only be of two kinds: (1) private service under land-holders as land-stewards or farm managers, or (2) farming.

A few applications for men to fill posts of land-stewards have been received and such applications always lay stress on the fact that experienced practical men are required. It is not likely that the demand for this class of men will increase until passed students of the College have proved their mettle. The fact that Government refuses to employ them in khasmahals and estates under the Court of Wards does not tend to encourage other land-holders to do so.

In coming to the question of the possibilities of farming as a profitable occupation for the educated middle classes, we have reached the crux of the problem. I have talked over this question with many people competent to judge regarding it and the general consensus of opinion would appear to be that under the conditions brought about by the permanent settlement it would be extremely difficult for a man to become a tenant farmer on a large scale and a zamindari manager or owner would not be able to make adequate profits from the cultivation of his scattered khas lands. It must also be borne in mind that a farmer who had undergone an expensive education would expect to be able to realise sufficiently large profits to enable him to maintain a position befitting his education. To do this he would require considerable capital and it is extremely improbable that this will be available in the case of a young man of the class under consideration. Again, up to the present a sufficiently large body of fact has not been collected to prove either that capitalist agriculture can be made to pay or to show what system of agriculture should be employed.

(20) *Criticism of present agricultural policy.*—Enough has been said above to show what is the position of the diploma course to-day; it now remains to indicate the lines on which the College teaching should be developed if it is to be of any service to the agricultural interests of the province. But before considering the educational edifice itself, it is necessary to make absolutely certain of the foundations.

(21) *Foundations of technical instruction omitted.*—The first essential to any scheme of scientific or technical education is a sufficient ground work of fact. It appears, however, that this principle was lost sight of when it was decided to improve Indian agriculture by the foundation of a College in each province simultaneously with the laying out of the experimental stations for the purpose of accumulating facts on which to base an improved system of agriculture.

In Bengal and in Bihar this mistake has been accentuated by the fact that the experimental stations have been multiplied without an adequate complement of expert officers to work each one of them. Such a mistake would naturally arise where the control of scientific work is put in the hands of officers accustomed to administrative work in which the independent work of a number of scattered offices is usually supervised by one superior officer. In consequence, the single Deputy Director has spent all his time in trains instead of on his farm and so has been unable to obtain any results himself, and has also been unable to ensure that any of the results produced by any of the managers of any of his farms are in any way reliable, with the result that the expenditure of large sums of money has produced no results of value.

This will appear to be a sweeping statement, but I can speak with some authority, as I have studied the farm reports very carefully, as can be seen from the summaries of the recommendations made by the Department which I compiled from the farm reports when in charge of the exhibitions. In perusing them it must be remembered that the list of recommended crops noted therein was objected to by me as unsuitable for distribution on account of their being impure local varieties instead of pure strains produced under careful supervision; and that Mr. Sherrard's observations on the work of the farm managers has since shown that it is very unlikely that their work has been sufficiently accurate to produce reliable results from the experiments carried out by them.

It is therefore necessary to preface any suggestions regarding the future of the College by pointing out that the College had to commence giving a course of technical instruction in Agriculture to prospective farmers before any improved system of farming has been worked out. At the present time an educated man who wished to farm would probably find it less expensive to spend his time learning the rule of thumb technical methods of agriculture from the ordinary cultivators. The College teaching must at present be confined mostly to science and to the principles of good agricultural practice as worked out in Europe, and is therefore only suitable to training Government servants for the purpose of working out the problems of Indian agriculture. The only private persons who would be likely to take such a course would be wealthy men who are willing to do pioneer work for the pleasure of it rather than for hope of profit. Unfortunately such a class does not appear to exist in India. In these circumstances it is not likely that the diploma course will attract many students until a paying system of agriculture has been worked out.

The means hitherto used to work out a paying system of agriculture have been ineffectual because it has been assumed that the amount of progress made depends on the number of farms opened by the Department under the supervision of a minimum qualified supervising staff. It is to be hoped that the complete failure of the agricultural work hitherto will lead to the provision of a largely increased staff of well-qualified Deputy Directors who will each be given a farm and a uniform tract in which to work. When such an organisation has been in existence some years and has made itself felt in the local agriculture, then only will a genuine economic demand for advanced agricultural technical education begin to be felt.

(22) *Defects in personnel.*—The next essential in technical instruction is an expert instructor provided with the best equipment. In this case no attempt has been made to meet these requirements.

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. Woodhouse.

[Continued.]

The first Professor of Agriculture started work here on 12th August, 1907, and since that time four officers have been in charge of the farm and agricultural teaching, a new officer being appointed to take charge of the agricultural teaching yearly (*vide* the subjoined table). The difficulties of the Professor of Agriculture are also increased by the frequent transfer of the more efficient of his overseers to other farms.

of English, so that they cannot understand the lectures and oral work, besides which their general education is defective so that much time is wasted while they are being grounded in English and mathematics. Much time could also be saved if only students who had been well grounded in science at the university were admitted. The curriculum also contains obvious defects which are attributable to the fact that it was prepared before

Name. (1)	Date of arrival in India. (2)	Appointments. (3)	Date of appointment. (4)	Date of transfer. (5)	Remarks. (6)
H. H. Corbin	Principal and Professor of Agriculture.	12th August, 1907.*	24th August, 1908.	*Office transferred to Sabour
A. C. Dobbs ...	17th October, 1906.	Principal and Professor of Agriculture, also Acting Deputy Director of Agriculture.	24th August, 1908. 30th March, 1911.	15th June, 1911.	
G. C. Sherrard ...	19th November, 1908.	Professor of Agriculture and also Acting Deputy Director of Agriculture.	15th June, 1911.	2nd October, 1912.	
N. S. McGowan ...	23rd February, 1912.	Professor of Agriculture ...	2nd October, 1912.	...	Also does wheat work in Bhangalpur Division.

The objections to this arrangement are sufficiently obvious. The new officers are usually less experienced than those transferred elsewhere. No officer has been permitted to stay here long enough to study local conditions and to understand the local difficulties. Each new officer has differed from his predecessor in some points and so has not carried on his predecessor's work in those points; he has also taken some time in picking up the work, so that much time and money has been wasted in laying out the farm and initiating the experimental work. Many of the officers have been given district work to do in addition to the College work, which has prevented them from giving proper attention to the College work. It is, therefore, to be expected that the management of the Sabour Farm has never been brought up to that degree of efficiency which must be attained to make the technical instruction in any way convincing.

The frequent transfers have also resulted in hopeless want of continuity in the teaching. The views of each succeeding officer have differed from those of his predecessors, but none of them have had sufficient time to study the question properly. The unpopularity of the teaching work as compared with independent research and the frequency of transfers have led each agriculturist to think and hope that his stay at Sabour will be short, and so proper attention has not been paid to the working out of a suitable course of agricultural teaching. It must be recognised that in this Department it is the man that counts, and that one officer cannot possibly carry on the work of his predecessor in the same way as in the administrative branches of Government Service.

A sound course of agricultural teaching can never be worked out until a whole-time officer with considerable Indian experience has been in charge of the teaching at Sabour for some years and has made a thorough study of the teaching work, and brought the farm management up to a high state of efficiency. It must also be recognised that the best of the Indian farm staff are required on the Sabour Farm. It should be obvious that the present policy of treating the Sabour Farm as a depot from which any efficient overseer can be drafted elsewhere is fatal to the efficiency of the farm.

(22) *Standard curriculum.*—When the standard curriculum which was prepared in 1906 for the guidance of the staff of the colleges is examined in the light of our present experience several defects come to light. The entrance-passed students on arrival at the College usually have an insufficient knowledge

any experience of agricultural teaching in India had been obtained.

In the first place the syllabus of each scientific subject contains much more material than can be properly taught in the time available, if due attention is to be given to agriculture. This is largely due to the fact that it was expected that the whole of the appointments in all sections of the Department's work would be filled from the ranks of the passed students and so it was thought advisable to give all the students a complete training to fit each student for any post in the Department in case he happened to show natural aptitude for it.

The course has also naturally taken this line in view of the fact that its framers possessed a very limited amount of personal experience of Indian agriculture at that time, and so the natural tendency was to base the teaching on the principles on which sound agricultural practice is based rather than to attempt to teach practices about which nothing was then known. In accordance with this idea the curriculum laid down the principle that the scientific subjects should be taught first and the applied subjects, such as agriculture, afterwards when a ground work of science had been laid.

Our study of the history of the College and the reasons for the failure has placed us in a position to consider what modifications are necessary to put the work on a sound foundation.

OBJECT OF COLLEGE.

(24) We are now in a position to reconsider the future of the College. It appears to have been originally intended to provide the English-educated middle classes, who normally try to obtain Government appointments or some form of office work, with the technical knowledge necessary to enable them to take up farming or to obtain posts as land-stewards. In addition a certain number of recruits for posts in the Agricultural Department would be required. At the same time it was recognised that it was useless to train any but hereditary agriculturists. It will be seen, therefore, that while it appears to have been intended to attempt to train the educated middle classes to become agriculturists, at the same time it was admitted that such an attempt was not likely to be successful unless they were hereditary agriculturists. It is probable that in the future we shall be more likely to obtain success if no attention is paid to the interests of any particular class, but our policy is directed solely to promote the interests of Indian agriculture. Especially

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. WOODHOUSE.

[Continued.]

is it important that an artificial atmosphere should not be created by the admission of students who are merely candidates for service under Government outside the Agricultural Department.

The types of education which have attained popularity in England may serve as a useful guide to the future needs of India. In the first place there are few colleges which cater for landowners' sons or science students who possess some education, and who wish to study the scientific principles of agriculture with a view to applying them in practice as land-agents or in scientific or expert posts. In this case only a small amount of attention is devoted to the details of agricultural technique. In the second place there are many colleges which cater for farmers' sons with a much smaller amount of education. In this case less science is taught but special attention is paid to the teaching of sound technique, no pains being spared to make the students understand farming as a business. Colleges of this type usually cater for the agriculturists of the particular tract in which they are situated and demonstrate the best systems of agriculture for that tract. Thirdly, comes the technical instruction given to employees in particular trades or branches of agriculture. For this only the most elementary education is required, and the instruction is intended to show the labourer how to get the best work out of his tools.

A comparison of the present system in use in India with the English one shows that the Indian Colleges are attempting to train simultaneously both scientific experts and practical farmers, and this work is being done under the following disadvantages:—

(i) The training of prospective experts must include a thorough grounding in all the sciences on which the art of agriculture is founded and the technical training in each of these sciences as applied to agriculture must be thorough in order that the students on graduation may be drafted into any post for which they have shown aptitude. This amount of scientific training is not required by a practical farmer. The amount of instruction in each subject could therefore be considerably reduced if the recruits required to fill special vacancies in the scientific branches were trained separately in the subjects concerned.

(ii) The education has to be given in English on account of the difficulty of giving scientific instruction in the vernacular and on account of the difficulty of finding any other language common to Bihar, Orissa, Bengal and Assam. Most of the students suffer from an imperfect acquaintance with English.

(iii) The course also differs from the English courses, in that the students have neither a foundation of science on which to build an understanding of technical agriculture, nor have they any stock of agricultural experience into which to graft the teachings of science.

(iv) In the absence of a proper basis of experience founded on experiment and observation it is only possible to teach the principles of scientific agriculture and such instruction, though suitable for the production of experts, is wholly unsuitable for the production of a class of practical farmers. It is probable that only a small proportion of the best students will be able to apply the principles successfully and the other students who attempt to farm are more than likely to fail. For such students a course with a minimum of science and a maximum of purely technical work will be most suitable, and its cost should be reduced to be commensurate with their future prospects.

It is likely therefore that eventually we shall find a demand for instruction of the following kinds:—

(i) In the first place we can provide recruits to fill vacancies in the scientific sections and to meet any private demand by offering post-graduate courses in such subjects as Agricultural Chemistry, Plant-breeding, Horticulture and Fruit Farming, Economic Entomology. Only a very limited number of students in any one subject would

be taken yearly, but they would work directly under the eye of the head of the section in his research laboratory. Only students with a sound grounding in science with particular reference to the subject concerned would be admitted. The course would probably be complete in one year.

(ii) The second course would be a technical course in agriculture, including horticulture, for the benefit of would-be farmers, land-stewards, etc. Very little science would be taught and that would be taught on nature study lines. The duration of the course would be reduced to two years if possible; it would probably have to be given in English on account of the number of languages spoken in the provinces concerned, but a vernacular course of the kind would probably prove more attractive. Students who pass through this course should make useful farm managers and land-stewards and should be suitable for all the general work of the Department.

It will be seen that the above scheme would avoid the waste of time involved in the teaching of an excessive amount of pure science in order to remedy the defects in the elementary education of the students, and the reduction in length of the course would enable us to deal with a larger number of students.

(iii) Besides these two courses there would be a series of short technical courses for the benefit of cultivators. These courses would either last for some time, e.g., the present *blado* and *rabi* course, and so would enable the cultivators to see any improved technical methods in use during that season, or they would deal with special subjects, e.g., dairy, *eri* silk or lac cultivation, use of Rajah plough, horticulture, etc. If necessary, instructors may also be sent out from Sabour to give certain of these short courses elsewhere.

I must repeat that I can see no useful purpose in continuing either the present course or the second of the above courses for the present. In case more recruits are required for the Department I should recommend that the exact number of candidates likely to be required be determined and that these be admitted in one year and after these have been through the course, it should be closed down until we are in a position to recommence teaching on proper lines. The scheme for the first proposed course can be brought into force at once, though it will take time to work out some of the courses. In the meantime the present short course can be continued as we can recommend a sufficient number of isolated improved methods to enable such a course to be of some value.

For many years to come we can expect no genuine spontaneous demand for agricultural instruction of any kind, but such a demand is likely to make itself felt as soon as the district staff begins to demonstrate effectively the advantages to be gained by improved methods of cultivation.

(25) *Organisation of College teaching.*—As regards the organisation of the College teaching the general arrangements for the College are placed in the hands of the Principal, but owing to the fact that the European officers have always been of almost equal standing and also to the fact that the efficiency of the teaching has depended on the quality of the work done by each officer in working out his own course of instruction, the European expert officers have been directly responsible to the Director of Agriculture only for the efficiency of their work. This system was tacitly acquiesced in by Mr. Gourlay (*vide* Mr. Dohhs' semi-official No. 1103 of 19th September, 1909, to which no reply was received) and no alterations have since been made. The only advantage that can be claimed for it is that it has been found to work satisfactorily and without undue friction. It practically means that the Principal is responsible for the efficiency of the arrangements for the teaching work but has no power to control the actual teaching work carried out by the staff under the charge of his European colleagues, except by reporting to

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. WOODHOUSE.

[Continued.]

the Director any cases in which he thinks the teaching is not being efficiently carried out. The Principal's position therefore cannot be considered an easy one.

It will probably be found that the solution of the above difficulty will eventually be found when a really enthusiastic and experienced Professor of Agriculture has been obtained for Sabour and when the courses of instruction in each subject have been worked out, when it would be possible to make the Professor of Agriculture Principal and put him in sole charge of the whole of the teaching staff, while the European expert staff will assist him with advice as regards the teaching of their subjects when required to do so.

In the meantime I do not consider that any good can come of laying down rules for the conduct of the agricultural teaching. This subject is better left entirely to the officer in charge of the work, who will profit by his mistakes and work out a sound course provided that he is allowed time enough to do so. If this course is not adopted I can assure you that the agricultural teaching will never be efficient.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS. —

(26) **General policy.** — Enough has been said to show that the work of the Department has hitherto been directed on wrong lines. In the first place a commencement has been made with an advanced course of teaching before the local conditions had been studied sufficiently to enable any improved system of agriculture to be worked out. In the second place the work of investigation has been reduced to a farce, and an expensive one, by the attempt to organise scientific investigation on similar lines to administrative work. As a result this Province has been left miles behind those Provinces which have developed the Agricultural Department on rational lines, and it will take a great effort to catch up with them.

I am convinced that no progress in agricultural education is possible until steps are taken to push on the work of agricultural investigation, and in doing this it must be recognised that the progress made will depend on the number of trained European investigators employed. At present only sufficient Indian officers are required to act as assistants to the European experts. Any attempt to build up a large Indian executive staff under the supervision of a few European experts will end in failure. At present it would appear that four additional Deputy Directors are required (1) for Tirhat and North Bhagalpur (2) Patna and South Bhagalpur, (3) Chota Nagpur and (4) Orissa. The officer in charge of the sugar station should probably be a Botanist or a Chemist with a good knowledge of Agriculture.

(27) **Education.** — It has been shown that the teaching work has hitherto suffered from absence of material to teach and the absence of a permanent and experienced officer to work out a proper agricultural course. A definite arrangement regarding the appointment of an officer to carry through the agricultural instruction here must be made as soon as possible if the teaching is to attain to any degree of success. It will probably be admitted that the courses of instruction undertaken by the Department should be designed with the object of making known (1) sound systems of agriculture and (2) improved technical methods. It should avoid wasting its time on giving a preliminary general scientific education if that can be avoided. The advanced teaching work should eventually be carried out for the benefit of those employed in capitalist farming, who will require a thorough knowledge of the best systems of agriculture and of the technical methods by which they can be made a success. The necessity for this type of teaching will depend on whether it is found that capitalist farming is economically sound or otherwise desirable in India. Smaller cultivators cannot afford to give so much time to education, and so instruction for their benefit should consist almost entirely in the practical demonstration of the best technical methods. There may also be a slight demand for persons trained in the technique of the sciences useful to agriculture. It is not, however, a part of the

Department's duty to give a training that will fit persons for appointments in Government service outside the Department and any time given to this may be regarded as wasted.

Three types of courses have been proposed to meet these requirements. The post-graduate course will be of service in training graduates of science colleges for the purpose of filling vacancies in the scientific branches of the Department. It will then be possible to reduce the science taught in the diploma course and to make it a technical course for those interested on the land. It is not, however, possible to start such a course until our knowledge of farm management under Indian conditions is much more advanced than it is at present. For the present the College may either be closed or used for the training of the staff required by the Department, the numbers of vacancies likely to be required in three years' time being published annually. The third item in the scheme, the short courses for cultivators, have been in progress for two years and they will be expanded as new material is accumulated. No course, however, can be expected to prove a thorough-going success until there is something to teach and until the quality of the Department's district work is such as to show clearly the advantage of the technical methods recommended by it.

The question of agricultural education is a very large subject and sufficient experience has nowhere been obtained in India to enable us to lay down a final policy. I would therefore suggest that steps be taken to lay the question of the most suitable types of agricultural education for India before the Board of Agriculture in December next.

(28) **Staff.** — At the present time I am quite unable to carry out the work of the Economic Botanist in addition to that of the Principal's office. I therefore propose that an additional Botanist be appointed to share a part of the work. Such a step can be fully justified when it is considered that the only conspicuous success to the credit of the Department has been obtained by me as Economic Botanist. This position would not however be necessary if it is decided to close the College at once and to put the whole of the teaching work in the charge of an experienced Professor of Agriculture as Principal. In order to take off as much routine work as possible from the Principal's shoulders a good Head Clerk is required. They also pointed out the absolute necessity of increasing the district staff by at least four officers if any results are to be obtained by the Department.

In view of the past policy of the Government in regard to the Agricultural Department it would appear unlikely that all the above additions to the staff will be sanctioned. There is perhaps a natural tendency for controlling officers who do not possess an expert knowledge of the work controlled by them to keep down the staff under them until they are certain that each officer is fully employed in doing routine work of a nature which can be easily checked. Scientific work which cannot be easily checked tends to be treated as a recreation for leisure moments. I would like to point out, however, that the Agricultural Department has no prospects whatever of producing the valuable results within its reach unless it is directed on very different lines from those common in executive work. The smaller the amount of administrative work demanded from each man the more thoroughly will he be able to do his legitimate work. For this reason I am convinced that the amount of progress in agricultural improvement will be found to be out of all proportion to the increase in the expert staff sanctioned, provided of course that good men are obtained.

I trust that you will find it possible to come to a decision regarding the above questions at an early date, as the existing state of affairs should not be allowed to continue for a day longer than necessary. In case it is not possible to carry through either the above or an improved scheme for putting the educational work of the department on a sound footing, I hope you will be able to see your way to allow me to revert to a branch of the Department's work in which I have some confidence.

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. WOODHOUSE.

[Continued.]

MR. E. J. WOODHOUSE called and examined.

68139. (Chairman.) The witness had been employed as economic botanist since his appointment in 1907. He had been at the Sabour Agricultural College since May, 1908, and was still carrying on the work of economic botanist in addition to his work as principal.

68140. His view was that the prevailing organisation at Sabour was not suitable. He would not propose to close the College entirely, but he would reduce its activities. He was originally in favour of closing the College until the Department had done a good deal more investigation work, but in view of the necessity of providing recruits for the subordinate posts in the Department, it would be necessary to continue the College work and to have a two years' course, mostly in agriculture. He contemplated an expansion in the cadre of the Agriculture Department. Such expansion was undoubtedly necessary.

68141. There were three research officers at Sabour, the agricultural chemist, the professor of agriculture, and himself. The research work, however, was done in spare time, after the teaching and administrative work was over. He did not approve of that system. He desired to continue the research work, as it was the most important work in the Department at present. He would therefore retain Sabour as a research centre, and he would set the officers in the research department entirely free from teaching duty. In some cases it would be of advantage to increase the staff by employing Indian professors for teaching work.

68142. He would not object to receiving highly-educated Indians at Sahour for a post-graduate course in the research department, provided they worked under the research officers.

68143. The best method for getting Indians into the higher branches of the Department on the agricultural side was to provide scholarships for schoolboys belonging to the cultivating classes and to give them a simple agricultural training with a view to their entry to the subordinate Agricultural Service. Then, when they had been tried in the subordinate service for a time, they might be promoted to the superior branches of the Service on their merits. This method did not apply to recruitment for research and teaching posts. For such posts men might be appointed from the University.

68144. It might be an advantage to give Indian officers study leave to England after some years' service.

68145. In his opinion there was room for a research college both at Sabour and at Pusa. There was ample scope for both institutions.

68146. Officers recruited in England had hitherto come up to a high standard. Most of them had been obliged to take charge of their duties with very little guidance, and on the whole they had done their work very creditably. There were indications, however, that the present conditions were no longer attracting a good class of man. He therefore looked upon it as urgently important that the conditions of service should be improved. The rates of pay he proposed were inclusive of allowances (except those of Principal and Director of Agriculture). He regarded the scheme for continuing the pay of the Service as at present and giving allowances to selected officers as extremely unsatisfactory.

68147. The post of Director of Agriculture should be thrown open to members of the Service. In some cases a civilian selected for the post had not sufficient knowledge of agriculture to enable him to direct the operations of the Department and, as the Department increased, such knowledge would become more and more essential. The head of the Department need not necessarily be a scientist in any particular branch; he must have a general knowledge of agriculture in its broad aspects, and should also possess a knowledge of administration. He agreed that an officer of the Indian Civil Service who had had many years' experience in settlement work, would come to agriculture with a not inconsiderable knowledge of the subject, but the

great drawback was that such a man would have no knowledge of the possibilities of improvement in agriculture by scientific means. Personally he was very much in favour of appointing members of the Agricultural Service, who knew what those possibilities were, to the post of Director. A Civilian Director was liable to go astray in taking too much pains over organisation for organisation's sake, and to that extent neglecting to assist Departmental operations, the efficient conduct of which was really essential to the rapid development of Indian agriculture.

68148. He would approve of the principle, as applied in the Education Department, that officers entering the Service after 25 years of age should be allowed to count for pension the number of completed years by which their age on entry exceeded the age of 25. All the officers at Pusa (except the supernumeraries) were recruited after the age of 25.

68149. He was in favour of obtaining men at a somewhat older age in order that they might have had experience of research work under proper direction in England.

68150. (Mr. Madge.) He thought a start in advanced agricultural education should not have been made until a sound basis of knowledge had been established as a result of experimental investigation. He was not afraid that the proposal he had made to reduce the educational and increase the investigation work would react adversely on agricultural development. Practically all the men obtained for the College so far had been of the educational standard required by the college prospectus. The difficulty was that students of the landlord class had not come to the College, and, if they did, they had not the necessary qualifications to comprehend the present college course. The standard was therefore being reduced with the object of attracting people from land.

68151. His experience of the Indian lecturer was that he was better at teaching than at research work. He thought it was possible to obtain in a short time a class of first-rate Indian lecturers in all subjects taught at the College.

68152. He agreed that what was wanted in a college like Sahour was practical experience combined with theory, and that was one of the reasons why he suggested that the College should be closed down for a number of years, and investigation work carried on, and more knowledge obtained about the various agricultural subjects. It might be an advantage to have English lecturers in all the subjects teaching in the vernacular, but it would take five or ten years for the men selected to attain a really high standard of efficiency.

68153. (Mr. Fisher.) He would like to have four scientific experts on research work at Sabour—a botanist for plant-breeding work, an agricultural chemist and two agriculturists, one in charge of arable work, and the other in charge of animal industries. This referred only to Sabour. It should be understood however that research work in the districts should also be made possible by a considerable increase in the number of qualified Deputy Directors. Without such a staff it would be impossible either to discover and introduce improvements in the local agriculture or to provide material for an agricultural course suitable for students from all parts of the Province.

68154. When the college was reopened, his conception of its function would be that it should contain, first, a research department, organised as he had said, and, secondly, an elementary teaching department, the teachers to be Indians. It would probably be necessary in the case of agriculture at first to have European teachers. The students at the College would be confined to the agricultural side.

68155. Asked whether, in such circumstances, there was any reason why there should be a research establishment at Sabour at all, the witness explained that research work on plant-breeding, for example, would be devoted to improving the

22 January 1914.]

Mr. E. J. Woodhouse.

[Continued.]

local crops for the benefit of the people of the Province; it would not necessarily have any reference to the teaching.

68156. At the present juncture research at Sabour was much more important than the teaching. The research work would have two ends, one the direct improvement of the agriculture of the Province, and, secondly, the provision of material for the teaching work.

68157. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness was recruited to the Agricultural Department when he was 23 years old. He was three years at Cambridge, taking the Honours Degree in natural science and one year at Cambridge taking the agricultural diploma. He then came straight out to India. He considered that was a bad method of recruitment. In addition to the college course, recruits should have had a longer period of training in practical research in England before coming to India. He himself did get some practical research at Cambridge in the summer of 1907. It was an advantage for recruits to expect appointments to have had at least some acquaintance with practical agricultural methods. And it should be laid down as an essential qualification for the post of Deputy Director that a man filling that position should have had at least a year's experience on the land.

68158. With reference to the proposals made to recruit a certain number of men of considerably older age, and of more established reputation, on short term agreements, he considered that such officers could be employed advantageously on special problems of which they had had previous experience but could not be economically employed in the ordinary district work of the Department.

68159. A young agriculturist on first coming out to India should be placed under an experienced Deputy Director, or agriculturist, in his own Province. As regards other subjects men should be deputed for a short time to work under the best of the specialists in their subjects, either at Pusa or elsewhere.

68160. With regard to the possibility of the employment of Indians in the Imperial Department, he proposed to have a two years' course of training in practical agriculture at Sabour. The matriculation standard for admission to that course would probably have to be abandoned. Having obtained the men, they would be employed in the Department on agricultural work in the districts. It was from the class he proposed to promote men into the Imperial Service. The idea was to have a two years' course to start with, and also to have a more advanced two years' course dealing more especially with agricultural sciences, which men might take after the first two years' course, either at once or at some later date. He agreed that if a man possessing only the matriculation standard or even a lower standard was taken and was given a two years' course, he would not be very promising material from which to obtain an officer of the class required to fill a Deputy Director's post, but the college was looking at the question from the point of view of agricultural develop-

ment rather than from any other point of view. The aim at present was to make use of the born agriculturist.

68161. With regard to the specialist side he proposed taking graduates in science as assistants to the European specialists, and also as teachers for some of the subjects at Sabour. From those two classes he thought it would be possible to select a certain small proportion of men for promotion to the Imperial Department. Selected men would take an extra post-graduate laboratory course. He was not of the opinion that it was necessary to give them any course of training in England; but it might be an advantage to send a man to Pusa, where he might get a rather wider outlook.

68162. The proposal put before the Commission that the Civilian Directorship of Agriculture should be abolished, that the head of the agricultural service should be filled by a suitably qualified departmental officer, and that a post of Rural Development Commissioner should be created, was quite a sound one.

68163. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Recruitment in England was adversely affected by poorness of the prospects held out to officers in the service.

68164. One great difficulty which had been found was that the landlords of India were not qualified by their education to benefit by the instruction which Sabour was prepared to give. Therefore, to bring teachers out from England to teach that class of pupil would be a pure waste of money at the present time.

68165. One of the chief objections entertained by his service to the appointment of an Indian Civil Service officer to the post of Director of Agriculture was that posts of that kind were apt to be given rather as a convenience to the Indian Civil Service than from the point of view of the advantage of the service concerned.

68166. If it were laid down that the appointment of an Indian Civilian should only be made when there was a man in the Indian Civil Service who was known to have taken an interest in, and to be experienced in agriculture, that would considerably remove the objection to a considerable extent, but at the same time there was a danger in appointing a man of that kind, because he might not after all have a thorough knowledge of agriculture.

68167. (*Chairman.*) A candidate had no agricultural education prior to his entrance at Sabour, and his contention was that the Indian candidates who now entered the college were unsuited to the agricultural profession.

68168. (*Mr. Fisher.*) If his recommendation were carried out, and the college were temporarily closed, agricultural diplomas could not be granted for Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and Assam. That would not create a grievance, because Government had stated that they could guarantee no Government service of any kind. The college had not up to the present given any agricultural diplomas; the first agricultural diploma examination would be held next March.

(The witness withdrew.)

JATINDRA NATH CHAKRAVARTI, Esq., Agricultural Supervisor, Rangpur, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68169. (I) *Methods of Recruitment.*—The present system of nomination from among distinguished Agricultural graduates and of promotion from the subordinate officers is quite satisfactory. Two-thirds of the total number of appointments should be filled up direct from among Agricultural graduates and one-third by promotion.

68170. (II) *Systems of Training and Probation.*—There are no fixed rules. All new officers should be appointed on probation for one year and put under training, at least six months of which should be spent on an experimental farm.

There is no regular system of training for the officers now. The courses in the Agricultural colleges are good as far as they go. But the officers selected direct from these colleges for the Provincial Service should undergo a further post-graduate training for two years either at Pusa or in one of the British or American Agricultural Colleges. The larger part of this period should be spent in practical work. They should be given a small allowance by Government during this period, as private students will have very little inducement to follow these courses. On completing the course satisfactorily, they should be appointed on probation for one year. Six months should be spent on

22 January 1914.]

Mr. JATINDRA NATH CHAKRAVARTI.

[Continued.]

an experimental farm in practical work and six months in touring under the direction of an Imperial Officer or a Senior Provincial Officer. Officers promoted from subordinate ranks should be appointed on probation for one year.

Provincial Officers promoted to the Imperial Service should spend at least a year in an approved European or American Agricultural College, if he has not already done so. This period might be treated as study-leave. The rule might be relaxed in exceptional cases.

68171. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The present salary is Rs. 200—10—400. The present salary is quite inadequate and has been always a matter of grievance. The Provincial Service, it is understood, was created mainly for the purpose of organising and supervising agricultural demonstrations. The officers have to go about in the country, study the local conditions, and make out suitable programmes of demonstrations for each tract. They have then to carry these out through the influential people of the localities. They have to meet a good deal of prejudice and sometimes active hostility among the cultivators. Their work can be only effectively done with the assistance of the District Officers and zamindars. Their duties are no less heavy nor less onerous than those of the Provincial Officers of the other Departments. If this Service is to command the necessary amount of influence among the people, and if they are to carry out their work successfully, it is essential that this Service should be put on the same footing as the other technical Provincial Services. In most of the departments one can usually expect to rise to the grade of Rs. 1,000, and also of promotion to the Imperial Branch.

There are at present four appointments in the Provincial Service. This is quite inadequate. In addition to the officers needed for supervising demonstrations, there should be one officer in each of the following departments: Chemistry, Fibres, Economic Botany, Mycology and Entomology. There should also be two officers to assist in the supervision of farms. The Experts belonging to the Imperial Service find very little time to study local conditions by touring, and it will be the duty of the Provincial Officers to study special problems on the spot and carry the results obtained in our laboratories by the Experts to the houses of our cultivators.

Our people are ignorant and superstitious. With the resignation of fatalism they submit to the ravages of diseases and insects as necessary evils. Judging by appearances they got on well enough without an Agricultural Department at all, and if we wait for their demand for a more efficient manning of the Department we shall wait for ever. Very often when they resort to any remedies, they try fanciful remedies suggested by superstition. The only way to help people is to show them the value of true scientific remedies. The Department should have a well-trained staff to do their work properly. Not properly carried out, our recommendations will be no better than their own remedies and will have the effect of bringing the Department itself into discredit. At present one Mycological Collector and one Entomological Collector on Rs. 50 each, trained at Pusa, are our only allowance of officers dealing with disease and insect-pests. This allowance is sadly inadequate for the needs of the province both in quality and number.

The following scheme is submitted for consideration:—

There should be 15 appointments:—

(1) Five for supervising Agricultural demonstrations in each of the five divisions.

(2) Five for each of the departments of Chemistry, Fibres, Economic Botany, Mycology and Entomology.

(3) Two for assisting in the supervision of experimental Farms.

(4) One Personal Assistant.

(5) One for special enquiry and one supernumerary officer for filling leave vacancies.

It is desirable that the Personal Assistant should be an officer with a knowledge of Agricultural matters, and it may not be always easy to find such an officer in the Executive Service.

The grade of these officers should be fixed at Rs. 250—25—800, or they should receive two-thirds the salary of the Imperial Officers. Those who are specially capable should also have a chance of being promoted to the Imperial Service.

The discrepancy in the salaries between the Imperial and Provincial Services is much greater than in any other technical departments. As a matter of fact, the annual increment of the Provincial Officers is Rs. 10 only, the same as obtains in the subordinate service. The usual practice in most of the other technical departments is to fix the salary at two-thirds that of the Imperial Officers. As an alternative to the previous scheme, the same scale might be introduced into the Agricultural Department. At present the average salary works out at about one-third the average salary of the Imperial Service. In some departments, Public Works Department, Telegraph, etc., even subordinate officers enjoy very nearly the same salary as the Provincial Officers of the Agricultural Department—a maximum of Rs. 400 only.

A statement is annexed herewith as Appendix I, giving the names and qualifications of the present officers of the Bengal Provincial Agricultural Service. This will, I venture to submit, show that their qualifications are in no way inferior to the members of any other Provincial Service. As a matter of fact, they are in many cases superior, and some of them have received the same training as the officers of the Imperial Service.

It has been previously pointed out that the officers of this branch of the Agricultural Department are required to be almost constantly on tour. As a matter of fact, they have to be out nearly 300 days in the year and most of this touring is in the interior where conveyance is expensive and inspection bungalows scarce. The charge of Provincial Agricultural Officers is very large in area, and they have to cover long distances and have to be away from head-quarters for considerable periods at a time. For the above reasons, they have to carry a considerable amount of equipage with them and one or two servants also. The second-class rates travelling allowance allowed are very often insufficient to meet these charges. They should, therefore, be allowed first-class travelling allowances, as in the Public Works Department and Telegraph Department.

68172. (V) Conditions of Leave.—The officers of this Department can very rarely avail themselves of Sundays or of the ordinary holidays. On account of the very technical nature of their work, as well as on account of shortage of officers, very few of them can obtain privilege leave when due. They should, therefore, be allowed to accumulate their privilege leave up to six months.

68173. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—Having regard to the arduous nature of the duties of officers of this Department, most of whose time is spent in outdoor work and in continuous touring, 25 years' service should be enough to earn full pension.

68174. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—Under the present conditions, it is very difficult for an Indian to get into the Imperial Service. As a matter of fact, out of about 70 Imperial Officers in the whole of India, there is only one Indian. At least one appointment in each province should be reserved to be filled up by promotion from among members of the Provincial Services.

The sharp line which now exists between the Imperial and Provincial Officers should be abolished. As in the other cognate departments

22 January 1914.]

MR. JATINDRA NATH CHAKRAVARTI.

[Continued.]

(Public Works Department, Telegraph and Forest), the duties of the Provincial and Imperial Officers should be, at least in the beginning of their services, similar, and Provincial Officers should be given independent charges, subordinate directly to the Director of Agriculture. Officiating vacancies in the Imperial Branch should also be invariably filled up by Provincial Officers instead of by officers from another province.

69175. (VIII) Relations of the Services with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—(1) The Co-operative Societies and our Department must work together, and closer co-operation is also desirable with the Educational Department in the matter of Agricultural training in the primary schools.

(2) The Agricultural Department can do very little useful work in the way of demonstrations without the help of District Officers.

(3) It is possible that, when the Department is fully developed and organised, the Head of the Department should be an Agricultural Expert. But for a long time to come the Department, if it is to carry out its work successfully, must be presided over by a member of the Indian Civil Service. It is he who alone can command the necessary amount of influence among the District Officers and the public. The Department, as at present constituted, consists of the Agricultural Statistics, Fisheries, Sericulture and Veterinary branches and it will be difficult to get a suitable expert who will take an impartial interest in all these.

69176. (IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered

by the preceding heads.—The designation of Provincial Officers should be changed to Assistants to the Director of Agriculture. The present term "Agricultural Supervisor" is misleading as, in some other departments, the term is used only for subordinate officers. As the Department is new, the public and even officers of the other departments very often take them to belong to the same class and this sometimes leads to awkward situations.

69177. ANNEXURE TO THE ABOVE.—Names and qualifications of the officers of the Bengal Provincial Agricultural Service:—

(1) Jotindra Nath Chakravarti, B.A. (Calcutta University); Diplomat, Higher Agricultural Class (Sibpur Government Engineering College), M.S.A. (Master of Science in Agriculture, Cornell, U.S.A.). Received practical training at Pusa for nine months on return from the U.S. Appointed in 1908.

(2) Rajeshwar Das Gupta, Higher Agricultural student (Sibpur). Promoted from the Subordinate Service for special merit. Served in the Agricultural Department in various capacities for nearly nine years before receiving his promotion. Appointed Agricultural Supervisor in 1912.

(3) Dwijadas Datta (temporary), B.Sc. (Calcutta), M.S.A. (Cornell, U.S.A.). Was managing a farm of his own when appointed to the Agricultural Service. Appointed in 1913.

(4) Nagendranath Gupta (Temporary), B.A. (Calcutta), B.Sc. (Edinburgh). Appointed in 1913.

Messrs. J. N. Chakravarti and D. Datta went to the U.S.A. with Government scholarships.

Mr. JATINDRA NATH CHAKRAVARTI called and examined.

69178. (Chairman.) The witness was appointed to the service in 1908. He was a graduate of the Calcutta University, and received the agricultural diploma of the Sibpur Government College. He was then sent for two years to Cornell University where he received a degree of Master of Science in Agriculture. Then he went to Pusa for nine months. At present he was in charge of a Government farm. He had four subordinates under him in addition to clerks.

69179. A certain proportion of vacancies should be set aside for subordinates in order to encourage them.

69180. It was difficult to find a class of landholder in Bengal who cultivated his own land with his own hands or by direct personal supervision, and at the same time possessed educational attainments.

69181. It was advisable, if possible, to get men into the agricultural service who had been intimately associated with the land all their lives. Landlords were gradually exhibiting more interest in agricultural education.

69182. The courses at the agricultural colleges were good, as far as they went, but they did not provide a wide enough training for admission to the higher branches of the service. That did not apply to the Pusa course. He thought the training given at Sabour was quite sufficient for present needs. Those who required higher training could go to Pusa. He suggested that all officers desirous of entering the Provincial Service should go through a course at Pusa, except in special cases.

69183. He considered that officers, under his scheme of promotion from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service, should, prior to entering the Imperial Service, take a course in some foreign country. It would give them a wider outlook. They should go away on study leave and obtain a certificate from an agricultural institution. Some of the officers now in the Provincial Service were qualified to fill higher posts, as they had had a scientific training abroad.

69184. The Provincial officer was carrying out work of a subordinate character to the Imperial

Officer, but the difference in pay between the two officers was too great.

69185. Full pension should be payable after 25 years' service. Officers now entered the service at about the age of 25, so that a man would have reached 55 under the present conditions by the time he had served 30 years.

69186. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) It would be difficult to give any figures in support of his statement that an increased interest was being taken by the classes associated with the land in the work of the Agricultural Department, but he could say from his own personal experience that that was the case. It could be fairly assumed that when it was a question of familiarising the Indian agriculturist with improved methods of agriculture, the Indian himself was in many ways much better fitted to bring that knowledge home to those whom it was desired to reach than a European. The duties of the witness's branch of the service consisted entirely of propaganda work.

69187. (Mr. Sly.) It took him four years to pass as a science graduate, that being the minimum period prescribed by the University. He held a Government scholarship of Rs. 10 for two years whilst in the University. He did not obtain a scholarship at Sibpur. He went there because he liked agriculture. He went to America with a scholarship worth Rs. 150 a month, with all tuition fees and other similar expenses paid. He was then sent by Government to Pusa with pay at the rate of Rs. 250. His American training had been of very great value to him in his work in India, in that it gave him an insight into American methods of propaganda work in addition to the necessary technical training. In his opinion men trained abroad were superior to men trained in India.

69188. An Indian who had his cultivation done by hired labour was not looked down upon. The total number of such men was small, and the number of educated men amongst that class was still smaller; but it was increasing. In the future he expected a considerable number of men from that class would be attracted to the college.

69189. (Mr. Fisher.) One or two landholders came

22 January 1914.]

Mr. JATINDEA NATH CHAKRAVARTI.

[Continued.]

to Sibpur College, not in order to enter Government service but in order to obtain agricultural knowledge, which might be useful to them on their own estate, but their educational qualifications were not very high. He was of the opinion that the number of landowners likely to avail themselves of the educational opportunities in Bengal in order to increase their own estates was likely to increase. He thought the courses undergone at the Provincial Colleges of Poona and Sabour were quite sufficient to fit an Indian for an advanced course at Pusa. It was not necessary that candidates for admission to the agricultural classes should have taken a scientific degree at the University.

68190. (Mr. Madge.) Zamindars might to some

extent be compared with English landlords who took to agriculture for the sake of their estates and their tenants. There was a prospect of their number increasing with the encouragement they received from Government in agricultural colleges as well as from the scientific officers of the Agricultural Department; in fact it was increasing. He looked forward to a time when zamindars would be more deeply interested in agriculture than they were at present.

68191. There was no reason why the Indian agricultural training should not be raised to the highest standard in a reasonable time. And in so far as conditions of agriculture were peculiar to India, an Indian (or Anglo-Indian) had an advantage over a man from England.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Madras, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

WALTER CULLEY MARSH, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

LL. E. BUCKLEY, Esq., I.C.S., Commissioner of Revenue Settlement, Madras.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

C. A. BAABER, Esq., M.A., D.Sc., Government Sugarcane Expert.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68192. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—I consider that the present class of recruits to the Agricultural Department in India is by no means uniformly satisfactory, in that the men joining are good, bad and indifferent. The reasons for this are not far to seek. The selection of new men is usually done in haste; those who are responsible for their recommendation are not in a position fully to grasp the local conditions and the candidates themselves are often very ignorant in the subject; the starting and the ultimate scale of pay are inadequate to attract the best class. The inclusion of good men is a matter of chance either because they happen to be out of employment for the moment or are at present unaware of their own value.

To remedy this state of affairs—which is very serious—I would make two suggestions: (1) A permanent selecting Board should be organised consisting of recognised heads of Agricultural Departments in England; these should be kept fully informed as to the local conditions, and at least one member of the Board should be a retired member of the Indian Agricultural Department. (2) It is advisable to inaugurate a definite policy with the object of forming a regular reserve of officers to draw upon. The Department, judging by the numbers in the Agricultural Department of other countries, is bound to increase for many years to come and there will always be plenty of work to do for members of this reserve as will be detailed below. As an example of such a policy I might suggest that two agriculturists (and scientific specialists to a less degree) be entertained on probation for each year for some time to come.

68193. (II) System of Training and Probation.—The period of probation is at present three years. This is a long time for a young trained man to be in suspense, and there is no reason why, if greater

care is taken in selection in the first instance, this period should not be reduced to two years. This, however, I think is the minimum.

A reserve of agriculturists should usually be kept in each province according to its probable ultimate needs. These could be utilised by being placed in charge of sections of the country, in supplying leave appointments for which there is no provision at present and in the investigation of special problems. The day of special enquiries has only commenced and these will, I believe, form an increasing factor in agricultural progress for some years to come. I regard it as useless at present to send agriculturists for training in Pusa and think that they should be trained in their own province in order to assimilate the local conditions and language.

The case is somewhat different with regard to scientific specialists, although the danger of unsuitable selection is greater than in the case of agriculturists. There are far fewer men available and, as the standard required is higher, any mistake made is much more serious. I would suggest that the reserve in this case should be under the control of the Imperial Section with whom it would rest to place the specialists as early as possible in the provinces likely to need them. Speaking specially for Madras I consider that an additional Botanist could now be usefully employed under training, and I have no doubt that the same may be said of other sections.

68194. (III) Conditions of Service.—I do not know the conditions of service in the Agricultural Department as my agreement is a separate one, but I am informed that in several respects they are inferior to those of other recognised Services. This is a very serious matter, considering the class of university recruits aimed at, which is exactly similar to that in the Educational Department. If it is objected that the Agricultural Department is a small one I would point out that the

27 January 1914.]

Dr. C. A. BARBER.

[Continued.]

recruitment of an unsuitable officer is a far more serious matter in a small than in a large Department. I consider that for the life of the Department the class of recruits should be unexceptionable.

68195. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—I consider that the salary offered at present is generally insufficient, both as regards initial pay and ultimate maximum. The initial pay does materially affect the class of recruits and will continue to do so until the Service is recognised as a good one. The tendency of those leaving the Agricultural Department at present is inevitably not to recommend it.

I have some experience in the recruitment of officers for the Agricultural Department, for during my last furlough I visited almost all the Agricultural Colleges and Universities in the Kingdom and was freely used by Sir Thomas Holderness in obtaining officers for various appointments. And I found that the prospects were quite insufficiently attractive to induce anyone to leave England who had a reasonable prospect of obtaining an appointment at home, frequently on a much lower scale of pay.

It is not desirable that an officer entering into service should reach his maximum rate of pay after 14 years' service and should then remain at this rate for another 15 or 16 years without the chance of improvement.

I would, however, here draw my first distinction between the agriculturists and scientific specialists. On the average the training of the latter is longer and more laborious and they enter the Services with a better equipment than the former. While it is perhaps possible to obtain young agriculturists at the rate of pay offered in other larger Services, I consider that it is idle to expect specialists to come out for the same salary.

I would recommend that it should be possible for all officers of the Department to rise to at least Rs. 1,500 a month, and that special inducements as regards initial pay should be held out to scientific specialists. And that there should be a chance for higher maximum pay than that named for the better men in each province.

68196. (V) Conditions of Leave.—It is generally admitted that the present leave rules are out of date and antiquated in several respects and I would merely desire that, if improvements are effected in this respect with regard to any of the other services (excepting the Civil Service and Military Service), they should be extended to the Agricultural Department as well.

68197. (VI) Conditions of Pension.—The pension at present offered is insufficient for anyone with a family to live in England. It is therefore necessary to seek employment upon retirement. I do not think that this is fair after 25 to 30 years in Government service in India. I would suggest the abolition of the Rs. 5,000 limit, that the rate of pension should depend upon the length of service and scale of pay during the last five years in India, and that an additional sum of Rs. 1,000 should be allowed to Provincial Directors of Agriculture, to the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India and to certain selected officers in the scientific section.

68198. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—Non-European officers—that is natives of the country—should be employed wherever possible in the higher posts. It is unnecessary to fix any limit for this at present because it is unfortunately the case that, in spite of careful search, hardly a single one has as yet been found to be suitable. Thus far we have met with a lack of administrative ability and power of independent research which probably indicates that we have not succeeded in attracting the best class of Indian to the Agricultural Department. The only openings at present available are those of Professors in the local colleges, and such appointments should be made where possible in order to attract a better class of Indians to the Service.

The present division of the Imperial Service into "Imperial" and "Provincial" is a good one. But it is not ideal. It is, in my opinion, of absolute importance that there should at least be an Imperial section. Otherwise we should have a series of detached Provincial services, some successful, others gradually atrophying and ultimately disappearing. There is, however, at present a serious dislocation between the Imperial and Provincial Services. It is difficult, without fuller knowledge, for me to indicate the remedy, but I put the following suggestions forward in the hope that they may be of use.

There should be one Imperial Department of Agriculture with a chief officer responsible to the Government of India. There should be a special research establishment at Pusa with reserve scientific men to be placed in those provinces where it has been demonstrated that useful work can be done. There should also be a reserve of agriculturists drafted to the various provinces where expansion is most probable in the near future. Once in a province, specialists, and especially agriculturists, should be moved as little as possible, although in the former case a special problem will sometimes have to be studied in several provinces.

It is difficult to indicate the exact amount of control to be exercised by the Chief of the Imperial Department, but with capable local Directors there should be little cause for interference and in matters of administration the local Government should have complete control of all officers serving under it. The permanent staff of the Research Institute would, however, naturally be recruited by selection from the Provincial Scientific Experts.

68199. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service.—The Directors of the Provincial Agricultural Departments should be selected with much greater care than has sometimes been the case in the past. At present it has been found "convenient to appoint a member of the Civil Service" as Director. He is usually a better trained man and, when qualified, the results have been admirable. This arrangement is, however, anomalous and it cannot be expected that a suitable member of this Service will be usually available. The appointment of a Civilian Director should be dropped as soon as possible for the following reasons—

(1) He is usually insufficiently master of his subject.

(2) Cases have occurred where the appointment has been used with less regard to the needs of the Department than that of Civil Service.

(3) A capable member of the Department with administrative ability would obviously have an advantage over a civilian in directing its policy. There would also be fewer changes of Director.

(4) It would definitely raise the status of the Department to have a Director recruited from its ranks. This is an extremely important matter at the present moment, for, unless the Department is recognised as a good one it is idle to expect an improvement in the class of recruits.

It is of great importance for the success of the Provincial Agricultural Department that its Director should have as free a hand as possible in carrying out his work. In Madras the Director is under Commissioner in the Board of Revenue, who is responsible to Government for the Department. This officer is a very busy man, and the Agricultural Department with its multiplicity of detail of necessity can occupy a very small part of his time. There appears to be no reason whatever for this arrangement, for the Agricultural Department has nothing to do with the collection of revenue. The Madras arrangements (I cannot speak as regards other provinces except that they regard our system as extremely curious) of placing the Director of Agriculture under the Board of Revenue leads, in my opinion, to endless delay and confusion.

69200. (IX) Other points.—I would call attention to another matter in which the Madras Agricultural Department differs from those elsewhere in India. The scientific officers are under a disadvantage as compared with the agricultural recruits.

27 January 1914.]

Dr. C. A. BARBER.

[Continued.]

I have already referred to the longer time involved and greater expense incurred (to put it on the lowest plane) in the training of a scientific specialist than in that of the average agriculturist. It is ruled in Madras that the post of Principal of the Agricultural College should be filled by agriculturists and not by scientific specialists. This is one of the posts carrying additional emoluments and I regard this treatment as likely to react unfavourably on the recruitment of scientific specialists for Madras. There is no reason why the Principal of the Agricultural College should be an agriculturist to the exclusion of scientific men, and the latter usually hold the position in other pro-

vinces. As regards the Director of Agriculture, I would leave the matter open but if two men of equal ability are available, one a scientific specialist and the other an agriculturist, I would choose the latter for the post. This being the case, I think it only fair that there should be a grade open to the scientific members of the Service with equal emoluments, after approved service to that of the Director. The matter is of some importance in view of the fact that in the general recruitment to the Department a mediocre scientific specialist would be much more of a disaster than a mediocre agriculturist because of the character of the work required of them.

DR. C. A. BARBER called and examined.

68201. (Chairman.) The witness was recruited to the Service under special contract. He came out as Government Botanist on Rs. 700 a month with a free house. He had been fifteen years in India. At present he was Government sugar-cane expert for India on Rs. 1,500 a month with a free house.

68202. The present class of recruits to the Agricultural Department was by no means always satisfactory, and he suggested three methods for bringing about an improvement—first of all, the reorganising of the Selection Board; secondly, the forming of a reserve of officers in the Department, and thirdly, an improvement in conditions of service. With regard to the reorganisation of the Selection Board, he desired to associate on the Board gentlemen with Indian agricultural experience. At present officers coming out to India knew nothing about the Service, and after a few years they always showed signs of dissatisfaction that they had not been better informed at the time of their first appointment.

68203. With regard to forming a reserve of officers in the Department, he suggested that agriculturists, and to a less degree, scientific officers, should be entered on probation, irrespective of vacancies. If that scheme were carried out it would not entail an unnecessary expense, because it was certain that there would be a large expansion of the Department in the near future. Even if the contemplated expansion did not take place, there would not be any serious block in promotion, as the additional officers could be employed at once in every province. He knew roughly what the conditions were in each province, and he could definitely say that there was room for such an increase of staff. His proposal was in fact based on a very strong assumption that the whole Department was about to undergo considerable expansion. He thought that if these measures were adopted the present system under which officers were selected rather hurriedly might be avoided.

68204. He had recently visited almost all of the institutions in England, and had found that there was a large field from which suitable candidates could be recruited to the Department. In 1912 there were thirty diplomats at Cambridge, one of whom had been induced to join the Department after considerable difficulty. None of the other twenty-nine men had made any offer to come into the Service. He thought that was due to the fact that they did not consider that the pay and prospects were adequate. If pay and prospects were improved eligible candidates would, he thought, be tempted to offer themselves for appointment.

68205. The point he mainly insisted on was that there must be a large increase* in the Department in order that it might play its proper part in the agricultural development of the country. At present the Department only dealt with one small spot at a time, and obtained good results if it was able to concentrate its attention and its staff on that spot. There had been in Madras during the last five years two District Officers, one of whom had had to deal with 23,000 square miles of crops, and the other with 29,000 square miles. Great portions

of the country had not been touched, and many questions were started, only to be dropped for lack of staff. Where the Department had been able to concentrate its attention on certain definite questions it had met with enormous success. He might refer, for example, to the case of single seedling paddy. The Department had discovered that instead of planting four or five or six seedlings, one was sufficient for the purpose and that saved Rs. 3 per acre. This improvement was now carried out on 100,000 acres. The increase in the Department which he considered necessary, and which would inevitably come, stood or fell by the inclusion of a large number of Indians in the Department. The Department could not have a great force of Europeans in it; the number of Europeans would have to be increased, but the Service would have to depend very largely upon the higher subordinates. If those upper subordinate posts were thrown open, a very much better class of men would enter the Department. What he had said with regard to the class of men entering the European Service applied even to a greater extent to the class of Indians the Service was able to recruit. It was not getting the best men, as the pay and prospects were so poor, and the number of posts open to them were so few. In that respect the Department suffered in comparison with the comparable sections of the Forest Department, the Public Works Department, and the Educational Department.

68206. He would like to see one Deputy Director in every district, which would mean an addition of twenty-two men in Madras alone. Even then the charges would be far more than a man could really manage, but attention could be concentrated on individual problems, with the result that there would be a great increase in the prosperity of the country, and ultimately in the revenue to Government.

68207. He felt satisfied as the result of his own experience that Deputy Directors when sent into the country districts succeeded in inducing the Indian farmer to take up improved methods of agriculture. It took three to four years to introduce the most obvious improvement, and then it was only done by obtaining the friendship and confidence of the people.

68208. He based his desire for an increase of Indians on the following facts. Indians formed a very large proportion of the Agricultural Service, and unless their number was increased largely, he did not think the Department would be justified in increasing the number of its District Officers. He did not say that those District Officers should be Europeans. There was no feeling against any Indian officer in the Service, provided he was as good as the European.

68209. He thought Indians intended for promotion to the upper branches of the Service should be trained in the Department, should pass up through the upper subordinate grades to a Provincial Service, and should then be selected from the Provincial Service into the Imperial Service. He was strongly against any direct recruitment in England of Indians who had passed through a University course, unless they had been thoroughly tested out in India first. He had quoted in the

* The witness afterwards put in two notes which have been printed as Appendices VIII. and IX.

27 January 1914.]

Dr. C. A. BARBER.

[Continued.]

written statement the report of the Commission on Technical Studies Scholarships, which pointed out that it was no use sending any Indian to England to go through a technical course there, unless he had had practical experience of the subject in India first, and unless he had been selected by the local authorities. He laid stress on the necessity for local selection in India, as the local authorities had intimate knowledge of a man's capacity and the work for which he was wanted.

68210. Having got his man, and assuming that he had been through a course of training in India, he would not suggest sending him to England, although there were certainly advantages to be gained from an English training. If a good man was found in the District Service, it would be a good thing for him to go to England for a couple of years, with the object of broadening his ideas. With regard to research, on the other hand, he did not consider at present the Indian colleges were sufficiently equipped to give a complete training. If a promising man was discovered on the research side, he would recommend sending him to an English University in order to be trained in his special subject. He would prefer to send a man to England for research purposes to sending him to Pusa, as Pusa was not sufficiently equipped with the necessary training staff. He agreed that the research work going on at Pusa was peculiarly adapted to Indian conditions, but he laid great stress on a thorough grounding in general principles. Moreover, Pusa was not in the tropics, and the crops on the whole were more similar to the crops of Europe than they were to those of southern India. The Provincial Colleges would be perfectly capable of training men in district work, and to a certain extent they would be capable of training them in teaching, but they would certainly not be capable of training them in research.

68211. The present standard of training in the Madras College was adequate for the class of man needed for the Service. He did not favour any method of direct recruitment of an Indian to the higher branches of the Service. Very occasionally a man might be appointed direct to the Provincial Service, but nobody should be appointed direct to the Imperial Service. An officer who had been in the subordinate ranks a considerable number of years would make an effective superior officer, and would hold his own with his colleagues. It was very difficult to say whether an officer recruited in that way would be likely to take the position of authority better than an officer highly trained and appointed direct. There was no doubt that a directly recruited officer would enjoy a certain amount of kudos, and he might possibly have more authority, but he would not be able to enforce that authority, as he would not know the Service so intimately as the promoted man and would not be respected by his subordinates in the same manner as the man who had risen from the ranks.

68212. The service would attract the best class of candidates if a prospect was held out of selection to the Provincial Service, and finally of promotion to the Senior Service. It should, however, be understood that a good man would be pushed on rapidly.

68213. In Madras the scientific specialist laboured under a special disability in that it was laid down that the post of Principal of the Coimbatore Agricultural College should be filled by an agriculturist. He did not know if there was a definite Government Order on the subject, but the practice was well defined. He did not say he would like the position to be open to both sections, but if it was a rule that the Principalship should be taken from the Deputy Director class, then he thought that some post carrying an equivalent rate of pay should be open to the scientific section. His whole object was to establish as fair conditions of service all round as possible. It was far more difficult to attract the scientific expert than to attract the ordinary agriculturist into the Department. He agreed that other things being equal, an agriculturist would be likely to be better qualified as an administrator, but the position of Principal required academic qualifications also.

68214. There was not the close contact which he would like to see between the research work at Pusa and the research work going on in Madras. He did not suggest the appointment of an officer with general authority over the whole of the agricultural service throughout India, because every province must be in charge of its own men, but he would like to see the authority of the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India increased. He agreed that it would be a good thing if, in each province, there was an officer in general control over the Agricultural Department, the Veterinary Department, Co-operative Credit Societies, and possibly Village Industries. Assuming that a suitable officer could be found, it would be an extremely good idea, but what he was afraid of was that the scheme might result merely in the employment of an additional Secretary, and that he particularly wished to avoid. He disapproved of the present arrangement under which the Director of Agriculture was placed under the Commissioner of the Board of Revenue; he thought it was unnecessary.

68215. (*Str Valentine Chirol.*) If the Department of Agriculture in Madras desired to bring any point to the notice of the Government of India, it should communicate direct with the Agricultural Adviser of the Government of India. What happened now was that a proposal would be made by one of the Scientific Experts to the Director of Agriculture, who had to forward it to the Board of Revenue. The Board of Revenue then sent it to the Government, and the Government might or might not send it on to the Government of India. The proposal might, however, be dropped at any stage, without reference to the expert by whom it was originated. If the question was merely one of scientific procedure, or co-ordination of scientific results, which had no reference to revenue or administration, then there were facilities for communicating direct with the Agricultural Adviser, and through him to the Government of India.

68216. The Agricultural Service was not one which required mere mental ability. Agriculture was a business, and anyone who was not a capable business man was of no use to the Service. A man could not be a successful man of business without technical knowledge, and for district work what they wanted was technical knowledge combined with business capacity.

68217. (*Mr. Sly.*) Local recruits to the Agricultural Department started on a salary of Rs. 35 rising to Rs. 50. He considered that such officers could in time be trained up to the standard required for the Imperial service. He agreed that better material might be obtained for the Imperial Service if officers were recruited direct to the Provincial Service on Rs. 200 a month, but they would not have had the necessary initial training. His suggestion was to recruit Indians from the subordinate to the Provincial Service; to test their capacity for a certain number of years; then, if necessary, to put selected officers through a post graduate course, preferably in India; and ultimately to promote them to the Imperial Service.

68218. The present average age of entry of the sixty men in the Imperial Department was 27 years and eight months. The ages at entry ranged from 20 to 40. Agriculturists should, he considered, have obtained a diploma from a recognised college, and should also have completed at least one year's training on a farm in England. That would make them 23 years of age. The research officer should have taken an honours degree at a recognised school, and should have completed at least two years on research, which would bring him to about 25 or over.

68219. On the whole he would be against bringing out a number of short-term specialists for the Department, as it would take a number of years for them to get accustomed to the conditions of the country. He quoted the instance of an eminent geologist who came out and proved an utter failure. He would be prepared to admit a possible exception in the case of a man who was engaged

27 January 1914.]

Dr. C. A. BARBER.

[Continued.]

for a short term simply for the investigation of a special subject, but it would be an enormously expensive arrangement. Taking the post of bacteriologist, he explained, that the bacteriological conditions of the soil in India were so different from those of the soil in England or in any temperate climate, that it would be useless to bring out a man of established reputation in England for a short period. It would be much better to appoint permanently men from England who had been trained as researchers.

68220. His colleagues considered that, if possible, the post of Director should be filled from the Agricultural Service and not by an Indian Civil Service officer, but personally he was not in favour of an immediate change. At present officers in the Agricultural Service were too young to fill the posts and if a Departmental officer were appointed he would hold the position for too long a time; and possibly also there were not enough officers in the Service from whom a selection could be made. He did not think it would be a suitable system to select an officer for a provincial directorship from the whole of India. There would be no objection to bringing a man from one part of the Gangetic plain to another part, provided the local Service was safeguarded against any injustice, and there might be no difficulty in taking a man from Bombay and putting him in the Central Provinces, but it would be a great mistake to bring a man from the Gangetic plain down to Madras.

68221. The position of Director should be open to the expert as well as to the agriculturist, but if there were two men available, one an expert and the other an agriculturist, he would choose the district officer for the post, other things being equal.

68222. It was not the case that experts (who should be a much smaller body than the Deputy Directors) were given compensation in the form of appointments at Pusa and special allowances. He was afraid the special allowances at Pusa were absolutely illusory. He believed that if the posts at Pusa were thrown open to the Department they would all go begging. If an officer from Madras was transferred to Pusa his provincial work would come to an end, and he would have to start all over again under entirely different conditions, in which he would not be interested. It was this consideration more than anything else which prevented men from going to Pusa. The theory under which the best of the provincial experts were selected to hold appointments at Pusa had broken down completely.

68223. A scheme providing that the Agricultural Service should have one of its own officers at its head that the Veterinary Department and Co-operative Credit Department should also be placed in charge of one of its own officers and that above these three branches of the Service, there should be an officer of the Indian Civil Service acting as Commissioner and dealing direct with the Government was a step in the right direction; but it was not an ideal scheme. A better system would be to have a trained technical officer acting as Commissioner. He agreed that one man could not be an expert in all three branches, but an officer trained in the technical work of any one of them would be much better fitted for the post of Commissioner than a mere administrator. He would not in the least mind a veterinary officer holding the position; he would be better qualified than an Indian Civil Service officer. What Government

wanted was an expert adviser and not a mere secretary.*

68224. (*Mr. Fisher.*) For the purposes of agriculture India could be divided into four main tracts, and there would no difficulty in transferring experts within the limits of those tracts, but if he was transferred from one tract to another, he would at first be under very great disadvantages.

68225. He would certainly not recommend that all candidates for the Agricultural Department in India should have passed through the agricultural course at Cambridge; there would be no advantage at all in that, and the Department would not obtain as good a class of man as it did at the present time.

68226. Nor would there be any advantage in selecting men at a comparatively young age, and in putting them through a course in an Agricultural College afterwards. The present plan was quite satisfactory.

68227. The starting pay of specialists and agriculturists would have to vary, because of the different qualifications required. For a scientific expert the Department would have to bargain directly in every case. There was no way of commanding the services of a good scientific expert in India, unless he was paid a very high figure. In his view a man might become a scientific expert two years after he had taken his degree. If an Indian obtained a good degree in India, and afterwards did well as a scientific research student at Cambridge, he should certainly be admitted straight into the Imperial Service, but he had never yet come across such a case.

68228. It would undoubtedly be more desirable at the present moment to strengthen the agricultural side of the Department than to increase the number of scientific and research officers.

68229. (*Mr. Madge.*) He fully believed that the operations of the Agricultural Department were sufficiently remunerative to justify a large measure of development. That view had been pressed upon the Government of India and a series of reports had been sent up at different times. During the recent meeting of the Board of Agriculture at Coimbatore, the dominant note was that great expansion must take place in district work.

68230. There was a class of landowner in Madras which corresponded with the landowners in Bengal who really took an interest in their estates, with the view of improving them, and the department had many friends amongst them.

68231. It was very hard upon a young man straight from college to be put in full administrative charge, and he would prefer that newly entered officers should have a certain amount of training before being placed in full control.

68232. (*Mr. Buckley.*) On the whole he thought it would be advisable to have a selection bar at Rs. 1,000 provided that there were not only a limited number of appointments above Rs. 1,000.

68233. He looked forward to the time when there would be a Deputy Director in each district. The first step, however, would be to get assistant directors in each district working under Deputy Directors who were in charge of four or five districts.

* The witness afterwards wrote: "I wish to modify this paragraph in that my answer had to be on the spur of the moment. After thinking the matter over and considering the type of Government in India and the excellence of the Civil Service, I withdraw my objection to a member of that Service occupying the post of Pusa Commissioner."

(The witness withdrew.)

M.R. RY. RAY BAHADUR K. RANGACHARIAR Avargal, Government Lecturing Botanist, Agricultural College, Coimbatore.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68234. A Provincial Service is necessary for this College, and some additions also to the executive branch. In all the other provinces, except Madras, there is a Provincial Service attached to the Agri-

cultural College. At Poona there are four or five men in the provincial grade. At Nagpur five, and in the Agricultural College at Pusa a number of them. In Bombay there are four divisional inspectors in the provincial grade, and in the Central Provinces there are seven men.

27 January 1914.]

RAJ BAHADUR K. RANGACHARIAR.

[Continued.]

In the Agricultural College, Coimbatore, there are 21 assistants at present and not even one in the Provincial Service. In the Forest College, which is also a technical college like our college, all the assistants are in the Provincial Service. The course in the Forest College is simpler and shorter than our college course.

Even at Saidapet there were two persons in this grade. (One was acting as Vice-Principal for ten years.)

This step will add to the prestige of the college, and the college will become more popular. Further, this will certainly attract superior type of men, and they will stick on to the Department and all the experience they gain will be an advantage to the college. Good men will take up appointments even in the lower grades, for there is every chance of their getting promotion. At present there is no inducement.

68235. (III) Conditions of Service.—The conditions of service so far as leave and such other privileges are concerned, the officers are at a disadvantage. They have lost all the advantages they have been enjoying while under the Educational Department, and even the few advantages of the Revenue Department are denied to them. The work of the assistants in this college is more arduous than in the Educational Department. Officers in the Educational Department have more pay, better prospects of promotion, and plenty of leisure besides the vacation leave.

68236. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—For our college we must have at least five appointments in the gazetted Service. All these may be on same pay, one being attached to each section. Or we may have different grades as in the Forest College, inasmuch as our college is in no way less important or inferior as regards the training.

At present there is a stop at Rs. 250, and comparatively speaking this is not fair. This college is more important, or at least as important as any other professional college, and as such it is only fair to bring this college in line with the other colleges, as regards pay, staff and conditions of service. This college certainly deserves, at least as much consideration as the Forest College, if we bear in mind the needs of the country. At present there may not be a great need for men of a superior type, but as soon as the college and the Department pass beyond the initial stage, there will be a great need for a better class of men.

[See also the supplementary statement by Rai Bahadur K. Rangachariar, immediately below.]

Supplementary Written Statement.

68237. (I) Method of Recruitment.—(A) Indian Agricultural Service.—Officers of this Service may be considered under two distinct classes: (1) Specialists and (2) Agriculturists proper, as the type of men required for the two branches are different.

(1) *Specialists*.—For some more years the specialists intended for research work of a higher order in the Department have to be recruited entirely from amongst Europeans, or Indians that have received a sound training in foreign Universities. Arrangements should, however, be made to bring into existence Indians capable of doing research work. Graduates in science of the Indian Universities that show special aptitude for science may be selected and sent to foreign countries for special training and drafted into the Department after the training. The scientific experts must consider the training of the Assistants under them for research work and the improving of the laboratories so as to bring them to the level of the model laboratories in Europe and America as a part and the foremost of their duties.

(2) *Agriculturists proper*.—As regards the officers who are to be pure agriculturists, recruitment should not be confined to the Europeans only. Indians should have a greater share in this cadre

than Europeans, because agricultural experts have to deal more directly with the ryot than the officers of other Departments. The officer for the agricultural side should possess a very intimate knowledge of the ryots' ways of thinking, their language and their needs to gain the confidence of the ryot. An European officer, however sympathetic and enthusiastic, cannot be expected to be able to do this work with the same facility as an Indian.

The present system of recruitment to the Indian Agricultural Service is that, when a vacancy occurs or is about to occur, the Secretary of State is informed and he selects a man, no nomination being usually sent up by the Local Government. This leads to the restriction of the selection to men resident in England and to the exclusion of Indians with foreign University qualifications who may have returned to India.

(B) *Provincial Agricultural Service*.—Recruitment for the Provincial Service, which, it is hoped, will be brought into existence soon, must be partly from the Subordinate Service and partly by direct nomination of men possessing high qualifications.

If the Scientific Assistants are trained properly by the experts, there need not be a special leave reserve in the Indian Agricultural Service. In the Educational Department the vacancies occurring by the granting of leave in the Indian Educational Service are filled up by selecting men from the Provincial Service.

68238. (II) System of Training and Probation.—All Assistants and officers of the grade of the Provincial Service should invariably be graduates in science and they should be made to undergo a course of training in Agriculture proper for a year. This system should be adopted until the local Agricultural College is able to turn out Licentiates in Agriculture of the right type, that is, men with good general education.

68239. (III) Conditions of Service.—At present the officers are expected to do both research and training work. This is not a satisfactory arrangement. An officer engaged in research work cannot devote sufficient time to teaching, without detriment to his research work. Teaching in this college is of a different type, and is far more taxing than in Arts colleges. Much time and previous preparation are needed for teaching and this, by itself, is a very hard task. So it is unfair to expect men who are teaching to take part in regular research work.

The primary duties of the experts being research work, the teaching has to be left entirely to the Indian Assistants and it is necessary that they must be in the Provincial Service.

68240. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The Agricultural Department must be on a par with the Educational or Revenue Department as regards pay, prospects, etc.

68241. (V) Conditions of Leave.—Rules as regards privilege leave so far as applicable to the teaching section are a very great hardship. At present they are allowed to take privilege leave only during the vacation time. The principle on which vacation leave is given to teachers and professors in schools and colleges should not be ignored in this Department, as teaching work in this college is more arduous.

68242. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, etc.—There is no need for any limitation as regards the employment in any branch of this Department, unlike the Indian Civil Service, for which such limitations may be considered necessary for political reasons.

68243. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service.—The post of the Director of Agriculture should be held only by an experienced officer of the Indian Civil Service who is specially trained. In view of the varied experience he gains in district work and his intimate knowledge of the conditions of the ryot, he is best fitted to be the head of this Department.

27 January 1914.]

RAY BAHADUR K. RANGACHARIAR.

[Continued.]

RAY BAHADUR K. RANGACHARIAR called and examined.

68244. (Chairman.) The witness had occupied the position of lecturing botanist at the Coimbatore College for the past two years. He had been 16 years in the Service. He had previously been connected with the Educational Department, from which he was lent to the Agricultural Department, and subsequently he became permanently attached to the latter Service.

68245. His first written statement consisted mainly of recommendations as to the organisation of the Provincial Service in the Agricultural College. The present scale of pay which he received in his present position rose from Rs. 330 to Rs. 660. He had modified his view as to the Provincial Service in a second written statement which he had forwarded to the Commission. His present idea was that there should be an intermediate Service leading to the Imperial Service. He preferred that method of recruitment of Indians to the higher Service to direct recruitment. He had two objects in view. If there were capable Indians they should be put straight away into the Provincial Service, with a view to being promoted to the higher Service. He would also give some encouragement to those who entered the subordinate Service, in that they would have higher pay when they retired. For that double object, it was necessary to have an intermediate grade.

68246. There were five definite scientific sections in the College, and at least one assistant ought to be on a higher grade of pay, so that he might have a better status. At present there was a good deal of difference between the assistant and the expert. The latter naturally did not consider an assistant as his equal. He recommended the establishment of a grade on Rs. 250 to Rs. 500. He meant that men would be promoted into the Rs. 500 grade, and if satisfactory there they would move on into the higher Service. His suggestion applied both to the teaching side and to the agricultural side.

68247. He thought the qualifications for entry into the college should be a distinct aptitude for science, and a subsequent agricultural training. He would test a man's aptitude for science by an ordinary examination in one of the local colleges.

68248. He would sooner see recruitment to the superior service by promotion from the Provincial Service than by a double process of promotion from the subordinate service to the Provincial Service, and from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service.

68249. He did not agree with the suggestion that 10 per cent. of the vacancies in the Imperial Service should be reserved for Indians. There should be

no limitation whatever, but there should be a preponderance of Indians in the purely agricultural line.

68250. With regard to the system of training at the College, he was of the opinion that the College should provide training for the higher class of agriculturists of India, and also a training for the ryots.

68251. Another point he wished to bring forward was that at present an agricultural graduate suffered very much in comparison with an ordinary graduate. Both took a four years' course. The arts graduate, however, was eligible to enter any department of the public service, whereas an agricultural graduate was supposed to be unfit for such positions. He was not considered as equal to the ordinary arts graduate. As a matter of fact if he was properly trained in the Agricultural College he ought to be superior to the ordinary arts graduate, because the scientific course in the Agricultural College was of a superior kind. He had been told that the training given at the Agricultural College in India was as good as that given in England.

68252. (Mr. Madge.) He thought a general admission to the effect that only people who were capable would be selected for promotion to the higher posts of the Service would give greater encouragement than the setting apart of a number of listed posts.

68253. (Mr. Fisher.) Assistants in the Agricultural Department had no chance of rising beyond Rs. 250, whereas in the Educational Department they could rise to Rs. 700. He admitted that no definite offer was made to teachers entering the College that they would rise to Rs. 700.

68254. (Mr. Sly.) There were two provincial appointments in the Agricultural Department, on Rs. 250 rising to Rs. 400, and there were five appointments on Rs. 150 rising to Rs. 250. He suggested the creation of a further intermediate service with five appointments ranging between Rs. 250 and Rs. 500. Officers for such posts should be recruited from amongst science graduates of the Indian Universities, who had undergone a subsequent period of training.

68255. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) He was not transferred at his own request from the Educational Department to the Agricultural Department. When he was transferred the conditions of service in the Agricultural Department were the same as they were at present, but he was not aware that he would be retained in the Agricultural Department. He was lent on a five years' agreement, but after four years had elapsed, it was thought necessary that he should stay in the Department, and he did not object.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Bombay, Tuesday, 10th February, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (Chairman).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

V. H. GONEHALLI, Esq., Extra Deputy Director of Agriculture, Bombay.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (Joint Secretary).

G. F. KEATINGE, Esq., C.I.E., I.C.S., Director of Agriculture, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68256. PRELIMINARY.—I am called upon to submit my remarks at very short notice on my return from furlough after two years' absence. I therefore propose to deal with the matter in

general terms. I shall be prepared to give detailed reasons for my opinions, if called upon to do so.

Our Imperial and Provincial Staff consists of two classes (a) District Staff, consisting of the Deputy Directors and Inspectors of Agriculture, (b) the Staff of the Poona Agricultural College and Re-

10 February 1914.]

Mr. G. F. KEATINGE.

[Continued.]

search Institute, consisting of the Professors and Assistant Professors of the various Sciences involved. It has been repeatedly pointed out that the multifarious duties of both the District and the Teaching Staff are such that they do not admit of an adequate amount of research taking place, and it cannot be long before it is recognised that we cannot make satisfactory progress as a Scientific Department without the services of men who possess both the training and the leisure necessary for adequate research. I would therefore add a third class to the two already mentioned and divide the Department into three branches, namely: (a) District Staff, (b) Teaching Staff, (c) Research Staff, without, of course, meaning to imply that branches (a) and (b) are not to do any research.

69257. (I) Methods of Recruitment.—Members of the Imperial Service are appointed by the Secretary of State for India. Members of the Provincial Department are appointed by the Bombay Government. I can suggest no better method of recruitment.

69258. (II) System of Training and Probation.—It has been customary to post new probationers for the Imperial Service to Pusa. When such men are destined for the District or Teaching branches, it is desirable that they should be posted at once to a Provincial Department, if possible to the Province in which they are likely to serve in order that they may become acquainted with the natural conditions, rural problems and departmental organisation, with which they will have to deal.

As regards probation, the period of three years should be sufficient if the probationer is serving throughout the period under the same supervision, but may be insufficient in cases where either he or the Supervising Officer is transferred. For the purpose of a general rule, however, I think that the period of three years is suitable.

As regards research men, it will be necessary to have the widest field of choice either from our existing District and Teaching Staffs, with or without additional special training, or from men from other countries who are actually engaged in research work. In the latter case, the conditions of service, either permanent or temporary, would have to be fixed to meet each individual case, and there should be no hard-and-fast-rules. It would be an essential and important part of the duties of such research workers that they should associate with them in their research work other selected members of our staff in such a way as to train them to take up independent research work.

I think it must be confessed that at present our District Staff as a whole are not in sufficient touch with research work and that the Department is suffering from this cause.

69259. (III) Conditions of Service.—The existing conditions of service appear to me to be suitable.

69260. (IV) Conditions of Salary.—The pay of any class of men must be fixed on a consideration of the market rate of pay that such men can command, and the conditions under which they will have to perform their work. In the case of the Agricultural Officers, brought from England, the rate of pay must be fixed so as to attract the right class of men, to compensate them for the disadvantages and expenses of foreign service, and to keep them satisfied that they are getting adequate remuneration for their work as compared with other similar services in this country and in other countries. I think that the present rates of pay sanctioned for the members of the Imperial Agricultural Service fairly meet the case—at any rate, in the earlier period of their service. As regards the latter part of their service, it is to be noticed that they reach the maximum, viz., Rs. 1,000 per mensem in the fourteenth year of their service, and in the case of the men who have been appointed direct on Rs. 500 per mensem, in the eleventh year of their service. The only increment in pay that then remains for them to look to under the existing arrangements is the chance of a special allowance as Principal of

an Agricultural College or a Member of the Pusa Staff, which, from the nature of the work that some of them perform, they are very unlikely to obtain, however efficient they may be. I think that this should be provided for, but I am not prepared to make definite suggestions on the spur of the moment. I made enquiries in Java as to the rate of pay given to the scientific experts recruited in Holland for the Java Agricultural Department, and ascertained that the rates of pay were very similar to ours, viz., Rs. 500 to Rs. 1,000 per mensem for the great bulk of the staff, and a few posts of Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 1,200 or Rs. 1,200 per mensem for the men in the most responsible positions. A Government post in Java, however, includes amongst its attractions a free passage to and from Europe for the officer and his family, and in some cases a rent-free house. It must be realised that the average rate of pay obtained by men doing this kind of work in their own country is much lower than we have to pay for European experts in India. At the College where I received my agricultural instruction, the salary of the Professors was £300 a year and of the Assistant Professors £120 a year, and some very capable men had been working at the latter rate of pay for many years, with little chance of promotion. At the Agricultural College, Utah, U.S.A., a large institution with a teaching and research staff of 80, the rates of pay are as follows:—Graduates are engaged in the first instance on a salary of 800 dols. a year (Rs. 200 per mensem); those that prove themselves capable will become Assistant Professors, after a period of from 3 to 10 years, on a salary of from 1,200 dols. to 2,000 dols. a year (Rs. 300 to 500 per mensem), and those who eventually become Professors get a salary of 1,800 dols. to 3,600 dols. a year (Rs. 450 to Rs. 900 per mensem). There are no pensions. These rates are extraordinarily low when consideration is paid to the cost of living and the rate of salaries in America; indeed, the salary of 800 dols. a year, which is all that a selected graduate will get for a period which may extend to 10 years, is just about the pay that an unskilled labourer will get in the same locality; but there is no difficulty in getting good men to take the jobs, because of the interest that they take in the work and the dignity that is attached to the position.

As regards the scale of pay sanctioned for our Provincial Department, viz., Rs. 350—50-2—550 for Extra-Deputy Directors, and Rs. 200—30-2—350 for Divisional Inspectors and Assistant Professors, I think that these rates are suitable. Having regard to the cost of living in India, they compare favourably with rates of pay given in other countries to men doing this class of work in their own country. We have hitherto had no difficulty in recruiting for the Department the best of our Agricultural Graduates. It is necessary, however, to keep the rates on a level approximating to the rates paid for similar work in other Departments in the Presidency, or we should not obtain the men, and it may be necessary eventually to raise the maximum rates for men in the Provincial Service who are appointed to positions involving much responsibility. The rates are certainly lower than those given to the European staff, and it may be asked “Why not substitute Indian for European staff?” I am dealing with this matter in my remarks under Heading VII.

69261. (VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—I gather from the reports submitted by some of the members of the Provincial Service in this Presidency that they have three main objections to the existing division between the Imperial and Provincial Departments. The first objection is regarding the different rates of pay. I have already dealt with this matter under Heading IV.

The second objection consists in the allegation that Members of the Provincial Department are not given sufficient freedom or scope for independent work, but are unduly subjected to the

10 February 1914.]

Mr. G. F. KEATINGE

[Continued.]

Members of the Imperial Service. Whatever system of division or classification of officers may be adopted, some officers must serve under the general orders and supervision of others. The amount of independence granted by an officer to any officer who serves under him will depend on the temperament and experience of the controlling officer, on the one hand, and on the capacity, resourcefulness and reliability of the subordinate officer on the other hand. It is certainly very desirable that officers in the Provincial Service should be given a large degree of independence, and anything like excessive departmentalism is to be deprecated in the Agricultural Department; but this is a matter that depends very much on the personal equation, and I do not see how it can be provided for by any hard and fast rules. The Department is a new one from top to bottom, and we are all in need of criticism. It is perhaps too much to expect that such criticisms as are made shall never hurt anyone's feelings. In so far as any genuine grievance exists, however, under this head, it points to defective administration rather than to defective rules.

The third objection, that the division of the Department into Imperial and Provincial is derogatory to the latter and checks esprit de corps seems to have little substance apart from the two objections already noted. I do not see that there is anything in the terms Imperial and Provincial that is objectionable; but if any sentimental grievance exists on this point, I should have no objection to the abolition of the terms, and to place all the officers on one list.

As regards the employment of Europeans and Indians in the Department, I see no reason why any man should not be promoted to any post for which he is qualified. Indians have already been appointed to high posts in this Department. But speaking as Director of Agriculture, with reference to the present generation and the work in hand,

I think that a proportion of European officers is essential in both the District and Teaching Branches (wide classification of branches made in paragraph 2). As regards the Research Branch, which does not yet exist apart from the two branches already mentioned, but which I hope to see shortly created, the only qualification needed is capacity for and experience in research work. At present I think we must look outside India for the men we want, but the sooner they can be obtained in India the better for all concerned.

68262. (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.—It is very important that close and friendly relations should exist between the Agricultural Department on the one hand and the Indian Civil Service and Irrigation and Forest Departments on the other hand; and this need will increase as time goes on. Hitherto our relations with other departments have been most friendly, and many officers in the Indian Civil Service and other Departments have co-operated with our work in the most cordial way. The Department is expanding rapidly, gaining experience daily and improving its organisation. I anticipate that in the near future it will be expected to advise and co-operate in matters with which it has hitherto had little concern; and it is probable that questions will arise regarding its exact position in the general scheme of administration. Such questions must be disposed of as they arise.

68263. In conclusion, I would suggest that the future of the Agricultural Department is not yet sufficiently defined to make it possible, at this stage to provide for future contingencies, and would deprecate any attempt, at this stage of development, to fetter our expanding activities by hard and fast rules. Rules which are suitable for one Province to-day are often inapplicable to another Province to-day, or even to the same Province in a few years time.

MR. G. F. KEATINGE called and examined.

68264. (Chairman.) The witness had occupied his present position for six years. He had been 19 years in the service. Prior to his taking up the Directorship he had undergone a two years' agricultural course in England.

68265. He had suggested dividing the department into three branches, but he did not intend to imply that there should be any hard and fast division. With regard to the suggestion of other witnesses, that there should be no further separation between research and administration than existed at present, and that it would be injurious to the progress of agriculture if such were the case, he said that to some extent there might be difficulties in that respect under the scheme he had put forward. Under present conditions men who ought to be in a position to undertake research work had not sufficient time to do so; they were occupied with teaching work, with administrative work, and with a mass of correspondence with the public. They ought to be relieved of some of this work, in order that they could devote more exclusive attention to research. He would like to have some men whose primary work was research, and who would form a definite branch of the service recruited in a different way. How they would be recruited would depend on how it was possible to recruit them. It would be difficult to obtain suitable men, and there would have to be an absolutely free hand in the matter of recruitment. He certainly thought that research work could be combined with a certain amount of teaching.

68266. The suggestion that the Pusa staff should consist of officers who had attained high positions and who were near the end of their service, and that they should form an Advisory Board for agriculture for all India, was no doubt a valuable one, but he had always understood that the

primary object of Pusa was to provide for post-graduate research, and that research would be carried on by the members of the institute, who would be prepared to train other people in their methods. Certainly, in so far as a staff could be brought into existence there, which would be able to advise the Provinces generally on matters which they were investigating, it would be, and was at present, very valuable. The conditions at Pusa, however, were very different from what they were in other parts of India, and the distances to be covered were so large that Bombay, for instance, very seldom saw members of the Pusa staff. Although he would like to see Pusa raised to the highest possible standard, he regarded it as essential that there should be other research centres in appropriate localities. He did not think in practice it would work out that Pusa could be a senior research centre with authority over the other centres. He thought each Province must do a great deal of its own research work, as the conditions in different Provinces were so very varied. There were problems in the drier parts of the Bombay Presidency which were not known at Pusa.

68267. He thought in years to come a certain number of the Deputy Directors would be qualified to hold the post of Director of Agriculture. It was mainly a matter of personal characteristics. The main part of the work which a Director had to do was administrative, and so long as a man had the capacity to do that kind of work, it did not matter whether he belonged to the agricultural service or to some other service. Of course, the man occupying the post should know something about the subject. As the work of the service expanded it would tend to become more administrative, and it would train men to become better administrators in the higher branch.

10 February 1914.]

Mr. G. F. KEATINGE.

[Continued.]

68268. He regarded it as important that provided competent men could be found, there should be an indigenous agency in India in the Department of Agriculture.

68269. The Bombay Presidency was divided into four divisions, one of which was in charge of an Extra Deputy Director, a member of the Provincial Service. That gentleman had been selected from amongst a number of candidates about 7 or 8 years ago, and was sent to Cambridge for a special agricultural training. Having taken his diploma he returned to the Presidency, and was appointed first of all as Divisional Inspector of Agriculture, and was subsequently promoted to the position of Extra Deputy Director. He came from the cultivator classes.

68270. Difficulty was experienced in the Bombay Presidency in getting men from the cultivator classes with sufficient education to make capable administrators. There was, however, a certain number of such men. Another difficulty was that a man might come from the cultivator classes but have no experience of cultivation.

68271. The only way in which active steps could be taken with a view to getting into the Service officers who had previous agricultural associations was to try and catch such men young, and get them to join the Department. Some years ago he had visited most of the High Schools in the Presidency, and had tried to pick out boys of the cultivator classes for scholarships at the agricultural college. He picked out some, but a good many of them failed to get through their examinations. Others were doing successfully. On the research side, it was less important to attract men from the cultivator class.

68272. Assuming that they had discovered a man who showed promise of making a good research officer, the decision as to sending him for a post-graduate course to Pusa would depend entirely on whether Pusa was offering facilities in that particular branch of research. He would sooner send a man to Poona for some classes of work than to Pusa. There existed at Poona all the arrangements and equipment for efficient post-graduate work in some of the scientific branches of research. The scientific staff at Poona consisted of an agricultural chemist, an agricultural botanist, a professor of agriculture and six assistant professors in various branches. That was not an adequate staff; there should be an increase, because the officers had to do a number of other duties in addition to their teaching and research work.

68273. He regarded it as important that there should be an increase on the administrative side of the Service. The charges were still very big, and might with advantage be further sub-divided.

68274. The best training an Indian could have for the Imperial Service was to serve in the first instance in the Provincial Branch, and having shown his capacity, he should then be sent to Europe to broaden his experience and to carry out further studies. In his opinion that was a better method than direct recruitment.

68275. He regarded the scale for the Provincial Service as adequate, except possibly towards the end of a man's service. The deficiency here had however, not yet arisen, as the service was still young.

68276. As to whether the salary of an Extra Deputy Director who was in charge of a division, and doing work of the same responsibility as the Deputy Director, was adequate by comparison with that of officers in the Imperial Service doing the same work alongside of him, it was a matter of the relative cost of living, and of the market rate of the European on the one side, and of the similarly trained Indian on the other. An Extra Deputy Director received up to Rs. 550 whereas Deputy Directors might rise to Rs. 1,000. He would not consider that an undue disparity in pay for work of comparable value. He regarded the matter entirely from the point of view of market values.

68277. If the work developed to any considerable

extent, he agreed that there might be a senior officer who would have general control over the whole of the Services which dealt with agriculture, and who would be a connecting link between those Services and Government, each of them having its own departmental head. There would be plenty of work for such an officer to perform.

68278. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The assistance which the Bombay Agricultural Service had hitherto obtained from Pusa had been mainly in the direction of training members of its staff in entomology and mycology. Pusa was not of very great use in co-ordinating the work which was performed by different branches of the Agricultural Department in different Provinces. Asked whether it would not be an improvement to have an institution which would help to co-ordinate the work, and prevent overlapping, the witness said that each department published its own report, in addition to which the Deputy Directors of one Province for the most part knew the Deputy Directors of another, and wrote a good deal, demi-officially, to each other. In that way the several Provinces kept in touch. The Department in Bombay followed the work which was being done by Pusa through the medium of the Pusa Bulletins. The Department was in demi-official correspondence with Pusa, but to a less extent than with the neighbouring Provinces. Some of the men in the Bombay Service who had been trained at Pusa kept in touch with Pusa officers; he was thinking specially of the entomologist and mycologist, who derived considerable help from the officers who had trained them at Pusa.

68279. It was suggested to him that at present Departments connected with Agriculture were under some official of the Civil Service, who might or might not be experienced or interested in them. In future they should all be grouped under one Officer, who would be called a Commissioner for Rural Development, and who should be *ex hypothesi* a man who had devoted a certain amount of time in his Service to gaining knowledge of, and taking an interest in, the agricultural problems of the country, and in all problems connected with agricultural life. Therefore, each of those Departments would be certain, when it came into contact with the big machinery of Government, of obtaining a hearing, and of putting its suggestions before a man who would be sympathetic, and who would be able to co-ordinate their work, and to balance the claims of one or other Department to favourable treatment by Government. It seemed to him, however, that the Rural Commissioner would really be what the Director of Agriculture at present ought to be, only under another name. In the Bombay Presidency the Director of Agriculture did at present control the Veterinary Department, and the Co-operative Credit Society. He agreed, however, that the principle had a good deal to recommend it. It would be desirable that a person so appointed should be called a Rural Commissioner rather than a Director of Agriculture, so as to avoid friction with certain Services.

68280. An Indian certainly possessed qualities which made him more valuable than a European in popularising the work of the Department. The extent to which he did so would vary in different tracts, but, taking it generally, an Indian was necessary in order to popularise the work. The reason he said it would vary in different tracts was because in some tracts cultivators were more and in other tracts were less, impressed, when a European arrived on the scene. Some Indians had shown very great aptitude for that special class of work. It was in that direction that he looked for the greatest benefit to the country from the larger employment of Indians.

68281. (*Mr. Madge.*) There would be no objection to interchanges between Research Officers and Administrative Officers, provided that they were limited to suitable cases. The advantage of having research work going on in Bombay Presidency would be enormous, partly because the conditions were different from those which pre-

10 February 1914.]

Mr. G. F. KEATINGE

[Continued.]

vailed in other provinces, and partly because there would be created in the midst of the Presidency an atmosphere of research, which would have an extraordinarily educative influence on the students and staff.

68282. It might be necessary to import specialists in research work for short periods, but it would be very difficult to get suitable men to break their connections in England in order to come out to India for a short time.

68283. He did not know that many landlords indulged in scientific study themselves, but they were interested in results obtained, and they were interested in the subject of agriculture generally. There was a short course at the College which was attended by young landowners, or the sons of landowners who wished to improve the cultivation on their own lands. Some of the bigger landowners also sent their sons to the College.

68284. Many of the cultivators' methods were extremely good, and the Department did not try to work against them. The difficulty of introducing many scientific methods was lack of means on the part of the cultivator to adopt them. Cheapness had driven him to methods which he would abandon if he were better off.

68285. (Mr. Fisher.) Some of the six assistant professors at Poona College were trained in the College; others had been to Cambridge, and others had not been to either Poona or Cambridge. Those who had been to Cambridge had profited by the training they had received there. It was to the advantage of their general education that agricultural students should go to Cambridge in order to become qualified for teaching work in agricultural colleges. The mere fact of seeing another country greatly enlarged their experience.

68286. Some of the assistant professors were doing original research work, and were good at it. He would be in favour of sending assistant professors of Provincial Colleges to Pusa for a term of study in mycology and entomology.

68287. His main desire was to get such a strengthening of the staff at Poona as to enable them to devote more time to research, but he did not want any hard and fast separation between teaching and research work. He also thought that research and teaching should be combined with district work. It would be difficult for district men to keep in efficient contact with research work, as their time was fully occupied. He agreed that the spreading of the results of the work of the Department depended a good deal on district inspectors, but he thought a man of the calibre of Deputy Director kept himself in touch with research work. The difficulty had been felt more keenly in the case of the members of the Subordinate Staff, who, after leaving the College, did not keep sufficiently in touch with scientific knowledge generally.

68288. Some extremely good men had been obtained in the Bombay Presidency under the present method of recruitment, and he knew of no better system.

68289. (Mr. Sty.) When he referred to the District Staff, he included under that term the Deputy Director. He would like to give that Officer time for research. From the nature of the case research must always form the smaller part of his work. What his recommendation really came to was that he desired more staff, and not mere sub-divisions into classes; he wanted more Deputy Directors and more specialists. He did not mean

to suggest there should be any firm line of division of function between the Deputy Directors who were going to do administrative work, and the Deputy Directors who were going to do research work.

68290. It was very desirable that young Europeans coming out to the Agricultural Service in India should have had previous practical experience. On the whole men who had been recruited at an older age in England, and who had practical experience were more suited for the work of the Department.

68291. The Indians who had been sent for special training to England had been sent immediately after their College course. There were four such men. He did not regard that as an ideal method, but the men thus sent to England had profited in their general education, and had widened their general experience. It depended entirely on the man himself whether that was a satisfactory method of recruiting Officers for the Imperial Service.

68292. There were young men in the present Provincial staff who were fit for promotion to the Imperial Service.

68293. He would not like to see Poona College without some European Professors in it.

68294. He would not contemplate the transfer of the Senior Officers of the Department from one part of India to another in order to fill the post of Director; this would involve sacrificing the great advantage of their local experience. The transfers should be mainly within the provinces themselves. If the Directorship was to go to a member of the Agricultural Service, he would support the proposal for the appointment of a Rural Development Commissioner.

68295. He would much prefer a system under which a man would be sent to serve under the Officer best qualified to give post-graduate instruction, rather than that Pusa should be made the one centre for post-graduate study.

68296. (Chairman.) With reference to his evidence that there was no firm line of distinction between the Deputy Director who was doing administrative work, and the research officer, he did not necessarily mean there should be interchange between those branches. What he meant was that he would not prevent a Research Officer from taking up some other work in addition, provided it did not interfere with his primary functions as a Research Officer. A District Officer was well informed as to the methods of modern agriculture, and he had to show his subordinates how to educate the agriculturists in the district. The Research Officer was the discoverer of those methods, either in the laboratory or in the field. Whilst he desired that there should be close contact between such officers, he would not suggest that there should be any interchange between them except on very rare occasions.

68297. (Mr. Gonchall.) He considered that the present prospects in the Provincial Agricultural Service were sufficient to attract a superior class of students to the college. He doubted whether students at the time of joining the College paid much attention to what the ultimate salaries of the higher posts were. They would primarily look to the fact whether, in the earlier stages of their service, they could obtain congenial work. As time went on, the Service would not be able to offer employment to a large portion of the students, and it was to be hoped that they would look out for employment elsewhere than in the Agricultural Department.

(The witness withdrew.)

DR. H. H. MANN, Principal, Agricultural College, Poona.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68298. Before attempting to answer the questions which have been issued by the Commission regarding the agricultural services, I should like to

make a few remarks on the purpose of the services which will indicate the reasons for the views which I take on the questions issued.

In the first place, the agricultural departments are essentially, if not wholly, missionary depart-

10 February 1914.]

Dr. H. H. MANN.

[Continued.]

inents. Their administrative, their purely educational, functions are wholly secondary. They have a very small amount, relatively, of work set which they must do, and which, having done, they may count their purpose accomplished. The work they do, on the other hand, is essentially that of missionaries. We believe that we can, by the aid of science and knowledge of what has been and is being done elsewhere, bring about more profitable methods of agriculture than those in vogue. We are not going to carry out these ourselves except as an illustration: our purpose is to carry the knowledge which we possess or find out and persuade the people to carry out the resulting methods. This position places us in an entirely different position to any other department of Government. In all of them the missionary work, though important, is secondary, the administrative predominant: in ours we want to do nothing permanent ourselves, but to bring the people to do everything.

If this be the case, then we may define, in my mind, more closely what the immediate aims of each department should be. They are these:—

(1) To find out what the cultivators and other agricultural classes want, and, if we know a means of meeting these wants, show them the way of meeting them; if we do not know, then to investigate till we find out.

(2) To find out what, beyond their wants, the cultivators, etc., need and, again, if we know a way of meeting these needs, proclaim such ways abroad; if we do not know, then to investigate till we find out.

(3) After investigation and discovery, to act as missionaries of what we have discovered through the tracts in which our work lies.

If this definition is true, then all work must begin with a knowledge of the people, with acquiring their confidence; in short, to know the people, to acquire their confidence, to investigate with their benefit solely in view, to have the power to get them, either singly or as local bodies, to try what is suggested: this is the work of the most important man in an agricultural department, of the man who must be the leader of all. Such a man may be a civilian: I have known such. He may be a pure farmer: I have known such. He may be himself a scientific investigator: I have again known such. He may have devoted much of his time to teaching: I have again known such. But if we once recognise that missionary power, as I have tried to define it above, is the most essential thing for the real purpose of an agricultural department to be fulfilled, then I think the answering of the questions set by the Commission will be much simplified.

This is the central point and leads to the general question of qualifications for positions in an agricultural department, whether in Imperial, Provincial, or other services. The first qualification which any member of the agricultural department must have is ability to get into touch with the people, and to inspire confidence in them. This is important for all members: it is important for men who are purely investigators; it is more important for those who are educators; it is all important for those who are directly and constantly in touch with the people in farm and district work.

The second qualification which any member must have is that he is himself an agriculturist, and a good one in some line, so that his knowledge in one direction at least may inspire confidence with those with whom he has to deal. If a man is a chemist, I want him to be more than a chemist, to be a man who has studied, both in the laboratory and in the field, the relations of chemistry to agriculture; if a man is a botanist, I want him to be an agricultural botanist, more interested in the problems that are important to cultivators than in any other, and able to judge himself of the practicability of what he suggests; if a man is an entomologist, I want him to study entomology from the agricultural point of view, and especially to know, as an agriculturist himself,

the value and use of the methods he suggests, and so on. We have had and have men chemists, botanists, entomologists, etc., who have been all this; we have had and have men who have been pure scientific men, and whose interest in the great industry to which we are missionaries is purely incidental.

The third qualification which any member of the agricultural departments must possess is knowledge of the country, of local conditions, of agricultural possibilities. Without depreciating in the least the value of high scientific attainment, nay, while insisting that it has not been enough considered in the past, yet without intimate local knowledge, far more intimate than most of the European and a large proportion of the Indian members of the departments have usually had, a great deal of damage may easily be done, confidence destroyed and the work of years spoilt.

These qualifications being recognised, I may proceed to answer, from my point of view, the questions which have been put by the Commission.

6829. (I) Method of Recruitment.—The recruitment of the Imperial Agricultural Service is on the whole unsatisfactory. If the qualifications which I have laid down be the chief ones, then there can be no distinction between Indians and Europeans in the Service. Missionary power, devotion to agriculture, either as "farming" or through his science, knowledge of local conditions: if these are the qualifications, then it must be recognised that no method of college training alone can give what is required. And few colleges, Indian or European, attempt to do so. They give the technical knowledge of farming, or of a connected science certainly, but beyond that a student is not equipped with the qualifications desired when he leaves college, whether in England or India. And in England there is the additional disadvantage that the agriculture which is before the eyes as an illustration is an agriculture which in its organisation is quite foreign to most parts of India, and will be for a long time to come.

Therefore, I would say that any attempt to bring to India, or engage in India, young men who have just left even the best of colleges as responsible heads of offices giving agriculture advice or doing agricultural teaching (whether in agriculture as a business or in the sciences on which it depends) must result in failure in a large proportion of cases, and long delay in getting what you want. It seems to me that this may be all very well as a preliminary training, but a man must have had long experience before he takes such a position, either in the agricultural departments in a non-responsible position, or outside in another sphere. This probation, whether of Englishmen or Indians, whether in the departments or elsewhere seems to me essential. Given this, and, as I shall indicate directly, a definite process of weeding out at the end of each year of probation, I do not think there should be any difference between equally qualified Europeans and Indians, and those trained in England or India.

68300. (II) System of Training and Probation. I have already stated that I consider that special agricultural training is important for all members of the Department. If the terms of probation are strictly defined, I am not prepared to say that a specially good chemist, botanist, or entomologist should not be engaged, provided that he fully understands that his work afterwards must specialise along agricultural lines, and that his probation will be judged by his success in specialising along those lines.

68301. (III) Conditions of Service.—If a man joins the Imperial Agricultural Service as a man without experience, I would insist on three years probation, which may be terminated at the end of each year if there is not promise of the man developing the character and missionary power we want. I look on the training of Indian agricultural students as one way in which missionary power may be shown. I would make it a real probation, with probably 25 per cent., at

